J. G. Jennings

The Vedāntic Buddhism of the Buddha



The Author lived and worked for nearly thirty years in the provinces (known in modern times as Bihar and Orissa) which were the scene of the Buddha's life-work 2,500 years earlier. In this important book the actual words of the Master are sifted out from the vast mass of the Hīnayāna Pali writings of Southern Buddhism and presented in English translation. The arrangement of the text is in strict chronological order and the addition of exhaustive footnotes and cross-references provide what is, in fact, a life of the Buddha. On this basis a clear, consistent, and original theory of his teaching is put forward and is further expounded in an illuminating introduction. Though the author's conclusions are definitely his own, he had a thorough acquaintance with the earlier investigations of such scholars as Kern, Oldenberg, Thomas, the two Rhys Davids, and A. B. Keith. He devoted the whole of his retirement, some twenty years, to the writing of this work, which undoubtedly marks an epoch in the study of the Southern Buddhist sources.

Price Rs. 65.00

THE
VEDĀNTIC BUDDHISM OF THE BUDDHA

©MOTILAL BANARSIDASS
Indological Publishers & Booksellers
Head Office : BUNGALOW ROAD, JAWAHARNAGAR, DELHI-7
Branches : 1. CHOWK, VARANASI-1 (U. P.)
2. ASHOK RAJPATH, PATNA-4 (BIHAR)

ISBN O-8426-0683-I

First Edition : London, 1947
Reprinted : London, 1948, 1949
Reprinted : Delhi, 1974
Price : Rs. 65.00

Printed in India
BY SHANTILAL JAIN, AT SHRI JAINENDRA PRESS, BUNGALOW ROAD, JAWAHAR NAGAR, DELHI-7 AND PUBLISHED BY SUNDARLAL JAIN FOR MOTILAL BANARSIDASS, BUNGALOW ROAD JAWAHARNAGAR, DELHI-7

TO

THE HOLY LAND OF INDIA

A PEACE OFFERING

*

Her hills and plains have sheltered through the ages
Saints, seers, sages;
Whose thoughts have spread like sunlight o'er the world;
Nor shall they pass, save to be new unfurl'd.

WHO SHALL DELIVER ME

God strengthen me to bear myself;
That heaviest weight of all to bear,
Inalienable weight of care.

All others are outside myself;
I lock my door and bar them out,
The turmoil, tedium, gad-about.

I lock my door upon myself,
And bar them out; but who shall wall
Self from myself, most loathed of all?

If I could once lay down myself,
And start self-purged upon the race
That all must run! Death runs apace.

If I could set aside myself,
And start with lightened heart upon
The road by all men overgone!

God harden me against myself,
This coward with pathetic voice
Who craves for ease, and rest, and joys:

Myself, arch-traitor to myself;
My hollowest friend, my deadliest foe,
My clog whatever road I go.

CHRISTINA GEORGINA ROSSETTI

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIFE OF THE BUDDHA TAKEN FROM THE PĀLI TEXTS

PART I

THE BUDDHA AND THE DHAMMA

RENUNCIATION, ENLIGHTENMENT, THE FIRST CONVERTS, AND THE FOUNDATION OF THE SAṂGHA

Part II

THE BUDDHA AND THE SAṂGHA

DEVELOPMENT OF THE SAṂGHA, AND THE GREAT TOURS

Part III

SĀVATTHI AND THE LAST JOURNEY

CONTINUOUS RESIDENCE IN SĀVATTHI; THE LAST STAGE; RĀJAGAHA REVISITED AND THE SCHISM OF DEVADATTA; THE LAST JOURNEY, AND PARINIBBĀNA

APPENDIXES

(*Containing supplementary texts taken from the Pāli*)

REFERENCES AND ABBREVIATIONS

REFERENCES

All the references to different portions of the present work are cross-references, so that a reader on referring to a paragraph or section may find the exact passage or phrase for which he is looking indicated there by a corresponding reference to the passage from which he is looking.

Those readers who wish to obtain only a general survey may very well dispense with the references, all of which merely provide comparisons supplying confirmation, expansion, or modification. The cross-references will be found to serve as a full Index, if trouble be taken to follow up all the links.

ABBREVIATIONS

Aṅg.	Aṅguttara	Majjh.	Majjhima Nikāya
Ap.	Appendix	masc.	masculine
comy.	commentary	MPS.	Mahā-parinibbāna-suttanta (Dīgha 16)
cp.	compare		
dat.	dative	n.	footnote
Dhp.	Dhammapada	Nik.	Nikāya
Dial.	Dialogues	Piṭ.	Piṭaka
Dict.	Dictionary	plur.	plural
e.g.	for instance	Pt.	Part
fem.	feminine	PTS.	Pāli Text Society
ff.	following	q.v.	quod vide, which see
fig.	figurative	ref.	reference
gen.	genitive	s.	Sutta or Suttānta
ger.	gerund	Saṃ.	Saṃyutta Nikāya
i.e.	that is	SBB.	Sacred Books of the Buddhists
IN	Introductory Note	SBE.	Sacred Books of the East
Int.	Introduction	tr.	translated by
lit.	literally	Vin.	Vinaya
loc.	locative	voc.	vocative

ABBREVIATED TITLES OF BOOKS AND THEIR AUTHORS

Buddh. Phil., *Buddhist Philosophy*, by A. B. Keith.

Bm. in Tr., *Buddhism in Translations*, by Henry Clarke Warren, Harvard Oriental Series, Vol. 3.

H. and B., *Hinduism and Buddhism*, by Sir Charles Eliot.

OB., H. Oldenberg's *Buddha, sein Leben, seine Lehre, seine Gemeinde.*

KM., H. Kern's 'Manual of Indian Buddhism', *Encyclopedia of Indo-Aryan Research*, vol. iii, Part 8.

Th.B., E. J. Thomas, *Life of Buddha.*

RDB., T. W. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism.*

RDBI., T. W. Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India.*

Brethren, *Psalms of the Brethren*, tr. by Mrs. Rhys Davids, PTS. 1913.

Sisters, *Psalms of the Sisters*, tr. by Mrs. Rhys Davids, PTS. 1909.

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

General Survey

1. The following Life of Siddhattha Gotama Sakya, the Buddha,[1] consists of a series of extracts from the Books of the Buddhist Canon (the Piṭakas or Baskets[2]), preserved in Ceylon;[3] from the mainly canonical narrative introduction to the *Mahā-vagga*[4] of the *Vinaya-Piṭaka*; and from the post-canonical anonymous Pāli Introduction (*Nidāna-Kathā*[5]) to the Commentary on the Jātaka or Book of Stories of the Buddha's previous Births; with occasional excerpts from the Pāli Commentaries of the learned Buddhaghosha,[6] who wrote in the fifth century A.D., and was steeped in the love of the ancient canon. The Introduction to the Jātaka is itself un-canonical, and was written in Ceylon, probably about the middle of the fifth century of our era,[7] but it was compiled from the Canonical Books themselves.[8]

2. Writing of the Pāli Introduction (*Nidāna-Kathā*) in 1877, Rhys Davids observes: 'The light it throws on the other [later] accounts [of Buddha's life] is often exceedingly interesting and instructive, especially as showing the gradual growth of the supernatural parts of the biography' (*Buddhism*, p. 13). Of the Piṭakas or Canonical Books he writes: 'It may be possible, hereafter, when the Piṭakas shall have been published, to ascertain which parts of them are older than the rest, and whether they contain an older system hidden under a later one;[9] at present it can only be said that of difference in age there is already sufficient evidence, but of growth or change in fundamental ideas none of any certainty,—except, indeed, as regards the person of Gautama himself' (*Buddhism*, p. 87).[10]

[1] See note to title of Part I. There is evidence that his disciples spoke of him simply as the devotee (*samaṇa*) Gotama; Ch. 13 *a* § 6.

[2] Ap. A 1. The collection of canonical books is known in Ceylon as the *Thera-vāda* or Elders' Doctrine; Ap. A 1 *b* (6).

[3] Int. §§ 21, 22, 118; Ap. A 1 *b*, *Note*.

[4] Ch. 4 § 9; Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7] n.

[5] Int. §§ 16, 89; Ch. 1 § 1 [47]; Ch. 10 *a* § 5 [94]; Ap. D *a*, *Note*. The introduction to the *Mahā-vagga* covers the period from the Enlightenment to the first establishing of the Saṃgha at Rājagaha; the biographical portion of the Introduction to the Jātaka expands the narrative with some strain so as to cover the period from Gotama's birth to the establishment of the Saṃgha at Sāvatthi.

[6] Int. § 21.

[7] See RDB, p. 13; RDBI, pp. 201, 207.

[8] Dr. E. J. Thomas's *Life of Buddha* (1927) comprises a scrupulous analysis and comparison of all the texts, Pāli (canonical and commentarial), Sanskrit, and Tibetan, available for the several parts of Gotama's biography. His somewhat sceptical survey leaves the conviction that the least unreliable sources are the accounts, not seldom supported by the other traditions, though sometimes inconsistent among themselves, found in the different parts of the Pāli Canon. The Sanskrit poetical narratives, *Lalita-Vistara* and *Buddha-carita*, as in Sir Edwin Arnold's *Light of Asia*, are little more than gracious fantasies.

[9] IN 6 (*Canon*); Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] n.

[10] See also RDBI, pp. 176–7, 188; KM, pp. 1–3; cp. also ThB, pp. 249–56.

3. Just as the earlier biographies of Buddha have clearly been added to and 'improved'[1] by later Buddhist editors, so the original and canonical accounts of Buddha's teachings have been touched and 'improved' in later recensions, generation after generation, to bring them into accordance with current ideas. The method of the growth of the Books of the Canon[2] is illustrated by the Buddhist theory that whatever is well said is a word of the Buddha.[3] Thus doubtless, as might have been assumed *a priori*, doctrines which to the early Fathers of the Buddhist Church, before the final closing of the Sacred Canon, seemed consonant with the original teachings of the Buddha, were gradually added to the tradition, their own misapprehensions of his teaching being naturally emphasized. It is here contended that the original core of Gotama's teaching[4] was the doctrine of pure altruism or non-egoism,[5] which has since been overlaid very naturally by one making a stronger appeal, namely the wonderful Indian dogma of personal salvation through long purgation by transmigration in successive lives. The ethical ideal of complete altruism is of such beauty that it would seem to be worth presenting in a concrete form, even if that form were not strictly historical. Of its historical truth, however, in the life of Gotama Buddha, there appears to be sufficient proof.

4. That Buddha found the doctrine of transmigration[6] prevalent among his contemporaries is sufficiently established.[7] It seems clear that he accepted so much of it[8] as declares the endless results of all

[1] Int. §§ 54, 69; IN 9; Ch. 4 § 10 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [4] n; Ap. B *b* § 3 [4].

[2] IN 6 (*Canon*); Ap. A 1 *b*; and Int. § 87 (*Mahāyāna*).

[3] 'A good word may be defined as possessing four characteristics [*Sutta Nipāta*, p. 78]; it is well said, conforms to salvation, pleasant and true as opposed to the opposites of these, and such a word by its intrinsic merit may be assumed to be spoken by the Buddha, despite the fact that no text containing it is available. Hence we read (*Ciksāsamuccaya of Cāntideva*, ed. C. Bendall, Bibliotheca Buddhica, Petrograd, i, 1902, p. 15; *Bodhicaryāvatārapañjikā of Prajñākaramati*, ix, 43, ed. Bibliotheca Indica, Calcutta, also in Poussin, *Bouddhisme, Études et Matériaux*, London, 1898) that anything that is well said is a word of the Buddha': A. Berriedale Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, 1923, pp. 36–7. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [1] (*indications*).

[4] The *Dhamma*, Law or System. IN 5 *b*; Ap. G 1 *b*.

[5] Int. § 113; Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [8]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 7 (*kindness*); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*). Further references: Int. § 10; Ch. 1 § 1 n; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [3] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (3); Ap. D (*Egoism*); Ap. G 1 *b* § 2; also Int. §§ 25, 55 n, 86; Part I (title) n; Ch. 5 *a* § 5 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 19 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (under *Six Teachers*). Cp. Ap. A 2 *c* (*Metteyya*); Ap. F 1 (*Action*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9]; also Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3] (*visuddhi*); Ch. 12 *e* § 11 [3] (*Nibbāna*); Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [2] (*goodness*) n.

[6] Int. §§ 7, 19, 62, 177; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] (*dissolution*); Ch. 13 *d* § 4; Ch. 14 *c* § 5 [189] n; Ap. B (*Results of Action*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2); Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8]; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [6]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [13] n. Gotama did not adopt the contemporary doctrine of personal Karma; he repudiated it (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [20]). 'The Anguttara Nikaya, book IV, chap. 77 [PTS, iii, p. 80], forbids speculation on four subjects as likely to bring madness and trouble. Two of the four are kamma-vipâko [action-fruition, *i.e.* retribution] and loka-cintâ [spheres-thought, *i.e.* metaphysics]'; Eliot, *H. and B.* i, p. 212.

[7] RDBI, pp. 251–7; Eliot, *H. and B.* i, p. 42. See Ap. B *b* § 3 [2] and Ap. H 2 *a* § 4, on Jains and fire-worshippers.

[8] IN 4; Ap. B *b* § 2 (*passing on*).

actions of the individual;[1] but the theory of personal reward and punishment in successive lives is radically inconsistent with his characteristic doctrine of No Self, or the impermanence of individuality (*sabbe dhammā an-attā*),[2] and with altruism, being in essence individualistic.[3]

5. It is sometimes said that, whilst Gotama accepted the Brāhman doctrine of Karma or transmigration (metempsychosis), he reformed it by clearing away the ancient reliance upon priestly ritual, of which the object was progress in the series of re-births, and by teaching that every man must be his own saviour.[4] But, whatever the degree of reliance upon ritual, the idea of ultimate salvation by self-effort and moral action is inherent in the doctrine of Karma, and must therefore have been current before the time of Gotama. The man born blind is punished for some sin of the eye in a previous birth, and not for neglect of ritual. What is distinctive of Gotama's teaching is, not salvation attained by non-reliance upon ritual and by reliance upon self, though self-reliance[5] is definitely taught by him, but the present attainment of the peace of Nibbāna[6] (Nirvāna) or freedom from sorrow, through the eradication of selfish desire or egoism, by following the Noble Eightfold Path,[7] which necessarily involves unselfish

[1] Ap. B *b*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*.

[2] Int. § 36; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]; Ap. E *c* i. The culminating thought which completed the Enlightenment of Gotama and his early followers (Ch. 4 § 10; Ch. 5 *c* § 7) may be rendered freely: 'All things pass away (save the divine substance in which) all things are originated (and of which) all things are compounded.' The words in brackets are implicit. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7] (*origination*); Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411] (*bhava-nirodha*).

[3] 'The doctrine of Karman, of metempsychosis, was already so deeply rooted in the popular conscience that Buddhism has retained it notwithstanding its standing in the most glaring conflict with Buddhist psychology, which denies the existence of soul altogether' (Kern, *Manual of Indian Buddhism*, 1896, p. 11).

'The two fundamental formulas ["These formulas are the four Āryasatyāni (Noble Truths) and the twelvefold Pratītyasamutpāda (Dependent Origination)", p. 46], to which may be added the stanza "*Ye dhammā hetuppabhavā* (Those things which spring from a cause)", do not presuppose the belief in retribution and rebirth, the Karman theory, nor do they contain anything decidedly opposed to it. The same cannot be said of the Buddhist doctrine regarding the Ātman, self, soul, individuality. . . . The more we try to remove the difficulties, the more we are driven to the suspicion that original Buddhism was not exactly that of the canonical books. If we suppose that the teaching of the founder of the Order was free from mythology and the Karman theory, we get a system intelligible, self-consistent and perfectly apt to lead persons possessing a contemplative bent of mind, by means of a dignified and harmless solitary and cenobitic mode of life, to the blissful state of calm beatitude, called Nirvāṇa, a state only surpassed by the final Nirvāṇa or Parinirvāṇa, when all suffering is absolutely and for ever at an end.

'Whatever may be our doubts about the original form of Buddhism, it is certain that the dogma in question made part and parcel of the whole system of Dharma before the great bulk of the canonical books were composed. The hypothesis that in course of time some elements were incorporated into the creed to which originally they were foreign, does not involve the belief in a radical change. In our view Buddhism was from the very beginning *essentially* such as we find it in the Tripiṭaka . . .' (Kern, *Manual*, pp. 49–50). Cp. Int. § 91.

[4] Cp. H. Baynes, *The Way of the Buddha* (1914), p. 35.

[5] Ap. E *c* ii.

[6] Ap. C *b*.

[7] Ap. F 2 *d*.

activity and precludes the self-cultural passivity of such asceticism as that of *Yoga*, tried and abandoned[1] by Gotama.

6. The centre of Gotama's doctrine lies in the Four Noble Truths, which culminate in the Noble Eightfold Path.[2] And in the discourse in which these appear there is but one word (and that perhaps interpolated) possibly referring to rebirth. That one word is *ponobbhavikā*[3] (tending to being again), and is an epithet of *taṇhā* (thirst or desire). Now if the 'being again' is not that of the soul, of which the lasting existence was denied[4] by Gotama, and if it is *taṇhā*, desire itself, that is here said to tend to re-exist or be again, then the epithet points to a fact which cannot be denied, and which, if once realized in its fullness, is as sufficient a moral sanction for altruism as future reward and punishment are for individualism; for the thought of ill once done reproducing itself and affecting endless lives through countless ages is at least as powerful a deterrent as the fear of punishment which is to be suffered hereafter by oneself and possibly may be escaped.[5] Those who consider that so purely rational a doctrine as that which is here attributed to Gotama could not have arisen at so early a date overlook not only generally the thousands of years of human civilization and intercommunication prior to that period, but specifically the rationalism[6] of Gotama's Indian philosophic contemporaries and opponents, as well as the rationalism of Confucius in China before Gotama, and that of the Stoics[7] in Asia Minor and Greece not many generations later.

7. All definitely transmigrationist phrases and passages have been omitted from the present text and have been placed in footnotes. Readers can thus judge for themselves, but it is here maintained that these are probably additions by later Buddhist authorities whose view of Karma (*kamma*)[8] was personal or individualistic, whereas Buddha's original teaching denies emphatically all permanent personality (*attan*, or *puggala*).[9]

8. The chain of consequence, the individual's moral responsibility[10]

[1] Int. § 178; Ch. 8 *k*; Ap. H 4 *c*; Ap. 1, *Note* (*yoga*). For the disciplined but intensely active and practical nature of Gotama's genius see Ch. 7 *c*, final note.

[2] Int. § 24 (*Dhammacakkappavatana-Sutta*).

[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 6.

[4] Ap. E *c* i.

[5] Ap. G 2 *a* (*Collective Karma*).

[6] Int. § 19; IN 13; Ap. G 2 *c*. See also Ap. E *c* ii § 4; Ap. G 1 *a*; and Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*.

[7] IN 10.

[8] Int. §§ 4, 19, 92. Contrast Ch. 9 *a* § 14 n; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 (*unfixedness*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 [3]. The view that sorrow and joy are caused by what has been done before (*pubbe kata-hetū*) is definitely called a heresy (*tiṭṭh-āyatana*; Ap. G 2 *c*) in the *Tika-nipāta* of the *Anguttara-Nikāya* (PTS, i, p. 173), in which sorrow is declared to be caused by ignorance and craving according to the law of Causative Process (Ap. B *c*). The other two heresies there mentioned are the view that sorrow and joy are caused by the will of God and the view that they are without cause.

[9] *Sabbe dhammā an-attā*. Ap. E *c* i; Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [3] n, and Ap. B *b* § 1 (*māran-antika*).

[10] Int. § 25; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [4] n; Ap. B *b*, *Note*; Ap. E *c* ii, *Note* (*free*); also Ap. H 4 (*Conduct*).

for every action, word, or thought,[1] the necessity of morality, are throughout assumed in Buddha's teaching. To this extent the force of Karma[2] is assumed by him, as by all his Hindu contemporaries; but the doctrines of lasting personality and of reward and punishment he definitely repudiated.[3] Assuming the common origin and the fundamental unity[4] of all life and spirit, he assumed the unity of the force of Karma upon the living material of the whole world, and the doctrine of Karma taught by him is collective not individual.[5] This doctrine of Collective Karma (Pāli, *Kamma*) is exactly expressed by the French statesman and writer Turgot, who in the year 1750 in his famous Discourse wrote that 'All epochs are fastened together by a sequence of causes and effects, linking the condition of the world to all the conditions that have gone before'. The influence of the great and unifying genius of Sir Isaac Newton upon Turgot is pointed out by Lord Morley in his essay on the French statesman. The doctrine is in accord with modern scientific thought.

9. 'None of the books of the Three Piṭakas', writes T. W. Rhys Davids (*Buddhism*, p. 86), 'can at present be satisfactorily traced back before the Council of Asoka, held at Patna about 250 B.C., that is to say, at least 130 years after the death of the teacher; but they undoubtedly contain a great deal of much older matter.'[6] The problem is to find a test which will distinguish between earlier and later passages and doctrines attributed to Gotama. That probably is to be found in the difference between altruistic and individualistic Buddhism. Gotama's teaching was a revolt[7] from the pious self-seeking of extreme asceticism; herein lies the key. Buddha's later followers reverted, naturally enough, to the effort after personal salvation, as also to personal worship and ultimately to polytheism—to *bhakti*

[1] For this threefold division of duty see Int. §§ 34, 42, 117; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*. 'The Buddhist warning against the ten sins; three of the body—taking life, theft, adultery; four of speech—lying, slander, abuse, and vain conversation; three of the mind—covetousness, malice and scepticism': Okakura-Yoshisaburo, *The Japanese Spirit* (1905), p. 58.

[2] IN 1; Int. § 17; Ap. B *b* § 3 [5].

[3] Ap. C *b* § 9; Ap. E *c* i; and Ch. 13 *a* § 6 (*existence*).

[4] Ap. B *c*; Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*); and Int. §§ 39, 53 (*samādhi*), 64 (*yoga*), 81 (*Vedānta*). 'Owing to the unsettled state of Indian chronology we cannot with full certainty fix the absolute date of the Nirvāna; yet we may confidently assert that the rise of Buddhism nearly coincides with the close of the Upaniṣad period. From the very tenets of Buddhism it is evident that the theories of the Vedānta had reached their full development, albeit not in the scholastic form of the Brahma-Sūtras. The practices of the Yoga, which though dogmatically no integral part of the Vedānta are not repudiated or disapproved by the Vedāntins, were scarcely less developed in the days of Buddha than later in the time of Patañjali, the author of the manual titled *Yoga-sūtra*' (Kern, *Manual of Indian Buddhism*, 1896, p. 11). Cp. Int. §§ 91, 178; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Vedāntic*). For further reference see J. B. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism* (1928), p. 90.

[5] Ap. B *b*.

[6] Int. § 57 n; Ap. A 1 *b*. 'The date of the Abhidharma [Piṭaka] and its redaction in its present shape are alike unknown to us, but we may reasonably believe that it was composed from the first in Pali, whereas the Vinaya [Piṭaka] and the Suttas were redacted in Pali—doubtless with many additions of original composition—on the basis of earlier work in a dialect more closely vernacular': A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), p. 153.

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 20 n; Ap. G 1 *b*.

(adoration), and so to Hinduism, from an earlier form of which Buddhism originally had emerged and in which the Indian school of Buddhism was ultimately reabsorbed.[1] To find again the teachings of Gotama, it is necessary to reverse their steps—to discard polytheism and the hierarchy of heaven, to discard personal adoration, and so finally to discard the doctrine of personal Karma and return to the fundamental doctrine of selfless well-doing without a thought of reward.[2]

10. The Buddha is described as hesitating long before deciding to teach his doctrine; he feared that it would not be understood.[3] There was, however, no reason why he should hesitate to teach the doctrines of Transmigration and Karma, ordinarily attributed to him, if he held them; they are perhaps the most popular religious doctrines in the world. We must look for the causes of his hesitation in some other form of doctrine, more difficult of acceptance by the world, and we may find it in the teaching of pure altruism (non-egoism).[4] The difficulties in the way of making the generality of the world understand the metaphysical basis[5] of this doctrine he might well regard as almost insuperable; but as regards the dogmatic teaching of the evils of selfishness, adopted finally by him, the difficulty was not so much of comprehension as of acceptance by the world. Gotama himself repeatedly insists upon the simplicity of the doctrine, and that a man can master it by himself.[6] To social man indeed the need for self-denial is self-evident when once clearly pointed out. It is perceived directly, like the reality of the world, but is equally unprovable by logic or metaphysics. It is this thread[7] which requires to be disentangled from the skein with which it has been intertwined.

11. In the Conversion Sermons[8] is probably to be found the nucleus and the purest form of the Buddha's own teaching,[9] to be distinguished from the developments of his later followers. It may be questioned whether the doctrine of Rebirth[10] is referred to in these sermons even in the present, possibly late, form in which they have come down to us. Their mention of Heaven (*sagga*)[11] is inconsistent with that doctrine, if *sagga* implies a future blissful existence, since descent from Heaven back to earth is possible only in the case of re-incarnations of the highest spirits, and *sagga* in the sermons is promised to all true converts. But this term, which etymologically

[1] Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*altruism*).

[2] IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*); IN 10. Cp. Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. v, ch. 6; vii. 73, 74; ix. 42.

[3] Ch. 5 *a* § 1.

[4] Int. § 3; Ch. 4 §§ 9 n, 16 n; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [7]. Cp. Ap. C *b* §§ 10, 11 (285); Ap. E *c* i; Ap. F 1 *b*; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii) n.

[5] Ap. G 1 *a* (*views*); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Presuppositions*).

[6] Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ap. E *c* ii § 1.

[7] Int. § 24.

[8] IN 2 *a*.

[9] *Dhamma*. Int. § 13; Ap. G 1 *b*.

[10] Int. § 19; Ch. 4 § 16 (*punabbhava*), § 18 [1] and [3]; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] (*previously*); Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [2] n; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 2 [1] n, 4 [8] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [11] n; Ch. 21 § 16; Ap. B *a* (*Karma*); Ap. B *b* § 1 [46] (*hereafter*).

[11] Int. § 33; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. Cp. Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note* (*belief*).

means 'light', probably denotes not the radiance of a future existence but the bliss of perfect enlightenment and self-forgetfulness in this world.

12. Apart from the Buddhist Canon, the Edicts of the Emperor Asoka[1] present to us the earliest known concise form of the Buddhist doctrine. In these edicts the first importance is attributed to the duties of a man towards his parents, teachers, relatives, neighbours, and animals. The teaching is substantially the same as that of the *Siṅgālovāda Sutta*,[2] in which Gotama laid down what was practically the whole duty of the pious layman. Asoka frequently refers to 'the hither side and the further side' (*hida* and *palata*), and these terms have hitherto been taken to refer to present and future lives. There is no other possible reference to the doctrine of Rebirth in the edicts. These two words, however, quite probably refer, as an examination of the context[3] will show, not to present and future lives but to the hither and further sides of the stream of Conversion,[4] i.e. the transition from an egoistic life to one of self-forgetfulness.[5] The edicts also mention on several occasions Heaven (*svaga*; *sagga*, *svarga*),[6] but as in the Conversion Sermons of Gotama this term much more probably refers to the blissful state of enlightenment on earth than to a radiant future existence. For the rest the Emperor in his edicts explains repeatedly how he has striven to serve his subjects and all men in accordance with the precepts of the Buddha. Whatever in the Canon is inconsistent with the simple form of Buddhism disclosed expressly or implicitly in the Edicts of Asoka is probably a later accretion added to the original Dhamma[7] after the middle of the third century B.C.[8]

13. As regards the present narrative and the form adopted, nothing has been included which is not to be found in Pāli texts of great antiquity, taken directly or ultimately from the Sacred Canon, but sometimes through the medium of the great Commentaries.[9] In these ancient texts we have a continuous narrative of the life of Gotama

[1] IN 5 *a*; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; Ap. H 5, *Note*.

[2] Ch. 9 *b*; and Int. § 29. Compare the Stoic teaching on the relationships (*scheseis*) or duties to different classes (Int. § 103; E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, 1911, pp. 106, 169, 307, 424).

[3] See Hultzsch's edition of the Edicts of Asoka with a translation, published by the Govt. of India (1925); Vincent A. Smith's translation of the Edicts in his *Asoka*, 2nd ed. (1909), 3rd ed. (1920); A. C. Woolner's *Asoka* (1924), comprising the original Māgadhi texts with a complete glossary.

[4] Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note* and § 7. Cp. Ap. B *a* § 6 (7, *sotā-panna*); Ap. C *b* § 11 (370); Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (414); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14). See also Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [261] (*paraloka*).

[5] Ap. D (*Egoism*).

[6] Int. §§ 33, 48; Ap. C *a* § 2; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; cp. Ch. 14 *f* §§ 4 [2] n, 9 [401] n. Even if a future heaven is here meant this, being an end in itself, is inconsistent with the theory of rebirth. No lower stages (Ap. D *c* § 3 [15] n) from which return is possible are mentioned in the edicts.

[7] IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

[8] Ap. A 1 *b*.

[9] Int. § 14.

presented in historical order up to the point when the Dhamma[1] had been definitely formulated (Chs. 1–4) and the Saṃgha[2] securely founded (Chs. 5–7); and also of the last few months of the Teacher's life, the so-called period of the Great Decease[3] (Chs. 20–2). Further we have accounts, but no consecutive narrative, of the long period of some forty-five years lying between those points, the period of Gotama's ministry in which the organization of the Saṃgha was completed. This difference in the nature of the records is natural enough. A continuous historical narrative of the steps by which the organization of the Buddhist Society or Community (Saṃgha) was gradually advanced and completed during the founder's prolonged ministry would be far more lengthy and less readily comprehensible than the logically, or systematically, arranged account given by the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*,[4] in which the disciplinary regulations of the Society are presented in a classified order, according to the subjects, with brief narratives of the circumstances and occasions out of which they severally arose.

14. Belonging to the middle period also are most of the great occasional Discourses (*Suttas*) which constitute the *Sutta-Piṭaka*.[5] The Nikāyas or great divisions of the *Sutta-Piṭaka*, which are less systematized than the *Vinaya-Piṭaka*, show how the doctrine was spread among the clans,[6] whilst the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* shows how the rules were formulated. In the present narrative both the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* and *Sutta-Piṭaka* (the First and Second 'Baskets' or Collections) have been largely drawn on, but nothing has been included from the *Abhidhamma-Piṭaka*[7] (the Third Basket), which deals with the 'metaphysics', or rather the logical and psychological developments and intricacies, of Buddhism and not with the life of the Teacher. Of the *Sutta-Piṭaka* only the first four Nikāyas or Collections, viz. the *Dīgha*, *Majjhima*, *Saṃyutta*, and *Aṅguttara* Nikāyas, have been extensively drawn upon, since the fifth or *Khuddaka-Nikāya* bears all the signs of having been added at a comparatively late date. The Pāli Commentaries,[8] though they are necessary to an understanding of medieval Buddhism, have not been referred to except in their narrative portions, because they necessarily give later and scholastic interpretations and favour *Abhi-dhamma* metaphysics and mystery rather than the original opinions of the Buddha. For these last the

[1] Law or System. Ch. 4 § 6; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 2 [2], 10; see Int. § 11 (*teaching*); and Part I (title) n.

[2] Society or Community. Ch. 7 *a* § 17 n; Ch. 8 (A).

[3] *Mahā-Parinibbāna*: Ap. C *b*, *Note*.

[4] Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7] n; Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 8 *e*; Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. H 1, *Note*.

[5] Ap. A 1 (*Canon*); and Ch. 23 *b* § 8 (*Collections*).

[6] Int. § 158.

[7] Int. § 85 n; Ch. 23 *b* § 8 n; Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*; and Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [6] n.

[8] Int. §§ 13, 21 (*Sinhalese commentaries*); Ch. 3 § 3; Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 10 *c* (49) n; Ch. 10 *d*; Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [1] n; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 9 (529) n, 14 [91] n, 24 [1] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n; Ch. 18 *b* §§ 1 [161] n, 2; Ch. 22 *b* § 1 [1] n; Ap. H 1, *Note*; Ap. H 5, *Note*. Many commentarial passages doubtless are embedded in the Canon (IN 6).

main reliance must be placed on a comparison and classification of the earliest texts.

15. The period up to the definite formulation of the Dhamma and the secure foundation of the Saṃgha forms the subject of Part I; the middle period of development and ceaseless propaganda that of Part II; and the last twenty years of permanent residence in Sāvatthi, the Teacher's last tour and the Great Decease that of Part III. Those readers who desire to start from secure historical ground may care to begin with Chapters 8A and 8B at the commencement of Part II, which present an account of the structure, duties, and daily life of the Saṃgha as it existed during the period between the lifetime of Gotama and the reign of the Emperor Asoka, and which are based upon the firm ground of the ancient rules contained in the *Vinaya-Piṭaka*. Thence they may turn back to the chapters of Part I, which in a necessarily more hypothetical manner deal with the origins of the Saṃgha and the youth and enlightenment of its founder—subjects which have presented an ample field for the poetic fancy and wonder of the old chroniclers and commentators.

16. Part I comprises the fundamental portion of the subject-matter of the *Nidāna-kathā*,[1] or biographical Introduction to the Commentary on the *Jātaka*,[2] and the corresponding chapters of the Piṭakas, including the narrative introductory portion of the *Mahā-vagga* of the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* with the *Dhamma-cakka-ppavattana-Sutta*;[3] Part II comprises the period subsequent to this, covered by the brief but consecutive summary of Gotama's rainy season (*vassa*)[4] visits, or months of continuous residence for meditation and instruction, recounted in the *Madhurattha-vilasini*[5] or Commentary on the *Buddha vaṃsa*, of which the narrative has to be pieced together out of the Canon and more especially out of the *Sutta-Piṭaka*; and Part III comprises those portions of the Canon which narrate events occurring in Sāvatthi after Gotama had established his head-quarters in that city, and finally the bulk of the *Mahā-parinibbāna Sutta*.[6]

17. The subject-matter of the middle period has not been arranged in chronological order but has been classified, partly under the more essential features of the Saṃgha discipline, and partly under the clans[7] and their chief towns—Rājagaha, Vesāli, Kapilavatthu, Kosambi, and Sāvatthi—and their scattered townships and villages, in which Gotama pursued his ministry after the Enlightenment at Bodh-Gaya and the first beginnings of the Saṃgha at Benāres. Nor indeed are there great events to record in the middle period of the

[1] Int. § 1.
[2] Ap. F 1 *a* § 2.
[3] The First Sermon. Int. § 24; Ch. 5 *b* § 4.
[4] Ch. 8 *c*.
[5] Ch. 10 *b*; Ch. 10 *d*.
[6] Chs. 20–2.
[7] Int. § 158. The geographical or political rearrangement of the Suttas may tend to make the progress of the spread of the doctrine clearer than it appears in the Nikāyas of the *Sutta-Piṭaka* and help to ascertain the most widely accepted characteristics of Buddha's teaching.

Teacher's life save, firstly, the development of the multiple rules (the Vināya) governing the Saṃgha, and secondly, the carrying of the Law (the Dhamma) to the several kingdoms and peoples adjoining Magadha, in the Middle-land[1] of India, with, finally, the dissensions[2] breaking forth, perhaps necessarily, in the Saṃgha between the ascetic or Hinduizing section and the moderate party of the Middle Way[3] favoured by Gotama himself.

18. Dimly behind the immense journeys[4] of the Teacher we see the greater and lesser political powers of that time[5]—the powerful kingdom of Magadha,[6] centred at Rājagaha, on the south side of the Ganges, poised on the one hand against the kingdom of Kosala,[7] centred at Sāvatthi, on the north of the Ganges to the north-west of Magadha, with the subordinate principality of Benāres (*Bārāṇasī*),[8] and the small dependent republic of Kapilavatthu,[9] with the Sakyan nobility of which state the royal house of Kosala was anciently connected;[10] and on the other hand against the confederacy of the Vajjian[11] clans, centred at Vesāli, east of Kosala and also on the north of the Ganges. To the south of Kosala extended the small kingdom of Kosambi,[12] of which the capital was situated upon the northern bank of the river Jamna, not far from the junction of that river with the Ganges. Beyond Kosambi lay the western kingdom of Avanti,[13] centred at Ujjeni. Shortly before the close of Gotama's life the king of Kosala destroyed the Sakyan capital,[14] Gotama's birthplace. About the same time the rivalry between Magadha and Kosala broke out into open warfare and Sāvatthi was temporarily captured by the Magadhan king.[15] Shortly after Gotama's death the Vajjian Confederacy fell before the aggressive southern power.[16] This latter emerged, less than two hundred years later, as the Mauryan empire, comprising all these states and others, of which powerful and enduring dominion the founder was Chandragupta,[17] the younger contemporary of Alexander the Great, and of which the greatest ornament was the famous Emperor Asoka,[18] Gotama's devout follower.

19. If indeed Gotama taught to his listeners a doctrine of pure altruism, the intellectual condition of India, which accepted his teachings so widely during his lifetime and in the immediately succeeding generations, must have been singularly advanced at that period, which we are apt to consider as so early, but which in reality

[1] *Madhya-desha*; Pāli *majjhima-desa*. Ch. 1 § 2.
[2] Ch. 16; Ch. 19.
[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].
[4] IN 11.
[5] IN 12.
[6] Ch. 11; and Int. §§ 21, 123 n.
[7] Ch. 14.
[8] The capital of the Kāsi clan. Int. § 158 (3).
[9] The capital of the Sakkas or Sakyas. Ch. 13 *c*.
[10] Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (18) n.
[11] Ch. 12.
[12] Int. § 150. The capital of the Vaṃsa clan.
[13] Int. § 158 (14).
[14] Int. § 169 (iii).
[15] Int. § 170.
[16] Under Ajātasattu. Int. § 166.
[17] Int. § 173.
[18] IN 5 *a*; Ch. 13 *c* § 16.

was preceded by long ages of civilization and religious and philosophical thought.[1] It is more than probable, however, that, whatever may have been his actual teaching, the bulk of his followers were unable to dispense with the support either of a belief in heaven (*svarga*),[2] or of the doctrine of Rebirth,[3] and with the sanctions of a system of rewards and punishments, appealing to those individual interests and desires, the extinction or eradication of which was Gotama's special ideal and aim.[4] None the less, despite this qualification, there must have been in India at that period a society, widely spread over a vast territory, ready to accept generally an ethical code of disinterested and devoted social service, similar to and at least as lofty as that of the best form of Stoicism,[5] a philosophy which in Greece and Rome at a somewhat later period appealed only to the choicest and most highly educated spirits of the age.

20. Many features of Indian life are illustrated by the passages here selected from the Pāli Canonical Books. These present a complex picture of the general life of the Middle-land of northern India in the time of the Buddha, and are dealt with in Notes 13 and 14 at the end of this Introduction. The difficult question of the exact dates of the birth and death of the Buddha is discussed by T. W. Rhys Davids in his Introduction to vol. xi of the *Sacred Books of the East* (1900).[6] It is agreed on all hands that the greater part of Gautama's life falls into the sixth century before the Christian era.

21. The Pāli books mentioned above constitute the Buddhist Canon[7] of Ceylon.[8] According to the Ceylon tradition contained in the *Dipa-vaṃsa*[9] and *Mahā-vaṃsa*[10] the whole Canon was brought over to the island by Prince Mahinda,[11] the missionary son or younger brother of the Emperor Asoka,[12] in the middle of the third century before the Christian era, at the time when he converted the island to the Buddhist faith. The Books of the Canon were handed down orally from generation to generation together with the *Atthakathā* (Commentaries), the latter being in the Sinhalese language, till the time of King Abhaya Vatta-gāmini in the first half of the first

[1] Int. §§ 6, 126; IN 13; Ap. G 2 *c*.

[2] Int. § 33; Ch. 14 *a* § 7 n; Ap. C *a* § 2 (126); Ap. G 1 *c* § 7.

[3] Int. §§ 4, 7, 14, 22 n; IN 1–5; Ap. B (*Results of Action*); also Ch. 16 *a* §§ 4 [18] n, 5 [3] n.

[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*taṇhā*); Ap. C *b* § 9 (*heavenly life*); Ap. D *a* § 10, ii (*desire*); Ap. E *c* i § 7 [1] (*conceit*).

[5] IN 10.

[6] See also Vincent A. Smith's *Early History of India*, 3rd ed. (1914), and *Oxford History of India* (1920), p. 48.

[7] Ap. A 1; Ap. *G* 1 *c*, *Note*.

[8] Int. § 1; Ch. 22 *a* § 4 n; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5.

[9] Composed about A.D. 300. Ap. A 1 *b*. See Kern's *Manual of Indian Buddhism* (1896), p. 8.

[10] Composed a generation after Buddhaghosha. See Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India* (1917), p. 278.

[11] Int. § 118; Ap. A 1 *b*, *Note*.

[12] Ap. G 1 *c*. See Rhys Davids's Introduction to SBE, xi (1900), p. xxii; Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1877), p. 234; V. A. Smith, *Oxford History of India* (1920), pp. 98–9.

century before Christ when they were first committed to writing.[1] In the first half of the fifth century A.D. the great Buddhist scholar and commentator, Buddhaghosha,[2] arrived in the island from northern India and translated or re-translated the Commentaries[3] into Pāli. So much for the tradition. The Pāli books have been preserved in no other country. Buddhaghosha was born at Bodh-Gayā, near the scene of the Buddha's enlightenment. His translated and original Commentaries are still the most authoritative treatises on the Pāli Canonical Books. His famous contemporary, the Chinese Buddhist traveller Fa Hian,[4] travelled in northern India and Ceylon at this time collecting manuscript copies of the Books of the Canon belonging to both the *Hīna-yāna* (Low or Lesser Vehicle) and *Mahā-yāna* (Greater Vehicle) sects, sometimes conveniently though not altogether accurately called the Southern and Northern Schools[5] of Buddhism. In the seventh century A.D. the equally famous Chinese traveller, Hiuen Tsang,[6] travelled through northern India on a similar mission. Thus it is evident that the Buddhist Canon existed in India at this period in a written form. That Buddhaghosha brought with him from Magadha the Sacred Books of the Pāli Canon is possible whether he found copies of some or all of them existing in Ceylon or not. If he brought some or all of the present books[7] of

[1] See Kern's *Manual*, p. 8; Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 234; Rhys Davids's Introduction to SBE, xi, p. xxii.

[2] See Kern's *Manual*, pp. 8, 125; Rhys Davids, BBS (revised ed.), lviii ff.; RDB, p. 236; Sir Charles Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), iii. 28 ff.; Int. § 1; Ch. 4 § 9 n; Ch. 8 *c* § 1 [2]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9] n; Ch. 8 *j* §§ 1 [34] n, 5 [3] n; Ch. 11 *d* § 1 n; Ch. 12 e §§ 3 [1] n, 5 [6]; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 n; Ap. D *b*, *Note* and § 3; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [2] n; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10] n; Ap. H 5, *Note*.

[3] Int. § 14; IN 6 (*Canon*); Ch. 2 § 4: Ch. 4 § 9 n; Ch. 8 *a* [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [15] n; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [6] n; Ch. 17 *e* [5] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 n; Ch. 21 § 11 [7] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 12 n; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2. The archaic Sinhalese or Elu (RDBI, p. 155; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 21, n) of the ancient commentaries was akin to the vernaculars upon which canonical Pāli was based and approached Mahārāshṭrī Prākrit (Int. § 159 n; for authorities see Eliot, *H. and B.*, iii, p. 12). Modern Sinhalese is akin to Pāli.

[4] See Kern's *Manual*, p. 125; A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), pp. 156, 158, 226; Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, pp. 243–4; V. A. Smith, *Oxford History of India*, pp. 153–6.

[5] The distinction is practically that between the Pāli books and the Sanskrit Buddhist books. Post-Vedic Sanskrit, the philosophic and universal language of the Upanishads, gradually ousted Pāli from literature (see RDBI, ch. viii). The Ceylon Books in Pāli are the sole representatives of the Canon of the *Hīna-yāna*, or 'Low' Vehicle. The Books of the *Mahā-yāna* or 'Great' Vehicle partly survive in Sanskrit, Tibetan, and Chinese (cp. Kern's *Manual*, pp. 3–6; T. W. Rhys Davids's lectures on *Buddhism, its History and Literature*, 2nd ed. 1926, pp. 204–8) and greatly emphasize the miraculous and metaphysical sides of Buddhism. The Mahāyānists in stressing the fundamental doctrine of self-sacrifice attributed a minor importance to the Buddha himself in as much as his Buddhahood implied his own final attainment of bliss, and they attributed a loftier importance to the Bodhisattas (Wisdom-Beings) who refrain from the bliss of Buddhahood in order that they may influence from the Heavens the well-being of mankind (cp. Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, pp. 166–7; and A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, Pt. III, for Mahāyānist developments). Int. §§ 22 n, 23, 87; IN 8 *c* (*Mahāyāna*); Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1] n; Ap. D *a* and *b*; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [13] n. Cp. Ap. B *b* § 4 [12].

[6] See V. A. Smith, *Oxford History of India*, p. 168.

[7] The *Sāsana-vaṃsa* attributes to him the re-translation of the whole Canon

the Canon in Pāli from the Middle-land of northern India this would imply the possibility that portions of the books are of a considerably later date than that of the Emperor Asoka and the missionary prince Mahinda. The Pāli[1] tongue is a highly elaborated literary language developed from the Prākrit vernaculars of middle northern India, including Kosalese and Magadhese, in which latter dialect the Edicts of Asoka[2] are written and with which language no doubt the Buddha was well acquainted during the long years of his ministry in Magadha.[3] The vernaculars of the numerous States in which Gotama worked and taught were doubtless closely similar since we hear of no difficulty encountered by him in teaching in any of these.

22. The authenticity of the Ceylon[4] Canon is borne out both by internal and external evidence. The internal evidence is particularly strong. There is practically no reference[5] in any of the Books of the Canon to any event outside northern India, or later than the immediate times of the Buddha. The political, social, and economic life depicted bears practically no traces of other countries or times. The historical references are very frequent and equally consistent; the books make no mention of the great Buddhist Emperor Asoka (third century B.C.) or his contemporaries. The whole picture presented by the books is completely Indian, and except in regard to the development of the miraculous[6] and the metaphysical,[7] is consistently early Buddhist in tone.[8] The Buddhist monks of Ceylon refrain scrupulously from any addition betraying a Sinhalese atmosphere. As regards external evidence the Edicts of Asoka,[9] which have been rediscovered and interpreted to the world during the last hundred years, strongly support the authenticity of the Ceylon Canon. Asoka avows himself a follower of the Buddha and sets forth the main principles of the Dhamma, which closely correspond with those laid down for laymen by Gotama in the *Siṅgālovāda Sutta*[10] of the *Dīgha Nikāya* in the *Sutta Piṭaka*. The emperor also commends a list of texts which have been sufficiently satisfactorily identified[11] with portions of the Ceylon Canon. The remarkable sculptures on the gates and railings of the

from Sinhalese into Pāli; see Kern's *Manual*, p. 125 n. It may be concluded that he collated all available material, Sinhalese and Pāli, to produce the authorized version.

[1] Ap. A 1 *a* (*Anāgatha-Vaṃsa*); and Part I (title) n. Cp. KM, pp. 7–8; RDBI, p. 211. Pāli is the standard literary language which was developed from the dialects of the Middle-land, chiefly Kosalese and Magadhese, as first the Vedic and subsequently the perfected Sanskrit literary languages were developed from the dialects of the north-west of India.

[2] IN 5 *a*.

[3] Int. §§ 18, 123.

[4] Int. § 1.

[5] Cp. RDBI, p. 176.

[6] IN 8 *b*; Int. § 94; Ap. I *b* (*Magic*).

[7] IN 8 *c* (*idealism*); Ap. I *b* (*Mysticism*); also Ap. B *c*, *Note*; and Ch. 4 § 5 n (*Abhidhamma*).

[8] Cp. RDBI, pp. 174–5. The animism and supernaturalism which Buddha lifted for a moment seem quickly to have descended again (IN 8).

[9] IN 5 *a*; Int. § 53.

[10] Ch. 9 *b*; and Int. § 29.

[11] See RDBI, pp. 169–70; V. A. Smith's *Asoka* (2nd ed. 1909), pp. 153–4, and *Oxford History of India* (1920), p. 109; and the text (Bhābrā Edict) in Hultzsch's edition of the edicts. Ap. G 1 *c* § 1.

great stupas at Bharhut and Sāñchī[1] depict scenes easily identified with events mentioned in the same Canon, e.g. the sale by Prince Jeta of land to Anāthapiṇḍika for the building of the famous Vihāra (rest-house or monastery) at Sāvatthi and also many scenes from the Jātaka (Book of Previous Births of the Buddha).[2] These sculptures were executed about the end of the third century B.C.[3] Inscriptions found on the same monuments mention the Piṭakas, the five Nikāyas, and the Suttas,[4] the chief and most characteristic divisions of the Ceylon Canonical Books. In the Pāli classic, *Milinda-Pañha* (Inquiry of Milinda),[5] a treatise composed in northern India about the first century A.D., all the texts quoted from the Canon (though these may have been added later)[6] are drawn from the Pāli books included in the Ceylon Canon. Again, despite the radical differences between the Chinese and the Pāli Buddhist Canons, their resemblances are notable and they have certain texts in common, e.g. the *Dhammapada* verses and *Pāṭimokkha* rules and similarly the *Dhūtanga*[7] rules, and the evidence shows that these have their point of origin[8] in northern India, not in Ceylon. Thus the presumption is that since these portions of the Pāli Canon are clearly traceable to an origin in northern India,[9] the bulk of the Ceylon Canon may equally be attributable to that source, as its supporters claim. It may therefore be said that the external evidence in favour of the Indian origin and great antiquity of the Pāli Canon is very considerable, and the internal evidence is still more convincing.

23. Apart from the great series of the *Sacred Books of the East* and the publications of the Pāli Text Society, and the late Professor T. W. Rhys Davids's *Dialogues of the Buddha* (*Dīgha Nikāya*) and *Buddhist Birth Stories* (Jātaka Introduction; Sacred Books of the Buddhists, vol. i), to which all workers on the Pāli Canon must be indebted, the editor of the present work owes special gratitude to the late Henry Clarke Warren's *Buddhism in Translations* (Harvard Oriental Series), a wide and suggestive selection of Hīnayāna[10] texts. Other debts are acknowledged[11] in the footnotes to the Introduction.

[1] IN 5 *a*; Int. §§ 70, 118; Ch. 10 *a* § 3 n. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [11] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (1).
[2] Cp. RDBI, p. 198; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 n.
[3] See RDBI, p. 288. Incidentally the scenes from the Jātaka show that the theory of rebirth or transmigration was fully incorporated in the popular Buddhist tradition before the close of the third century B.C. (Int. § 19; Ap. B, *Results of Action*).
[4] See RDBI, pp. 167–9; KM, p. 2; A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 20.
[5] Int. § 36.
[6] See KM, p. 9; cp. Keith's *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 20.
[7] Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [13].
[8] See SBE, x, pp. lviii–lx; *Vin. Piṭ.*, Oldenberg, i, pp. xliii–xlviii.
[9] The disappearance of the Pāli Canon from northern India may be attributed mainly to the constantly increasing use of Sanskrit in India and to the metaphysical subtleties of that philosophical language, which had scarcely a footing among the Sinhalese clergy. Int. § 21 n. Cp. Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*altruism*); Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 n.
[10] Int. § 21 n.
[11] Paul Carus's small work, *The Gospel of the Buddha*, contains a suggestive selection, but would have been more useful, from the point of view of the present

My greatest debt is owed to my wife, who has been my secretary throughout the long period required for the final draft of this book, and whose kindness and self-forgetfulness, skill and courage have made it possible for me to carry on a work, planned and sketched in health, but composed and dictated in darkness.

The following is a list of English translations of those Pāli books upon which chiefly the present work is based:

The Vinaya-Piṭaka, tr. by T. W. Rhys Davids and H. Oldenberg ('Vinaya Texts', SBE, vols. xiii, xvii, and xx).
The Dīgha-Nikāya, tr. by T. W. Rhys Davids ('Dialogues of the Buddha', 3 vols.; SBB, ii–iv).
The Majjhima-Nikāya, tr. by Lord Chalmers ('Further Dialogues of the Buddha', 2 vols.; SBB, v–vi).
The Saṃyutta-Nikāya, tr. by Mrs. Rhys Davids and F. L. Woodward ('The Book of the Kindred Sayings', 5 vols.; PTS).
The Aṅguttara-Nikāya, tr. by F. L. Woodward and E. M. Hare ('The Book of the Gradual Sayings', 5 vols.; PTS).
The Jātaka, Nidāna-kathā (Pāli Introduction), tr. by T. W. Rhys Davids ('Buddhist Birth Stories', 1 vol.).
The Dhammapada, tr. by F. Max Müller (SBE, x, Part I).
The Sutta-Nipāta, tr. by V. Fausböll (SBE, x, Part II).
The Buddhavaṃsa, Commentary, tr. by the Rev. Richard Morris (PTS, 1882).

Immense industry and learning have been devoted by scholars of different nations to the study of Buddhism, but only a small part of their attention, rightly or wrongly, has been directed to that which is the central problem of the present work, the Buddhism of the Buddha.

work, if it had been limited to Hīnayāna texts, and if he had distinguished precisely between text and elucidatory additions.

INTRODUCTORY NOTES

NOTE 1

REBIRTH, OR TRANSMIGRATION,[1] AND THE FIRST SERMON;[2] RECURRENCE, OR COLLECTIVE KARMA (THE WORD *PONO-BBHAVIKĀ*)[3]

24. The core of Gotama's teaching[4] is to be found in the First Sermon, the *Dhammacakkappavatana-Sutta*,[5] in which he lays down the Four Noble Truths including the famous Noble Eightfold Path.[6] In this famous discourse there is no phrase or word which can be claimed as supporting the doctrine of Rebirth except possibly the word *ponobbhavikā*[7] which is usually translated as 'causing re-existence or rebirth'. Thus translated this word, used as an epithet of *taṇhā* (thirst, craving), is so startlingly irrelevant in the sermon that it would appear to have been added by a later hand.[8] Its omission makes no difference to the closely woven argument establishing the origin of all sorrow in selfish desire; and the phrase itself is entirely unsupported here by any argument. It implies the motive of self-salvation and that self-interested desire which is declared by Buddha in the rest of the discourse to be the root and cause of all the sorrow in the world. The rest of the discourse implies, and other discourses of the Buddha definitely state, that there is no permanent individual soul or *attan*,[9] and this phrase, taken literally, states the opposite.

25. The synthesis of these opposing tenets[10] is sometimes stated

[1] IN 8 n; Int. §§ 19, 88, 92; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6] n; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] n; Ap. B *a* (*Karma*).

[2] Ch. 5 *b*.

[3] Int. § 8; Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ch. 9 *a* §§ 11, 14 n.

[4] Int. § 10; IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 1; and Int. §§ 6, 16, 30.

[6] The Truths and the Path are as follows:

(1) that all individual life is sorrowful;
(2) that the cause of sorrow is (individualistic) desire;
(3) that the eradication of (individualistic) desire is the destruction of sorrow;
(4) that the road to the destruction of sorrow, to the eradication of (individualistic) desire, to the bliss of *Nibbāna* (Extinction of Self)—the Middle Way, avoiding self-torture and luxurious self-indulgence, both of which are vain—is the Noble Eightfold Path, to wit, right outlook, right wish, right word, right deed, right effort, right way of livelihood, right mindfulness (*sammā sati*), and right rapture or deep meditation (*sammā samādhi*). Ch. 5 *b* §§ 4, 10; Ap. G 1 *a* (*Truths*); and Ap. F 2 *d*; also Int. §§ 104, 106 n.

[7] IN 5 *b* n; Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ch. 9 *a* § 11; Ch. 20 § 2 (5); Ap. D *a* § 1; Ap. E *b* § 2 [6]; and Int. § 55. Cp. Ch. 4 § 16 (*puna-bbhava*); Ap. A 2 *a* (7); also Ap. B *c* § 1 (2) (*builder*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*burden*). 'Causing rebirth' implies that rebirth is a misfortune. In the threefold analysis of *taṇhā* which follows immediately in the sermon the phrase *vibbhava-taṇhā* is usually translated as 'craving for a higher or divine existence'. This at least is inconsistent with the idea that rebirth is necessarily a misfortune, though not with the idea that craving is contagious and deplorable.

[8] IN 6 (*Canon*).

[9] IN 3 *a*; Int. § 36. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 5 (*khandhā*); and Int. § 38.

[10] Int. § 36 (*Milinda-pañhā*); Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note* (*belief*).

to be one of the mysteries[1] of Buddhism; but the reconciliation savours more of his metaphysical successors than of Gotama himself, who declared that he did not deal with metaphysical[2] questions but with the extinction of sorrow[3] and with the Eightfold Path of conduct.[4] The reconciliation is supposed to consist in the assumption that whereas the individual soul disappears at the close of this life, its aggregate of actions or Karma (*kamma*) causes the birth of a new individual, and so on—as a flame[5] is transmitted—until Karma ceases. This doubtless shows that Buddha taught that all actions have their inevitable effects,[6] but it is not established that he himself assumed that the aggregate of one individual's actions miraculously creates upon his death a new individual to bear the consequences. That his later followers endeavoured to reconcile his twofold doctrine of no-permanent-soul[7] and the moral responsibility[8] of the individual for his actions, with the Hindu view of the transmigration of the soul, is probable enough. In the Hindu view the same individual acts and suffers in different lives; the usual modern Buddhist view is the same; but the strict original Buddhist view is altruistic, the actor being one, and the ultimate sufferer or beneficiary another, individual. Allowing that the reconciliation is later, it may be assumed that Buddha, teaching the doctrines of no-permanent-soul, moral responsibility, and altruism,[9] taught a doctrine of altruistic responsibility or collective Karma,[10] according to which every action, word, and thought[11] of the individual, transient though he be, brings forth inevitably consequences to be suffered or enjoyed by others in endless succeeding generations. The sanctions of such a doctrine of altruism appear to be as impressive as those based upon the individualistic doctrine of personal immortality.

26. If, however, the epithet *pono-bbhavikā*, applied to *tanhā* (thirst, desire, selfishness), be translated as 'tending to arise again, repeating itself, recurring' (that is, causing the rebirth of itself, not of the individual), it is fully in accord with the doctrine of altruistic responsibility. If each selfish grasping act ceased with itself, and had no consequences, it would be ill enough; but each such action, word, or thought is endlessly fertile in its kind, and the idea of these endless repercussions[12] throughout the generations of men is an essential part of Gotama's doctrine. It would be natural therefore to stress

[1] Int. § 27. See RDB, pp. 100–2.
[2] Int. § 27; Ap. G 1 *a* (iii); Ap. G 2 *a*.
[3] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6, *cessation*).
[4] Ap. G 1 *a* (i, *Truths*).
[5] Ap. B *b* § 2.
[6] Ap. B *b* § 3 [5] (*Karma*).
[7] IN 3 *a*.
[8] Int. §§ 8, 42; Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [3] n; Ap. B *b* § 1 (*evil actions*). Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 1 (*virtuous*); Ap. E *c* ii (*self-training*); Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note* (*moral forces*).
[9] Int. § 3; Ap. F 1 *a* (*dāna*); Ap. F 1 *b* (*mettā*); Ap. F 2 *b* (*Brahma-vihārā*).
[10] Ap. B *b*; Ap. G 2 *a*; also Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [viii].
[11] Ap. B *b*, *Note*. Ap. H 1 § 4; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 n.
[12] Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [5] (*increases*), § 4 [17] (*increase*). Cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [3] n; Ap. B *a* § 4 [1] n (*vipāka*); Ap. B *b* § 1 (*evil actions*); Ap. D *a* § 4 (335), *wide-spreading*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4 (*fruit*).

that idea by the application of this epithet to desire (*taṇhā*), though in this sense it might equally be applied to love or self-denial.

27. If the word *pono-bbhavikā* be translated as 'recurring, self-perpetuating', i.e. causing the renewal of its own existence, not another individual's existence, then the translation certainly corresponds with actual fact, and apparently with the etymology of the word, meaning literally 'concerned with again-being'.[1] The ever renewed existence of craving, begotten by itself, is clear: the 'renewal of existence', presumed by the doctrine of transmigration, is an assumption of that metaphysics which Gotama deprecated,[2] and implies either (*a*) a transfer of the *attan* (soul, self), the existence of which was denied[3] by Gotama; or (*b*) an earlier and more orthodox doctrine, viz. a transfer of *kamma* (accumulated merit or demerit, *karma*) at the time of death from one individual to another newly born[4]—no proof of which mystery[5] is ever attributed to Gotama, though his intellect probed to the quick all that was submitted to it, and he declared that he had 'preached the truth without making any distinction between exoteric and esoteric doctrine' and had 'no such thing as the closed fist of a teacher who keeps some things back',[6] and stated repeatedly that everyone could learn the truth for himself in this life.[7]

28. That desire perpetuates itself from one generation to another of mankind is clear, and Gotama can scarcely have failed to be aware of it. That he expressed the idea in the term *pono-bbhavikā*, thus interpreted, seems not improbable. One of the beautiful sayings attributed to him is 'Never in this world does hatred cease through hatred; hatred ceases through love; this is always its nature',[8] i.e. hatred causes hatred, love causes love. If one adds to this the plain truth that these feelings continue beyond the individual's life, to succeeding generations, one has the true doctrine of collective Karma or *kamma*[9]—mankind bearing the sorrowful burden of the sins of its desirous units together with the transforming hopes of those who can transcend the self—which would seem to be the real *dhamma* (*dharma*, law) of Gotama, the foundation on which so much that is extraneous to his teaching was constructed in later ages.[10]

29. It is noticeable that the subject of transmigration receives no mention whatsoever either in the famous *Tevijja Sutta*,[11] in which Gotama is represented as showing the way to a state of union with the Divine (*Brahman*),[12] or in the equally famous 'comprehensive religious talk',[13] summarizing the faith, and repeated by him in every town and

[1] The word may mean 'concerning itself with re-existence'. Cp. *akusala dhammā ponobhavikā saddarā āyatim jāti-jarā-maraṇiyā*, 'evil thoughts concerned with re-birth, full of fears, concerned with future individual-existence decay and death' (*Dīgha-Nik.*, p. 57). The passage is differently translated in *Dials of B.*, iii, p. 52.

[2] Int. § 25. [3] IN 3 *a*. [4] Int. § 36 (*Milinda-pañha*).

[5] Int. § 25. [6] Ch. 21; SBE, xi, p. 36. [7] Ap. E *c* § 1.

[8] *Dhammapada*, verse 5; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5); Ap. G 2 *a* § 10.

[9] Ap. B *b*. [10] IN 8. [11] *Dīgha-Nik.* 13; Int. § 37.

[12] Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [78]. [13] Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20].

village during his last tour. Nor is there mention of transmigration in the well-known *Siṅgālovāda Sutta*,[1] which lays down the duties of laymen, though in the last line of the list there is mention of 'the way to heaven'.[2] 'Heaven' similarly is mentioned in the Conversion Sermons,[3] but not transmigration. Nor is rebirth referred to in the crucial passages relating to the essentials of the Dhamma.[4] Moreover, in the *Questions of Milinda*,[5] the orthodoxy of which is undisputed though the book is extra-canonical, having been written in or about the first century of the Christian era, the Buddhist sage Nāgasena is represented as stating categorically that 'it is not the same name-and-form (*nāma-rūpa*, individual) that is born into the next existence',[6] and 'the new birth takes place without anything transmigrating', which interpreted plainly and without mystery, is tantamount to stating that the effects of actions pass on but the individual soul does not.

NOTE 2

REBIRTH[7] AND (*a*) THE CONVERSION SERMONS; (*b*) THE INSTRUCTIONS TO THE FIRST MISSIONERS

(*a*) *The Conversion Sermons*;[8] *'heaven'* (*the word* sagga)[9]

30. In the Conversion Sermons is probably to be found the nucleus and the purest form of the Buddha's own teaching, to be distinguished from the developments of his later followers. The greatest of these sermons was the First Sermon, delivered at the Hermitage (*Isi-patana*)[10] in the Deer-park (*Miga-dāya*) near Benares (*Bārāṇasī*), the famous *Dhammacakkappavattana-Sutta* (Sermon of the Starting of the Wheel of the Law),[11] which sets forth the Four Noble Truths and the Middle Way or Noble Eightfold Path. The First Sermon converted Gotama's five original followers—Koṇḍañña, Vappa, Bhaddiya, Mahānāma, and Assaji. After these the first convert was the rich merchant's son Yasa,[12] in Benares. The number of converts in Benares soon amounted to sixty.[13] Thereafter came the important

[1] Ch. 9 *b*; and Int. §§ 12, 22, 32, 51 n, 53, 65, 74 n, 134 n.
[2] Ch. 9 *b* § 9; and Int. § 33.
[3] IN 2 *a*.
[4] Ap. G 1 *b*.
[5] Int. § 36.
[6] Ap. B *b* § 1 (*nāma-rūpa*).
[7] Int. § 19. For instances in which the subject of rebirth is ignored in expositions of Buddha's doctrine see also Int. § 84; Ch. 8 *h* §§ 1 [14] n, 2 (17) n; Ch. 9 *a* § 14 n; Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [11] n; Ch. 20 § 2 [6] n; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3] n; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 (*prevails*).
[8] Int. §§ 11, 29, 55; also Ch. 6 *a* §§ 4 [5] n, 11 [2] n; Ch. 9 *b* § 10 n; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [3] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [208] n. With the conversion sermons may be classed discourses leading to arahatship; Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [8] n. In the discourse which converted the Kālāmans (Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [2] n) bliss in the next world 'if it exists' is offered as an uncertain inducement.
[9] Int. § 101; IN 6 (*Canon*) n; Ch. 10 *a* § 7 n; Ap. C *a* § 2 (126). The idea of *sagga* is older than Buddhism; Ch. 14 *f* § 13 [4] n.
[10] The spot now known as Sārnāth; Ch. 5 *a* § 9.
[11] Int. § 24.
[12] Ch. 6 *a* § 2.
[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 14.

conversions[1] of Uruvela-Kassapa[2] sometimes identified with Mahā-Kassapa, who succeeded to the leadership after Gotama's death, and Sāriputta[3] and Moggallāna,[4] the two friends who during their lifetime were nearest to the Buddha in intellectual sympathy. Among the most important names after these great converts come King Bimbisāra,[5] Anāthapiṇḍika,[6] the great merchant of Sāvatthi and chief lay follower of the Buddha, and Gotama's father, Suddhodana,[7] with other Sakyans,[8] members of Gotama's own clan in Kapilavatthu, including his faithful cousin and personal attendant Ānanda.[9] Among other converts come the Brāhman student Vāseṭṭha and his friend Bhāradvāja,[10] the householder Siṅgāla,[11] Bhāradvāja the farmer,[12] Vaccha the sophist,[13] Siṃha the general,[14] and Subhadda the last convert.[15] In none of the discourses recorded as responsible for these conversions is there anything to establish that Gotama accepted the doctrine of rebirth or transmigration. The same may be said of his instructions to the first missioners,[16] whom he sent forth from Benares when the total number of his followers was sixty; and of the famous Fire Sermon[17] preached by him to the multitude on a hillside near Gayā by night in sight of one of those jungle fires that creep along the spurs of the great Vindhyan mountain range, which shut off the mysterious Southern Country from the inhabitants of the great Indian plain; and of the 'comprehensive religious discourse'[18] so often delivered by him during his last journey; and finally of the solemn last words[19] in which the dying Teacher addressed his followers. Even in their present form, as handed down in the tradition, these taken as a whole lay no emphasis upon, if indeed they can be said to refer to, the doctrine of rebirth.

31. The account of the conversion of Yasa is given in the *Mahā-Vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, and in the *Nidāna-kathā* of the Introduction to the *Jātaka*.[20] In these narratives the account of Gotama's address to Yasa is given in what is evidently a systematized summary covering all such addresses delivered by the Buddha on similar occasions. The sermon is called a 'graduated discourse (*anupubbi-kathā*)',[21] and then more specifically described as a discourse on giving or charity (*dāna-kathā*), a discourse on virtuous action (*sīla-kathā*), and a discourse on 'heaven' (*sagga-kathā*). As regards the

[1] In *Ang. Nik.* I. xiv (PTS, i, pp. 23–6) is given a list attributed to the Buddha himself, enumerating his chief converts, men and women. Ch. 10 *c*.
[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 2.
[3] Int. § 98; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 16, 18; Ch. 11 *c* § 14 n.
[4] Ch. 7 *a* §§ 16, 18; Ch. 13 *b* § 6 n.
[5] Ch. 7 *a* §§ 11–12.
[6] Ch. 10 *a*.
[7] Ch. 7 *b* § 1.
[8] Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 13 *c*.
[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ap. A 1 *b* (8); Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [3].
[10] Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [81] n.
[11] Ch. 9 *b*.
[12] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2].
[13] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).
[14] Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. B *b* § 3.
[15] Ch. 22 *b* §§ 16 n, 20. See also Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*).
[16] Ch. 6 *b*, and IN 2 *b*.
[17] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2].
[18] Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20].
[19] Ch. 22.
[20] Ch. 6 *a* § 1.
[21] Cp. Int. § 53 (*comprehensive discourse*).

first part of this 'graduated discourse' the word *dāna*[1] meaning literally 'giving' is equivalent to altruism, that self-sacrificing charity which is the theme of the *Jātaka*[2] and is the chief of the Ten Perfections[3] illustrated in the life of the Bodhisat Sumedha,[4] the first sage in the final series of the earthly previous-existences of the Buddha according to the *Buddha-vaṃsa*, and is moreover the basis of the Four Noble Truths.[5]

32. The second part of the 'graduated discourse' to Yasa deals with right or virtuous conduct (*sīla*)[6] which is in effect the pursuing of the Fourth Noble Truth or Noble Eightfold Path. This virtuous conduct is set forth in a detailed manner for the guidance of laymen in the *Siṅgālovāda Sutta*,[7] and is described more generally as *Brahmacariya*[8] or holy living, and again as the four *Brahma-vihārā*[9] or holy attitudes of mind, namely friendliness or love (*mettā*), pity (*karuṇā*), sympathy with joy (*muditā*), and serenity (*upekkhā*), all of them being characteristically altruistic.

33. The last section of the 'graduated discourse' treats of 'heaven', but the word *sagga*[10] which is translated as 'heaven' may mean and should mean the peace of enlightenment, nirvāna (*nibbāna*), the extinction of all selfish desire here on earth during this present life,[11] referred to in the Fourth Noble Truth of the First Sermon. This contention is borne out by the words which in the narrative immediately follow the division of the discourse into three parts; these words are 'the misery, worthlessness, and painfulness of desires[12] and the joy in renunciation', words which have no relation to a transcendent 'Heaven', but plainly refer to a present state of mind, serenity.

(*b*) *The Instructions to the First Missioners*;[13] *the spirits or gods* (*the word* devatā)[14]

34. The account of Gotama's instructions to the first Buddhist missioners is a very remarkable document. In the first place it is to be noticed that it contains no word regarding Saṃsāra[15] (rebirth) and (personal) Karma. The goal to which Gotama points is freedom[16] from the temptations arising from the bodily senses[17] and from spiritual desires,[18] not freedom from the terror of rebirth. The doctrine[19]

[1] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. [2] Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 n. [3] Ap. F 2 *a*.
[4] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*. [5] Cp. Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-transcendence*).
[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 6; Ap. H 4, *Note* (*Sīla*); Ap. H 4 *a*.
[7] Int. § 29. [8] Ch. 5 *a* § 10. [9] Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [207]; Ap. F 2 *b*.
[10] Int. §§ 11, 12, 19, 29, 48; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. C *a* § 2 (126); Ap. C *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [1] n; Ch. 17 *a* [4] n.
[11] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 and Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] (*Peace*); Ap. C *b* § 4 [13]. In any case a transcendent 'Heaven' as an end or object is altogether opposed to the doctrine of transmigration.
[12] Or, passions. *Kāma* more precisely means sensuous pleasure; Ap. D *a* § 1 n.
[13] Int. §§ 30, 55, 72; Ch. 6 *b*.
[14] IN 8 *a*. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 9, last verse.
[15] Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*). [16] Ap. D *a* § 6 (*vimutti*). [17] Ap. D *a* § 9 § (*rūpā*).
[18] Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] (*spirits*); Ap. C *b* § 9 (*heavenly life*). [19] Ch. 5 *b*.

(*Dhamma*, Law) which it inculcates is that of the Four Noble Truths, which reveal the origin of all sorrow in the desires of a transient Self, and show the path leading to the annihilation of selfish desire by due activity in thought, deed, and word.[1] In effect these instructions to the first missioners merely say that having themselves attained freedom by the subjugation of the passions they should carry this freedom to all who are ready to receive it. The two bases of the Dhamma are thus selflessness and helpfulness. The whole elaborate metaphysical superstructure, built up later upon this, fades away.[2]

35. (i) In the text as we have it the missioners are bidden to go forth and teach for the benefit of 'gods and men'. The word translated as 'gods' is much more accurately rendered as 'spirits' (*devā*, bright spirits;[3] *devatā*, divinities). Gotama's own attitude towards the hierarchy of Hindu gods is shown in the first part of the *Tevijja Sutta*[4] in which he demonstrates that it is impossible to have any knowledge of the nature of Brahmā,[5] and that therefore any attempt to attain union of spirit with Brahmā is beyond the capacity of any religious teacher. In the last part of the Sutta,[6] however, he lays down that through the practice of the four *Brahma-vihārā*,[7] namely loving-kindness,[8] pity,[9] sympathetic joy,[10] and serenity,[11] it is possible to draw near to Brahman;[12] and unless the two parts of the Sutta are entirely contradictory, the Brahman of the latter part must be the universal impersonal divine spirit (*Brahman*), the *Param-ātman*[13] of the Vedāntists, and not the personal Hindu deity of whom he had declared that no knowledge was possible and with whom all attempts at union were consequently futile. (ii) As regards the views of the Buddha's followers after his death, the *Nidāna-kathā* of the Introduction to the *Jātaka* shows the great gods of Hinduism and other similar deities as inferior[14] to, and as attending upon, the Buddha, and the *Mahā-Vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka* shows them in the same subor-

[1] Int. § 8.
[2] IN 8 (*Hinduization*).
[3] Cp. SBE, xi, p. 45, note by Rhys Davids; IN 8 *a*; Ch. 1 § 9 [59] n; Ch. 3 § 1; Ch. 4 § 15 n; Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [3] n; Ch. 18 *e* § 1; Ap. I *a* (*Anāgatha Vaṃsa*); Ap. C *b* §§ 2, 9 (*dibba*); Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii); Ap. E *c* i § 2; Ap. F 1 *b* § 7 n. Cp. also *devaputta* (Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [5] n).
[4] IN 10 n; Int. § 37; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8.
[5] Int. §§ 69, 93 ii; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n; and Ap. E *c* i § 9 (last verse).
[6] Ap. G 2 *a* § 2.
[7] Divine attitudes (literally abodes). Ap. B *b*, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *b*; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14, *veil*).
[8] Benevolence or goodwill.
[9] Sympathy with sorrow.
[10] Sympathy with joy.
[11] Tranquillity.
[12] It is convenient to use the form *Brahman* for the impersonal and *Brahmā* for the personal deity.
[13] Int. §§ 37, 178 (*Brahman*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14] n; and Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note* (*Paramatta*). Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [2] (*Supreme*); Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [8] (*Self*); Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [206] n; Ap. C *b* § 11 (374); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*). Cp. also Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1912), p. 57; A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), p. 71. See the position of the impersonal Preas Prohm (*Brahman*) in the Hīnayāna Buddhism of modern Cambodia (J. B. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism*, 1928, p. 204).
[14] Int. § 69; Ch. 4 § 4 [71] n. Cp. RDBI, p. 219.

dinate character.[1] Prayer to the gods would have been entirely superfluous, since a man could attain Nirvāna only by his own exertions.[2] In the present instructions to the missioners the gods or spirits are open to teaching by the simple missioners of the Dhamma. To attain the rank of Buddhahood it was necessary for the gods to become men;[3] as men alone could they rise to the ultimate height of Enlightenment, Arahatship.[4] In the *Mahā-Vagga* the most prominent supernatural figure is that of Māra,[5] the Tempter, who clearly is a personification of those desires, grossly or more subtly selfish, which naturally arise in the human mind, and the eradication of which is the object of the teaching of the Four Noble Truths. The lower ranks of spirits haunting the earth[6] figure also in the Book of the Great Decease,[7] and are plainly survivals of ancient rustic animistic beliefs. (iii) That Gotama denied the existence of beings in the spiritual world does not seem provable; it is much more probable that he left such a question aside as being beyond his province, which was concerned neither with such questions nor with metaphysics,[8] but with the Four Truths and the eradication of selfish desire.[9] The whole tendency of his teaching was to secure emancipation[10] of the mind from superfluous burdens and superstitions, and to concentrate upon the plain duty of unselfish activity. The phrase 'spirits and men' in the mouth of Gotama perhaps means 'all classes of intelligent beings, whether invisible (if any) or visible', and such a phrase, at the opening of the career of a Hindu reformer, seems not improbable.

NOTE 3

REBIRTH[11] AND (*a*) THE 'THREE CHARACTERISTICS'; (*b*) THE BUDDHA'S LAST WORDS

(*a*) *The Three Characteristics of Individuality; the word* an-attā[12]

36. In a famous formula[13] the Buddha characterizes all individuals (*saṃkhārā*, composites; *dhammā*, beings subject to the law of nature)[14]

[1] 'Buddhism neither denies nor affirms the existence of gods . . . all gods pass away as we do . . . the saint (*Arahat*) who has worked out his salvation, and above all the Buddha, is superior to any god': Subhadra Bhikshu, *A Buddhist Catechism* (1890), p. 78. Their anomalous position as unneeded subordinates reflects their late and apologetic introduction into Buddhism from older animistic cults (IN 8 *a*).

[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 8 (*not dependent on others*); Ap. E *c* ii § 1 (*by yourselves*).

[3] *Buddhist Birth-Stories*, ed. Mrs. Rhys Davids, pp. 147–9 (Ch. 1 §§ 2–3). See also Ap. A 2 *c*.

[4] See SBE, xi. pp. 162–3. Ap. D *c*; cp. Ap. C *a* § 2 (*heaven*).

[5] Int. § 69; Ch. 4 § 4 [71] n.

[6] Int. § 70.

[7] Ch. 20 § 11 [26] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 28 [11].

[8] Ap. G 1 *a* (*Positivism*).

[9] IN 5 *b*; Ap. G 1 *b* (*Essentials of the Dhamma*).

[10] Or liberation; Ap. D *a* § 6 (*mutti*).

[11] Int. § 19.

[12] Int. §§ 24, 25, 27, 48, 85, 105, 106; Ap. E *c* i.

[13] *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta, Sutta* 134 (Ap. E, *Note*). Cp. Int. § 97.

[14] The word *saṃkhārā* is used in connexion with the first two characteristics here mentioned and *dhammā* in connexion with the third. Cp. Buddha's last words in

as 'transient' (*a-niccā*), 'sorrowful' (*dukkhā*), 'without (durable or separate) self' (*an-attā*).[1] The last[2] of these three characteristics is plainly opposed to belief in the doctrine of Rebirth or transmigration; if there is no durable self there cannot be a transmigration of the soul to a new body after the death of the first. This was clearly perceived by the early Buddhists, and even so late as five hundred years after the death of the Buddha the *Milinda-pañha*[3] makes the orthodox Buddhist sage Nāgasena, explaining the (*Hīnayāna*) doctrine, state that on the death of an individual there is no transmigration of the soul, though there is transference of karma (effect of actions), like the passage of fire, from the dying person to a new individual. This explanation represents the effort of the orthodox Buddhists to reconcile the teaching of Gotama with the ancient and powerful Indian doctrine of transmigration, the influence of which they evidently felt deeply. The explanation, however, plainly leaves the matter a mystery.[4] The doctrine that the soul migrates on the death of one individual to the newly born body of another is perfectly logical though subject neither to proof nor to disproof. The doctrine that the effects of an individual's actions (i.e. his karma) pass at his death to a new individual places plainly arbitrary and illogical limitations upon those effects (i.e. his karma), which obviously are in reality neither limited to the time of the death of one individual nor are borne by a single new individual. Those effects act upon innumerable persons, during the whole of the lifetime of the individual.[5] This was as obvious in the time of Gotama as at the present day, as is evidenced by the First Sermon and the Noble Eightfold Path, and the whole of his ethical teaching. In the end the ancient Indian doctrine of Rebirth overcame its rival.

37. But though Gotama's doctrine of the impermanence of the soul is strictly opposed to that of rebirth it is not necessarily in conflict with the idea of a higher Soul. He states that all individuals (*dhammā* or *saṃkhārā*) are without (permanent- or separate-) soul (*an-attā*). But this is not the same as saying that there is no *attan*[6] or *param-ātman* (Supreme Soul). In the latter part of the *Tevijja Sutta*[7]

which it is stated that the *saṃkhārā* are perishable (Ch. 4 § 18). Cp. the *pañc' upādāna-kkhandhā* (fivefold grasping aggregates) in the First Sermon (cp. also Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [3]).

[1] Int. §§ 4, 24, 74. The fleeting nature of individuality is emphatically stated in the constantly repeated formula 'this is not of me, I am not this, this is not the permanent self of me' (Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45]), the realization of which according to Gotama is the entrance to Nibbāna.

[2] The statement *sabbe dhammā an-attā* (all things in nature are without permanent soul) seems clearly to have been intended to deny the Jain doctrine of indestructible souls or spirits pervading all matter. Int. § 184.

[3] Int. §§ 22, 25, 27, 29, 43 n, 52; Ap. B *b* §§ 1, 2.

[4] Cp. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1877), pp. 100–2; Kern, *Manual of Indian Buddhism*, pp. 49, 50.

[5] Ap. G 2 *a* (*Collective Karma*).

[6] Int. § 35 (i); Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [206] n; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Cp. Oldenberg (Stuttgart, 1923), p. 288.

[7] Int. §§ 29, 35 (i), 49, 64, 178; Ch. 1 § 1 [49] n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8.

indeed he shows how the four divine qualities (*Brahma-vihārā*)[1] unite the individual with Brahman, the latter being plainly not the personal deity Brahmā. These divine qualities all make for unity and harmony, and Brahman[2] is evidently the fundamental spirit which unites all things, and from which the personal desires of the individual separate him with disastrous results of pain and sin.[3]

(*b*) *The last words of the Buddha; effort and free will*[4]

38. The last words of Gotama ('Individuals are transient; labour (therefore) strenuously')[5] are similarly opposed to the doctrine of transmigration. T. W. Rhys Davids[6] translates the latter part of this 'Work out your own salvation with diligence', but there is no mention of 'salvation' in the original. The Pāli word *saṃpādetha* means 'work (ye)'.[7] The Teacher says 'Our compound nature must [soon] dissolve; [therefore] labour diligently'. The opposite of this is the conclusion of individualism: 'Enjoy to-day, for to-morrow we die.' The other conclusion is possible only on an altruistic and monistic basis:[8] 'There is so little time to play one's part; therefore work zealously.'

39. Behind the individual self and the visible world there lies, in the Indian mind, the fundamental idea of the Whole,[9] the impersonal divine One, the universal breath or spirit (*atta*), the creative force or

[1] Literally, 'holy dwelling-places', i.e. qualities in which the divine abides. Int. § 106 n; Ap. F 2 *b*.

[2] Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; also Int. §§ 38, 87 n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 6 (*amata*). Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] (*origin*), and contemporary Vedāntic thought—'The whole process has a threefold aspect—origination, growth, dissolution. "That from whence these beings are born, that by which when born they live, that into which they enter at their death, this is Brahman (cf. *Taittirīya Upanishad*, III, iii, 1)"': W. S. Urquhart, *The Upanishads and Life* (Calcutta, 1916), p. 57. In Sutta 14 of the Nines of the *Aṅguttara-Nikāya* (PTS, iv, p. 385) individuals attaining the highest point are termed *Amat-ogadhā* (immersed in the deathless).

[3] See the First Sermon (the Second Noble Truth as to the origin of Sorrow); Ch. 5 *b* § 6.

[4] Int. §§ 55, 102; Ap. E *c* ii.

[5] Ch. 22 *b* § 25; and Int. § 55 n; Ch. 3 § 5 [165] n; Ch. 21 § 16; Ap. B *a*, *Note*. On diligence and the urgency of duty see Ap. C *b* § 11 (21); Ap. H 4 *a* (*Sīlas*); and Ap. B *b*, *Note* (*consequences*).

[6] SBE, xi, p. 114.

[7] Or more exactly, proceed (as on a journey).

[8] Int. § 97.

[9] Int. §§ 8, 44, 68; Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [4] (*Self*); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*). Compare the *Nomos, logos, pan, holon, phusis, pneuma*, of the Stoics (Int. §§ 97, 186 n). Cp. 'Western thought . . . represents a world-and-life affirmation which is no longer completely ethical. . . . It endeavours now to derive ideals from reality. And it reaches a point where it no longer allows man to be preoccupied with his relation to infinite Being, but only with his relation to human society. . . . Western thought is not governed like mystical thought by the idea that the one thing needful is the spiritual union of man with infinite Being': A. Schweitzer, *Indian Thought and its Development* (1936), pp. 253–4. The fundamental law stated by Buddha—'Everything that has by nature an origin has also by nature an end' (Ch. 5 *c* § 7)—taken with his *an-attā* doctrine (Ch. 5 *c* §§ 1–5) and his view of Nibbāna (Ap. C *b*) implies that the individual, arising from and returning to the divine unity, dwells in it and is separated from it only by grasping and egoism which can be transcended, and equally affirms the reality of life and duty. Compare the Stoic maxim: 'God has placed it in man's power not to be sundered in any way from the whole and has empowered him when sundered to come back and grow together again', Marcus Aurelius, viii. 34.

Brahman (neuter).[1] With the idea of the transience of the individual self there comes, therefore, not a feeling of the crumbling away of Law, the dethronement of personal Rulership, and a reckless irresponsibility or despair, as to the modern Western, markedly individualistic, mind, but a sense of reconciliation and unity, and of the due subordination of the unstable to the stable,[2] of the individual to the One.[3] So for the Western cry, 'Eat, drink, and be merry, for to-morrow we die', is substituted the Eastern, 'We are transient; let us strive without ceasing!'

40. The doctrine of free will[4] could hardly be more clearly stated than here: 'Labour diligently; strive arduously.' Such effort necessarily implies freedom of will. This and kindred sayings of the Teacher, 'Depend upon yourselves',[5] and 'You can attain full wisdom in this present life',[6] constitute a clear denial not only of the doctrine of predestination, but of the Indian doctrine of personal Karma. The latter implies a fatalistic evolution of the results of actions, good or bad, done in the past, and therefore beyond control, though possibly expiable by a new effort of will. Gotama calls for self-dependence and eager activity in the present, not, however, on behalf of the self, since such grasping, whether for immediate or ultimate reward, is the source of all sorrow, therefore necessarily on behalf of others.[7]

NOTE 4

REBIRTH[8] AND THE DISCOURSE TO SĪHA[9] THE JAIN. THE WORDS *KIRIYA-VĀDA* AND *A-KIRIYA-VĀDA*; JAINISM

41. During one of his visits to Vesāli Gotama attracted the attention and won the admiration of Sīha,[10] the General of the Licchavis, the dominant clan of the Vajjian Confederacy. Sīha was a follower of the Jains,[11] a religious sect established not long previously by Mahāvīra, himself a member of the Licchavi clan and a somewhat older contemporary of the Buddha. In the account handed down to us in the *Mahā-Vagga*[12] of the *Vinaya Piṭaka* the General is represented as asking permission of the Jain leader to interview Gotama, and as being refused that permission on the ground that the recluse Gotama taught *a-kiriya-vāda*.[13] Sīha finally, however, decided to disregard

[1] Int. § 37; SBE, xi, p. 201 (the close of the *Tevijja Sutta*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 8; Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note*.
[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 n (*unity*).
[3] Cp. Marcus Aurelius, bk. xii, ch. 30.
[4] Cp. Int. § 42 n.
[5] Ch. 21 § 8; Ap. E *c* ii; Ap. E *c* ii § 1 (*by yourselves*), § 3 (*paccattaṃ*), § 4 (*atta-saraṇā*).
[6] Ap. C *a* § 3.
[7] Ap. F 1 *b* (*Mettā*).
[8] Int. §§ 4, 19.
[9] Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. B *b* § 3.
[10] i.e. the lion.
[11] In the *Mahā-vagga* of the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* the sect is called the *Nigaṇṭha* sect and the founder Nāta-putta, but these have been identified by Bühler and Jacobi with the Jains and Mahāvīra respectively (see SBE, xvii, p. 109, note by T. W. Rhys Davids). Int. §§ 85 n, 179, 184; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1].
[12] Ap. B *b* § 3.
[13] Int. § 55 (*Karma*), § 177.

this prohibition and to visit the new Teacher, whom he at once questioned as to whether he taught *a-kiriya-vāda* or not. Gotama is represented as replying that he taught both *a-kiriya-vāda* and *kiriya-vāda*, since he taught abstention from evil actions and the performance of good actions. From this reply it is evident that he is represented as having taken the word *a-kiriya-vāda* to mean 'the doctrine of non-action', i.e. passivism, and the word *kiriya-vāda* to mean 'the doctrine of action' or activism.[1] It seems evident, however, that the reporter of the incident, as we now have it in the Canon,[2] misapprehended the reply, for the Jains themselves were passivists (i.e. *a-kiriya-vādins* in this sense) and their leader cannot have reproached Gotama with being what he himself and his own followers were. Believing in the dangerous consequences of an active life, the Jains taught the utmost possible passivity.[3] It seems to follow, therefore, that in the present passage the word *a-kiriya-vāda* cannot mean 'the doctrine of non-action' (passivism); it seems more than probable that the word here really means 'non-belief in action (*Karma*)'.

42. Gotama's reply, which, as we at present have it, seems in no way to distinguish his teaching from that of any other moral teacher, would then become distinctive and appropriate, signifying that in one sense he was not a believer in the doctrine of Karma, but that in another he was. Disbelieving in the permanence of the individual soul he could not accept the Hindu doctrine of Karma implying the transmigration of the soul at death to a new body; but believing fully in moral responsibility[4] and the consequences of all acts, words, and thoughts,[5] he fully accepted the doctrine of Karma in another sense, implying the transmission of the effects of actions from one generation of men to all succeeding generations.[6] Whereas the Jains can scarcely be conceived of as reproaching Gotama with being a non-activist (passivist), partly because they were themselves passivists, and partly because, as a teacher of the Noble Eightfold Path, he was obviously not open to the reproach of passivism, it is quite possible that his opponents did think him open to a charge of moral irresponsibility, which in their eyes was involved in the rejection of the Hindu doctrine of Karma. Thus it is likely that they would charge him with being a non-believer in Karma, i.e. a teacher of the doctrine of moral irresponsibility. Gotama himself strenuously rejected this charge, as is evidenced by the rare vehemence with which he attacked the teaching of Makkhali Gosāla,[7] a contemporary nihilist thinker, who main-

[1] '"The doctrine of non-action", and "the doctrine . . action" taken in the ordinary sense of the words, are the doctrines that the actions of sentient beings receive not, or receive, their reward according to the law of moral retribution. In this discourse, however, a peculiar meaning is attached to these two terms': SBE, xvii, p. 110, note by T. W. Rhys. Int. § 186; Ap. B *b* § 3 [2].

[2] IN 6 (*Canon*).

[3] See SBE, xlv (*Jaina Texts*, ed. Jacobi), p. xv, n.

[4] Int. § 25.

[5] Int. § 8.

[6] Int. §§ 48, 82, 102; Ap. G 2 *a* (*Collective Karma*).

[7] Head of the Ājīvaka sect, who denied all freedom of the will and therefore all moral responsibility. Int. §§ 40, 183.

tained that all actions were indifferent in their effects. The pernicious nature of this doctrine was fiercely emphasized by Gotama,[1] who rarely departed from his habitual attitude of tolerance.[2]

43. In the Book of the Great Decease Gotama is represented as teaching how some actions have effects and others have none, and that the latter are of a higher moral order. That the piercing and practical mind of Gotama should have taught any such metaphysical doctrine is more than unlikely. It seems highly probable that here again the reporter of the Sutta failed to understand the Teacher's statement that in one sense he rejected the doctrine of Karma and in another he did not, i.e. that he did not believe in the effect of actions upon one individual after rebirth but did believe in the effect of actions upon all subsequent generations of men.[3]

44. Jainism, which in its origin was contemporary with and the rival of Buddhism, accepted, as radical parts of the faith, the doctrines of Rebirth and Spiritism.[4] In ignoring the Vedas[5] and their ritual, and caste, and in advocating universal love based on the idea of an impersonal all-pervading One,[6] or in the case of the Jains an affinity of all-pervading indestructible spirits, the two faiths resembled each other. It may be questioned whether Gotama's creed would have really differed from that of his somewhat older contemporary, the Licchavi Rājput Mahāvīra, the founder of the rival religion or sect, if he had also accepted the doctrines of Rebirth and Spiritism. Yet a distinction, and a great one, must have existed. Between such men it cannot have been one of minor points or a matter of mere names or of personal rivalry. At a later period, indeed, both these doctrines were included in the Buddhist creed, and then the distinction between the two faiths became blurred, as ultimately that between Buddhism and Hinduism. What was really distinctive of Gotama's teaching was 'that Nirvāna, that highest good, which one might in no long time, and in the present life, learn for oneself and realize and live in possession of'.[7] This was none other than the peace of mind obtainable by the self-forgetful activity of the Eightfold Path,[8] and not any state to be attained in a future life.

45. It may be asked why, if Gotama rejected the doctrine of Rebirth, he did not renounce it. But it is a remarkable characteristic of Gotama that he denounced no religious beliefs.[9] He rejected the

[1] See *Ang. Nik.* i, p. 268 (Oldenberg, *Buddha*, p. 198); SBE, xi, p. 106; A. B. Keith, *Buddh. Phil.* (1923), pp. 116, 136 n 2; Oldenberg, *Buddha* (Stuttgart, 1923), pp. 82, 94 n; SBE, xlv (*Jaina Texts*, ed. Jacobi), p. xxix; *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 483 (KM, p. 72).

[2] Ap. B *b* § 3 [10] n; AP. G 1 *a*, *Note*, n.

[3] Ap. B *b* § 3 [5] n. Cp. Nāgasena's orthodox (*Hīnayāna*) explanation in the *Milinda-pañha*, stating that the Buddha while rejecting the Hindu theory of Karma yet taught another variant of that doctrine by which Karma was transferred without rebirth of the individual soul. Int. § 36.

[4] IN 8 *a*.

[5] Int. § 91; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13].

[6] Int. § 39.

[7] Ch. 5 *a* § 10.

[8] Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note* (*nibbāna in this present life*).

[9] Compare the tolerance of the Emperor Asoka; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vi] (*Jains*). Cp. Int. § 183 (*censure*).

Vedas, and did not denounce, but rather ignored, them; he rejected sacrificial ritual and caste, but denounced neither, though he held up in contrast the nature and duties of the true worshipper[1] and Brāhman[2] and the practice of the four divine virtues or Brahma-vihārā.[3]

46. Tolerance and gentleness were deeply rooted in his nature and mode of thought. And it is consistent that a doctrine of universal love and brotherhood[4] should not destroy but build up; when the new edifice is ready and suffices, it will be time for the old to be destroyed. It is the revealed dogmatic religions that denounce and uproot. Gotama strove to uproot only egotism, and this could be done only by love, not by hate.[5] That the things of which we know him to have expressed strong disapproval are limited in number is consistent with his outlook upon the world.

NOTE 5

REBIRTH[6] AND (*a*) THE EDICTS OF ASOKA; (*b*) THE ESSENTIALS OF THE DHAMMA

(*a*) *The Edicts of Asoka;*[7] *the Mauryan stupas at Bharhut and Sāñchī*[8]

47. The Edicts of the Emperor Asoka (about 250 B.C.) are found engraved on rocks and pillars sparsely scattered over the provinces of his vast Indian empire. Their authenticity and that of the creed which they set forth are indisputable. They summarize with care, and again and again, the Dhamma of Buddha in the form in which it was accepted by the ruler of the greater part of India somewhat more than two centuries after the death of Gotama, and about two and a half centuries before the birth of Christ. They give us therefore a reliable picture of the state of the Buddhist faith at that period as it presented itself at least to a superior and commanding mind. Doubtless in minds of an inferior order it appeared in a somewhat different form, less clearly separated from the current superstitions of the time. That Asoka considered his creed perfectly accordant with the orthodox Dhamma of the time seems clear from the Sārnāth minor pillar edict[9] in which he declares that 'the unity of the Church (*Saṃgha*)' must not be broken.

48. The Dhamma accepted by the Emperor Asoka is in almost all

[1] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2] (*pay reverence*); cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (1, *result of* [*our*] *mind*).
[2] Ch. 13 *c* § 18; Ap. F 2 *c* (*the true Brahman*).
[3] Ap. F 2 *b*.
[4] Ap. F 1 *b*.
[5] *Dhammapada* (5); Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5).
[6] Int. § 19; IN 6 (*Canon*) n; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] n.
[7] Int. §§ 12, 18, 21, 22, 118, 174; Ap. G 1 *c*; Ap. H 5, *Note*; also Int. § 56.
[8] Int. § 22. Of all the edicts only one inscription, the latest found—namely that discovered at Maski in Hyderabad in 1915—mentions Asoka by name. Here he appears as Devānampiya Asoka. (See Hultzch's edition of the Edicts, 1925). The identity of the Piyadasi ('the Gracious') with Asoka the Mauryan Emperor was, however, clearly known from other sources.
[9] See V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., pp. 195–6.

essentials that presented in the various summaries of the faith found clearly stated in the earliest books of the Canon.[1] The apparent inconsistency lies in Asoka's seeming insistence on 'Heaven (*sagga*)',[2] and on the results of actions in 'the next world', though these phrases conceivably, and even probably, refer to Nibbāna in this life, and to the state of conversion[3] respectively, whilst the sanctions of the rewards of heaven as well as the punishments of hell are appeals to the individual and to self-interest, which are inconsistent with Gotama's doctrine of the non-existence or rather the non-permanent existence of the individual or self.[4] Gotama taught the doctrine of present peace or release from selfishness on earth,[5] and emphasized the endless effects of actions—deeds, words, and thoughts—on future generations,[6] and the step from these two positions to the individualistic sanctions of heaven and hell would doubtless be easy and comprehensible. Of Karma, however, in the usual Hindu personal sense, there is no trace in the emperor's edicts. In many of the books of the Buddhist Canon[7] personal Karma figures prominently. The conclusion seems justified that those portions of the Canon in which that doctrine appears are either of later date than the Emperor Asoka, or were not accepted by him and by the Buddhist teachers[8] who surrounded and influenced him. The Edicts of Asoka may be used as a touchstone to test the age of portions of the Canonical Books.

49. The doctrine of Harmlessness (*a-hiṃsā*),[9] or the sanctity of animal life, is more strongly insisted upon by the emperor than by the Buddha, who instructed the mendicant brothers to eat whatever was placed before them without picking and choosing, but not to permit

[1] Ap. G 1 *b* (*Essentials of the Dhamma*).

[2] Int. §§ 12, 33, 101; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (29); Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Compare the following passage (from J. B. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism*, 1928, p. 205), which, whilst describing the Hīnayāna Buddhism of present-day Cambodia, may be applicable also, if not to the Buddhism of Asoka, yet to the popular Buddhism of his time. 'Preas Prohm [i.e. the impersonal Brahman] has no cult and plays but a small rôle in the thoughts of any but the most learned and philosophical. Nippean [i.e. Nirvāna], too, is not a matter of much practical importance. Heaven and hell, on the other hand, are much more lively, definite, and interesting conceptions for both laity and clergy. Heaven is a kind of terrestrial paradise situated on Tray-trong (Mt. Meru of Indian mythology). It has three gradations, in an ascending scale: namely, that of the laity, the bonzes, and the ascetics. The bonzes play a much more prominent place (*sic*) in the minds of the Cambodian Buddhists than either Nirvāna or rebirth. Hell is no less real, and is a constant peril to the unwary.' The unimportance of the next world in the early Buddhist scheme is shown in Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [2] n.

[3] '"In this world", literally, "here"; "in the other world", literally, "on the other side"; "heaven", *svarga*', Vincent Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed. (1909), p. 64, n. Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210] n.

[4] IN 3 *a*; Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*).

[5] Ap. C *b*.

[6] Ap. G 2 *a* (*Collective Karma*). Cp. the Discourse to Sīha (the word *kiriyavādin*), Int. § 42; and Asoka's Rock Edict IV ('the end of the cycle'), Int. § 49.

[7] e.g. the *Jātaka* (Book of Previous Births of the Buddha).

[8] Int. § 56 (*Asoka*). Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] n.

[9] Int. §§ 108, 184; Ch. 9 *a* § 13 [2]; Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [7]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2 [14]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 6; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (10). Cp. Ch. 4 § 14 [iii, 4]; Ch. 8 *j* §§ 7, 8 [13]; Ch. 8 *l* §§ 1 (19), 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [4]; Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [8]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10].

the slaughter of animals for meals specially prepared for them.[1] The edicts do not state expressly the fundamental unity of life but the doctrine of *a-hiṃsā* implies it, as does the Canonical *Tevijja Sutta*[2] and, indeed, the whole of Gotama's doctrine of selflessness and non-individualism.[3] The periodical return of all things to the fundamental Unity is implied in the mention of 'the end of the cycle (*kappa, kalpa*)'[4] in Rock Edict IV. Of gods or spirits[5] there is no mention in the edicts, with the doubtful exception of one passage which has been rendered by translators as stating that 'the gods who were regarded as true all over India (*in Jambudvīpa*) have been shown to be untrue',[6] and, further, that involved in the formal and conventional title of the king, Devānampiya (literally, Beloved of the Gods, i.e. His Sacred Majesty).[7]

50. That the Dhamma as summarized in the edicts was a living and working creed may be seen by a comparison with the Japanese Imperial Edict of 1890, circulated to educational institutions by the Japanese Board of Education. The resemblance of the latter to several of the Edicts of Asoka is most striking; in spirit it seems practically identical with them, and shows a continuity of thought lasting for over two thousand years. The edict[8] runs:

'Know ye, Our Subjects—

'Our Imperial Ancestors have founded our Empire on a basis broad and everlasting and have deeply and finally implanted virtue. Our subjects, ever united in loyalty and filial piety, have from generation to generation illustrated the beauty thereof. This is the glory of the fundamental character of our Empire, and herein also lies the source of our education.

'Ye, our subjects, be filial to your parents, affectionate to your brothers and sisters, as husbands and wives be harmonious, as friends true; bear yourselves in modesty and moderation; extend your benevolence to all; pursue learning and cultivate arts, and thereby develop intellectual faculties and perfect moral powers; furthermore, advance public good and promote common interests. Always respect the constitution and observe the laws; should emergency arise offer yourselves courageously to the State, and thus guard and maintain the prosperity of our Imperial Throne, co-eval with heaven and earth. So ye shall not only be our good and faithful subjects, but render illustration to the best traditions of your fore-fathers.

'The way here set forth is indeed the teaching bequeathed by Our

[1] Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [14].
[2] Int. § 37.
[3] Ap. G 2 *a* (*Metaphysical Presuppositions*).
[4] Int. §§ 49, 107; Ch. 21 § 10 [3] n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 6; Ap. H 1 §§ 5, 6 [6]; also Rock Edict V; cp. Pillar Edict VII (9).
[5] IN 8 *a*.
[6] Minor Rock Edict I (V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 149); Ap. G 1 *c* § 2. The passage possibly means that divine beings who were thought not to mix with men now mingle among them as saints (*arahats*). The edict goes on immediately to say that the lowly as well as the exalted can attain the bliss of sanctity.
[7] Ap. G 1 *c* 4; cp. Ch. 10 *c* [3] (28). See V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 22. The plural *Devānampiyā* is replaced in the Girnar version of Rock Edict VIII by *Rājāno* (rājas or kings); see V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, p. 165.
[8] Quoted in *The Beharee* newspaper, 26 June, 1917, from H. B. Watson in the *Education Times*.

Imperial Ancestors, to be observed alike by Their Descendants and the subjects, infallible for all ages and true in all places. It is Our wish to lay it to heart in all reverence in common with you, Our subjects, that we all thus attain to the same virtue.'

51. Save for the passages in the Asokan Edicts which apparently profess belief in a future world, there is an almost perfect accord between the religion of Asoka and the Dhamma of the Buddha. The Dhamma of Asoka affords an almost exact cursory presentation of the Dhamma of Gotama Buddha, from whose lifetime it was separated by scarcely two and a half centuries—a doctrine of devoted altruistic service, based on a belief in the divine unity of all things but without personal deity or deities; without formal ritual or ceremonies,[1] but with a sense that all actions properly regarded are acts of worship; without expectation of personal reward other than the joy and peace of well-doing; and with no sanction save the betterment or suffering of others both now and in all future generations.[2]

52. Although the doctrine of Rebirth makes no appearance in the Edicts of Asoka,[3] it none the less took a large place in the popular form of the Buddhist belief shortly after that emperor's reign and doubtless also during his lifetime. The very animated sculptures on the late Mauryan stūpas at Bharhut and Sāñchī[4] depict incidents described in the *Jātaka* or Book of the Previous Births of the Buddha. The *Jātaka*[5] consists largely of ancient Hindu tales, illustrating the virtue of self-sacrifice, which have been adapted by the Buddhists to form narratives of the previous existences of Gotama Buddha as a Bodhisatta (wisdom-being or future Buddha). These tales fully adopt the Hindu theory of rebirth. The stūpas at Bharhut and Sāñchī date from about the close of the third century B.C., when evidently popular Buddhism did not differ from Hinduism in this respect. None the less, some three hundred years later the orthodox *Hīnayāna* text-book, the *Milinda-pañhā*,[6] emphatically denied the truth of the theory of Rebirth, though it asserted the transfer of Karma at the death of the individual to another individual newly born.

(*b*) *The Essentials*[7] *of the Dhamma*[8]

53. The *Dhamma* of Asoka[9] is in essence the same as the code of duties laid down for laymen in the *Siṅgālovāda-Sutta*[10] of the *Dīgha-*

[1] *Siṅgālovāda-Sutta* (Int. § 29); Ap. G 1 *c* § 4.
[2] Int. § 42.
[3] Cp. V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 64.
[4] Int. § 22; Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note.*
[5] Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 n.
[6] Int. § 36.
[7] Int. §§ 9, 12, 24, 35 iii, 84, 100, 181; and IN 6 (*Canon*) n. Ch. 4 § 3 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9]; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 2 [10], 13 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] n; Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 16 n; Ch. 23 [9]; Ap. E *c* ii § 3; Ap. G 1 *b*; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3] n; Ap. I *b* § 4 [8] n. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228] (*prevails*); Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [7] n. The three points of the 'comprehensive discourse' frequently repeated in the MPS (Ap. G 1 *b* § 3, *discourse*) constitute the final summary of Gotama's code and may be thus rendered—to injure none, to strive to transcend the individual self, to perceive the divine which is in all things and is their origin and end (Int. § 178,

[For notes 8–10 see opposite]

Nikāya, that is a code of social duties based upon the Four Noble Truths.[1] In the opening chapter of the Book of the Great Decease the Buddha is described as preaching during all the earlier stages of his last great tour a 'comprehensive religious discourse',[2] which may be taken as summarizing the essentials of his faith.[3] This discourse deals with three specific subjects, namely virtuous action (*sīla*), abstraction or rapture (*samādhi*), and reason (*paññā*). It is noticeable that *samādhi* is the last section (*sammā-samādhi*) of the Noble Eightfold Path, whilst *paññā* is practically identical with the first section (*sammā-diṭṭhi*, right view or outlook). Reason (*paññā*) is necessary, and likewise religious rapture (*samādhi*); but these qualities, which might be exercised in solitary retirement, will not suffice without activity, that virtuous action (*sīla*), which the Eightfold Path enjoins.[4] Reason is required for the true comprehension of the first three of the Four Noble Truths, and good deeds are enjoined by the fourth of these, the Noble Eightfold Path; but *samādhi*,[5] religious feeling or earnest contemplation, is required in addition to mere rationalism and mere duty, in order to introduce that love (*mettā*),[6] which makes of altruism a living principle, not a mere rational theory scarcely distinguishable from highly enlightened self-interest or Epicureanism. And mystical religious rapture[7] is not sufficient, unaccompanied on the one hand by clear reason and on the other by practical well-doing. The threefold division of the essentials of the doctrine in the 'comprehensive discourse' covers the same ground as the sevenfold division of fundamental truths taught by the Master, which appears in a later passage

Brahman; Ch. 13 *c* § 20, *paññā*). These oppose the three Fires of hate, desire, and delusion; Ap. D *a* § 10. The subject of *Majjh.* 44 is selfhood (*sakkāya*), its composite nature, its origination (Ch. 5 *b* § 6) in craving and its cessation in Nibbāna. This summary survey of the Dhamma contains no reference to rebirth apart from the disputable and unsupported word *ponobbhavikā*. See also *aññā* (gnosis or perception of fundamental truth): Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] (*dhamma-cakkhu*) n; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2].

8 Law or system. Int. §§ 3, 97; Part I (title); Ch. 4 § 10 n; Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ch. 21 § 8 [26]; Ch. 22 *b* § 21; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]. For the creed of modern Ceylon see Ap. H 1 *c* (*Refuges*). A summary of the orthodox doctrine of Hīnayāna Buddhism is thus presented in *A Buddhist Catechism* by Subhadra Bhikshu (1890), pp. 58–9: 'Buddhism teaches the reign of perfect goodness and wisdom without a personal God, continuance of individuality without an immortal soul, eternal happiness without a local heaven, the way of salvation without a vicarious Saviour, redemption worked out by each one himself, without any prayers, sacrifices and penances, without the ministry of ordained priests, without the intercession of saints, without divine mercy. Finally it teaches that supreme perfection is attainable even in this life and on this earth.' Each of these points may be tested by the ancient canonical texts collected in this volume.

9 Int. § 22.

10 Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; also Int. §§ 29, 84, 106; and Ch. 9 *b*.

---

1 The First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b*).

2 Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20]; Ch. 20 § 8; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3; Cp. Int. § 31 (*graduated discourse*).

3 Ap. G 1 *b* § 3.

4 Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

5 The sense of unity; Int. § 8; Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-transcendence*).

6 Ap. F 1 *b*.

7 i.e. self-transcendence; Ch. 20 5 (6) n.

of the Book of the Great Decease.[1] Of these the first six divisions may be said to correspond with *samādhi* and *paññā* of the 'comprehensive discourse'. The seventh is the Noble Eightfold Path.

54. In the final discourse which Gotama delivered to his disciples, in the moments shortly preceding his death, he uttered the words: 'It may be, Ānanda, that some of you will think, "The word (*pāvacanam*)[2] is now without a Teacher; we have now no Teacher". But that, Ānanda, is not the correct view. The Law (*dhammo ca*) and Discipline (*vinayo ca*), which I have taught and enjoined upon you is to be your teacher when I am gone.' Overlaid as the Law (*dhamma*) and Discipline (*vinaya*) have been by later accumulations, the difficulty is to get down to that stratum in which the original doctrine and rules are to be found.[3] We must look first to the great Sermon in the Deerpark at Isipatana near Benāres, with which he set the wheel of the Law rolling.[4] Here we have the Four Noble Truths, of which the first three are the basis for the fourth, the Noble Eightfold Path, the position of which, at the forefront and again at the close of the Truths, emphasizes its supreme importance. Again, in the discourse to Subhadda,[5] the wandering Brāhman ascetic who was the Great Teacher's last convert, Gotama is represented as saying: 'In whatever doctrine and discipline the Noble Eightfold Path is not found, therein also is not found the pious devotee (*samaṇo*) of the first, second, third or fourth degree. . . . Now in this Doctrine and Discipline, O Subhadda, the Noble Eightfold Path is found. . . . Destitute of true devotees are all other creeds.' Here then in the Noble Eightfold Path is the centre of Gotama's teaching.[6] This position is fully brought out in the *Mahā-Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta* (Discourse on fixing the attention, or The Intent Contemplations) of the *Dīgha Nikāya*,[7] in which the Buddha is represented as saying that 'There is but one way open to mortals for the attainment of purity, for the overcoming of sorrow and lamentation, for the abolition of misery and grief, for the acquisition of the correct rule of conduct, for the realization of *Nibbāna*, and that is the Four Intent Contemplations'; whilst this Discourse on the Contemplations is nothing else than an expansion of the seventh section (on *sammā-sati*, right contemplation) of the Eightfold Path.

55. In all the great Conversion Sermons,[8] again, as in the First Sermon, delivered at Benāres, and the last, delivered to Subhadda by the dying Teacher, it is always the Truths and the Path that are dwelled upon,[9] the burning fires of personal desire, the peace ensuing

[1] Ch. 20 § 7 (the six conditions securing stability).
[2] Ch. 22 *b* § 21.
[3] Int. § 3 (*improved*).
[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 1 (*Dhamma-cakka-ppavatana-Sutta*) n.
[5] Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23].
[6] Ap. F 2 *d* (*the Noble Eightfold Path*).
[7] *Dīgha* 22 (Ch. 9 *a*).
[8] IN 2 *a*.
[9] Compare Gotama's dying words, which are in effect an adjuration to follow strenuously the Eightfold Path. IN 3 *b*; Int. § 38.

on their extinction.[1] No other features will be found prominent in any of these crucial discourses. The discourse to the First Missioners,[2] also, delivered at Benāres after the conferences held there during the first *Was*, contains nothing more than these same points, strange as this fact seems to those who look for dogma and metaphysical subtleties in the teachings of the Founder of Buddhism, instead of the purest ethical doctrine, the doctrine of selfless activity, of complete but balanced and practical altruism.[3] The principle of Karma[4] so far as it figures here must necessarily conform to this altruistic basis of the Truths. Whatever conflicts with the Truths and the Way is likely to prove, on examination, to be of later date than the Teacher's doctrine, and to have been added by followers who failed to grasp firmly the essential truths of the doctrine.[5] These developments and subtleties we owe, not to Gotama, but to his successors, often, indeed, great Doctors of the Law,[6] but lesser Teachers.

NOTE 6

THE BUDDHIST COUNCILS,[7] AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE CANON;[8] EARLY SCHISMS; HINDUIZATION[9]

56. The first Buddhist Council[10] called for the purpose of fixing orally the text of the Sacred Canon is said to have been held at

[1] Ap. C *b*. [2] IN 2 *b*. [3] Ap. D (*Egoism*).

[4] Int. § 24 (*ponobbhavikā*), § 41 (*a-kiriya-vāda*).

[5] 'These live counsels of how to keep well, of how to walk in the Way to "the Well", of how to help the brother so to walk—this is the real *brahmachariya* the teaching originally meant; this it is that the first missioners were sent to carry out; this it is that was to lead to the ending of sorrow. And this it was—according to the Canonical legend, the great Apadāna—which first suggested to Gotama the ideal that lay in the "going forth", the *pabbajjā*, from the world to end sorrow:—"The excellence, namely, of righteous and peaceful conduct, of good and worthy action, of harming none, of compassion to creatures". [Dialogues of the Buddha, ii, p. 22 (Digha ii, 28, 29)]': *Mrs. Rhys Davids's editorial note to the Book of Kindred Sayings (Saṃyutta-Nikāya), Pt. III, translated by F. L. Woodward; pp. vii–viii.*

[6] The *Dhamma* may be summed up as the law of altruism, based upon the fundamental divine unity, and fortified by the sanctions of the continuous consequences of actions (deeds, words, and thoughts); or more briefly the law of unity (Ch. 7 *a* § 20; Ap. F 1 *b* § 6; Ap. G 2 *a*), continuity (Ap. B *b*), and altruism (Int. § 3; Ap. D *a*). Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6, *dhamma-cakkhu*]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 10.

[7] Int. §§ 158, 171 n; Ch. 10 *d* § 2 n; Ch. 23; Ap. H 3, *Note*.

[8] The foundation of the Canon consists of the *amata*, *anattā*, *nibbāna* (with the Noble Truths and Way), and *mettā* doctrines (cp. IN 5 *b*. *Essentials*; IN 9; and Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] n), together with the first Vinaya rules. Accretions to these are the theories of rebirth (IN 5), of heaven and hell (IN 2 *a*), of gods and spirits (IN 8 *a*), of the Tathāgatas (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] n), of merit through the Saṃgha (Ap. H 1 § 6 n), of supernatural powers (Ap. I, *Note*, *iddhi*), of the unreality of life (Ap. D *b*, *Māyā*), of origination (Ap. B *c*), of trance (Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] n; to which must be added varied increments from the poetical histories (Ap. 2 *a Note*), the rearrangement of the Suttantas (Ch. 20, *suttanta*), and Commentarial additions to the *Sutta-Piṭaka* (Int. § 21) and to the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* (Ch. 4, iii, *Mahā-vagga*, and § 10 n). The mention of the Yonas (Greeks) with the Kambojans as bordering nations in *Majjh.* 93 (Ch. 14 *a* § 7 n) is more than conjecturally significant. On stages in the

[For notes 9–10 see next page]

Rājagaha during the *Was*, or period of residence in the rainy season, following the death of Gotama. Mahā-Kassapa presided. The Council consisted of five hundred members of the Order, and met in the Sattapaṇṇi cave of the Vaihāra (Vebhāra) hill, in the immediate neighbourhood of Rājagaha, and under the patronage of King Ajātasattu. All the members recited the words attributed to the Teacher, Upāli leading during the recitation of the Rules[1] (*Vinaya*), and Ānanda during the recitation of the Law (*Dhamma*) contained in Gotama's Discourses (*Suttas*). A second Council was found to be necessary about a hundred years later and was held at Vesāli.[2] The decisions then reached did not settle the differences which had arisen in the Order, and the dissentients forthwith held another Council, which was much more numerously attended and was consequently called the *Mahā-saṇgīti*[3] or Great Council; and thus was created the first formal schism after the death of Gotama. Still another Council is said to have been held at Pātaliputta[4] during the reign of Asoka,[5] whose son Mahinda is said to have converted the inhabitants of Ceylon and carried with him the Sacred Canon still preserved there. Another Council was held, under the patronage of the Emperor Kanishka, in the first century A.D.[6]

growth of Hīnayāna Buddhism compare E. H. Johnston, *Early Sāṃkhya* (1937), p. 14: '. . . We have first the period of the Buddha and his immediate successors, about whose views on philosophical questions little positive assertion can be made. Next comes the period of the earliest dogmatism represented by the greater part of the four Pāli Nikāyas, excluding the small amount of really early matter and those parts which belong to the next period. To the latter belongs the development of the Abhidharma, contained in the earlier books of the Pāli Abhidhamma and the Sarvāstivādin *Jñānaprasthāna* with its six feet, about which latter little is yet known. Finally there is the stage of the full-blown Abhidharma. . . .' See also Int. §§ 2 n, 3, 14, 24, 41, 90, 118; Ch. 1 § 6 [55] n; Ch. 3 § 5 n; Ch. 4 §§ 5 n, 17 n; Ch. 5 *b* §§ 9 n, 10 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 7 n; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 4 n, 24 n; Ch. 7 *b* § 8 n; Ch. 8 *e* § 4; Ch. 9 *a*, n; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 2 n, 15 [4] n; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [6] n; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 1 [1] n, 4 [4] n, 7 [6] n; Ch. 12 *d* §§ 1 [2] n, 2 [11] n, 5 [1] n; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 3 [3] n, 6 [1] n, 10 n; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [10] n; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92] n; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [ii, 1] n, 14 [93], 23 [354] n; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 7 [3] n, 8 [5] n; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 3 [2] n, 5 [189] n, 6 [4] n; 11 [2] n; Ch. 14 *d* § 3 n; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 3 [13] n, 8 n; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 1 [5] n, 6 [5] n, 10 [156] n; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 1 [502] n, 4 [11] n, 5 [2] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7] n; Ch. 17 *a* [4] n; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [90] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1] n; Ch. 20 § 10 [16] n; Ch. 21 §§ 4 [14] n, 7 [25] n, 11 [7] n, [33] n, 19 [7], [10]; Ch. 22 *a* §§ 4 n, 6 [26] n, 8 [41] n, 9 [42] n; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 6 [11] n, 8 [16] n, 9 [18] n, 16 n, 26, 28 n; Ch. 22 *c* §§ 6 n, 12 n; Ch. 23 *b* § 9 n; Ap. B *a* § 2 [8]; Ap. B *c* § 4 [1] n; Ap. D *c*, *Note*; Ap. E *a*, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32] n; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*, and § 4 [3] n; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2 n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [39] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) n; Ap. H 1, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10] n; Ap. H 4 c § 1 n; Ap. I *b* § 3 n. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 (*indications*); Ap. G 1 *b* § 6 n.

[9] IN 8.

[10] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 213; KM, p. 101; cp. Keith, *Buddh. Phil.* (1923), p. 16; ThB, pp. 165–8.

---

[1] Ch. 8 *d* (*ordination ceremony*), and 8 *e* (*Vinaya*); Ap. A 1 *b* (3).

[2] Ch. 11 *c*, n. See Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 215; Kern, *Manual of Indian Buddhism*, p. 103; cp. A. B. Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, p. 16.

[3] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 217; Kern, *Manual*, p. 105; cp. A. B. Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, pp. 16, 148–9.

[4] About 240 B.C. Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*. See V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., pp. 55, 74; Kern's *Manual*, p. 110.

[5] IN 5 *a*; Int. § 48 (*teachers*).

[6] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 239; Kern, *Manual*, p. 119.

All these were held before the rise of the Northern Buddhist school known as the Mahā-yāna (Great Vehicle),[1] as distinguished from the Hīna-yāna (Little Vehicle) or old Indian, sometimes called Southern, school of Buddhism.[2]

57. A continual process of divergence from the original doctrines of the Teacher is thus evident.[3] It is noticeable that the *Mahā-saṅgīti*,[4] or Great Council of dissentients mentioned above, stigmatized by the *Dīpavaṃsa* (*Bhānavārav*) as 'heretics', not only passed resolutions relaxing the strict ascetic rules by means of 'indulgences', but rejected a large part of the Canon as now known, thus apparently resisting, though with imperfect success, the tendency to Hinduize[5] the practice, and to add to the number of the sacred books, of Buddhism. The tendency to add to the Canon is evident from Buddhaghosha's account of the first Council. Of this account T. W. Rhys Davids writes:

'In the Commentarial tradition of the procedure at the First Council, as told by Buddhaghosa (Sum. Vil., i. 15), in the Commentary on the *Dīgha Nikāya* [No. 33, the *Saṅgīti Suttanta*], it is related that whereas Ānanda was required to testify to the circumstances under which every Sutta in the Nikāya [*Dīgha Nikāya*] was uttered, the other three [early] Nikāyas were handed over to the disciples of (the late) Sāriputta, Mahā-Kassapa (the president) and Anuruddha respectively. Thus it was the *Majjhima* that fell to the school of Sāriputta.'[6]

58. Thus neither the fifth or *Khuddaka Nikāya* nor the *Abhidhamma* (the third, explanatory or metaphysical *Piṭaka*) receives mention in the earliest tradition of the first Council, and both consequently may be deemed as later and less authoritative additions, however ancient. Both the *Abhidhamma* and the fifth *Nikāya* indeed are mentioned in a later portion of Buddhaghosha's narrative (in § 41 and § 42 respectively), but that these did not form part of the original tradition is evidenced by the fact that reciters of the *Vinaya* or Rules (viz. Upāli) and first four Nikāyas (as above) are named, the *Abhidhamma* and

[1] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 240; Kern, *Manual*, p. 119.

[2] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India* (1917), pp. 171–3.

[3] 'If, on the one hand, we compare the short precepts of the Pāṭimokkha, and, on the other, the stories, the endless *pariyāya*, the whole of the great apparatus that is brought forward in these Vinaya books [Ch. 8 *b*], we shall find a very distinct contrast between the two literary epochs reflected in the said works. . . . A careful investigation of the Sutta-piṭaka would lead to similar results. As in the case of the Vinaya, we should be able to distinguish various strata representing the literary activity of those different periods': H. Oldenberg, *Vin. Piṭ.*, 1879, vol. i, p. xxiii.

[4] Ch. 11 *c*, n. They 'broke up the old Scriptures and made a new recension . . . destroyed much of the spirit by holding to the shadow of the letter . . . partly rejected the Sutta and Vinaya . . . the six books of the Abhidhamma, the Patisambhida [*Khuddaka Nikāya*], the Nidesa [*Khud. Nik.*], and a portion of the Jātaka [*Khud. Nik.*]': *Dīpa-vaṃsa*, *Bhānavāra* v (Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 217). See ThB, pp. 252–3. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7] n.

[5] IN 7 (*Devadatta's Schism*); Ch. 3 § 7 *n*. Ap. C *a*, *Note*.

[6] Introduction to the *Saṅgīti Suttanta* [*Digha* 33], in *Dialogues of the Buddha*, translated by Rhys Davids, Part III, p. 198.

Khuddaka Nikāya are left to unknown collectors. From the confused manner in which Ānanda is sometimes said to have been the authority for every Sutta in the Nikāyas and sometimes the reciter of the first Nikāya only, one may perhaps gather that the other great disciples mentioned or their schools were authorized by the Council to form supplementary collections of Suttas. This would be the business-like thing to do, and these early Councils understood practical procedure and the nature of affairs.[1]

NOTE 7

HINDUIZATION DURING BUDDHA'S LIFETIME;[2] DEVADATTA'S SCHISM[3]

59. The controversy of Devadatta, Gotama's cousin, with the Buddha in the later years of the latter's mission throws much light upon the nature of Gotama's teaching and upon opposing tendencies within the Order. Gotama's aim was the extinction of egoism by means of the analysis contained in the Four Noble Truths and especially by the social activity of the Eightfold Path;[4] Devadatta aimed at transcending the ego by ascetic practices, similar to those of the orthodox Hindus,[5] so reverting to the position of Gotama before the Enlightenment.

60. The following account of the Schism is given by T. W. Rhys Davids[6] in his *Buddhism* (pp. 75–7) on the authority of the *Vinaya Piṭaka* (*Culla-vagga*, VII. iii. 14–17):

'. . . Gautama came to Rājagriha to spend the rainy season in the Veḷuvana Wihāra, and Devadatta still professing himself a Buddhist, asked permission to found a new Order under his own leadership, the rules of which should be much more stringent than those adopted by Gautama. The refusal of this is said to have determined him to break with Buddhism altogether, and to found a new religion of his own. . . . [He] formally called upon Gautama to insist on the stricter rules which he advocated. These were, that the mendicants should live in the open air, and not close to towns; should dress in cast-off rags; should always beg their food from door to door (that is never accept invitations, or food sent to the Wihāras); and should eat no meat; Gautama answered that his precepts could be kept in any place, and that he had no objection to such members of the Order as wished to do so keeping stricter rules, but that they were not necessary,

[1] See the whole of Ch. 8, especially 8 A (*d*) and (*e*), and 8 B (*j*); also Ap. H 1 § 4 and Ap. H 2 § 5.

[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17] n.

[3] Int. §§ 57 n, 170; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 19 *b*; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*. The first four Nikāyas mention Devadatta's secession in merely general terms (*Majjh. Nik.*, I, pp. 192, 393; *Saṃ. Nik.* I, p. 153, II, pp. 156, 163–4; *Ang, Nik.* II, p. 73, III, pp. 123, 402, IV, pp. 160, 164, 402); for details reference must be made to portions of the *Vin. Piṭ.* which are possibly of later date.

[4] Ap. F 2 *d* (*Eightfold Path*).

[5] Ch. 3 § 7.

[6] 'The relation in which Devadatta stood to Gautama seems to have resembled, in some essential points, the relation in which the Judaizing Christians stood to St. Paul': Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 77 n.

and could not be kept at all by the young or delicate; as to food, the members of the Order might eat whatever was customary in the countries where they were, so long as they eat without indulgence of the appetite. It was possible to become holy at the foot of a tree, or in a house; in cast-off clothes, or in clothes given by laymen; whilst abstaining from flesh, or whilst using it. To establish one uniform law would be a hindrance in the way of those who were seeking Nirvāna; and it was to show men the way to Nirvāna[1] which was his sole aim. Devadatta upon this returned to his own Wihāra, and founded a new and stricter Order, which gradually grew in numbers. . . .'

61. In refusing Devadatta's propositions Gotama once more emphasized his rejection of all isolation, ascetic self-seeking, and self-righteousness. The *Saṃgha* was a society for the teaching and service of others, not an isolated class of devotees straining towards ultimate emancipation.

62. It would appear that Devadatta and his followers, demanding the strictest asceticism, rejected Gotama, on account of the latter's persistent advocacy of the Middle Way,[2] and turned to the Tathāgatas, the previous Buddhas,[3] to whom Gotama possibly referred in general terms from time to time as teachers of the ancient doctrine of Selflessness, and to whom in course of time specific names were given. From Fa Hian[4] we learn that in the fifth century A.D. the followers of Devadatta, established near Srāvasti, rejected Gotama and reverenced the three previous Buddhas and especially Kaṣyapa Buddha, who was declared to be the latest of the line.[5] Thus Devadatta evidently secured important and lasting support among the more conservative Buddhists, who still held to the Hindu ideal of the strictest asceticism as the true road to ultimate bliss, and turned their thoughts to the past, real or imaginary, and were perhaps largely responsible for the reintroduction of the sanctions of Saṃsāra and Rebirth,[6] that wonderful Indian system of reward and punishment leading the spirit of man onward by means of desire and fear, which to Gotama, with his non-personal ideal,[7] must have seemed selfish, but which certainly point to the path of virtue in every other respect.

63. It is noticeable that in the Ceylonese *Kamma-vācā*[8] the Four Reliances are so stated that the strict form, exactly as demanded by Devadatta,[9] appears first in each case, and the allowable 'exceptions', as in the Middle Way of Gotama, follow. The *Kamma-vācā* rules are very ancient and may have been drawn from India at the time of the conversion of Ceylon in the reign of Asoka. This suggests the wide

[1] Ap. C *b*.
[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].
[3] See *Buddha-vaṃsa* (lives of the 24 previous Buddhas and of Gotama Buddha); Int. § 74 n; Ap. A 2 *c*.
[4] See Beal's translation, pp. 82, 83.
[5] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 181.
[6] Int. § 4; Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*).
[7] Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*); Ap. D (*Egoism the origin of sorrow and evil*).
[8] Ap. H 2 *a* § 5.
[9] *Culla-vagga*, bk. vii; OB, p. 180.

influence in early times of Devadatta's opinions or of similar Hinduizing views.

NOTE 8

HINDUIZATION AFTER BUDDHA[1]

(a) *The Return of the Gods; Spirits*[2]

64. Gotama's own belief regarding the origin and government of the phenomenal world is indicated in the latter part of the *Tevijja Sutta*[3] in the *Dīgha-Nikāya*. There he states that in the practice of the four *Brahma-vihārā* or Divine Virtues, namely, universal love or charity (*mettā*), universal pity (*karuṇā*), universal sympathy with joy (*muditā*), and serenity (*upekkhā*),[4] will be found a means of union with the Highest. In the earlier part of the same Sutta he ridicules the notion of union with Brahmā, the chief deity of the Hindus, on the ground that none of the teachers who profess to be able to secure this union has any knowledge of, or any possibility of knowing, the god with whom union is to be secured. The *Brahma-vihārā* are all unifying qualities, in accord with a belief in a common divine impersonal origin as the *Brahman* of the Vedāntists,[5] the universal soul, *Ātman or Paramātman*. In the exercise of these virtues the worshipper is bidden to fill all the six regions of the heavens (the four quarters, the zenith, and the nadir) with thoughts of them severally.

65. In the *Siṇgālovāda Sutta*[6] the householder Siṇgāla, who is found by Gotama near the ancient city of Rājagaha turning to the Hindu gods of the six regions of the heavens, is bidden by Buddha to cease from such practices and in the future to make offerings only of duty to his fellow men divided into six classes beginning with parents and teachers.

66. In the First Sermon[7] setting forth the Four Noble Truths, the fundamentals of the Dhamma, there is no mention whatsoever of gods

[1] This point needs consideration apart from the question how far the Hindu doctrine of Karma was accepted (i) by Buddha himself, and (ii) by his later followers: IN 1–6; Int. §§ 22 n, 24, 28; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] n; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; also Ch. 8 *h* § 2 n, and Ap. I, *Note* (*Sāṇkhya*). The influencing forces are Vedānta (idealistic monism), Saṇkhya (dualism), and Yoga (spirit-union), Jainism (personal salvation through rebirth), Bhakti (personal adoration), and an ever-recurring animism with corresponding charms and rites (Ap. G 2 *c*).

[2] IN 2 *b*; IN 6 (*Canon*) n; Int. §§ 35, 35 ii, n, 49, 88, 93, 118, 134, 176; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5]; Ch. 13 *c* § 17 n; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2] (*Devadatta*); Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [1] n; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n; Ch. 21 § 11 [12] n; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 9 [18] n, 28; Ch. 22 *c* §§ 3, 6; Ap. A 2 *d*; Ap. C *a* § 1 [94]; Ap. D *b* § 6 [1]; Ap. D *c* § 4 (*Āsuras*). Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*); Ap. G 2 *b* (*Power*); Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 (*Brahmā*). The first two subdivisions of the poetical *Sagātha-vagga* of the *Saṃyutta-Nikāya* are called *Devatā-saṃyutta* and *Devaputta-saṃyutta*. It is noticeable that there are no great female deities in the Hīnayāna Canon. Excepting a few names in common, the mythology developed by the 'Western' Brāhmans and that adopted by the Hīnayāna Buddhists of the Middleland are independent. *The Gods of Northern Buddhism* by Alice Getty (1914) should be consulted.

[3] Int. § 37.

[4] Cp. the Stoic *ataraxia* (unperturbedness) IN 10 (*Stoicism*) n.

[5] Int. § 97, and § 8.

[6] Int. §§ 29, 74, 134.

[7] Ch. 5 *b*.

or spirits; but the last section of the Noble Eightfold Path, which is the Fourth Noble Truth, is *Sammā-samādhi*, right-rapture, ecstasy or meditation, which was afterwards developed, doubtless by the Buddha's later followers, into the four stages of Trance (*Jhāna*).[1] In these trances may be seen a return to the practice of *Yoga*,[2] associated with the beliefs of the Vedāntists, who apparently were Gotama's teachers.[3]

67. The *Paticca-samuppāda* or Process of Dependent Origination,[4] the course of reasoning which is supposed to have occurred to the Buddha at the time of his Enlightenment,[5] shows the automatic rise of the individual, or perhaps rather the sense of individuality, from the universal, followed by the reverse of the process.[6] This process in the form, or rather the two forms, in which it has come down to us is confused and doubtless differs considerably from that which originally occurred to Gotama, but in any case the *Paṭicca-samuppāda*[7] is necessarily opposed to belief in a personal deity or deities, as Creator of the Universe or as rulers of the world.[8]

68. Gotama rejected the personal deities of Hinduism, and to him, it would appear, the source and origin of things was the impersonal Brahman,[9] the Divine, the Eternal, the Breath, the Life, the Mysterious, the Uncomprehended, the One, All. To the minds of his later followers, however, the gods and spirits of India, Hindu or otherwise, once more appealed.

69. In the account of the great Enlightenment given in the Pāli Introduction to the Jātaka (*Nidāṇa-Kathā*)[10] which is drawn from the Canon, the tempter Māra[11] and the gods headed by Sakka[12] figure largely, the one as opponent and the others as supporters of the future Buddha. The Bodhisatta is defended by Sakka, Brahmā,[13] Mahā-Kālanāga-rāja, King of Snakes,[14] and others. It is noticeable that the gods are all put to flight by Māra's army, and so prove inferior[15] to the human Teacher, who is victorious.[16] A chief part of the attack directed against the Bodhisatta is led by Māra's three daughters, personifications of Craving (*Taṇhā*), Discontent (*Aratī*), and Lust

[1] Ap. I *a* (*Jhāna*) n. [2] Int. § 8.
[3] Int. § 178; Ap. D *b*, *Note* (*Vedānta*). [4] Ap. B *c*.
[5] Ch. 4 § 10 [i, 2]. [6] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. [7] IN 8 *c*; Int. § 86.
[8] Int. 178 (*Brahman*); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Fundamental Unity*).
[9] The fundamental power underlying, in the Hindu mind, the three aspects of Creator (*Brahmā*), Preserver (*Vishnu*), and Destroyer (*Shiva*). Cp. the Vedic hymn to the 'All-Creating' and the song of 'Creation', *Ṛig-Veda*, x. 81 and 129 (A. A. Macdonell, *History of Sanskrit Literature*, 1900); also the hymn of the Stoic Cleanthes. Int. § 39. [10] Ch. 4 § 4.
[11] Int. §§ 35 (ii), 93 (iv); Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 27 n; Ch. 15 *a*, n, and § 8 [248] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [261] n; Ch. 21 § 11 [7–11] n; Ap. G 2 *b*.
[12] Int. § 93 (i); Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [2] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [29] n. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 27 n.
[13] Int. §§ 35 (i), 93 (ii); Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n; Ch. 14 d § 3 n; Ch. 15 *a* § 4 n; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84]. [14] Int. §§ 93 (vii), 188. [15] Int. § 35 (ii).
[16] Cp. *Sutta-Nipāta*, No. 28, which narrates in old ballad form the temptation of the future Buddha. See Oldenberg, *Buddha*, Stuttgart, 1923, pp. 97, 102 n.

(*Rāgā*). The account[1] of Māra's reflections on his defeat is very suggestive of the growth of the tradition,[2] giving first the Ten Perfections[3] (*dasa pāramiyo*) of the Buddha, viz. Charity (*dāna-pāramī*), Goodness (*sīla-pāramī*), Self-sacrifice (*nekkhamma-pāramī*), Wisdom (*pañña-pāramī*), Exertion (*viriya-pāramī*), Long-suffering (*khanti-pāramī*), Truth (*sacca-pāramī*), Resolution (*adhiṭṭhāna-pāramī*), Kindness (*mettā-pāramī*), Equanimity (*upekkhā-pāramī*); and then adding matter of a mystical and magical character, probably a monkish addition. The text is as follows:[4]

'Then [Mara] thinking, "I did not attain the Ten Perfections, the conditions precedent to the acquisition of the extraordinary knowledge of the objects of sense [*indriya-paropariyāñāṇa*], and therefore I have not become like him", he drew the eleventh line. Then thinking, "I did not attain to the Ten Perfections, the conditions precedent to the acquisition of the extraordinary knowledge of inclinations and dispositions [*āsayānusaya-ñāṇa*], of the attainment of compassion [*mahā-karuṇāsamāpatti-ñāṇa*], of the double miracle [*yamakapātihīra-ñāṇa*], of the removal of hindrances [*anāvarana-ñāṇa*], and of omniscience [*sabbaññūta-ñāṇa*]; therefore I have not become like him", he drew the five other lines.[5] And so he sat on the highway, drawing sixteen lines for these sixteen thoughts.'

The temptation by Māra does not appear in the much older *Maha-Vagga* account[6] of the four-times seven[7] days following the Great Enlightenment. It is mentioned, however, briefly, and in another form, in the *Book of the Great Decease*[8] (ch. iii).

70. Towards the close of the famous narrative of the First Sermon called the *Dhammacakkappavattana-Sutta* it is narrated[9] that the first of the Buddha's First Five Disciples, Kondañña, on this account named Aññāta-Kondañña (Koṇḍañña who realized), was convinced and converted. The Buddha's joy was naturally great. In the closing words of the narrative, moreover, the joy of all the heavens at this commencement of the course of the Wheel of the Law (*Dhamma*) is poetically described. The spirits (*devā*) of the earth[10] gave forth a shout which was taken up by those of the spirit-spheres above, up to the seventh sphere,[11] the world of Brahmā,[12] beginning with that of the

[1] Ch. 4 § 6 n. [2] Int. § 3. [3] Int. §§ 101, 102; Ap. F 2 *a*.
[4] *Buddhist Birth Stories*, tr. by T. W. Rhys Davids, vol. i, p. 106; Ch. 4 § 4 [71] (*Ten Perfections*).
[5] On this supernatural knowledge cp. Ap. H 1 § 5 (*supernatural knowledge*); Ap. I *b* § 3 (*superhuman*). [6] OB, p. 135 n; KM, p. 21 n. Ch. 4 (iii).
[7] Ch. 4 §§ 13–15. [8] Ch. 21 § 11 [7–11] n and § 12 [34–37] n.
[9] Ch. 5 *c* §§ 7 and 8 (MV, I. vi. 29–32).
[10] Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [4] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 28; also Int. § 35 (ii); Ch. 9 c § 3 [3].
[11] Int. § 93 (vi); also Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; Ap. B *c* § 4 [4]; Ap. C *b* § 9; Ap. F 1 *a* § 1; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *loka*); Ap. H 5 [93] n (*Vasvatti*). Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (29); also Ch. 1 § 9 n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [25]; Ap. G 2 *b*. The spheres are fully enumerated in Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [9] n. including the region of Death or Yama and the Yāmā devā, and appear somewhat differently elsewhere; Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [2] n; Ch. 17 *a* [4] n.
[12] Ap. C *b*, *Note* and § 8 n; Ap. I *b* §§ 3, 6 [22] n. Cp. Ap. F 2 *b* [6] (*loka*). See also Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n.

four great kings[1] or guardians of the four quarters of the world, and including the Tāvatiṃsa[2] and Tusita heavens. The 'ten-thousand-world-system'[3] quaked, and a miraculous light shone. The names of the Four Great Kings are given in the *Mahā-Govinda Suttanta*:[4] 'At the four quarters of the firmament sat the Four Great Kings. There was Dhataraṭṭha, king of the East . . . Virūḷhaka, king of the South . . . Virūpakkha, king of the West . . . and Vessavaṇa, king of the North, seated facing the South, presiding over his host. . . .' These kings appear already in the sculptures on the Mauryan Stupa at Bharhut erected about the close of the third century B.C.[5]

71. In the earlier part of the *Book of the Great Decease* the Buddha is said to have passed through Pātaligāma[6] (Pātaliputta) on his last journey from Magadha northwards. At this time King Ajātāsattu's ministers were building a fort at this spot to safeguard the kingdom of Magadha against the Vajjians. The narrative records that thousands of earth-spirits (*devatā*) visited the Buddha in a vision and that he thereupon prophesied the future prosperity of the city.[7]

72. He proceeded to Vesāli, and at the termination of his visit he assembled in the 'Service Hall' all the brethren residing in the neighbourhood, and delivered to them a farewell address, bidding them abide by the *Dhamma*, which he had established for 'the good and the gain and the weal of Spirits (*devatā*) and men'. The phraseology here is similar to that used in the instructions to the First Missioners.[8] Thus the spirits in this address, as in the instructions to the Missioners, are placed in subordination to the *Dhamma* (Law) of the Buddha.

73. In the narrative of the Great Enlightenment given in the Pāli Introduction to the *Jātaka* (*Nidāna Kathā*)[9] the Buddha after attaining enlightenment is represented as hesitating before the stupendous task of attempting to convert the world, and all the orders of the heavenly spirits, headed by Brahmā Sahampati (All-Ruler), entreat him to undertake his divine mission. Thus here Brahmā and all the host of spirits are placed in subordination to the Buddha personally, and not only to the Law or *Dhamma*. In the earlier *Mahā-Vagga* (*Vinaya Piṭaka*) account Brahmā Sahampati appears alone.

74. In the address delivered in the Service Hall near Vesāli (recorded in the *Book of the Great Decease*), as in the instructions to the First Missioners the spirits are mentioned only generally. In the narratives of the enlightenment and death of Buddha they have been

[1] Int. § 93 (v); Ch. 1 § 4 [50]; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4]; Ch. 14 *d* § 2 n; cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1].
[2] Ch. 10 *d* § 1; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [5] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 4 [5] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [29] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2.
[3] Ap. B *c* § 1 n. This is elsewhere reduced to a 'thousand-world-system' (Ch. 12 *d* § 4 n; Ch. 15 *a* § 4 n); and still elsewhere to 'ten-world-systems' (Ch. 22 *b* § 3 [4] n).
[4] *Dīgha* 19 § 2 (SBB, iii, p. 259).
[5] Int. § 22 (RDBI, p. 220).
[6] Int. § 145; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [1].
[7] Ch. 20 § 11 [26] n.
[8] IN 2 *b*.
[9] Ch. 5 *a*.

divided into orders and subordinated to named deities.[1] That Gotama did not believe in gods requiring worship seems sufficiently clear.[2] That he did not believe in beings superior to, and risen by means of rebirth from the state of, man seems also clear.[3] But whether he believed that animals and men exhausted the category of conscious beings is not so clear. The phrase 'spirits and men', which occurs in the texts of the address in the Service Hall and in the instructions to the First Missioners, recurs frequently in passages which seem in other respects characteristic of Gotama's own teaching. Through some such opening as this, possibly, left in the Teacher's creed, there entered later Māra, Brahmā Sahampati, Sakka, and the whole host of the Three and Thirty Heavens[4] and endless worlds. Gods and spirits, heavenly portents and miracles, figure largely in the account of the death of the great Teacher in the *Book of the Great Decease*,[5] greatly enhancing the strangeness, if not the real impressiveness, of this fundamentally beautiful narrative. In two poetic Suttantas of the *Dīgha Nikāya*, namely the *Mahā Samaya Suttanta* and the *Ātānātiyā Suttanta*, the gods and spirits supporting or opposed to the Buddha appear in vast hosts and are elaborately classified.[6]

75. In spite of the mention of gods, or rather spirits (*devatā*), in the Canonical Books, and the general belief in them in Gotama's time,[7] there is no proof that he himself accepted the existence of supernatural beings. Mention of them in the Canon appears to be by way of later ornamental addition to enhance the importance of various occasions. Gotama's teaching in no way relies upon a belief in such spirits. At most they may have appeared to him to be possibilities, quite unessential to his creed. Their influence and power, if any, were absolutely ignored by the doctrine.

(*b*) *Miracles*[8]

76. In the *Culla Vagga*[9] (*Vinaya Piṭaka*) there is a description of how Gotama's disciple Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja performed a miracle of a not very dignified kind. A fine begging-bowl had been placed on the top of a lofty bamboo structure by the Seṭṭhi of Rājagaha, and the religious teachers present were invited to remove it by supernatural means. Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja easily discomfited the teachers of the rival sects by floating through the air and appropriating the bowl.

[1] Compare the process by which the Teachers preceding the Buddha became first the three or six (see Kern, *Manual*, p. 64) and ultimately the twenty-four named Tathāgatas preceding Gotama. Int. § 62; Ap. A 2 *c*.

[2] Int. § 65 (*Singālovāda-S.*); also Int. § 29.

[3] Int. § 36. In the popular belief this promotion was natural and desirable (Ap. F 1 *b* § 7 n; cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n, and Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note* (*Bodhisatta*).

[4] The *Tāva-Tiṃsa* Heavens; Int. § 70; Ch. 10 d § 1.

[5] Ch. 22 *b* § 28.

[6] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, pp. 219–36. Ap. A 2 *d*.

[7] See Oldenberg, *Buddha* (Stuttgart, 1923), pp. 135–6.

[8] Int. §§ 22, 88, 94, 188; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 n.

[9] Khandhaka V, Ch. 8; Ap. I *b* (*Magic and Occultism*).

Gotama, it is said, on hearing of this performance expressed strong disapproval, and forbade any such miraculous displays in the future. It may be gathered from this narrative that Gotama disliked pretensions to miraculous powers and that he attempted no such exhibitions himself. His later followers apparently, however, were sensitive regarding the absence of such displays by the great Teacher, and attributed it not to want of ability but to deliberate purpose as in the narrative above.

77. In the *Sīlāni* (a treatise on the Virtues), one of the oldest parts of the *Dīgha Nikāya*,[1] magic and occultism of all kinds practised by the followers of the old religion are mentioned along with other low arts[2] as contrary to the principles of the Buddha. None the less, miracles performed by the Teacher and by his followers appear not infrequently in the Canonical Books, consistency apparently giving way to the desire for effectiveness and strangeness of narrative.

78. In the story of the conversion of Yasa and of his father, the merchant prince (*seṭṭhi*), at Benāres[3] the narrative states that on the approach of the merchant the Blessed One decided that this was an appropriate occasion for displaying his miraculous powers, and he therefore made Yasa though present invisible. And then deciding that the time to close the miracle had arrived, he made Yasa visible once more. The quiet beauty of the narrative and the loftiness of its ethical tone are somewhat disturbed by this interlude.

79. In the early part of the *Book of the Great Decease*, when Gotama had arrived at Pātaligāma, the future capital to be known as Pātaliputta, on his way to the territory of the Vajjians, on the northern bank of the Ganges, the narrative attributes to him a miraculous crossing of the river together with his immediate followers without the aid of boats. The occasion gives rise to some appropriate reflections in verse[4] on the crossing of the stream of worldly desires, or perhaps rather the incident was suggested by the verses, which figured in an older popular poetic narrative. At the close of the same book miraculous powers are attributed to the Teacher's dead body, which at first cannot be raised from the spot where it lies and which subsequently is consumed by divine fires, which are in turn extinguished by supernatural showers, which have been preceded by a knee-deep fall of heavenly Mandārava flowers[5]—miraculous incidents which show how deeply the narrator's feelings were moved.

80. The passages which narrate miracles performed by the Buddha, his followers, his opponents, and the gods, have been omitted from the texts given below, but have been placed in summary form in the footnotes and have been classified in Note 9. None of these marvels is an inherent part of the narrative; all are apparently accretions.

[1] RDBI, pp. 107, 188, 215.
[2] Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
[3] Ch. 6 *a* § 2.
[4] Ch. 20 § 11 [33] n.
[5] Ch. 22 *c* § 3 n.

(c) Māyā, *illusion, idealism.*[1] *Gotama's teachers*;[2] Paṭicca-samuppāda[3] (*Dependent Origination*); Hīna-yāna *and* Mahā-yāna[4]

81. In the *Nidāna-kathā*, or Pāli Introduction to the *Jātaka*, it is stated that Gotama seeking for enlightenment, having reached Rājagaha, the capital of the Magadhan king Bimbisāra, left that city in search of spiritual teachers, and placed himself first under Āḷāra Kāḷāma[5] and then under Uddaka,[6] the disciple of Rāma, and 'acquired from them the eight stages of meditation'.[7] The succeeding passages treating of Gotama's period of discipleship under these Hindu philosophers present somewhat obscurely the Vedānta doctrine of the *Param-ātman* (Universal Soul), and the need of the individual ego to attain re-absorption therein.[8] Though Gotama ultimately rejected the teachings of both these ascetic thinkers, the Brāhman doctrine of the *Param-ātman* evidently remained as the basis of his own doctrine of the impermanence of the individual.[9] It is evident that a close sympathy survived between the greater pupil and his Hindu teachers.[10] On his Enlightenment the Buddha's first feeling was that as Āḷāra Kāḷāma and Uddaka had so nearly attained the truth it was to them that he should first carry the new *Dhamma* (doctrine, law).

82. Āḷāra's doctrine,[11] we learn from the *Majjhima-Nikāya*, conducted to the 'realm of nothingness'; that of Uddaka to the 'realm of neither perception nor yet non-perception'. The six preceding steps mentioned, commencing from the first, are the four trances,[12] the 'realm of infinity of space', and the 'realm of infinity of consciousness'.[13] In this same text a final stage is mentioned, namely, 'the

[1] Int. §§ 22, 88, 96, 117, 178; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2] n; Ap. D *b*; Ap. E *c* ii, *Note.* Cp. Ap. B *c*; Ap. G 1 *a*. 'Perhaps it is in the later Upanishads that we find the conception of illusion most explicitly stated, e.g., in the Svetasvatara Upanishads, xx. i. 10. . . . Many authorities hold the opinion that the doctrine of *Maya* is nothing but a late introduction. . . . Professor Dutt Shastri [in *The Doctrine of Maya*, p. 36] holds the opinion that . . . "though the word is found for the first time in the *Svetasvatara*, the idea may be traced to the later stage of the Vedic Civilisation, and, though not in a systematic and organic form, is already found in the *Rig-Veda* and the Upanishads" ': W. S. Urquhart, *The Upanishads and Life* (Calcutta, 1916), p. 34.

[2] Int. § 178; Ch. 3 § 5 [163] (*Āḷāra Kāḷāma*).

[3] Int. §§ 67, 98 n, 102; Ap. B *c*.

[4] Int. §§ 21 n, 87; Ap. E *c* i 9 n.

[5] Ch. 3 § 4 [66].

[6] Int. § 178.

[7] Ch. 3 § 5 [165] (*nothingness*) n; Ap. I *a* (*Jhāna*) n.

[8] Int. § 97; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] n. Cp. Int. § 8. On Buddhist acquaintance with Vedāntic philosophy compare Rhys Davids's note on the *Kevaddha-sutta, Dīgha* 11 (SBB, ii, p. 274): 'This is a striking, and in all probability intentional, contrast to the Upanishad passages where the same kind of language is used of the Great Soul, the corollary of the human soul. It is one of many instances (as has been pointed out by Father Dahlmann) where the same expressions, used in the Piṭakas of the Arahat, are used in the older or later priestly speculation of God.'

[9] Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*).

[10] Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [165] n (*departed*).

[11] Ch. 3 § 5 [165].

[12] Ap. I *a* (*Jhāna*) n.

[13] All the eight steps are mentioned at the close of the *Mahā-parinibbāna Sutta*, but it is noticeable that in the end the dying Buddha attains *parinibbāna* or final extinction after the fourth trance, and not after any of the four additional stages (Ch. 22 *b* § 25, *Perishable*, n). One may suspect that the latter stages were subsequently added by an age returning to Hindu metaphysics.

cessation of perception and sensation'.[1] This final stage, however, is not a ninth step but an escape from all these intricacies. One may detect that the doctrines of Āḷāra Kāḷāma and Uddaka were Vedāntist and taught a form of pantheism (*māyā*, illusion or idealistic monism), which did not satisfy Gotama's ethical instinct and strong sense of personal responsibility,[2] which latter could never be silenced by his sense of the transience of the individual. The monism of Buddha's ultimate belief is clear enough; but so also is its realism.

83. In rejecting the doctrines of Āḷāra and Uddaka Gotama is said to have stated that they did not lead to 'aversion [from passion], absence [of passion], cessation [of sorrow], quiescence, knowledge, supreme wisdom, and Nirvāna [extinction, peace]'.[3] His rejection of the doctrines of his teachers may be taken to imply his instinctive though still undefined feeling that Nirvāna (peace) is not to be found in a passive or unconscious state, but in a state of pragmatic activity, such as he found later in the Noble Eightfold Path. Both teachers apparently taught some form of the Vedāntist theory of Māyā. Perhaps one may detect the difference that Āḷāra taught a discipline leading to the ideal of the extinction of the individual soul in nothingness by the removal of illusion; whereas Uddaka taught the reabsorption of the individual soul in the universal Soul (*Ātman*), so that its individual perception would be extinguished but not its perception as part of the universal Soul. Neither of these ideals could satisfy Buddha's ethical impulses, since each, while endeavouring to break down the barriers of the ego, is concerned with only the individual ego that seeks salvation, that is to say, is still egoistic. Buddha's compassion was too great for him to leave his fellow sufferers thus.[4] He found the solution not in passive selflessness, but in self-forgetful loving activity, the way of the Eightfold Path.

84. The Middle Way or Eightfold Path of Gotama is the path of duty to be pursued every day here and now.[5] It assumes unquestioningly the world which we see, and guides the action to be taken therein. The path of altruism seems to be necessarily realistic; the illusionist or idealistic view of life is that of a refined egoism searching for its own purification. The outlook of the first two Piṭakas is predominantly realistic; their world is that of the Middle Way of duty to all classes of society.[6] They set forth in picturesque narratives incidents of the life of the Buddha in this material world; the precepts of the Dhamma, of which the centre is the Middle Way of dutiful practice; and the establishment and elaborately practical organization of the Saṃgha or Society of mendicant priests, who under the direction of the powerful

[1] Ch. 3 § 5 [165].
[2] Int. § 42.
[3] Ch. 3 § 5 [165].
[4] Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [xi, 1] (*lok-ānukampāya*) n.
[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] (*majjhima-paṭipadā*). See Int. § 100 (*Social Service*). Cp. Marcus Aurelius, bk. iii, 12; also Asoka's Rock Edict VI (Ap. G 1 *c* § 7, *debt*).
[6] Int. § 53 (*Siṅgālovāda-Sutta*).

and statesmanlike[1] mind of Gotama spread the saving doctrines of the Dhamma over the wide realms of the Middle Land of India during the long years of his leadership. In the Suttas,[2] called after the names of Uttiya,[3] Māluṅkyāputta,[4] and Vaccha,[5] the Teacher steadily refuses to deal with the metaphysical problems which they laid before him. His business is not with such questions but with the practical subject of duty, the Eightfold Path.[6] This Way will lead to the destruction of desire and of sorrow. He offers them the cure for sorrow; it is for his questioners to decide whether they will take it and be free or whether they prefer first to know everything about the nature of the medicine and its origin, and of their sickness and its cause.

85. Realistic, however, as is the prevailing tone of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, and at least the first four Nikāyas of the *Sutta Piṭaka*,[7] it is plain that there was a metaphysical background to the Buddha's doctrine. During the six long years of strenuous asceticism which followed the period of pupilage under Āḷāra and Uddaka, he must have scrutinized deeply the Vedāntist and Monistic theories of the time.[8] In the *Nidāna-kathā* or Pāli Introduction to the *Jātaka* it is stated that after the delivery of the famous First Sermon at Isipatana near Benāres, setting forth the Four Noble Truths, he delivered a second Sermon called the *Anattalakkhaṇa Suttanta*, or Discourse on the Non-existence of Individuality,[9] a discourse which was apparently intended to explain to the First Five Disciples the fundamental monistic principles on which he based the main contention of the Truths, namely that individual desire is the cause of sorrow and can and must be uprooted.

86. In the *Mahā-vagga* (*Vinaya Piṭaka*) it is stated that at the time of the Great Enlightenment the future Buddha discovered the *Paticca-samuppāda*, or Process of Dependent Origination,[10] and here evidently

[1] See the numberless sagacious and practical decisions attributed to Gotama in the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga* of the *Vinaya-Piṭaka*.

[2] IN 2. [3] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4. [4] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3.

[5] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1). [6] IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

[7] The *Abhi-dhamma* (or metaphysical) *Piṭaka* is plainly of a later date. Int. § 14.

[8] He was certainly acquainted either then or later with the teachings of the Jain leader Nāta-putta (Mahā-vīra), who was his somewhat older contemporary (Int. 41 n), and with the various philosophic views of the rest of the Six Teachers—namely (besides Nāta-putta) Pūraṇa Kassapa, Makkhali Gosāla, Ajita Kesa-kambalin, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya Belaṭṭhi-putta—who are constantly mentioned as his chief rivals. Int. § 179; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1].

[9] Or, transience and unreality of phenomena (see Oldenberg's *Buddha*, Stuttgart, 1923, p. 149); 'Inanity of all physical and mental phenomena' (Kern's *Manual*, 1896, p. 24). IN 3 *a*; Int. § 98 n.

[10] 'When the Buddha had taken possession of the seat of full enlightenment he evolved from within two formulas, ever since revealed by him to all beings, and represented as the fundamental truths of his teaching. These formulas are the four Āryasatyāni and the twelvefold Pratītyasamutpāda' (KM, p. 46). With these two formulas should be taken the verses beginning *Ye dhammā-hetuppabhavā* (what things spring from a cause), which repeated by the fifth disciple Assaji, are said to have converted the two famous disciples Sāriputta and Moggallāna. Int. §§ 67, 98 n.

again we have an attempt to explain the metaphysical background of Gotama's Dhamma. The Process is described in more than one place in the Canon, and somewhat differently in the different books.[1] It sometimes appears as a process of twelve steps and is sometimes abbreviated to nine. In the former case the beginning is Ignorance (*avijjā*), implying misapprehension and delusion, from which desire, individuality, and ultimately birth, sickness, old age, death, and sorrows of all kinds proceed. In the forms in which it has come down to us the process is admittedly confused, but it seems possible to perceive in it a substructure of realism overlaid by a later structure of illusionism. The Buddha taught that out of desire and an exaggerated sense of individuality[2] arose the sorrows which accompany man from birth to death, and that the exaggerated sense of individuality arose from delusion. It is not difficult to see how so simply realistic a view of life might be converted to the uses of those of his later followers who inclined towards the ancient Hindu doctrine of Illusion or Māyā.

87. The growth of the theory of Illusion among the sects of the later Buddhists of the *Hīna-yāna*, or old Indian school, is described in A. Berriedale Keith's learned *Buddhist Philosophy*,[3] as also the development of purely idealistic sects of the *Mahā-yāna* school,[4] from about the commencement of the first century of the Christian era.[5]

[1] Ap. B *c* n.

[2] Int. § 3 (*altruism*).

[3] Keith's *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), pp. 148–60. Cp. Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*, and Ch. 8 *e* § 5 n. For the Buddhist sects of the period of Ashvaghosha some 500 years after the death of Buddha, see Prof. E. H. Johnston's introduction (pp. xxiv–xliv) to the *Buddhacarita*, Pt. II (translation), 1936. For the chief Hīnayāna sects and modern views on the same, see also J. B. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism* (1928), ch. xii. Only the general tendency of these sects to Hinduization comes within the scope of the present work.

[4] Keith's *Buddhist Philosophy*, pp. 216–19, 259–63. Int. § 21; Ap. A 2 *c* (*Metteyya*). For further refs. see IN 8 *c* (*Mahāyāna*). A sympathetic and illuminating account of Sanskrit Mahāyāna literature is included in Coomaraswamy's *Buddha*, 1928 (1916), pp. 301–23.

[5] Cp. *Pilgrimage of Buddhism*, pp. 621–2, on the prominent Mahāyānist sect of Tendai in Japan: 'The Tendai universe may be called a divine universe with no "God" in it. The Tendai teaches incarnation, many incarnations, without any deity becoming incarnate. For it, incarnation means not the descent of deity into human flesh, but the ascent of the individual to deity by becoming his true self, which is selfless. "Become what thou art" is its most fundamental command, a command which underlies and transcends all the laws of morality. Many individuals, so Buddhism teaches, have risen from the common level, perhaps an infinite number, to this higher plane of realization and divinization: not in the sense of achieving something essentially new, but by realizing the Buddha nature which was always theirs and which lies, frequently unguessed, in all beings. To know Reality is to be it. To this realization one attains chiefly through cultivation of the two great Buddhist virtues of insight and compassion. These mean much more than mere morality. They include it, but they include metaphysical comprehension and mystical experience as well. When these qualities of soul are fully attained, when self is completely forgotten in love for others and the illusion of separateness, both in theory and in inner feeling, is overcome, one enters into the Buddhahood. This must mean, it would seem, that comparison and insight, in some high sense, constitute the ultimate nature of reality.' Cp. Int. §§ 3, 37.

NOTE 9

HINDUIZING PASSAGES OMITTED FROM THE TEXTS[1]

88. In the following pages taken from the Canon and kindred Pāli books, setting forth the life and doctrines of the Buddha, all passages mentioning gods and particularized spirits[2] have been relegated to footnotes, as also all passages setting forth miraculous events[3] attributed to gods or spirits, to Gotama and his disciples, or to their opponents, also passages treating of supernatural knowledge or prophecies, and similarly all passages and phrases dealing with the Indian doctrine of Rebirth,[4] or based upon the illusionist theory[5] of phenomena. In this way, it is believed, the text proper will not only represent the facts of the life of Gotama more truly, but also will discriminate between the doctrines and opinions of the Buddha himself and those of his later followers, whose opinions and teachings gradually resumed the animistic and popular characteristics from which Buddhism originally diverged. This arrangement at the same time allows the reader to see and to weigh for himself all the matter contained in the relevant portions of the Pāli books.

89. Writing of the *Nidāna-kathā* or Pāli Introduction to the *Jātaka* T. W. Rhys Davids observes: 'The light it throws on the other [later] accounts [of Buddha's life] is often exceedingly interesting and instructive, especially as showing the gradual growth of the supernatural parts of the biography.'[6] With the still more exaggerated wonders and miracles of the Sanskrit *Lalita Vistara*[7] and the other Northern biographies of the Buddha the present work is not concerned. It may be questioned whether they can add anything to our knowledge of the life of Gotama. Such facts as they contain are included in the Life of Buddha given in the *Jātaka Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*), which is based upon the Canonical Books, and includes many marvels in a somewhat less incredible form than that which they assume in the Northern accounts.[8] The same may be said of the Southern narratives (Ceylonese, Burmese,[9] and Siamese), later than the *Nidāna-kathā* upon which they are based, and to which they add nothing

[1] Int. § 3; IN 6 (*Canon*) n.
[2] IN 8 *a*; Int. § 93.
[3] IN 8 *b*.
[4] IN 1–5.
[5] IN 8 *c*; Ap. B *c*, *Note*.
[6] Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1877), p. 13.
[7] RDB, pp. 11–12; KM, pp. 12–13; ThB, pp. xx–xxi.
[8] Int. § 1 (*Nidāna-kathā*); Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 10 *a* § 2 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 2 n. Cp. Ap. A 2; also Ch. 10 *d* § 3 n.
[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 1 n. 'There is no life of Gotama the Buddha in the Buddhist Scriptures. Indeed the only work, so far known to us, that can be called a biography in our Western sense is a quite modern book called the *Mālālankāra Watthu* . . . almost certainly quite two thousand years later than the Buddha himself [translated by Bishop Bigandet as *The Life or Legend of Gaudama the Budha of the Burmese*, 1866]': T. W. Rhys Davids's (lectures on) *Buddhism, its History and Literature*, 2nd ed. 1926, p. 87.

except wonders and ever-increasing numerical figures. The main points, as they emerge from the Canonical Books,[1] present little room for scepticism. Gotama was a Rājput or member of the martial caste, born in the Sakyan clan, was educated and married, became a recluse and searcher after truth, founded a creed, gathered together certain disciples, organized an order of preachers, travelled long through the various States of the Middle-land, preaching and establishing branches of his Order, met certain kings, ministers, and religious teachers, and died in old age, still preaching and striving for the enlightenment of others. These main facts are as well established as any others in history. Further details might be welcome, but are not essential. The only essentials that are doubtful are the exact form of the creed which he himself held and taught to others with so much labour and devotion, and the precise religious and philosophical beliefs of his contemporaries.

90. Respect for the faithfully memorized text is characteristic of the East. It is evident, indeed, that much has been added to the original Canon—doubtless in good faith, in each age, by way of illustration and exegesis—but it is probable that whatever was once enshrined in the text remained unaltered, save by such addition.[2] The search must be made under the several layers of such additions for Gotama's original creed.

91. If the theories of Rebirth and illusion were essentially Buddhist and not Hindu in origin, it follows that medieval and modern Hinduism, of which they are characteristic tenets, must be in essential points Buddhist also: a proposition which cannot be seriously maintained. Whether these theories were developed by Hinduism prior to, or after, the time of Gotama[3] does not affect the argument that they are Hindu theories which were intruded into Buddhism, and not Buddhist theories adopted by Hinduism.[4] Similarly the belief in spirits (animism) is characteristic of primitive tribes, and was imported by them into the doctrines of their Hindu and Buddhist converters, just as many heathen ideas and customs were introduced into Christianity. It was the adoption of these theories that finally merged Buddhism into Hinduism in India. It was the absence of these theories (whatever the stage of development which they had reached) that discriminated the creed of Gotama from that of the Brāhmans of his time, and not merely his rejecting, or rather ignoring, the Vedas,[5] Brāhmanical ritual, and caste, and his insistence upon the selfless activity of the Eightfold Path.

92. *Passages in footnotes (a) regarding Rebirth*[6] *and future states.*

Ch. 1, i (*Bodhisatta, or future Buddha*), § 5 [52] (*previous births*); Ch. 4 § 5 [77] (*past lives*), § 17 (*re-birth of beings*); Ch. 7 *a* § 8

[1] RDB, pp. 12–15. [2] IN 6 (*Canon*). [3] Int. §§ 4 n, 8 n.
[4] Cp. OB, pp. 45–57. [5] Int. § 44.
[6] Int. § 7; IN 1–5; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note* (*Bodhisatta*); Ap. B *a*.

[83] (*a former birth*); Ch. 9 *a* § 14 [22]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8] (*sagga*); Ap. B *c* § 1 (2, *saṃsāra*); Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32]; Ap. H 5 [92].

93. *Passages in footnotes (b) regarding Gods and Spirits.*[1]

(i) *Sakka.*[2]

Ch. 1 § 9 [59]; Ch. 4 §§ 4 [71], 8 [80]; Ch. 5 *a* § 1 [81]; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 2 [xv, 2], 9 [84]; Ch. 11 *d* § 12; Ch. 22 *b* § 27.

(ii) *Brahmā Sahampati.*[3]

Ch. 1 § 5 [52]; Ch. 2 § 7 [64]; Ch. 5 *a* § 1 [81]; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28], Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [30]; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [xv, 2]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 27.

(iii) *Indra*[4] *and other named Gods.*

Ch. 1 § 5 [52]; Ch. 5 *a* § 1 [81]; Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (2–9).

(iv) *Māra.*[5]

Ch. 2 § 4 [62]; Ch. 4 §§ 4 [71], 6 [78]; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28]; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [2]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 20 [18], 25 [43]; Ch. 11 *d* § 14; Ch. 13 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 14 *f* § 3; Ch. 21 § 11 [7–11].

(v) *The Four Kings,*[6] *or Guardians, of the Four Regions.*

Ch. 1 §§ 4 [50], 5 [52]; Ch. 4 § 15 [iv, 1]; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [xv, 2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [9]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 1; Ap. H 5 [93].

(vi) *Spirits of the earth,*[7] *the air, the Brahmā-world, the Heavens*[8] *in general; spirit apparitions.*

Ch. 1, i (*Tusita-heaven*), § 3 [50] (*Tusita-heaven*), [54] (*Tāvatiṃsa-heaven*); Ch. 2 §§ 6 [63], 7 [65] (*Tāvatiṃsa-heaven*); Ch. 3 §§ 6, 7 [67]; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 7, 8 [169]; Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ch. 6 *a* § 3 (*non-human beings*); Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [2] (*Tāvatiṃsa-heaven*); Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 1, 6 [3]; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *d* § 4; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [9]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n (*nymphs*); Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [262] (*Tusita*); Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [5] n (*devaputta*); Ch. 19 *b* § 3

[1] IN 8 *a*; Int. § 88; and Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] n.

[2] Int. § 69; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [53]; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22] n. A subdivision of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* is named after Sakka. The word *sakka* means *able* and as an epithet was applied to different Vedic Gods (SBB, iii, p. 296, Rhys Davids's note). When the position of Sakka is defined it is as head of the Thirty Three (*Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 264; *Saṃ Nik.* i, p. 230).

[3] Int. §§ 35 (i), 69 (*Brahmā*); Ch. 5 *b* § 2 n; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 18 n, 26 n; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5] n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13], [25]; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2. A subdivision of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* is named the *Brahma-saṃyutta*. It includes more than one Brahmā; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14] n. In Dīgha 19 (Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [29] n) Brahmā is definitely given place above Sakka and is a deity on the border of the impersonal and personal (cp. Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note, Brahman*).

[4] Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [25]. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 27 (*Indaka yakkha*). It would appear that such Vedic western (Ch. 1 § 2 n) deities as have been given minor places in the mythology of the Middle-land have not been degraded but merely adopted on hearsay as convenient.

[5] Int. § 69; Ap. G 2 *b*. A subdivision of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* is named after Māra.

[6] Int. § 70; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2.

[7] Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [4] n. Cp. Ap. B *a* § 6 (8, *peta*); Ap. B c § 4 [4] (*ghosts*).

[8] Int. § 70; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 n.

the Law to the Buddha was altruistic,[1] as to the Stoics the law of nature was social.

98. The famous verses (*Ye dhammā hetu-ppabhavā*)[2] which are said to have converted the chief disciples Sāriputta[3] and Moggallāna may be rendered as follows: 'All natures (*dhammā*) springing from a cause (*hetu-ppabhavā*) arise and dissolve: 'tis this the Mighty Monk proclaims.'[4] From this summary statement the two gifted Brāhman students, already disciples of the philosophic teacher, Sañjaya, are said to have deduced immediately the main doctrines of the Buddha, that is the teaching centred in the Four Noble Truths, including the Eightfold Path.[5] To be thus fruitful the verses above must have conveyed something more than the merely negative idea of transience. They must have implied to the two young Brāhmans not only the transience of all created things but the permanence of the uncreated;[6] the transience of the many, the permanence of the One. From this positive idea of the unity and eternity of the Whole (*Ātman*) would flow the ideas of the common origin and bond uniting all individuals, and of a durability in which generation after generation of transient individuals share. These are the ideas conveyed by the first three Noble Truths, which state that all sorrows arise from individualist desires, and the fourth Truth which points out the way of self-forgetful activity, serving the purposes not of the individual but of the whole.

99. Such views would unite them with the Stoics, who found a divine principle in the One,[7] and not with the Epicureans to whom the universe and its processes were mechanical, so that to the former fraternal love and social duty seemed natural and imperative,[8] while the philosophy of the latter school culminated in enlightened egotism.[9]

[1] Int. § 38. [2] Ch. 7 *a* § 19. [3] Int. § 30.

[4] H. C. Warren (*Buddhism in Translations*, p. 89) translates as follows:

The Buddha hath the causes told
Of all things springing from a cause;
And also how things cease to be—
'Tis this the Mighty Monk proclaims.

These verses must be read in close connexion with the Process of Dependent Origination (*Paticca-samuppāda*, IN 8 *c*; Int. § 86), which is said to have been discovered by the Bodhisatta immediately before the Enlightenment, and with the *An-attalakkhaṇa Suttanta* (Int. § 85), which the Buddha delivered immediately after the First Sermon.

[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 8 n. [6] Ap. G 2 *a* § 7.

[7] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. iii, ch. 11; bk. v, ch. 30; bk. vi, ch. 42; bk. viii, ch. 50; bk. ix, ch. 1; bk. xii, ch. 32. Cp. Ap. E *a*, *Note* (*impulse*). Compare: 'The whole matter, however, appears very differently when we regard, as it seems to me for the reasons already stated that we must, our whole universe as embodying the manifestation of God, and our individual lives as deriving their only final reality from the manifestation in them of God. On this view the death of an individual is no disappearance of spiritual reality, but something in which God's manifestation is still present': Prof. J. S. Haldane's lecture 'Modern Idolatry', in his *Materialism*, 1932, pp. 178–9.

[8] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 1; bk. vi, ch. 45; bk. vii, ch. 5, 13; bk. viii, ch. 34; bk. ix, ch. 22; bk. x, ch. 6, 20; bk. xii, ch. 26.

[9] See Zeller, *Stoics, Epicureans, and Sceptics* (1870), pp. 449–55. Ap. E *b*, *Note*.

NOTE 10

PARALLELISM OF THE DHAMMA AND STOICISM;[1] TWO EARLY SYSTEMS OF SELF-CONTROL AND MUTUAL SERVICE, BASED UPON RATIONALISM[2] AND NATURAL LAW

97. The first of Gotama's sermons is known as the *Dhammacakka-ppavattana-Sutta* (the discourse setting the Wheel of the Dhamma or Law in motion).[3] The word *Dhamma* (Sanskrit, *Dharma*)[4] means originally the natural condition of things or beings, and so the law of their existence. The original meaning is brought out clearly in compound words, as in *vaya-dhammā saṃkhārā* (perishable-by-nature are compounds, i.e. individuals),[5] in the last utterance of Gotama.[6] It is notable that as Gotama called his doctrine (*Dhamma*) after the Nature of things or Natural Law, the Stoics similarly based their teaching upon *Phusis* or Nature, insisting as they did upon the need of living 'according to nature'—*kata phusin*.[7] Man is by nature and its law (*nomos*), according to the Stoics, a social animal (*koinōnikos*),[8] just as according to Aristotle he is a political animal; and they found their ethical ideal in his fulfilment of his social nature. At the basis of Gotama's Dhamma was the doctrine of Non-Ego;[9] and, since the world was to him, though in one sense illusory, yet real, not ideal as to the Vedāntists,[10] and activity in it was imperative, it followed that

[1] Int. §§ 6, 9, 19, 64; Ch. 4 § 18 n; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [3] n; Ch. 9 *a* §§ 2 [2] n, 10; Ap. E *c* i, *Note*; Ap. F 1, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (Six teachers), and § 3 (i) [23]. Cp. J. B. Pratt, *The Pilgrimage of Buddhism* (1928), pp. 31–3: 'India produced also its sophists (Int. § 126 n), physicists (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [26]), atomists (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*, *Vaiṣeshika*), and sceptics (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [32]); even its cynics (Ch. 13 *d* § 5). In the beautiful Tevijja Sutta (Int. § 35, i) Gotama displays the intellectual characteristics of a Socrates, a Plato, and an Aristotle, refuting by question, answer, and definition the claims of the Brāhmans to a knowledge of the Gods, then soaring upon a flight of survey through all worlds, and returning to classify the divine virtues which harmonize all things. In the Siṅgālovāda-Sutta (Ch. 9 *b*) again he shows the mental qualities of a Zeno or a Confucius, surveying in one view the world of daily duties. In the Vinaya Rules (Ap. H 3, *Note*) organizing the Saṃgha the founder displays an Aristotelian grasp of detail and power of systematization extending to secular affairs.' Cp. Ch. 7 *c*, final note (*genius*).

[2] Ap. G 1 *a*.

[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 1.

[4] Mrs. Rhys Davids translates *Dhamma* as 'Norm'. See her *Buddhism* (1912), pp. 32–3. See also IN 5 *b*. The one idea underlying all uses of this difficult word seems to be that of unseen regulating power or nature. See A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), 68 ff.

[5] What we call individuals are called in Pāli *saṃkhārā*, i.e. compounds—the *pañc 'upādāna-kkhandhā*, i.e. fivefold grasping aggregates, of the First Noble Truth in the First Sermon. Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ap. E *a*.

[6] Ch. 22 *b* § 25.

[7] Int. § 39; Ap. E *b*, *Note*.

[8] Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. iii, ch. 4. For the social aspect of Stoicism see *A Selection from the Meditations of the Emperor Marcus Aurelius Antoninus*, translated and annotated by J. G. Jennings (1917).

[9] *Sabbe dhammā an-attā*. Int. § 36 (*formula*), and Ap. E *c* i, *Note*.

[10] Int. §§ 64, 81; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

the Law to the Buddha was altruistic,[1] as to the Stoics the law of nature was social.

98. The famous verses (*Ye dhammā hetu-ppabhavā*)[2] which are said to have converted the chief disciples Sāriputta[3] and Moggallāna may be rendered as follows: 'All natures (*dhammā*) springing from a cause (*hetu-ppabhavā*) arise and dissolve: 'tis this the Mighty Monk proclaims.'[4] From this summary statement the two gifted Brāhman students, already disciples of the philosophic teacher, Sañjaya, are said to have deduced immediately the main doctrines of the Buddha, that is the teaching centred in the Four Noble Truths, including the Eightfold Path.[5] To be thus fruitful the verses above must have conveyed something more than the merely negative idea of transience. They must have implied to the two young Brāhmans not only the transience of all created things but the permanence of the uncreated;[6] the transience of the many, the permanence of the One. From this positive idea of the unity and eternity of the Whole (*Ātman*) would flow the ideas of the common origin and bond uniting all individuals, and of a durability in which generation after generation of transient individuals share. These are the ideas conveyed by the first three Noble Truths, which state that all sorrows arise from individualist desires, and the fourth Truth which points out the way of self-forgetful activity, serving the purposes not of the individual but of the whole.

99. Such views would unite them with the Stoics, who found a divine principle in the One,[7] and not with the Epicureans to whom the universe and its processes were mechanical, so that to the former fraternal love and social duty seemed natural and imperative,[8] while the philosophy of the latter school culminated in enlightened egotism.[9]

[1] Int. § 38. [2] Ch. 7 *a* § 19. [3] Int. § 30.

[4] H. C. Warren (*Buddhism in Translations*, p. 89) translates as follows:

The Buddha hath the causes told
Of all things springing from a cause;
And also how things cease to be—
'Tis this the Mighty Monk proclaims.

These verses must be read in close connexion with the Process of Dependent Origination (*Paticca-samuppāda*, IN 8 *c*; Int. § 86), which is said to have been discovered by the Bodhisatta immediately before the Enlightenment, and with the *An-attalakkhaṇa Suttanta* (Int. § 85), which the Buddha delivered immediately after the First Sermon.

[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 8 n. [6] Ap. G 2 *a* § 7.

[7] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. iii, ch. 11; bk. v, ch. 30; bk. vi, ch. 42; bk. viii, ch. 50; bk. ix, ch. 1; bk. xii, ch. 32. Cp. Ap. E *a*, *Note* (*impulse*). Compare: 'The whole matter, however, appears very differently when we regard, as it seems to me for the reasons already stated that we must, our whole universe as embodying the manifestation of God, and our individual lives as deriving their only final reality from the manifestation in them of God. On this view the death of an individual is no disappearance of spiritual reality, but something in which God's manifestation is still present': Prof. J. S. Haldane's lecture 'Modern Idolatry', in his *Materialism*, 1932, pp. 178–9.

[8] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 1; bk. vi, ch. 45; bk. vii, ch. 5, 13; bk. viii, ch. 34; bk. ix, ch. 22; bk. x, ch. 6, 20; bk. xii, ch. 26.

[9] See Zeller, *Stoics, Epicureans, and Sceptics* (1870), pp. 449–55. Ap. E *b*, *Note*.

The relief and peace of mind which the great Epicurean poet Lucretius found in the phrase 'Nothing arises from nothing'[1] (the doctrine of the material nature of the universe, based upon the atomic theory of Democritus), resemble at first sight the enthusiasm with which Gotama's followers received the news that 'all compounds pass away'. In the mechanical or physical theory of cosmogony the arbitrary and dubious gods of the classical world faded away. To the Epicurean this brought the opportunity for unhampered self-development and wisest self-interest; to the Stoic of the best type it brought a sense of natural unity, of community of interests, and the impulse of social service, self-culture being for a common end and not for any individual purpose.[2] Here the resemblance between the teaching of Gotama, based upon the doctrine of the transience of the Ego, and that of the Stoics who did not allow self-culture to obscure the more radical duty of service to the community,[3] is evident once more.[4]

100. Perhaps the most striking resemblance of the teaching of Buddha to that of the Stoics is to be found in the dialogues of Gotama with Uttiya[5] and with Māluñkyāputta.[6] In declaring that questions as to whether the world is eternal or not eternal, finite or infinite and so on, did not concern him or touch the essential point,[7] which is the eradication of egotism and so of sorrow by means of the Eightfold Path, Gotama practically takes the same point of view as that taken, some seven centuries later, by the Stoic Emperor, who insisted that whether the soul be mortal or immortal, whether there be God or gods or only atoms,[8] the duty of man remains clear, namely to fulfil his social, that is his unselfish, nature, and do good without thought of

[1] See Lucretius, *De Rerum Natura*, lib. i, ll. 147–59:

Hunc igitur terrorem animi tenebrasque necesse est
Non radii solis neque lucida tela diei
Discutiant, sed naturae species ratioque:
Principium cuius hinc nobis exordia sumet,
Nullam rem e nilo gigni divinitus unquam.
Quippe ita formido mortalis continet omnis
Quod multa in terris fieri caeloque tuentur
Quorum operum causas nulla ratione videre
Possunt ac fieri divino numine rentur.
Quas ob res ubi viderimus nil posse creari
De nilo, tum quod sequimur iam rectius inde
Perspiciemus, et unde queat res quaeque creari
Et quo quaeque modo fiant opera sine divum.

[2] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism* (1911), p. 284.

[3] Compare Epictetus, *Discourses*, bk. i, ch. 19 (Matheson's translation, vol. i, p. 103) with Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. iv, ch. 3.

[4] Cp. the late Prof. Huxley's comparison of Buddhism with Stoicism in his Romanes Lecture included in his collected works. And see also E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism* (1911), pp. 14–17, 54, 295 n, on the general resemblance of the Buddhist Sage and the Wise Man of the Cynics who passed on this ideal to the Stoics.

[5] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4. [6] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3. [7] IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

[8] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. vi, ch. 24; bk. vii, ch. 32; bk. ix, ch. 38, ch. 39; bk. x, ch. 6.; bk. xi, ch. 18 (1); bk. xii, ch. 14. Int. § 84; Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [2] n; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*.

reward. This is the modern doctrine of Social Service,[1] which also may be said to be the ethical foundation of all the great religions.

101. The most characteristic of Stoic virtues is *apatheia*, 'apathy' (tranquillity), or *ataraxia* (unperturbedness).[2] This virtue is the fourth and last of the *Brahma-vihārā* (divine attitudes)[3] enumerated in the famous *Tevijja Sutta*, namely, *upekkhā* (serenity), and is also the last of the Ten Perfections[4] requisite for a *Bodhisatta* (future Buddha). This tranquillity or serenity is the frame of mind which in its perfection characterizes the blissful state of Nibbāna.[5] The ideal of Nibbāna, or the extinction of the self in this life, as taught by Buddha, is not a merely negative and passive state of extinction, but a positive and active condition implying love, pity, and sympathy, as well as the final virtue of serenity. Its object is neither repose nor heaven,[6] but universal charity or love.[7] In other words it is not egoistic or individualistic, but altruistic or social. It aims not at ascetic purity and isolation from the world,[8] but at social service.[9]

102. There are other striking parallelisms between the ethical teaching of the Buddha and the reflections of the noblest of Roman Stoic writers, that great and self-forgetful servant of the public, the Emperor Marcus Aurelius. Just as wisdom (*paññā*)[10] is placed among the essential virtues by Buddhism, and the Great Teacher is named the Enlightened (*Buddha*),[11] so Knowledge is the foundation of the Stoic virtues,[12] and the Wise Man[13] is made the model and ideal of the Stoic writers. In the Process of Dependent Origination (*Paticca samuppāda*)[14] the first step in the series which culminates in birth, sickness, old age, death, and all the sorrows is ignorance (*a-vijjā*), and it is only by the abolition of ignorance that sorrows and apparent evils can be brought to an end. So ignorance is insisted upon by the Stoic philosophers as the origin of error[15] and all apparent ills;[16] and the chain of causation figures in the Roman Emperor's *Meditations* as the

[1] Int. § 84. Cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 7 (*debt*).

[2] Int. §§ 105 n, 107; Ap. F 1, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *a* (162). See Zeller, *Stoics, Epicureans, and Sceptics* (1870), p. 22.

[3] Ap. F 2 *b*. [4] Int. § 69. [5] Ap. C *b*.

[6] IN 2 *a*; Int. § 48; Ap. C *a* § 2.

[7] Ap. F 1 *a* (*Dāna*); Ap. F 1 *b* (*Mettā*).

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] (*majjhimā paṭipadā*).

[9] Ch. 6 *b* § 1 (*lok-ānukampayā*) n.

[10] *Paññā* (wisdom, intelligence) is the third and last of the essential points of the Dhamma, mentioned in the famous Comprehensive Discourse delivered on numerous occasions by Gotama during his last journey (Ch. 20 § 8). It is the fourth and last of the Ten Perfections (Int. § 69) which begin with *Dāna* (generosity, altruism) and end with *upekkhā* (tranquillity).

[11] A future Buddha is called a *Bodhisatta* (wisdom-being or embodiment of wisdom); Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

[12] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 285, 295; Epictetus, *Discourses*, bk. i, ch. 18 (3, 4).

[13] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 16, 295.

[14] IN 8 *c*.

[15] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 1.

[16] See ibid., bk. iv, ch. 3.

long process of interwoven fate,[1] which yet leaves room for free will[2] and moral responsibility.[3]

103. The similarity between the classes of duties, insisted on in the *Singālovāda Sutta* and in the Edicts of Asoka, and the Relationships (*scheseis*) of Stoic Ethics, has been pointed out already.[4]

104. The well-known Stoic precept 'Bear and forbear' (*anechou kai apechou*)[5] accords with the spirit of the second and third Noble Truths[6] which find in personal desire and its uprooting the origin and end of all sorrow, and with the beautiful charity of the famous *Dhammapada* verse:[7]

> Not indeed by hatred does hate cease at any time;
> Hatred is brought to an end by love: this is an eternal law.

105. What is commonly and, from the individualistic point of view, naturally regarded as the pessimism[8] of the two philosophies finds expression in their condemnation of the desire for pleasure,[9] the desire for approbation and reward,[10] the desire for future life;[11] and in their depreciation of the human body and all that appertains to it.[12]

106. In both systems, though the soul is, or may be, transient,[13]

[1] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 3.

[2] See ibid., bk. iii, ch. 11; bk. v, ch. 20, ch. 34; bk. viii, ch. 7.

[3] IN 3 *b*; Int. § 42.

[4] Int. § 12 n; Ap. F 1, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [viii].

[5] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 126, 350; Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. v, ch. 33. Cp. Ch. 22 c § 10 (*forbearance*); Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (6); Ap. F 2 *a* (142).

[6] Int. § 24.

[7] *Dhammapada* (5); Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5).

[8] It is a self-flattering mistake of individualism to suppose that the altruistic or social nature is soft and pessimistic. On the contrary the most altruistic spirits, such as St. Francis of Assisi, to mention no higher example, have constantly proved the most fiery and unconquerable. It was the social impulse that caused Marcus Aurelius to consider himself born to stand before Rome as the bull before the herd (see *Meditations*, bk. xi, ch. 18), and upon his broad forehead, on the distant confines of the Empire, the 'blond beasts' of the north flung themselves repeatedly and in vain. Hercules, the type of strength and energy, and Diogenes, the type of rugged freedom, are in the forefront of Stoic ideals of conduct (see Arnold, *R. Stoicism*, pp. 169, 296). In our own times the 'unknown warrior', though perhaps among the humblest, is assuredly not least among the heroes. The absence of self-seeking and hatred is not a diminution, but an added element, of strength. There can be no question as to which is the more virile figure, the Stoic or the Epicurean, the man of duty or the intelligent seeker after self-interest. The famous Stoic *apatheia* is not the modern apathy, but a valiant state of mastery over suffering (Int. § 101). Finally the untiring and hopeful energy of the Buddha, labouring to spread enlightenment, fighting down pain by will (Ch. 21 § 7 [23]) until his course was run, is as typical of him as are his mildness and unshaken calm.—For a markedly predatory view, rather 'pack'-like than individualistic see chapter x on 'Buddhism, Stoicism, Socialism' in Spengler's *Decline of the West* (London, 1926).

[9] Compare the three kinds of desire (*taṇhā*) enumerated in the First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 6).

[10] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*. bk. v, ch. 6; bk. vii, ch. 73, ch. 74. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (8).

[11] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 16, ch. 17; cp. IN 3*a*; Ap. G 1 *a* (*Gotama's Positivism*).

[12] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 17; bk. xii, ch. 3. Also Ap. D *a* § 6 (*detachment*); Ap. H 2 *a* § 5.

[13] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 238, 269; Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 17; bk. iv, ch. 21. IN 3 *a*; Ap. E c i (*an-attā*); Ap. G 1 *a* (*Gotama's Positivism*).

all things that are not of the soul are indifferent;[1] and though both systems inculcate the training of the self,[2] this self-culture is evidently not for egotistical, but for social or altruistic, purposes.[3]

107. On the physical side also the similarity of the philosophies is emphasized by the Stoic belief in the end and recommencement of the ordered universe in a periodic general conflagration (*ekpurosis*),[4] which markedly resembles the Indian belief, not less Hindu than Buddhist, in the sequence of cycles or aeons, proceeding in eternal succession, each cycle (*kappa*, Sanskrit *kalpa*)[5] closely resembling its predecessor.

108. Respect for women, for all castes and classes, and for all nationalities[6] naturally arises from the monistic principles of Buddhism, as from those of Stoicism. Tenderness for animals, however, which also follows logically and is eminently a Hindu and Buddhist ideal (*a-hiṃsā*, unhurtfulness),[7] does not find a place in the Stoic theory.[8]

109. The similarities, general or specific, of the two systems may be utilized to throw light on both. They may be supplemented by other more incidental resemblances. The Stoic paradox that the sage can be happy even when in pain[9] may be paralleled by the Buddhist contention that one may be wretched of body but not wretched of mind.[10]

110. The monks of the four degrees mentioned in the *Book of the Great Decease*[11] and the well-known four stages[12] commencing with conversion and culminating in Arahatship (saintship) remind one of the stages of progress (*prokope*; *progressio*) which figure prominently in the treatises of the Greek and Roman Stoic writers.[13]

111. The list of things mentioned in the 26th Sutta of the *Majjhima*

[1] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 40, 289, 315; Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. ii, ch. 11; bk. v, ch. 20, ch. 33; bk. vi, ch. 32; bk. viii, ch. 56; bk. xi, ch. 16; bk. xii, ch. 2, ch. 33. Cp. Int. § 101; Ap. C *b*.

[2] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 236, 360; Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. vii, ch. 28, ch. 33; bk. xi, ch. 18 (7), ch. 20; *Dhammapada*, 183. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 13 (*yourselves*); Ap. E *c* ii (*self-training*), esp. § 4; Ap. F 2 *c* (*true Brāhman*).

[3] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. iii, ch. 4. Int. § 24 (on the Eightfold Path, which follows on the first three Truths demonstrating the evils of individualistic desire). Cp. Int. § 37 (on the four virtues known as the *Brahma-vihārā*); Int. § 53 (on the Edicts of Asoka).

[4] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 95, 106, 190; Epictetus, *Discourses*, bk. iii, ch. 13 (Matheson's tr., vol. ii, p. 41).

[5] Int. § 49; Ch. 7 *a* § 20; Ch. 10 *c* (40) n; Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 1 [393]; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Buddhavaṃsa* II, 1; Ap. A 2 *c*; Ap. B *a* § 2; Ap. E *a*, *Note*; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [55]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 6; Ap. I *b* § 3; also Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [7] n; and Ch. 4 §§ 3 n, 16 n. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *eternal*); and Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n (*repetitions*).

[6] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 (CV. x. i); Ap. F 2 *c* (*The True Brāhman*). Cp. E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 270, 279, 384.

[7] Int. § 49; KM, p. 69; A. V. Smith, *Oxford History of India* (1920), pp. 32, 155.

[8] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 205, 274.

[9] See ibid., p. 299.

[10] Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [4]; Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [2]; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [18]. Cp. Ap. F 1 *b* § 2 n.

[11] Ch. 22 *b* § 16.

[12] Ap. D *c*. See KM, p. 52.

[13] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, pp. 102, 294, 325.

Nikāya[1] as objects of ignoble craving being subject to birth, old age, disease, death, sorrow, and corruption, namely, 'wife and child, slaves male and female, goats and sheep, fowls and pigs, elephants, cattle, horses and mares, gold and silver, and all the supports of individual life', bears a resemblance to the Stoic lists of things that are indifferent[2] because external or beyond one's control[3] 'the praise of the many, or dominion, or wealth, or enjoyment of pleasure',[4] 'country houses, retreats on the sea-shore and in the hills';[5] 'whatsoever others do, or say, and whatever thou thyself hast done, or said, and whatsoever things perturb thee as about to happen in the future, and whatsoever through the body surrounding thee, or through the breath associated therewith, is attached to thee but beyond the power of thy will, and whatsoever the circumfluent vortex of external things whirls past thee'.[6]

112. As the freedom of the mind[7] from the fetters[8] of external things is a Stoic ideal, so freedom or emancipation (*mutti*, Sanskrit *mukti*)[9] from the 'fetters'[10] of individualistic desire (*taṇhā*, *upadāna*)[11] leads to the Buddhist Nirvāna (extinction of the self),[12] a blissful mental condition of selflessness, which is the sole object of 'noble craving'.[13]

113. In the *Mahā Vagga* the rich patroness Visākhā is described as asking permission to grant certain benefactions to the Buddhist Order and as calling these gifts 'boons' to herself,[14] thus showing a state of mind corresponding to that which the Stoic Emperor recommends when he writes that having done a kindness one should require no thanks but rather consider that one has done a kindness to oneself in fulfilling one's social nature.[15]

114. Resemblances in similes used by way of illustration—moonlight[16] and sunshine,[17] the hand unfettered by the air;[18] the open

[1] Ap. F 1 *c* [162]; cp. Ap. B *a* § 3 [11].

[2] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, p. 289; Epictetus, *Discourses*, bk. ii, ch. 19 (Matheson's tr. vol. i, p. 213); Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. v, ch. 33, bk. xi, ch. 2. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7] (*gain*); and Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7] n (*Eight worldly matters*); also Ch. 14 *c* § 9 (*treasures*).

[3] Epictetus, *Manual*, 1. 31, 32; *Discourses*, bk. i, ch. xxx. Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. vi, ch. 41; bk. viii, ch. 7; bk. xi, ch. 37. Cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [4].

[4] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. iii, ch. 6.

[5] See ibid., bk. iv, ch. 3.

[6] See ibid., bk. xii, ch. 3.

[7] Compare E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, p. 17.

[8] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. viii, ch. 7.

[9] Cp. A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 128; Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 170. Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ap. D *a* § 6.

[10] Compare Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 213.

[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 6.

[12] Ap. C *a*.

[13] Ap. F 1 *c*.

[14] Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [6]; also Ch. 10 *c* (66) n. Cp. OB, pp. 188–90. Cp. also Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [ii, 1]; Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35].

[15] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. vii, ch. 73, ch. 74. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [7]; Ap. F 1 b §§ 3 [4], 7; and Int. § 3 (*altruism*); Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (10); also Ch. 13 *a* § 6, and Ap. C *b* § 9.

[16] Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [2].

[17] See Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, bk. viii, ch. 57; Ap. F 1 *b* § 2.

[18] Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [6].

hand,[1] the closed fist,[2] the vessel defiled[3] or cracked,[4] and the like[5]—are plainly superficial.

115. One of the most marked and characteristic features of Buddhism, the third 'Refuge',[6] namely the Saṃgha (community) or Order of preaching Mendicants, has no equivalent in the Stoic system. It was through this organization of preachers that the doctrines of Gotama were spread throughout the numerous states of the Middle-land during his lifetime, and far beyond the boundaries of India after his death.

116. A link between the Ionian Greeks and the India of the period closely succeeding the age of Buddha might be found in the highly organized Persian Empire, which in its decay was taken over by the Macedonian conqueror, somewhat after the period of the great speculative Asiatic Greek physicists, Heraclitus and Democritus, and before the maturity of the Cyprian Zeno, the founder of the Stoic philosophy, who was studying at Athens at the time. But even if the affiliation of Stoicism to Buddhism were established, there would still remain to be explained the resemblance of Buddhism and the great philosophical religion of Confucius,[7] Gotama's somewhat older contemporary in China. It does not seem impossible that a monistic and altruistic or social philosophy should arise among different races independently.

117. The remarkable resemblances between Buddhism and Stoicism seem due to similarity of initial premises[8] rather than to affiliation after the development of the Eastern creed. If the oneness of the universe, and at the same time its reality, be granted, then not only the transience but the divineness of life, the kinship of all beings, and the natural impulse[9] to self-forgetful love and active social service for their own sake and not for reward, follow, as also the influence of every action, thought, and word upon the whole.[10] The ethics are not only those of Buddhism and of Stoicism but, despite the difference of premises, those of Christ also, who however added, what the heart of man for the most part needs, worship, a belief in the consoling presence of a personal God, and the hope of immortal life. To the philosophic Hindu thinkers of Buddha's day the oneness of the universe was clear, but with this sense of unity there came to the best of them a sense of the illusion (*māyā*)[11] of this world and individual existences, and to the less elevated spirits a keen desire to escape from the coils of this life, It was left to Gotama to synthesize the essential

[1] See E. V. Arnold, *Roman Stoicism*, p. 68.
[2] Ch. 21 § 7 [25].
[3] Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 9 n (*the empty water-pot*).
[4] See Epictetus, *Discourses*, bk. ii, ch. 4.
[5] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]; Ap. G 2 *b* § 1 [4].
[6] On the Three Refuges—Buddha, Dhamma, Saṃgha—see Ap. H 1 § 5.
[7] Cp. Okakura-Yoshisaburo, *The Japanese Spirit* (1905), pp. 57–8.
[8] Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*.
[9] Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7.[228].
[10] Int. § 8; Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* (*Metaphysical Presuppositions of Gotama*); Ap. B *b* (*Impersonal Karma*).
[11] IN 8 *c*.

oneness of the universe and its practical reality, the transience of the soul and its imperative everyday duties, the divineness and the commonplaceness of life.[1]

NOTE 11

GOTAMA'S JOURNEYS[2]

118. Though there doubtless is a superstructure of fictitious localities, claims and incidents, set down among the Suttas—as for example in the strange interviews recorded as taking place between Gotama and gods, or spirits,[3] and demons (*yakkhā*)—yet the geographical and topographical details of the first four or early Nikāyas of the *Sutta* (2nd) *Piṭaka*, as well as in the *Vinaya* (1st) *Piṭaka*, stand comparison on the whole with known facts and bear with them a conviction of the general truth of the narrative. The Ceylon[4] monks—from whom we have the sacred books of the Hīna-yāna (Little Vehicle) Canon, and who claim that they have them by direct tradition from Prince Mahinda,[5] the missionary son of the Emperor Asoka, though they may have drawn them from a more recent origin—cannot possibly have invented the itineraries of the Nikāyas as a whole, any more than they can have invented an ancient canonical language, corresponding fundamentally with that of the Asokan inscriptions, and etymologically with the Sanskrit language, differing from though resembling their own Southern speech; or the *Jātaka* stories corresponding with the carvings on the railings of the Mauryan Topes at Bharhut and Sāñchī;[6] or the main facts of the life of Buddha, which are found equally in the Mahā-yāna (Great Vehicle) tradition of Northern countries to which the influence of Ceylon never reached.[7] Nor can they have elaborated these itineraries from merely vague geographical information such as is conveyed by travellers' tales; they must at least have based them upon a precise and detailed tradition of Gotama's journeyings, itself founded on topographical, as well as historical, knowledge. The fundamental tradition and the language must have been derived direct from the Middle-land of India, whether in Asoka's time or later. The Indian tradition itself, doubtless—whether corresponding closely or not with the Ceylon Canon in its present form—must have been compounded of matter of varying authenticity,[8] and it is perhaps now impossible first to sift out, and then in turn to sift, the Indian

[1] Ap. C *b*; cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4].

[2] Int. § 18. In Chapters 11 to 17 all the places mentioned in the settings of the first four Nikāyas of the *Sutta Piṭaka* are included. These settings are doubtless sometimes commentarial and without original authority, but they fit readily into a topographical system. Further reference may be made to the indexes of place-names in vols. ii and v in Oldenberg's edition of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, where the area is somewhat enlarged and the commentarial hand seems more evident.

[3] IN 8 *a*.

[4] Int. § 1.

[5] Int. § 21.

[6] IN 5 *a*; Ap. G 1 *c*.

[7] Int. § 22.

[8] IN 6 (*Canon*).

record. The conviction of the general truth of the itineraries, however, remains, and in the same way the Discourses themselves, whatever may be said of their superstructure, convey a similar conviction as to the historical authenticity of their basis.

(*a*) *The great routes*[1]

119. It is remarkable that so little is recorded of Benāres and Gayā after the great events of the Enlightenment and the First Sermon, in the first four or early Nikāyas of the *Sutta Piṭaka*. From these it would appear that Gotama visited Benāres[2] seldom thereafter, and Gayā[3] perhaps only once.

120. One may gather that he was not actuated by the sentimental feelings of his later followers for the scenes of those truly remarkable events, but as a great administrator he went where his presence was practically most useful, namely to the capital cities of the four chief states of the Middle Country—Rājagaha, Vesāli, Sāvatthi, and Kosambi—following the beaten routes between those cities, and taking his own native town of Kapilavatthu on the way between Vesāli and Sāvatthi, not only because he had there a large following of his own clansmen, but because it lay in the line of march.

121. His usual route seems to have been in the order above mentioned,[4] and the reverse,[5] and not between Kosambi and Rājagaha, which latter would have led him through Benāres and Gayā. No villages apparently are mentioned as halting-places of the Buddha between Benāres and Gayā, though many are named on the long routes between the four capitals mentioned above.[6] It may be surmised also that the Ganges river route,[7] which was the usual route between Kosambi and Benāres and what was later Pātaliputta, was not convenient for a party of begging and preaching friars, which was doubtless considerable in numbers, even though it may have been less than the conventional 'five hundred'[8] elders and friars (*therā*

[1] Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [7] n; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 1 [36] n, 12 (ii) n).

[2] Int. §§ 151, 158 n, 167; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 1 n, 2, 13; Ch. 15 *a*; Ch. 17 *c* [36].

[3] Ch. 11 *b*.

[4] 'The stopping places [on the route from Sāvatthi to Rājagaha] were (beginning at Sāvatthi), Setavya, Kapilavastu, Kusinārā, Pāvā, Hatthi-gāma, Bhandagāma, Vesāli, Pātaliputta, and Nālandā' (RDBI, p. 103). A shorter route between Sāvatthi and Kusinārā via Ātumā is indicated (Ch. 13 *a* § 7 [1] n).

[5] Cp. OB, p. 110.

[6] See Chapters 11–19

[7] In the *Vinaya Piṭaka* (*Culla-vagga*, XI. i. 12; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12]) it is stated that after the Buddha's death Ānanda with five hundred followers went by boat upstream (presumably from the neighbourhood of Pātaliputta) to Kosambi, where he saw King Udena and the recalcitrant monk Channa. In the same *Piṭaka* (MV, VI. xvii. 8) we read also that a party of monks, who had passed the rainy season (*vas*) among the Kāsis (Ch. 15 *a*), journey (apparently on foot) to Rājagaha to visit the Buddha. For the river Ganges see Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 12 *e* § 11 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 15 [2] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii); Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [1] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 2; Ch. 20 § 11 [32]; also Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n; Ch. 11 *c* § 6 [263] n; Ch. 13 *a* § 8 [1] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (529); Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11] n; Ch. 14 *e* § 8; Ch. 15 *b* § 7.

[8] Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 17; Ch. 14 *d* §§ 3, 4; Ch. 14 *f* § 10 [1]; Ch. 19 *b* § 9; Ch. 22 *b* § 24 [6] n; Ch. 23 *b* § 4. The number

bhikkhū) of the Nikāyas. If this is correct, one may gather that the number of his followers in these two towns was not large, despite the first success in Benāres, which was then, as now, a stronghold of Brāhmanism. It is noticeable that no other spot in or near Benāres besides the Isipatana deer-park is mentioned in the first four Nikāyas, except once the Khemiyambavana (mango-grove) where Udena stayed.[1] No conversions in the town of Gayā itself are recorded in the Nikāyas, though Gotama stayed for a while on the Gayā-Head,[2] a hill overlooking the town, and converted there a thousand fire-worshippers, the followers of Kassapa, on his way from Benāres to Rājagaha after the first *vas*. Uruvelā, the scene of his enlightenment, was a lonely spot on the banks of the river Nerañjarā some miles east of Gayā, and though he must have passed through that town on his original journey to Benāres he did not preach there, whether because it was then a small place or because he was too full of thoughts not yet finally arranged and was instinctively bent on speaking first to the already partially prepared minds of his five former followers and friends.

122. That he occasionally diverged from the great routes is probable enough, but most of the places visited by him were apparently, like Nālandā and Pāvā, on the direct way. The authenticity of the claims of other places to the honour of having been visited by him is difficult to establish. An early follower, living in one of these places and speaking of some great discourse heard from the lips of the Teacher, might unwittingly originate a tradition that the Teacher himself stayed and spoke in that place.

123. In the *Madhurattha-Vilāsini*, a Pāli Commentary on the *Buddha-vaṃsa*, there appears a summary account of the Buddha's movements during the twenty years intervening between the time of his establishment of his first head-quarters at Rājagaha, the capital of the kingdom of Magadha,[3] and the date of his finally establishing his head-quarters at Sāvatthi, the capital of the rival kingdom of Kosala. 'The Blessed One for twenty years after his enlightenment being without a fixed dwelling', runs the Commentary, 'went and stayed wheresoever he listed. . . . But from that point he stayed regularly at Sāvatthi, either in the great Jetavana monastery or in the Eastern monastery (*Pubbārāma*), living on alms.'[4] For reasons not clearly stated, but possibly political, he left Sāvatthi some twenty-four years

is used also of non-Buddhists. Ch. 15 *b* § 2; cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 n; Ch. 7 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 11 [2]; also Ch. 4 § 8 n; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [2] n. Contrast Buddha's declared dislike of noise and crowds (Ch. 13 *c* § 19), though as a great leader he had to endure them (Ch. 8 *k* [8]).

[1] Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [157].

[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [1].

[3] It is convenient and apparently not incorrect to use this tribal name as the name of the country. Int. §§ 18, 21, 158 (2); Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [3]; Ch. 11 *f* § 3 n; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 20 § 11 [26]. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 (*Vajjī*); Ch. 13 *b* § 1 (*Bhagga*); Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [3] (*Kāsi*), § 3 [11] (*Kāsi-Kosalu*); Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15] (*Avanti*), § 2 [5].

[4] See Ch. 10 *d* (20th year).

later, about a year before his death, and spent the rainy season again in Rājagaha, from which place he started northwards upon the journey which ended with his death. The basis for this summary account was doubtless ancient tradition, which may be accepted as sufficient authority. Mention is made of those places at which Gotama spent each *vas* or period of residence during the rainy season, and intermediary halting-places are not named. The Teacher's long and constant journeys, during all seasons except the rains,[1] must have been performed mainly on foot, with occasional stages on horseback[2] and doubtless some in wagons drawn by slow but efficient Indian bullocks,[3] in a manner not very unlike that of the long cold-weather camping tours of Indian officials before motor transport curtailed that leisurely procedure. In place of tents there would be the village assembly-hall[4] or monastery,[5] which the Teacher and his followers would reach before the heat of the day, after a long slow march in the early morning or at times by night, through country often beautiful and always interesting, by roads worn with traffic, or tracks less easy to find, leading to fords sometimes dangerous to negotiate, winding through growing crops or silent jungle, or mounting gradually through forests on the hill-sides to the north and south of the great Gangetic plain,[6] with halts by the wayside to preach to whosoever would listen. The official march in India used to be about sixteen miles, or eight *kos*, but this was often for convenience reduced to half, and such a half-march[7] may well have suited Gotama and his many followers. There is evidence that he was sensitive to the great beauty through which he passed on his journeys between busy towns.[8]

124. The distances between the ancient capital cities were very great. In the narrative of the Bodhisatta's journey when he first left Kapilavatthu on his search for enlightenment the *Jātaka* Introduction states[9] that having ridden thirty leagues (*yojanas*) he halted at the river Anomā, and went thence to Rājagaha, a distance of thirty leagues, on foot. On this Rhys Davids remarks:[10]

'The thirty yojanas here mentioned, together with the thirty from Kapilavastu to the river Anomā, make together sixty, or four hundred and eighty miles from Kapilavastu to Rājagaha, which is far too much for the direct distance. There is here, I think, an undesigned coincidence between Northern and Southern accounts, for the Lalita Vistara (chap. xvi, at the commencement) makes the Bodhisat go to Rājagaha *viā* Vesāli, and this would make the total distance exactly sixty yojanas.'

Describing the Buddha's return journey from Rājagaha to Kapilavatthu, after his enlightenment and the establishment of the *Saṃgha*

1 Ch. 8 *c*.
2 Ch. 2 § 4.
3 Int. § 189 (*caravans*); Ch. 1 § 7 (*Sowing Festival*).
4 Int. §§ 133, 171; Ch. 12 *a* § 1.
5 Int. § 127; Ch. 8 *g*.
6 Cp. Ch. 8 *f* § 2.
7 Ch. 7 *b* § 1.
8 Ch. 3 § 5 n.
9 Ch. 2 § 7.
10 *Buddhist Birth Stories*, vol. i, p. 87.

at the former city, the *Jātaka* Introduction[1] states that 'The Blessed One, . . . started from Rājagaha, and travelled a league a day; going slowly with the intention of reaching Kapilavatthu, sixty leagues from Rājagaha, in two months.'[2] In a later passage in the same narrative[3] *Anātha-piṇḍika*, the merchant prince of Sāvatthi, after his conversion by the Buddha during a visit to Rājagaha, is said to have built resting-places (*vihāre*)[4] 'along the road to Sāvatthi, forty-five leagues in length', as well as buying the famous Jetavana Grove in Sāvatthi as a gift for the Buddha. It is perhaps meant that the merchant built rest-houses along a more direct and shorter route which lay within the kingdom of Kosala, of which Sāvatthi was the capital.

(*b*) *Topography of the chief cities*

125. Many details are given regarding the topography of the great capital cities. (1) The groves, hills, and caves of RĀJAGAHA,[5] the capital of the Magadhan kingdom, are mentioned frequently. During his original visit to Rājagaha, before the Great Enlightenment, Gotama rested in the shadow of the Pandava Rock, facing east.[6] After his enlightenment his first resting-place in Rājagaha was at Laṭṭhivan-uyyāna (Sapling-grove-park),[7] six miles distant (*ti-gāvuta-maggo*) from Rājagaha; this place being afterwards called the Vaṇṇa-bhu (Place of Praise).[8] Near this spot was the shrine (*cetiya*) [called] Supaṭṭitha.[9]

126. His first abode in Rājagaha was the Veḷuvanuyyāna (Bamboo-grove-park)[10] or Veḷuvan-ārāma (Bamboo-grove-garden),[11] a grove situated near to Rājagaha and presented to the Order by King Bimbisāra on his conversion. This grove or garden was situated upon the lofty hill known as Gijjha-kūta (Vulture-Peak),[12] near the city. It is constantly stated in the Nikāyas that Buddha stayed on this hill in the Bamboo-grove in the Squirrels' Feeding-ground (*Veḷuvane Kalandaka-nivāpe*),[13] and it is not infrequently added that at that time

[1] Ch. 7 *b* § 1. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [166]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3].

[2] i.e. travelling one league (8 miles) a day as formerly customary among Indian officials touring with tents and carts.

[3] Ch. 10 *a* § 2.

[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3).

[5] Int. §§ 145, 167; Ch. 2 § 7 [66]; Ch. 3 § 1; Ch. 7 *a* § 11; Ch. 7 *c* § 1; Ch. 8 *j* § 10; Ch. 11 *c*; Ch. 14 *f* § 8 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 12; Ch. 19 *b* § 2; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]; Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [3]; Ap. H 3, *Note*.

[6] Ch. 3 § 2.

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 7. 'Latthivana (Sansk. yashtivana), literally "stick forest", means a forest consisting of bambus. General Cunningham has the following note about this bambu forest: "In 1862, when I was at Rājgir (i.e. Rājagaha), I heard the bambu forest always spoken of as Jaktiban . . . I fixed the position of the bambu forest to the south-west of Rājgir [the modern village near the new city] on the hill lying between the hot springs of the Tapoban and old Rājagriha". Reports, III, 140': SBE xiii, p. 136 n. See also Kern, *Manual*, p. 24 n.

[8] Ch. 7 *a* § 9.

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [1].

[10, 11] Ch. 7 *a* §§ 10 [85], 14 [17].

[12] Int. § 128.

[13] Ch. 8 *c* § 1 [1]; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1]; Ch. 9 *b* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 6, 7, 21, 25 [43]; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 19 *c* § 1; Ch. 23 *a* [7].

certain Hindu wandering philosophers (*paribbājakā*)[1] were staying at the Peacocks' Feeding-ground (*Mora-nivāpe*),[2] which was apparently at no great distance. It is possible that the two large gardens with their respective rest-houses were called after the squirrels and peacocks which frequented the two spots. The word Bamboo-grove is not distinctive alone, and possibly the name Squirrels' Feeding-ground was added in apposition to distinguish this bamboo-grove from others. In the Nikāyas the two words generally appear together, but the Veḷuvana is sometimes mentioned alone.[3] Frequent references occur in the Nikāyas to the large grove or garden, near the city, set apart for Hindu wandering preachers (*paribbājakā*), and sometimes to Queen Udumbarikā's Garden for the Wanderers,[4] which possibly may have been identical with the Peacocks' Feeding-ground (*Mora-nivāpa*) mentioned above.[5] Such gardens[6] with rest-houses for wandering religious and philosophical teachers (*paribbājakā*) of all sects were not uncommon in the neighbourhood of Indian cities of the time. The Seers' or Ṛishis' Retreat (*Isi-patana*)[7] near Benāres, where Gotama preached the First Sermon, was such an institution; the Gabled-roof (*Kūṭ-āgāra*) Hall,[8] in the Great Wood (*Mahā-vana*) near Vesāli, was another; the Hall in Queen Mallikā's park[9] at Sāvatthi was another. Even after the Saṃgha received the gift of the Veḷuvana from King Bimbisāra the Buddha occasionally stayed in the Wanderers' Garden at the Peacocks' Feeding-ground.[10] It would appear that Gotama availed himself of this rest-house on the same footing as any other wandering preacher (*paribbājaka*), and that the house and garden were not assigned to any particular sect.

127. The buildings, such as they were, at the Veḷuvana were naturally at first by no means commodious,[11] and we read that while the Buddha stayed there the Elder Sāriputta and other followers lodged elsewhere on the Vulture-Peak Hill (*Gijjha-kūṭe pabbate*).[12] It is evident that Gotama and his chief disciples did not habitually, at any rate at first, lodge together, though their lodgings may have been

[1] Rhys Davids compares these *paribbājakā* with Greek Sophists (RDBI, p. 141). Int. §§ 133, 137, 144, 168, 179, 187; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 16, 18; Ch. 8 *k* [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 9; Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1]; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 1 [1], 2; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6). Cp. Int. § 19; IN 10 n; Ch. 2 § 3; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2; also Ap. G 2 *c* (*Opponents*).

[2] Ch. 8 *k* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* § 9.

[3] Ch. 11 *c* § 2 [17]. The order of these names, all in the locative case, differs. The Squirrels' Feeding-ground is put after the Bamboo-grove, whilst the Peacocks' Feeding-ground is put before the Wanderers' garden.

[4] Ch. 11 *c* § 11 [1].

[5] Ch. 8 *k* § 1.

[6] RDBI, pp. 141–2; Ch. 12 *e* § 10; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3]; and Int. § 136.

[7] Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171]; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 9, 16 [1].

[8] Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 1, 3 [237].

[9] Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1]; and Int. § 142.

[10] Ch. 11 *c* § 10.

[11] The various types of houses presented to the Order in Rājagaha are described, perhaps conventionally, in *Culla-vagga VI* (Ch. 8 *j* § 10). Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3); Ch. 8 *g* (*Vihāra*). Cp. also Int. § 123 (*Monastery*), and § 190 (*architecture*).

[12] Int. § 128.

near one another. The idea of large monasteries, built at great cost, came later, possibly after Gotama's death.

128. The ancient city was situated in a valley encircled and defended by high hills, the northern gate[1] being close to an opening in the hills, through which a small stream passes on its way towards the river Ganges. A later city was built by King Bimbisāra,[2] Gotama's contemporary, in the plain immediately to the north of this opening. Of the peaks near the ancient city the most famous was the Vulture-Peak (*Gijjha-kūṭa*)[3] on which the Veḷuvana was situated. Four other peaks named in the first four Nikāyas are the Seers'-mountain (*Isigili passa*, or *Isigiri*),[4] Mount Vebhāra,[5] Indra's Peak (*Inda-kūṭa pabbata*),[6] and Mount Vipula or Vepulla, formerly called East Ridge (*Pācena vaṃso*).[7] In the fifth Nikāya another peak, the Pandava Hill,[8] is mentioned. To these must be added Dakkhinā-giri,[9] the long 'southern range', which forms the southern boundary of the valley and is an outpost of the great Central Indian table-land.

129. In these mountains there are numerous caves,[10] some of them very commodious. The Canonical Books mention, among such caves, the Sattapaṇṇi Cave[11] on the side of Mount Vebhāra; the mountain-cave of the Snakes'-pool (*Sappasoṇḍika*)[12] in the Sīta-vana Grove;[13] the Gomaṭa Grotto;[14] and the Cave of the Tinduka Trees.[15]

130. Other spots in the immediate neighbourhood of Rājagaha mentioned in the Canon are: Sūkarakhatā,[16] on the Vulture Peak and therefore not far from the Veḷuvana Grove; the Black Rock (*Kāla-silā*)[17] on the side of the Seers'-mountain; the mountain-grove called Sītavana;[18] the Robbers' Cliff;[19] the Forest-hut (*Araññakutikā*);[20]

[1] Int. § 136.

[2] See Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, p. 37; V. A. Smith, *Oxford History of India* (1920), p. 45. (Int. § 168; Ch. 7 *a* § 13.) The new Rājagaha (King's Home) was perhaps originally a fortified palace suburb. The Nikāyas do not seem to imply that the ancient city was deserted (Ch. 11 *c* § 13). The Magadha kingdom was established about the middle of the seventh century B.C. by Sisunāga, a Kāsi chief, who made the ancient city of Giribbaja his capital. The fifth king of the Saisunāga dynasty was Bimbisāra, who is said to have moved out of the old capital in Rājagaha. This move can scarcely have taken place later than this date, since the next king Ajātasattu removed the capital northward to Pātaliputta on the Ganges; Ch. 20 § 11 [26]. He, however, strengthened the fortifications of Rājagaha; Ch. 23 *a* [7].

[3] Int. § 127; Ch. 8 *a* [1]; Ch. 8 *f* § 1 n; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 6; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 17 n; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 n; Ch. 19 *d* §§ 1 [1], 2 [3]; Ch. 20 §§ 1, 8.

[4] Ch. 11 *c* §§ 8, 20, 25 [43]; and Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92].

[5] Ch. 11 *c* § 24 (4).

[6] Ch. 11 *c* § 27.

[7] Ch. 11 *c* § 26 [4]; Ch. 11 *d* § 12 (*Vediyaka-hill*).

[8] Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n.

[9] Int. § 132.

[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3); Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 28 [2] n; Ch. 11 *d* § 12; also Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513].

[11] The first General Council of the Order after the Buddha's death is said to have been held here. Int. § 56; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 24 (4), 25 [43]; Ap. A 1 *b* (*Dīpavaṃsa*, 14).

[12] Ch. 11 *c* §§ 3 n, 12.

[13] Int. § 130.

[14] Ch. 11*c* § 24 (6).

[15] Ch. 11 *c* § 24 (7).

[16] Ch. 11 *c* § 14.

[17] Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92]; Ch. 11 *c* § 8.

[18] Ch. 7 *b* § 6; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [12]; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 3, 24 (5), 25 [43]. The Sītavana was a cemetery; see KM, p. 28.

[19] Ch. 11 *c* §§ 24 (2), 25 [43].

[20] Ch. 11 *c* § 29.

the stream called Sappinī;[1] the Tapoda Grotto (bathing-steps);[2] the Tapoda Garden (*Tapod-ārāma*);[3] Jīvaka's Mango-grove;[4] the Kassapaka Garden (*Kassapak-ārāma*);[5] the Potter's house (*Kumbhakāra-nivesana*);[6] and the Deer-park (*migadāya*) at Maddakucchi.[7]

131. Of the places mentioned above some ten are included in a list of the 'pleasant spots' of Rājagaha said to have been enumerated by the Buddha to Ānanda on his last journey[8] shortly before his death, and eleven are included in the list of customary 'lodging-places' for Buddhist friars (*bhikkhū*) in the neighbourhood of Rājagaha, specified in the *Culla Vagga*[9] of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*.

132. The hills surrounding the ancient city of Rājagaha form a northern spur of the mountain range now known as Chota Nagpur, the Southern mountain-land (*Dakkhinā-giri*)[10] mentioned occasionally in the Canon as being visited by the Buddha or his chief disciples, situated at the eastern extremity of the great Vindhyan range, which constitutes the southern boundary of the Gangetic plain and the foremost barrier of Southern India not then penetrated by the Āryan tribes.

133. Topographical details regarding (2) VESĀLI,[11] the capital city of the Licchavis, the leading members of the Vajjian Confederacy,[12] are also supplied by the Canonical Books, though less profusely than in the case of Rājagaha. The Vajjian country was situated on the northern side of the Ganges opposite the kingdom of Magadha, and Vesāli lay on the line of march northward from Rājagaha to Gotama's birthplace, Kapilavatthu. Between the former city and the distant Himālaya mountains stretched the Great Forest (*Mahā-vana*).[13] On the outskirts of the town and within the Great Forest the citizens had built their famous Gabled-roof Hall (*Kūṭ-āgāra-sālā*),[14] provided either for the Buddha or for the use of wandering religious teachers (*paribbājakā*).[15] This was possibly a public hall for discussions of a religious or philosophical kind open to all sects. The Buddha is constantly stated in the Canon to have stayed here, and there were doubtless rest-houses[16] in the grounds or garden surrounding the hall.

[1] Ch. 11 *c* § 15. [2] Ch. 11 *c* § 24 (8). [3] Ch. 11 *c* § 24 (9).
[4] Ch. 11 *c* §§ 17 [1], 24 (10), 25 [43]; Ch. 23 *b* § 8 (ii).
[5] Ch. 11 *c* § 18. [6] Ch. 11 *c* §§ 18, 20; Ap. C *b* § 5.
[7] Ch. 8 *f* § 1 n; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 24 (11), 25 [43]. [8] Ch. 11 *c* § 25.
[9] Ch. 11 *c* § 24.
[10] Int. §§ 128, 145; Ch. 4 § 2 n; Ch. 11 *d* § 1; Ap. H 3, *Note*; also Ch. 1 § 2 (*south*). Cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [5] (*wilderness*).
[11] Identified with Basār in North Bihār (see V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 117) Int. §§ 147, 167; Ch. 12; Ch. 21 §§ 3 [11], 17 [1]; Ap. H 3, *Note*.
[12] Int. § 158 (5); Ch. 12 *d*; Ch. 12 *e*; Ch. 20 § 11 [26].
[13] See RDBI, p. 41; BBS, i, p. 197 n. Also called the Mahā-Sālā. Int. § 136; Ch. 1 § 2; Ch. 12 *a* §§ 7 [229] n, 101; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]; Ch. 13 *c* § 17 [1]; Ch. 21 § 12 [48].
[14] Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* § 1; Ap. B *a* § 5. Cp. Int. § 137 (*Santh-āgāra-Sakyānaṃ*). The Kūṭāgāra-hall was different from the Council-hall (Int. § 164 n; Ap. B *b* § 3, 1). Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3).
[15] Int. §§ 123, 126; cp. Int. § 137 n (*rhetoric and philosophy*). See RDBI, p. 141.
[16] Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [4] (*vihāra*).

Besides this hall there was a garden called Ekapuṇḍarīka,[1] provided as a lodging-place for the wandering teachers. The head-quarters of the Buddhist Order in Vesāli were ultimately fixed in Ambapāli's Grove (*Ambapāli-vana*),[2] a spot which is said to have been presented to the Buddha by Ambapāli, a rich courtesan.[3] Mention is also made of the Avarapura Grove (*Avarapura-vana-sanda*),[4] outside the city, and of Beluva or Beluva-gāmaka,[5] a village where the Buddha sometimes stopped, near Vesāli, within an easy walking distance of that city.[6]

134. The list of 'pleasant spots' in or near Vesāli, said in the *Mahā-Parinibbāna Sutta*[7] to have been mentioned to Ānanda by the Buddha on his last journey, comprises six Cetiyas[8] or shrines—the Cāpāla Cetiya, which was evidently an easy walk[9] from the village of Beluva, and the Udena, Gotamaka,[10] Sattambaka or Sattamba, Bahuputta, and Sārandada[11] Cetiyas. The Pāli Commentary, *Sumaṅgala Vilāsini*, explains that the Vajjian shrines here enumerated were *vihāras* erected on the sites of former temples of Yakkhas[12] (demons) after whom they were named. That Gotama should select Buddhist *vihāras* for praise as 'pleasant spots' is likely enough; that he should call such *vihāras* shrines or temples seems more than unlikely, and that he should designate them by the names of spirits[13] or demons hostile to mortals altogether improbable.[14] One of the seven conditions of welfare for the Vajjians supposed to be laid down by Gotama in the opening passage of the *Mahā-Parinibbāna Sutta*[15] was reverence for and support of the Vajjian shrines in town or country, though all external worship was condemned by Gotama. Spirit-worship was characteristic of contemporary Hinduism and became later a great feature of Buddhism. It would appear that these passages were introduced into the narrative later in its interest; but the shrines may have existed in Gotama's time, and it is possible that he may have commended to the Vajjians the preservation of monuments erected to ancestral leaders[16] or teachers of the clan, as well as the preservation of their ancient and well-tried political institutions, which is the first of the conditions[17] said to have been laid down by the Buddha for the welfare of the Confederacy.

[1] Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481].
[2] Ch. 12 § 11 [xxx, 1]. Cp. Int. § 136.
[3] Ch. 21 § 4 [19].
[4] Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68].
[5] Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [21]; Ch. 21 § 6 [21].
[6] Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] n; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]; Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [14].
[7] Ch. 11 *c* § 25; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2]; Ch. 21 § 12 n [41–7].
[8] Ch. 7 *a* § 11; Ch. 11 *c* § 1; Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [1]; Ch. 12 *d*; Ch. 12 *e* § 3[1]; Ch. 21 §§ 9 [1], 19 [5]; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8]; Ch. 22 *c* § 4; Ap. H 1 § 5. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [11] n (*thūpa*, i.e. *stūpa*).
[9] Cp. the previous section (133), and Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] n.
[10] Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2].
[11] Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [1].
[12] Int. § 93 (vii); also see SBE, xi, p. 4 n.
[13] IN 8 *a*.
[14] Int. § 65 (*Singālovāda S.*); and Int. § 29.
[15] Ch. 19 d § 3 [5].
[16] Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*ancestor-worship*).
[17] Ch. 20 § 2 [6].

135. Far distant to the north-west of Vesāli, within the boundaries of what is now Nepāl, lay (3) KAPILAVATTHU,[1] which was the capital of the small oligarchic republic[2] of the Sakyans and was Gotama's native town. Where the road between Vesāli and Kapilavatthu passes from the plain into the foot-hills of the Himālayas the Buddhist Emperor Asoka placed pillars, of which four are now known,[3] to mark the route followed by the great Teacher some 250 years previously and the spot where the Bodhisatta was born. Not far from the Sakyan capital lay Devadaha,[4] the chief town of the Koliyans, a clan closely related to the Sakyans. Suddhodana the Sakyan was married to Māyā, the daughter of a member of one of the ruling families of the Koliyans, and Māyā, it is said, when her child was about to be born was permitted to return to her birthplace. Midway between the two towns, in the Lumbini Grove (*Lumbini-vana*),[5] Siddhattha Gotama, afterwards to become the Buddha, was born. Topographical details regarding Kapilavatthu are to be found in the Canonical Books.

136. Kapilavatthu, apparently, was a fortified town, as the Bodhisat is said to have passed the closed gates[6] when he set forth on his great journey seeking enlightenment. The little capital of the neighbouring Mallan clan, Kusinārā[7] (Kuṣinagarā), the scene of the Buddha's death, was similarly fortified. On a much larger scale the ancient capital of Magadha was a fortified city[8] with stone walls, traces of which are still to be found, and later the city of Pātaliputta was fortified with a vast wooden palisade, of which some portions have recently been discovered.[9] The three houses[10] said to have been allotted to the young Siddhattha by his father for the different seasons of the year may be only conventional parts of the tradition, but doubtless then, as at the present day, it was usual for a wealthy Indian family to possess, besides a gardenless quadrangular mansion in the city, a smaller house or pavilion in a garden[11] on the outskirts. The Nigrodha-tree[12] Garden (*Nigrodh-ārāma*),[13] in which Gotama and his followers stayed on many occasions, belonged not to any private family but to the townsmen. Beyond the city and its outlying gardens and fields[14]

[1] Int. § 167; Ch. 1 § 3; Ch. 7 *b*; Ch. 10 *b*; Ch. 10 *d* §§ 1, 2 (*Kapilapura*); Ch. 13 *c* §§ 8 [1], 10 [15] n; Ch. 13 *c* (ii); Ap. A 2 *b*.

[2] Int. § 165; Ch. 1 § 7 [57] n. See OB, p. 116.

[3] See V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 120.

[4] Ch. 1 § 5 [52].

[5] Ch. 1 § 5 [52]; Ch. 13 *c* § 4.

[6] Int. § 175 (*fortified cities*); Ch. 2 § 6 [63] n.

[7] Ch. 22 *b* §§ 1 [1]–26.

[8] Int. § 128. Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* § 5 n. Cp. RDBI, p. 37, where, however, the position of the old city is said to be north instead of south of the new town. See also Int. § 175.

[9] Ch. 20 § 11 [26]. See V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India* (1920), p. 77.

[10] Ch. 1 § 8. Cp. the three houses given to the youthful Yasa (Ch. 6 *a* § 2), and to Anuruddha (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]).

[11] Int. § 190; Ch. 1 § 9 [58]; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2] n. Cp. Ambapāli's garden (Int. §§ 126, 133).

[12] The Banyan tree (*Ficus indica*). Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43].

[13] Ch. 13 *c* § 18; Ap. C *b* § 8 n; Ap. G 1 *b* § 6 n.

[14] Ch. 1 § 2 [49] (*Mahā-sālā*), § 7 [57].

stretched the Great Forest (*Mahā-vana* or *Mahā-sālā*).[1] Through the fields of the town flowed the Rohini river (or Kohāna).[2]

137. The townsmen possessed a Meeting Hall (*Santh-āgāra Sakyānam*)[3] which was newly built in the Buddha's time and was open to Buddhist monks (*samaṇas*) and Brāhman teachers equally.[4] An Arts College[5] was situated in the mango-grove of the Sakyan family named the Archers,[6] and here the Sakyan youths were educated.[7]

138. Westward of Kapilavatthu, and equally among the foot-hills of the Himālayas, within the boundaries of what is now Nepāl, lay (4) the city of SĀVATTHI,[8] the capital of the kingdom of Kosala, which was an older power than, and still the equal of, the rising Magadhan kingdom. The road from Kapilavatthu apparently entered Sāvatthi by the north gate.[9] In the third year of the Buddha's ministry Anāthapiṇḍika,[10] the famous merchant-prince of Sāvatthi, whilst on a business visit to Rājagaha, made the acquaintance of the Teacher and was converted by him. Shortly after his return to Sāvatthi he purchased from Prince Jeta, a member of King Pasenadi's family, the famous Jeta Grove (*Jeta-vana*),[11] and built therein a rest-house (*vihāra*), which from the twentieth year[12] of the Buddha's ministry became the most important head-quarters of the Saṃgha. Topographical details of the city and its environs are found in some fullness in the Canonical Books.

[1] Int. § 133 (*Mahā-vana*) n; Ch. 13 *c* § 17 n; Ch. 22 *b* § 1 n. This is called the Great Sāl Forest (*Mahā-Sālā*) in the *Jātaka* Introduction (Ch. 1 § 2 [49]).

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (529). See also RDB, p. 25; KM, p. 30. 'On this river now the Rowai, or Rohwaini, see the detailed account in Cunningham's *Archaeological Survey of India*, xii, p. 190 ff.' (Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 249).

[3] Int. § 190 (*architecture*); Ch. 22 *c* § 8.

[4] Cp. Int. § 126 and § 133 (*Kūṭ-āgāra-sālā* and *paribbājakā*).

[5] '*Sippuggahan-atthāya* (for the sake of the learning of arts)'—Pāli Commentary. See SBB, iv, p. 111 n. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 5 (*arts*).

[6] Ch. 13 *c* § 24 [1] n.

[7] Int. § 190 (*education*). T. W. Rhys Davids calls this institution a 'Technical College'. It was apparently a school in which the boys of the ruling families learnt such part of the arts (*sippāni*) required by their position as could not be learnt at home (Ch. 18, *sippaṃ*). These arts doubtless included horse-mastership and the use of arms, and something of engineering and agriculture (Ch. 1 § 7) and sometimes the art of statesmanship (Int. § 172, *ministers*), with rhetoric and philosophy (cp. Int. § 133, *paribbājakā*), and occasionally perhaps reading and writing (see RDBI, pp. 107–20). The most famous of such institutions was that of Takkasilā (the Greek *Taxila*; see RDBI, pp. 8, 203) at which according to the Jātakas (see *Jāt.* 151, *Rājevāda-Jātaka*: *Jāt.* 411, *Susīma-Jātaka*) it was customary for the princes of the day to be educated. How ancient this school at Taxila may have been is not known, but Gotama's contemporary Pasenadi, King of Kosala, is said on Commentarial authority, but not in the Canon, to have been educated there (see *Saṃ. Nik.* iii, *Kosala-Saṃyutta*, Ch. 17 *e* [5] n), as also the famous physician Jīvaka (Ch. 8 *j* § 1 n).

[8] Int. §§ 149, 167; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1]; Ch. 14 *c*; Ch. 15 *a* § 12; Ch. 15 *b* § 12 [v, 1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3. The city lay upon the river Aciravatī (modern Rāpti): Int. § 149 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11].

[9] Sāvatthi was a walled city. Cp. Int. § 175 (*fortified cities*).

[10] Ch. 10 *a*.

[11] Ch. 1 § 11 n; Ch. 8 *h* § 2; Ch. 14 *c* § 2; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [262]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1; Ap. B *a* §§ 2 n, 3 n; Ap. D *b* § 6 [1].

[12] Ch. 10 *d* § 1 (20th year and after).

139. The most frequently mentioned of the sites in Sāvatthi was the Jeta Grove in which was situated Anāthapiṇḍika's *vihāra*. The Jetavana site lay outside the city near the south gate[1] and comprised extensive grounds, in which were placed the *vihāra*, of which the chief room was the perfumed chamber (*gandhākuti*), and numerous separate buildings for the Elders, with assembly-halls, terraces or platforms for walking, and ponds or tanks for bathing.[2] The entrance to the garden was through a gateway, over which was built a large room.[3]

140. Outside the city near the east gate[4] lay the Eastern Garden (*Pubb-ārāma*).[5] This was given to the Order by Visākhā,[6] a rich benefactress, considerably after Anāthapiṇḍika's great donation, and became the Buddha's alternative head-quarters in Sāvatthi. The principal building in the garden was a structure of more than one story, termed a *pāsāda*,[7] such as was usually surmounted by a flat roof used for taking the air in the evening and at night. The Eastern Garden (*Pubb-ārāma*) was not, as may at first appear, the same as the Eastern Enclosure[8] (*Pubba-koṭṭhaka*), though it may have included it; the whole garden was doubtless an enclosure surrounded by a protective wall.[9] From the description given in Sutta 26 of the *Majjhima Nikāya* it would appear that at first the storied house within the enclosure was not a monastery, since the Buddha when resting there delivered no discourse, but proceeded to the neighbouring hall of Rammaka[10] the Brāhman to address the mendicant brethren.

141. Near the garden was the Eastern bathing-place,[11] whether within or outside the precincts, and hard by was the hall of Rammaka the Brāhman, which was a Buddhist institution, as is shown by the nature of the discussions held therein by its inmates.[12]

142. Mention is also made of Queen Mallikā's Garden, in which there was a great hall for public discussions.[13] In the neighbourhood were the Royal Garden,[14] the wood called Andhavana,[15] and the stream called Sutanu.[16]

143. Far to the south of the Kosalan capital lay (5) the city of

[1] There would not have been sufficient space within the encircling fortified city wall.

[2] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 16 (*the Tapoda-Garden*).

[3] Ch. 10 *a* § 11 (*gateways*).

[4] Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [476].

[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 4; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [1]; Ch. 18 *b*.

[6] Int. § 146; Ch. 14 *c* § 17; Ch. 18 *b* § 2 n; Visākhā was also known as Migāra's mother (Ch. 18 *b* §§ 1, 3 [1], 4 [78]; Ap. D *c* § 4 n).

[7] Int. §§ 136, 190 (*architecture*); Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1].

[8] Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [1].

[9] A *koṭṭhaka* is a boundary wall or the enclosed space within it. The *ārāmā* or gardens, of which one so frequently reads in the Nikāyas, were doubtless enclosed within walls of mud topped with tiles, or of thin baked bricks, as is usual in the India of the present day; Int. § 190 (*gardens*).

[10] Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [160].

[11] *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 345.

[12] Though Gotama taught that there was a higher purity than that of caste (see Ap. F 2 *c*, The True Brāhman), he treated Brāhmans with scrupulous respect, and many members of that caste became his followers (cp. Ch. 9 *b*, *Siṅgālovāda Sutta*).

[13] Int. § 126; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1].

[14] Ch. 14 *c* § 11.

[15] Ch. 14 *c* §§ 12, 13.

[16] Ch. 14 *c* § 14.

KOSAMBI,[1] which became during Gotama's lifetime notorious through the dissensions[2] of the numerous Buddhist monks established there. The city was situated at no great distance westward of the junction of the Ganges and its great affluent the river Jumna.[3] It was the capital of what had been formerly a considerable independent kingdom lying immediately to the west of the ancient kingdom of Kāsi,[4] which latter had become subordinate to its greater northern neighbour Kosala. The city lay on the north bank of the Jumna. In the *Saṃyutta Nikāya*[5] it is said to have been situated on the banks of the Ganges (*Gangāya nadiyā tīre*), but either this is a mistake or the name Kosambi has been brought into the text here by error for some other place.[6]

144. Some topographical details are to be found in the Canonical Books. Mention is made there of Ghosita's Garden (*Ghosit-ārāma*),[7] the Badarika Garden[8] (called by Mrs. Rhys Davids[9] the Jujube Tree Park),[10] and the Siṃsapa-tree Grove (*Siṃsapa-vana*),[11] and also of the Pilakkha Cave (*Pilakkhaguhā*),[12] which was frequented by wandering teachers (*paribbājakā*)[13] of all sects. Of the Buddhist establishments here Rhys Davids writes:[14] 'In the Buddha's time there were already four distinct establishments of his Order in the suburbs of Kosambi—the Badarika, Kukkuta, and Ghosita Parks, and the Mango Grove of Pāvāriya (Vin. 4. 16; Sum. 319).' Of the four places thus referred to only the first and third are mentioned in the *Vinaya*; the remaining two appear in the commentaries but are additional to those mentioned in the first four Nikāyas and the *Vinaya*. Rāja Udena's park near the river at Kosambi is also mentioned.[15]

(*c*) *Minor towns and villages visited by the Buddha*[16]

145. Along the routes between the great cities the Buddha visited many minor towns and small villages.[17] In the land of the Magadhas[18]

[1] Int. §§ 150, 167; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 n; Ch. 15 *b* (i); Ch. 19 *b* § 1; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 9 [17], 24 n; Ap. F 1 *b* § 1; Ap. G 1 *a* § 6.
[2] Ch. 15 *b* (ii).
[3] Ch. 8 *d* § 8.
[4] Int. § 162.
[5] Ch. 15 *b* § 7.
[6] The scene of the next Sutta is placed at 'Kimbilā on the bank of the river Ganges' (Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [1] n).
[7] Ch. 15 *a* § 2 n; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 1 [1], 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15 [15].
[8] Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [2].
[9] *Book of Kindred Sayings* (*Saṃ. Nik.*), iii, p. 107.
[10] 'Comy. "a matter of three miles distant"'—Mrs. Rhys Davids's footnote.
[11] Ch. 15 *b* § 8; Ap. G 1 *a* § 6. There were groves of the same name at Ālavi (*Ang. Nik.* i, p. 136, and iv, p. 216) and at Setavya (Ch. 14 *d* § 2).
[12] Ch. 15 *b* § 2. The bank of the Ganges opposite Akbar's Fort, at the junction of that river with the Jumna, close to the modern city of Allahabad, forms a high cliff and is honeycombed with ascetics' caves. There were apparently similar caves on the bank of the Jumna near the ancient city of Kosambi.
[13] Int. § 126.
[14] RDBI, p. 36.
[15] Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12].
[16] Int. § 162.
[17] The references to the capital cities of the four great States of the Middle-land—Rājagaha, Vesālī, Sāvatthi, and Kosambi—as well as to Kapilavatthu, the chief town of the Sakyans, are very numerous in the first four or early Nikāyas of the *Sutta Piṭaka*, and sufficiently establish that Gotama from time to time dwelt and

[For note 18 see opposite]

he is said to have visited the following places besides Rājagaha:[1] Uruvelā,[2] on the bank of the river Nerañjarā, where Gotama attained enlightenment, and, not far distant, Gayā-Head (*Gayā-sīsa*) overlooking the town of Gayā;[3] the Southern Mountain region[4] lying south of the capital, in which region the Brāhman village of Ekanālā receives specific mention; Ambalalaṭṭikā,[5] Ambasaṇḍā,[6] Andhakavinda,[7] Khānumata,[8] Mātulā,[9] Nālaka,[10] Nālandā,[11] Pañcasālā,[12] and Pāṭaligāma, which afterwards became the famous city of Pāṭaliputta.[13] Mention is also made of Kallavāḷamutta-village,[14] where, however, Buddha merely appeared in a vision.

146. In the Aṅgan[15] country, which was a subordinate kingdom lying to the eastward of Magadha along the course of the Ganges, and which had recently come under the overlordship[16] of that kingdom, the following places are mentioned as being honoured by a visit from the Buddha: Campā,[17] the capital city, with the villages of Assapura[18] and Āpana,[19] and also the city of Bhaddiya.[20] The city of Campā lay on the east bank of the river of the same name,[21] which formed the eastern boundary of Magadha. It was close to the modern Bhāgulpur.[22] The tradition that Gotama visited Campā and the villages of the Aṅga country south of the Ganges and east of Magadha proper is supported by scattered references in all four early Nikāyas. Campā is further mentioned in the *Mahā-Parinibbāna Sutta*[23] as one of the great cities more suitable to be the scene of the death of the Blessed One than the small town of Kusinagara. The city of Bhaddiya was the native place of the lady Visākhā,[24] the great benefactress of the Buddhist Order, and is said in Buddhaghosha's Commentary on the

preached therein. The references are too numerous to record here in full. As regards other localities, whose claims are less clearly proven, it is believed that all the references in the first four Nikāyas to the actual presence of the Master there are given in the several chapters or sections devoted to the subject in the present work.

[18] Int. § 158 (2); Ch. 11; Ch. 20.

---

[1] Int. § 125.

[2] Ch. 3 §§ 5, 6; Ch. 4 §§ 1, 9; Ch. 6 *a* § 1; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 11 *b*; Ap. B *c* § 2 (1).

[3] Ch. 5 *a* § 4; Ch. 7 *a* § 5; Ch. 11 *b*; and Ch. 19 *b* § 9 [1].

[4] Int. § 132.

[5] Ch. 11 *d* §§ 8 [2], 9; Ap. E *c* i § 2 n.

[6] 'Mango-Wood', SBB. Ch. 11 *d* § 12.

[7] Ch. 11 *d* § 11 [1].

[8] Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1].

[9] Ch. 11 *d* § 13.

[10] Ch. 11 *d* § 4; Ap. C *b* § 7 n. This is the same as the Brāhman village Nālā or Nālāgāmaka (Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2]).

[11] Ch. 11 *d* §§ 5, 6, 7 [16], 8; Ch. 20 § 10 [15]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 1 n.

[12] Ch. 11 *d* § 14.

[13] Int. § 71; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [1] n; Ch. 20 § 11 [19]. For the name cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [1] n.

[14] Ch. 13 *b* § 6 [1].

[15] Int. §§ 158 (1), 162; Ch. 11; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 (i).

[16] See RDBI, p. 24.

[17] Int. § 167; Ch. 8 *e* § 5; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [1] n; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]; Ap. I *b* § 3 n.

[18] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[19] Ch. 11 *f* § 4.

[20] Ch. 11 *f* §§ 1 [1], 2 [1]; Ap. B *b* § 4.

[21] See *Jāt. Nid.* iv. 454; SBB, ii. p. 144 n.

[22] See SBB, ii, p. 144 n.

[23] Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17].

[24] Int. § 140; Ch. 18 *b*.

Dhammapada to have been in Bengal,[1] which lay still farther eastward than the Aṅgan country; but in the *Mahā-vagga*[2] of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, the Magadhan king Bimbisāra[3] speaks of 'that city of Bhaddiya which is our territory', and it was therefore probably annexed to the Aṅgan country. The *Mahā-vagga* also records a visit of the Buddha to Bhaddiya, where he is said to have stayed in the Jātiya Grove.[4]

147. In the territories united under the Vajjian[5] Confederacy, which covered what is now called Tirhūt and of which the western part was known as Videha or Mithilā,[6] the following places besides Vesāli[7] are mentioned as visited by the Teacher: Bhandagāma,[8] Hattigāma,[9] Kotigāma,[10] Ukkācelā or Ukkāvelā[11] on the bank of the Ganges, 'all among the Vajjians'; Ambugama,[12] Jambugama,[13] Bhoganagara[14] northward of Vesāli, the town of Mithilā, Nādika or Nātika or Ñātikā[15] with the neighbouring Gosinga Wood, 'among the Videhans'.[16]

148. In the lands of the small sub-Himalayan tribal republics, which came under the influence either of the Vajjian Confederacy or the Kosalan monarchy, the Canonical Books mention:

(i) 'Among the Mallas':[17] the chief town of the clan, Pāvā,[18] and Anupiyā,[19] Kusinārā[20] the scene of the Buddha's death, and Uruvelakappa.[21]

(ii) 'Among the Sakkas[22] (or Sakyas)',[23] Gotama's own clan: besides Kapilavatthu the townships of Cātumā,[24] Khomadussa,[25] Medaḷumpa,[26] Sakkara,[27] Sāmagāma,[28] Sīlāvati,[29] and Devadaha,[30] which is elsewhere said to be the capital town of the neighbouring and closely related clan, the Koliyas.

(iii) 'Among the Koliyas',[31] the clan of Gotama's mother and of

[1] See Warren's *Buddhism in Translations* (1922) 101, verse 53.
[2] See *Mahā-vagga*, vi. 34 [3–4].
[3] Int. §§ 162, 168.
[4] MV, v. 8 [1].
[5] Int. §§ 158 (5), 170; Ap. H 3 *a* § 1.
[6] The western part of North Bihār (*Tirhūt*) is still known as Mithilā. Int. §§ 166, 168; Ch. 12 *e* § 12.
[7] Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *c*.
[8] Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 21 § 17 [1].
[9] Ch. 12 *e* § 2 [1].
[10] Ch. 12 *e* § 4 [1].
[11] Ch. 12 *e* § 11 [1].
[12] Ch. 21 § 19 [5].
[13] Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [1]; Ch. 21 § 19 [5].
[14] Ch. 21 § 19 [5].
[15] Ch. 12 *c* § 11; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 5 [6], 6 [1], 7 [1], 8 [1], 9 [1], 10.
[16] Int. §§ 166, 168.
[17] Int. §§ 158 (6), 164; Ch. 13 *a*; Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [13] n.
[18] Ap. G 1 *a* § 1 n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 [ii].
[19] Ch. 2 § 7; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [I, 15] n; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1], Ch. 19 *b* § 1.
[20] Ch. 11 *f* § 7; Ch. 13 *a* §§ 5, 6, 7, 8; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 1, 10 [19]. 'Probably . . . at the junction of the Rāpti with the Gandak', V. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, p. 51; cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 8 [39] n. See Ch. 8 *d* § 8.
[21] Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [1].
[22] Int. § 164; Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii); Ap. H 2 *a* § 4.
[23] Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [353]. The adjectival form is *Sākiya*; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (529).
[24] Ch. 13 *c* § 26. See OB, p. 114 n.
[25] Ch. 13 *c* § 28.
[26] Ch. 13 *c* § 30; Ch. 14 *d* § 5.
[27] Ch. 13 *c* § 29.
[28] Ch. 13 *c* § 24 [1] n, § 25.
[29] Ch. 13 *c* § 27.
[30] Ch. 1 § 5 [52].
[31] Int. § 164; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (529); Ch. 13 *d*.

his wife:[1] Devadaha[2] the capital town of the clan, Halidda-vasana,[3] Kakkarapata,[4] Sajjanela,[5] Sāpūga,[6] and Uttara.[7]

(iv) 'Among the Bhaggans'[8] the Buddha and the Elders stayed from time to time on the Suṃsumāra Peak (*Suṃsumāra-gire*).[9] This is stated[10] to have been near Kapilavatthu, but may have been considerably to the south of the Sakyan territories since Buddha is said in the *Culla-vagga*[11] to have proceeded from Vesāli to Suṃsumāragiri in the Bhaggan country and to have gone thence direct to Sāvatthi.

(v) In the Himālayan[12] country (*Himavanta-padese*), north of Kosala and westward of the Sakkans, on the slopes of the mountains (*Himavanta-passe*), numerous Buddhist devotees settled, and the Buddha is said to have visited them.

149. In the Kosalan[13] kingdom the visits of the Buddha or the Elders to a large number of places besides Sāvatthi[14] are recorded. (*a*) Between Gotama's native town Kapilavatthu and the great city of Sāvatthi lay Setavyā[15] or Setabbyā, which was an important halting-place; and Nangaraka[16] may have lain near this route. Between Setabbyā and Sāvatthi lay the villages of Ukkatthā[17] and Icchānankala,[18] and the villages of Manasākata,[19] Tudi,[20] and Kāmandā[21] appear to have been in their neighbourhood. This last village was on the bank of the river Aciravati[22] on which Sāvatthi was situated. On his journeys from Sāvatthi to these places Gotama it seems left the city by the north gate.[23] (*b*) between Sāvatthi and the southern capital towns of Kosambi and Kāsi (*Benāres*) lay Ayojjhā and Sāketa. Ayojjhā[24] is said in the Nikāyas to have been situated upon the Ganges, but in fact it was on the river Sarayu,[25] near the modern Ajodhya or Oudh, situated on the river now called the Ghaghra, a northern tributary of the Ganges. Close to Ayojjhā, and perhaps adjoining it,[26] was the important city of Sāketa.[27] Between Sāketa and

1 See RDB, p. 52; Ch. 10 *c* (76) n.
2 Ch. 13 *d* §§ 2, 3, 4. Cp. Int. § 166 (*Rāmagāma*).
3 Ch. 13 *d* § 5.
4 Ch. 13 *d* § 8.
5 Ch. 13 *d* § 7.
6 Ch. 13 *d* § 9.
7 Ch. 13 *d* § 6.
8 Int. § 164; Ch. 13 *b*; Ap. E *c* i § 8 n.
9 Ch. 10 *c* § (70) n; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 (8th *vassa*) *Madhurattha Vilāsini*.
10 RDB, p. 71.
11 CV, v. xxi, xxii; Ch. 13 *b*.
12 Ch. 13 *e* §§ 1, 2.
13 Int. § 158 (4); Ch. 6 *a* § 1 n; Ch. 14 *d* §§ 2, 4; Ch. 14 *f* § 1.
14 Int. § 138.
15 Ch. 14 *d* § 2.
16 Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [118]; Ch. 14 *d* § 5.
17 Ch. 14 *d* § 3.
18 Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9] n; Ch. 14 *d* §§ 4, 6.
19 Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [37] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i).
20 Ch. 14 *d* § 6 [2].
21 Ch. 14 *d* § 7.
22 'Hiouen Thsang mentions a river A-chi-lo-fa-ti, which is doubtless the same [as Aciravati]. It is evidently the river on which stood the town of Sāvatthi, and near to which lay the Jetavana monastery (see *Buddhist Birth Stories*, p. 331); and it must therefore, in accordance with Burnouf's conjecture, be the Rāpti, which is the Sanskrit Irāvati': Rhys Davids's note, SBE, xi, p. 167.
23 Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [476].
24 Ch. 14 *e* § 8.
25 RDBI, p. 34.
26 'Sāketa is often supposed to be the same as Ayojjhā (Oudh), but both cities are mentioned as existing in the Buddha's time. They were possibly adjoining, like London and Westminster': Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, p. 39.
27 Ch. 14 *e* § 2; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]; Ch. 17 *e* [7] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [3].

Sāvatthi lay Toranavatthu.[1] (c) Other places[2] visited by him were: Caṇḍalakappa,[3] Daṇḍakappaka,[4] Ekasāla,[5] Kesaputta,[6] Nagaravinda,[7] Naḷakapāna,[8] Opasāda,[9] Pankadhā,[10] Sādhukā,[11] Sālā,[12] Sālavatika,[13] Ujuññā,[14] Veludvāra,[15] and Venāgapura.[16] Mention is made of the Sundarikā river,[17] but without the specific name of the Buddha's halṭing-place.

150. In the Vaṃsa[18] kingdom of Kosambi,[19] lying south-west of Kosala and north of the Jamna, besides the capital city of the same name, few if any places are mentioned. After the dissensions which broke out among the members of the Order at Kosambi at a later date during Gotama's residence in that city, the Teacher finding it impossible to placate their quarrels departed to await the return of a spirit of moderation to both parties, and on his route northward passed through Bālakaloṇakāra-gāma (Bālaka the salt-maker's village),[20] and after halting there reached Pācīna-vaṃsa-daya (Eastern Bamboo Park),[21] whence he proceeded to Pārileyyaka.[22] It is not clear whether this last place lay in the Vaṃsa territory or in Kosala.

151. In the sub-kingdom of Kāsi (Benāres),[23] the eastern neighbour of Kosambi, few places[24] are mentioned in the Canon other than the city and immediate environs of Benāres.

152. In the lands of the Kuru clan[25] neighbouring on Kosambi on the north-west side, and situated between the Jamna on the west and Kosala on the east, the township of Kammāssadhamma[26] and Thullakoṭṭhita[27] are said in the Canonical Books to have been visited by the Buddha.

153. The Buddha is also said in the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* to have stayed among the Sumbhans[28] (*Sumbhesu*), in a town called Setaka or Sedaka.

[1] Ch. 14 *e* § 1 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [3]. [2] Cp. Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [1] n.
[3] Ch. 14 *f* § 1. [4] Ch. 14 *f* § 2. [5] Ch. 14 *f* § 3.
[6] Ch. 14 *f* § 4. [7] Ch. 14 *f* § 5. [8] Ch. 14 *f* § 6.
[9] Ch. 14 *f* § 7. [10] Ch. 14 *f* § 8. [11] Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [3].
[12] Ch. 14 *f* § 9. [13] Ch. 14 *f* § 10. [14] Ch. 14 *f* § 12.
[15] Ch. 14 *f* § 13. [16] Ch. 14 *f* § 14 [1]; Ap. F 2 *b* [6].
[17] Ch. 14 *f* § 16.
[18] Int. §§ 18, 158 (8); 'Vaṃsa is the country of the Vacchas, of which Kosambi, properly only the name of the capital, is the more familiar name': Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, p. 27. [19] Int. § 143; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 (9th *vassa*); Ch. 15 *b* (i).
[20] Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [154].
[21] Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 1 n. From Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] it appears that this place was in the land of the Cetis (see § 154 below).
[22] Ch. 15 *b* §§ 6 [5], 11 [iv, 6], 12 [v, 1]. At Pārileyyaka was the Rakkhita grove called the Pārileyyaka Wood in the Commentary on the Buddhavaṃsa (*Madhuratthа Vilāsini*); Ch. 10 *d* § 1.
[23] Int. § 119; Ch. 3 § 8 [68]; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 1, 3, 9; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]; Ap. B *a* 2 [6] n; Ap. C *b* § 2 [8]; Ap. D *c* § 3 n. [24] Ch. 15 *a* § 14.
[25] Int. § 158 (9). 'The Kurus occupied the country of which Indraprastha, close to the modern Delhi, was the capital': T. W. Rhys Davids's footnote, *Dial. of the Buddha*, Pt. II, p. 50.
[26] The name is variously spelt. Ch. 16 *a* §§ 1, 2, 3, 4, 5; Ap. B *c* § 4; Ap. C *a* § 3.
[27] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54].
[28] Ch. 16 *d* § 3. The position of this clan is not clear, but it was apparently settled in the lands west of Kosala.

154. A prominent disciple of the Buddha, the venerable Mahā-Cunda, and other *therā* (elders) and *bhikkhū* (friars or monks) are said in the *Aṅguttara* and *Saṃyutta* Nikāyas[1] to have stayed among the Cetis[2] (*Cetesu*) at Sahajāti or Sahañcanika.[3] This clan was apparently not reached by the Buddha himself. Its lands adjoined those of Kosambi and apparently lay on the northern border of the Vaṃsa lands in the Doāb between the Ganges and the Jamna.[4]

155. On the western (or right) bank[5] of the Jamna[6] were situated the lands of the Matsya (*Maccha*)[7] and of the Sūrasena clans[8] and the kingdom of Avanti.[9] There is no record apparently of any visit of the Buddha to the Macchas, but the Nikāyas record the residence of the Elder Mahā-Kaccāna in Madhura (or Madhurā),[10] the capital city of the Sūrasenas.[11] They also state that the Buddha himself halted midway between Madhura and Verañjā,[12] from which statement it would appear that the two towns were not far distant from each other, though perhaps separated by the river Jamna.

156. Westward and southward of the Jamna lay the great western kingdom of Avanti,[13] of which the capital was Ujjeni.[14] It would not appear to be authenticated that the Teacher himself journeyed to the regions on this side of the Jamna. It is noticeable that in the first four Nikāyas Avanti is only five times made the scene of a Discourse (Sutta), and on each of these occasions the preacher is the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna.[15] The scenes of these Discourses are Kuraraghara[16]

[1] *Saṃ. Nik.*, PTS, v, p. 436; *Aṅg. Nik.*, PTS, iii, p. 355; v, p. 41, p. 157.

[2] Int. §§ 150 n, 158 (7); Ch. 13 *b* § 6 [1] n; Ch. 16 *c* §§ 1, 2, 3.

[3] Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [1].

[4] 'The Cetis . . . had two distinct settlements. One, probably the older, was in the mountains, in what is now called Nepal [Jat. v. 514, 518]. The other, probably a later colony, was near Kosambi to the east and has been even confused with the land of the Vaṃsā [Kosambi]': Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, p. 26.

[5] In the *Mahā-vagga*, Kh. VII. i. 1 (Ch. 8 *j* § 5), it is stated that a party of Pātheyyaka (western) Bhikkhus (friars) on their way to Sāvatthi were delayed during the rainy season at Sāketa. On the word Pātheyyaka Rhys Davids (SBE, xvii, pp. 146–7) has the following note: '. . . Pātheyya, with Pācīna, Avanti, and Dakkhinā-patha, is one of the principal divisions into which India, as then known, was divided; and that it includes most, if not all, of the great westerly kingdoms of Kura, Pancāla, etc., which are the last eight of the 16 kingdoms in the stock list [see IN 12 below] . . . Probably the literal meaning of Pātheyya is "western" (Sans. pratyañk). . . .' Int. § 159.

[6] The rivers which figure in the *Vinaya Piṭaka* and in the first four Nikāyas of the *Sutta Piṭaka* are those of the Gangetic plain, from the river Jamna eastward. See Ap. II 4 *d*, *Culla-vagga*, Kh. IX. i. 4: '. . . the great rivers—that is to say, the Gangā, the Yamunā, the Aciravatī [Int. § 149], the Sarabhū and the Mahī—when they have fallen into the great ocean, renounce their name and lineage and are thenceforth reckoned as the great ocean.' Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 1; also 'The feast of the Gangā and the Mahī', MV, v. ix. 3.

[7] Int. § 158 (11); Ch. 17 *a* [4].

[8] Int. § 158 (12). See Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, p. 27.

[9] See RDBI, p. 28; Ch. 6 *a* § 1 n, and Int. § 158 (14).

[10] Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii) n; Ch. 17 *b* § 1. 'Madhurā was visited by the Buddha (*Aṅg. Nik.* 2. 57),' RDBI, p. 36.

[11] Int. § 158 (12).

[12] Int. § 157; Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii).

[13] Int. §§ 158 (14), 162; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15]; Ap. H 3, *Note*.

[14] See RDBI, p. 28.

[15] Ch. 10 *c* [1] (10).

[16] Ch. 17 *d* §§ 2 [1], 4 [1].

and Makarakata.[1] Varanā (or Viranā) mentioned in the *Aṅguttara Nikāya*, i, p. 65, was probably a township of the Avantis, but is not described thus definitely. If Gotama did not visit Avanti this was probably for sound administrative reasons and it may be hazarded that these were connected with linguistic difficulties, the language or languages of the inhabitants of the western kingdom differing markedly at that period from the group of kindred tongues of the dominant peoples of the Middle-land, though whether the former were connected with those of the north-west or south of India does not appear.

157. Certain places are said in the Nikāyas and elsewhere to have been visited by the Buddha or his followers without any specification being given of the clan, province, or kingdom to which they belonged. Under this head come Ālavi,[2] Kajangalā[3] which is described as an eastern border township, Kimbilā[4] which was on the bank of the river Ganges, and Verañjā[5] which apparently was between the Ganges and the river Jamna; also Ātimā[6] which was between Kusinārā and Sāvatthi, and the Mankula[7] and Cāliya[8] hills. Macchikāsaṇḍa[9] is alternatively placed among the Kāsis and Sāvatthi; it is not claimed that the Teacher himself went there. Setakaṇṇika and Thūna are barely mentioned as remote places on the southern and western borders of the Middle-land.[10]

NOTE 12

POLITICAL BACKGROUND[11] OF GOTAMA'S TIMES

158. The *Aṅguttara Nikāya* sets forth in several Suttas[12] a list of sixteen chief clans[13] or tribes occupying the Gangetic valley and the territories west of that region. This list comprises the following names, which always appear in the same order: (1) Aṅgas,[14] (2) Magadhas,[15] (3) Kāsis,[16] (4) Kosalas,[17] (5) Vajjis,[18] (6) Mallas,[19]

[1] Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [1].
[2] Ch. 10 *c* (64); Ch. 10 *d* § 1; Ch. 16 *d* § 1.
[3] Ch. 16 *d* § 8; Ap. E *c* ii § 2.
[4] Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [1]; see also Ch. 1 § 2, which apparently places the town in the Vajjian country.
[5] Int. § 155; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 (7th *vassa*, n; 12th *vassa*); Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii); Ch. 17 b § 1.
[6] Ch. 13 *a* §§ 5 [1] n, 7 [1] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 6; *Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 131.
[7] Ch. 10 *d* § 1; Ch. 16 *d* § 1.
[8] Or, Cālikā. Ch. 10 *d* § 1; Ch. 16 *d* § 1.
[9] Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1].
[10] Ch. 1 § 2.
[11] Int. § 18.
[12] 'The Stock list of the Sixteen Great Countries, the Sixteen Powers, which is found in several places in the books. ["E.g., Aṅguttara, 1. 213; 4. 252, 256, 260; Vinaya Texts, 2. 146."]': Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, p. 23.
[13] Int. §§ 14, 17, 159 (*Rājput*); Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; Ch. 11 *f* § 3; Ch. 17 *a* [4]. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36].
[14] Int. §§ 146, 162; Ch. 11 *a* § 2; Ch. 11 *e*; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]; Ch. 17 *a* [4].
[15] Int. §§ 123, 145; Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 5 *a* § 6 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 11; Ch. 7 *c* § 1; Ch. 8 *a* [2].
[16] Int. §§ 18, 119, 162; Ch. 8 *j* § 2; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; Ch. 15 *a*; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*, n. Their ancient capital, Benāres, figures prominently in timeless legends (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2).
[17] Int. § 149; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1]; Ch. 14.
[18] Int. §§ 133, 147; Ch. 12; Ch. 19 *a* § 2; Ch. 21.
[19] Int. § 148 (i); Ch. 13 *a*; Ch. 22.

(7) Cetis,[1] (8) Vaṃsas,[2] (9) Kurus,[3] (10) Pañcālas,[4] (11) Macchas,[5] (12) Sūrasenas,[6] (13) Assakas,[7] (14) Avantis,[8] (15) Gandhāras,[9] (16) Kambojas.[10] In *Dīgha* 18 (*Jana-vasabha Suttanta*)[11] appears a shorter and apparently older list of ten clans, namely, 'Kāsis and Kosalas, Vajjis and Mallas, Cetis and Vaṃsas, Kurus and Pañcālas, Macchas and Sūrasenas'. It is noticeable that the order in which the clans are placed in these lists is from the east to the west.[12] The shorter list observes the same order as the longer, but omits at the beginning the two easternmost clans, namely, Aṅgas and Magadhas, and at the end the four westernmost (west and north-west) clans, and thus includes only the clans occupying the Middle-land (*Madhya-desha*),[13] which lies between the river Gandak on the east and the Jamna on the west, and which is the central region of northern Indian history. The Suttas contained in the first four Nikāyas were gathered from persons who had heard them in places scattered over all the regions visited by the Buddha, and were collected at the great Councils[14] from the mouths of representatives of the several states or provinces. It would seem that the longer list of states was developed in imperial Magadha, and the shorter list found in *Dīgha* 18 was formulated north of the Ganges under the influence of either Sāvatthi or Vesāli.

159. It may be conjectured that the ten clans above mentioned formed the inner circle of Kshatriya or Rājput[15] tribes ruling the Middle-land at this period, having issued from the mid-Himālayan region and spread eastward and westward.[16] Gotama's tribe, the

[1] Int. § 154; Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [1]. [2] Int. § 150; Ch. 15 *b*.
[3] Int. § 152; Ch. 16 *a*. [4] Ch. 16 *b* § 1. [5] Int. § 155.
[6] Int. § 155; Ch. 17 *a* and *b*. [7] Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]; Ch. 17 *a* [4].
[8] Int. §§ 18, 155, 156, 162; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15].
[9] Int. § 173 (*frontier*); Ch. 17 *e*.
[10] These cannot be located. The name reappears, as do numerous Indian Buddhist place-names, in Indo-China, and one may hazard the conjecture that it was carried there by warlike emigrants from the western coast of India who took with them both the Buddhist faith and Brāhman priests for ritual offices and powerful charms. Ch. 17 *a* [4]. Cp. Eliot, *H. and B.*, iii, pp. 100–4; and Ap. A 2 *d* (*practices*).
[11] Int. § 162; Ch. 12 *e* § 6; Ch. 16 *b* § 1 n.
[12] Except that the Kāsis and Kosalas are placed before the Vajjis and Mallas.
[13] Ch. 1 § 2; Ch. 4 § 8 n; Ch. 8 d § 8; Ap. G 1 *b* § 1 n. Cp. KM, p. 13.
[14] IN 6 (*Councils*).
[15] Int. §§ 158 (*clans*), 185; Ch. 7 *b* § 2 n; Ch. 12 *a* § 19 [1] (*warrior caste*); Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (19) n; Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2] n. Cp. *Kula-putta*, men of [good] family; Ch. 1 § 6 [56]; Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* § 2; Ch. 7 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 7 *c* § 1; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [2]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 4 [8], 20; Ap. C *b* § 10; cp. also Ch. 7 *a* § 11 (*Sakya-kula*), and Ap. F 2 *a* (134). The pride and quick temper of the clansmen were notorious (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]).
[16] For the early Prākrit legendary history of the Middle-land see F. E. Pargiter; *Purāṇa Text of the Kāli Age* (1913). In the confused Purāṇa annals most of the sixteen tribes are mentioned but not those of the North-west; Ikshvāku, the legendary ancestor of the Sakyas, appears repeatedly (Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [15] n). For the distinction between the eastern and western Aryan tribes occupying northern India cp. Oldenberg, *Buddha* (Stuttgart, 1923), pp. 10, 73, 174, 191. See also Int. § 155 n; cp. Ch. 17 *c* [36] n. It was the north-western clans that Alexander met and overcame some two hundred years after Gotama's death. A branch of the Sixteen Clans,

Sakyans, was not of sufficient importance for separate mention in such a list.[1]

160. That these tribes imposed their rule on a people of mixed blood, speaking an Aryan language, brought thither by invaders from the north-west, seems likely. The people of Magadha were not, apparently, of the inner circle of tribes, but their royal house was closely allied in blood to the Vajjian aristocracy[2] and to the Kosalan royal house,[3] and doubtless the landed and martial classes generally were related to the clansmen north of the Ganges.

161. The easternmost clan of the shorter list above, the Vajjians,[4] were organized in a Confederacy, which at the time of Buddha's death constituted an independent and vigorous republican state.[5] Of this Confederacy the Licchavis,[6] whose head-quarters were at Vesāli, were the most important member, and they were still powerful in the fourth century A.D., when the fifth Gupta monarch married a Licchavi princess.[7] The non-Brāhman inhabitants of Tirhūt, or the north-west part of modern Bihār, are doubtless largely descended from the Vajjians and kindred clans and are a remarkably robust and virile stock with marked characteristics of their own.

162. The 'stock list' of chief clans in *Dīgha* 18[8] represents a tradition doubtless older than the Buddha's time,[9] and still adequately represents the condition of affairs prevailing in Gotama's lifetime, as is shown by the details given of the Teacher's journeyings from tribe to tribe.[10] The Magadhas, however, under King Bimbisāra,[11] shortly before the Buddha's ministry established an overlordship over their eastern neighbours the Aṅgas;[12] and the Kosalas by this time under Gotama's contemporary, King Pasenadi, had imposed their overlordship upon their southern neighbours the Kāsis,[13] and upon the famous and ancient city of Benāres. The monarchical system of government[14]

having reached the western coast, seems to have set forth by sea at a very early date to Ceylon (Int. § 21 n) and to have established a kingdom there, whence they maintained a connexion with northern India (cp. Eliot, *H. and B.*, vol. iii, p. 12). They may thus have pointed the way to the countries now known as Indo-China. The two great Indian epics seem to be based originally on Kosalan legends of a war between the eastern and western clans and an invasion of Ceylon by the former. It may not be fanciful to see in the martial and puritanical Sīkhs or Singhs of the Panjāb the descendants, lineal or spiritual, of those eastern clansmen who carried the Mauryan Empire into the countries westward of the Middle-land and who filled the valleys of Afghanistān and Kashmīr with Buddhist monasteries.

[1] Int. § 165 (*a small agricultural community*).
[2] RDBI, pp. 25–6.
[3] See V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, p. 45.
[4] Ch. 12.
[5] Ch. 12 *d* § 5; Ch. 12 *e* § 13 (*Videhans*) n.
[6] Ap. B *b* § 3 (1). See also Ch. 12 *a*.
[7] See V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, pp. 147–8.
[8] Int. § 158.
[9] See RDBI, p. 23.
[10] IN 11 *c*.
[11] Int. § 146.
[12] See RDBI, pp. 24, 260; V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, p. 45; Int. §§ 146, 158 (1); Ch. 7 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5]; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163].
[13] See RDBI, p. 24; Int. §§ 143, 158 (3); Ch. 8 *j* § 2 n; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [111].
[14] See RDBI, pp. 3–4; KM, p. 14. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*consecrated*); Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [11] n (*emperor*); and Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [34] (*rāja-kattāro*).

was firmly established among the Magadhas and Kosalas, and westward of these the Vaṃsas[1] occupying the strip of territory between the Ganges and the Jamna, near the junction of those rivers, were also under the monarchical form of government. This form of government also prevailed among the Avantis[2] in the great kingdom stretching south-westward from the Jamna to Ujjeni,[3] the capital city. Northwestward of Avanti and westward of the river Jamna the Sūrasena clan was also under monarchical rule, the royal house being related by marriage[4] to that of Avanti.

163. There is no mention of monarchical institutions at this date among the clans lying to the north and north-west of these kingdoms and westward of the Kosalan kingdom, of which latter the river Ganges was apparently the western boundary.

164. Eastward of the Kosalan kingdom and northward of the Vajjian Confederacy lay the territories of a number of minor clans, of which only the Mallas find place in the 'stock list', but which include Gotama's own clan, the Sakyas,[5] besides the less known Kolis[6] and Bhaggas.[7] The system of government prevailing among the Sakyas and the small neighbouring clans, as well as among the Mallas[8] and the more powerful Vajjian Confederacy,[9] was evidently republican.[10]

165. The Introduction to the Jātaka Commentary represents Suddhodana, Gotama's father, as a Mahārāja or great king,[11] but it is apparent from the same narrative that the Sakyas were a comparatively small agricultural community,[12] and the *Vinaya Piṭaka*[13] accounts show that the head of the government was temporary and elective, though frequently, but perhaps not necessarily always, chosen from the family to which Gotama belonged.[14] Suddhodana's eldest son Siddhattha, who afterwards became the Buddha, and Siddhattha's only son Rāhula retired from the world, as did after-

[1] Int. § 150.
[2] Int. §§ 156, 158; Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [1] n; Ch. 23 *a* [7] n.
[3] See RDBI, p. 28.
[4] See RDBI, pp. 36, 40.
[5] Spelt also Sākiya or Sakka. Int. § 148 (ii); Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1], [4]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 13 *c*; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (3).
[6] Int. § 148 (iii).
[7] Int. § 148 (iv); Ap. E *c* i § 8 n.
[8] 'The Mallas were an oligarchy of rājas. They are called rājas in the Comy.': SBB, iv, p. 201 n. It would be more accurate to call them kshatriyas (Int. § 164; cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [ii, 1] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (1), Ajātasattu's claim) or rājputs. For proceedings in their mote-halls at Pāvā see the opening of *Dīgha* 33, i. 1 (*Saṅgīti Suttanta*), and at Kusinārā (Ap. H 3 *a* § 3). Cp. Int. § 171 (*Council-chambers*).
[9] Ch. 20 § 2. For the Council-hall and the meeting-house at Vesālī called the Kūṭāgāra Hall see Int. § 133.
[10] Int. § 171 (*self-government*); cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 3 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3] n. It may be conjectured that where there were republics the population consisted mainly of Kshatriya clansmen, whilst the population of the kingdoms was more mixed, as a result of later and less radical conquest.
[11] Ch. 1 § 5 n; cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [b].
[12] Int. §§ 135, 159; Ch. 1 § 7 [57] n.
[13] See *Culla-vagga* VII in Ch. 10 *b* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 13; Ch. 19 *b*.
[14] See RDBI, p. 19. Cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 2.

wards their cousin Bhaddiya[1] during the period when he was actually head of the government, besides Nanda[2] who was the Teacher's half-brother, and Ānanda his cousin and numerous other close relations, without apparently any disturbance of the course of affairs in the little state.

166. On the death of the Buddha in the small town of Kusinārā in the territory of the Mallas it fell to the Mallas of Kusinārā[3] to distribute the Teacher's remains after the cremation. The *Mahā-Parinibbāna Sutta*[4] account states that the remains were distributed by them to (1) the King of Magadha, Ajātasattu,[5] the son of the queen[6] of the Videha[7] clan, (2) the Licchavis of Vesāli, (3) the Sakyas of Kapilavatthu,[8] (4) the Bulis of Allakappa, (5) the Koliyas of Rāmagāma,[9] (6) the Brāhman of Vethadīpa, (7) the Mallas of Pāvā,[10] besides (8) their own share; whilst other relics were given by them to (9) Doṇa the Brāhman,[11] and (10) the Moriyas of Pipphilivana. Thus the Mallas of Kusinārā are said, not without verisimilitude, to have distributed, besides their own portion, remains or other relics to the King of Magadha; to the Licchavis of Vesāli, who were the most powerful of their nearer neighbours; to their own kinsmen the Mallas of Pāvā; to the Sakyas and Kolis, who were close kinsmen of Gotama; to the Bulis of Allakappa, and the Moriyas[12] of Pipphilivana, who were neighbours,[13] and possibly kinsmen, either of the Mallas or of the Sakyas; and, further, to two Brāhmans,[14] Vethadīpaka and Doṇa, the former being apparently an important spiritual personage of the neighbourhood, and the latter a prominent figure of the town. It is observable that this list, whilst including the powers of Vesāli and Magadha, makes no mention of the King of Kosala, who at this time was the overlord[15] of Gotama's clan, the Sakyas, and who had lately invaded and sacked[16] Gotama's birthplace, Kapilavatthu. It may perhaps be concluded that though the Sakyas were under the Kosalan king, their neighbours the Mallas and some of the kindred clans were drawn within the influence of, if not subjected to, the more easterly power, the Vajjians, who in turn came, through marriage alliances, within the sphere of influence of Magadha.

[1] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3]. Mahānāma (Int. § 169), Gotama's cousin (KM, p. 40) succeeded Bhadraka, or Bhaddiya, the successor of Suddhodana in the headship of the Sakyan clan (see RDB, p. 73).
[2] Ch. 7 *b* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 11 [91] n.
[3] Ch. 13 *a* § 7 [1].
[4] Ch. 22 *c* § 10.
[5] Int. §§ 18, 167, 168; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [1], [7]; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [1]; Ch. 22 *c* § 9.
[6] The wife of Bimbisāra, King of Magadha.
[7] Int. § 147.
[8] The phrasing brings no suggestion of a royal house or method of government.
[9] Int. § 148 (iii, *Devadaha*) n; Ch. 13 *d* § 2 [52] (*Devadaha*) n; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (5).
[10] Ch. 13 *a* § 1 [13].
[11] Ch. 22 *c* § 10.
[12] Ch. 22 *c* § 11.
[13] Ch. 2 § 6.
[14] Ch. 22 *c* § 10 n.
[15] In *Ang. Nik.* iii. 124 it is stated that 'the Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans came to Kapilavatthu', and thus the Sakyan capital at that time was considered to be within the Kosalan kingdom. See also RDBI, p. 259.
[16] See RDBI, pp. 4 11–12; OB. p. 117 n; KM, p. 40. Int. §§ 167, 169.

167. In the narrative of the Buddha's last journey[1] it is stated that when the Teacher lay sick unto death in the Mallan town of Kusinārā his cousin and disciple, Ānanda, begged him not to die in 'this little wattle and daub town', but in one of the 'great cities, such as Campā,[2] Rājagaha,[3] Sāvatthi,[4] Sāketa,[5] Kosambi,[6] and Benāres',[7] where due honour could be paid to his remains. This list of towns including Campā (Bhāgalpūr) and Sāketa, besides four of the scenes of the Teacher's greatest activity, but excluding Vesāli,[8] is interesting. Ānanda, who had recently with Gotama departed from the last-named city, would scarcely have omitted it. One may perhaps conclude that the list was made after the subjection of the Vajjians to Magadha[9] under King Ajātasattu.[10] The omission of Kapilavatthu[11] is equally interesting. From this omission it may be gathered that the Sakyan capital was only a small provincial town. From the circumstance that Ānanda, himself a Sakyan, is traditionally supposed to have deplored that Gotama, his cousin, should not die in an important city such as, among others, Sāvatthi, the Kosalan capital, one may guess that the memory of the recent attack of the Kosalan king, Vidūdabha,[12] upon Kapilavatthu roused no great resentment among the Sakyan Rājputs, and therefore that the accounts of the destruction of the town found in the Commentaries are exaggerated.

168. When Gotama made the Great Renunciation and left his native town to seek that Enlightenment which should illumine and save the world, he turned his steps southwards towards the famous city of Rājagaha and the kingdom of Magadha. There doubtless he looked forward to meeting the spiritual teachers[13] attracted to the neighbourhood of the capital city of that powerful kingdom. At that time the King of the Magadhas was Bimbisāra,[14] who is said to have received the Bodhisatta with respect and kindness, and who six years later after the Great Enlightenment accepted the teaching of the Buddha on his return to the neighbourhood of the great city[15] and richly endowed the Order (*Saṃgha*). Bimbisāra was married to the sister[16] of Pasenadi, King of Kosala, and the bride received as her dowry the revenue[17] of a village in the ancient kingdom of Kāsi, now

[1] Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]. [2] Int. § 146. [3] Int. § 125.
[4] Int. § 138. [5] Int. § 149. [6] Int. § 143.
[7] Int. § 119. [8] Int. § 133; and Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17] n.
[9] Int. § 18; cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 6, and Ch. 20 § 1 [1]. See RDBI, p. 12.
[10] Int. § 166. [11] Int. § 135. [12] Int. §§ 166 n, 169 (iii).
[13] Ch. 3 § 1 [66] (*rāja*). See also Int. §§ 126, 178. The first teachers to whom he presented himself may, however, have lived in the Vajjian country, immediately north of the Magadhan kingdom (Ch. 3 § 5 n).
[14] Int. §§ 128, 146; Ch. 3 § 1; Ch. 7 *a* § 11; Ch. 8 *a* [2]; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [1]; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [94]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 6 [2] n, 8 [6] n; Ch. 10 *c* (28), (49); Ch. 11 *c* §§ 21 n, 23 [1] n; Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5]; Ch. 12 *a* §§ 2, 3; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 14 [92] n, 15 (15); Ch. 14 *a* § 3; Ch. 14 *f* § 7 n; Ch. 19 *b* §§ 4 [1], 5; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99] n; Ap. H 2 *b* §§ 1, 2. See also *Majjh. Nik.*, Suttas 15, 86, and 95.
[15] Ch. 7 *a* § 7 [83].
[16] Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [12]. See RDBI, p. 3.
[17] Int. § 170 n. Compare the remission of the revenues of the village of

subjected to Kosala. Bimbisāra also married a lady of the Videha clan,[1] intending apparently thus to cement an alliance with the important Vajjian Confederacy, whose territories lay on the northern bank of the Ganges opposite Magadha. Mention is made of Udumbarikā[2] and Kshemā[3] as Magadhan queen-consorts, and the Canonical Books mention Abhaya[4] and Jayasena[5] as princes of the royal house of Magadha. It does not appear whether either of these was the same as Ajātasattu,[6] the son of the Videhan consort of Bimbisāra. This prince succeeded to the throne,[7] which, it is said, he occupied before the death of his father, whom he subsequently murdered.[8]

169. (i) In the Kosalan kingdom during the greater part of the Buddha's ministry the throne was occupied by Pasenadi,[9] of whom frequent mention is made in the Canonical Books, a whole section of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* being called 'The Kosalan' after him. The king became a devoted follower of the Buddha.[10] (ii) His policy was evidently one of peaceful alliance with the kingdom of Magadha, as is evidenced by the marriage of his sister to King Bimbisāra and of his daughter[11] to Ajātasattu. (iii) Pasenadi was married to the daughter of Mahānāma,[12] who was for the time ruler of the Sakyan clan. Tradition or commentarial imagination relates that the Sakyan Council played a trick upon their Kosalan neighbour and dominant ally and sent him as his bride an illegitimate daughter of their chief by a slave-girl. The offspring of this marriage was Vidūdabha,[13] who near the close of the Buddha's life successfully rebelled against his father, who died whilst fleeing towards Magadha. After Vidūdabha's accession, it is said, he invaded[14] and subjugated the Sakyans in revenge, having learnt the true origin of his mother.

Rummiṇḍeī (Lummini), the Buddha's birthplace, by the Emperor Asoka. (See the Rummiṇḍeī Pillar Inscription, Ch. 13 *c* § 16; cp. Int. § 174; also Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1].)

1 Int. §§ 147, 190; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 12 *e* § 13; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [1]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 20 § 1. See also RDBI, pp. 3, 12. An alternative rendering of Ajātasattu's appellation 'Vedehiputta' is 'Son of the Accomplished Princess', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 109.

2 Ch. 11 *c* § 11 [1] n.

3 See RDBI, pp. 31–2.

4 Ch. 8 *j* § 1 n; Ch. 7 *e* [6] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 1 [392]; Ap. B *a* § 5 n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) n. 'This "royal prince Abhaya is mentioned by the Gainas . . . as the son of Seniya, i.e. Bimbisāra,"' SBE, vii, p. 173.

5 Ch. 11 *c* § 29 n.

6 Ajātasattu means 'having no enemy', and is probably an official title. (See SBE, xi, p. 1 n.) Int. §§ 166, 170; Ch. 19 *b* § 2; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 20 § 1; Ch. 23 *b* § 8 (ii); Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i).

7 Commentarial conjecture dates this about eight years before the death of the Buddha. (See KM, p. 38; RDBI, p. 14.)

8 But see V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, pp. 47–8.

9 See RDBI, pp. 8–11; Ch. 8 *j* § 2 n; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n; Ch. 12 *a* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [26] n, 30; Ch. 14 *a* § 1; Ch. 14 *b*; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 7 n, 10 [1] n; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 3 [11], 4; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [7]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3.

10 *Saṃ. Nik.*, 1, 70.

11 See RDBI, p. 4.

12 Int. § 165 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1] n; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (15th *vassa*). See RDBI, p. 11; KM, p. 40.

13 Int. § 167; Ch. 14 *a* § 1 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [127]; Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110]. See Eliot, *H. and B.*, i, p. 161, where in the absence of canonical authorities reference is made to the *Jātaka* and other Commentaries.

14 Int. §§ 18, 166. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1] n; Ch. 14 *d* § 5 [119] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8].

170. Thus when the reign of King Pasenadi was drawing to a close the understanding between the kingdoms of Magadha and Kosala was broken, and Ajātasattu[1] invaded Kosala, but after some preliminary successes was defeated, and a peace was patched up[2] which postponed the ultimate struggle between the two kingdoms for mastery over the Middle-land. Ajātasattu favoured the Buddha's dissentient cousin Devadatta,[3] who after accepting the teaching of Gotama subsequently found the Middle Way too easy for salvation and returned to the stricter path of an asceticism which did not differ greatly from that of the Hindus. The king, however, was afterwards induced to visit the Buddha and nominally at least accepted his teaching.[4] When maturing his schemes for the conquest of his mother's kinsmen, the Vajjians, he sent his Brāhman minister to question the Buddha, with a view to finding out the weak points of the Vajjian Confederacy.[5] The Buddha is sometimes reproached by historians for having replied to such questioning, but the Canon only records that the Buddha, when interviewed by the minister, addressed his own followers and said that as long as the Vajjians faithfully observed their own well-tried institutions they would flourish and be strong. The king is said to have proceeded to undermine these institutions, but for that the Teacher cannot be held responsible; nor can any great teacher be fairly reproached for the fact that he does not shun the company of publicans and sinners. On the last journey, when Gotama reached Pātaligāma on the south bank of the river Ganges, near the junction with the river Sōn,[6] he found the two chief ministers[7] of Ajātasattu fortifying that strong position, nominally against the attacks of the Vajjians. On the death of the Buddha not long afterwards the king claimed from the Mallas a share of the relics of the Blessed One.

171. Frequent mention is made in the Canonical Books of the councils of the republican clans occupying the north-easterly part of the Middle-land, and council-chambers[8] are mentioned both at the head-quarters of a clan and in minor towns, and in the case of the Vajjians a great Confederacy was formed uniting a number of minor clans and yet apparently leaving to each a measure of self-government.[9]

[1] Ch. 19 *d*; Ch. 23 *a* [7]; and Int. § 168. See *Kindred Sayings*, i, pp. 109–10.

[2] Int. § 18. The daughter of Pasenadi was given in marriage to Ajātasattu, and the dowry previously given to her aunt was renewed in favour of the young queen. Int. § 168 (*revenue*) n.

[3] IN 7 (*Devadatta's Schism*).

[4] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99].

[5] Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *d* § 6; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2].

[6] The Sōn formerly entered the Ganges to the east of the city.

[7] Int. § 172.

[8] Int. §§ 123, 164 (*Mallas*); Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [353]; Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [20]; Ap. B *b* § 3 (1); Ap. H 3 *a* § 3. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 5, 28 [3]; also Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1].

[9] Int. § 164 (*republican*); Ch. 1 § 8; Ap. H 3 *a*. See RDBI, p. 25. The elaborate and at the same time practical and effective organization of the *Saṃgha* (Ch. 8 *e*, *Constitution*) shown in the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, and the procedure of the Great Councils (IN 6, (*Councils*)) must have been based upon those of similar contemporary political or civil institutions.

172. From time to time mention is made of chief and other ministers[1] employed by the kings of those clans which had come under the monarchical form of government. The kings necessarily were acquainted with the institutions of their republican neighbours, and it may be concluded that their methods of government though not constitutional were by no means unsystematic.

173. Some two hundred years later, near the close of the fourth century B.C., Seleukos Nikator,[2] after the death of Alexander the Great, succeeded in establishing his claim to the most easterly part of the Macedonian conqueror's newly formed empire, including Persia and the north-west portion of India. In pursuance of his claims in India Seleukos encountered and was defeated by the consolidated clans of the Middle-land, who had found union and strength under Chandragupta[3] (Greek *Sandrakottos*), the first sovereign of the great Mauryan line. A treaty was made by which Seleukos gave up to Chandragupta his Indian provinces, including the modern Afghanistān and Baluchistān, and the Mauryan Empire thus included all the eastern and western clans of northern India and the north-west frontier.[4] As a result of the treaty Seleukos sent Megasthenes as ambassador to the court of Chandragupta at Pātaliputta (Greek *Palimbothra*). Megasthenes' account[5] of the government centralized at the head-quarters of Chandragupta's empire shows a highly elaborated and regularized system, sufficiently practical to maintain Chandragupta's large empire in a condition of remarkable strength and prosperity.

174. Another account of the Mauryan system of government was written by Chandragupta's Brāhman minister, Chānakya, whose *Arthashāstra*[6] testifies to the high elaboration of the art of government in ancient northern India. Something more than the elements of the elaborate system reported by Megasthenes and Chānakya had doubtless been developed under the predecessors of the Mauryan Emperor in the kingdoms and republics of the Middle-land in the time of the Buddha. The famous Edicts inscribed by Chandragupta's grandson Asoka[7] upon rocks and pillars in the widely separated provinces of his great empire afford further evidence of the development of the art of government in ancient India.

[1] Int. § 137 (*statesmanship*); Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 11 *a* § 5 [1]; Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5]; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 3 n, 9 [1]; Ch. 19 *b* § 5; Ch. 20 § 11 [26]; Ch. 22 *b* § 8 [15]; Ch. 23 *a* [8]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [iv]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2; also Ch. 8 *b* §6 [*b*]; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [1]; Ch. 11 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 15 [17]; Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 2 [18], 13 [163] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [6] n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vii]. Such ministers were often Brāhmans (Int. § 170; Ch. 11 *c* § 21; Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2]; cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [29] (*purohita*). See KM, p. 34 n).

[2] See RDBI, p. 268; V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, p. 74.

[3] Int. § 18. See V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, p. 57.

[4] Int. § 158 (15).

[5] See RDBI, pp. 264, 268.

[6] See V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, p. 86.

[7] IN 5 *a*; Int. § 168 n.

175. War,[1] fortified cities,[2] frontier forts,[3] armies[4] and arms,[5] and what may be termed police,[6] receive only passing references in the Nikāyas and the *Vinaya*.

NOTE 13

RELIGIOUS AND PHILOSOPHICAL BACKGROUND[7]

176. Glimpses of the ancient Indian religious beliefs contemporary with and earlier than Buddhism are given from time to time in the Canonical Books. The hierarchy of Hindu gods headed by Brahmā[8] appears not infrequently in the background, as it were, but much changed and diminished in power and altogether subordinate to the Buddha. Mention is made of the Vedas,[9] the ancient collections of hymns addressed to the gods ruling over the forces of nature by the Ṛishis or Seers of the Aryan tribes, which entered the plains of India through the north-western passes, but in each case it is the 'three vedas' that are mentioned, the fourth or *Atharva Veda*[10] being evidently a later addition.[11]

177. The great ethical doctrine of *karma*,[12] i.e. the continuous consequences of actions upon the individual in a long series of re-births, was widely spread before the time of the Buddha, and was accepted by him, but was necessarily greatly modified[13] in his teaching by his doctrine of the non-existence of a permanent self. The endeavour to escape from *karma* and the chain of existences encouraged then, as now among Hindu devotees, practices of extreme asceticism.[14]

178. Behind the gods and behind the whole phenomenal world the Indian philosophic mind perceives the unconditioned origin of all, the One, Brahman.[15] The doctrine of *māyā*,[16] or the illusory nature of

[1] Ch. 12 *d* § 6.
[2] Int. §§ 136, 138; Ch. 2 § 6 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 3; Ch. 20 § 11 [26]; Ch. 22 *c* § 4 (*gate*); Ch. 23 *a* [7]; also Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17] (*mud-walled*). See also Ch. 15 *a* § 5; and Int. § 190 (*architecture*).
[3] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].
[4] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 11 *a* § 5 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [1]; Ap. B *b* § 3 (1); Ap. H 2 *b* § 2.
[5] Ch. 8 *l* § 3; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*bows*); Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [99]; Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).
[6] Ch. 13 *d* § 6 n; Ch. 22 *c* § 2 [13]; also Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [6] n (*informers*).
[7] Int. §§ 6, 19; Ch. 1 § 11 n; Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*); Ap. C *a*; Ap. E *c* i § 2 n; Ap. G 2 *a*; Ap. G 2 *c*.
[8] IN 8 *a*.
[9] Ch. 1 § 6 [55]; Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133]; Ap. A 2 *a* (6); Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13] (*te-vijja*); also Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (11), *charms* or *Mantras*.
[10] See RDBI, p. 213; V. A. Smith, *Oxford Hist. of India*, pp. 16–18. The first three are the *Ṛig*, *Sāma*, and *Yajur Vedas*. The fourth veda consists of incantations and spells, some of which are apparently as old as the other vedas (Int. § 188).
[11] Ap. A 1 *b* (15) n.
[12] Int. §§ 4 (*transmigration*), 8, 186; Ap. B *b* § 5 n.
[13] Int. § 41.
[14] Int. § 187; Ch. 3 (iii) § 7 [67] (*austerities*).
[15] Int. §§ 35 (i), 178; IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*unity*).
[16] IN 8 *c*.

all phenomena, was taught by thinkers of the Vedāntist[1] school, and it would appear that Gotama's teachers[2] Āḷāra Kāḷāma[3] and Uddaka[4] the disciple[5] of Rāma imparted to him this philosophy. Though Gotama was not satisfied with their doctrines and with their efforts to transcend the ego,[6] yet even after his Enlightenment he considered that they were not far from the truth. In the famous *Tevijja Suttanta*[7] the two young Brāhman interlocutors of the Buddha question him regarding the respective merits of the methods of Pokkarasāti and Tārukka, each of whom taught a method of attaining union with Brahmā. These teachers evidently were orthodox Hindu exponents of yoga[8] (union with the deity), and probably differed only as to method and imparted a doctrine similar to that inculcated by Gotama's own teachers.

179. Important Hindu teachers contemporary with Gotama are mentioned frequently in the Canon, and their activities in opposition to the Buddha are strictured. Their teachings, like those of Gotama, were not confined to the ancient ways. Like the Buddha they wandered[9] from place to place in the Middle-land spreading their doctrines by discussion. Six[10] of these leaders are specially censured, namely, Pūrana Kassapa,[11] Makkhali Gosāla,[12] Ajita Kesakambalin,[13]

[1] Int. §§ 8 n, 66; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] n; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [11] n; Ap. D *b*, *Note*. Cp Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2] n. For contemporary Vedāntic or Upanishadic teaching see A. Coomaraswamy, *Buddha and the Gospel of Buddhism*, 1916 (1928), pp. 187–94.

[2] IN 8 *c* (*teachers*); Int. § 168; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (cp. Ch. 16 *a* 1 [502], *lore*). These philosophers may have been idealist Vedāntist monists or possibly Yogis of the dualist Saṅkhya school.

[3] Int. § 81; Ch. 3 §§ 4, 5 [164]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26].

[4] Int. § 81; IN 8 *c* (*teachers*); Ch. 3 § 5 [165].

[5] Or son.

[6] Ch. 3 § 5 n.

[7] Int. § 37.

[8] Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. C *b* § 11 (23); Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Sāṅkhya*); Ap. I *a* (*Trance*). See A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), pp. 66, 143 ff.; OB, pp. 78 ff. 'The expression "Yogin" is first found in the later Upanishads. In the *Ṛig Veda* (x. 136) the man in the state of ecstasy is called Kesin (the long-haired). The oldest word for ascetic is Muni. It is often found in the *Ṛig Veda*. Ancient expressions for ascetics are "Sannyāsin" (he who renounces), "Sramaṅa" (he who takes great pains), and "Parivrājaka" (the wanderer)': A. Schweitzer, *Indian Thought and its Development* (1936), p. 38 n. Cp. Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2] (*Samaṇa*).

[9] Int. § 126.

[10] Int. § 185; Ch. 4 § 17 n; Ch. 9 *c* (*Titthiyas*), as also Ch. 8 *j* § 4 [1]; Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ap. B *b* §§ 4, 5 n. These six were the chief leaders of the Titthiyā or sectaries frequently mentioned in the Canon (Ch. 8 *k* [2] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 8 [15]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*). See also Ap. G 2 *c* (*Opponents*). For accounts of the six schools and for references to Pāli texts dealing with them see Sir C. Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), i, pp. 98–100; OB, p. 82. Cp. KM, p. 32. They must not be confounded with the six dissentient Buddhists, whose opposition to the Buddha later within the Saṃgha is frequently reprobated in the *Vinaya Piṭaka* (Ch. 8 *c* § 3; Ap. I *b* § 1).

[11] Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 5 [3], 11 [3] n; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i).

[12] Makkhali 'of the cattle-pen'. Int. § 183. The hyphen is optional; in *Dīgha* 2 [3], [19] (PTS, i, p. 48, p. 53), only the second half of the name is inflected, whilst in [21] both parts of the name appear in the genitive form.

[13] Ajita 'of the hair-garment'. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i). *Dīgha* 2 [4] (PTS, i, p. 48) reads Kesa-kambalo.

Pakudha Kaccāyana,[1] Sañjaya Balaṭṭhiputta,[2] and the Nigaṇṭha (unfettered, or Jain) Nātaputta.[3]

180. Except in the case of Nātaputta, who was the founder of the Jain sect, the tenets of these philosophers are now known only through the reports of their confirmed opponents, and therefore any definition of the exact boundaries of their several philosophies can only be tentative. At the same time, the subject is one of real importance, since it is evident that the Buddha found himself in strong opposition to, and strongly opposed by, all of them, and from this opposition it should be possible to obtain important indications regarding the nature of Gotama's original doctrines.

181. Though it may be hazardous to define the boundaries between these hostile philosophies, it yet seems safe to say that each of them exhibited one or more of the following characteristics, all of which were repugnant to Gotama, namely, a radical scepticism[4] questioning all things and sapping all decision and all action; a radical materialism[5] denying all things spiritual and involving a determinism which denied all freedom of the will; a materialism combined with a radical indeterminism, which left all things to chance, and equally eliminated the freedom of the will, the distinction between good and evil, and all moral responsibility; and an individualism which, while seeking to transcend the boundaries or material limitations of the ego and thus to merge itself in the Universal, yet concentrated its efforts solely upon its own salvation, through a series of rebirths or directly, and found in passivism or quietism the way of escape from the earthly coil.[6] All these tenets were in exact opposition to the teachings of the *Dhamma* of Gotama, who, whatever may have been the doctrines of the later Buddhism preached by his followers, himself taught a realism which accepted the phenomenal world as we see it, and insisted upon the freedom of the will and moral responsibility, upon the insignificance of the individual as individual, though equally insistent upon the importance of all actions of the individual in relation to their consequences upon others, and turned away resolutely from the quest after

[1] Kaccāyana 'of the Pakudha-tree'. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [26].

[2] Int. § 182.

[3] Vardhamāna of the Nāta clan, who was variously called Nigaṇṭha (the unfettered) Mahāvīra (the great hero) and Jina (the conqueror)—from which last title his sect is named Jaina (victorious). (See Sir C. Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism*, i, p. 111; Jacobi, *Jaina Sūtras*, SBE, xxii, xlv.) Int. §§ 41, 184, 187 n; Ch. 8 n; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 6; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [3]; Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [243]; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [4] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 1; Ap. B *b* § 3 (1), (2); also Ap. A 2 *c* (*Tathāgatas*) n.

[4] Int. § 182.

[5] Int. § 183; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [6].

[6] The *Brahmajāla Suttanta* attributes to Buddha a list of sixty-two philosophic views opposed to his own teachings. The several views are treated cursorily, but something further is learnt of their tenets through their classification under ten heads, these heads themselves being arranged in two groups, of which the first deals with 'the beginning of things', that is the origin of the world and the soul, and the second with 'the future', that is the destiny of the soul and Karma. (See Ap. C; Ap. G 2 *c*, (*Gotama's Opponents*).) Cp. E. J. Thomas, *Life of Buddha* (1927), pp. 199–201.

self-salvation through self-concentration and quietism to find the blessing of Nibbāna[1] (self-extinction) in selfless and tireless activity.[2]

182. Of the six leaders mentioned above, Sañjaya,[3] the subtle-minded sceptic or agnostic, was the teacher of the youthful Sāriputta and Moggallāna, who became the two chief disciples of Gotama. His agnosticism was as radical as that of the Athenian Sceptics who troubled the philosophic schools of Greece not long afterwards.

183. Makkhali Gosāla,[4] the head of the Ājīvaka[5] sect, was a thorough materialist, who attributed all phenomena to chance, found no difference between right and wrong, and consequently denied all moral responsibility. He apparently believed in an almost endless series of re-births, but not in any moral progress during the process. His teachings called forth the special censure[6] of the Buddha.

184. Nātaputta, the most famous of the six *titthiya* leaders, was the founder of the Nigaṇṭha sect, whose doctrines have been identified with Jainism,[7] and outside the Buddhist texts is generally known as Mahāvīra. He was a Licchavi of high family and was apparently somewhat older than Gotama, whom he predeceased by a brief time.[8] Though the tenets of Jainism and Buddhism have often been confounded, there must have been originally a strong contrast between the two faiths. According to the Buddhist tradition the followers of Nātaputta brought about the death of Moggallāna[9] shortly before the death of the Buddha. The opposition between the two leaders was great and constant, and in the case of two such men cannot be attributed to personal rivalry. Their doctrines doubtless had a common starting-point in Vedāntic Hinduism, but they differed radically in their views on the nature of the soul, the older leader teaching a theory of *karma*[10] conducting the individual soul through endless rebirths

[1] Compare the *mukti* or *moksha* (liberation, deliverance) of the Vedānta (see KM, p. 53 n).

[2] IN 5 b (*Essentials*).

[3] Int. §§ 179, 181 (*scepticism*); Ch. 7 *a* §§ 16, 18, 22; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 22 *b* § 15; Ap. G 2 *c* §§ 2 (ii) [23], 3 (i) [32].

[4] Int. §§ 42, 179, 181 (*materialism*); Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524]; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i).

[5] Ch. 5 *a* § 4; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524]; Ap. C *b* § 2 n. Those who 'follow the right or strict way or method of living'. Cp. *sammā-ājīva*, the fifth section of the Noble Eightfold Path (Ch. 5 *b* § 4). They were solitary, or rather independent, naked ascetics of an extreme Cynic and pessimistic type (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*asceticism*)). They are mentioned along with the Brāhmans and Jains in Asoka's sixth Pillar Edict (Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vi]), and received benefactions from that tolerant emperor (see V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 134).

[6] Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*, n. Cp. Int. § 45 n.

[7] Int. §§ 41, 179; Ch. 4 § 17 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [5] n, [8] n; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13]; Ch. 9 *c*; Ch. 11 *a* § 3 (*Nigaṇṭhas*); Ch. 12 *a*; Ch. 13 *d* § 4; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 19 *c* § 1; Ch. 22 *b* § 15; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vi]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*, §§ 3 (i) [29], 3 (ii); Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 n. See Sir C. Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), vol. i, ch. vii where full authorities on Jainism are cited.

[8] Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [243].

[9] Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [1] n.

[10] Ap. § 177; Ap. B *a* § 5. See ThB, pp. 205–6, where the *Cūla-Dukkhakkhandha Sutta* of the *Majjhima Nikāya* (*Majjh.* 14) is cited showing that the exhaustion of *karma* was the ideal of the Jains. See Ch. 9 *c* § 1.

to ultimate salvation in the liberation of the ego from matter, and the other teaching the mortality of the soul, and the unimportance of the ego except in the sphere of duty and moral responsibility, of which the effects are without end.[1] For Jainism matter and the individual soul[2] are indestructible, and the supreme aim is the liberation of the latter from the former. Matter is pervaded by countless individual souls, and their liberation, which is the supreme end, is attainable by asceticism, passivism, and harmlessness (*ahiṃsā*).[3]

185. All the six leaders[4] ignored, as did Gotama, the Vedic rites and the claims of the Brāhmans[5] to religious dominance. None of them belonged to the Brāhman caste, and two at least of the seven, Nātaputta and Gotama, were members of the Kshatriya[6] or martial caste. All the six are occasionally in the Nikāyas termed Brāhmans, but only in the sense of holy or religious men or ascetics.[7] The Nikāyas and the *Vinaya* in specifying the four great castes[8]—or sometimes three,[9] including the Vaisyas and omitting the Sūdra[10] (Pāli *Sudda*) caste which is non-Aryan—place the Kshatriya (Pāli *Khattiya*) or martial caste first and the Brāhman only second. The name Brāhman is used respectfully throughout the Canon, but in many passages means, as above, 'a holy man', and is by no means limited to the Brāhman caste. In the life of the householder an occasional part only is played by the Brāhman ritual.[11]

186. The first great convert made by the Buddha was Kassapa, who may be the same as the Mahā-Kassapa who succeeded to the headship of the Saṃgha after the Buddha's death. Kassapa at the

[1] See Ap. B *b* (*Impersonal kamma*).
[2] Int. § 36 n.
[3] Int. § 49.
[4] Int. § 179.
[5] Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [26]; Ap. E *c* i § 2 (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*); Ap. F 2 *c* (*Brāhman*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 (*Three-Veda*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (1) [2]; also Ch. 1 § 2; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] n (*mānava*); Ch. 14 *a* § 7; Ch. 14 *d* §§ 4, 6 [2], 7 (*Brāhmaṇī*); Ch. 14 *f* § 10 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [157]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [501]; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [3]; Ap. E *c* ii § 2 n; and Ch. 7 *a* § 7 [83]. See also Ch. 9 *b* § 9 (*religious devotees*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Brāhman*); and Ap. G 2 *c* (*Opponents*). It would seem that the local or tribal priesthood in the Middle-land was gradually replaced by the Three-Veda or Western Brāhmans, whose learning and claims were higher; cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1] n.
[6] Int. § 159; Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [26], 15 (16), 30 [120] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 6 [10], 9 [17]; Ch. 22 *c* § 9; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].
[7] Ch. 22 *b* § 15 n. See SBE, xi, p. 105, Rhys Davids's note on 'Samaṇa-brāhmaṇa'.
[8] Ch. 1 § 2 (*caste*); Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [15]; Ch. 14 *a* § 7; Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [127]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84]; Ap. F 2 *c* (*caste*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4); Ap. H 4 d. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii, 1]. Caste was still little more than class. The great physician Jivaka (Ch. 8 *j* § 1) was a foundling and casteless; he practised at the court of Rājagaha, and was educated at Taxila.
[9] Ch. 14 *b* §§ 5 [4], 6 [2]; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21]; MPS, v. 17.
[10] Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 8; Ap. F 2 *c* § 2 (21); and Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [2] n. Low castes are enumerated at *Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 152, iii, p. 169.
[11] Int. § 190 (*Brāhman*); cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 3 [19]; Ch. 11 *d* § 10 (*sacrifice*); Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2]; Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [1] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [204] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1. Cp. Ch. 1 § 2 (*village*); Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1] (*sacrificial*); Ap. A 2 *d* (*practices*). The influence of the Brāhmans apparently had not yet reached the daily life of the smaller households in the Middle-land. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (7) n.

time of his conversion was a fire-worshipper, and it may be gathered that this sect at that time numbered a great many adherents. The object of their worship doubtless represented the fundamental principle of ethereal fire from which all things created were said to arise. The worship was doubtless connected with the Vedic god Agni,[1] and perhaps with the fire-worship of the Iranian section of the Aryans. The sect was Brāhmanical, and its members were called Jaṭilas[2] (matted-haired). It was to them that the Buddha preached the beautiful Fire-sermon.[3] It is notable that in the rules of ordination contained in the *Vinaya Piṭaka* the probationary period imposed upon novices was excused in the case of former fire-worshippers.[4] The ground for this exemption is stated in the *Vinaya* to be their belief in the doctrine that actions have results, in other words the doctrine of moral responsibility. They thus evidently accepted the doctrine of *karma* in some sense.[5] It would seem, moreover, that the Buddha recognized an affinity between the worship of a divine ethereal creative fire[6] and the cosmogonic basis[7] of his own creed.

187. Mendicancy[8] was an accepted feature of the religious life in India then as now. It was the natural duty of the householder to supply the few needs of the ascetics[9] and wanderers,[10] devoted to holy life and high thinking. It seems to have been expected that from among these there would arise from time to time divinely enlightened teachers or Buddhas,[11] and that their enlightenment would be the outcome of a long series of previous births.[12]

188. There also appear before us in the canonical texts astrologers and fortune-tellers,[13] interpreters of dreams,[14] tree-worshippers,[15] snake-worshippers, and bird-worshippers,[16] and practitioners of

[1] Ch. 7 *a* § 8; Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [1] n; Ap. A 2 *d* (*sacrifices*); Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (11). Cp. Sir C. Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), vol. i, pp. 56 ff.

[2] Ch. 7 *a* §§ 2, 3, 22 [3] n; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Buddhavaṃsa*, ii, (61); Ap. B *b* § 5; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (383).

[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 1.

[4] Ap. H 2 *a* § 4. Cp. KM, p. 78; A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 78.

[5] Cp. Int. §§ 41, 177.

[6] Compare the Greek *Pneuma* (breath, spirit). Int. § 39 n. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (4).

[7] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6, *Peace*); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Metaphysical Presuppositions*).

[8] Ch. 1 § 6 [57] n; Ch. 2 §§ 2 (*pabbajitvā*), 5; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*go forth*); Ch. 5 *c* § 8 (*Bhikkhu*).

[9] Int. § 177; Ch. 3 § 7 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 4 (*Ājīvaka*); Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92] n; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15] (*acela*); Ch. 13 *d* § 5 [387]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*asceticism*).

[10] Int. § 126; Ch. 8 *a* [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [3]. The Nigaṇṭhas (Jains) were a mendicant and wandering sect (Ch. 11 *d* § 6) as were the Paribbājakas and the ascetic Ājīvakas and Acelas, prior to the Buddhists.

[11] Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 1, 6 [2]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [1]. See Part I (title). Compare the titles (Conqueror, Emancipated, Great Hero) given to the founder of Jainism as well as to the Buddha (Int. § 179 n; Ch. 7 *c* § 2; Ap. A 1 *b*, 3; Ap. A 2 *b*, 64; Ap. C *b* § 2).

[12] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[13] Ch. 1 § 6 [55] (*the child's future*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (2); Ap. I *b* (*Magic and Occultism*).

[14] Ch. 1 § 4 [50] n; Ch. 4 § 2; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (2); Ap. I *b*.

[15] Ch. 4 §§ 1, 2.

[16] Int. §§ 69, 93 (vii); Ch. 3 § 1; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 1 n.

incantations,[1] magic, and miracles;[2] and everywhere there mingled among them, as the mission of Gotama the Sakyan prospered, a growing number of the mendicants of the new Buddhist sect in the yellow dress of the Order.

NOTE 14

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL BACKGROUND[3]

189. Many features of Indian life, besides the political and religious, are illustrated by the texts selected. The picture of course is a compounded one and exactly the same reliance cannot be placed on every part. Light is thrown upon the revenues,[4] trade, and occupations[5] and economic life of the day, its manufactures,[6] its money,[7] its merchant princes or Seṭṭhis,[8] travel by sea[9] and by land, transport and caravans,[10] and behind these the farmers on the land,[11] and incidental famines,[12] earthquakes,[13] and robber bands.[14]

190. The household life of the time is partly reconstructed before our eyes, to which are momentarily revealed the family,[15] the principal and other wives,[16] the life of the women,[17] the naming[18] of the children,

[1] Int. § 176 n; Ap. A 2 *a* (6, *mantras*). [2] IN 8 *b*; Int. § 94; Ap. I *b*.

[3] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*rule*); Ap. A 2 *d* (*Sīla*); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (80), (239); Ap. H 4, *Note* (*life*); Ap. H 5 (*Habits*).

[4] Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 16; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 3 [11], 5 n.

[5] Ch. 8 *l* § 3; Ch. 9 *a* [2] n; Ch. 11 *c* § 19; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*corporation*); Ch. 14 *c* § 16 [1]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [13] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 10 n.

[6] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (2); Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [iii], (*robes*); Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [6]; Ch. 22 *a* §§ 1 [13], 7 [35]; Ch. 22 *c* § 5 [18]; Ap. B *a* § 2 [6].

[7] Ch. 1 § 3 n; Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 4 § 1; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10), § 7 [3]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 2, 10 [9]; Ch. 13 *a* § 7 [1]; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163] n (*kahāpaṇa*); Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [5] (*kahāpaṇa*); Ap. A 1 *a* (*kahāpaṇa*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [12]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [2].

[8] Masters of merchant guilds. Ch. 1 § 2; Ch. 6 *a* § 2; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 1, 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3].

[9] See *Jātaka*, No. 339 (*Bāveru Jāt.*), BBS, iii, p. 126. The voyagers to Babylon (*Bāveru*) were probably Dravidians (see Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, pp. 104, 116).

[10] Int. § 123; Ch. 4 § 8 n; Ch. 10 *a* § 1 [92]; Ch. 22 *a* § 5 n. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [9]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [v]; Ap. H 1, *Note* (ch. vii).

[11] Ch. 1 § 7 (*Sowing Festival*); Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (4); Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [13]; Ch. 9 *b* § 8 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [4]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [6] n; Ch. 14 *f* § 15 [2]; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [2] (*rice*); Ch. 17 *e* [7]; Ap. D *a* § 4 (335) n; also Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10] n.

[12] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1].

[13] Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n; Ch. 21 § 11 [12] n.

[14] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (*20th year*); Ch. 12 *a* § 3; Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [154].

[15] Ch. 9 *b* §§ 1 [2], 3, 4; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 16; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vii]. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18) n; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56] n; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [4] n. *Khandhaka* v of CV treats of the daily life of the Bhikkhus and gives many details of ordinary household customs; so also *Khandhaka* vi which treats of sleeping apartments and furniture.

[16] Ch. 1 § 7 n; Ch. 2 § 4 (*devī*); Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [13]; also Int. § 168 (Bimbisāra's two wives).

[17] Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4]; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [xiv] n; Ch. 7 *b* § 2 n; Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 9 *b* § 3; Ch. 10 *a* § 3 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [2]; Ch. 10 *c* [7]; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] (*saintship*); Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (5); Ch. 13 *b* § 5 n; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [24], 12 [1]; Ch. 14 *d* § 7 (*Brāhmaṇī*); Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [127]; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [1] n; Ch. 17 *a* [4] n; Ch. 17 *b* § 1; Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 4 [8], 5 [9], 11 [21]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 1. Women are the subject of *Saṃ. Nik.*, *Salāyatana-Vagga*, book iii, *Mātugāma-Saṃyutta* (xxxvii) (PTS, iv, pp. 238–43).

[18] Ch. 1 § 6.

daily prayer,[1] the position of the Brāhmans[2] in the household and their status in secular life, fasts[3] and feasts,[4] marriages,[5] the servants[6] and slaves,[7] with food and drink,[8] furniture,[9] dress,[10] bathing,[11] fans,[12] the toilet[13] and the way of doing the hair,[14] the noon-day rest,[15] vehicles,[16] streets,[17] gardens,[18] ceremonial[19] and mode of address,[20] medicine in sickness,[21] and burial or cremation[22] at death. And we perceive outside the family but deeply affecting it the courtesan;[23] and music, acting, and the arts,[24] amusements and sports.[25] Something is

[1] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2] n.

[2] Int. § 185 (*ritual*); Ch. 1 §§ 6 [55], 7 (*festival*); Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [127]; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [29]; also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [197]; and Ch. 23 *a* [7]. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2] n; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [15]; Ch. 22 *c* § 10 n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4 (*ceremonies*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 1; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (2) n. An instructive account of Brāhmanic and popular Indian animistic and seasonal rites retained under a Buddhist régime is included in H. G. Q. Wales's *Siamese State Ceremonies* (1931), chs. xix–xxi, xxiv–xxvii.

[3] Ch. 8 *a*; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51] (*observances*).

[4] Ch. 1 §§ 3, 7; Ch. 10 *a* § 4; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (1). Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 4 (*dances*).

[5] Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 7 *b* § 3; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [2] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii, 1].

[6] Ch. 9 *b* §§ 3, 6, 8; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 6 [2], 11; Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [3].

[7] Ch. 1 § 7; Ch. 4 § 1; Ch. 8 *d* § 6; Ch. 8 *l* § 3; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ap. F 1 *c*[162]; Ap. G 1 *c* §§ 4, 5 [viii].

[8] Ch. 1 § 6 [55]; Ch. 4 § 1 [68] n; Ch. 6 *a* § 12; Ch. 8 *d* §§ 2 (1), (4), 5 (5); Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [1] n; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8]; Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 9 *a* [6] n; Ch. 9 *b* § 8; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [1] n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [4]; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24]; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [3]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 7 n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 (i); Ap. H 3, *Note* (MV, 6).

[9] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 14 [3]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14].

[10] Ch. 6 *a* §§ 3, 4 [6], 13 [1]; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (2); Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8]; Ch. 8 *j*; Ch. 11 *f* § 5 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx, 1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119]; Ap. H 3, *Note* (*leather shoes*); Ap. H *b* 4 § 1 [15].

[11] Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 10 *a* § 11; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6]; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [5]; Ap. H 3, *Note*; Ap. H 5 [94].

[12] Ch. 11 *c* § 14; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 3 [4].

[13] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (8); Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8] and [24] n; Ch. 13 *d* § 8; Ch. 22 *c* § 2.

[14] Ch. 2 § 5; Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] (*barber*); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2].

[15] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].

[16] Ch. 1 § 9; Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [9]; Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149]; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 21 § 7 [25]; Ap. B *b* § 4 (12). Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [9].

[17] Ap. A 2 *a* (1–2).

[18] Int. §§ 136, 149 n; Ch. 1 § 9 (*garden-house*).

[19] Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 6 *a* § 9 [14]; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17]; Ch. 7 *b* § 3; Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]; Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; Ch. 12 *b* §§ 2 [4] (i), 3 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [120]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89] (*rise*); Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101]; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2]; Ch. 20 § 2 (*seasonable*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [2].

[20] Ch. 3 §§ 1–4, 5; Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7], [9]; Ch. 8 *g* § 3; Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 6 [4], 10 [9]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 11 [7], 17 [2], 23 [8]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [i, 19]; Ch. 12 *b* §§ 2 [2], 3 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481]; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [7]; Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [4]; Ch. 14 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [4]; Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [197]; Ch. 19 *b* § 5; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [100]; Ch. 20 § 11 [29]; Ch. 22 *a* § 5 [21]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 7 n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [1]; Ap. G 2 *b* § 2; Ap. H 2 *b* §§ 1 [1], 2 [3]. Also Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*greetings*); Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*saluting*); Ch. 12 *c* § 3 (*courtesies*); Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] (*health*); Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [9] (*standing*), 12 [3] (*third time*).

[21] Ch. 8 *d* §§ 2 (4), 6 [1]; Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [5] n; Ch. 17 *e* [5]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [4]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) n; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4; and Ch. 22 *a* § 3 [20].

[22] Ch. 8 *j* § 10; Ch. 9 *a* [7–10]; Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [11] n; Ch. 22 *c* §§ 2, 5. See SBE, xi, Rhys Davids's *Introduction*, pp. xxxix–xlv.

[23] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxix, 1], [xxx, 1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11].

[24] Ch. 6 *a* § 2; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (7); Ch. 22 *c* § 2.

[25] Ch. 14 *e* § 8 [2] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 14 n; Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [2] n.

learnt of the education[1] of the time and of legal procedure and punishments,[2] and buildings and architecture[3] receive some detailed notice.

191. It is in a varied scene amidst an ancient civilization, probably established by earlier races before the advent of his own clan into India, that the grave figure of the Sakyan Sage, the Enlightened, the Selfless, moves upon his ceaseless mission. Those who desire to study more fully the political, social, and economic life, and the religious beliefs, Brāhmanic and animistic, of India in the time of Gotama must turn to the late T. W. Rhys Davids's *Buddhist India*, where the necessary references to the Pāli texts are collected and analysed. It is not practicable to give here more than glimpses at the complex background of the Buddha's life.

[1] Int. § 137; Ch. 1 § 8 [58]; Ch. 8 *j* § 1 n; Ch. 9 *b* § 5; Ch. 17 *e* [5] n; Ap. B *b* § 2; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [1].

[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 10 [84]; Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 6 [2] (*judgement*), 7 [3]; also Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*]; Ch. 14 *a* § 5 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3].

[3] Int. §§ 127, 137, 140, 175 (*cities*); Ch. 2 §§ 2, 4; Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1], [2]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10] n; Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 2, 11; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11]; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [3]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [4]; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92]; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14] n; Ch. 21 § 7 [24]; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (*stūpa*); Ch. 23 *b* § 6 n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii).

PART I[1]

THE BUDDHA[2] AND THE DHAMMA[3]

RENUNCIATION, ENLIGHTENMENT, THE FIRST CONVERTS, AND THE FOUNDATION OF THE SAṂGHA

[1] The following passages are as far as possible literal translations from the Pāli originals (Int. § 21). All omissions are indicated by dots. Summaries of the longer passages omitted are given in footnotes, and reasons where necessary are given for their omission. Many of these omitted passages are descriptive of supernatural or marvellous events. Single words or phrases have occasionally been omitted from the main text in accordance with the present editor's belief that the Buddha taught a doctrine of pure altruism, and that egoistic or individualistic phrases and passages in the text are of later origin (Int. § 3). In all these cases the omitted words have been given in the footnotes so that readers may judge for themselves.

[2] The Enlightened One, or the Awakened; literally, Understanding, Knowing (Int. §§ 1, 187; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]). For titles applied to Buddha see Ch. 4 § 9; Ch. 7 *a* § 8; Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 2, 6 [2]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [3]; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (534) n; Ch. 22 *b* § 27; Ch. 22 *c* § 10; Ap. A 2 *c*; Ap. E *b* § 2; Ap. H 1 § 5.

[3] Int. § 13; IN 5 *b*; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 [5]; Ap. G and G 1 *b* § 4. The qualities of the Dhamma are variously stated: Ch. 5 *a* § 2 [2]; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14]; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 21 § 7 [25]; Ap. E *c* ii § 1; Ap. G 1 *a* § 5 (1), *lead*; Ap. H 1 § 5. *Dhamma* in this connexion has been rendered in this book almost uniformly as 'Law'. The word has many shades of meaning. Its general force may be rendered by the word 'system', a word which implies both regularity and complexity, and is applicable to concrete and to abstract things (Ch. 3 § 5 [163]; Ch. 14 *a* § 7; Ap. E *c* i § 1 n). For varied meanings cp. Ch. 4 §§ 10 [3], 13 [ii, 3]; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*]; Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 6; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 3; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99]; Ap. C *b* § 4; Ap. F 1 *c* [161]; Ap. H 1 § 6 [9]. Perhaps 'idea' or 'ideal' comes as near as possible to the common purport of these varied meanings. Taken in the widest sense *dhamma* means the truth (the system or nature of things): Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23] and Ch. 14 *c* § 5 [189].

CHAPTER 1

KAPILAVATTHU: BIRTH, YOUTH, AND EARLY DOUBTS

(i) Birth and Early Youth

Jātaka Commentary,[1] *Introduction*[2] (*Nidāna-kathā*), *Record of the Less-distant Past* (*Avidūre-nidāna*),[3] *JN*, 49 *ff*.[4]

§ 1. [JN, p. 49.] . . .[5] [At certain periods] men do not understand the [individual] existence,[6] decay, and death of beings (*sattānaṃ jāti-jarā-maranāni*);[7] and the triple pearl[8] of the doctrine (*dhamma-desanā*) of the Buddhas is not taught, and when the Buddhas speak of transience, of sorrow, and of the absence of a permanent self (*anicca-dukkham-anattā ti*)[9] men will not listen or believe, but say

[1] Int. § 1; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2.

[2] Or, Narrative of connected (introductory) events. In the following extracts from the JN much use has been made of Rhys Davids's *Buddhist Birth Stories*, vol. i.

[3] The *Avidūre-nidāna* (Events of the Less-distant Past, or the period nearing the Buddhahood) is the second part of the *Nidāna-kathā* or Introduction to the Jātaka Commentary; *avi-dūre* means 'not far off' (Ch. 21 § 10 [6]). The first part, or *Dūre-nidāna* (Events of the Far Past), is concerned only with the previous births of Gotama as a Bodhisatta (future Buddha; Int. § 92; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) during the lives of the twenty-four previous Buddhas (Ap. A 2 *c*), first as the Brāhman Sumedha and ultimately as Vessantara, after which preparatory existence on earth he proceeded to the Tusita heaven (*Tusita-bhavane nibbatti*, or *Tusita-pure nibbatti*; Int. § 93, vi), from which he descended in due course to earth as Ṣiddhattha Gotama. The third part, or *Santike-nidāna* (Near Events), deals with Gotama's life subsequent to the Great Enlightenment (Ch. 4 §§ 4 n, 5; Ch. 10 *d* § 3). For the meaning of *Nidāna* cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4]; Ch. 8 *b* § 5; Ch. 12 *d* § 4; Ch. 23 *b* § 8; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[4] The *Jātaka-Nidānakathā* narrative of Gotama's birth is based on the *Acchariya-bhutadhamma-S.*, *Majjh.* 123; and the account of his youth is founded upon the legend of Vipassin Buddha attributed to Gotama in the *Mahāpadāna-S.*, *Dīgha* 14 (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2; Ap. I *b* § 3 n).

[5] Omitting the three Premonitory Uproars, during the first of which a hundred thousand years before the birth of the Buddha the Spirits cry aloud for 'Friendliness, compassion, sympathy with joy, serenity, reverence for mothers, reverence for fathers and respect for elders'. Of these virtues, thus placed in the very forefront of the Law, the first four are the Divine Qualities (*Brahma-vihārā*) of the *Tevijja-Sutta* (Int. § 37; Ap. F 2 *b*) and the last three summarize the social duties of laymen emphasized in the *Sigālobāda-Sutta* (Ch. 8 *l*) and in the Edicts of Asoka (Int. 53). Omitting also: 'When the length of human life is more than a hundred thousand years, the time [for the birth of a Buddha] has not come. Why not?' The words are attributed to the Spirit of Wisdom (the Bodhisatta) destined to become the Buddha. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 26 [4]; Ch. 12 *e* § 12 n.

[6] Literally, birth.

[7] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*maranam*).

[8] Ap. E. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 10; also Ch. 7 *b* § 4 (*treasure*).

[9] Int. § 3; Ch. 4 § 18. These are the famous Three Characteristics, and summarize the basis of the Buddhist philosophy. On their right interpretation depends the proper understanding of the Buddhist creed. They declare in summary form the futility of individual desire or egoism. For the completion of the Buddhist doctrine, however, the Noble Eightfold Path must be added. The Characteristics correspond as a whole with the first three of the Four Noble Truths (Ch. 5). They are philosophical and contemplative and viewed alone passive; but the fourth Truth (the Eightfold Path) inculcates an intense activity such as the Teacher's own life displays.

'What do they talk of?' At such periods there is no comprehension and instruction would be without result (*a-niyyānikaṃ sāsanaṃ hoti*).[1] . . . [At other periods] the teaching of the Dhamma (Law) is effective. . . .

§ 2. [JN, p. 49.] . . .[2] 'The Indian continent (*Jambudīpo*)[3] is large, ten thousand leagues in extent (*dasa-yojana-sahassa-parimāṇaṃ*). Now in which country do the Buddhas appear?' . . .[4] The Middle-land (*Majjhima-deso*)[5] is thus defined in the Vinaya[6] (*Vinaya vutto padeso*): 'On the east the township (*nigamo*) Kajangala,[7] and beyond it Mahāsāla[8] . . .;[9] on the south-east the river Salalavati[10]. . .; on the south[11] the township Setaṇṇika . . .; on the west[12] the Brāhman village[13] Thūna . . .; and on the north the Usīraddhaja mountain. . . . In this country the Buddhas,[14] the solitary Buddhas[15] (*Pacceka-buddhā*), the Chief Disciples, the eighty great disciples,[16] the world-monarch,[17] and other leaders, great men of the martial caste, of the Brāhman caste,[18] and wealthy householders[19] are born. Herein is the city of Kapilavatthu (*Kapilavatthukaṃ nāma nagaraṃ*). . . .'

[1] Omitting the statement that this is because of their longevity.

[2] Omitting 'Then [the Great Being or future Buddha] reflected upon the country [in which he should be re-born] and thought'.

[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 2.

[4] Omitting 'He fixed upon the Middle-land'.

[5] Int. §§ 17, 157, 158; Ch. 11 *a*; Ch. 16.

[6] MV, v. xiii. 12 (BBS, i, p. 61); Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [6] n. For references see SBE, xvii, p. 38. The compiler of the *Nidāna-kathā* assembles as far as possible and supplements the relevant passages or points found in the *Vinaya* and *Sutta Piṭakas*; his other sources are patently imaginative. Ch. 13 *c* § 4 (*Sutta-Nipāta*).

[7] Int. § 157.

[8] Possibly the great Sāl-tree forest. Int. §§ 133, 136; Ch. 11 *f* § 3 n. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 10; Ch. 14 *f* § 7 [164]; Ch. 15 *b* § 6 [5]; Ch. 22 *b* § 1 [1] n.

[9] Omitting here and after each succeeding quarter, 'beyond which are the frontier countries—on this side [of these] the middle countries (*tato paraṃ paccantimā janapadā orato majjhe*)'. See Ap. H 2 *b* § 2; cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]; Ch. 17 *a* [4].

[10] *Sallavati*, MV, v. xiii. 12.

[11] Int. § 132; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [5] (*wilderness*).

[12] Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [2].

[13] *Brāhmaṇa-gāma*. 'Brāhman district', SBE, vii, p. 38. North-western India with the Panjāb is here excluded from the holy-land, and the Brāhmans of the Vedic hymns and sacrifices are foreigners (Ch. 11 *d* § 5 [1] n.; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24] n); from the other point of view in *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, i, p. 66) Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c*) which lay in the north of the Middle-land is spoken of as being 'in the eastern parts (*puratthimesu janapadesu*)'. For Brāhman settlements see Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 2 [1], 3, 10 [1], 12, 14; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2] n; Ch. 14 *d* §§ 4 [1], 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 3, 5, 7, 9, 13, 14. For Brāhman status cp. Int. § 93, iii, n, § 185 (*ritual*); Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [1] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 28 [3]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84]; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (6); Ap. H 4, *Note*.

[14] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[15] Or, private Buddhas. These are perfectly Enlightened Ones, who owing to circumstances are unable to impart the Dhamma. Ch. 4 § 18 n; Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [11] n; Ap. H 1 § 5. Cp. KM, pp. 61–2. In *Majjh.* 142 the Pacceka-Buddhas come second in rank in the list of recipients of gifts.

[16] Ch. 10 *a* § 2 [92]; Ch. 10 *c*.

[17] Cp. Ch. 22 *b* §§ 6 [11] n, 9 [18] n.

[18] Int. § 185.

[19] Int. § 189.

§ 3. [JN, p. 50.] . . .[1] At that time in the city of Kapilavatthu[2] the Midsummer-full-moon-festival[3] (*āsālhi-nakkhattaṃ*) was announced, and the people celebrated the festival. Commencing from the seventh day before the full moon the lady Mahā-Māyā (*Mahā-Māyā devī*)[4] took part in the festivities, which were free from intoxicants[5] and rich with garlands and perfumes. On the seventh day, having risen very early and bathed in perfumed water, she distributed a great largesse. . . .[6] Elegantly attired she ate of choice food, and took the holy-day-vows (*uposath-aṅgāni*),[7] and having entered the richly adorned inner state-chamber she lay down upon her state-couch, and falling asleep she dreamed this dream:[8]

§ 4. The Four Great Kings (*cattāro mahā-rājāno*)[9] having raised her and her couch carried her to Himavanta,[10] and having placed her upon the Manosilā tableland, sixty leagues in extent, under a great Sāl-tree, seven leagues in height, they stood [respectfully] aside. Then their consorts came and led her to the Anotatta lake, and having caused her to bathe in order to remove all human taint they dressed her in divine attire and anointed her with perfumes and decked her with divine flowers. Not far thence was the Silver Hill (*Rajata-pabbato*), in which there was a golden palace. There they prepared a divine couch facing the east[11] and laid her upon it. Then the Bodhisatta having assumed the form of a noble white elephant[12] and having gone to the Golden Hill (*Suvaṇṇa-pabbato*) not far from there, descended thence and ascended the Silver Hill. Approaching from the north side he took a white lotus in his silver-coloured trunk, and having trumpeted he entered the golden palace, and, having moved thrice round his mother's couch keeping his right side[13] towards her he touched her right side and, as it were, entered her womb. Thus he had his conception at the end of the Midsummer-full-moon-

[1] Omitting the promise of the Mahā-satta or Great Being [i.e. Bodhisatta] to the gods in the Tusita-heaven (Int. § 93, vi) that he will now assume Buddhahood (Int. § 35, ii).

[2] Int. § 135.

[3] Int. § 190 (*feasts*); Ch. 2 § 6; Ch. 5 *a* § 1; Ch. 8 *c* § 2 [2]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (8); Ap. H 2 *c* § 2 (1). See also § 6 [55] below; Ch. 10 *d* § 2 (*Phussa*) and (*Phagguna*); Ap. H 2 *a* § 5 (*Vesākha*). Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [161].

[4] Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*, and Ch. 10 *c* (48) n; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 13 *d* § 2. The title *devī* (goddess) is applicable to any high-caste lady (Ch. 2 § 4; Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [2]; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8] (*deva*)). The prefix *mahā* (great) here is honorific. The lady Māyā was wife to the Rāja Suddhodana, who is sometimes termed Mahārāja (JN, p. 52). For his true position cp. Int. § 165 (see OB, p. 118). The name Māyā has the authority of *Dīgha* 14 (PTS, ii, pp. 7, 52).

[5] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (23), § 3.

[6] Omitting '400,000 [pieces]'. Int. § 189.

[7] Ap. H 2 *b*.

[8] Cp. the *Acchariya-bbhūtadhamma-S.*, or Discourse of Marvellous Events (*Majjh.* 123, PTS, iii, pp. 119–24); also the *Mah'-apadāna-S.*, or Discourse of the Great Story (*Dīgha* 14, PTS, ii, pp. 12–15). From these accounts details, excepting the feast and dream, are borrowed.

[9] Int. §§ 70, 93 (v).

[10] The Himālaya mountains.

[11] Ch. 4 § 2.

[12] For the animistic and Brāhmanic cult of the white elephant, traceable in the folk-lore of the Buddhist birth-stories and adopted by Buddhist kings, see H. G. Q. Wales, *Siamese State Ceremonies* (1931), pp. 273–87.

[13] Ch. 2 § 2.

festival. Awaking the next day the lady narrated her dream to the Rāja[1]. . . .[2]

§ 5. [JN, p. 52.] The lady Mahāmāyā, having carried the Bodhisatta for ten months in her womb, like oil in a vessel, being near her time and desiring to visit her parents' home, said to Suddhodana[3] the Rāja (*mahārājassa*)[4] 'I wish, lord (*deva*),[5] to go to the city of my family, Devadaha.'[6] The Rāja assented, saying 'It is well' . . .[7] and dispatched the lady with a great suite. Now between the two cities there is a pleasure park of Sāl-trees, called the Lumbini Grove[8] (*Lumbini-vanaṃ nāma*), belonging to the inhabitants of both towns. . . .[9] The lady on seeing it desired to disport herself in the Sāl-tree park and her attendants bearing her entered the grove. Having reached the foot of a noble Sāl-tree she wished to take hold of one of its branches. . . .[10] She stretched out her hand and took hold of the branch; and at that moment her pains began. Then they placed a hempen screen around her and the crowd withdrew. Thus grasping the branch of the Sāl-tree, and standing, she was delivered. . . .[11] [JN, p. 54.] Then the inhabitants of both towns took the Bodhisatta and carried him to Kapilavatthu. . . .[12]

[1] 'In the four Nikāyas the only occurrence of the name of the Buddha's father is in the *Mahāpadāna-sutta*, which gives the names of the fathers of the six previous Buddhas as well. There he is called Suddhodana'—ThB, p. 288. Ch. 7 *b* §§ 1, 7 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (534); Ap. A 2 *b* (66).

[2] Omitting the interpretation (Int. § 188) by the 64 Brāhmans, and the Rāja's feast and gifts to the same; also the portents (Int. § 94, i, § 95) at the moment of conception; and the statement that the mother of a Bodhisatta necessarily dies shortly (seven days, see § 7 below) after his birth. The last statement is based upon the *Mahāpadāna-sutta* (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2) and the *Acchariya-bbhūtadhamma-sutta* (*Majjh*. 123).

[3] Ch. 7 *b* § 1.

[4] He is called Rāja as immediately above, or Mahārāja (Ch. 7 *b* § 1). On the real position of the Sakya Rājas cp. Int. § 165. See Ch. 1 [50] n; Ch. 2 [60]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3]; also Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*consecrated*); Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] n; and Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*]. The Emperor Asoka termed himself Rāja (Ch. 13 *c* § 16). Cp. also Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n (*Rāhula-kumāra*).

[5] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8]. Cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110].

[6] Int. §§ 135, 148 (ii and iii); Ch. 10 *c* (76) n; Ch. 13 *d* § 2.

[7] Omitting the levelling and adorning of the road between the two cities; also the lady's golden litter and one thousand attendants.

[8] Int. § 135; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 4 (5), 16. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 1 [1] n.

[9] Omitting conventional details of foliage, bees, and birds.

[10] Omitting the miraculous approach of the branch to her hand (Int. § 94, ii).

[11] Omitting the miraculous assistance of the four Mahā-Brahmā spirits (*cattāro Mahā-brāhmano*), the four kings of the four quarters (*cattāro Mahā-rājāno*; Int. § 93, v), Brahmā, Suyāma, and other deities (Int. § 93, ii, iii), the two miraculous showers of water from the sky (*akasato*; cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 8 n), the child's seven strides and speeches (Int. § 94, iii), and details of two previous births (Int. § 92); also mention of the 'seven connatal ones (*satta saha-jātā*)', born at the same moment as Gotama Buddha.

[12] Omitting the rejoicings of choirs of spirits in the Tāvatiṃsa heaven (*Tāvatiṃsa-bhavane*; Int. § 93, vi; Ch. 10 *d* § 1). Omitting also the vision and prophesying (Int. § 95) of the ascetic Kāla Devala (based on the *Nālaka-sutta* of the *Sutta-Nipāta*, SBE, x. 124 ff., which narrates in old ballad form the visit and prophecy of the saint who is there called Asita—Ch. 13 *c* § 4 n; cp. Ch. 2, JN, [60] n, and Ch. 4 § 3 n); and the homage of Suddhodana to his son. Both of these latter are inconsistent with the later actions attributed to Suddhodana on the first return of the Buddha to Kapilavatthu after the Enlightenment.

§ 6. [JN, p. 55.] On the fifth[1] day they bathed the Bodhisatta's head, saying 'We will perform the ceremony[2] of choosing his name.'[3] They perfumed the Rāja's house and decked it with flowers . . .[4] and prepared rice cooked in milk.[5] They then invited one hundred and eight Brāhmans,[6] experts in the three Vedas[7] (*tiṇṇaṃ vedānaṃ pārage*), and seating them in the Rāja's house, fed them delicately, and paid them great respect. Then they asked them to observe the signs[8] and declare what the child's future would be.[9] . . . [10] [JN, p. 56.] Then the Brāhmans went home. . . .[11] But the young Brāhman Kondañña,[12] full of vigour . . .[13] leaving all that he possessed, made the great retirement (*maha-'bhinikkhamanaṃ abhinikkhamitvā*); and coming at length to Uruvelā[14] he thought: 'How pleasant is this place! How suitable for the exertions of a clansman[15] (*kula-puttassa*) intent on effort.'[16] So he abode there; and when at length he heard that the Great Being (*Mahā-satta*)[17] had retired from the world he went to the sons of the

[1] The exact dates of Gotama's birth and death are a subject of controversy among historians and archaeologists. The dates usually assigned are 567 and 487 B.C. Others would place them about sixty years earlier (V. A. Smith, *Oxford History of India*, 1920, p. 48; E. J. Thomas, *Life of Buddha*, 1927, p. 27). The controversy lies outside the scope of the present work. As regards the day, the Japanese celebrate the birth of Shakamuni on April 8th (J. B. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism*, 1928, p. 574), see § 3 (*āsālhī*) above. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 16 n.

[2] Int. § 190 (*naming*).

[3] The personal name chosen was Siddhatta (see § 8 below); the name does not occur in *Vin. Piṭ.* or in the first four Nikāyas. His family name was Gotama (cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354] n; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]), and he was widely known to the public as the Samaṇa (recluse, devotee, or ascetic) Gotama (Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 20 § 11 [32]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [2]). From his clan name Sakya he was always known as Sakyamuni (the sage of the Sakyas; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2, 1; *Saṃ. Nik.*, PTS, ii, p. 10) or Sakya-putta (son of the Sakyas; Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]).

[4] Omitting four kinds of scents and five kinds of flowers.

[5] Int. § 190 (*food*).

[6] Int. § 190 (*Brahman priesthood*); Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [2].

[7] Int. § 176. The fourth or *Atharva Veda* either had not been collected or was not yet reputed sacred. This illustrates the growth of the Buddhist religious books (IN 6, *Canon*).

[8] Int. § 95; Ch. 3 § 7 n; Ap. A 2 *a* (6); cp. Ap. A 2 *d*. The signs are described in the *Mahāpadāna-sutta* (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2), in the *Lakkhana-sutta* (Ch. 14 *c* § 3), and in *Majjh.* 91 (Ch. 12 *e* § 13). In the *Sela-sutta* of the *Sutta-Nipāta* the *Brāhman* states that 'In our Mantras are handed down the thirty-two signs of a great man'.

[9] Int. § 188.

[10] Omitting the account of the eight Brāhmans who recognized the marvellous signs on the child. The youngest of these eight was Kondañña, who foresaw that the infant would become a Buddha, whilst the other seven Brāhmans foretold that he would be either a universal king or a Buddha.

[11] Omitting the instructions of the seven aged Brāhmans to their sons to take vows according to the Buddha's religion thereafter (Int. § 95). This is inconsistent with their later temporary repudiation of him (Ch. 3 § 8; Ch. 5 *a* § 10).

[12] Ch. 3 § 7 n; Ch. 5 *b* § 2.

[13] Omitting 'Pursuing the wisdom of the Great Being (*Mahā-satte buddhiṃ anvāya*)'. His subsequent temporary lack of faith (Ch. 5 *a* § 10) is inconsistent with the foreknowledge attributed to him in this part of the narrative.

[14] Ch. 3 § 6.

[15] Int. § 159 n; Ch. 3 § 5 [167]. 'A young man', BBS. Kondañña is said above, not very convincingly, to be a Brāhman; the two epithets seem to be inconsistent.

[16] Ch. 3 § 6.

[17] Ch. 10 *d* § 3; Ap. A 2 *a* (*Bodhisatta*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9].

[seven] Brāhmans. . . .[1] But all of these did not agree. Three of them did not renounce the world; the other four retired from the world and made Kondañña the Brāhman their head. [JN, p. 57.] These five were afterwards called the company of the Five Elders[2] (*pañca-vaggiya-therā*). . . .[3]

§ 7. [And on the seventh day the lady Mahā-māyā died.][4] The Rāja appointed nurses for the Bodhisatta. . . .[5] Thus the Bodhisatta was brought up. . . .[6]

Now one day[7] the Rāja celebrated what is called the Sowing Festival[8] (*vappamangalaṃ nāma*). On that day they used to adorn the city like a palace of the gods. All the slaves[9] and labourers (*sabbe dāsa-kammakarādayo*), in new clothes and wearing perfumed garlands, used to assemble at the Rāja's house. . . .[10] The plough for the Rāja's use was adorned with red gold; also the horns of the oxen, the reins, and the goads. The Rāja with a large retinue left his house taking his son with him.[11] In the field there was a rose-apple tree (*jambu-rukkho*) with full foliage giving a deep shade. Under it the Rāja caused the babe's (*kumarassa*) couch to be laid, and over the couch he caused a canopy to be spread. . . .[12] Leaving guardians there, the Rāja, in splendid robes, with the councillors, went to the ploughing. On these occasions the Rāja takes a golden plough, the councillors take one hundred and eight silver ploughs less one, and the farmers (*kassakā*) take the remaining ploughs. Grasping them they plough up and down. The Rāja ploughs from one side of the field to the other and back again. On this occasion the Rāja ploughed with great success.

[1] Omitting reference to their fathers' earlier injunction.

[2] Ch. 3 §§ 7, 8; Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ch. 15 *a* § 5; and Int. § 187 (*mendicancy*).

[3] Omitting the Brāhman's prophecy (Int. § 95) of the Bodhisatta's renouncing the world after seeing the Four Omens (see § 9 below), and the Rāja's extraordinary precautions against this risk. Omitting also the dedication of their sons by 80,000 clansmen to the prince's service whether as Buddha or as King (see § 8 [58] n below).

[4] See § 4 n. above. '"But what shall be her span of life?" thought the Mahāsatta; and he perceived that it was to be ten months and seven days' (*Jātaka*, Fausböll, i, p. 49). Her sister Mahā-Pajāpati, who was also married to the Rāja Suddhodana, brought up the child (Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] and Int. § 190, *wives*; cp. OB, p. 112 n). Pajāpati became the mother of Nanda (Ch. 7 *b* § 3); cp. E. J. Thomas, *Life of Buddha*, 1927, p. 26.

[5] Omitting 'women of great beauty, free from every blemish'.

[6] Omitting 'in great splendour and surrounded by an innumerable retinue'.

[7] Cp. *Majjh. Nik.*, *Mahāsaccaka-sutta* (ThB, p. 44).

[8] Int. § 123 n (*bullocks*), § 137 n (*agriculture*), § 189 (*farmers*), § 190 (*feasts*); cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2]. The *Nidāna-kathā* has drawn this and kindred practices not from the Nikāyas but from contemporary Brāhmanical rites and ceremonies. Such ceremonies are still conducted by Brāhmans in Buddhist Siam. See H. G. Q. Wales, *Siamese State Ceremonies* (1931), pp. 256–64. All propitious rites and festival ceremonies, whatever their origin, tended to become Brāhmanic prerogatives (Int. § 190, *priesthood*; Ap. A 2 *d*, *practices*) even under Buddhist rule.

[9] Int. § 190; Ch. 9 *b* § 3; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [3].

[10] Omitting conventional details regarding the number and ornamentation of the ploughs used.

[11] Int. § 136. The smallness of the real scale of the State seems to peep out in this narrative (Int. §§ 135, 165).

[12] Omitting details.

And the nurses sat attending to the Bodhisatta . . . behind a hempen curtain. . . .[1]

(ii) Doubts

§ 8. [JN, p. 58.] In due course the Bodhisatta came to be sixteen years of age;[2] and the Rāja caused three mansions[3] (*pāsāde*) to be made for him, suitable for the three seasons. . . .[4] And the lady[5] [who was afterwards] the mother of Rāhula became his consort[6] (*devī agga-mahesī*). Whilst he thus enjoyed much prosperity these words were said in the assembly of his kinsmen (*ñāti-saṃghassa*):[7] 'Siddhattha's[8] life is devoted to pleasure; not one [practical] art (*sippaṃ*)[9] does he learn. If war broke out what could he do?'[10] . . .[11]

§ 9. One day[12] the Bodhisatta wishing to go to his garden-house[13]

[1] Omitting the miracle (Int. § 94, ii) of the shadow, which stood still to protect the child, who, sitting cross-legged, sank into the first *jhāna* (*paṭhama-jjhānaṃ*; Ap. I *a*); also the Rāja's homage, which is inconsistent with his later action (Ch. 7, JN, pp. 89–90). Sutta 36 of *Majjh. Nik.* (Ch. 4 § 17) mentions the first trance 'in the cool shade of a Jambu-tree . . . whilst my father the Sakkan was occupied'. Ch. 13 *c* § 6 [246]; and Ch. 7 *b* [1]; cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 7.

[2] Ch. 2 § 5 n. Cp. Ap. H 2 *a* § 2; also Int. § 190 (*marriages*). See Ch. 13 *c* § 5.

[3] Int. §§ 136, 140; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n; see § 10 n below. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]. A *pāsāda* was a storied building; Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 12 *c* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92]. The 'three mansions' are drawn from the legend of Vipassin Buddha in the *Mahāpadāna-sutta* (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2).

[4] Omitting conventional details of the number of stories of each mansion; and also 40,000 dancing-girls with musical instruments (cp. § 9 below).

[5] Known as Yasodharā, Bhaddā, Subhaddakā, Bimbā, and by other names, and also simply as Rāhula's Mother. Her real name is a matter of uncertainty (OB, p. 119; ThB, pp. 48–50). Ch. 2 § 1; Ch. 7 *b* § 4; Ch. 10 *c* (22); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91] n; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*.

[6] Literally, first wife (Ch. 2 § 1; cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [3] n). There is no record of the Bodhisatta's having had any other wife, though the profusion of names supplied by the commentators has led some of these to believe that they belonged to different persons.

[7] Int. § 171; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3] (*office*); Ch. 13 *c* § 13 [3]; Ap. H 3 *a*.

[8] See § 6 n above; Ch. 13 *c* § 5. This personal name, meaning 'accomplished purpose', is traditional but does not appear in the four Nikāyas; cp. ThB, p. 44. It is used frequently in the *Apadāna* (Story of the Saints), the 13th Book of the *Khuddaka Nikāya* (Ap. A 1 *a*, n; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*, and also Ch. 7 *b* § 1 n; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 [1] n).

[9] Int. §§ 137 n, 190 (*education*); Ch. 9 *b* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 17 *e* [6]. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3].

[10] This implies ignorance of, or disbelief in, the prophecies made at the child's birth (see § 6 [57] n above).

[11] Omitting the miraculous display (Int. § 94, iii) of Siddhatta's skill in archery, which satisfied the clansmen.

[12] There is no necessary connexion between the Four Signs and the birth of Rāhula, or between the latter event and Gotama's renunciation of the world. An artificial connexion is found in the supposed meaning of the name of Rāhula (i.e. fetter), but this meaning has been shown to be erroneous (ThB, p. 53 n). The tradition may have compressed the time of the events in order to increase the dramatic effect (Ch. 2 § 1).

[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]. This was a pleasure-ground (*uyyāna*) or large garden outside the city, possibly with a house inside the enclosure: Int. §§ 136, 190; Ch. 7 *a* § 7, § 10; Ch. 8 *j* § 10; Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [9]; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12]. Such garden-houses are still valued possessions of wealthy Indians dwelling in towns. Another name for *uyyāna* was *ārāma* (Ch. 7 *a* § 10, *ārāma*). Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56] n; Ch. 20 § 9 [14].

(*uyyāna-bhūmiṃ*) informed his driver and said 'Make ready the chariot'[1] . . . .[2] [JN, p. 59.] The gods[3] (*devatā*) . . .[4] showed him a decrepit old man wasted by age, broken-toothed, grey-haired, bowed and bent-bodied, holding a staff and trembling. . . .[5] 'Fie on earthly existence (*jativa*)',[6] he cried, 'in which to him who is born decay will be known!' Then with agitated heart he turned back and re-entered his mansion (*pāsādaṃ*). . . .[7] Again one day the Bodhisatta going in the same way towards his garden-house saw a diseased man . . .[8] and with agitated heart he turned back and re-entered the mansion. . . . Further, one day the Bodhisatta going towards his garden-house saw a dead man . . . and deeply moved he turned back and re-entered the mansion. . . . Again on another day going towards his garden-house he saw one who had retired (*pabbajitaṃ*)[9] [from worldly life], duly robed and covered. . . .[10] That day the Bodhisatta taking pleasure in [the thought of] retirement (*pabbajāya*) from the worldly life went on to the garden-house. . . .[11] The reciters of the Dīgha[12] (*Dīgha bhāṇakā*), however, state that he saw the Four Omens[13] on the same day, as he was going [to the garden].[14]

[1] *Ratha*; Ch. 14 *e* § 3, and Int. § 190 (*vehicles*).

[2] Omitting mention of details and of the four white State horses of the Sindhi breed, and the resolve of the gods or spirits (*devatā*) to show the Bodhisatta the Four Omens (Int. § 94, i).

[3] IN 8 *a* (*spirits*).

[4] Omitting 'making a son of the gods represent (a man)'.

[5] Omitting 'But he was only visible to the future Buddha and his charioteer'. Omitting also the Bodhisatta's surprise and questions addressed to the charioteer, and the mention of the *Mahāpadāna* (Sutta 14 of the *Dīgha-Nikāya*]. The Four Omens are taken from the legend of Vipassin Buddha (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2).

[6] Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]. Cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [4] (*jīvitā*) and [5] (*decay*).

[7] Omitting the Rāja's distress and increased precautions (see § 8 above).

[8] Omitting 'sent by the gods', and 'making the same inquiries as before'.

[9] In the text this is a *Pabbajita*, a Buddhist monk, an anticipation of the future Order, and this is commented upon as miraculous. The word, however, means originally one who goes forth and renounces the ordinary life of the world, and may be applied to a Hindu ascetic. Begging ascetics were common among the Hindu sects of the period (Int. § 187). That many Hindu youths of good family retired from the world, 'deserting the household life for the homeless one', in search of 'the highest good', in Gotama's time in India, as in all periods of the history of that spiritually inclined country, he himself testifies (Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]). See Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (10); Ch. 11 *c* § 10; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [197]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2 [14]. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [167].

[10] Omitting 'sent by the gods'; also the Bodhisatta's inquiry and the charioteer's inspired reply describing monks and their advantages, although 'he understood neither what a monk was nor what were his distinguishing virtues (*guṇe*)'.

[11] Omitting the thoughts of Sakka (Int. § 93, i) as his heavenly throne became warm, and his dispatch of Vissakamma from heaven in the likeness of the royal barber to bind a miraculous turban round the Bodhisatta's head.

[12] In *Dīgha* 14 (*Mahāpadāna Sutta*, the legend of Vipassin Buddha), from which these incidents are borrowed, Vipassin himself sees the Four Omens separated by intervals of many years.

[13] *Nimitte*; Ap. A 2 *d* [21]; cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. In the *Aṅg. Nik.* (i. 138) old age, sickness, and death are called messages of the gods or of Yama Rāja (King Death; Int. § 35, § 70 n, *devatā*; Ap. G 2 *b*).

[14] If the miraculous portions of the narrative be omitted, we have here a series of events and reflections such as the Buddha may well have narrated to his disciples later (see extracts immediately below from the *Aṅg. Nik.* and *Majjh. Nik.* Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 5). Gotama indeed must necessarily have seen and reflected upon old age,

§ 10. *Sutta Piṭaka*, *Aṅguttara-Nikāya*,[1] *Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 38*. (*PTS*, *i*, *p. 145*.)

. . . .[2] [2] With such power (*iddhiyā*), mendicant brothers (*bhikkhave*),[3] with such excessive luxury, was I endowed. Then this [thought] came to me:[4] 'An ordinary uninstructed man, himself subjected to old age[5] (*jarā-dhammo*) . . .[6] to disease . . . to death, and not having passed beyond[7] [them] . . . when he sees (an old man . . . a diseased man . . .) a dead man, is alarmed [at the fate of mortals], abashed and repelled, being alarmed for himself. I too am subjected (to old age . . . to disease . . .) to death, and should I . . . be repelled . . . ? That does not befit me.' As I thus thought all intoxication[8] (with youth . . . with health . . .) with life utterly left me.[9]

§ 11. *Majjhima-Nikāya*, *Sutta 26* (*Ariyapariyesana-S*).[10]

[PTS, i, p. 163.] Thus, mendicant brothers[11] (*bhikkhave*), before my enlightenment I, being not yet enlightened . . .[12] being myself subjected to earthly-existence[13] (*jāti-dhammo*) . . .[14] to decay[15] . . .

sickness, and death. There was no need for special messengers or miracles; they add no dignity to the Buddha. The reflections of Sumedha may be attributed to Gotama on this occasion (Ap. A 2 *a*).

[1] The fourth Collection in the *Sutta-Piṭaka* (Ap. A 1). The meaning of the title (*Aṅguttara* means literally, 'Parts [successively] higher') is obscure, but it may be freely rendered as 'numerical collection'. The several divisions are named Units, Twos, Threes, &c., up to Elevens. Ch. 10 *c* (*Units*); cp. Ap. D *a* § 9 (*Five*).

[2] Omitting a description, attributed to the Buddha himself, of his luxurious upbringing and of his three mansions, corresponding to the description given above (see § 8). The details are taken from the Vipassin legend (*Dīgha Nik.*, PTS, ii, p. 21).

[3] The Buddha is addressing his followers (Ch. 5 *c* § 8 n). The scene is not stated (Ap. B *a* § 4).

[4] It occurred to me (*mayhaṃ etad ahosi*). Ch. 13 *a* § 6 (*idea*).

[5] Or, having a nature liable to decay. See § 11 below. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [8] n; Ap. B *c* § 3 [6] n.

[6] Omitting repetitions.

[7] The problem which Gotama ultimately set himself to solve was freedom from the fear of old age, disease, and death, and from the power of sorrow (Ch. 5 *b* § 4, *Peace*; cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]; and Ap. D *a* 9 (ii), *fear*).

[8] The Pāli word is *mada*.

[9] The Sutta here closes. The succeeding discourse analyses the three intoxications.

[10] Discourse on the Noble Enquiry or Quest. The earlier portions of this Sutta will be found in Ch. 18 *b* § 5 and Ap. F 1 *c*.

[11] The Buddha is addressing his followers at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana monastery; Int. § 138.

[12] Omitting 'while yet a Bodhisatta'. The word *Bodhisatta* (wisdom-being) means one who is about to be fully enlightened. Gotama in conversation may well have spoken of the period before he received enlightenment without conferring upon himself either the title of Buddha or that of Bodhisatta (Ap. A 2 *a*). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92].

[13] Or, being born. On *jāti* see Ch. 4 §§ 16, 17; Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ch. 5 *c* § 6; Ch. 9 *a* § 10; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4]; Ap. A 2 *a* (8), (13); Ap. B *c* §§ 2 (2), 6; Ap. F 1 *c* [161]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5). The word *jāti* here rendered 'earthly-existence' might perhaps be translated more accurately as 'mortal existence' or 'life'. It means literally 'birth' and is sometimes translated as 're-birth', but the latter idea is not necessarily involved: Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [ii, 1], 15 [19]; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [9] n, [10]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [7] (*mortal*); Ap. B *a*; also Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] (*origin*), and Ap. E *a* (*Saṃkhārā*). In Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [4] the word *jīvita* (life) replaces *jāti*.

[14] Omitting repetitions.

[15] Or, ageing; see § 10 above: Ap. 1. *Note*.

disease[1] . . . death[2] . . . (*maranadhammo*) . . . grief[3] . . . (and) defilement,[4] sought what was subjected to (earthly-existence . . . decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief . . .) defilement. Then there came to me this thought:[5] 'Why do I being myself subjected to earthly-existence . . . to decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief . . . defilement . . . seek what is subjected to earthly-existence . . . decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief . . . defilement? What if now perceiving the wretchedness of what is subjected to earthly-existence, I were to seek the supreme[6] peace of union (*yoga-kkhemaṃ*),[7] Nirvāna (*nibbānaṃ*)[8] which is not subjected[9] to earthly-existence (*a-jātaṃ*)[10] . . . perceiving the wretchedness of what is subjected to decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief . . . (and) defilement I were to seek the supreme peace of union, Nirvāna (*nibbānaṃ*), which is not subjected to[11] (decay . . . disease . . . death[12] . . . grief . . .[13] and) defilement?'[14]

(*See Appendix A containing texts supplementary to this chapter.*)

[1] Or, ailing.
[2] Or, being mortal.
[3] Or, being troubled.
[4] Or, being defiled; Pāli *saṇkilesa-dhamma*. Ap. F 1 *c* [161]. Cp. Ch. 2 § 2 (*kilesa*); Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91]; Ch. 20 § 10 [17]; Ap. D *a* § 7 (*āsava*), and Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (*defilement*).
[5] *Mayhaṃ etad ahosi*, it occurred to me. Ch. 13 *a* § 6 (*idea*).
[6] *An-uttara*, unsurpassed; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3].
[7] Or, harmonious calm. Int. § 178; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; Ap. C *b* § 11 [23]; and Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [3] n. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 4 (*khema*); further Ch. 15 *b* § 15 (*fulfilment*); Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265] (*unperturbedness*); Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2] n; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] (*Brahma-bhūta*); Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [9] n; Ap. F 2 *d* (*transcendence*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4]; also Ch. 4 § 18 [3] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 (*discord*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Tat tvam asi*). This search for harmony with the fundamental unity is the basis of Vedāntist and of Buddhist thought.
[8] *Nibbāna* means 'extinction' (Ch. 22 *b* § 27) and may be rendered as 'emancipation' or 'release' (cp. *mutti*, Ap. D *a* § 6). As Gotama was not yet enlightened the Buddhist *Nibbāna* cannot as yet have been known, and that which he sought must have been some form or other of the Hindu *Nirvāna* taught by his contemporaries. IN 13; Ch. 3 § 5 [163] n, [165]; Ch. 5 *a* § 2; Ch. 5 *b* § 4; Ch. 9 *a* [1]; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [3]; Ap. C *a* and *b*; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [19]. Cp. Ch. 2 § 2 (*nibbuta*); Ch. 7 *a* § 18 (*amata*); Ap. E *a*, *Note* (*amata*).
[9] Or, not affected by, independent of.
[10] Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 7 (*uncreated*).
[11] Or, affected by.
[12] i.e. 'deathless' (*a-mata*): Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ap. C *b* § 11 (374). The youthful Gotama sought the principle of the permanent amidst the impermanent.
[13] Omitting repetitions.
[14] This passage commences Gotama's narrative of his youth and enlightenment and of the conversion of his first disciples. The narrative is continued in Ch. 2 § 5 and in the three following chapters.

CHAPTER 2

KAPILAVATTHU: THE GREAT RETIREMENT[1]

(i) Renunciation

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (*Nidāna-kathā*), *JN*, *60 ff.*[2]

§ 1. [JN, p. 60.] At that time Suddhodana the Mahārāja[3] received the news that [his son's wife] the mother of Rāhula (*Rāhula-mātā*)[4] had borne a son; and thereupon issued the order, 'Make known the glad news to my son'. The future Buddha (*Bodhisatta*) on hearing the news said '[As] a fetter (*rāhulo*)[5] has [he] been born, [as] a bond has [he] been born'. The Rāja having asked 'What did my son say?' and hearing of his remark said 'Henceforth let the name of my grandson indeed be Rāhula-kumāra'.[6] Meanwhile the future Buddha (Bodhisatta) mounted his chariot and . . .[7] entered the city.

§ 2. [JN, p. 60 cd.] At that time a Kshatriya maiden (*khattiya-kaññā*)[8] called Kisā-Gotamī,[9] having ascended to the upper terrace of a mansion,[10] saw the majestic beauty of the future Buddha as he drove keeping the city on his right.[11] Filled with pleasure and delight she breathed forth this cry (*udānaṃ*):[12]

> 'At peace (*nibbutā*)[13] indeed is his mother; at peace (*nibbuto*) indeed is his father;
> At peace indeed is that wife, of whom such an one is lord!'

[1] See Ap. G 2 *c* (*Contemporary thought*).
[2] Based on the slight account given in the verse narrative of the *Pabbajjā-Sutta* in the *Mahā-vagga* of the *Sutta-Nipāta* (Part 5 of the *Khuddaka-Nikāya* of the *Sutta-Piṭaka*). Cp. Ch. 1 § 5 n (*Asita*); Ch. 3 §§ 1, 3; Ch. 4 § 3.
[3] Ch. 1 § 5 [52].
[4] Ch. 1 §§ 8, 9.
[5] In reality the name is probably derived from Rāhu, the demon who in Hindu mythology causes eclipses. Ch. 1 § 9 [58] n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 1.
[6] That is Prince Fetter. Kumāra is the title of a rāja's son. The *Buddhavaṃsa* (xxvi. 15; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*), which calls Gotama's wife Bhaddakaccā, mentions also Rāhula, and is proof of the antiquity of the tradition which makes Rāhula the son of Gotama. The tradition has no secure foundation in the first four Nikāyas (ThB, p. 59), but is supported by the *Vinaya* (Ch. 7 *b* § 7 n). Rāhula as a disciple might have claimed sonship (Ch. 3 § 5 [165]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84]; see Ap. E *c* i § 7 [2] n).
[7] Omitting the pomp and magnificence.
[8] Int. § 186.
[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 10 *c* [5] (59); Ch. 14 *c* § 13. The incident is not based on any text in *Vin. Piṭ.* or the first four Nikāyas. For Gotamī cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2].
[10] The word used is *pāsāda*; Int. § 190 (*architecture*); Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3]; Ch. 12 *c* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 24 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 7; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1]. The mansion was apparently on or near the city wall.
[11] Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*); Ch. 1 § 4; Ch. 6 *a* § 9 [14]; Ch. 22 *c* § 7.
[12] Ch. 4 § 10; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [iv, 6] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 8 n; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]; Ap. B *c* § 1 (2). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 4 n; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note* (*ballads*).
[13] *Nibbutā* (happy, tranquil) and *nibbāyati* (3rd sing. pr. ind. of v. 'to be extinguished, i.e. with passions and sorrows extinguished') are strictly from different roots, but the former is used as perfect participle of the latter. In translation it is necessary to find some suggestive word on which the Bodhisatta's mind may play. Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]; Ap. C *b* §§ 2, 11 (89); Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (414); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (1). Cp. Ch. 1 § 11 (*Nibbāna*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (4).

Overhearing her the Bodhisatta thought: 'Thus she says: "On their seeing such an one, the heart of his mother feels peace (*nibbāyati*),[1] the heart of his father feels peace, the heart of his wife feels peace!"' But what must be pacified (*nibbute*) if the heart is to be truly at peace (*nibbutaṃ*)? Then this [thought] arose in his mind, which was now without trace of the defiling passions (*kilesesu*):[2] 'When the fire of desire[3] is extinguished (*nibbute*), then [the heart] is indeed at peace (*nibbutaṃ*); when the fires of hatred[4] and delusion[5] are extinguished, when the false views of pride and such conceits, when all the pains of passion, have been extinguished, then it is at peace. This maiden has taught me a fair lesson. Peace (*nibbānaṃ*)[6] is indeed that for which I go seeking. This day, renouncing house and home, going forth, retiring [from the world] (*pabbajitvā*)[7] I must set forth to seek for Peace (*nibbānaṃ*).' And saying 'Let this be payment to her as my teacher', he took from his neck a string of pearls . . .[8] and sent it to Kisā-Gotamī. . . .[9]

§ 3. [JN, p. 61.] Then the future Buddha entered his mansion (*pāsādaṃ*) . . .[10] and lay down. . . .[11] Awaking, the future Buddha sat cross-legged upon his couch. . . . [Individual] existence in its three kinds (*tayo bhavā*)[12] seemed to him like a burning house.[13] A cry (*udānaṃ*) broke from him: 'O what wretchedness! O what affliction! (*Upaddutaṃ vata bho, upassaṭṭhaṃ vata bho*)',[14] and he turned his thoughts eagerly to retirement [from the world] (*pabbajjāya*).[15] Crying,

[1] See above *nibbutā*.
[2] Literally, the defilements. Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 20 § 10 [17]; Ap. A 2 *a* (17).
[3] The Pāli word used is *rāg-aggi*. For the Three Fires see Ap. A 2 *a*, n; Ap. B *a* 4 n; Ap. D *a* § 10. See also Ch. 7 *a* § 5 (xxi, 2–4).
[4] Pāli, *dos-aggi*.
[5] Pāli, *moh-aggi*.
[6] Ap. C *b*.
[7] Int. § 187 (*mendicancy*); Ch. 3 § 5 [167] (*effort*). Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* (*Dhūtanga*). See below § 3 (*pabbajjā*).
[8] Omitting 'worth a hundred thousand'. Int. § 189.
[9] Omitting Kisā-Gotamī's delight. The nucleus of truth in this famous story is doubtless to be found in the Bodhisatta's declaration that happiness is to be gained only by renunciation of desire, a statement which might safely be attributed to all Hindu ascetics. Further steps were necessary for the attainment of enlightenment, namely, the perception that the search for the peace of desirelessness might itself turn into an egoistic desire (Ch. 3 § 2 [66]; Ap. D *a*, *Taṇhā*), and the discovery that right desire is selfless (Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ap. F 2, iv, *Eightfold Path*).
[10] Omitting 'in great state'.
[11] Omitting the conventional details regarding the luxury of the household, with its women and music, and the repugnance of the Bodhisatta when he awoke and meditated. The same details recur in the account of Yasa's conversion. Ch. 6 *a* § 2.
[12] 'Literally, "the three Bhavas seemed like houses on fire". The three Bhavas are Existence in the Kāma-loka, the Rūpa-loka and the Arūpa-loka respectively. That is existence in the worlds whose inhabitants are subject to passion, have material forms, and have immaterial forms respectively', BBS, i, p. 81 n (cp. Ch. 3 § 5 n; Ap. I *a* 1, *realm*). The Bhavas are modes of individual existence. Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ap. B *a* § 6 (7); Ap. B *c* § 4 [5]; Ap. C *b*, *Note*; Ap. D *a* § 1; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *a-rūpa-rāga*).
[13] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 (xxi, 2–4).
[14] Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [2].
[15] Int. § 126; Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 6 *a* § 1 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]. See above § 2 (*pabbajitvā*).

'This very day must I go forth, making the great renunciation (*mahā-'bhi-nikkhamanaṃ*)', he arose from his couch. . . .[1]

§ 4. [JN, p. 62.] Thinking 'I will see the child meanwhile' he rose from his seat and went to the apartment of the mother of Rāhula and opened the inner door. At that time a lamp of perfumed oil was burning in the inner chamber (*anto-gabbhe*).[2] The mother of Rāhula was sleeping on a couch strewn with . . .[3] flowers with her hand placed on the head of the child. The Bodhisatta, having put his foot on the threshold, stood gazing and thought: 'If I move her hand and take my child, my wife (*devī*)[4] will awake and that will be a hindrance to my going. When I return after gaining enlightenment (*Buddho hutvā*)[5] I will see him.' So thinking he went down and left the mansion. Now that which is said in the Jātaka Commentary (*Jātak-aṭṭha-kathāya*),[6] namely, 'Rāhula then was seven days old',[7] is not stated in the other commentaries (*ses-aṭṭhakathāsu*); and therefore the account above is to be accepted. Then leaving the mansion the Bodhisatta went to his horse.[8] . . .[9]

§ 5. Alternative account:

Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26 (Ariya-pariyesana-Sutta)[10]

[PTS, i, p. 163.] Then, mendicant brothers, later while still young

[1] Omitting the incident of Channa the groom and Kanthaka the steed and miraculous events. Int. § 94, ii.

[2] Int. § 190 (*architecture*). Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4].

[3] Omitting details.

[4] Int. § 190 (*wives*); Ch. 1 § 3.

[5] This is usually translated as 'When I have become a Buddha', but the literal meaning of the phrase, namely 'having become enlightened', has more verisimilitude.

[6] The reference doubtless is to the introductory portion of the ancient Sinhalese Commentary on which the extant Pāli Commentary was founded, and which has since disappeared. Int. § 21; BBS, i, p. 82 n; ThB, p. 54 n. Cp. Sir C. Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism*, 1921, vol. iii, p. 30.

[7] The commentarial accounts, which make the child seven days or only one day old when the future Buddha retired from the world, appear to be more dramatic than authoritative. In the *Vinaya Piṭaka* (Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [6]) it is stated that the Buddha emphatically forbade his followers to confer full ordination upon youths less than twenty years old, on the ground that younger persons were unfit to endure the rigours of a monkish life. The *Vinaya* account (Ch. 7 *b* § 8) of Rāhula's admission as a novice makes no mention of his age, though it implies that he was young, since after admitting him the Buddha promised to admit no more youths without the consent of their fathers. The whole of the *Vinaya* shows the practical sagacity and administrative capacity of the founder of the Order, and there is an inherent improbability in the commentarial account, which makes Rāhula only seven years old at the time of his admission (Ch. 7 *b* § 5). It seems much more likely that the child was born within the first few years of the marriage, and that he was some ten or twelve years old at the time of Gotama's retirement, and was of an age to understand his father's teaching when he was admitted to the Order.

[8] Int. § 123.

[9] Omitting further miraculous incidents (Int. § 94, ii) of the flight with Channa and the horse Kanthaka. The horse was eighteen cubits (*aṭṭhārasa-hattho*) in length. Omitting also the temptation by Māra (Int. § 93, iv), who offered the wheel of universal empire (*cakka-ratanaṃ*; Ap. A 2 *a*, n) in seven days.

[10] Continued from Ch. 1 § 11; the setting of the discourse is given in Ch. 18 *b* § 5. The narrative from this point to Gotama's settling down to intense meditation at Uruvelā is given in identical words in *Sutta* 36 (*Mahā-Saccaka Sutta*) of the *Majjhima Nikāya* (Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 7). Another account of Gotama's renunciation, striving, and enlightenment appears in *Majjh. Nik.*, *Sutta* 85, *Bodhirāja-kumāra Sutta* (Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92] n), which combines long passages from *Suttas* 26 and 36; similarly in *Majjh.* 100 (Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210] n).

(*daharo*),[1] with glossy black hair, in vigorous youth and in my prime,[2] though my mother[3] and my father were unwilling and tears poured from their eyes, I caused my hair and beard to be cut off,[4] and I assumed the yellow robes,[5] and went forth from the household to the homeless life.[6] And having thus gone forth [from the world], pursuing the good,[7] seeking the supreme path of tranquillity (*santi-vara-padaṃ*)[8] I drew near to where Ālāra Kālāma was.[9]

(ii) Pilgrimage

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna Kathā), JN, 63 ff.

§ 6. [JN, p. 63.] The Bodhisatta . . .[10] left the city . . .[11] on the full-moon day of Āsāḷhi, the moon being in the Uttarāsāḷha conjunction[12] (*āsāḷhi-puṇṇa-māya uttarāsāḷha-nakkhatte vattamāne*). When he had left the city he felt a desire to look back upon it. . . .[13] So the Bodhisatta, turning his face towards the city, gazed upon it. . . .[14] [JN, p. 64.] He . . .[15] passed through three states (*rajjāni*),[16] and having travelled thirty leagues,[17] arrived at the bank of the river Anoma.[18] . . .[19]

§ 7. . . .[20] [JN, p. 65.] Taking the eight requisites[21] of a devotee[22]

[1] Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (16); Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5].

[2] The well-known verses near the close of the MPS (Ch. 22 *b* § 16, MPS, v. 27) attribute to the Buddha a statement that he was at this time twenty-nine years old; see also *Buddhavaṃsa*, xxvi. 14. Cp. Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 7 *b* § 1; Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. See Ch. 13 *c* § 7 [240].

[3] Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21] n.

[4] Int. § 190 (*hair*); Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [10] n; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (11).

[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].

[6] Int. § 187 (*mendicancy*); Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [ix. 1].

[7] The Pāli word is *kusala*. Ch. 3 § 5 [163]; Ch. 22 *b* § 16 (*Right*); and Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*). Compare *amata* (Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]). The term is applied to the Brāhman ideal in Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [197].

[8] Ap. C *b* § 11 (285).

[9] This passage is continued in Ch. 3 § 5.

[10] Omitting 'making light of the kingdom of the world (*cakkavatti-rajjaṃ*) thus within his reach, casting it away as one would saliva' (Int. § 94, i).

[11] Omitting 'in great splendour'. Omitting also the miraculous opening (Ch. 6 *a* § 3 n; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3] n) of the city-gate (Int. §§ 94; i, 136, 175; also Ch. 20 § 11 [32]).

[12] 'i.e. on the 1st July', BBS, i, p. 84. Ch. 1 § 3.

[13] Omitting a miraculous movement of the earth. Int. § 94 (ii).

[14] Omitting his selection of that place for the site of the future Shrine of Kanthaka's Staying (*Kanthaka-nivattana-cetiya-tthānaṃ*). Omitting also the attendance of spirits (*devatā*), &c.; Int. § 93 (vi). Compare the simpler parting from Vesālī; Ch. 21 § 17 [1].

[15] Omitting 'in that one night'.

[16] i.e. tribal territories. Int. § 166; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 [4].

[17] Approximately 240 miles. See § 7 below.

[18] i.e. Illustrious; a tributary of the Gandak (Ch. 8 *d* § 8).

[19] Omitting the miraculous impeding of Kanthaka by the profusion of flowers thrown down from heaven (Int. § 94, i). Omitting also the miraculous crossing of the river (Int. § 94, iii), and the dismissal of Channa and Kanthaka.

[20] Omitting the cutting off of his long hair, and the statement that his hair and beard never needed further trimming, and his rejection of his muslin robes and diadem (cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]), with accompanying miracles (Int. § 94, i). Omitting also the assistance of Ghaṭīkāra the Mahā-Brahmā (Int. § 93, ii), his former friend in the time of Kassapa Buddha, in now providing him with the eight requisites of a religious mendicant. Ch. 4 § 2 n.

[For notes 21–2 see opposite]

(*aṭṭha samaṇa-parikkhāre*) . . .[1] the Bodhisatta assumed these saintly emblems (*araha-ddhjaṃ*), and donned the garb of utter retirement [from the world] (*uttama-pabbajjāvesaṃ*). . . .[2] Then the Bodhisatta, having retired from the world, spent seven days in a mango grove (*amba-vanaṃ*) called Anūpiya,[3] near by, in the joy of retirement (*pabbajjā-sukhena*). [JN, p. 66.] Thereafter he went on foot . . .[4] to Rājagaha,[5] a distance of thirty leagues (*tiṃsa-yojana-maggaṃ*).[6]

(*See Appendix B containing texts supplementary to this chapter.*)

21 Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]; cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; also Ch. 8 *j* (*Apparel*); and Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1] (*bowl*). The eight requisites are:

'The three robes (*ticīvaraṃ*), alms-bowl (*patto*), razor (*vāsi*), needle (*sūciṃ*), girdle (*bandhanaṃ*),
With water-strainer (*parissāvanena*)—these eight are [all] the wealth of the devout mendicant (*bhikkhuno*).' (See JN, p. 64.)

22 Ap. A 2 *d* (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*).

---

[1] Omitting 'Ghaṭīkāra gave them to him, and'.

[2] Omitting the home-coming of Channa, and the death of the steed Kanthaka of a broken heart and his re-birth in the Tāvatiṃsa (Int. § 83, vi) heaven as an angel (*deva-putto*).

[3] Int. § 148 (i); Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[4] Omitting 'in one day'.

[5] Int. § 125. The site is now called Rājgīr.

[6] See § 6 above. Int. § 124; Ch. 7 *a* § 9 n; Ch. 7 *b* § 1; Ch. 8 *f* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119]; Ch. 14 *e* § 2; Ch. 15 *a* § 5; Ch. 17 *e* [7]; Ap. H 1, *Note* (ch. vii).

CHAPTER 3

RĀJAGAHA AND URUVELĀ: STRIVING TOWARDS THE LIGHT

(i) Rājagaha

Jātaka Commentary, *Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*), *JN*, *66*.

§ 1. [JN, p. 66.] Having entered Rājagaha[1] he begged food [from house to house] continuously.[2] . . .[3] Then the officers of the king[4] went to the palace and described him, saying: 'Lord[5] (*deva*), a being of such and such appearance is begging food in the city. We do not know whether he is a divine-spirit (*devo*),[6] a man (*manusso*), a snake-demon (*nāgo*),[7] or a bird-spirit (*supaṇṇo*).'[8] Then the king (*rājā*),[9] standing on the palace-roof[10] and seeing the Great One (*Mahāpurisaṃ*), wondered and commanded his officers, saying: 'Go, sirs (*bhaṇe*),[11] and observe. If this person is non-human (*a-manusso*), he will vanish when he leaves the city—that is, if a spirit (*devatā*)[12] he will disappear through the air, and if a snake-demon he will sink into the earth, but if a man he will eat the food which he has obtained.'

§ 2. [JN, p. 66 cd.] Meanwhile the Great One collected alms of mingled food, and when he saw that there was sufficient for his support he left the city by the gate[13] through which he had entered.

[1] Int. § 125.
[2] Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [8]; cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (134).
[3] Omitting the excitement at his appearance.
[4] The account of the meeting with King Bimbisāra is based on the *Pabbajjā-Sutta* (Narrative of the Going-forth) in the *Sutta-nipāta* (No. 5 of the *Khuddaka Nikāya*). See § 3 below: Ch. 2 § 3 n; Ch. 4 § 3 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 15. It seems probable that this early meeting between the young devotee and the king has no firmer basis than poetic aptness. Conversations between King Bimbisāra and Buddha are recorded here in the *Jātaka Introduction*, and in MV, I. xxii. 2–3 (Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2–3]) and 15 (Ch. 7 *a* § 13 [15]); in MV, II. i (Ch. 8 A [2]); also at MV, I. xl (Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [1]); and CV, VII. iii. 1 (Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1]); see further Ch. 13 *c* § 15 from the *Pabbajjā-Sutta* of the SN. The first four Nikāyas mention no such meetings. The impression left is formal and something less than intimate; cp. Ch. 14 *a* § 1 [1] n, and Ch. 14 *b* (*King Pasenadi and Gotama*).
[5] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8].
[6] IN 8 *a*; Ch. 14 *d* § 1 n.
[7] Int. § 93 (vii). Cp. *Yakkha* (Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3] n; Ch. 17 *b* § 1 n).
[8] Int. 188. 'These are the superhuman snakes and winged creatures, who were supposed, like the gods and angels, to be able to assume the appearance of men' (BBS, i, p. 88 n).
[9] Int. § 168 (Bimbisāra).
[10] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [2]; and Ch. 2 § 2.
[11] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [3]; Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5]; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6]; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18]; Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35]; Ch. 22 *c* §§ 2, 5. Cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[12] Int. § 35.
[13] It would appear that he left Bimbisāra's new fortress-city by the south gate facing the mountains. Int. § 136.

Sitting down with his face towards the east,[1] in the shadow of the Paṇḍava hill (*Paṇḍava-pabbata chāyāya*),[2] he began to eat the food. . . .[3] The royal officers returned and told the king what they had seen. On hearing the words of his messengers the king in haste went forth from the city, and drew near to the Bodhisatta. . . .[4] The Bodhisatta said: 'Great King (*mahārāja*),[5] for me there is nothing in wealth or in sense-pleasures, which defile (*kilesa-kāmehi*).[6] I have retired from the world seeking complete enlightenment (*paramābhisambodhiṃ patthayanto*).' . . .[7] 'Truly', said the king, 'thou wilt become enlightened (*Buddho bhavissasi*).[8] After attaining enlightenment (*Buddha-bhūtena pana te*) come first to my kingdom.'

§ 3. [JN, p. 66 cd.] This is here stated briefly. The full account, beginning 'I will sing of the Retirement,[9] how the Clear-Seeing retired [from the world]',[10] may be found by referring to the *Pabbajjā-Sutta*[11] with its commentary[12] (*aṭṭha-kathāya*).

(ii) Seeking the Good

§ 4. [JN, p. 66 cd.] Then the future Buddha . . .[13] proceeded on his journeying. Then joining [first] Āḷāra Kāḷāma[14] and [subsequently] Uddaka,[15] the disciple of Rāma (*Rāma-puttaṃ*),[16] and having mastered their highest attainments[17] (*samāpattiyo nibbattetvā*), he saw that this was not the way to enlightenment (*nāyaṃ maggo bodhīyā ti*), [JN, p. 67] and abandoned the method of attainment by trances (*samāpatti-bhāvanaṃ analaṃkaritvā*).[18]

1 Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [3].
2 Int. §§ 125, 128; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 1 n, 25 [43] n. 'Paṇḍava Rock', BBS. i, p. 180.
3 Omitting the Bodhisatta's physical aversion from the food, implying that this was the first meal which he had begged. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1); Ch. 12 *d* 1 [1]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [11].
4 Omitting his offer of his kingdom to the future Buddha (*Bodhisatta*). It is possible that Bimbisāra's first meeting with Gotama was that recorded in Ch. 7 *a* § 7.
5 Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [100].
6 Ch. 2 § 2 (*kilesa*). For *kāma* see Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ap. D *a* §§ 1, 8 (ii).
7 Omitting the king's repeated request.
8 The Hindu faith accepted the idea of perfectly enlightened beings or Buddhas arising from time to time. Int. § 187.
9 Or, Going-forth.
10 *Pabbajjaṃ kittayissāmi yathā pabbaji cakkhumā ti.*
11 Narrative of the Going-forth. See § 1 n above; Ch. 2 § 1 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [2] n.
12 Int. § 14.
13 Omitting 'granting the king's request'.
14 Int. § 178; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2].
15 Int. § 81.
16 Ch. 11 *c* § 21 n.
17 i.e. systems of ecstatic trances, or successive stages of meditation. See § 5 [164] n below; Ch. 4 § 5; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [156] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2] n; Ch. 21 § 11 [33] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [8], [9]; Ap. E *c* i § 2 n; Ap. I *a* (*Trance*). Cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3], where the *kasiṇa*-series is expounded; also Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [II. 1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]; Ap. F 2 *d* (*transcendence*).
18 Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. I *a* (*Meditation*), and Ch. 9 *a* § 8. Continued in § 6 below.

§ 5. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26 (Ariya-pariyesana-Sutta).*

[PTS, i, p. 163.] 'Pursuing the good,[1] seeking the supreme[2] path of tranquillity (*santi-vara-padaṃ*), I drew near to where Āḷāra Kālāma[3] was and addressed him thus: "Friend Kālāma (*āvuso Kālāma*),[4] I desire to lead the holy life (*brahma-cariyaṃ*)[5] under this [thy] system[6] and discipline[7] (*dhamma-vinaye*)." When I had thus spoken, mendicant brothers, Āḷāra Kālāma thus replied: "Let my venerable friend (*āyasmā*) remain. Such is this system (*dhammo*) [p. 164] that in no long time an intelligent man can learn for himself[8] (*sayaṃ*), realize, and having attained (*upasampajja*) abide in his teacher's practice as his own." . . .[9] Then I said to Āḷāra Kālāma: "How far dost thou . . . declare[10] this system [to proceed]?" Thereupon Āḷāra Kālāma declared [that it proceeded to] the realm[11] of nothingness[12] (*ākiñcaññ-āyatanaṃ*). . . .[13] Then quickly I in no long time learnt for myself, realized and having attained abode in that system. Then I drew near to Āḷāra Kālāma and . . . addressed him thus: "Friend Kālāma, is this as far as thou . . . teachest this system?" "Friend, this is as far as I . . .

[1] Continued from Ch. 2 § 5. In *Sutta* 36 (*Mahā-Saccaka Sutta*) of the *Majjhima Nikāya* (Ch. 4 § 17) this passage concerning Āḷāra, Uddaka, and Uruvelā is repeated verbally. The narrative leaves it uncertain whether the visits to Āḷāra Kālāma and Uddaka preceded Gotama's arrival in Magadha, and those philosophical ascetics therefore may have dwelt in the Vajjian country, possibly near Vesāli (Int. § 168 n). Both accounts ignore the meeting with Bimbisāra. Distinction must be made here, as usual, between the original facts, the original report, and the ultimate report, with its exegetical additions and possibly alterations (IN 6, *Canon*). The details are not of first-rate importance unless they represent, or draw us nearer to, the thoughts of the Buddha, which evidently were concerned with the transcending of the Self (Int. § 178; Ch. 1 § 11), with the process of the Many from the One (Ap. G 2 *a*), the escape from the sorrows of individuality (Ch. 5, First Sermon), and with moral responsibility or the continuous consequences of actions (Ap. B *b*). Cp. Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199].

[2] *An-uttara*, unsurpassed; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3].

[3] IN 8 *c*; Int. § 178; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2].

[4] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1], [5]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 7 [13], 13 [24], 22; Ap. D *c* § 3 [6].

[5] Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 7 *a* § 18; Ch. 7 *c* § 1; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11].

[6] Law or religious practice. Ch. 6 *a* § 13; Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [4]; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii). See also Part I (title).

[7] Ch. 22 *b* § 16. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].

[8] Buddha subsequently uses this phrase of his own teaching. Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ap. B *c* § 5.

[9] Omitting a preliminary and superficial stage of learning.

[10] Literally, teach.

[11] Abode or seat.

[12] The state or realm of nothingness may be supposed to lie beyond the three bhavas or states of existence (Ch. 2 § 3). It corresponds with the seventh of the eight stages of ecstatic meditation (IN 8 *c*, *teachers*, n), through which Buddha is said to have passed immediately before his death (Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [8]). Āḷāra Kālāma's doctrine conducted to the 'realm of nothingness'; that of Uddaka (see below) to the 'realm of neither consciousness nor yet non-consciousness'; which is the eighth of the above stages. Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]; see § 4 [66] above; also IN 8 *c* (*teachers*); Ch. 21 § 11 [33] (4); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14]; Ap. G 2 *c* §§ 1 (ii), 2 (i).

[13] Omitting repetition and a passage in which the Bodhisatta is made to claim for himself faith (*saddhā*), energy (*viriya*), self-knowledge (*sati*), self-transcendence (*samādhi*), and insight (*paññā*). Ap. F 2 *i*. These five qualities are termed the *indriyāni* or moral faculties (Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3]; Ap. C *a* § 1, 94; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; see KM, p. 67).

teach this system." "Friend, I also have learnt this system for myself. . . ." "It is an advantage[1] to us, friend, it is a gain to us, who find such a venerable companion in holy-living. . . . [p. 165.] Thou art as I, I am as thou. Come, friend, let us together lead this company[2] (*gaṇaṃ*)." Thus Āḷāra Kāḷāma, my teacher, set up me, his pupil, as completely equal to himself, and honoured me with great honour. And then I thought: "This system conducting to the realm of nothingness does not lead to . . .[3] tranquillity, highest knowledge, full enlightenment, Peace[4] (*nibbānāya*)." Then, mendicant brothers, finding that system insufficient and becoming indifferent (*nibbijja*) to it, I departed.[5]

'And pursuing the good, seeking the supreme path of tranquillity, I drew near to where Uddaka[6] the disciple[7] of Rāma was. . . .[8] Then I said to Uddaka the disciple of Rāma: "How far dost thou . . . declare this system [to proceed]?" Thereupon Uddaka declared that it proceeded to the state of neither perception nor non-perception[9] (*nevasaññānāsaññ-āyatana*). . . . [p. 166.] Then quickly I in no long time learnt for myself, realized and having attained abode in that system.[10] Then I drew near to Uddaka and . . . addressed him thus: "Friend, is this as far as thou . . . teachest this system?" "Friend, this is as far as I . . . teach this system." "Friend, I also have learnt this system for myself. . . ." "It is an advantage to us, friend, it is a gain to us, who find such a venerable companion in holy-living. . . . Thou art as Rāma, Rāma was as thou. Come, friend, lead this company." Thus Uddaka, my companion in holy-living, set me up in the place of his teacher. And then I thought: "This system does not lead to . . . Peace (*nibbānāya*)." . . . Then I departed.

1 Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [3].

2 Ch. 7 *a* §§ 2 [1] n, 22 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 15. Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 10 (*parties*); Ap. H 3 *b* § 1 (*chapter*).

3 Omitting 'detachment, absence of passion, cessation'; see Int. § 83; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6). These phrases appear to be anachronistic, anticipating Buddha's ultimate doctrine (Ap. D *a* § 6). Gotama doubtless was dissatisfied with the trances, because he found that he brought back from them neither purity nor knowledge.

4 Int. § 83; Ch. 1 § 11. These terms appear in the First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]). Cp. Ap. C *b* § 1.

5 That Buddha retained his affection and esteem for his old teachers was shown later. Int. § 81 (*teachers*); Ch. 5 *a* § 3.

6 Int. § 178.

7 Or, son (*putta*). Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [227]; also Ch. 2 § 1 n; Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21] n.

8 As above.

9 Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]; Ch. 22 *b* § 26; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]; also Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] (*perception*). This corresponds with the eighth stage of later Buddhist ecstatic meditation. Uddaka's practice of trance evidently differed from Āḷāra's (see above), but did not necessarily go beyond it. Gotama's subsequent dissatisfaction perhaps indicates that the practice, far from bringing peace, induced intense striving to gain for the individual the re-union of the ego with the supreme Soul. Perhaps the ultimate difference (which later he himself felt to be in one sense not great) between the outlook of Gotama's teachers and his own may be said concisely to have been that, whereas they taught ways by which the individual Self (*ātman*) might find refuge in its original Source (*Param-ātman*), his ideal was the way in which the transient self (Int. § 38) might act in accord with the fundamental Unity, selflessly, that is divinely, as an Arahat (Ap. D *c*). Cp. Ap. D *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* and § 9 n.

10 i.e. that of Rāma, Uddaka's master.

'And pursuing the good,[1] seeking the supreme path of tranquillity, I journeyed by stages[2] among the Magadhas[3] and came to where Uruvelā[4] the army-township[5] (*senā-nigamo*) was. [p. 167.] There I saw a delightful spot[6] and a fair grove, and a clear flowing river,[7] delightful and easy of approach, and finally a village near by in which to beg food.[8] Then I thought: ". . .[9] Truly here is all that is needed by a clansman (*kula-puttassa*)[10] intent on effort."[11] There I settled, mendicant brothers, here being everything needed for effort. . . .'[12]

(iii) The Great Effort[13]

§ 6. *Jātaka Commentary*, *Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*), *JN*, *p. 67*.

[JN, p. 67.] Then desirous of undertaking the Great Effort (*mahā-padhānaṃ*) . . .[14] he went to Uruvelā,[15] and saying 'Truly delightful is this spot', he abode there and undertook the Great Effort.[16]

[1] Ch. 11 *a* § 1.

[2] Int. § 124; Ch. 5 *a* § 9; Ch. 10 *a* § 12 [1]; Ch. 11 *f* § 4; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 14; Ch. 15 *b* § 6 [5]; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [4]; and Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (*way*).

[3] Int. § 158; Ch. 11 *c* § 19.

[4] Int. § 145.

[5] The meaning of this epithet is disputed. It perhaps indicates a small township with the adjoining district, the revenues of which were devoted to the payment of a military chief or of an army division; or a settlement in a district required to furnish a feudal-contingent (Ch. 11 *a* § 5, *king's service*; cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1]). The term may possibly mean the head-quarters of the divisional administration. Ch. 4 § 1; Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 10 *c* (71). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [2]; also Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [1]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).

[6] Buddha and his followers constantly showed a very human delight in natural beauty, very far from the indifference of self-centred asceticism. Int. § 123 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 6; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 23 [1] n, 25 [43]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [5]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]; Ap. C *a* § 1 (95) n; Ap. E *a*, *Note*; Ap. F 1 *b* § 5; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. I, *Note*. Compare the Buddhist 'Psalms' (*Thera-gāthā*, *Therī-gāthā*) in the fifth Nikāya; also Ap. F 2 (ii), *upekkhā*.

[7] Ch. 4 § 3. This was the Nerañjarā, a southern tributary of the Ganges (Int. § 121 n).

[8] Literally, pasture-village. Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [6] n; Ch. 23 *b* § 5 n.

[9] Omitting repetitions.

[10] Int. § 159 n; Ch. 1 § 6 [56]; Ch. 12 *d* §§ 3 [3], 5 [2] (5). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (19). The strong religious impulse which among the Western invaders of India had created the Vedic hymns and the Brāhman caste and ritual was now stirring in the warrior and merchant classes of the Eastern clans (Int. § 185).

[11] Ch. 1 § 6 [56]; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 9 [59]; Ch. 2 § 2 (*pabbajitvā*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4]. The idea of resolving to become a future Buddha appears to have been a somewhat later poetic development (Ap. H 5 [95] n).

[12] This passage is continued in Ch. 4 § 16.

[13] Continued from § 4 above. Cp. *Majjh.* 26 and 36.

[14] On .tting 'and showing his fortitude and energy to Spirits and men'. Int. § 93 (vi).

[15] Int. § 145; Ch. 1 § 6.

[16] 'The Great Struggle played a great part in the Buddhist system of moral training; it was the wrestling with the flesh by which a true Buddhist overcame delusion and sin, and attained to Nirvāna. It is best explained by its fourfold division into 1. Mastery over the passions. 2. Suppression of sinful thoughts. 3. Meditation on the seven kinds of wisdom (*Bodhi-angā*, see Buddhism, p. 173); and 4. Fixed attention, the power of preventing the mind from wandering. . . . The system was, of course, not worked out at the time here referred to; but throughout the chronicle the biographer ascribes to Gotama, from the beginning, a knowledge of the whole Buddhist theory as afterwards elaborated' (BBS, i, p. 89). Ch. 1 § 6 [56]. Cp. Ch. 21 § 15 (2); Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; also Ap. F 1 *c* (*Quest*). See Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] n.

§ 7. [JN, p. 67 cd.] Then those five recluses[1] (*panca pabbajitā*), headed by Koṇḍañña, begging alms of food through villages, towns, and royal cities (*gāma-nigama-rājadhānīsu*), met the Bodhisatta there. And during six years, while he undertook the Great Effort, they remained with him doing him all manner of services,[2] sweeping out the hermitage and so on, [all the while] thinking 'Now he will become enlightened (*idāni buddho bhavissati*), now he will become enlightened!' And the Bodhisatta, thinking 'I will perform the uttermost austerities (*dukkara-kārikaṃ*)',[3] lived upon single grains of sesamum or rice[4] or such and even practised complete abstention from food. . . .[5] By this fasting he became utterly emaciated; his golden-coloured body became dark. . . .[6] One day at the edge of his place of exercise[7] (*caṅka-mana-koṭiyaṃ*) during a trance of suppressed breathing[8] (*appaṇakaṃ jhānam jhayanto*) he was overcome by violent pain and fell unconscious. . . .[9] Then the Bodhisatta recovered consciousness and raised himself. . . .[10] And the Great One's austerity for these six years was like time spent in making a knot[11] in the air (*ākāse gaṇṭhi-karanakālo viya*); and thinking 'Truly this austerity is not the way[12] to enlightenment (*ayaṃ dukkarakārikā nāma bodhāya maggo na hotī ti*),[13] he went through the

[1] Known as the 'Band of Five Elders' (Ch. 1 § 6 [57]). The names of these five disciples were Kondañña, Vappa, Bhaddiya, Mahānāma, and Assaji (Ch. 5, MV, I. vi. 32–6). In JN, p. 56 it is stated that Kondañña was the youngest of the eight Brāhman fortune-tellers or astrologers who were present at the naming ceremony of Siddhattha, and that the remaining four disciples were the sons of four of the other seven Brāhmans. It is thus assumed that these five were a party of Brāhman ascetics, connected with the Sakyans of Kapilavatthu. The Five appear in the two Suttas of the *Majjhima Nikāya* giving the Canonical account of the Great Effort (Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *a* § 9). See Ch. 15 *a* § 5.

[2] Ch. 8 (i).

[3] Int. §§ 59, 177; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68] n; Ap. F 2 *d* (*transcendence*) n. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 6 n; and Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14].

[4] Ch. 7 *b* § 1; Ap. B *b* § 3 [5]. In *Majjh. Nik.*, *Sutta* 12 (PTS, I, pp. 77–9) and *Sutta* 36 (SBB, V, pp. 174–6) the external details of Gotama's austerities are described minutely (cp. Ch. 4 § 16 n).

[5] Omitting the design of the Spirits (*devatā*) to feed him through the pores of his skin; Int. § 93 (vi).

[6] Omitting 'and the thirty-two signs of a Great Being (*dvattiṃsa Mahā-purisā-lakkhanāni*) disappeared'; Ch. 1 § 6 [55].

[7] A small terrace for walking to and fro. Ch. 6 *a* § 4; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [13]; Ch. 10 *a* § 2; Ch. 12 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1].

[8] Cp. Ch. 9 *a* [2].

[9] Omitting the intervention of certain Spirits, who told Suddhodana that his son had died during the Great Effort, but were disbelieved by the Rāja on the strength of the early miracles foretelling Gotama's Buddhahood. Ch. 1 § 6 [55] n.

[10] Omitting a second visit of the Spirits to Suddhodana.

[11] Or, [the sound of] a bell (*ghaṇṭā*).

[12] The true Way (*magga*), as he afterwards found, was the Noble Eightfold Way of self-forgetfulness and active well-doing; Ch. 5; Ap. D *a*, *Note*.

[13] Gotama apparently had continued the practice of trances with additional purification of body through starvation. It would appear that he found the same cause for dissatisfaction with this austerity as he did with the teachings of his masters, namely an inherent egotism, an insistent individualistic striving for one small self and its particular salvation (Ap. D *a*, (*moha*); Ap. F 1 *b*). The objection at this stage would be instinctive rather than defined. It would appear that Gotama henceforth abandoned trances and depended solely on meditation. His later followers developed an elaborate system of trances (Ap. I, *Note*; Ap. I *a*), but this was only a part of the general gradual Hinduization of Buddhism (Int. § 57). Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [13] (*Dhūtanga*); and Int. § 187 (*ascetics*).

township and villages begging for ordinary food and living upon it. . . .[1]

§ 8. [JN, p. 67 cd.] Then the band of five mendicants (*panca-vaggiyā bhikkhū*)[2] thought: 'He was not able even by the austerity of six years to reach all-knowledge (*sabbaññutaṃ paṭivijjhituṃ nāsakkhi*). [JN, p. 68.] How is it possible for him to do so now that he goes through the villages begging and taking ordinary food? He is defeated in the Effort; for us to look for benefit from him is as if one should think to wash one's head in a dew-drop. What is he to us (*kiṃ no iminā ti*)?' Then taking their robes and begging-bowls they left the Great One; and going eighteen leagues[3] away they entered Isipatana.[4]

(*See Appendix C containing texts supplementary to this chapter.*)

[1] Omitting the return of the thirty-two signs and his golden colour.
[2] Ch. 1 § 6; Ch. 5 *a* § 1.
[3] About 144 miles; Ch. 15 *a* § 5.
[4] On the outskirts of Benāres. Int. § 151.

CHAPTER 4

URUVELĀ: THE GREAT ENLIGHTENMENT

(i) Legend

Jātaka Commentary, *Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*,) *JN*, *68 ff.*[1]

§ 1. [JN, p. 68.] At that time at Uruvelā,[2] the General's township (*Senāni-nigame*),[3] there lived a young woman named Sujātā,[4] born in the family of the General who was a landholder there. On reaching womanhood she had vowed to a certain banyan-tree (*nigrodha-rukkhe*)[5] thus, 'If I obtain a husband of my own rank, and my first babe is a son, I will make to thee a yearly offering . . .'[6] and her prayer had been fulfilled. . . .[7] And on the full-moon day of Visākhā[8] (*visākha-puṇṇamą-divase*) she rose early and caused eight cows to be milked. . . .[9] She took the milk, and, having poured it into a new bowl, with her own hands kindled a fire and began the cooking. . . .[10] [JN, p. 69.] Then Sujātā said to her slave-girl[11] Puṇṇā (*Puṇṇa-dasim*): 'Dear Puṇṇā, the spirit (*devatā*) is very favourably disposed to us to-day. . . .[12] Run quickly and tend the holy place.' . . .

§ 2. [JN, p. 69 cd.] Now the future Buddha (*Bodhisatta*) . . .[13] when the night was ended . . .[14] came early in the morning and sat at the foot of the tree. . . .[15] Then Puṇṇā coming there saw the future Buddha seated at the foot of the tree turned towards the east[16] . . .[17] and thought 'Our deity (*devatā*) to-day indeed has issued from the tree and is sitting to receive our offering in his own hand.' Then she ran back in haste and told Sujātā. Sujātā hearing was delighted and cried 'Be thou to me from this day as an eldest daughter.' . . .[18] She then fetched

[1] Continued directly from Ch. 3 § 8.

[2] Int. § 145. The scene of the Enlightenment is now called Bodh-Gāya.

[3] Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 6 *b* § 1. Senāni is equivalent to Senā-pati, meaning General (see SBE, xiii, p. 113 n); cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110].

[4] Whether the traditionary story of Sujātā, here introduced by the compiler of the *Nidāna-kathā*, is authentic or not, it picturesquely represents Hindu practice. The story is a development of the Buddha's speech in MPS, iv. 42 (Ch. 22 *a* § 9) and of the suggestion in *Aṅg. Nik.* I. xiv. 7 (Ch. 10 *c*, 71), but is not altogether consistent with the latter.

[5] Or, pīpal-tree; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [v]. See also Int. § 188; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

[6] Omitting 'worth a hundred thousand [pieces of money]'. Int. § 189 (*money*).

[7] Omitting the account of the intensive feeding of Sujāta's cows.

[8] i.e. April–May. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 1.

[9] Omitting the miraculous milking of the cows. Int. § 94 (i).

[10] Omitting the miraculous cooking of the milk and rice (Int. § 190, *food*).

[11] Int. § 190; Ch. 9 *b* § 8; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [162].

[12] Omitting reference to the miracles.

[13] Omitting the summary mention of five dreams (Int. § 188) indicating the near approach of Buddhahood. Cp. *Aṅg. Nik.* iii. 240 (ThB, p. 70).

[14] Omitting details.

[15] Omitting the miraculous illumination of the tree. Int. § 94 (iii).

[16] Ch. 1 § 4; see §§ 3, 4 below.

[17] Omitting a description of the miraculous light issuing from his body (Ch. 22 *a* § 8 [37] n).

[18] Omitting mention of the ornaments given to Puṇṇā.

a golden bowl . . .[1] raised the cooking-vessel and poured out the milk-rice. The milk-rice rolled from the vessel as water from a lotus-leaf, and filled the bowl exactly. Having placed over the bowl another dish, also of gold, and wrapped a cloth round them, she put on all her ornaments, and carrying the bowl upon her head, proceeded to the foot of the banyan-tree. Seeing the future Buddha she was delighted, thinking him to be the tree-spirit (*rukkha-devatā ti*),[2] and as she advanced she made obeisance. . . .[3] Sujātā then placed the bowl of milk-rice in the hand of the Great One (*Mahā-purisassa*),[4] and the Great One looked at Sujātā. Then realizing his condition she made obeisance, and said: 'Sir (*ayya*),[5] accept my offering to thee, and go whithersoever thou desirest. May thy wish prosper as mine has done!' So saying she departed. . . .[6]

§ 3. [JN, p. 70.] Then[7] the future Buddha rising from his seat departed from the tree keeping his right side towards it, and taking the bowl went to the bank of the river Nerañjarā.[8] . . .[9] The bathing-place there is called the Supatiṭṭhita[10] landing stage. Having placed the bowl upon the bank he descended into the water and bathed. . . .[11] Then having sat down with his face to the east,[12] he made all the thick sweet milk-rice[13] into forty-nine pellets . . . and ate it. . . .[14] He took his midday rest in a grove of blossoming sāl-trees on the bank of the river.

§ 4. [JN, p. 70 cd.] That evening he proceeded . . .[15] towards the Bodhi-tree (tree of Enlightenment)[16] . . .[17] [JN, p. 71.] Turning his

[1] Omitting details regarding the bowl, valued at 100,000 pieces of money.
[2] Int. § 188.
[3] Omitting the miraculous disappearance of the future Buddha's earthenware bowl, formerly given to him by Ghaṭikāra Mahā-Brahmā. Ch. 2 § 7 n.
[4] Ap. A 2 *a* (*Bodhisatta*).
[5] Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1]. Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [2].
[6] Omitting Sujātā's indifference to the golden bowl, worth 100,000 pieces of money. The gold and the miracles do not enhance the charm of the scene, the beauty of the spot beside the river, issuing from the foothills of the tableland of Choṭa Nāgpūr, where in later years the Buddha and his chief followers from time to time withdrew (into the 'Southern Hills', Int. § 132), and the grace of the Nature-worship that still survives among the people.
[7] For the fast and the temptation by Māra compare the *Padhāna Sutta* of the *Sutta Nipāta*. See Ch. 1 § 5 n; Ch. 2 § 1 n; Ch. 3 § 1 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 4 n; Ap. A 1 *a*, n.
[8] Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 11 *a* § 1.
[9] Omitting the statement that many thousands of previous Bodhisattas had so acted. Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*; Ch. 5 *a* § 1 n. The belief in innumerable Buddhas apparently originated in a theory of unnumbered Kalpas (Int. § 107), in which severally the world, reconstituted, expresses the divine fundamental unity (Ap. G 2 *a*) afresh in the development of intelligent social beings and in their ultimate clear perception of the Law of unity (IN, 5 *b*).
[10] Ch. 11 *a* § 1.
[11] Omitting a further comparison with many thousands of previous Bodhisattas.
[12] See § 2 above.
[13] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8].
[14] Omitting a statement that the future Buddha then fasted for forty-nine days; also the miracle of the golden bowl and the incident of Kāla the snake-king. Int. § 93 (vii).
[15] Omitting details.
[16] Ch. 5 *a* § 1; Ap. A 2 *b* (64). Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3); Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]. The three remaining trees are doubtless expansions of this.
[17] Omitting miraculous appearances of gods, snakes, genii, &c. (Int. § 93, vii). Omitting also the incident of Sotthiya the grass-cutter who provided a miraculous seat, and the miracles accompanying the choice of the eastern station beneath the Bo-tree. Int. § 94 (i).

back to the Bodhi-tree, with his face towards the east[1] . . .[2] he sat cross-legged. . . .[3] So he sat meditating on the Ten Perfections (*dasa pāramiyo*).[4] [JN, p. 72.] . . .[5] . . .[6] [JN, p. 75.] Before the sun had set the Great One put to flight the army of Māra. And then . . .[7] he acquired in the first watch[8] of the night the knowledge of previous existences, in the middle watch of the night the divine vision,[9] and in the last watch of the night the knowledge of the causative-process. . . .[10] [JN, p. 76.] Thus he attained omniscience[11] (*sabbaññūta-ñāṇaṃ*). . . .[12]

(ii) The Enlightenment: Commentarial Account of the First Days of Buddhahood

§ 5. (*Santike-nidāna* or Recent Period)[13] [JN, p. 77.] . . .[14] And the Bodhisatta sat there attaining immeasurable heights of thought (*samāpattiyo*)[15] for the seven days with reference to which it is said:[16] 'Then

[1] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; see § 2 above.

[2] Omitting the Bodhisatta's resolution to attain complete knowledge there.

[3] Omitting the attack by Māra (Int. § 35, ii) and his army, and the defence of the Bodhisatta by Sakka, Brahmā, Mahā-Kālanāga-rāja, king of snakes, and others (Int. §§ 35, ii, 69, 93, i). Māra is the Evil One, the Tempter, god of desire; rather the spirit of selfishness and personal indulgence than the Devil. As a personified power he probably arose from Buddha's denunciation of *taṇhā* (thirst) and *rāga* (lust). (Int. § 93, iv; Ap. C *b* § 11, 370; Ap. G 2 *b*. Cp. KM, p. 20; OB, pp. 101–5.)

[4] Int. § 69 (*Ten Perfections*); Ap. F 2 (i).

[5] The attack by Māra and his army, continued, omitted.

[6] Omitting the famous passage in which the Earth bears witness to the great alms given by the Buddha in previous existences as follows: [JN, p. 74.] 'Then the Tempter addressed the Great Being, and said, "Siddhattha! who is witness that thou hast given alms?" And the Great Being answered, "Thou hast living [animate] witnesses that thou hast given alms: and I have in this place no living [animate] witness at all. But not counting the alms I have given in other births, let this great and solid earth, unconscious though it be, be witness of the sevenhundredfold great alms I gave when I was born as Wessantara [Vessantara, Ap. A 2 *a*, n]!" And withdrawing his right hand from beneath his robe, he stretched it forth towards the earth [Ap. D *a*, *Note*; cp. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism*, 1928, pp. 294–5, on the Mudrās (Pāli *muddā*) or attitudes of Buddhist statues], and said "Are you or are you not witness of the seven hundredfold great gift I gave in my birth as Wessantara [Vessantara]?" And the Great Earth (*Mahā-pathavī*] uttered a voice, saying, "I am witness to thee of that!" overwhelming as it were the hosts of the Evil One as with the shouts of hundreds of thousands of foes. Then the mighty elephant "Girded-with-mountains", [on which Māra was seated,] as he realized what the generosity of Wessantara had been, fell down on his knees before the Great Being. And the army of Māra fled'. BBS, i, p. 101.

[7] As in Ap. B *c* § 1.

[8] Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 10 [19], 12 [22]. Ap. H 5 [94].

[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 10 *c* [1] (5).

[10] As in Ap. B *c* § 1. See § 10 below.

[11] Cp. Ch. 4 § 16 (*ñāna*); Ch. 5 *b* §§ 4 [17], 9; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6); and Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3].

[12] Omitting [JN, p. 77.] 'The period of time from his existence in the Tusita Heaven to his attainment of omniscience . . . constitutes the Middle Period'. Ch. 1 § 1 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 1 n.

[13] Or, Period of the Presence. Ch. 1 § 1 n; Ch. 10 *d* § 3. The *Nidāna Kathā* now begins to correspond with the *Mahā-vagga* Introduction, which commences at this point.

[14] Omitting the Buddha's recollections of past lives. Int. § 92.

[15] Ch. 3 § 4 [66].

[16] See § 9 below.

the Blessed One sat cross-legged continuously for seven days and experienced the bliss of liberation (*vimutti-sukha-paṭisaṃvedi*)'[1] . . .[2]

§ 6. [JN, p. 78.] Then, having spent four weeks near the Bo-tree, he proceeded in the fifth week to the Goatherds' banyan-tree (*yena Ajapāla-nigrodho*)[3] and sat there meditating on the Law (*dhammaṃ*)[4] and experiencing the bliss of liberation. . . .[5]

§ 7. [JN, p. 80.] When he had spent a week [the fifth] at that spot, he proceeded to the Mucalinda [tree] (*Mucalindaṃ agamāsi*), and there he passed a week. . . .[6]

§ 8. [JN, p. 80 cd.] Thence he went on to the Rājāyatana[7] [tree] (*rājāyatanaṃ upasaṃkami*), and there also he sat [during the seventh week] experiencing the bliss of liberation. Thus seven weeks passed. . . .[8] Then the Supremely Enlightened rose and returned thence to the Goatherds' banyan-tree. . . .[9]

[1] See § 13 below; Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. Ap. C *b* (*Nibbāna*); Ap. D *a* §§ 6 (*liberation*), 8 (*Fetters*).

[2] Omitting the doubts of the spirits (*devatā*), dispelled by a miracle (Int. § 94, i). Omitting also the seven days spent by the Buddha in gazing at the seat where he had attained enlightenment; and the seven days spent in walking in the jewelled cloister between the seat and the spot from which he had gazed; and a fourth week spent in a house of gems thinking out the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*, book by book (Ap. A 1 *a*, and Int. § 22). The remark which follows is very suggestive of the growth of the tradition (IN 6; § 6 n below), and runs: 'The Abhidhammikas say that House of Gems here means either a mansion built of the seven kinds of jewels, or the place where the seven books were thought out: and as they give these two explanations of the passage both should be accepted as correct' (BBS, i, p. 105). That Gotama pondered long near the Bo-tree upon his new-found system is doubtless the fact and the nucleus from which the rest of this part of the tradition grew.

[3] See § 13 below; Ch. 5 *a* § 1. This is Sujātā's tree, Ap. A 2 *b* (63).

[4] Int. § 13.

[5] Omitting the reflections of Māra (Int. § 93, iv), and the attack directed against the Buddha by Māra's three daughters (Ap. G 2 *b* § 2), personifications of Craving (*Taṇhā*), Discontent (*Aratī*), and Lust (*Rāgā*). The Māra legend does not appear in the *Mahā-vagga* account (see §§ 9 n and 12 below); it forms an important portion of the poetical *Sutta Nipāta*. The inclusion here of numerous incidents which do not appear in the *Mahā-vagga* is very suggestive of the method of the growth of the tradition (Int. § 69; see § 5 n above). For a still further incident see Ch. 21 § 12 [34] n.

[6] Omitting the miraculous protection of the Buddha by Mucalinda, the snake-king. Int. § 93 (vii); see § 14 below.

[7] Literally, King's seat or royal abode.

[8] Omitting the ministrations of Sakka, king of the gods (Int. § 93, i), on the last day of the seven weeks' fast. Omitting also the account of the conversion of the two merchants Tapassu and Bhalluka (see § 15 n below), said to have been travelling with five hundred carts (Ch. 10 *a* § 1; and Int. §§ 121, 189) from Ukkala (Orissa) to Middle India (*majjhima-desaṃ*, Int. § 158), which can hardly be reconciled with the MV accounts and was perhaps added to the tradition later in the interests of Ceylon and Orissa, to which latter the two converts are said to have carried certain hair-relics, afterwards removed to Ceylon (cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 12 n). They are said to have taken refuge in the Buddha and the Law (i.e. the dyad, cp. Ap. H 1 *c*; Ap. H 2, *Note, Refuges*). Their names appear in a list of early converts mentioned in the *Aṅguttara Nikāya*; PTS, i, p. 26 (Ch. 10 *c*, 61), out of which the story may have grown, though it is not quite consistent with details therein.

[9] Continued in Ch. 5 *a* § 1.

(iii) Vinaya Account

Vinaya-Piṭaka,[1] *Mahā-vagga,*[2] *Khandhaka I, i–v.*

§ 9. [MV, 1. i. 1.] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One (*bhagavā*),[3] was staying at Uruvelā[4] on the bank of the Nerañjarā at the foot of the tree of Enlightenment having just become All-enlightened. Then the Blessed One sat cross-legged continuously for seven days[5] at the foot of the tree of Enlightenment feeling the bliss of liberation.

§ 10. [i. 2.] Then the Blessed One during the first watch of the night thought over the causative-process[6] forward and reversed. . . .[7] 'Thus there is origination (*samudayo*)[8] of this whole aggregation of sorrow'. . . .[9] 'Thus there is cessation (*nirodho*)[10] of this whole aggregation of sorrow.' [i. 3.] Then indeed the Blessed One having understood this matter (*atthaṃ*) at that time breathed forth this cry (*udānaṃ*):[11]

[1] Ap. A 1 *a*; Ap. H 3, *Note*. For the commencement of *Khandhaka* II see Ch. 8 *a*.

[2] From the complete confusion of the two differing accounts of the Great Enlightenment given in the *Jātaka* Introduction and in the Introductory portion of the *Mahā-vagga* it may be gathered that when these accounts were compiled the real nature of the Enlightenment had been forgotten. The Canonical accounts in the *Majjhima Nikāya* (§§ 16 and 17 below) are comparatively simple and straightforward, and show an appreciation of the central fact of the Enlightenment, the perception of the wretchedness and futility of egoism (cp. many characteristic definitions of the Buddhist Nibbāna, Ap. C *b*; and Int. § 10; also § 14 below). The first twenty-four chapters of *Khandhaka* I of the *Mahā-vagga* appear to be a commentarial introduction to the *Mahā-vagga proper* (Int. § 1; Ch. 5 *c* § 8 n; Ch. 7 *c* § 2 n; Ap. H 3, *Note*). They contain an account of events from immediately after the Enlightenment up to the conversion of the great disciples Sāriputta and Moggallāna, and the regular establishment of the Saṃgha in Rājagaha, the account being pieced together partly from the first four Nikāyas and partly from ancient traditionary accounts in prose and in verse (IN 6, Canon; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). The date of this introductory matter can scarcely be determined, but the narrative is old enough to ignore the poetical *Sutta Nipāta* legend of Māra the Tempter (see § 6 n above), and to be included in the scope of the Commentary (the *Samanta-pāsādikā*, Eliot, *H. and B.*, 1921, iii, p. 30; SBE, xiii, p. 79) by Buddhaghosha, who wrote in the 5th century A.D. (Int. § 21). The nucleus of this introductory narrative, which is now included in the Canon, may perhaps have been found in the ancient Sinhalese commentaries (Int. § 21) utilized by Buddhaghosha.

[3] Literally, Fortunate. Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [15]; Ap. E *b* § 2. See Part I, title (*Buddha*). The word implies high distinction and was applied popularly to eminent teachers of religious thought; SBB, vi, p. 2 (*Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 3).

[4] Int. § 145; Ap. B *c* § 2.

[5] See § 5 above.

[6] Int. § 67. It is noticeable that in the *Mahā-vagga* account the three watches succeed the Enlightenment, and thus make the discovery of the chain of causation an effect, not the cause, of enlightenment. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 1 (1), (*watches of the night*).

[7, 8] As in Ap. B *c* § 2. In the legend of Vipassin (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2) the enlightenment of that Buddha is attributed to the discovery of the Causative Process; here in the *Mahā-vagga* Introduction, as in the JN (see § 4 above), Gotama's enlightenment is associated with the same discovery.

[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ap. B *c* (*samuppāda*).

[10] Ch. 7 *a* § 19; and Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n.

[11] Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]; see § 13 below. The verse narrative enclosed in the *Mahā-vagga* Introduction appears to be the earliest known account of Gotama's Enlightenment. It is, however, only a popular and somewhat Hinduized account, composed not by one of the inner circle of the disciples but by a popular bard for the

'When (separate-)natures (*dhammā*)[1] truly are manifested (*pātubhavanti*)[2] to the strenuous contemplative holy-man (*brāhmaṇassa*),[3]
Then all his doubts vanish, because he understands nature that has a cause (*sa-hetu-dhammaṃ*)'.[4]

§ 11. [i. 4.] Then again the Blessed One during the Middle watch of the night thought over the causative process. . . .[5] [i. 5.] Then indeed the Blessed One . . . breathed forth this cry:

'When (separate-)natures truly are manifested to the strenuous contemplative holy-man,
Then all his doubts vanish, because he has known the destruction of the bases (*khayaṃ paccāyaṃ*).'[6]

§ 12 [i. 6.] Then indeed the Blessed One during the third watch of the night thought over the causative process. . . .[7] [i. 7.] Then indeed the Blessed One . . . breathed forth this cry:

'When (separate-)natures truly are manifested to the strenuous contemplative holy-man,
He stands and scatters the army of Māra [the Tempter][8] even as the sun lighting the heavens.'

§ 13. [ii. 1.] Then the Blessed One at the end of seven days rose from that contemplation (*samādhimhā*),[9] and went from the foot of the tree of Enlightenment towards the Goatherds' banyan-tree,[10] and having reached it he sat cross-legged at the foot of the Goatherds'

edification of the people (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). The prose of the *Mahā-vagga* Introduction adds to and greatly exaggerates the narrative supplied by the verses and by portions of the Suttas, and the introduction to the *Jātaka*, supported by the poetical *Sutta Nipata*, does so still more. The 'Northern' legends complete the process of exaggeration (Int. § 3; IN 6). The third Book in the fifth *Nikāya* (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Khudda-Nikāya*) is called *Udāna* and comprises a collection of such lyrics with explanatory narratives.

[1] i.e. phenomena, more especially individuality, personality; Ch. 7 *a* § 19; see § 18 [3] below; Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]; Ap. E *c* i §§ 1, 9 (*suddha-dhammā*); cp. *saṃkhārā* in Ap. B *c* § 2 (2), and Ap. E *a*. Compare Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ap. E *a* ii § 1. See further Ap. F 2 *a* (116); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14); also Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3] (where *dhammā* means thoughts), and Ap. D *c* § 3 [10]. Cp. IN 5 *b* (*Dhamma*, Law); Part I (title) n.

[2] 'When the real nature of things becomes clear', SBE, xiii, p. 78. 'When verily things are manifested', ThB, p. 76. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 19 [5] n; Ap. D *c* § 3 (*realize*).

[3] Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]; Ap. F, iii.

[4] Or, that which has by nature a cause. 'He realises what is that nature and what its cause', SBE, xiii, p. 78. 'He knows things together with their causes', ThB, p. 76. For *hetu* see Ch. 7 *a* § 19. See Int. § 4 n.

[5] As in Ap. B *c* § 2.

[6] The destruction of the bases of individual desire (Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3], *paccay*; cp. *upadhi*, Ch. 7 *a* § 8), or the transience of individuality (cp. Ap. E *a* i, *Anicca*). 'He has understood the cessation of causation', SBE, xiii, p. 78. 'He has reached the destruction of the causes', ThB, p. 76. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n; also § 18 below (*individuality*); Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ch. 7 *a* § 19 (*nirodha*); Ch. 9 *a* [3] (*perishable*); Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7] (*destruction*); Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2] (*transience*); Ap. E, *Note*; Ap. E *a* ii § 1. Cp. also Ap. B *c* § 2 (2) *paccaya*; Ap. E *c* i § 9 (*dependence*).

[7] As in Ap. B *c* § 2.

[8] The spirit of egoistic desire. This brief poetical mention of the hosts of Māra, or the powers of temptation, is Māra's sole appearance in the *Mahā-vagga* account of the Enlightenment. See § 6 n above; Ap. G 2 *b*. Cp. Ap. D *b* § 4 (*death*).

[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[10] See § 6 above.

banyan-tree for seven days continuously, experiencing the bliss of liberation.[1] [ii. 2.] . . .[2] [ii. 3.] Then the Blessed One . . . breathed forth this cry:[3]

'The holy-man (*Brāhmano*) whose nature is unsinful, not harsh, unstained (*ni-kasāvo*),[4] self-restrained (*yat-atto*),
Who has mastered Knowledge and follows the holy-life, he rightly (*dhammena*)[5] being holy (*Brāhmano*)[6] should announce the holy-teaching (*Brahma-vādaṃ*);
Who has no pride[7] whatever in the world (*loke*).'

§ 14. [iii. 1.] Then the Blessed One at the end of seven days . . . went to the Mucalinda-tree and sat cross-legged at the foot of the Mucalinda-tree for seven days continuously . . .[8] [iii. 4.] Then the Blessed One . . . breathed forth this cry:

'Blissful (*sukho*) is the solitude of the happy one (*tuṭṭhassa*) who has learnt the Law and comprehends;
Blissful is unhurtfulness[9] in the world, self-restraint[10] towards living things;
Blissful is non-desire (*vi-rāgatā*) in the world, the transcending of sense-pleasures (*kāmānaṃ*),[11]
The putting away of the conceit "I am"[12] (*asmi-mānassa*)—this indeed is the highest bliss.'[13]

§ 15. [iv. 1.] Then the Blessed One at the end of seven days . . . went to the Rājāyatana-tree and sat cross-legged at the foot of the Rājāyatana-tree for seven days continuously . . .[14] [v. 1.] Then the Blessed One returned to the Goatherds' banyan-tree. . . .[15]

(iv) Nikāya Accounts

§ 16. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26* (*Ariya-pariyesana-Sutta*).[16]

[PTS, i, p. 167.] 'There [at Uruvelā] I settled, mendicant brothers, here being everything needed for effort. And being myself subjected

[1] See § 5 above.
[2] Omitting the visit and questions of a haughty Brāhman, whose existence appears to be due to a prose expansion of the ancient verses.
[3] Ch. 4 § 10 n.
[4] Cp. Ap. C *b* § 2.
[5] Part I (title) n.
[6] Ap. F 2 (iii).
[7] Or, self-assertion. The meaning of *ussāda* is uncertain. 'Whose behaviour is uneven to nothing in the world', SBE, xiii, p. 80. Possibly, for whom there is no selfhood anywhere in the world.
[8] Omitting the miracle of the serpent-king Mucalinda. See § 7 above.
[9] *A-vy-āpajjha*; non-malice. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 ii (*ill-will*); and Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [7].
[10] *Saṃ-yama*; cp. Int. § 49 (*ahiṃsā*).
[11] Ap. D *a* § 1.
[12] i.e. I exist separately. Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425]; also Ap. E *c* i § 7 [3] (*conceit*); see § 9 n above. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 ii; Ap. D *b* § 1; Ap. E *c* i.
[13] Ap. C *b* § 11 (203).
[14] Omitting the incident of the two merchants, Tapassu and Bhalluka (see § 8 n above; Ch. 10 *c*, 61) of Ukkala (Orissa), and the spirit (*deva*, Int. § 35) of their departed relative; and the miracle of the bowls supplied by the four Mahārāja gods of the four quarters (Int. § 93, v).
[15] Continued in Ch. 5 *a* § 2.
[16] Continued from Ch. 3 § 5. No mention is made of the austerities which figure so largely in *Mahā-Saccaka-S.* (see § 17 below) and in the JN account based thereon (Ch. 3 § 7), or of trances or marvels (see § 9 n above).

to earthly-existence[1] I perceived the wretchedness of what is subjected to earthly-existence, and seeking the supreme peace of Nirvāna (*nibbānaṃ*)[2] which is not affected by earthly-existence, I attained the supreme[3] peace of a self-extinction[4] (*nibbānaṃ*) not affected by[5] earthly-existence. Being myself subjected to decay . . .[6] to disease . . . to death . . . to grief . . . (and) to defilement . . . and seeking the supreme peace of Nirvāna which is not affected by decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief . . . (and) defilement, I attained the supreme peace of a self-extinction not affected by decay[7] . . . disease . . . death[8] . . . grief . . . (and) defilement.

'And the knowledge (*ñānaṃ*)[9] now as a thing seen[10] arose in me: "My liberation (*vimutti*)[11] is established,[12] separate-existence (*jāti*)[13] is terminated[14] here; there is not now survival (*puna-bbhavo*)".'[15]

[1] Ch. 1 § 11.

[2] Extinction (of the ego); peace. A distinction must be drawn between the metaphysical extinction of the ego (Ap. D *b*; Ap. I *a*) and the ethical extinction of selfishness (Ap. D *a*; Ap. G 1). Seeking for the former, Gotama reached the latter (Int. § 10; Ap. C). The Nirvāna to which he attained, and which he taught, was an escape from the doctrine of Samsāra or endless transmigration (Ap. B) so overwhelming in Hindu eyes. It brought the sense of the transience and unreality of individuality (Ch. 5 *c*, *Second Sermon*), and so brought rest to those who laboured under the burden of the doctrine of the ceaseless migration of the individual soul. The oppression of an aeonian personal struggle gave way to the peace and security of selflessness and active unselfish well-doing (Ap. F 1) without thought of personal reward. The close of the present passage is not necessarily discordant with this interpretation.

[3] *An-uttara*; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3].

[4] Peace in this life (Ap. C *b*). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] n.

[5] Because self-transcendent (Ap. D *c*, *Arahat*).

[6] Omitting repetitions.

[7] Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*cessation*).

[8] Ap. C *b* § 11 (374).

[9] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28], [29]; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [d]; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 n; Ch. 9 *a* §§ 2 [3], 13 (1); Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7]; and Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149] n. Cp. Ch. 4 § 4 [75]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200] (*vision*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14); also Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*); and Ap. H 1 § 6 [5].

[10] Or clear sight (*dassanaṃ*). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [II, 1] (*realization*); Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [4].

[11] Ap. D *a* § 6; and Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20].

[12] Literally, not to be shaken. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 8. 'Immovable is the emancipation of my heart', SBE, xi, p. 153. 'My deliverance is unshakeable', Warren, *Buddhism in Translation* (1922), p. 338.

[13] Or, individuality. Cp. § 17 below; Ch. 5 *b* § 9; Ch. 5 *c* § 5; Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9]. This term does not necessarily imply acceptance of the doctrine of re-birth. The theories of previous and future re-births are inconsistent with the Buddha's *an-atta* doctrine (Ap. E *c*). He, however, seems to have accepted the theories of the succession of Kalpas (Int. 107), of the Paramātman (Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*)), and of the Khandhas (Ap. E *a* ii), and these imply the building up of the constituents of the individual through the course of long ages. But the theory of the Khandhas and the *an-atta* doctrine imply the dissolution of the individual at death, though under the Law of Karma (Ap. B *b*) the consequences of the actions of the individual continue through the ages (cp. Ch. 22, Buddha's last words; Ap. G 2 *a* (*Karma*)).

[14] Or, finite; *ayam-antimā*. Cp. Ap. B *b* 1 (*māran-antika*). 'This is my last existence', SBE and Warren. 'This was my last birth', SBB, v, p. 118.

[15] Or, recurrence (of individuality). Ch. 5 *c* § 6; Ch. 7 *a* § 20 n; and Ch. 21 § 17 [2]; also Int. § 11. Cp. Int. § 24 (*pono-bbhavika*); Ch. 9 *a* § 14 n. Cp. also Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ch. 13 *c* 18 (*bhav-ābhava*). 'There will now be no re-birth for me', SBE, xi, p. 153; 'Hence I shall not be born again', SBE, xiii, p. 97; 'No more shall I be born again', Warren.—The meaning of these three phrases is disputable, but the phrase *bhava-nirodha* in Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411] seems decisive; compare especially the *Mahā-Saccaka-S.* (see § 17 below), the *An-attalakkhana-S.* (Ch. 5 *b* § 2), and Gotama's last words (Ch. 22 *b* § 25). *Bhava* means existence, but means

§ 17. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 36 (Mahā-Saccaka Sutta).*[1]

[PTS, i, p. 249.] '. . .[2] Then I turned my mind to the knowledge of the destruction of the taints (*āsavānaṃ*).[3] I knew verily (*yathā-bhūtaṃ*) [the four Truths][4]: "This is sorrow" . . . "This is the origination of sorrow" . . . "This is the cessation of sorrow" . . . "This is the path (*paṭipadā*) leading to the cessation of sorrow". I knew verily: "These are the taints (*āsavā*)" . . . "This is the origination of the taints" . . . "This is the cessation of the taints" . . . "This is the path leading to the cessation of the taints."

'When thus I perceived and understood, my mind[5] (*cittaṃ*) was liberated[6] from the taint of lust[7] (*kām-āsavā*), . . . the taint of individuality (*bhav-āsavā*),[8] and . . . the taint of ignorance[9] (*avijj-āsavā*); and when I was liberated there arose in me the knowledge of my liberation. I knew: "Separate-existence (*jāti*)[10] is ended[11] (*khīnā*); the holy-life (*brahma-cariyaṃ*) is lived,[12] what must be done is done;[13]

also individuality and as such is one of the taints (*āsavā*) which are to be destroyed (Ap. D *a* § 7). This passage is continued in Ch. 5 *a* § 5.

[1] Discourse of the Buddha to Saccaka the Jain (Ch. 12 *a* § 7; also Int. § 184; Ch. 11 *c* § 14 n). The scene is laid at Vesāli in the Kūṭāgāra Hall (Int. § 133). See Ch. 1 § 7 n; Ch. 2 § 5 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 6, 7; Ap. D *a* § 7.—A less detailed account of the period of Gotama's asceticism and trances is given in *Majjh.* 4 (*Bhaya-bherava-S.*), which includes the present passage as also does *Majjh.* 85 (Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92] n).

[2] Omitting an account of the four trances (Ap. I *a*) which followed Gotama's first meal after the great austerities, described in much detail (cp. § 16 above; Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68] n); and also a description of the first two watches of the night (Ap. B *c* § 1 [1]), in the first of which he turned his mind to 'the remembrance of his former existences', and in the second to 'the passing away and re-birth of beings' (Int. § 92). This part of the narrative occurs also in *Majjh.* 4 (SBB, v, pp. 14–17) and *Majjh.* 100 (Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210] n). See § 9 n above; Ch. 3 §§ 5 n, 7; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1] (*tevijja*). Contrast Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [I, 30].

[3] Or, passions. Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411] n; Ap. D *a* § 7; also Ap. D (*Evil*). Literally, 'flowing in'. See note on the word Āsavas in ThB, p. 67. The Āsavas are enumerated below.

[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1]. We have here the central fact of Gotama's Enlightenment (Ap. G 1 *a* §§ 1, 2, 3 (7); Ap. G 1 *b*), to which the three watches, the three knowledges, the four trees, the four trances, and the four or seven weeks, evidently are imaginative additions (IN 6, *Canon*).

[5] Or, will; Ch. 9 *a* § 4 [12]; Ch. 13 *d* § 9. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 27 (*ceto*); Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6].

[6] Ch. 5 *b* §§ 7, 9; Ap. C *b* § 5; Ap. D *a* § 6.

[7] Desire, or sensuous pleasure. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92].

[8] Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*Second Truth*); Ap. B *c* § 2 (2). Individuality and ignorance resemble closely the hatred (*dosa*) and delusion (*moha*) which constitute the second and third 'Fires', as *kāma* resembles *rāga*, the first of these (Ap. A 2 *a* § 12 n; Ap. D *a* § 10).

[9] Ap. D *b*.

[10] See § 16 above; Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 9 *a* § 10; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8]; Ch. 21 § 16. Better, the sense of separate existence. *Jāti* has previously been translated as earthly-existence, but as Gotama's ideas cleared a more definite expression should be used. *Jāti* is defined by the words which frequently follow and expand it, decay, disease, death, and all the sorrows. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 (*me*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73]. 'Re-birth is exhausted', SBE, xiii, p. 101.

[11] Literally, destroyed, or cancelled; cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6] (*khīn-āsava*).

[12] Ch. 5 *c* § 5. In Ch. 5 *a* § 10 the 'fulfilment of the holy-life' is declared to be the attainment of the 'deathless', that is present *nibbāna* or the transcendence of self in this life. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10. See Ch. 22 *b* § 25 n; Ap. B *c* § 4 [6] n. 'Holiness is completed', SBE, xiii.

[13] 'Duty is fulfilled', SBE, xiii.

there is nothing [individual] beyond this [existence] (*n'āparaṃ itthattāya*)".[1]

'This was the third knowledge (*vijjā*), which I gained in the last watch of the night. Ignorance was driven away, knowledge had arisen; thus it is with one who abides diligent (*appamattassa*), ardent and firm.' . . .[2]

§ 18. *Aṅguttara-Nikaya, Tika-nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 134. (The three characteristics of Individuality.)*[3]

[1] 'Whether Right-farers[4] arise, mendicant brothers, or do not arise, it remains a principle[5] (*dhātu*), a foundation of nature, a certainty of nature, that all individuality (*saṃkhārā*)[6] is transitory (*a-niccā*).[7] A Right-farer awakens to and arrives at[8] this, and having awakened to and arrived at it, he proclaims . . .[9] and makes clear that all indi-

[1] Ch. 5 *c* § 5; Ch. 7 *a* § 6; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [17]; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 18 [3] n, 20 n; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 7 [9], 18 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 1 [5], 15 [15]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]; Ch. 22 *b* § 20. Cp. § 16 above (*survival*), and § 18 [1] below; Ap. B *c* §§ 3 [19], 4 [21]. The meaning is disputed. 'There is no further return to this world', SBE, xiii, p. 101; 'There is nought (for me) beyond this world', ThB, p. 68; 'There is no more of this', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 284; 'There is no more of this state', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 54. The whole phrase is the subject of a dialogue between Buddha and Sunakkhatta (Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68]) in *Majjh.* 105 (PTS, ii, pp. 252–61). In the second Sutta of *Dīgha Nikāya* this phrase, translated in SBB (ii, p. 93) as 'After this present life there will be no beyond', follows immediately after an account of the power to perceive the past and future births of beings and is affected by this context. The context in Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411] and [413] seems decisive.

[2] The personal narrative here closes; brief mention of the six Titthiya philosophers follows (Int. § 179).

[3] Ap. E, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 4 § 11; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*cessation*). This passage sets forth the Three Characteristics of Life, which it declares to be transitory, sorrowful, and without any permanent or individual self. But the joy and happiness of Nibbāna (peace in this life, Ap. C *b*) and of Mettā (love, Ap. F 1 *a*) are equally insisted upon in Buddha's teaching. The reconciliation of these two mental attitudes must be sought. It is to be found in Buddha's characteristic teaching of Selflessness (Ap. D). Transitory all individual existence must be; and also sorrowful, so long as it dwells upon its own individuality; but when it realizes its relationship to the whole, sharing in the welfare of the whole, then, with the loss of its dominant sense of selfhood, there comes peace, and also active joy in well-doing. This is the attitude of the Stoic school of thought represented by Marcus Aurelius Antoninus (IN 10). The passage is in full accord with the Four Truths of the First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 10). The Three Characteristics are the negative side of Buddha's doctrine, and correspond generally with the first three Truths, and arise as a corollary to the third of these. The positive side is found in the fourth Truth, the Eightfold Path, necessitating activity.

[4] Or Leaders; finding the right way, following the right way, showing the right way. Pāli *Tathāgata*. Ap. A 2 *c*; cp. Ch. 14 *e* § 5 [1] n.

[5] 'It remains a fact', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. xx. Cp. Ch. 20 § 10 [16] n; also Ap. G 1 *b*.

[6] Literally, composite unity. Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40]. Compare Assaji's summary in Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228].

[7] Ap. E *a* i. Cp. § 17 n above; Ch. 7 *a* § 20 (*cessation*); also Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [8]; Ch. 20 § 6 (1); Ch. 21 § 12 [48]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 7 [14], 28 [11]; and Int. § 11. Contrast Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [17] (*niccato*).

[8] Int. § 36. The discovery and mastery and proclamation of the transience and misery of individual life is here declared essential to the attainment of Buddhahood. A Pacceka Buddha discovers these truths afresh for himself, but cannot impart them. Ch. 1 §§ 1, 2.

[9] Omitting synonyms.

viduality is transitory. [2] Whether Right-farers arise, mendicant brothers, or do not arise, it remains a principle, a foundation of nature, a certainty of nature, that all individuality is sorrowful (*dukkhā*).[1] A Right-farer awakens to and arrives at this . . . and makes clear that all individuality is sorrowful. [3] Whether Right-farers arise, mendicant brothers, or do not arise, it remains a principle, a foundation of nature, a certainty of nature, that all separate-natures are without permanent-self (*sabbe dhammā*[2] *an-attā*).[3] A Right-farer awakens to and arrives at this . . . and makes clear that all separate-natures are without permanent-self.'

(*See Appendix D containing texts supplementary to this chapter; also Appendix Bc* (*Paṭicca-samuppāda.*)

[1] Ap. E *b*.

[2] See § 10 [i. 3] above; Ch. 14 *c* § 5 [189]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [21].

[3] Ap. E *c* i. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 6 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2] n; Ch. 14 *e* § 8 [2] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 21 § 16 (*perishable*); and Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [7] (*self*); also Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [14] (*individuality*); see Int. § 11 (*re-birth*). For Buddha the individual self was the prime delusion (Ap. D *a* § 10, ii, n, *moha*) and barrier (cp. Ch. 1 § 11, *yoga-kkhema*); cp. Ap. D *b* § 3 (*doer*).

CHAPTER 5

URUVELĀ AND ISIPATANA: THE STARTING OF THE WHEEL

a. The Buddha's Hesitation and Decision; the Journey to Benāres

(i) *Commentarial account*

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā), JN, p. 81[1]

§ 1. [JN, p. 81.] Then the Supremely Enlightened rose and returned[2] to the Goatherds' banyan-tree[3] and sat at the foot of the tree. And [at first] as he was seated there, viewing the profundity of the Law (*dhammassa*) to which he had attained, there rose in his mind a doubt . . .[4] whether he could show to others[5] the Law. . . .[6] Then he considered to whom he should first reveal the Law. And first he thought of Āḷāra.[7] . . . Then he thought of Uddaka[8] the disciple of Rāma. . . . Then he thought of the five mendicants.[9] . . . And he remained there for a few days and begged for alms of food near the Bodhi-tree,[10] intending to go to Benāres[11] on the full-moon day of Āsālhi (*Āsālhi-puṇṇa-māsiyaṃ*).[12] . . .[13]

(ii) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, v–vi. 9[14]

§ 2. [MV, I. v. 1.] Then the Blessed One . . .[15] returned to the Goatherds' banyan-tree[16] and . . . remained at the foot of the tree. [2] Then in the mind of the Blessed One, who was alone and quiet,[17]

[1] Continued directly from Ch. 4 § 8. See Int. § 73.
[2] The next incident follows naturally on the close of the second Epoch (Ch. 4 § 4 n) of the *Nidāna-kathā*. The marvellous incidents of the 49 days' fast, succeeding the attainment of Omniscience, show all the signs of comparatively late additions.
[3] Ch. 4 § 6; see § 2 below.
[4] Omitting 'felt by each of the Buddhas as he became aware of his having arrived at the truth'. Ch. 4 § 3 n.
[5] See §§ 2, 5, below; Int. § 10; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*.
[6] Omitting the supplications of Mahā-Brahmā and apparently other powers (*Sakka-Suyāma-Santusita-Sunimmita-Vasavatti-Mahābrahmano*). Int. § 93 (i, ii, iii).
[7] See § 3 below (MV, I. vi. 1–2).
[8] See § 3 below (MV, I. vi. 3–4).
[9] See § 3 below (MV, I. vi. 5–6); Ch. 3 § 8.
[10] Ch. 4 § 4.
[11] Int. § 151; Ch. 15 *a*.
[12] Ch. 1 § 3. Cp. Ch. 4 § 1; Ch. 8 *c* (*Uposatha*).
[13] Omitting the incident of the Hindu mendicant Upaka the Ājīvaka. See § 4 below (MV, I. vi. 7–9). The narrative is continued in Ch. 5 *b* § 1.
[14] Continued directly from Ch. 4 § 15.
[15] Omitting mention of the seven days spent at the foot of the Rājayatana-tree.
[16] See § 1 above.
[17] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

this reflection arose:[1] 'I have attained to this Law,[2] deep, difficult to see, hard to understand, tranquillizing (*santo*), exalted, beyond questioning (*a-takk-āvacaro*),[3] subtle, to be felt by the wise (*paṇḍita-vedanīyo*). This generation (*pajā*) on the other hand enjoys, is satisfied with, and delights in attachments.[4] For a generation . . .[5] delighting in attachments this principle (*thānam*), that is causality (*idappacca-yatā*), [the individuality's] dependent origination (*paṭicca-samuppādo*),[6] would be difficult to see, and hardest for them to see would be the pacification of all individuality (*sabba-saṃkhāra-samatho*)[7] . . .[8] peace (*nibbānaṃ*).[9] If I were to explain the Law and others did not understand me, that would be weariness, and that would be vexation to me.' . . .[10]

§ 3. [vi. 1.] Then the Blessed One thought: 'To whom first shall I declare the Law? . . . What if I should first declare the Law to Āḷāra Kālāma?[11] He will quickly comprehend it.' . . .[12] [vi. 3.] '. . . What if I should first declare the Law to Uddaka[13] the disciple of Rāma? He will quickly comprehend it.' . . .[14] [vi. 5.] '. . . What if I should first declare the Law to the Five Mendicants?'[15] [vi. 6.] . . .[16] Then the Blessed One went on his way towards Benāres.[17]

§ 4. [vi. 7.] As the Blessed One was proceeding along the road[18] from the Bodhi-tree to Gayā,[19] Upaka the Ājīvaka[20] saw him and said to the Blessed One: '. . . Who is thy teacher? Whose Law dost thou profess?' [vi. 8.] When Upaka the Ājīvaka had thus spoken, the Blessed One replied . . .[21] 'Having by myself gained knowledge, to whom should I pay regard? . . .'[22]

(iii) *Nikāya account*

Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26 (Ariya-pariyesana Sutta)[23]

§ 5. [PTS, i, p. 167.] 'Then, mendicant brothers, this thought came[24] to me: "I have attained to this Law, difficult to see and under-

[1] The events from this point up to the beginning of the First Sermon are narrated in the same terms in the *Mahā-vagga* and in Sutta 26 of the *Majjhima Nikāya*, except that the *Majjhima* narrative is in the first person (see § 5 below; see also Int. § 35, ii). The source is apparently the legend of Vipassin Buddha, in which the same events are related in practically the same words (SBB, iii, pp. 29–33; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2).

[2] Int. § 13; Part I (title) n.

[3] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3). 'Unattainable by reasoning', SBE, xiii, p. 84. So translated this phrase directly contradicts other notable passages: cp. Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3] (*precision*); Ap. B *c* § 5 [6]; Ap. E *c* ii § 1 (*sayaṃ*); also Ap. G 1 *a* (ii).

[4] 'Desire', SBE. The Pāli word is *ālaya*. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 7 *a* § 8 (*upadhi*); Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*).

[5] Omitting repetitions.

[6] Ap. B *c*.

[7] Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*).

[8] As in Ap. C *b* § 1.

[9] Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13].

[10] Omitting the verses on the Buddha's hesitation; also the supplications of Brahmā Sahampati; as in § 6 below. See § 1 above.

[11] Cp. § 1 above; Ch. 3 § 5 n.

[12] As in § 7 below.

[13] See § 1 above.

[14] As in § 8 below.

[15] See § 1 above.

[16] As in § 9 below.

[17] Int. § 151; Ch. 15 *a* § 6 [170].

[18] Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26].

[19] Int. § 145.

[20] Int. §§ 183, 187 (*ascetics*); Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524] n; see § 1 n above, § 9 n below. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [3].

[21] As in Ap. C *b* § 2.

[22] As in Ap. C *b* § 2; cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [1] n. Continued in Ch. 5 *b* § 3.

[23] Continued directly from Ch. 4 § 16.

[24] See § 2 above.

stand. . . . [p. 168.] If I were to explain the Law and others did not understand me, that would be weariness, that would be vexation to me."[1]

§ 6. 'Then, mendicant brothers, these new[2] verses[3] (*gāthā*), not heard before,[4] occurred to me:

"With great toil have I attained [the Law]. Let me not now announce it.
By those given over to lust and hate[5] hardly will this Law be understood.

What is toilsome, abstruse, deep, difficult to see, subtle,
They will not see, given over to desire, encircled by thick darkness."

'Thus, mendicant brothers, as I pondered, my mind inclined me to inaction and to refrain from explaining the Law. . . .[6] [p. 169.] Then, because of compassion (*kāruññataṃ*)[7] for living beings (*sattesu*),[8] I gazed over the world (*lokaṃ*) . . .[9] and I saw [beings with natures] scarcely tainted (*appa-rajakkhe*),[10] much tainted, with keen faculties, with dull faculties (*mud-indriye*), well-disposed, ill-disposed, docile, indocile, and a few who lived perceiving a world beyond[11] and sin and

[1] See § 1 above. It is scarcely credible that Gotama could doubt the acceptability of the doctrines of Saṃsāra and Karma to the Hindu mind, to which they are profoundly congenial. His doubts, if they occurred, probably concerned the possibility of persuading mankind to accept a rarer doctrine, namely that of pure altruism (Int. § 3). His hesitation may perhaps indicate that Gotama, having thought out the metaphysical monistic basis of his system (Ap. G 2 *a*), decided against the possibility of imparting it widely (Ap. G 1 *a* ii) and then decided to devote himself to the inculcation of unselfishness in practical daily life (Ap. F 1; Ap. G 1 *b*). The Teacher may have described this hesitation at some later date to his followers. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 n.

[2] The meaning of *anacchariyā* is doubtful. (SBE, xiii, p. 85.)

[3] See § 2 above. The following verses by an unknown poet are simpler, and therefore probably earlier, than those parts of the prose in which they are here set (cp. Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). It may be noted that they contain no mention of the law of Dependent Origination (Ap. B *c*). The verses are taken from the legend of Vipassin Buddha (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2).

[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 n. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 1 (2).

[5] Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[6] Omitting the supplications of Brahmā Sahampati (Int. § 93, ii) and the ballad verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) attributed to him, beginning:

'Among the Magadhas (Int. § 158) there has been manifest till now
A law (*dhammo*), impure, conceived with many blemishes.
Open thou the door of the Deathless (*amatassa*; see below, and Ap. A 2 *a* Buddha-vaṃsa II, sloka (15) n; Ap. C *b* 2; Ap. E *a*, *Note*);
Let them hear the Law revealed unblemished.'

In the *Mahā-vagga* account, as in the legend of Vipassin Buddha, the Buddha repeats his doubts to Brahmā Sahampati and the latter makes his request three times before succeeding.

[7] Ap. F 1 *b*; Ap. F 2 *b* (*karuṇā*).

[8] Ch. 8 *l* § 3; Ch. 9 *a* § 10; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [4]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] (*world*).

[9] Omitting 'with the eye of a Buddha' (Ap. B *c* § 1, 1; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4) and repetitions. The phrase would come naturally to the Buddha's followers.

[10] Ch. 6 *b* § 1 (*tainted*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*.

[11] This apparently is said rather of hell and heaven than of Saṃsāra and Karma (Ap. B *a*). *Para-loka* is the world beyond. Ch. 7 *b* § 2; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [261]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 n.

danger—just as[1] in a pond of blue lotuses or of pink lotuses or of white lotuses[2] some lotuses . . . born and springing up in the water, do not emerge from but are nourished under the water; others . . . reach the surface of the water; and others . . . rise above and are untouched by the water. . . .[3]

§ 7. 'Then this thought came to me: "To whom first shall I declare the Law? Who will comprehend the Law quickly?" And the thought came to me: "There is Āḷāra Kālāma,[4] wise, intelligent and learned; his nature has long been scarcely tainted. What if I should first declare the Law to him? He will quickly comprehend it." . . .[5] And the knowledge clearly (*dassanaṃ*) came to me: "Āḷāra Kālāma died seven days ago." Then, mendicant brothers, this thought came to me: "Nobly-born (*mah'-ājāniyo*) was Āḷāra Kālāma. If he had heard the Law he would quickly have comprehended it."

§ 8. . . . 'Then the thought came to me: "There is Uddaka[6] the disciple of Rāma, wise, intelligent and learned; his nature has long been scarcely tainted." . . .[7] And the knowledge clearly came to me: "Uddaka the disciple of Rāma died yesterday evening." Then, mendicant brothers, this thought came to me: "Nobly-born was Uddaka the disciple of Rāma. If he had heard the Law he would quickly have comprehended it."

§ 9. . . . 'Then this thought came to me: "Of great service to me were the Five Mendicants[8] who attended on me whilst I undertook the Effort (*padhāna-pahitattaṃ*). What if I should first declare the Law to the Five Mendicants?" . . .[9] Then having stayed as long as I required at Uruvelā I went on my way to Benāres. . . .[10] [p. 171.] And journeying from place to place,[11] I came to Benāres, to Isipatana[12] the

[1] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [5].

[2] Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n; Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (17); Ch. 11 *c* § 11 [6] n; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] n; Ap. C *a* § 1 (95); Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [55]. This just and beautiful comparison will carry back the mind of anyone who has travelled in the country parts of India to many a lovely pool or 'tank' such as Gotama must often have gazed upon. Cp. Ch. 8 *f* § 2; Ap. I, *Note*; and Ch. 15 *b* § 2 (*pool*).

[3] Omitting repetitions. Omitting also the Buddha's reply to Brahmā Sahampati, which includes verses beginning 'Opened is the door of the Deathless (see § 6 n above) to those that can hear'; and the disappearance of Brahmā after salutations.

[4] See § 3 above. For the inherent toleration of Gotama's nature see Ap. B *b* § 3 [10] n.

[5] Omitting the announcement of Āḷāra's death by a deity or spirit. Int. § 93 (vi). A similar incident is given in the legend of Vipassin Buddha (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2), but without the angelic intervention.

[6] See § 3 above.

[7] Omitting repetitions and the announcement of Uddaka's death by a spirit. Int. § 93 (vi).

[8] See § 3 above; Ch. 3 § 7 n. See also Ch. 15 *a* § 6 [170].

[9] Omitting a statement that with his 'divinely clear and superhuman vision' (*cakkhunā*; Ap. B *c* § 1, 1) he saw the Five dwelling near Benāres, in the deer-park, at Isipatana.

[10] Omitting the meeting with Upaka; as in § 4 above (see Ap. C *b* § 2).

[11] Or gradually. Ch. 3 § 5 [166]; Ch. 5 *b* § 3; Ch. 7 *a* § 2.

[12] Possibly 'the Rishis' or Seers' alighting-place'. Int. §§ 30, 126. Cp. Isi-gili (Ch. 11 *c* § 8). In the *Sutta-nipāta* the spot is called Isi-vhaya; Ch. 13 *c* § 4 (6).

deer-park[1] (*yena Bārāṇasī Isipatanaṃ migadāyo*), where the Five Mendicants were.

§ 10.[2] 'And the Five Mendicants saw me from afar as I approached, and seeing me they agreed the one with the other,[3] saying: "Friend (*āvuso*), here comes the devotee[4] (*samaṇo*) Gotama, who lives in plenty, having given up effort, and turned back to the life of plenty. He should not be saluted, nor should we rise,[5] nor take his bowl and robe;[6] but we should prepare a place[7] (*āsanaṃ*), and if he wishes he will sit down." But as I drew near to them the Five Mendicants could not abide by their agreement; and one among them coming to meet me took my bowl and robe, another assigned a place, another brought water for my feet (*pad-odakaṃ*).[8] Then they addressed me by name and saying "friend (*āvuso*)". Thereupon I said to the Five Mendicants: ". . .[9] [p. 172.] Hearken, mendicants, the Immortal (*amataṃ*)[10] has been gained (*adhigataṃ*). I teach, I show[11] the Law.[12] If you walk as I teach you will ere long (*nacirass' eva*) and in the present life (*diṭṭhe va dhamme*)[13] learn fully for yourselves[14] (*sayaṃ*),

[1] Or, to Benāres, to the deer-forest [called] Isipatana. Int. § 151; Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* § 3; Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 6 [171], 8 [248]. Isipatana is usually regarded as the name of the whole deer-park or forest, but may have been the name of the spot now called Sārnāth (cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 1, *grove*; also Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1] n). For deer-parks or forests (*miga-dāyā*) see Ch. 11 *c* § 24 (11); Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91]; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 12; Ap. E *c* i § 8 n; also Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56] n. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 10 (*vana-dāya*); Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155] (*vaṃsa-dāya*).

[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 3.

[3] Ch. 1 § 6 n.

[4] Or recluse. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].

[5] Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89].

[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 8 *j* § 3 [2].

[7] Ch. Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482]; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] (*mat*); Ch. 22 *a* § 5 [21] (*fourfold*).

[8] Int. § 190 (*bathing*); Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (16); Ch. 11 *d* §§ 9, 15 [2]; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]. The *Mahā-vagga* account is here slightly different and adds a footstool and a towel (SBE, xiii, p. 92; cp. Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10]; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]).

[9] Omitting an admonition by the Teacher to the Five not to address him by name or with the appellation 'friend'; Ch. 3 § 5 (*āvuso*); and Int. § 190 (*address*); see Ch. 5 *b* § 1 n; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3] n. Omitting also the following phrase: 'The Tathāgata (Ap. A 2 *c*), O mendicants, is a Saint (*arahaṃ*) and supremely Enlightened (*sammā-sambuddho*)'. Both of these suggest a zealous narrator, and are discordant with the plain tone attributed to the Master in his decisions prevailingly in the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga*; cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14] n, and Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [3] n. It may be observed that the Five in their next speech repeat the phrase 'friend Gotama'; cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 6.

[10] The Eternal, i.e. the Universal (Ap. G 2 *a*), the Self-same (Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45] n); or the transcendence of the mortal self (Ap. F 2 *d*, *sammā-samādhi*). See § 6 n above; Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2] n; Ap. A 2 *a* (15); Ap. C *b* §§ 2, 11 (374); Ap. G 2 *a* § 6.

[11] Declare, make plain. Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [1].

[12] Truth; the scheme of things. Int. § 13; Ch. 15 *a* § 6 [172]; Ch. 22 *o* § 13 [23].

[13] Int. § 33; Ap. C *b*; Ap. D *c* § 3. The doctrine that all intelligent and earnest men, not only one or two extraordinary saints long prepared for enlightenment, may attain, through the Dhamma, Nibbāna in this life, cuts the ground from under the doctrine of Saṃsāra and personal Karma almost as thoroughly as does Buddha's *an-atta* theory (Ap. E *c* i).

[14] Gotama constantly declares that his doctrine is not difficult to learn, and that it must be mastered by the learner himself, not merely accepted. Int. §§ 10, 44; Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; Ap. B *c* § 5; Ap. E *c* ii § 1; Ap. G 1 *a* (iv).

realize[1] and having attained abide in the supreme[2] fulfilment of the holy life[3] (*brahmacariya-pariyosānaṃ*), for the sake of which the clansmen (*kula-puttā*)[4] rightly go forth (*pabbajanti*)[5] from the household to the houseless life." When I had thus spoken the Five Mendicants said to me: "By those [ascetic] practices, friend Gotama, by those exercises and austerities, thou didst not attain to powers beyond human [nature],[6] to pre-eminence in truly noble knowledge and vision (*alaṃ-ariya-ñāna-dassana-visesaṃ*).[7] Now that thou livest in plenty, having given up effort and turned back to the life of plenty, how shouldst thou attain . . . insight?" . . .[8] When they had thus spoken I said to the Five Mendicants: "Are you conscious, mendicants, that I have not spoken to you in this manner before?" "Not in this manner, revered Sir (*bhante*)." . . .[9] [p. 173.] And then I was able to make the Five Mendicants understand.'[10] . . .[11]

b. The First Sermon[12]

(i) *Commentarial account*

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā), JN, pp. 81–2[13]

§ 1. [JN, p. 81.] The Five Mendicants[14] saw the Leader[15] (*Tathāgataṃ*) from afar as he approached. . . .[16] [p. 82.] Then having concentrated the loving mind (*mettacittaṃ saṃkhipitvā*),[17] which reached out universally to all spirits and men (*sabba-deva-manusesu*)[18] he directed it specially towards them; and the Blessed One filled them with his loving mind. . . .[19] Then he pronounced to them the *Dhamma-cakka-*

[1] Or visualize. The verb is *saccni-karoti*. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii, 1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [4]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79] n.

[2] *Anuttara*; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3].

[3] Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [15]; Ch. 22 *b* § 20; cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [3]; also Ch. 15 *a* § 9 (*conclusion*). This is Nirvāna or Nibbāna (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ap. C *b*). Compare Ch. 5 *c* § 5; Ap. F 1 *c* (*quest*); also Ch. 14 *c* § 5 [189] (*Unshaken*), § 8 [2] (*Supreme*); Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vi) n. For *brahma-cariya* see also Ch. 3 § 5 [163]; Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 8 [2], 29 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 25 n; Ch. 23 *a* [9] n; Ap. F 2 *c*, n; and Int. § 32.

[4] Kshatriya or Rājput. 'Noble youths', SBE, xiii, p. 93. The word *kula-putta* perhaps implies membership of one of the dominant Kshatriya clans which had entered India from the mid-Himālayan region and ruled the 'Middle-land' at this period. Int. § 159; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 10 (*Licchavi-putto*).

[5] Int. § 187; Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [ix, 1]; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [3]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 9; Ch. 2 § 3; Ch. 5 *b* § 4; also Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11].

[6] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].

[7] Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200]; and Ch. 4 § 16; cp. Ap. B *c* § 1 (1). For *ariya* see Ch. 5 *b* § 5.

[8] Omitting the Buddha's denial of the charge that he lives in luxury; and repetitions.

[9] Omitting a second repetition of the phrases in which the Teacher is made to claim Supreme Buddhahood, and of the injunction to hearken.

[10] The Sutta thus only cursorily refers to the First Sermon proper (Ch. 5 *b* § [illegible] n).

[11] The Sutta is continued in Ch. 5 *c* § 6.

[12] IN 1; Int. § 34 (*doctrine*), § 66; Ap. C *a* § 3 n; Ap. C *b* § 5 (*truth*).

[13] Continued from Ch. 5 *a* § 1.

[14] In the text they are now called Elders (*therā*); Ap. A 1 *b* (2).

[15] Or Successor; Ap. A 2 *c* (*Tathāgatas*). See Ch. 15 *a* § 7.

[16] Omitting the agreement of the Five among themselves not to salute him.

[17] Ap. F 1 *b*.

[18] Ch. 6 *b* § 1.

[19] Omitting instructions on the mode of addressing a Buddha, as in Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n.

ppavatana Sutta (Discourse of the starting of the wheel of the Law).[1]

§ 2. Among these [Five Elders] Koṇḍañña[2] the Perceiver[3] (*Aññā-Koṇḍañña-thero*) gained knowledge (*ñāṇaṃ*) as the discourse proceeded; and when it ended, he . . .[4] was established in the reward of Stream-attaining[5] (*sotā-patti-phale patiṭṭhāsi*). Then the Teacher (*Satthā*),[6] dwelling there for the rainy season (*vassaṃ*),[7] sat in the vihāra[8] on the following day, talking to Vappa,[9] while the other four went begging for alms; and on that morning Vappa was established in the reward of Stream-attaining. Similarly, on the next day Bhaddiya,[10] on the following day Mahānāma,[11] on the following day Assaji,[12] were all established in the reward of Stream-attaining. Then on the fifth day he summoned the Five together and pronounced to them the *An-atta-lakkhaṇa-Suttanta*[13] (Discourse on the absence of signs of a [permanent individual] Self);[14] and at the end of the discourse all the Five Elders were established in the reward of saintship (*arahatta-phale patiṭṭhahiṃsu*).[15]

(ii) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, vi, 10–29[16]

§ 3. [MV, I. vi. 10.] And journeying from place to place[17] the Blessed One came to Isipatana in the deer-park near Benāres, to the place where the Five Mendicants were. . . .[18] [16.] Then the Blessed One was able to make the Five Mendicants understand. Then the Five Mendicants once more listened willingly, hearkened, and gave attention to the Blessed One.

[1] See § 4 below; Int. §§ 24, 54, 97; Ch. 7 *b* § 1; Ch. 15 *a* § 7 [82]; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8]; Ap. C *b* § 2. The wheel (*cakka*) may indicate empire (the chariot of an Emperor), or continuity (causation), or completion (of thought); or further the completeness of a circle or community: Ch. 14 *c* § 3; Ap. B *c*, *Note* (*Ajanta*); also Ch. 15 *a* § 8; and Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14].

[2] Ch. 1 § 6; Ch. 5 *c* § 1; Ch. 10 *c* (1).

[3] Ch. 5 *c* § 7.

[4] Omitting 'with eighteen hundred thousand holy ones' (or Brahmās; *attharasahi Brahmakotīhi saddhiṃ*). Int. § 93 (ii); Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n.

[5] Or, conversion. Ap. D *c* § 3 [7].

[6] Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13]; Ap. A 1 *b* (14); Ap. E *b* § 2.

[7] Ch. 8 *a*.

[8] The rest-house for wandering religious teachers. Int. § 124.

[9] Ch. 5 *c* § 9.

[10] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3] n; Ch. 10 *c* [1] (7).

[11] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1] n.

[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 16.

[13] Or *Sutta* (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*). Ch. 5 *c*.

[14] Ch. 5 *c*; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 5 [1] n, 19 [4] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 7; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; cp. Ch. 4 § 16 (*puna-bbhavo*), § 17 (*bhav-āsavā*). Fausböll's edition, p. 82, reads *Anantalakkhaṇasuttantaṃ*, which might mean 'Discourse on the signs of the Eternal' (cp. Ap. G 2 *a*).

[15] Ap. D *c* § 3 [15]. It is noticeable that there is here no mention of any intermediate stages (Ch. 21 § 2 [6–9] n). The text is continued in Ch. 6 *a* § 1.

[16] Continued from Ch. 5 *a* § 4.

[17] Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171].

[18] As in Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*Majjh. Nik.*, *Sutta 26*), except that the 3rd person is used instead of the 1st.

§ 4. *Unfolding.*[1] [17.] Then the Blessed One instructed (*āmantesi*)[2] the Five Mendicants thus:[3]

'These two extremes,[4] mendicant brothers, are not to be approached by him who has withdrawn[5] [from the world]. Which two? On the one hand that which is linked and connected with lust through sensuous pleasures (*kāmesu*),[6] and is low (*hīno*), ignorant, vulgar, ignoble (*an-ariyo*),[7] and profitless (*an-attha-saṃhito*);[8] and on the other hand that which is connected with self-mortification,[9] and is painful (*dukkho*), ignoble and profitless. Avoiding both these extremes, mendicant brothers, the middle road (*majjhimā paṭipadā*)[10] . . .[11] bringing insight,[12] bringing knowledge, leads to tranquillity (*upasamāya*),[13] to highest knowledge (*abhiññāya*),[14] to full enlightenment (*sambodhāya*),[15] to Peace (*nibbānāya*).[16] [18.] And, mendicant brothers, what middle road . . .[17] leads to Peace? It is indeed this Noble Eightfold Path (*ariyo*[18]

[1] See § 1 above; Int. §§ 16, 24; Ap. B *c*, *Note* and § 5 [6] n. The *Mahā-vagga* account of these incidents has hitherto followed Sutta 26 of the *Majjhima Nikāya* word for word; it now gives the First Sermon (omitted by *Majjh.* 26), taking it verbatim from the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* (§§ 9 n and 10 n below). The phrasing shows that the *Mahā-vagga* introduction is a mosaic (IN 6, *Canon*).

[2] Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1].

[3] What follows is plainly a summarized form, not the whole, of the First Sermon. It appears in several places in the Canon (see § 10 n below), and there seems to be no sufficient reason to doubt its substantial accuracy. Gotama had several weeks in which to prepare and fix the outline of his first discourse, and this he would naturally use on many occasions, and it would eventually be repeated by his hearers, though the simple Assaji was unable to repeat it to Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [4]).

[4] These two may be briefly described as material selfishness and spiritual egoism. Between them will be found altruism, which forgets itself in active well-doing. Ch. 6 *b* § 1.

[5] Or, by one who has gone forth (*pabbajitena*). Ch. 5 *a* § 10.

[6] Ch. 4 § 17; Ap. D *a* § 1; see § 6 below. *Kāma* means rather sense-pleasure than lust; see Ch. 13 *d* § 8.

[7] Ap. I *b* § 5 [18]. See below (*ariya*). Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (4, *kad-ariya*).

[8] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).

[9] The Pāli word used is *atta-kilamatha*. Ch. 3 § 7 n; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] (*burnt away*); Ap. B *b* § 3 [8]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 [11]; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *c* (*Penances*).

[10] Int. §§ 17, 62, 84, 101; Ch. 22 *b* § 24 [5]; see § 8 below (*paṭipadā*); also Ap. B *c* § 5 (*majjhena*). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4] n; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] n; Ch. 8 *k*; Ch. 13 *a* § 8 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354]; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 4] n; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5 (*nakedness*) n. The 'roads approaching unperturbedness' are described in *Majjh.* 106 (Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]).

[11] Omitting 'revealed by the Tathāgata'. Ap. A 2 *c*. Cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] n.

[12] Or, vision. The Pāli word is *cakkhu*. Ch. 5 *a* § 6; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175].

[13] Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [244]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (368); Ap. G 1 *b* § 2 [14]; also Ap. C *b* § 1 (*nirodha*). This and the three succeeding qualities appear together in Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6), preceded by three others.

[14] See Ap. I, *Note* for scholastic developments of *abhiññā*; Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*).

[15] Cp. Ch. 4 § 4 (*omniscience*); Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3].

[16] Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 3 § 5 [165]; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 13 *d* § 9; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 22 *b* § 16 n; Ap. C *b*; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; and Int. § 33.

[17] Omitting repetitions.

[18] See above (*an-ariya*); and § 5 below; Ch. 5 *c* § 4; Ap. C *b* § 5; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6]; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]; Ap. F 1 *c* [161]; Ap. F 2 *b* [6] n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 1. Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 8 n *ayya*).

aṭṭh-aṅgiko maggo),[1] namely, right outlook (*sammā-diṭṭhi*),[2] right will (*sammā-saṃkappo*),[3] right speech (*sammā-vācā*),[4] right action (*sammā-kammanto*),[5] self-discipline (*sammā-ājīvo*),[6] right activity (*sammā-vāyāmo*),[7] right self-knowledge (*sammā-sati*),[8] right self-transcendence (*sammā-samādhi*).[9] This middle road, mendicant brothers, . . . leads to Peace.

§ 5. '*First Truth.*[10] [19.] Now again, mendicant brothers, this is *the Noble Truth*[11] *as to* Sorrow[12] (*dukkhaṃ ariya*[13]*-saccaṃ*); earthly existence (*jāti*)[14] indeed is sorrowful (*dukkhā*), decay[15] is sorrowful, disease is sorrowful, death is sorrowful, union with the unpleasing is sorrowful, separation from the pleasing[16] is sorrowful, the wish which one does

[1] Int. § 53; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]; Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9]; Ch. 21 § 15 [7]; Ch. 22 *b* § 16; Ap. F 2 *d* (*Saṃ. Nik.*); see § 8 below (*maggo*); also Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3] (*magg-āmagga*). For a canonical explanation of the Eightfold Path see Ch. 9 *a* § 13.

[2] Right views, SBE, xi, p. 147; right belief, SBE, xiii, p. 95; right views, ThB, p. 87. Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4]; Ch. 20 § 7 (6); Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2]. Cp. Ch. 13 *d* § 9; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1); Ap. H 4 *a* § 2; also Ch. 20 § 4 (7, *paññā*), and Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (1) n (*mano*). The prefix *sammā-* means 'complete (completely)', 'perfect (perfectly)', Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*. Cp. § 10 below; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [6]; Ap. E *c* i § 6 [3]; Ap. H 1 § 6 [7] n; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (1); also Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3] (*samīci*). *Sammā* (right) and *micchā* (wrong) as prefixes are opposed in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 237–8).

[3] Right aspirations, SBE, xi; right aspiration, SBE, xiii; right intention, ThB. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vii) n; Ch. 21 § 16 (*resolve*); Cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 (6, *thought*).

[4] Right speech, SBE. xi, SBE, xiii, ThB. Ap. B *b* § 3 (6, *word*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9]. Cp. Ch. 20 § 3 (2).

[5] Right conduct, SBE, xi, SBE, xiii; right action, ThB. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6] (*deed*); Ap. F 2 *c* § 2 (21). See Ap. F; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii, 1] (*virtue*).

[6] Right livelihood, SBE, xi, ThB; right means of livelihood, SBE, xiii. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (5). Cp. Int. § 183 n; Ap. E *c* ii; also *Majjh.* 78 (PTS, ii, pp. 24, 25).

[7] Right effort, SBE, xi, ThB; right endeavour, SBE, xiii. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 n. Ch. 20 § 8 (*sīla*); Ch. 22 § 25 (*earnestly labour*); Ap. E *c* ii, *Note*; Ap. F.

[8] Or, self-examination. Right mindfulness, SBE, xi, ThB; right memory, SBE, xiii. This seems to be the knowledge that individuality or personality is transitory, sorrowful, and without permanent self. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (7); Ch. 11 *c* § 15 n; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [4]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425] n; Ap. D *c* § 3; Ap. E *c* i § 7 [3] n; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*self-scrutiny*). Cp. Ch. 9 *a* (*sati-paṭṭhāna*); Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2] (*maraṇa-sati*).

[9] Right contemplation, SBE, xi; right meditation, SBE, xiii; right concentration, ThB; right rapture, RDB, p. 51. This is the culminating point at which the mind escapes from the sense-pleasures and selfish desire (Ap. D), and enters upon Nibbāna in this life (Ap. C *b* § 6). Ch. 4 § 13; Ch. 20 §§ 5 (6), 7 (5); Ch. 22 *b* § 16 n; Ch. 23 *a* [9] n; Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-transcendence*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Compare Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3] (*visuddhi*); Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [2] (*supreme*); Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265] (*unperturbedness*); also Ch. 5 *c* § 5 (*brahma-cariya*); Ap. E *a*, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [24] n; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14, veil).

[10] For a canonical explanation of the Four Noble Truths see Ch. 9 *a* §§ 10–13.

[11] The words in italics may be later additions, see § 7 n below.

[12] Or, suffering Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [9]; Ap. E *b*. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 2; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28]; also Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [111] n (*soka*). This is the truth that 'all individuality (*saṃkhārā*) is sorrowful' (Ap. E, *Note*) unless transcended. The just translation of *dukkhaṃ* here is rather 'sorrow' than 'pain'. Gotama did not teach that pain can be eliminated from life, but that the sting of it, sorrow, can be cancelled through self-forgetfulness and the selfless activity of the Path.

[13] See § 4 above. The word *ariya* (Aryan, Noble) is practically equivalent to 'Buddhist': Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 20 [7], 21 [5] n; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6]; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]; Ap. H 1 § 6 [8]. Cp. Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [6]; Ch. 16 *d* 2 [12] (*Aryan*). It is used also of pre-Buddhist philosophy: Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200].

[14] Literally, birth. Ch. 9 *a* § 10; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *jāti*).

[15] Or, old age. Cp. Ch. 1 § 9.

[16] Ap. B *a* § 3 [3]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 10.

not fulfil is sorrowful—in brief desirous transient individuality (*panc'*[1] *upādāna*[2] *kkhandhā*[3]) is sorrowful.

§ 6. '*Second Truth.*[4] [20.] Again, mendicant brothers, this is *the Noble Truth as to* the Origin[5] of Sorrow (*dukkha-samudayaṃ ariya-saccaṃ*); it is this recurring[6] craving (*taṇhā*)[7] associated with enjoyment[8] and desire,[9] seeking enjoyment everywhere,[10] namely, the craving for sense-pleasures (*kāma-taṇhā*),[11] the craving for individual existence (*bhava-taṇhā*),[12] the craving for super-existence (*vi-bhava-taṇhā*).[13]

§ 7. '*Third Truth.*[14] [21.] Again, mendicant brothers, this is *the*

[1] Ap. D *a* § 9.

[2] Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14] n; Ap. C *b* § 6; Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*). Cp. § 6 below (*taṇhā*).

[3] Literally, the five grasping aggregations. Int. § 97; Ch. 5 *c* § 1 n; Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [7]; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2); Ap. E *a*; Ap. E *b* § 2; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; and Int. § 24. 'The fivefold clinging to existence', SBE, xiii, p. 95; 'The five khandhas of grasping', ThB, p. 87.

[4] Ap. D *a* § 1.

[5] Int. § 37; Ch. 4 § 10 [2]; Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [5]; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *samudaya*); and IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*) n. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; also Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13] (*uppāda*) n; and Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [11] n.

[6] Pāli, *pono-bbhavikā*; usually translated as 'causing the renewal of existence (or re-birth)'. IN 1; Int. §§ 6, 24; Ch. 9 *a* § 11; Ap. E *b* § 2; also *Dīgha Nik.* iii, p. 57; cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [5] (*increases*). The epithet causing re-birth is deterrent, and appeals to that very craving which it reprobates. The word might mean 'concerning itself with further existence'; cp. note below on *vi-bhava taṇhā*.

[7] Int. §§ 19, 112; Ap. D *a*. Cp. § 5 above (*upādāna*); Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [2] n; Ap. F 1 *c* (*right desire*).

[8] Or, pleasure; Pāli *nandi*. Ap. E *b* § 3 (1); cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411].

[9] Pāli *rāga*. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii); Ap. E *b* § 3 (2).

[10] Pāli *tatra-tatra*; literally here and there.

[11] See § 4 above; Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2].

[12] Craving for selfhood; or, craving for bliss in a future existence. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 17 (*bhav-āsava*); Ch. 13 *a* § 6 (*existence*); Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [108]; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411]; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *bhava*); also Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8] (*bhavissāmi*).

[13] Perhaps, craving for higher-existence. 'Craving for success (in this present life)', SBE, xi; 'thirst for prosperity', SBE, xiii; 'craving for non-existence', ThB; 'desire for non-existence', A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), p. 275. 'Childers on the authority of Vigesiṇha, says: "The former (*bhava-taṇhā*] applies to the sassata-diṭṭhi, and means a desire for an eternity of existence; the latter (*vibhava-taṇha*] applies to the ukkheda-diṭṭhi [Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9] and means a desire for annihilation in the very first (the present) form of existence"' (SBE, xi, p. 149). If this threefold division of *taṇhā* is Gotama's, and not an explanatory interpolation (Ch. 9 *a* §§ 11 n, 14 n), it probably has some relation to the two extremes (*antā*), between which lies the middle path. In this case the gross desires of the sensual man, the pious man's craving for bliss hereafter (Ap. C *a* § 2), and the Hindu ascetic's longing to escape from the risks of even heavenly bliss, would seem to constitute the three classes of egoistic desire, the first two relating to personal enjoyment and the third to release therefrom, or otherwise the first relating to pleasure in this world, and the last two to bliss hereafter (Cp. Int. § 105, and note above on *pono-bbhavikā*). Cp. 'The three [directions of] craving, to wit, craving for life in the sphere of sense, for life in the brahma (*rūpa*) world, for life in the higher worlds': Rhys Davids, *Dialogues of the Buddha* [*Dīgha Nikāya*], Part III, p. 209. Oldenberg (*Buddha*, 1923, p. 147 n) refers to the *Itivuttaka* (Sayings of the Buddha), p. 43, as establishing that the third term (*vibhava-taṇhā*) does not mean 'thirst for power (Durst nach Macht)', but 'thirst for non-existence (Vergänglichkeitsdurst)'. A simpler interpretation is suggested by Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3). What is censured is the sense of individuality and of separate interests; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 6 [266]. Cp. also Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) *arūpa-rāga*.

[14] Ap. D *a* § 6. See Ap. B *a* § 4 [2] n.

Noble Truth[1] *as to* the Cessation[2] of Sorrow (*dukkha-nirodhaṃ ariya-saccaṃ*); it is the cessation of this very craving, so that no remnant or trace of it remains[3]—its abandonment,[4] its renouncement, liberation (*mutti*)[5] from it, detachment (*an-alayo*)[6] from it.

§ 8. '*Fourth Truth.*[7] [22.] And this once more, mendicant brothers, is *the Noble Truth as to* the road leading to the Cessation of Sorrow (*dukkha-nirodha-gāminī patipadā*[8] *ariya-saccaṃ*); it is indeed that Noble Eightfold Path (*maggo*),[9] namely, right outlook, right will, right speech, right action, right self-discipline, right activity, right self-knowledge, right self-transcendence.

§ 9. '*Freedom.* [23.] . . .[10] [28.] As soon, mendicant brothers, as my knowledge and insight (*ñāṇa-dassanaṃ*)[11] concerning these four noble truths . . .[12] were pure, I knew that I had attained supreme and full enlightenment (*sammā-sambodhiṃ*).[13] . . .[14] [29.] The knowledge now as a thing seen[15] arose in me: "The liberation of my mind (*me ceto*

[1] See § 5 above, and § 8 below.

[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 6 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4]; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2) *nirodha*; Ap. E *b* § 2; Ap. G 1 *a* §§ 3 (5), (6), 5 (1). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 19; Ch. 20 § 6 (7); Ap. C *b* § 1; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14). This implies the eradication of selfish craving, not of unselfish desire and action (Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [18]; Ap. F 1; Ap. F 1 *c*, *Quest*; Ap. F 2 *d*, *right act*). One must distinguish further the cessation of sensation (Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] n, *non-perception*, and the cessation of individual existence (Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]).

[3] The Pāli terms are *a-sesa* (without remainder; cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] n, and Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92], *complete*), and *vi-rāga* (without colour, without trace). Ch. 2 § 2 n; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1, *virāgā*). Cp. also Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7] n, *sammā*.

[4] Or, renunciation (*cāga*). Ch. 8 *l* § 2; cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13] (*pahāna*).

[5] Int. § 112; Ch. 4 § 17.

[6] Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 2 [v, 2]; Ch. 5 *c* § 4 [10]; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [6]; Ch. 9 *a* [2] (*independent*); Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]; Ap. C *b* § 6; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*vivekaja*), [175] (*adherence*).

[7] Ap. D *a* § 6 n; see § 7 above.

[8] Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2]. See § 4 above (*majjhima patipadā*, the middle road). This is identified with *paññā* or insight in Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; cp. Ap. D *b* § 6 [3]. It is described elsewhere (Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]) as leading to the Unattained, the Unapproached, the Unrealized.

[9] The definition of the Path is repeated as in § 4 above (*maggo*). The position of the formula of the Noble Eightfold Path at the opening and again at the close of the Four Noble Truths is significant and emphasizes the fact that the Path is the main principle of the Dhamma. It is active altruism that Gotama inculcates, not passive self-negation. Ap. F 2 *d*; also Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [3]. See also Int. § 98.

[10] Omitting a threefold statement regarding each of the four Truths, namely, that it exists, that it must be mastered, and that it has been mastered by the Buddha. This has the appearance of monkish exegesis and elaboration, and the same may be said of much of the succeeding portion of the discourse as it has come down to us. The statement of each of the Truths mentions that it was 'among doctrines not heard before' (*pubbe an-anussutesu dhammesu*; cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6). This passage and the whole of the narrative down to the close of Koṇḍañña's conversion has been borrowed by the *Mahā-vagga* compiler from the *Sam. Nik.* (See § 4 n above, and § 10 n below).

[11] Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92]; cp. Ch. 4 § 16; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3].

[12] Omitting 'with the threefold modifications and [consequently] twelve divisions'.

[13] Ch. 4 § 4; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8].

[14] Omitting 'in the sphere of gods (*sa-devake loke*), of Māra (Int. § 93, iv), of Brahmā (Int. § 93, ii), and in the world of samaṇas (devotees, Ap. A 2 *d*) and brāhmans (Ap. F 2, iii), of spirits (Ch. 6 *b* § 1) and men'. These details are apparently a scholastic definition of the universe comprehended by the Buddha; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 n; Ch. 22 *a* § 2 [18] n; cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 8 [248] n.

[15] Or, clearly. This passage is drawn from Sutta 26, *Majjh. Nik.* (Ch. 4 § 16).

vimutti)[1] is established, separate existence[2] is here-ended, there is not now survival".'[3] Thus spoke the Blessed One; the Five Mendicants, rejoicing,[4] welcomed the word[5] (*bhāsitaṃ*) of the Blessed One.[6]

(iii) *Nikāya accounts*

§ 10. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sacca-saṃyutta (Saṃ. lvi), Sutta 11 (Tathāgatena vutta). First Sermon; the Four Truths*[7]

Reverence[8] to that Blessed One, the Saint Supremely Enlightened (*Namo tassa Bhagavato*[9] *arahato*[10] *sammā-sambhuddhassa*).[11]

[PTS, v, p. 420.] Thus was it heard by me (*Evaṃ me sutaṃ*).[12] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Benāres[13] (*Bārāṇasiyaṃ*) at

[1] Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 6 *a* § 8 [11]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [208]; also Ap. D *a* § 6; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. For *ceto* or *citta* cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 4 [12]; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20]; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91]; Ch. 13 *d* § 9; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [10]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [201]; Ch. 22 *b* § 27; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 n; Ap. I *a* § 4; Ap. I *b* §§ 3, 6 [22].

[2] 'This is my last birth', SBE, xiii, p. 97. See Ch. 4 § 16 (*Majjh.* 26, from which the whole passage is taken); cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8].

[3] Ch. 5 *c* § 6; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 5. 'Hence I shall not be born again', SBE, xiii. The statement apparently is general, not particular (cp. Ap. B *a*). The point is expanded in the Second Sermon (*An-atta-lakkhaṇa Sutta*, Ch. 5 *c*).

[4] Or, pleased; *attamanā*. Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [102]; cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1] (*displeased*).

[5] This closing formula is as usual in the Suttas as the opening formula 'Thus have I heard (*Evaṃ me sutaṃ*).' These are part of the conventional framework into which the discourses in the *Sutta Piṭaka* are fitted (IN 6). Ch. 9 *a* § 14; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [5]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [426]; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [25]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (7). See § 10 [420] below; also Ap. B *b* § 3 (4) n; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [1].

[6] The *Mahā-vagga* narrative is continued in Ch. 5 *c* § 7 where Koṇḍañña's complete conversion is described. His conversion is attained when he realizes that everything subject to origination is also subject to cessation. This conclusion does not follow consequentially upon anything said in the First Sermon, but follows logically enough on the matter of the Second Sermon. The compiler of the *Mahā-vagga* account has added the First and Second Sermons to the narrative contained in Sutta 26 of the *Majjhima Nikāya* (Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n; see §§ 4 n, 9 n above; Ch. 5 *c* § 1 n; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] n), but (following exactly the setting given by the reporter of the first of these Suttas in the *Saṃyutta Nikāya*) has separated the two discourses and placed the conversion of Koṇḍañña and his companions between the two, whereas it seems evident that their full enlightenment followed on the realization of the transience of individuality, which is the subject of the *Anattalakkhaṇa Sutta*. This latter therefore is here placed immediately after the First Sermon.

[7] The First Sermon as given in the introductory part of the *Mahā-vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka* is taken word for word from the present passage (see §§ 4 n, 9 n above). In the *Tika-nipāta* of the *Aṅguttara Nikāya* (PTS, i, pp. 176–7) the central and essential portion of the First Sermon, namely the Four Truths, is restated, combined with a repetition of the law of Dependent Origination (Ap. B *c*); and similarly in Sutta 22 of the *Dīgha Nikāya* (*Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna Sutta*, Ch. 9 *a* § 9 [17]) it appears with a commentary or explanation, attributed to the Buddha. In *Majjh.* 141 (Ch. 15 *a* § 8) the Four Truths are stated concisely by Buddha and followed by a commentary by Sāriputta.

[8] This is the customary formula preceding a Sutta when written separately. Cp. Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2] (*homage*).

[9] Ch. 22 *b* § 5 [9]; Ap. E *b* § 2.

[10] Ch. 15 *a* § 8; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [4]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [1]; Ap. D *c*; Ap. F 1 *b* § 5; Ap. H 1 § 6. Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (*worthy*).

[11] Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [3] n; Ch. 20 § 10 [17]; Ap. H 1 § 5; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]; also Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3]. See § 4 n above (*sammā*). Cp. the phrases in Ch. 23 *a* [9].

[12] See § 9 n above; Ch. 9 *a* § 1. The oral tradition of the Sermons was the essential part of Buddhist learning (Ch. 8 *l* § 2).

[13] Or, near Benāres. Ch. 10 *b* § 1; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 25 (*Veḷuvane*); Ch. 13 *c* § 4 (*gāme*).

Isipatana in the deer-park[1] (*Isipatane migadāye*). There the Blessed One addressed the company of Five Mendicants (*pañca-vaggiye bhikkhu*).[2] . . .[3] [p. 423.] The Five Mendicants, rejoicing, welcomed the word of the Blessed One. . . .[4]

c. THE SECOND SERMON;[5] THE FIRST SIX ARAHATS[6]

(i) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, vi. 38–46[7]

§ 1. *No lasting principle in individuality.* [MV, I. vi. 38.] And the Blessed One spoke to the Five Mendicants[8] thus: 'The material-form[9] (*rūpaṃ*), mendicant brothers, is not a permanent-self (*an-attā*).[10] If the material-form, mendicant brothers, were a permanent-self, the material-form would not be liable to deterioration (*ābādhāya*),[11] and it could be assumed[12] of the material-form "My material-form must be thus[13] (*evaṃ me rupaṃ hotu*), or not be thus (*evaṃ me rupaṃ mā ahosi-ti*)". But since the material-form is not a permanent-self, therefore the material-form is liable to deterioration, and it cannot be assumed of it "My material-form must be thus, or not be thus". [39.] Sensation[14] (*vedanā*) is not a permanent-self. If sensation were a permanent-self, sensation would not be liable to deterioration, and it could be assumed of sensation "My sensation must be thus, or not be thus". . . .[15] [40.] Perception (*saññā*)[16] is not a permanent-self. If perception

[1] Ch. 5 *a* § 9.

[2] Ch. 1 § 6.

[3] As in *Mahā-vagga* introduction (see §§ 4–9 above); also in Ap. D *a* §§ 1, 6, and in Ap. F 2 *d* (*Saṃ. Nik.*). Omitting further elaboration of the threefold modifications of each of the Four Truths, due apparently to a scholastic desire to enhance and emphasize (IN 6, *Canon*; see § 9 n above). See Int. § 24 (*Truths*).

[4] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] n, [31] n.

[5] Ch. 4 § 16 n; Ch. 5 *b* §§ 2, 9 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9] n; Ap. B *c*, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*; also Ap. E *a* (*Khandhā*); and Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [3] (*eye*). The Second Sermon or *Anattalakkhaṇa Sutta* (Discourse on the signs of a non-permanent self) is taken from the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* where it appears as the *Pañca Sutta* (*Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta, Sutta 59*; *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 59). Cp. Ch. 18 *f* § 1.

[6] Ap. D *c*.

[7] In the *Mahā-vagga* account the Second Sermon is placed after the conversion or enlightenment of the Five (see § 10 below).

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 2 (*Koṇḍañña*).

[9] Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]. 'Body', SBE, xiii, p. 100. For the five constituents of transient individuality, visible and percipient, see Ap. E *a* ii (*Khandhā*), and Ch. 5 *b* § 5; see also Ap. G 2 *b* § 1 [4]. Whether this fivefold division was original or not, in Buddhism, such speculations on the nature of the individual soul and the universe were common among Gotama's contemporaries. Ap. G 2 *c*; cp. Keith, *Buddh. Phil.* (1923), pp. 94–5; ThB, p. 130.

[10] 'Is not the self', SBE, xiii; 'is soulless', ThB, p. 88; 'is not an Ego' Warren, p. 146. The word *attan* means self, and implies indestructible unity (Int. § 39, *stable*), or self-sameness. Int. § 39 n; Ap. E, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i; Ap. I, *Note*.

[11] 'Disease', SBE, xiii. See § 2 below; cp. § 7 [29] below (*cessation*). The ideal of an incorruptible Self is implied (Ap. G 2 *a* § 5).

[12] i.e. foretold. 'We should be able to say', SBE, xiii.

[13] Because it is permanent, not liable to decay.

[14] Ch. 9 *a* § 3 [11]; Ch. 11 *c* § 14 n.

[15] Omitting repetitions.

[16] Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [108]; Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

were a permanent-self, perception would not be liable to deterioration, and it could be assumed of it "My perception must be thus or not be thus". . . . The individual-character[1] (*saṃkhārā*) is not a permanent-self. If individual-character were a permanent-self, it would not be liable to deterioration, and it could be assumed of it "My individual-character must be thus, or not be thus". . . . [41] Consciousness[2] (*viññāṇaṃ*) is not a permanent-self. If consciousness were a permanent-self, consciousness would not be liable to deterioration and it could be assumed of it "My consciousness must be thus, or not be thus".' . . .

§ 2. [42] 'Again what think you, mendicant brothers? Is the material-form permanent (*niccaṃ*) or impermanent[3] (*a-niccaṃ*)?' 'Impermanent, revered sir (*bhante*).' 'But that which is impermanent, is that suffering[4] (*dukkhaṃ*) or happy (*sukhaṃ*)?' 'Suffering, revered sir.' 'That then which is impermanent, suffering, and by nature changeable (*vi-pariṇāma-*[5]*dhammaṃ*), is it proper to regard it thus "This is mine,[6] I am this, this is my permanent-self[7] (*etaṃ mama, eso 'ham asmi, eso me attā*)?"' 'No indeed, revered sir.' [43] 'Is sensation permanent? . . .[8] Is perception permanent? . . . Is individual-character permanent? . . . Is consciousness permanent? . . . That then which is permanent, suffering, and by nature changeable, is it proper to regard it thus "This is mine, I am this, this is my permanent self?"' 'No indeed, revered sir.'

§ 3. *Turning from individuality*. [44] 'And so, mendicant brothers, all material-form, whether past, future or present, whether within us (*ajjh-attaṃ*) or external, whether gross or subtle,[9] low or high, far or near, is to be regarded with right insight as it really is (*yathā-bhūtaṃ*) thus: "This is not mine, I am not this, this is not the permanent-self

[1] Or, will; composite unity. Ch. 4 § 18 [1]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; Ap. B *c* § 1 (2), § 2 (2); Ap. E, *Note*; Ap. E *a* and *Note* (*saṃkhāra*); Ap. E *a* ii § 2. 'Productions', SBE, xiii, p. 76 n; 'the Saṃkhāras', SBE, xiii, p. 100; 'the aggregates', ThB, p. 89. The word 'individuality', though in many respects a suitable translation, is etymologically altogether opposed to *saṃ-khārā* as the former implies indivisibility, and the latter implies compositeness and consequent liability to dissolution.

[2] Intellect; reason; or, the ego-mind. Ch. 11 *c* § 20 [18] n; Ap. B *c* § 3. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 4 [12] (*citta*). 'Consciousness', SBE, xiii; 'clear consciousness', KM, pp. 47, 51.

[3] Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [6]. See § 3 (not this) below; also Ap. E *a* i; and Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [3].

[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [12]; Ap. E *b*. 'That which is perishable does that cause pain?' SBE, xiii, p. 101. 'Is the impermanent painful?' ThB.

[5] See § 1 above; cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 4.

[6] See § 3 [45] (*not mine*) below; Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [3] n; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 6 [4], 7 [3]; Ap. D *a* § 3; Ap. E *c* i §§ 5 [5], 6 [3], 7 [8], 8 [19].

[7] Or, 'the [changeless, immortal] Spirit in me', 'My self', SBE, xiii; 'my soul', ThB; 'my Ego', Warren. Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8]; Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [2] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [11]; Ap. E *c* i. Cp. Ap. D *b* § 2 [6]; also Ch. 14 *c* §§ 5 [189], 8 [2] (*Soul*), 10 [6] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [4]. On the wider and narrower meanings of *ātman* (attan), *puriṣa*, *sattva*, and similar terms in early Sanskrit philosophical works see E. H. Johnston, *Early Sāṁkhya*, 1937, § 4 (*Life and the Soul*).

[8] Omitting repetitions.

[9] Cp. Ap. B *b* § 1 (*nāma-rūpa*). For this and the context see Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [12]; Ap. E *c* i § 7 [4]; also Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; and Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [4].

of me." [45] All sensation . . .[1] gross or subtle . . . all perception . . . gross or subtle . . . all individual-character . . . low or high . . . all consciousness . . . far or near is to be regarded with right insight as it really is thus: "This is not mine,[2] I am not this,[3] this is not the permanent-self of me."[4]

§ 4. [46] 'Regarding them thus, mendicant brothers, an instructed disciple of the Noble[5] becomes indifferent to (*nibbindati*)[6] material-form, becomes indifferent to sensation, becomes indifferent to perception, becomes indifferent to individual-character, becomes indifferent to consciousness.[7] Becoming indifferent he becomes free from desire (*vi-rajjati*); through non-desire (*vi-rāgā*)[8] he is liberated.[9]

§ 5. '*Release.* When he is liberated, there arises in him the knowledge, "I am liberated".[9] He knows "Separate-existence[10] (*jāti*) is ended (*khīnā*);[11] the holy-life (*brahmacariya*)[12] has been lived, what ought to be done (*karanīyaṃ*) has been done;[13] there is nothing beyond

[1] Omitting repetitions.

[2] i.e. is transitory. See § 2 [42] (*mine*) above; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; Ap. E *a*.

[3] Int. § 36; and Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n. Cp. § 2 [42] (*impermanent*) above; Ap. E, *Note* (*aniccā*); also Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] (*void*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*nothingness*). 'This discourse . . . shows the perishable nature of the five khandhas, and that the khandhas are not the self. But it does not deal with the question whether the self exists or not, in any other way', SBE, xiii, p. 100 n. The text presupposes that the *attan* (Self, Ego) can only be identified with an eternal entity. It is implied that individuality comprises the five constituents (the khandhas); but it seems further to be implied that there is in living beings not only individuality, but also a subconscious or perhaps rather super-conscious part, which is common to all and is the Attan, imperishable and universal (cp. § 7 n below; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [xiv]; Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]; Ap. E *a*, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 5). The absence of permanent individuality does not involve the absence of divinity any more than the transience of waves implies the absence of the ocean (cp. Ap. E *a* ii §§ 4, 5). Individuals (*saṃkhārā, dhammā*) may be regarded, in this respect, as waves rising upon and falling back into the surface of the divine, immortal, changeless ocean of the One, the All, the Self-same. Consciousness of this fundamental unity is possibly the sense of the *amata* (immortal), to which reference is frequently made in the Canon (Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ap. C *b* § 11, *Dhp.* 374).

[4] Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [2] n; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii) n.

[5] Or, noble Law. The Pāli word is *ariya*. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7]; and Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. See Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9].

[6] Or, feels aversion from. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4]. See Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9]; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411]; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [4]; Ap. B *a* § 2 [10]; Ap. E *a* i (277); Ap. E *c* i § 5 [2]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6); Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii). Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 9 *a* [2] (*independent*); Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3] (*visuddhi*); Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [7]; Ap. C *b* § 1 [2]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1); Ap. F 2 (ii, *upekkhā*); Ap. I *b* § 4 [8] (*avoid*), § 5 [18] (*turning away*).

[7] i.e. becomes indifferent to individuality and all its constituents.

[8] Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [422]; cp. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii) n.

[9] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[10] i.e. individual (or egoistic) existence. Better 'the sense of separate existence'. Ch. 22 *b* § 20. Cp. Ch. 4 § 16; see Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32].

[11] 'Re-birth is exhausted', SBE, xiii; 'destroyed is re-birth', ThB. See Ap. B *a*. The meaning of this difficult phrase may be that the separation of individuality from the divine and universal is over.

[12] Ch. 4 § 17. This is the life of the Arahat (Ap. D *c*; see § 8 below). It is led when the virtues called *brahma-vihārā* are practised (Ap. F 2 *b*). These virtues must be practised with diligence (Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7]). They are attained by transcending the individuality (Ch. 5 *b* § 4, *sammā-samādhi*; Ap. F 2 *d*, *self-transcendence*). See also § 8 below; Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 21 § 14 [50]; Ap. C *b* § 4; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5), (6); and Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vi) n.

[13] i.e. the ideal has been achieved; Ch. 22 *b* § 25 n.

(*n'āparaṃ*) this state (*itthattāya*).'''[1] [47] Thus spoke the Blessed One; the Five Mendicants, rejoicing, welcomed the word of the Blessed One.[2]

(ii) *Nikāya account*

Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26[3]

§ 6. [PTS, i, p. 173]. 'Then I was able to make the Five Mendicants understand. I instructed two of the mendicant brothers and three[4] mendicant brothers went to beg alms; and we six lived upon the alms which the three brought back; then I instructed three mendicant brothers and two mendicant brothers went to beg alms; and we six lived upon the alms which the two brought back. Thus the Five Mendicants were instructed and admonished by me, and they being themselves subjected[5] to earthly-existence[6] perceived the wretchedness of what is subjected to earthly-existence, and seeking the supreme peace of Nirvāna (*nibbānaṃ*) which is not affected by earthly-existence, attained the supreme peace of a Nirvāna not affected by earthly-existence;[7] being themselves subjected to decay[8] . . .[9] disease . . . death . . . grief . . . (and) defilement, perceived the wretchedness of what is subjected to (decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief . . . and) defilement, and attained the supreme peace of a Nirvāna not affected by (decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief . . . and) defilement.

'And the knowledge now as a thing seen arose in them: "Our liberation is established, separate-existence is here terminated, there is not now survival".'[10] . . .[11]

[1] Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 7 *a* § 6; Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9]; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [12]; Ap. E *b* § 3 (2); Ap. E *c* i §§ 5 [16] n, 6 [8]. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 (*survival*). Contrast Ch. 7 *b* § 2. 'There is no further return to this world', SBE, xiii; 'there is naught (for him) beyond this world', ThB. The implication appears to be that the egoistic fear of re-birth is unfounded. The whole Sutta is directed against egoism, individualism, or particularism. The phrases used here in the text constituted an often repeated formula. If they formed part of the original sermon they must be rendered in such a way as to harmonize with the main part of the discourse. The last phrase may now be interpreted in the light of contemporary Vedāntic (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*) monism as meaning —there is no individuality beyond this (temporary and delusory) individuality, i.e. the One is the end and origin of all and is in all.

[2] This whole passage, borrowed from the *Saṃ. Nik.*, shows that the Five were converted only after the Second Sermon (see § 7 n below). The *Mahā-vagga* narrative is continued in § 10 below.

[3] Continued from Ch. 5 *a* § 10. See Ap. I *a* § 1.

[4] See § 9 below.

[5] i.e. by their nature.

[6] Ch. 1 § 11.

[7] Or, by the sense of separate existence. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10.

[8] Or, old age.

[9] Omitting repetitions.

[10] Ch. 4 § 16; Ch. 5 *b* § 9; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [5] (*residue*).

[11] The narrative here ceases; for the concluding portion of this long and complex Sutta see Ch. 18 *b* § 5 n.

(iii) *Vinaya account resumed*

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, vi. 29–47

§ 7.[1] [MV, I. vi. 29] . . . When the discourse[2] had been set forth, there arose in the venerable[3] (*āyasmato*) Koṇḍañña the stainless clear vision of the Law (*dhamma-cakkhuṃ*):[4] 'Everything[5] that has by nature an origin[6] has also by nature a cessation[7] (*Yam kiñci samudaya-dhammaṃ, sabbaṃ taṃ nirodha-dhammaṃ*).' [30] [Thus] the wheel[8] of the Law[9] was started (*pavattite*) by the Blessed One . . .[10] [31] And

[1] The narrative in *Mahā-vagga*, I. vi. 29–31, corresponds word for word with the *Saṃyutta* narrative in the closing sections of the *Dhammacakkapavatana Sutta*, which contains the First Sermon proper (Ch. 5 *b* § 10), followed by the account of the miraculous events accompanying Koṇḍañña's conversion. The miraculous narrative does not claim to be given by the author of the Sermons themselves.

[2] According to the *Mahā-vagga* account (and *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Saṃyutta* 12, *Sutta* 11) this was the first Sermon, but there seem to be sufficient reasons for thinking it to have been the second. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 n; see § 5 n above.

[3] Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13]; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [i. 19]; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [100]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] n.

[4] See § 9 below; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9]; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii) n; also Ap. B *c* § 1 (1, *dibba-cakkhu*). Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6, *abhiññā*); Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*yoga, knowledge*); and Ch. 15 *a* § 6 [172] (*amata*). This is the *aññā* (perception or full knowledge of fundamental truth) announced by all the Saints in the books called *Thera-gāthā* and *Therī-gāthā* (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Khudda-Nikāya*); cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] (*aññā*); cp. also IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

[5] 'Whatsoever is subject to the condition of origination, is subject also to the condition of cessation', SBE, xiii, p. 97. Int. §§ 4 n, 39 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 12 [8], 19; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [12] n; Ch. 20 § 8 n. Cp. Ch. 1 § 10; Ch. 4 §§ 10, 11; Ap. E *c* i §§ 3 [29], 4 [7]; Ap. F 1 *c* [161]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 4. With this famous phrase compare the last words of Gotama: 'Vayadhammā saṃkhārā; appamādena sampādetha' (Perishable by nature are composites [i.e. individuality, personality]; labour diligently; Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7]). Taken along with the *an-atta* (Ap. E *c*) and *dukkha* (Ap. E *b*) doctrines these phrases can only mean that individuality is transient, so that individualistic grasping is waste of labour (Ch. 9, the *Mahā-satipaṭṭhana-S.*) as well as the cause of sorrow; and yet unceasing labour is necessary, but for others not for the self (Ap. D, Egoism; Ap. F 1 *b*). Mankind lasts, men perish (Ap. B *b*). The dying words of the Teacher are usually interpreted in a sense accordant with the doctrine of transmigration, so as to mean that salvation can be attained only by long effort through many re-births; and when once the doctrine of personal Karma was introduced into Buddhism such an interpretation became necessary, but it appears to be not only in direct conflict with the *an-atta* doctrine and the Four truths, but forced and unnatural in the context (IN 1; Ap. B *a*). The two famous phrases above clearly state (1) that the constituents of individuality dissolve, and (2) that the individual perishes; not (1) that the constituents of individuality dissolve, and (2) that the individual survives. The last conclusion being in opposition to the premiss would require a definite statement, and cannot be inferred.

[6] Or, origination (*samudaya*); Ch. 9 *a* [3]; also Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ap. B *c* § 5 [5]; Ap. D *b* § 6 [3]. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]; also Ch. 1 § 11 (*jāti*). It is implied in the Second Sermon that there is an eternal Uncaused-Cause (see § 3 n above) and from this all things caused originate (cp. Int. § 37, *Brahman*; Ap. B *c* § 3 n; Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 1; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1, 383). This highly metaphysical passage follows naturally on the Second Sermon, which is metaphysical and for the few, but could not be deduced from the First Sermon, which is ethical and for the many (Ap. G 1 *a*).

[7] Ch. 4 § 10 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [18]; Ch. 20 § 6 (7); Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3] n; Ap. I, *Note*; and Ch. 5 *b* § 7 n. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n; also § 1 [38] above; Ch. 4 §§ 16 (*decay*), 18; Ch. 9 *a* § 6 (*disappearance*); Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2] (*death*); Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2] (*transience*); Ap. E, *Note* (*self*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 5 (*vaya*).

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 1; Ap. C *b* § 2.

[9] IN 5 *b*.

[10] Omitting the triumphant shout of the earth-inhabiting spirits (*bhummā devā*; Int. § 93, vi), repeated by the spirits attendant on the Four Kings of the four

the Blessed One breathed forth this cry (*udānaṃ*): 'Koṇḍañña verily has perceived[1] (*aññāsi*); Koṇḍañña verily has perceived!' So the venerable Koṇḍañña received the name Aññāta-Koṇḍañña (Koṇḍañña the Perceiver).[2]

§ 8. [32] And the venerable Aññāta-Koṇḍañña having seen the Law, having attained the Law, having understood the Law, having immersed himself in the Law, having left uncertainty behind, having escaped from doubt, having attained confidence and not dependent on others (*a-para-ppaccayo*)[3] in the doctrine of the Teacher, said to the Blessed One: 'Master (*bhante*),[4] let me receive from the Blessed One ordination as one who has gone forth [from the world][5] and receive admission.'[6] The Blessed One replied: 'Come (*ehi*),[7] mendicant brother (*bhikkhu*)![8] Happily proclaimed (*sv-ākkhāto*)[9] is the Law, lead the holy-life (*brahma-cariyaṃ*)[10] for the complete ending[11] of sorrow.' This was the *upasampadā*-ordination of this venerable man (*āyasmato*).[12]

quarters of the firmament (*Catu-mahārājika devā*), the three-and-thirty spirits (*tāva-tiṃsa devā*), the *Yāmā devā*, the *Tusita devā*, the *Nimmānarati devā*, the *Paranimmitavasavatti devā*, and finally by the spirits of the highest world or gods of the Holy Body (*Brahma-kayikā devā*; Int. § 93, ii; Ch. 5 *b* § 2 n); with the quaking of the 'ten thousand world system' and miraculous light (Int. § 94, i; Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n). See Int. § 70; for further elaboration of the classes of spirits see KM, p. 58.

[1] Or, understood.

[2] Ch. 3 § 7; Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 10 *c* (1). On *aññāta* cp. Ch. 10 *c* (48) n; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 20 n (*abbhaññāsi*). At this point the *Saṃ. Nik.* account, which has been exactly followed by the compiler of the *Mahā-vagga* introductory narrative, closes (Ch. 5 *b* § 10).

[3] Int. § 35 (ii); Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [5]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 16 (*established*); Ap. G 10 (iv).

[4] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9]; Ch. 7 *a* § 8; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13]; Ap. B *b* §§ 1, 3 [2]. Contrast Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n.

[5] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56]; Ch. 22 *b* § 17. 'Let me receive the pabbajjā and upasampadā ordinations', SBE, xiii, p. 99. For the *pabbajjā* see Ap. H 2. Cp. Ch. 2 § 3; and Int. § 187 (*mendicancy*).

[6] On the *upasampadā* see Ap. H 2 *c*. The whole formula with the answer recurs constantly: Ch. 6 *a* § 10; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 3, 24. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3, 4].

[7] The formula '*Ehi bhikkhu*' is here said to have been the earliest form of admission to the Order. The first Khandhaka of the *Mahā-vagga* is entitled 'Admission to the Order of Bhikkhus', and claims to set forth an historical account of the development of the ordination ceremony from its earliest form, with an account of the Enlightenment and of the foundation of the Order (Ch. 4 § 9 n). The formulae for the admission of brethren and laymen are an essential part of the *Vinaya* and doubtless instituted the original nucleus of the introductory portion of the *Mahāvagga*. See Ch. 6 *a* § 1; Ch. 7 *a* § 1; Ch. 8 *d*; Ap. H 2, *Note*.

[8] Literally, beggar. The term was applied to any religious mendicant; Ch. 15 *b* § 4 [2]. After the institution of the Buddhist Order the word came to imply membership of the Buddhist confraternity. The translation 'mendicant brother' seems preferable to 'monk' or 'friar', which words have a different connotation. 'Almsman' is a close rendering but scarcely suggests a confraternity. Int. § 187; Ch. 1 § 10; Ch. 8 *h*.

[9] Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14]; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [108]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 6 [3]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii); Ap. H 1 § 6 [6].

[10] See § 5 above.

[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *nirodha*); Ap. H 2 *a* § 5. The sorrow to be uprooted is caused by selfhood (Ap. D, *Sorrow*). Cp. Ch. 7 *c*, final note; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*.

[12] *Āyasmat* and *thera* were titles given to the early disciples. Ch. 22 *b* § 22; Ap. A 1 *b* (2).

§ 9. [33] And the Blessed One instructed and admonished the remaining mendicants by discourse on the Law. Then there arose in the venerable Vappa[1] and the venerable Bhaddiya . . .[2] the stainless clear vision of the Law.[3] . . . [34] So was the *upasampadā*-ordination of these venerable men. [35] Then the Blessed One taking aside the remaining mendicants in this way instructed and admonished them by discourse on the Law. The six lived on the alms which three[4] brought back. [36–37] Then the venerable Mahānāma and the venerable Assaji[5] . . . received the *upasampadā*-ordination. . . .[6]

§ 10. [47] And . . .[7] the minds (*cittāni*) of the Five Mendicants, detached (*an-upādāya*),[8] were liberated from the taints (*āsavehi*).[9] Then there were six Saints (*arahanto*)[10] in the world (*loke*).[11]

(*See Appendix Bb, Appendix Cb, and Appendix E, containing texts supplementary to this Chapter.*)

[1] Ch. 5 *b* § 2. The canonical collection of early sacred songs called the *Thera-gāthā* assigns Song lxi to Vappa.

[2] Omitting repetitions.

[3] See § 7 above.

[4] The *Majjhima* account slightly differs. In it whilst the first two were receiving instruction the other three begged, and after the first two were convinced they supported the rest till these in turn were convinced. See § 6 above.

[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 16; Ch. 11 *c* § 18; Ch. 12 *a* § 7.

[6] The *Mahā-vagga* places here the Second Sermon (see §§ 1–2 above). Ch. 5 *b* § 9 n.

[7] Omitting 'when this exposition had been set forth', i.e. when the transience of individuality, as propounded in the Second Sermon (see § 1 above), had been made clear to each and all of them; Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [8] n. This passage in the *Mahā-vagga* comes directly after the passage given in § 5 above; the first sentence closes the corresponding Sutta in the *Saṃ. Nik.*

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*an-ālayo*); Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*); Ap. G 1 *b* § 5.

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 6; Ap. D *a* § 7.

[10] Ch. 6 *a* § 10; Ch. 7 *a* § 20 n; Ap. D *c*.

[11] Ch. 6 *a* § 7. The narrative is continued in Ch. 6 *a* § 2.

CHAPTER 6

BENĀRES: THE FIRST SIXTY FOLLOWERS

a. The Conversion of Yasa and others

(i) *Commentarial account*

§ 1. *Jātaka Commentary*, *Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*), *JN*, *p. 82*.[1]

Then the Teacher (*Satthā*)[2] saw that Yasa[3] the clansman was ready . . . and admitted him, and he admitted also the other fifty-four, Yasa's companions, with the ordination-formula 'Come, mendicant-brother (*ehi-bhikkhu-pabbajjāya*)'[4] and caused them to attain to Saintship (*arahattaṃ*).[5] . . . He then sent forth the Sixty[6] in different directions, saying 'Go forth, mendicant brothers, on your travel (*caratha, bhikkhave, cārikaṃ*)'. Then he went towards Uruvelā[7] and half-way there in the Kappāsiya[8] wood, he convinced the party of thirty well-born youths[9] (*bhadda-vaggiya-kumāre*)[10] . . . and sending them also forth into the neighbouring regions, he himself proceeded [on his way from Benāres] to Uruvelā.[11] . . .[12]

(ii) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya, Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, vii–x[13]

§ 2. [MV, I. vii. 1] At that time there was in Benāres[14] a clansman (*kula-putto*)[15] named Yasa,[16] a delicately nurtured youth, the son of a

[1] Continued from Ch. 5 *b* § 2. [2] Ap. E *b* § 2. [3] See §§ 2, 4 below.

[4] See § 10 below; Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 7 *b* § 3; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [1]. The *pabbajjā* is the ordination of one who has gone forth from the world (Ch. 2 § 3).

[5] Ap. D *c*. [6] See § 14 below; Ch. 15 *a* § 7; and Ch. 6 *b*.

[7] Int. § 145, and Int. § 119 (*Benāres*). Gotama's route between Benāres and Uruvelā, near Gayā, is unknown, but it may be conjectured that the first half of it lay along the north bank of the Ganges, which formed part of the Kosalan kingdom (Int. § 149). The country along the south bank lay between the great kingdoms of Avanti (Int. § 155) and Magadha, and was probably at that time inhabited by the aboriginal tribes of the Vindhyan mountains, and was therefore less favourable for the Teacher's work. [8] Cotton-tree.

[9] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [xiv] n. For *kumāra*, meaning a 'youth', see Ch. 7 *b* § 4.

[10] Omitting 'Of these the least advanced entered the First [*sotapanno ahosi*] and the most advanced the Third Path [*anāgāmī ahosi*]', BBS, i, p. 114.

[11] See Ap. B *a* § 6; also Int. § 92. For the passage of time see Ch. 7 *b* § 1.

[12] The narrative is continued in Ch. 7 *a* § 1.

[13] Continued from Ch. 5 *c* § 10. The authority for this part of the narrative is apparently tradition, as gathered by the compiler of the introductory portion of the *Mahā-vagga*. [14] Int. §§ 77, 119; Ch. 15 *a*.

[15] Int. § 159 n. See § 13 [ix. 1] below; Ch. 9 *b* § 7; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 12 *e* § 10; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [55] Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 12 [22] n; also Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 n; with Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [2], and Ap. D *b* § 6 [1] n.

[16] See § 1 above; Int. § 30; Ap. F 1, *Note*. The story does not appear in the first four Nikāyas. The canonical collection of early sacred songs called the *Theragāthā* assigns Song cxvii to Yasa. His story, built up of many texts from other narratives, may be taken as typical and at least broadly true. *Yasa* signifies Renown or Fame (Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7]).

great merchant.[1] He had three mansions (*pāsādā*),[2] one for winter, one for summer, and one for the rainy season.[3] For four months in the rainy season he was surrounded by female musicians[4] and never left his mansion. Then [it happened that] Yasa the clansman, given over and altogether surrendered to the five sense-pleasures (*pañcahi-kāmaguṇehi*),[5] thus attended fell asleep earlier than usual, and sleep descended later on the women attending him, and an oil lamp burnt on through the night. [2] Then Yasa the clansman, having awaked earlier,[6] saw his attendants as they slept, a lute under the armpit of one, a tambourine on the neck of another, a drum in the armpit of another, one with hair dishevelled, another with moisture trickling from her mouth, [some] muttering in their sleep. It was like a cemetery (*susānaṃ*)[7] ready to hand. As he looked (on the spectacle) the misery of it appeared to him, and his mind stood aghast. Then Yasa the clansman breathed forth the cry (*udānaṃ*) 'O what wretchedness, O what affliction!'[8]

§ 3. [3] Then, having put on his gilded slippers,[9] he went to the house-door . . .[10] then he went to the city gate.[11] . . .[12] Then he went to Isipatana the deer-park (*yena Isipatanaṃ migadāyo*).[13]

§ 4. [4] And at that time the Blessed One, having risen in the night as dawn approached, was walking to and fro[14] in the open air. The Blessed One saw Yasa the clansman from afar approaching,[15] and having seen him he left his pathway (*caṅkamā*) and sat in his customary seat. Then Yasa the clansman not far from the Blessed One breathed forth the cry 'O what wretchedness, O what affliction!' And the Blessed One spoke thus to Yasa the clansman: 'Here is no wretchedness, Yasa; here is no affliction. Come, Yasa, sit; I will show thee the Law (*dhammaṃ*).' [5] Then Yasa the clansman saying 'Here surely

[1] 'Treasurer', SBE, xiii, p. 102. The Pāli word is *seṭṭhi*. Int. § 189; Ch. 15 *a* (*Benāres*) n; also Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2]; Ch. 9 *c* § [1]; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3]. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*corporation*); also Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [2] (*gahapati*).

[2] Int. § 140; Ch. 1 § 8. These details are drawn from the legend of Vipassin Buddha (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2).

[3] Int. § 136 n.

[4] Int. § 190; Ch. 22 *c* § 2 (*music*). The sentence is repeated in Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1] and is taken from the Vipassin legend (*Dīgha Nik.*, PTS, ii, p. 21).

[5] Ap. D *a* §§ 1, 9 (i).

[6] *Paṭigacc 'eva*; cp. Ch. 21 § 12 [48] n.

[7] Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [7–10] n.

[8] Ch. 2 § 3.

[9] Int. § 190 (*dress*); Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [29].

[10] Omitting 'Non-human beings [*a-manussa*, Int. § 93, vi] opened the door, saying "Lest anyone should place an obstacle in the way of Yasa's withdrawal from the household to the homeless state." ' Cp. Ch. 2 § 6 n.

[11] Int. § 175.

[12] Omitting the miraculous opening as above.

[13] Ch. 5 *a* § 9. This passage supports the idea that Isipatana was the name of the deer-park, not of a spot in the park. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [229]; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237] n; also Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5] n. It must be pointed out, however, that the nominative case is sometimes used elliptically for the locative (Ch. 11 *e* § 4) and perhaps for the accusative of direction; and if this applies the present passage may read 'to where Isipatana was, [where was] the deer-park'.

[14] There was apparently a rest-house for ascetics at Isipatana, where Gotama and the five disciples found quarters. Beside the rest-house was a path on which the ascetics might walk to and fro in meditation. Ch. 3 § 7; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [158]; cp. Ap. H 5 [94].

[15] See § 1 above; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4].

is no wretchedness; here is no affliction!' glad and exulting, having put off his gilded slippers, drew near to where the Blessed One was; and having drawn near he exchanged greetings[1] with the Blessed One and seated himself at one side.[2] To him thus seated by his side the Blessed One addressed a graduated discourse (*anu-pubbikathaṃ*),[3] namely, a discourse on charity (*dāna-kathaṃ*),[4] a discourse on conduct (*sīla-kathaṃ*),[5] a discourse on the heavenly bliss [of Nibbāna] (*sagga-kathaṃ*),[6] and made clear the misery,[7] the worthlessness, and the defilement (*saṃkilesaṃ*) of the sense-pleasures (*kāmānaṃ*)[8] and the blessing (*ānisaṃsaṃ*)[9] in [their] renunciation (*nekkhamme*).[10] [6] When the Blessed One perceived that his mind was restored to health, at peace, rid of obstacles,[11] exulting and calm, then he made clear to him

[1] *Abhivādeti*; Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5]. Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i); Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9]; Ch. 14 *f* § 13 [3] n; Ch. 20 § 11 [29].

[2] Ch. 12 *b* § 3; Ap. B *b* § 3 [4]. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [2].

[3] 'Preached to him in due course', SBE, xiii, p. 104; cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (1); also Ch. 10 *a* § 12 [1]; Ap. I *a* § 2 [5] (*gradual*). With this graduated discourse compare the 'comprehensive discourse' of the MPS (Ch. 20 § 8; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3). The latter, though differently distributed and addressed to those already converted, must have covered much the same ground. The term 'graduated discourse' apparently applies only to the phrases 'a discourse on charity . . . renunciation'. These then comprise the essence of the Doctrine (Ap. G 1 *b*), and so must include the Four Truths mentioned in the next sentence. The incident is taken from the legend of Vipassin Buddha, SBE, iii, pp. 34–5 (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2); the sermon recurs in *Dīgha* 3 (i, p. 110) and 5 (i, p. 148; Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1] n), and *Majjh.* 56 (i, p. 379; see Ch. 11 *d* § 6 n), and 91 (Ch. 12 *e* § 13). See §§ 6 [10] and 11 [1] below; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [6]; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [9]; Ap. B *b* § 4 [13] n; also Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note* and Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3] n.

[4] Int. § 31, and Ap. F 1 *a*. *Dāna* (giving) is something more than generosity, it signifies a state of mind rather than external action, and thus implies altruism. Cp. Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1]; and Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [5] n (*cāga*).

[5] Or, duty. Int. § 32; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [4]; Ap. F 1, *Note*; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]; Ap. F 2; Ap. G 1 *a* § 2 n; Ap. H 4 *a*; Ap. H 5 [95] n.

[6] 'About heaven', SBE, xiii, p. 104. 'The heavenly bliss of Nibbāna' appears to be a correct rendering. Gotama did not hold up before the eyes of his followers Heaven or any other reward save the peace of mind of self-forgetful activity (Ap. C *b*; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 18, *any existence*, § 20 [7] n). Nibbāna is always included in the formula describing the Path with the mention of which the 'graduated' discourse concludes; and it must clearly have figured largely throughout the sermon. Gotama's later followers gave to it the name of *sagga* (Int. § 33; Ap. C *b* § 11 [174]), and it appears ultimately by a natural transition as a reward in a future life (cp. Ap. C *a* § 2; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*). It is noticeable that *dāna* (charity) and *sīla* (virtuous action) are the first two of the famous Ten Perfections (*dasa-pāramiyo*; Ap. F 2 *a*) which distinguish Buddhas and Bodhisattas, and it seems probable that the 'graduated discourse' which constituted the regular conversion sermon (IN 2 *a*) proceeded however cursorily to describe these saintly virtues. Thus the *sagga-kathā*, with which the discourse closed, may have treated of the tenth perfection, *upekkhā* (equanimity), which is practically the same as *nibbāna* (peace). In any case, however *sagga* is to be interpreted, no reference whatever to the doctrine of re-birth is here apparent (Ap. B *a*); see Ch. 11 *d* § 6 where the 'graduated discourse' is opposed to the Jain doctrine of penance and Karma. Int. § 11; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]. Cp. Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 (*the other side*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 [3].

[7] Ādīnava; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92]; Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [203]; Ch. 20 § 6 (4).

[8] Ap. D *a* § 1.

[9] Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2].

[10] Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (2). Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7] (*gain*). This is the third of the Ten Perfections mentioned in the note above (Ap. F 2 *a*, 127). Apparently all the words following *sagga-kathaṃ* are in apposition to that noun and therefore are to be taken as explanatory expansions of it.

[11] The Pāli word is *vi-nivaraṇa*. Ap. D *a* § 9 (iv); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].

that which is the most exalted (*sām-ukkaṃsikā*)[1] doctrine (*dhamma-desanā*) of the Buddhas[2]—sorrow, its origin, its cessation, the path (*maggam*).[3] As when[4] a clean garment freed from all soiling takes the dye[5] completely even so there arose in Yasa the clansman, as he sat there, the stainless clear vision of the Law[6] (*dhamma-cakkhuṃ*)—'Everything[7] that has by nature an origin has also by nature a cessation'.

§ 5. [7] Now the mother of Yasa the clansman, having ascended his mansion and not seeing him, went to where [her] husband the great merchant, the householder (*gahapati*), was, and having approached him said: 'Thy son Yasa, O householder,[8] is not to be seen!' Then the great merchant, the householder, having sent out horsemen to the four quarters, himself went to Isipatana the deer-park. Then he perceived the cast-off gilded slippers, and having perceived them went on. [8] The Blessed One saw the great merchant, the householder, from afar approaching. . . .[9] [9] Then the great merchant, the householder, went near to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near he said to the Blessed One: 'Haply, revered sir (*bhante*),[10] the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*)[11] has seen Yasa the clansman.' 'Sit there, O householder; haply sitting here thou mayst see Yasa here seated.' Then the great merchant, thinking 'Verily sitting here I shall see

[1] Ap. G 1 *b*.

[2] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[3] These are the Four Truths (Ch. 4 § 17). The discourse appears to be without the persuasiveness attributed to it in the narrative if the Buddha offered as inducement a long and indefinable course of re-births culminating in Nirvāna dependent on present and continued abjuration of the world and all desires. Moreover, it is difficult to find in the Four Truths any such doctrine (IN 1). What was offered was the present peace in well-doing if once self-seeking can be dropped. It was something within the power of ordinary men. Ch. 5 *a* § 10.

[4] See § 7 below; Ch. 13 *b* § 6 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 8 (*just as*); Ap. B *b* § 1 (*as if*).

[5] See Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9]. Int. § 190 (*dress*).

[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 12 [8], 20; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [102]. Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3] (*ñāna*); and Ap. B *c* § 1 (1). Yasa has attained this 'vision' whilst still a layman (Ap. C *b*, *Note*). The *dhamma-cakkhu* is explained in the succeeding clause in the text. It is the perception not only of the transience of the individual but of the unity and continuity underlying all changes. The *Dhamma* may be summarized as the law of unity, altruism, and continuity (Int. § 55 n; see § 10 below).

[7] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [vi. 29].

[8] See Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [18]; and Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21]. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [1]; Ch. 10 *c* (79); Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [4]; Ch. 17 *b* § 1; also Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [2] (*treasurer*).

[9] Omitting 'And having seen him the Blessed One thought "What if I were to perform such magic-making (*iddh-ābhisaṃkhāraṃ*; cp. Ap. I *b* § 3, *iddhi-vidhaṃ*) that the great merchant, as he sits here, should not see Yasa here seated?" Then the Blessed One indeed performed such magic-making' (see § 8 [11] below). This bears every sign of being an addition intended by a devout narrator to enhance the story, in which, however, it stands as an excrescence, since there was no necessity for Yasa to continue sitting beside the Teacher all day. Int. § 94 (iii).

[10] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [16]; Ch. 11 *c* § 19; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [11]; Ch. 22 *b* § 22; see § 10 [15] below. *Bhante* is also used as plural (Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12]).

[11] Literally, fortunate or auspicious (Ch. 4 § 9). The title may be given to any religious teacher; Ch. 11 *c* § 11 [7]. The use of the word in the vocative is here avoided and is rare; Ch. 22 *b* § 5 [9].

Yasa here seated', glad and exulting, exchanged greetings with the Blessed One and seated himself at one side.

§ 6. [10] To the great merchant seated by his side the Blessed One addressed the graduated discourse,[1] namely a discourse on charity, a discourse on conduct, a discourse on the heavenly bliss[2] [of Nibbāna], and made clear the misery, the worthlessness, and the defilement of the passions and the blessing in [their] renunciation.[3]

§ 7. [10 cd.] Then the great merchant, having seen and attained and understood and immersed himself in the Law, having left uncertainty behind (*tiṇṇa-vicikiccho*),[4] having escaped from doubt,[5] having attained confidence, not dependent on others (*a-para-ppaccavo*)[6] in the doctrine (*sāsane*)[7] of the Teacher (*Satthu*), spoke thus to the Blessed One: '[How] excellent (*abhikkantaṃ*),[8] revered sir (*bhante*), [how] excellent, revered sir! It is as if[9] one should set upright what was overturned, or disclose what was concealed, or show the path to the erring or hold up a lamp in the darkness so that they who have eyes see forms; even so the Law is made clear by the Blessed One in different methods.[10] I here, revered sir, come for refuge[11] (*saraṇaṃ*) to the Blessed One (*Bhagavantaṃ*), and to the Law, and to the community of mendicant brothers (*bhikkhu-saṃghaṃ*);[12] let the

[1] See § 4 [5] above, § 11 [2] below; Ch. 10 *a* § 7; Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [13] n.

[2] Here, as above, the context suggests that *sagga* is a state of mind in which all individualistic desires are extinguished, not a place where desires of any kind are gratified.

[3] The phraseology suggests that the 'graduated discourse' was subdivided into three parts, which covered the whole subject, and that the explanations regarding desire and renunciation did not follow but were comprised within one or other of these three parts. The fact that here the phrases common to the cases of Yasa and his father end, shows that the 'graduated discourse' closes at this point. The circumstance that 'renunciation (*nekkhamma*)' is pressed both upon Yasa, who became a friar, and upon his father, who remained a householder, seems to show that Gotama was not here prescribing a monk's renunciation of the world, but the good citizen's renunciation of worldliness or selfish aims (Ch. 8 *l*).

[4] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).

[5] Or, questioning. The Pāli word is *katham-kathā*. Ch. 13 *c* § 18; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (414). Cp. Ch. 14 *c* §§ 4 [9], 19 [4].

[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ap. E *c* ii. i.e. 'absolutely sure'. The phrase is part of a stock passage (IN 6; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29] n).

[7] Ap. A 1 *b* (10); Ap. I *b* § 4 [8]. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228].

[8] See the narratives of the conversions of Bimbisāra (Ch. 7 *a* § 13), Sīha (Ap. B *b* § 3 [10]); Vacchagotta (Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [6]) and others (Ch. 9 *b* § 10 [35]); Ch. 10 *a* § 7; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [10]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [11]; Ch. 19 *c* §§ 1 [396], 2 [99]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 17 [28]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [82], some of which bear the authority of the Nikāyas. Cp. Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*.

[9] See § 4 [6] above. For vivid imaginative similes attributed to Gotama himself see: Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [5] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [8]; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [8]; Ap. G 1 *a* §§ 3 (4), 4 [4].

[10] This formula shows how severely abridged is the summary account given above. Ch. 8 *e* § 2 [1]; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2; also Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (2); and Ch. 14 *d* § 3 (*pariyāya*).

[11] To Yasa's father, the first lay disciple, is attributed the first utterance of this formula of the triple refuge. Ch. 5 *b* § 2 [3]; Ap. H 1 *c*; see note on *te-vāciko* below. Cp. Ch. 23 *a* [9] (*paṭi-saraṇa*).

[12] This term shows that the Saṃgha indicated the community of monks or friars, and not the congregation of believers. Ch. 8; Ap. H.

Blessed One receive me as a lay disciple (*upasakaṃ*)[1] taking refuge from this day forth whilst life lasts.'[2] And he was in this world (*loke*)[3] the first lay-disciple of the triple formula[4] (*te-vāciko*).

§ 8. [11] Then Yasa the clansman, whilst the Law was being shown to his father, considered the ground[5] (*bhūmiṃ*) as seen and as understood, and having ceased to grasp (*an-upādāya*)[6] his mind (*cittaṃ*) was liberated[7] from the defilements[8] (*āsavehi*). Then this thought came to the Blessed One: 'Yasa, whilst the Law was being shown to his father, has considered . . .[9] and his mind has been liberated from the defilements; Yasa is incapable of returning to the lower [life] and enjoying the passions (*kāme*)[10] as formerly when he was living in his home.' . . .[11] [12] And the great merchant saw Yasa sitting, and having seen him said to him: 'Thy mother, dear Yasa, is full of lamentation and grief; give thy mother life.' [13] Then Yasa looked at the Blessed One. Then the Blessed One spoke to the great merchant thus: 'What thinkest thou, householder? The Law is visible (*diṭṭho*) to Yasa through the knowledge of a learner and the insight of a learner[12] (*sekhena dassanena*), as indeed to thee,[13] and on his considering the ground, as seen and as understood, his mind no longer grasping[14] is liberated from the defilements. Is now Yasa capable of returning to the lower [life] and enjoying the passions as formerly when he was living in his home?' 'Not so, revered sir.' '. . .[15] He is incapable of returning. . . .'

§ 9. [14] 'The gain is Yasa's, revered sir; great gain is Yasa's, revered sir, since his mind no longer grasping is liberated from the defilements. May the Blessed One, revered sir, accept from me a meal to-day, with Yasa as his attendant-recluse (*pacchā-samaṇena*).'[16] The Blessed One accepted by his silence.[17] Then the great merchant having seen the Blessed One's acceptance, rising from his seat, having

[1] Ch. 8 *l*. He does not appear in the list of foremost lay disciples in *Aṅg. Nik.* I. xiv (Ch. 10 *c* [6]) or in the more extended list in the 'Sixes' (PTS, iii, p. 451).

[2] Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [34]; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1); Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [7].

[3] Ch. 5 *c* § 10. Cp. Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note* (*predecessors*); Ap. C *b* § 11 (89).

[4] Or, triad. See note on 'refuge' above. Cp. Ch. 4 § 8 n.

[5] Or, plane of knowledge. 'Stage of knowledge', SBE, iii, p. 106.

[6] Ap. D *a*; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (414).

[7] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[8] Or, contamination. Ap. D *a* § 7; Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8]. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 (*vimutti*).

[9] Omitting repetitions.

[10] Ap. D *a* § 1.

[11] Omitting the Buddha's decision to end the magic invisibility of Yasa. See § 5 [8] above.

[12] Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3].

[13] 'What do you think then, O householder? That Yasa has (first) won only an imperfect degree of knowledge and insight into the Truth as you have yourself? Or that rather, &c.', SBE, xiii, p. 107.

[14] Namely, at individual pleasure or advantage.

[15] Omitting repetitions.

[16] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9]; see § 11 [1] below.

[17] Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*); Ch. 11 *c* § 20 [5]; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2]; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [2]. This very frequent phrase doubtless implies a gracious inclination of the head. Profuse thanks for a meal, which theoretically must be ranked with scraps placed in the mendicant's bowl, were out of the question. Silence could also indicate refusal (Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]). Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 9 [5].

saluted the Blessed One, and so moving as to keep his right side towards him (*padakkhinaṃ katvā*)[1] departed.

§ 10. [15] Then Yasa the clansman not long after the departure of the great merchant said to the Blessed One: 'Master (*bhante*),[2] let me receive from the Blessed One ordination as one who has gone forth [from the world] and receive admission.'[3] The Blessed One replied: 'Come (*ehi*),[4] mendicant brother; happily proclaimed is the Law;[5] lead the holy life for the complete ending of sorrow.'[6] Thus this venerable man received his *upasampadā*-ordination. So at that time there were seven saints (*arahā*)[7] in the world.

§ 11. [viii. 1] Then before noon[8] the Blessed One, wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe[9] and alms-bowl,[10] with the venerable Yasa as his attendant (*pacchā-samaṇena*),[11] went to where the dwelling[12] of the great merchant, the householder, was, and having arrived he sat down on the seat arranged.[13] Then the mother and the former wife[14] of the venerable Yasa went near to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near they exchanged the customary greetings with the Blessed One and seated themselves at one side.

[1] Ch. 10 *a* § 7; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [1, 2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [3]; Ch. 21 § 10 [6]; Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [36]. Cp. Ch. 2 § 2. This movement, which politeness required, seems to imply that visitors 'sitting at one side' were always seated at the Teacher's left hand. The movement was an ordinary act of courtesy; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [162]; Ch. 19 *c* § 1.

[2] See § 5 [9] above. *Bhante* is a title conveying different shades of meaning varying from respect to reverence and may be applied to laymen as well as to religious teachers: Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35]. It is applied to religious teachers irrespective of sect (Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 19 *c* § 1 [393]).

[3] See § 13 [4] below: Ch. 5 *c* § 8 [32]; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17]; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56].

[4] See § 1 above.

[5] The Law of unity. See § 4 [6] n above.

[6] Ch. 5 *b* § 7. This phrase once more asserts emphatically the aim of Gotama's teaching, which was to make a certain end of sorrow now in this life (Ap. C *b*) in this world, not a hypothetical one ages hence after an incalculable series of re-births. The thought of such a series can be endured with resignation, but it never has aroused enthusiasm such as Gotama's gospel called forth on all sides in its early days.

[7] Ch. 5 *c* § 10. From the case of Yasa it appears that one may become an Arahat (Ap. D *c*) and attain Nibbāna by force of sudden conviction without previous stages or purification. There is no word here of preparation either in this life or by previous births (Ap. B).

[8] Ch. 8 *k* [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 9; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [108]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 10 [2], 16; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [420]; Ch. 21 § 9 [1]; Ch. 22 *a* § 2 [18]; Ch. 23 *a* [7]. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (25); also Ap. H 5 [91]. The details following are found again in the story of Anāthapiṇḍika in Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7], with necessary changes; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6], and Ch. 21 § 4 [19]. Here the details are crowded into one morning.

[9] Better more generally, having dressed, with bowl and formal garb. Ch. 7 *a* § 13 [12] (*bowl*); Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [2]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10]; Ch. 8 *j*; Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 10 [19]; cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [5].

[10] Ch. 2 § 7 [65] n; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171]; Ch. 8 *k* § 6; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2] n; Ch. 20 § 7 (4); Ch. 21 § 4 [19].

[11] See § 9 above.

[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 13 [15]; Ch. 7 *b* § 7. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6] n.

[13] Or, indicated. Ch. 11 *c* § 15; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2]; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13; Ch. 20 § 2; Ch. 21 § 7 [24]; Ch. 22 *a* § 5 [22]. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502]; Ch. 22 *b* § 1 [1]; also Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482] (*lower*); Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [13] (*high*). The narrative in *Majjh*. 56 (SBB, v, pp. 274–5) makes it clear that the 'finest, best and choicest seat' is meant, though perhaps not invariably (Ch. 21 § 7 [24]).

[14] The Pāli word is *dutiyikā*; literally, second or help-meet. Int. § 190.

[2] To them the Blessed One addressed the graduated discourse[1] . . .[2] [3] And these were in this world the first women lay-disciples (*upāsikā*)[3] of the triple formula.

§ 12. [4] Then the mother and father and the former wife of the venerable Yasa, serving with their own hands[4] the Blessed One and the venerable Yasa, satisfied them with heaped-up (*paṇitena*) food and delicacies;[5] and when the Blessed One, having eaten, had withdrawn his hand from the bowl,[6] they seated themselves at one side. Then the Blessed One, having enlightened, informed, stirred and gladdened[7] the mother and father and the former wife of the venerable Yasa by discourse on the Law[8] (*dhammiyā kathāya*), rose from his seat and departed.

§ 13. [ix. 1] Now four householders in Benāres (*Bārāṇasiyaṃ*),[9] friends of the venerable Yasa, clansmen (*kulānaṃ puttā*),[10] sons of great or lesser merchants[11] Vimala, Subāhu, Puṇṇaji, Gavampati,[12] heard: 'So Yasa the clansman has cut off[13] his hair and beard, assumed the yellow (*kāsāyāni*) robes,[14] and gone forth[15] from the household to the houseless life.' When they heard this the thought came to them: 'This truly is not a commonplace (*orako*) doctrine and discipline (*dhamma-vinayo*),[16] truly this is no commonplace retirement (*pabbajjā*),[17] for which Yasa the clansman has cut off his hair and beard, assumed the yellow robes and gone forth from the household to the homeless

[1] See § 4 [5] above. The simplicity of the early Buddhist doctrine seems well established. The discourses delivered to Yasa and his family are particularly important on account of this simplicity, which indeed seems to have been shared by all the great Conversion Sermons of Buddha (IN 2 *a*). Tradition appears to have preserved these in comparative purity, perhaps owing to the narratives in which they are set, and they are deserving of special study for their contrast to the more elaborate discourses which appear to owe much. if not everything, to monkish systematizers of the doctrine.

[2] As in § 4 [5–6] and §§ 6–7 above; see also Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [14] n.

[3] Ch. 8 *l*. Cp. Ch. 12 *d*.

[4] The non-exclusion of women from family meals is noticeable.

[5] Or, choice food solid and moist; 'Excellent food both hard and soft', SBE, xiii, p. 110; cp. Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] (*chosen*). Int. § 190 (*food*); Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [14] (1) and (2); Ch. 11 *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 (i); also Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 (2).

[6] Or, 'cleansed his bowl and his hands', SBE, xiii, p. 110. Ch. 7 *a* § 13 [15]; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6].

[7] Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [iv. 6]; Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [162]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7].

[8] Or, moral discourse. Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [18]; Ch. 7 *b* § 8 [6]; Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7] n; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23; Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [3]; Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [14]; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]. Cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4]; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (*customary*).

[9] Int. § 119.

[10] Cp. § 2 [vii. 1] above; § 14 below; also Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [55].

[11] 'Belonging to the *setthi* families of Benāres and the highest after the *setthi* families', SBE, xiii, p. 110.

[12] Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2] n; and Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*).

[13] Ch. 2 § 5; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [10] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]; also Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [24] n; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2] (*shaveling*); and Int. § 190 (*toilet*).

[14] Ch. 6 *b* § 2; Ch. 8 *j*; Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [13]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2 [15]. Contrast the white robes of laymen; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii). See Int. § 190 (*dress*).

[15] Ch. 5 *a* § 10.

[16] Ch. 3 § 5; Ap. A 1 *b* (6); Ap. G 1 *b* § 1.

[17] Int. § 187 (*mendicancy*).

life.' [2] Those four went to where the venerable Yasa was. . . .[1] [4] These venerable men received their *upasampadā*-ordination. . . .[2] So at that time there were eleven saints in the world.

§ 14. [x. 1] Then fifty householders in the country, friends of the venerable Yasa, clansmen (*kulānaṃ puttā*),[3] members of the foremost and next families, heard. . . .[4] These venerable men received their *upasampadā*-ordination . . . having ceased to grasp their minds were liberated from the defilements (*āsavehi*).[5] So at that time there were sixty-one saints[6] in the world.

b. The First Mission sent forth[7]

Vinaya and Nikāya accounts

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, xi–xiv[8]

§ 1. [MV, I. xi. 1] Then the Blessed One exhorted (*āmantesi*)[9] the mendicant brothers: 'I have been liberated,[10] mendicant brothers, from all the snares[11] (*sabba-pāsehi*), whether of[12] spirits (*dibbā*)[13] or of men (*manussā*); and ye also, mendicant brothers, have been liberated from all the snares, whether of spirits or of men. Go forth, mendicant brothers, upon journeys for the help[14] of the many, for the well-being[15] of the many, out of compassion for the world (*lok-ānukampaya*),[16] for

[1] Omitting an account of how Yasa took them to the Buddha, and repetitions.
[2] See § 10 above. [3] See § 13 above. [4] Omitting repetitions.
[5] Ap. D *a* § 7. [6] Int. § 30; see § 1 above.
[7] Int. §§ 30, 34. The missionary as well as ascetic nature of early Buddhism is indicated by the term 'houseless' (Ch. 8 *d* § 8) applied to the Order, and by the *vassa* rule of residence in a Vihāra during the rainy season (Ch. 8 *c*). This was modified later by the increasing need of providing permanent places for the training of recruits (Ch. 8 *d* § 5, *probationers*, § 6 [1], *instructor*) and centres for conference and administration (Ch. 10 *d* § 1, *Sāvatthi*).
[8] The *Mahā-vagga* chapters 11 and 13 appear also in the *Saṃyutta-Nikāya*, *Sagātha-vagga*, *Saṃyutta* iv (*Māra-saṃ.*) i. 5 and 4 respectively, where the scene is stated to be the Deer-park at Benāres (Ch. 15 *a*); Ch. 11 *b* § 1. The instructions to the first missioners, except the first sentence, occur word for word in, and are apparently taken from, the legend of Vipassin Buddha (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2).
[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 7 [13], 25. See Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513] n.
[10] Through the Dhamma (Ap. D *a* § 6). 'By radical-thinking (*yoniso-manasikāra*) and by radically thorough effort' (§ 2 [xiii] n below).
[11] The bonds and tyranny of the Self. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 7 (*āsava*), § 8 (*Fetters*). 'All fetters human and divine', SBE, xiii, p. 112.
[12] i.e. which encompass either spirits or men (intelligent beings of all kinds).
[13] Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3), which suggests that the meaning here may be that Buddha is liberated from desire for pleasures 'human and divine'. See Int. § 34.
[14] Or, welfare. The Pāli word is *hita*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 7.
[15] Or, happiness. The Pāli word is *sukha*. Ch. 13 *c* § 4 (5); Ap. C *b* § 11 (203). Cp. Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7] n.
[16] Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14]; Ch. 13 *a* § 6; Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35]; Ap. E *c* ii § 5; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8]. That Buddhism was not a mere system of self-culture is evident. The active altruistic nature of Buddhism is here emphasized (Int. §§ 3, 10, 101; Ch. 5 *b* § 4, *vāyāma*; Ap. F 1). The love of our fellow-men and the duty of labouring for their welfare are prominent features of Gotama's teaching, in strong contrast with the isolation and quietism of asceticism (Ch. 5 *b* § 4). 'Apathy' (the Stoic quality of ἀπάθεια), or better 'unperturbedness' (ἀταραξία), is indeed a Buddhist virtue, but only in the sense which Marcus Aurelius gave to it; namely, supremacy

the sake of, for the help of, for the well-being of spirits and men (*deva-manussānaṃ*).[1] Let not two go the same way. Make known, mendicant brothers, the Law, good[2] in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, in the meaning and in the letter;[3] make clear the complete and pure holy-life (*brahma-cariyam*).[4] There are beings whose natures are scarcely tainted;[5] through not hearing of the Law they are lost (*pari-hāyanti*). They will comprehend the Law.[6] I, mendicant brothers, will go to Uruvelā,[7] where the army-township[8] (*Senanigamo*) is, to make known the Law. [2] . . .[9]

§ 2. . . .[10] [xii. 3] 'I enjoin[11] you now, mendicant brothers: In the different regions, in the different country-districts, confer the ordination of going forth [from the world] (*pabbajetha*) and grant admission [to the Order] (*upasampādetha*).[12] And it is thus, mendicant brothers, that the ordination and admission should be conferred: [the candidate] should have his hair and beard cut off,[13] assume the yellow robes,[14] adjust the upper wrap[15] over one shoulder, salute[16] the feet of the

over one's own individual feelings, not the suppression of one's social impulses and sympathies (IN 10). Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6 (*beings*); Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (21) n; Ch. 9 *b* § 4 (*good will*); Ch. 15 *a* § 8 (*helpful*); Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (*aṇudayata*); Ap. F 2 *b* [6] (*karuṇā*).

[1] Whilst not denying, Gotama attached no importance to the possible existence of the unseen world (Int. § 35; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 n; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 11 n, 12 [5]; Ch. 8 *d* § 6; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n, 16th *vassa*; Ch. 21 §§ 12 [38], 14 [50]; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73]; Ap. H 1 §§ 5, 6). The phrase 'spirits and men' appears to be merely a conventional term intended to include intelligent beings of all kinds. Comparison may be made with the conventional use of the word 'gods' in the royal title *Devānaṃ-piya* frequent in the Asokan inscriptions (Ap. G 1 *c*). Apart from this conventional title and a passage in which possibly he denies their existence (Minor Rock Edict I, *Rūpnāth* Text) the Emperor Asoka makes no mention of gods or spirits, and therefore it may be assumed that in the Buddhism of his time such beings had not yet found any secure place. At the time of Gotama's hesitation (Ch. 5 *a* § 5 n) immediately after his Enlightenment there was no question of his preaching to any but men—the Māgadhan people, his former teachers, and the Five Mendicants. Yet it is conceivable that Gotama, like St. Francis of Assisi, may have attributed understanding to the higher animals and plants. In Buddhaghosha's *Sumangala Vilāsini* the spirits come to Buddha's monastery daily for instruction (Ap. H 5 [94] n); in *Dīgha* thirty-two spirits instruct Buddha (Ch. 13 *c* § 17 n). Interpreted Vedāntically (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*) *deva-manussā* might mean the divine in men; cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502], and Ch. 17 *b* § 1 n.

[2] Or, righteous; the word used is *kalyāna*. Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6].

[3] This phrase suggests a scholastic origin.

[4] Ch. 5 *c* § 5; Ap. F 2 *b* and *c*.

[5] Ch. 5 *a* § 6 (*taints*).

[6] There is no mention or apparent suggestion of the doctrine of re-birth in any part of this address. Ap. B.

[7] Int. § 145.

[8] Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 4 § 1.

[9] Omitting verses attributed to Māra (Int. § 93, iv; Ap. G 2 *b*) and to Gotama. They appear to have been taken from an ancient ballad narrative (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*).

[10] Omitting details and repetitions.

[11] Pāli *anujanāmi*. See [4] below.

[12] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 8 *d*; Ap. H 2, *Note*; cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [3]. The following formula of deputed ordination was later necessarily superseded by a more formal ceremony (Ap. H 2 *c*).

[13] Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [10] n.

[14] Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5; Ap. H 2 *c* § 1.

[15] Ch. 8 *b* § 4; Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [14]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8]; Ch. 8 *j*.

[16] By touching; Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*); Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3]. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5]; Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [126]; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2] (*forehead*).

mendicant brothers, sit upon his heels and raise his joined palms;[1] then he must be told to say thus: [4] "I come for refuge[2] to the Enlightened,[3] I come for refuge to the Law,[4] I come for refuge to the Community,"[5] and so a second time . . . and a third time.[6] . . . I sanction,[7] mendicant brothers, the *pabbajjā* and *upasampadā*-ordination[8] with these three declarations of taking refuge (*saraṇa-gamanehi*).' [xiii] . . .[9] [xiv] . . .[10]

(*See Appendix F containing texts supplementary to this chapter.*)

[1] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* §§ 2 [8], 3 [4]; Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1]; Ch. 22 *c* § 7. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1] n.

[2] Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 1; Ap. H 2 *a* § 1. Cp. Ch. 21 § 16.

[3] Better in Gotama's own mouth 'the Awakened'. Ch. 13 *a* § 8 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [209]; Ch. 22 *b* § 24 [5]. See Part I (title) n; and Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]. Cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14].

[4] Ch. 23 *b* § 3.

[5] Or, Fellowship. Ch. 8 A; Ch. 21 § 7 [23].

[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 22 [2] n; Ch. 8 *b* § 3; Ap. H 3 *a*. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [3].

[7] Pāli *anujanāmi*. See [3] above; Ch. 7 *a* § 15; Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [3]; Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[8] Or, 'Renunciation and Admission'. Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 7 *a* § 16.

[9] Omitting a passage which repeats in substance the opening of [xi. 1] with the additional phrase *vassaṃ vuttho* (having kept the rainy-season period of residence; Ch. 8 *a*); also verses attributed to Māra and Buddha.

[10] Omitting the story of the conversion of a party of thirty well-born youths (*Bhadda-vaggiyā*; cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1], *householder's son*, and Ch. 19 *b* § 2, *bhaddaka*) and their twenty-nine wives, whom Buddha met seeking for the remaining member of the party, and whom he asked: 'Which is better for you—to go in search of the woman [a harlot and a thief] or to go in search of yourselves (*attānaṃ gaveseyyātha*; Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45] n; Ap. E *c* i)?' The story seems to have been woven round this saying. Ch. 6 *a* § 1; also Int. § 190 (*women*). The narrative is continued in Ch. 7 *a* § 2.

CHAPTER 7

RETURN TO MAGADHA: THE GREAT CONVERTS; KAPILAVATTHU REVISITED

a. Uruvelā and Rājagaha: Kassapa; the Fire Sermon; King Bimbisāra of Magadha, and the gift of the Veḷuvana Garden; Sāriputta and Moggallāna

(1) *The Jaṭilas converted.* (i) *Commentarial account*

§ 1. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā), JN, p. 82*[1]

. . . There [at Uruvelā][2] he convinced . . .[3] the three brothers,[4] matted-haired ascetics (*te-bhātika-jaṭile*)—Uruvelā Kassapa and the others[5]—who had a thousand followers; and admitted them by the formula 'Come, mendicant brothers';[6] and he established them in Saintship[7] by his Fire Discourse,[8] delivered to them when seated on the Gayā Head (*Gayā-sīse*).[9] . . .[10]

(ii) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, 15–21[11]

§ 2. [MV, I. xv. 1] Then journeying gradually[12] the Blessed One came to Uruvelā.[13] At that time at Uruvelā there dwelt three matted-haired ascetics (*tayo jaṭilā*),[14] Uruvelā Kassapa[15], Nadī Kassapa, and Gayā Kassapa.[16] Of these Uruvelā Kassapa was leader of five hundred[17] ascetics, chief, highest, first, foremost; Nadī Kassapa was leader of three hundred ascetics . . .[18] Gayā Kassapa was leader of two hundred ascetics. . . . [2] Then the Blessed One drew near to where the abode

[1] Continued from Ch. 6 *a* § 1. [2] Int. § 145; Ch. 10 *d* § 2; Ch. 15 *a* § 7.
[3] Omitting 'by performing three thousand five hundred miracles'. See § 4 [23] n below. [4] See § 2 below.
[5] See §§ 2, 4 below. In the canonical *Thera-gāthā* (Songs of the Elders) Songs cciii, cciv, and ccx are assigned to the three.
[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; see § 3 below.
[7] Ap. D *c* (*Arahat*). Nothing is said here of preliminary stages.
[8] *Āditta-pariyāya-desana*. See § 5 below. Int. § 186.
[9] Int. § 119. [10] Continued in § 7 below.
[11] Continued from Ch. 6 *b* § 2.
[12] Or, from place to place; see § 11 below; Ch. 5 *a* § 9. [13] Int. § 145.
[14] Int. § 186; Ch. 7 *c* § 1; Ch. 11 *a* § 2; Ch. 11 *f* § 4 n; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; Ap. B *b* § 5; Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 [11]. See § 1 above. The *Sela Sutta* of the *Sutta Nipāta* treats of Keniya the Jaṭila and of his intimate friend the learned Three-Veda Brāhman Sela. Cp. Ap. G 2 *c*.
[15] This may not be the Mahā-Kassapa who became the Buddha's successor (Int. § 30; Ch. 10 *c* (4), (37); Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [13]; Ch. 22 *c* § 7 [22]; Ap. A 1 *b*). For the clan name Kassapa cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [2] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].
[16] See § 1 above.
[17] That the Buddhist Saṃgha was an adaptation, not an innovation, is evident from this and many similar passages. Ch. 3 § 5 (*company*); see § 22 [2] below; Ch. 8; Ap. H. [18] Omitting repetitions.

(*assama*)[1] of Uruvelā Kassapa was, and having drawn near he spoke to Uruvelā Kassapa the ascetic (*jaṭilaṃ*). . . .[2] [xx. 17] Then this thought came to the Blessed One: 'For a long time this deluded man (*mogha-purisassa*)[3] will have the idea "The great devotee (*mahā-samaṇo*) indeed is possessed of great powers (*mah-iddhiko*)[4] and great experience, but he is not sacred (*arahā*)[5] as I am." What now if I could move this matted-haired ascetic.' Then the Blessed One spoke to Uruvelā Kassapa the ascetic thus: 'Thou truly art not a saint (*arahā*); indeed thou hast not attained the path leading to saintship (*arahatta-maggaṃ*);[6] nor is this way (*pati-padā*) of thine such that thou mayst become a saint or attain to the path leading to saintship.' Then[7] Kassapa inclined[8] himself with his head at the feet of the Blessed One and said to the Blessed One: 'Master, let me receive from the Blessed One ordination (*pabbajjaṃ*), let me receive admission (*upasampadaṃ*).'[9]

§ 3. [18] 'Thou, Kassapa,' [said the Blessed One], 'art leader of five hundred ascetics, . . . inform them now, and as they think fit so let them do.' Then Kassapa drew near to where the ascetics were and having approached them spoke thus: 'I wish, sirs, to lead the holy-life (*brahma-cariyaṃ*) with the great recluse; as ye think fit so do ye.' 'We have long, sir, had a regard for the great recluse,' said they; 'if thou, revered sir, wilt lead the holy-life with the great recluse, we will all lead the holy-life with the great recluse.' [19] Then those ascetics cast away their hair and matted locks, their apparatus[10] and their sacrificial fires (*aggihutta-missaṃ*)[11] upon the water, and drew near to where the Blessed One was, and having approached him inclined

[1] 'Hermitage', SBE, xiii, p. 118. Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [160].

[2] Omitting marvels in which figure a fiery Nāga (Int. §§ 93, vii, 188; Ch. 16 *d* § 1 n), the Four Kings (Int. § 93, v), Sakka (Int. § 93, i), Brahmā-Sahampati (Int. § 93, ii), and a friendly tree-spirit (Int. § 94, ii), and miraculous feats by the Buddha including visits to the Jambu-tree from which the continent of Jambudīpa is named (Ch. 1 § 2) and to the Tāvatiṃsa heaven (Int. § 93, vi), and to the prevention of and expediting of log-splitting, the prevention of and expediting of fires and the extinction of fires, the provision of braziers for the ascetics after bathing, and the creation of a dusty island in the middle of a flood (Int. § 94, iii). See Ch. 11 *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 (i).

[3] Ap. G 1 *a* §§ 3 (3), 4 [1]. *Mogha* is equivalent to *moha*, delusion. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 10 (iv); Ap. D *b* § 4.

[4] Cp. Ap. I *b* § 4 [5].

[5] Kassapa's initial arrogance was probably due to caste pride. The Jaṭilas were Brāhmaṇ ascetics (Ap. F 2 *c*, *caste*). With their admission there was introduced the possibility of a Hinduizing reaction in Buddhism (IN 7). It was perhaps in order to meet this that Gotama later insisted on privileges of admission for his Kshatriya kinsmen (Ap. H 1 i).

[6] Ap. D *c* (*Arahat*); Ap. F 2 *d*.

[7] Doubtless the conversion was due to Gotama's impressive discourse, but the narrative attributes it to the miracles, though persuasion had sufficed for all previous conversions. In *Saṃ. Nik.* xvi. 11 Kassapa gives to Ananda a simple account of his conversion, devoid of miracles. Ch. 11 *d* § 7.

[8] Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*).

[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 10 [15].

[10] 'Provisions', SBE, xiii, p. 132.

[11] 'The things for the agnihotra sacrifice', SBE, xiii. Int. § 186; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; Ap. A 2 *d*; see §§ 8 and 12 [4] below; also Int. § 85 (*ritual*). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24] (*pā-huṇa*); Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [3]. See also Ch. 14 *f* § 5 [291] n.

themselves with their heads at the feet of the Blessed One and said: 'Master, let us receive from the Blessed One ordination, let us receive admission.' The Blessed One replied: 'Come, mendicant brothers (*etha bhikkhavo*)![1] Happily proclaimed is the Law;[2] lead the holy-life[3] for ending sorrow completely (*sammā*).'[4] And this was the ordination[5] (*upasampadā*) of these venerable men.[6]

§ 4. [20] And Nadī Kassapa[7] saw the hair and matted locks . . . as they were carried along on the water; and seeing them he thought 'May no misfortune have happened to my brother!' . . .[8] and he himself went with the three hundred ascetics to where the venerable Uruvelā Kassapa was . . . and said: 'Is this now, Kassapa, better (*seyyo*)?'[9] 'Yes, friend, this is better.' . . . [22] And Gayā Kassapa[10] . . .[11] went with the two hundred ascetics to where the venerable Uruvelā Kassapa was. . . . [23] Thus these venerable men[12] received their *upasampadā*-ordination. . . .[13]

§ 5. [xxi. 1] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Uruvelā as long as he wished proceeded to Gayā Head (*Gayā-sīsaṃ*) with a great company,[14] a thousand mendicant brothers, all formerly matted-haired ascetics. There the Blessed One stayed at Gayā (*Gayāyaṃ*) on Gayā-Head (*Gayā-sīse*)[15] with the thousand mendicants. [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicants, saying:[16] 'Everything, mendicant brothers, is on fire (*ādittaṃ*). And how, mendicant brothers, is

[1] See § 1 above. [2] Ap. G 1 *b*.
[3] Of selflessness or self-transcendence. Ap. D *c* § 1; Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*).
[4] This may have a collective application. Ap. G 2 *a* (*kamma*).
[5] Ch. 5 *c* § 8 (*admission*); see § 24 below.
[6] Or, thus these Elders received admission.
[7] i.e. River-Kassapa, so called from the river Nerañjarā. See § 1 above.
[8] Omitting details.
[9] 'Bliss', SBE, xiii.
[10] So called from the village or town of Gayā which was lower down the stream, if the narrative is accurate. The modern Gayā is some distance west of the river. See § 5 below.
[11] Omitting his alarm on seeing the floating objects.
[12] Or, Elders.
[13] Omitting 'On the Blessed One's command five hundred logs could not be split and were split, fires could not be lit and were lit, could not be extinguished and were extinguished; and further he fashioned five hundred braziers. In this way there were 3500 marvels' (see § 1 above). This figure is given as comprising the total number of 'striking events'. The extra wonders apparently are of later date, but the original figure is faithfully preserved (IN 6, *Canon*; see § 24 below).
[14] Ch. 11 *b* 2. For the large numbers with which Gotama is said to have journeyed from place to place see Int. § 121; Ch. 7 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [1]. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 11.
[15] A high hill overlooking the town or village of Gayā. See §§ 4 above, 11 below; Int. §§ 119, 121, 145.
[16] See § 1 above; Int. § 30. The Fire Sermon is a pendant to the Second Sermon. The way of escape from the senses is the perception of the transience of individuality (Ch. 5 *b* § 2) and the consequent realization of the triviality and futility of the senses. The five senses and the mind together cover, from another point of view, the same ground as the five Khandhas (Ap. E *a* ii). Gotama insists upon the maleficent aspect of fire, as the Jaṭilas had dwelt upon its beneficent aspect. The Sermon appears in the *Saṃyutta Nikāya*, *Salāyatana-vagga*, *Saṃyutta xxxv*, *Sutta 28* (*Āditta*).

everything on fire? The eye[1] is on fire, material-forms (*rūpā*)[2] are on fire, thought coming from sight (*cakkhu-viññānaṃ*)[3] is on fire, sight-contact (*cakkhu-saṃphasso*)[4] is on fire, and that [sensation] which originates dependently[5] from sight-contact, felt (*vedayitaṃ*) as either pleasant or painful or neither painful nor pleasant,[6] that also is on fire. With what is everything on fire? It is on fire with the fire[7] of desire, with the fire of hate, with the fire of delusion;[8] I say that it is on fire with individual existence (*jātiyā*),[9] [that is] with decay, with death, with grief, with lamentation, with sorrow, with dejection, with despair.[10] [3] The ear is on fire, sounds are on fire . . .[11] the nostrils are on fire, odours are on fire . . . the tongue is on fire, tastes are on fire . . . the body is on fire, tangible things are on fire . . . the mind (*mano*)[12] is on fire, things that are thought (*dhammā*)[13] are on fire, thought coming to the mind is on fire, mind-contact[14] is on fire, and that [sensation] which originates dependently from mind-contact, felt as either pleasant or painful or neither painful nor pleasant, that also is on fire. . . .

[4] 'Considering thus, mendicant brothers, an instructed disciple of the Noble[15] becomes indifferent[16] to the eye, and indifferent to material-forms . . . to the ear, and to sounds . . . to the nostrils, and to odours . . . to the tongue, and to tastes . . . to the body, and to tangible things . . . to the mind,[17] and to things that are thought. . . . Becoming

[1] Ch. 14 *c* §§ 7 [3], 12 [1] n; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 1 [502] n, 4 [11] (*sight*), 5 [3] (ii). Cp. Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n; Ap. D *a* § 9 (i); also Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *saḷāyatana*), and Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] n. The same subject is treated in *Saṃ*, xli of *Saṃ. Nik.* (Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [10]) with further analysis: the fire is not present unless there is desire.

[2] Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [3]; see § 8 below. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

[3] 'Mental impressions based on the eye', SBE, xiii, p. 134. Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7].

[4] Ap. D *b* § 2 [6].

[5] Or, consequently. Ap. B *c* 2 (2, *-paccayā*).

[6] Ch. 9 *a* § 3 [11]; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28].

[7] Ap. D *a* § 10; Ap. I *a* § 2 n (*delusion*).

[8] i.e. of egoism, deluded as to individuality.

[9] i.e. birth and the individuality conferred by birth (Ap. B *c* § 2, 2). The meaning of *jāti* is much the same as that of the difficult word *saṃkhārā* (cp. Ap. B *c* § 1, 2). See § 6 below; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3].

[10] Or, with individuality—with that which decays and dies and has many sorrows.

[11] Omitting repetitions.

[12] Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [16]; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 4 [12] (*citta*).

[13] Or, things that are objects of thought. 'Thoughts', SBE, xiii, p. 135. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [5]; Ch. 9 *a* §§ 5, 7, 11; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [8]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 6 [246], 14 [91]; Ch. 14 *c* § 14 [3]; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [5]; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [10]; Ch. 21 § 7 [24]; Ap. C *b* § 2; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14); Ap. I *b* § 3 (*ideas*). Cp. Ch. 4 § 10 [3]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [25]; also Part I (title).

[14] 'Impressions received by the mind', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 352.

[15] Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9].

[16] Ch. 5 *c* § 4 [46]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [422]; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [12].

[17] i.e. to thoughts of sensual things and egoistic desires. That the powerfully analytical and practical mind of Gotama counselled unqualified aversion from the mind and all ideas is impossible (Ap. F 1). This would have been to set the Four Noble Truths, including the Noble Eightfold Path, in which he concentrated his teaching, at naught, and would savour strongly of the idealistic asceticism which Gotama rejected before he re-entered the practical world and commenced his forty-five years' ministry of selfless thought and labour (cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4, *middle road*). See Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [8].

indifferent he becomes free from desire;[1] becoming free from desire he is liberated.

§ 6. [4 cd.] 'When he is liberated, there arises in him the knowledge, "I am liberated."[2] He knows "Closed[3] is individual existence (*jāti*),[4] lived is the holy-life; done is what ought to be done, there is nothing beyond this state". '[5]

Now whilst this exposition[6] was being set forth the minds (*cittāni*) of the thousand mendicants ceased from grasping (*anupādāya*) and were liberated from the defilements.[7]

(2) *The Gift of the Veḷuvana.* (i) *Commentarial account*

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (*Nidāna-kathā*), *JN*, *83 ff.*[8]

§ 7. [JN, p. 83] Attended by three thousand Saints he proceeded to the Laṭṭhivana Park (*Laṭṭhi-van-uyyānaṃ*)[9] in the neighbourhood[10] of the town of Rājagaha, in order to fulfil his promise made to King Bimbisāra.[11] When the king heard from the guardian[12] of the park 'The Teacher (*Satthā*)[13] is come, he went to the Teacher accompanied by innumerable[14] holy men and householders (*brāhmaṇa-gahapatikehi*)[15] and fell at the feet[16] of the Leader (*Tathāgatassa*). . . .[17] Then he and his followers seated themselves respectfully beside him.

§ 8. [p. 83 cd.] Then the thought came to those holy men and householders: 'Now how is it; does the great devotee (*Mahā-samaṇo*)[18] lead the holy-life with Uruvela-Kassapa, or does Uruvela-Kassapa

[1] Freedom from desire is the object held up in this discourse as in the First Sermon. But the fourth Noble Truth, calling for activity in mind, word, and deed, must not be overlooked.

[2] This close of the Sermon is an often-repeated formula. Ap. D *a* § 6.

[3] Literally, destroyed.

[4] See § 5 [2] (p. 69, n. 9) above.

[5] Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *c* § 5; Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9]. 'This state' in this context might refer to the condition of mind in which the fires of lust, hatred, and delusion, all individualistic desires and misapprehensions, are extinguished here in this life (Ap. D *c*, *Arahat*). The passage, however, is the regular formula for full enlightenment (*Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 63, v, p. 165). If this oft-repeated formula is early it is crucial and may be assumed to accord with the doctrine that there are no permanently separate selves (Ch. 4 § 18 [3], *anattā*).

[6] In this great conversion sermon the fundamental idea is, simply, the need of divesting the mind of egoism—of the sense of a separate individuality, whose interests are to be pursued irrespective of others.

[7] Ch. 5 *c* § 10. Continued in § 11 below.

[8] Continued from § 1 above.

[9] Sapling-grove-park (see § 11 below; Int. § 125). The word *laṭṭhi* means stick or sapling, probably here of bamboo (cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [108]). The word *uyyāna* means a large pleasure-ground (Ch. 1 § 9; cp. § 10 below).

[10] Pāli, *-upacāre*.

[11] Ch. 3 § 2. The *Mahā-vagga* account says nothing of this promise (see § 11 below).

[12] Ch. 12 *e* § 10.

[13] Ap. E *b* § 2.

[14] Literally, 'twelve myriad'. See § 11 below.

[15] Ap. F 2 *c* (*Brāhman*); and Int. § 185. See § 11 below (*householders*).

[16] Int. § 168.

[17] Omitting mention of the mystic sign of the sacred wheel (Ch. 14 *d* § 1; and Ch. 1 § 6) on the Buddha's feet and the bright light emanating from them.

[18] See § 11 [2] below; Ch. 23 *b* § 2; and Part I, title (*Buddha*) n.

lead the holy-life with the great devotee?' And the Blessed One . . .[1] addressed the Elder (*theraṃ*) in the verse:[2]

'What hast thou seen, dweller in Uruvelā, that thou, called the Emaciated, hast abandoned Agni (*aggiṃ*)?[3]
I ask thee, Kassapa, the meaning of this. Why hast thou abandoned the fire-sacrifice[4] (*aggi-huttaṃ*)?'

Then the Elder . . . replied:

'Sacrifices (*yaññā*) promise material-things (*rūpe*)[5] and things heard and savours and sensual delights.
In regarding these supports (*upadhīsu*)[6] I perceived "This is dross (*malaṃ*)"; therefore have I no pleasure in sacrifice or oblation.'

Then he fell down with his head at the feet of the Right-farer[7] (*Tathāgatassa*) and said: 'Master (*bhante*),[8] the Blessed One is my teacher; I am a learner (*savako*).'[9] . . .[10] Then the Blessed One . . .[11] made clear the Four Truths (*cattārisaccāmi*).[12] And the Magadha[13] king (*Magadharājā*) together with . . .[14] vast numbers was established in the reward of stream-attaining[15] (*sota-patti-phale*), and a vast number declared their lay-discipleship (*upāsakattaṃ*).[16] . . .[17]

§ 9. [JN, p. 84] On the next day all the folk who dwelt in Rājagaha . . .[18] came early from Rājagaha to the Laṭṭhivana to see the Successor[19] (*Tathāgataṃ*). The road six miles long (*ti-gāvuta-maggo*)[20] became quite full. . . .[21] And the place was called *Vaṇṇa-bhū* (Praise-place)[22] . . .[23]

[1] Omitting details.
[2] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*; see § 12 below.
[3] 'The Fire-God', BBS, i, p. 114; 'sacred fire', SBE, xiii, p. 138. Int. § 186; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; see §§ 3 above, 22 [3] n below. Cp. Ch. 10 *c* [4] (45).
[4] Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [2]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (11); also Ch. 11 *a* § 2; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24]; Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. G 1 *a*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 6; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 4 (*offering*); Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [2] n; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5].
[5] See § 5 [2] above.
[6] Or, bases of egoism. See § 12 below; Ch. 8 *j* § 11 n; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]; Ap. F 1 *c* [162]; Ap. I *b* § 5 [18]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 11 (*bases*); Ch. 5 *a* § 2 [v. 2] (*attachments*); Ap. C *b* § 1.
[7] Or, Leader, Ap. A 2 *c*.
[8] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.
[9] Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [17].
[10] Omitting the Buddha's miraculous rising in the air seven times. Int. § 94 (iii).
[11] Omitting the Jātaka-story of the Bodhisatta's previous conquest of Uruvela-Kassapa in a former birth. Int. § 92; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2.
[12] Ap. G 1 *b*; cp. § 12 [6] below.
[13] Cp Ch. 11 *c* § 21.
[14] Omitting 'eleven'. The word *nahuta* means an indeterminately vast number. There were twelve such present (see § 11 below).
[15] Or, conversion. See § 16 below; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ap. D *c* § 3 [7].
[16] Ch. 8 *l*; see § 12 [8] below.
[17] Omitting the king's mention of his five early wishes now fulfilled (see § 13 n below), his invitation for the next day and his departure.
[18] Omitting '18 kotis (100,000) in number', and further details.
[19] Leader or Right-farer (Ap. A 2 *c*). 'The successor of the Buddhas', BBS, i, p. 116.
[20] Literally, the road of three gāvutas. A *gāvuta* was a quarter of a *yojana*, or league (Ch. 2 § 7). See Ch. 11 *b* § 3.
[21] Omitting details.
[22] 'Place of Praise', BBS. Int. § 125. Cp. Ch. 8 *e* § 2 [1].
[23] Omitting 'for at such spots all the greater and lesser characteristics of a Buddha, and the glorious beauty of his person, are fated to be sung', BBS. Omitting also further details, and the appearance of Sakka (Int. § 93, i) in the form of a young Brāhman and the verses sung by him (see § 13 n below).

§ 10. [JN, p. 85] Then the Teacher entered Rājagaha together with a thousand mendicants. The king made a great gift to the Order headed by the Buddha (*Buddha-pamukhassa saṃghassa*), and caused water[1] to be brought . . . and poured it over the hand of the tenfold [Sage] (*Dasa-balassa*)[2] whilst presenting the Veḷuvana Park (*Veḷuvan-uyyānaṃ*),[3] saying: 'Revered sir, I cannot live without the Three Jewels (*tīni ratanāni*).[4] I wish to visit the Blessed One at all seasons. The park called the Laṭṭhivana is distant; but this our park called the Veḷuvana is near, and is easily reached, and is a suitable residence for a Buddha. May the Blessed One accept this from me.' . . .[5] When the Teacher had accepted the Veḷuvana Garden (*Veḷuvan-ārāmaṃ*)[6] and had given thanks for it, he rose and went together with the company of mendicants to the Veḷuvana.[7]

(ii) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, xxii[8]

§ 11. [MV, I. xxii. 1] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Gayā-Head[9] as long as he wished proceeded towards Rājagaha[10] with a great company, a thousand mendicant brothers, all formerly matted-haired ascetics. Then journeying gradually[11] the Blessed One came to Rājagaha. And there the Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha in the Laṭṭhivana Park,[12] by the shrine[13] [called] Supatiṭṭha (*Supatiṭṭhe cetiye*).[14] [2] And the Māgadhan[15] (*Māgadho*) king Seniya[16] Bimbisāra[17] heard: 'Verily the devotee Gotama[18] the Sakyan (*Sakya-*

[1] Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; Ch. 10 *a* § 3; and Int. § 190 (*legal procedure*).
[2] Ch. 10 *a* § 2.
[3] Int. § 126; see § 14 [17] below. Cp. § 7 above and Ch. 1 § 9 (*uyyāna*); also Ch. 13 *b* § 1 n. This is the famous Bamboo-grove, the first home of the Order. King Bimbisāra is not included as a donor in the list of foremost laymen (Ch. 10 *c* [6]). The Veḷuvana was not yet a monastery, but a garden for meditation (Ch. 11 *c* § 4); the gift seems to have been made without prejudice to the claims of other sects and philosophies.
[4] The Triad; Ch. 8 *d*. Cp. Ch. 1 § 1; Ap. A 2 *a* (4).
[5] Omitting the shaking of the earth at the acceptance of the gift. Int. § 94 (i).
[6] The words *ārāma* (pleasure-garden) and *uyyāna* (open space) are used alternatively: Int. § 126; Ch. 18 *b* § 1; and Ch. 1 § 9; also Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* § 11 [1]; Ch. 12*c* § 1 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 10 [1], 11 [1]; Ch. 14 *e* § 5 [1]. For other gardens of the Order see Ch. 10 *a* § 4; Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 2 [1], 18 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 1 [1], 9 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 21 § 4 [19].
[7] Continued in § 16 below.
[8] Continued from § 6 above.
[9] See § 5 above.
[10] Int. § 125.
[11] See § 2 above.
[12] See § 7 above; Ch. 11 *b* § 3; Ch. 11 *c* § 1.
[13] Literally, cairn or burial-mound. Int. § 134; Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16]; Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4]. In the *Pārāyana-vagga* of the Sutta-Nipāta (PTS, p. 218) Buddha stays 'at the Stone Shrine (*pāsāṇake cetiye*) among the Magadhas'.
[14] Int. § 125.
[15] Int. § 158.
[16] This name or title means literally soldier, army-leader, or emperor. Cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110] (*senā-pati*); also Ch. 3 § 5 (*senā-nigama*); Ch. 10 *c* (71) n.
[17] Int. §§ 30, 168; see § 7 above. It is to be observed, as discounting the story of Bimbisāra's conversion, that the Jains also claimed him as a supporter. See Ch. 3 § 1.
[18] '*Samaṇa Gotama*' was the usual appellation of the Buddha among non-Buddhists, Gotama being his family name: Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13]; Ch. 8 *k*

putto),[1] he who has gone forth from the Sakyan clan (*Sakya-kulā*),[2] has arrived and is staying at Rājagaha. . . .[3] [3] Then the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra, together with . . .[4] vast numbers of Brāhmans and householders[5] of Magadha[6] (*Māgadhikehi*), drew near to where the Blessed One was. . . .[7]

§ 12. [4] Then the thought came to them . . . 'Now how is it; does the great devotee lead the holy-life with Uruvela-Kassapa,[8] or does Uruvela-Kassapa lead the holy-life with the great devotee?' And the Blessed One addressed the venerable Uruvela-Kassapa in the verse:[9]

'What hast thou seen, dweller in Uruvela, that thou, called the Emaciated, hast abandoned Agni?
I ask thee, Kassapa, the meaning of this. Why hast thou abandoned the fire-sacrifice?'
'Sacrifices[10] promise material-things and things heard and savours and sensual delights.
In regarding these supports I perceived "This is dross"; therefore have I no pleasure in sacrifice or oblation.'
[5] 'And if thy mind (*mano*) takes no more pleasure therein, Kassapa (said the Blessed One), in material things, things heard, or savours,
Then wherein, in the world of spirits and men (*deva-manussa-loke*),[11] does thy mind delight? O Kassapa, tell me this.'
'I have seen the tranquil state (*padaṃ santaṃ*);[12] without residue[13] [of self][14] (*an-upadhīkaṃ*), without anything[15] [of self], not attached to sensual existence (*kāma-bhave*),[16]

[6]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 19 *b* §§ 6 [6] n, 7; Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23]; Ap. A 2 *b* (66); Ap. B *b* § 3 [2]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [37]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8]. For *Samaṇa* see also Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]; Ap. A 2 *d*, n. Cp. § 8 above; Ch. 8 *g* § 3 (*gotta*); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 1. This designation is also used by the disciples (Ch. 13 *a* § 6).

1 Int. § 148 (ii); Ch. 1 § 6 [55] n; Ch. 21 § 7 [25] n. Cp. Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7]; also Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2].

2 Int. § 159 n; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* § 13; Ch. 13 *c* § 1; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502]; Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8]; see § 18 [4] below. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (19).

3 Omitting repetitions. Omitting also a eulogy of Gotama as the '*Sammā-sambuddha* . . . the teacher of spirits and of men (*deva-manussānaṃ*; Ch. 6 *b* § 1)'.

4 Omitting 'twelve'. See §§ 7, 8 above.

5 The Pāli word is *gaha-patika*, which is used of well-to-do laymen, and these perhaps include any who are not priests or devotees. See § 7 above; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n; also Ap. H 3 *a* § 2. Cp. Ap. H 4 *b* § 2; also Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [14].

6 Magadha may be a place-name as well as a tribal name. Int. § 123; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1] n.

7 Omitting details of how they sat down near the Teacher.

8 Ap. A 1 *b*.

9 See § 8 above; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 (ii).

10 *Yaññā*; see § 3 [19] above.

11 Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1].

12 Literally, 'path'. Ap. C *b* § 11 (285); cp. § 20 below.

13 See §§ 8 above, 24 below; Ap. C *b* § 1; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 6 (*survival*); Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] (*outflow*). 'The basis of existence (*upadhi*)', SBE, xiii, p. 138.

14 Ap. D (*Egoism*). The uprooting of egoism seems here to be the ideal, not the egoistic eradication of the danger of re-birth (Ap. B *a*), such as was the Jain ideal (Int. § 184).

15 'In which . . . the obstacles to perfection (kiñcana) have ceased', SBE.

16 Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *bhava*).

Not becoming otherwise[1] (*an-aññatha-bhāviṃ*), independent (*an-añña-neyyaṃ*);[2] therefore have I no pleasure in sacrifice and oblation.'

[6] Then the venerable Uruvela-Kassapa . . . said to the Blessed One: 'Master, the Blessed One is my teacher; I am a learner.'[3] . . . [7] Then the Blessed One . . . addressed to them a graduated discourse. . . .[4] [8] As when a clean garment freed from all soiling takes the dye completely, even so there arose in . . .[5] vast numbers of Brāhmans and householders from Magadha headed by Bimbisāra, as they sat there, the stainless clear vision of the Law (*dhamma-cakkhuṃ*):[6] 'Everything[7] that has by nature an origin has also by nature a cessation.'[8] And a vast number declared their lay-discipleship.[9]

§ 13. [9] . . .[10] [12] . . . Then before noon the Blessed One, wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe and alms-bowl,[11] entered Rājagaha with a great company, a thousand mendicant brothers, all formerly matted-haired ascetics. . . .[12] [15] Then the Blessed One went to where the dwelling (*nivesanaṃ*)[13] of the Māgadhan king, Seniya Bimbisāra, was. . . .[14] And when the Blessed One, having eaten, had withdrawn his hand from the bowl,[15] the king sat down beside him.

§ 14. [16] And this thought came to the king as he sat beside him: 'Where now should the Blessed One stay, not too far from the town

[1] 'Which cannot pass over into another state', SBE.

[2] Literally, 'not to be led by another'. Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ap. G 1 *a*.

[3] *Sāvaka*. The speech is taken from Kassapa's account of his conversion in *Saṃ. Nik.* xvi, Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [17].

[4] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. It is to be observed that the Jātaka Introduction summarizes the whole of the 'graduated discourse' as 'the Four Truths' (see § 8 above).

[5] Omitting 'eleven'.

[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; see § 19 n below.

[7] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [vi. 29]. This phrase occurs as prominently in the legend of Vipassin Buddha (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2) as in the *Mahā-vagga* introduction.

[8] i.e. The many pass [the One remains] (Ap. G 2 *a*). This famous phrase must mean that the many pass naturally, by the impermanence of their nature (Ap. E), not after agelong delay and effort to overcome or purify their durability as was the Jain teaching (Int. § 184). If the phrase marks a stage beyond the perception of the four Omens and the sense of mortality in Ch. 1 (§ 10, *age*) it must imply a consciousness of the Permanent behind the impermanent. Cp. § 19 (*cessation*) below; Ch. 9 *a* [3] (*perishable*).

[9] See § 8 above; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*. Contrast Ch. 7 *c* § 1.

[10] Omitting stock passages which are found in Ch. 6 *a* § 7. Omitting also a detailed account of the king's five wishes formed when he was a prince and now fulfilled (see § 8 n above), referring to his obtaining the kingdom and receiving the Supreme Buddha; also the king's invitation for the next day and his departure. The whole passage has the appearance of being a dramatic version of probabilities rather than historical.

[11] Ch. 6 *a* § 11. Most of these details are found in the story of Anāthapiṇḍika in Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7].

[12] Omitting the appearance of Sakka (see § 9 n above) in the form of a young Brāhman and the verses sung by him in praise of the qualities of the Blessed One and of his thousand companions, formerly Jaṭilas.

[13] The phrasing is repeated from Ch. 6 *a* § 11 (see Ch. 7 *b* § 7). The palace apparently was in the new fortress-city built by Bimbisāra outside the romantic circle of hills which surround the site of the prehistoric city (Int. § 128). See Ch. 3 § 1 n.

[14] Omitting details of the meal provided by the king.

[15] Ch. 6 *a* § 12.

(*gāmato*) and not too near, suitable for coming and going, approachable for people having business with him, by day not crowded, by night free from noise, undisturbed, solitary, fit for rest away from men, suited for retirement?'[1] [17] Then this thought came to the king: 'There is our park, the Veḷuvana[2] (*Veḷuvanaṃ uyyānaṃ*). . . .[3] What now if I should give the Veḷuvana park to the mendicant-community (*bhikkhu-saṃghassa*)[4] headed by the Buddha?'[5] [18] Then the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra having taken a golden pitcher made a gift (*onojesi*)[6] to the Blessed One [by pouring out water], saying 'Revered sir (*bhante*),[7] I give[8] this Veḷuvana park to the mendicant-community headed by the Buddha.' The Blessed One accepted the garden (*ārāmaṃ*). Then the Blessed One having instructed, informed, stirred and gladdened the king by discourse on the Law,[9] rose from his seat and departed.

§ 15. [18 cd.] Then in this connexion (*nidāne*)[10] the Blessed One delivered a discourse on the Law and instructed the mendicant brothers and said: 'I sanction (*anu-jānāmi*),[11] mendicant brothers, [the possession of] a garden.'[12]

(3) *Sāriputta and Moggallāna.* (i) *Commentarial account*

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā), JN, p. 85[13]

§ 16. [JN, p. 85] At that time two wandering philosophers (*paribbājaka*),[14] Sāriputta[15] and Moggallāna,[16] were staying near Rājagaha, seeking the Deathless (*amataṃ*).[17] Of these two Sāriputta saw the Elder Assaji[18] begging alms, and being favourably impressed approached him and heard from him the verse[19] 'Whatsoever things are produced

[1] See Ch. 14 *c* § 1 [8]. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* §§ 8 [7], 10 [8].
[2] Int. § 126; Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* § 2. See § 10 n above.
[3] Omitting repetitions.
[4] Ap. H.
[5] Ap. H 2 *b* § 1. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [4].
[6] Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; Ch. 10 *a* § 3. Cp. Ch. 8 *j* (*property*).
[7] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9].
[8] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]; Ch. 21 § 4 [19].
[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 12.
[10] Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [3]; Ch. 8 *a* [4]; Ch. 23 *b* § 8. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 4; Ap. B *a* § 4; Ap. B *c* §§ 2 (2) n, 4.
[11] Literally, recognize. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]. This may be said to be the second minute of the Saṃgha's proceedings, which mainly constitute the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, the first being that empowering the First Missioners to confer ordination. Much, if not most, of the narrative appended to these two minutes is evidently explanatory and of later date. Both minutes plainly are preliminary and less formal than the remaining resolutions. Cp. § 17 n below; and see footnote at end of Part I.
[12] Ch. 12 *c* § 1 [1]; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]. This was soon followed by the gift of dwellings bestowed by the Seṭṭhi of Rājagaha (Ch. 8 *j* § 10). Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 11 (*land*). Continued in § 18 below.
[13] Continued from § 10.
[14] Int. § 126.
[15] Int. § 30; Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [2]; Ch. 19 *a* §§ 1 [2], 2 [1]. See § 18 below.
[16] Int. § 30; Ch. 10 *c* (3); Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 26 n; Ch. 15 *b* § 5 [1].
[17] 'Seeking after salvation', BBS, i, p. 116. Ap. C *b* § 11 (374).
[18] See § 18 below; Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 5 *c* § 9; Ch. 11 *c* § 18.
[19] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

from a cause[1] (*Ye dhammā hetu-ppabhavā*)'; and he was established in the reward of stream-attaining.[2] And he repeated the verse to his companion the wandering philosopher Moggallāna, who also was established in the reward of stream-attaining. Then they both left Sañjaya[3] [their instructor], and together with their associates they received ordination from the Teacher (*satthu santike pabbajiṃsu*).[4] Of these two Mahā-Moggallāna attained arahatship[5] (*arahattaṃ pāpuṇi*) within seven days, and the Elder Sāriputta within half a month;[6] and the Teacher established these two in the position of chief-disciples (*agga-sāvaka-ṭṭhāne*).[7]

§ 17. [p. 85 cd.] On the day when the Elder Sāriputta attained Arahatship, [the Teacher] formed the Council of Disciples (*sāvaka-sannipātaṃ*).[8]

(ii) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, xxiii–xxiv, 4

§ 18. [MV, I. xxiii. 1] Now at that time Sañjaya[10] the wandering-philosopher (*paribbajako*)[11] was staying at Rājagaha with a large assembly of Wanderers, two hundred and fifty in number.[12] And at

[1] i.e. All created (compounded) things are transient; so therefore is individuality (Ap. E). It is expressly stated that the two were seeking the Deathless. They found satisfaction in this verse, which states that all caused things are transient. The inference is that they found by contrast the Deathless in the Uncreated (Ap. G 2 *a*), or (if *amata* means a state such as *Nibbāna*) an immortal state (Ap. D *c*, *Arahat*) in unison with the Uncaused. The verse is found in MV, I. xxiii (see § 19 below), but not elsewhere in the Piṭakas (BBS, Introduction, revised edition by Mrs. Rhys Davids, p. 215 n). This verse, 'the most famous Buddhist stanza', is 'found engraved on ten thousand votive gifts to Buddhist shrines in India' (T. W. Rhys Davids's lectures on *Buddhism, its History and Literature*, 2nd ed., 1926, p. 42). Whether it is to be interpreted as rejecting or accepting the doctrine of re-birth probably depends on its date.

[2] Or, conversion. See § 8 above.

[3] Int. § 182. This passage recounts the Buddha's first recorded meeting with the so-called Titthiyas or Hindu heterodox philosophers.

[4] No distinction was drawn as yet between the preliminary and the final parts of Ordination. Ch. 6 *b* § 2; Ap. H 1.

[5] Cp. § 20 below; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] (*three knowledges*); Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [8] n; also Ch. 13 *b* § 6 n. In this passage the first and last 'stages' to Arahatship are referred to; in the corresponding *Mahā-vagga* account there is no suggestion of 'stages' (Ap. B *a* § 6 [7] n).

[6] Ch. 11 *c* § 14 n.

[7] Ap. A 2 *b* (67); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. H 1 § 6 [7].

[8] 'Or perhaps, "He formed the Corporation of the Disciples", that is, the Order of Mendicants', BBS, i, p. 119 n. The phrase apparently implies that the Saṃgha was now formally constituted (Int. § 13; Ch. 8 *a* [4] (*meetings*); Ap. H 3; cp. § 15 n above). From this point Gotama began to reveal his great practical constructive powers. Continued in Ch. 7 *b* § 1.

[9] Continued from § 15.

[10] Int. § 182; see § 22 below; Ch. 7 *c* § 1; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1].

[11] Int. § 126; Ch. 8 *k* [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 9; Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1]. Sañjaya is described as both a *paribbājaka* and a *Titthiya* teacher (Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; and Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524] n).

[12] These appear to have been students of philosophy attending lectures at a school

that time Sāriputta[1] and Moggallāna[2] were leading a religious life[3] (*brahmacariyaṃ*) with Sañjaya the wandering philosopher. By these [two] an agreement was made: 'He who first comes to the Deathless[4] (*amataṃ adhigacchati*) shall instruct [the other].' [2] Then the venerable Assaji[5] before noon wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe and alms-bowl entered Rājagaha for alms (*piṇḍāya*).[6] His deportment with downcast eyes was perfect as he moved befittingly this way and that, looked this way and that, and bent and advanced.[7] And Sāriputta saw the venerable Assaji. . . .[8] [3] Then the venerable Assaji having gone through Rājagaha for alms, taking what he had obtained as alms, withdrew. Then Sāriputta drew near to where the venerable Assaji was . . . and standing on one side spoke to him thus: 'Thy faculties (*indriyāni*),[9] friend, are clear; the colour of thy skin is bright and pure. On whose account, friend, hast thou renounced [the world]? Who is thy teacher? Whose Law dost thou profess?'[10] [4] 'There is, friend, the great devotee Gotama the Sakyan, he who has gone forth from the Sakyan clan;[11] on account of him, the Blessed One, I have renounced [the world]. He, the Blessed One, is my teacher. I profess the Law of him, the Blessed One.' 'And what, venerable sir, does thy teacher declare, what does he announce?'[12] 'I indeed, friend, an newly and but a short while ordained,[13] recently come to this law and discipline (*dhamma-vinayaṃ*).[14] I cannot show thee the Law in full; but I will tell thee the meaning (*atthaṃ*)[15] briefly.' . . .

or college where they qualified for the calling of wandering teachers. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 11. Also Ch. 8 *a*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [2].

[1] Int. § 30; Ch. 7 *b* § 4; Ch. 8 *d* § 1; Ch. 10 *c* (2); Ch. 11 *c* § 6; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1]; Ch. 11 *f* § 6; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 10 n, 11 [1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 16 n; Ch. 14 *e* § 7; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [1]; Ch. 15 *a*, n; Ch. 18 *a* § 2; Ap. C *b* § 7; Ap. D *c* § 3 [10]; Ap. E *c* i § 8 n; Ap. G 1 *b* § 6; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 n. See § 16 above. The form of the name is matriarchal; cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1), *Māluṇkya-putta*, also Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [3] and *Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 102, *Mantāṇi-putta*. See Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1] n.

[2] Int. 30; Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [2]; Ch. 10 *c* (3); Ch. 11 *c* § 7; Ch. 12 *a* § 2 n; Ch. 13 *b* §§ 1 n, 6; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354] n; Ch. 14 *e* § 7; Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [476]; Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [1].

[3] Perhaps more properly 'a life of religious study'. Ch. 3 § 5.

[4] Ap. C *b* § 11 (374); see §§ 19 n and 21 below. If this passage can be trusted, the *amata* was a Hindu philosophic as well as a Buddhist ideal (Ap. G 2 *a* § 6; cp. Ch. 1 § 11, *Nirvāna*).

[5] See § 16 above; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [227].

[6] Ch. 7 *a* [MV, I, xxiii, 2] also § 18 [3] below (alms); Ch. 8 *k* [PTS, II, p. 1] § 18 (alms).

[7] Cp. Ch. 9 *a* [4].

[8] Omitting repetitions and details.

[9] Literally, ruling principles or powers. Compare the 'guiding' or 'ruling' faculty of the Stoics, Marcus Aurelius ii. 2, iv. 1; see IN 10. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*senses*); also Ch. 13 *e* § 9 [3] (*moral-faculties*); Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2].

[10] These phrases are repeated from Ch. 5 *a* § 4. The question is very suggestive of the earnest inquiry and the open mind which have always distinguished thoughtful Hinduism.

[11] See § 11 [2] above.

[12] Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7].

[13] These apologies must be taken as a polite convention in the presence of a learned stranger, since Assaji was one of the first sixty missioners.

[14] Ch. 3 § 5.

[15] Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [2]. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10.

§ 19. [5] Then the venerable Assaji pronounced to the wandering philosopher Sāriputta this statement[1] of the Law:

'Whatsoever natures (*dhammā*)[2] are produced from a cause,[3] of these the Leader (*Tathāgato*)[4] tells the cause (*hetuṃ*),[5]
And that which is the cessation (*yo nirodho*)[6] of these; thus the Great Recluse declares.'[7]

§ 20. [5 cd.] Then, when he had heard this statement of the Law there arose in Sāriputta the stainless clear vision of the Law (*dhamma-cakkhuṃ*):[8] 'Everything[9] that has by nature an origin has also by nature a cessation.'[10] He said: 'If this indeed is the Law, ye have reached even now to the griefless state[11] (*padam-a-sokaṃ*) unseen in the past[12] during many vast numbers of ages.'[13]

[1] The Pāli word is *pariyāya*, literally, 'discourse'.

[2] Or, phenomena. 'Objects', SBE, xiii, p. 146; 'things', ThB, p. 93. Ch. 4 § 10 (*dhammā*).

[3] See § 16 above.

[4] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[5] Either, their finiteness, which is implied in any case; or, the One, the impersonal Uncaused Cause, which may be the *amata* sought by the two students (see § 18 [1] above; Ap. G 2 *a*). For *hetu* see Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 10 (*sa-hetu-dhammaṃ*); and Ap. B *c* (*samuppāda*); also Ap. G 1 *c* § 1 (*Upatishya*).

[6] Either, their transience, which in any case is implied (Ap. E *c* i); or, the transcendence of their individuality in the selfless state of Nibbāna, which may be the *amata* sought by the two students (see § 18 [1] above). 'He has explained their cessation also', SBE; 'and also their cessation', ThB. The message of Gotama (Int. § 3; Ap. G 1 *b*) was twofold, namely (1) the transience of individuality (Ap. E), and (2) the passing of egoistic desire and sorrow upon the full realization of the former truth and all its implications, especially the divine fundamental unity (Ap. G 2 *a*). See § 12 [8] above (*cessation*); Ch. 4 §§ 10 (*nirodho*), 11 (*khayaṃ paccayānaṃ*); Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ap. B *c* §§ 2 (2), 5 [6]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 1; Ap. I, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7] (*ending*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [1] (*attha-gama*).

[7] This verse, which is here stated to summarize the Dhamma, is in effect a summary of the *Anattalakkhaṇa-Sutta* (Ch. 5 *b* § 2), which is the essential philosophic background or foundation of the First Sermon (Ap. G 1 *a*, i, *Four Truths*). These lines summarizing the Dhamma are in essence the same as the verses attributed to Gotama at the time of his Enlightenment (Ch. 4 § 10, *manifested*), and as the verse called the *Dhamma-cakkhu* (see §§ 12 [8] above, 20 below). They are an expansion of Assaji's summary in *Majjh*. 35 (Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]). The corollary of this concise statement of the Law is that the Uncaused Cause alone is permanent. To perceive this is to find with Gotama the lasting One amidst the fleeting Many (Int. § 98; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 25 n (the last words of the Buddha); Ap. C *b* § 11 (374); Ap. G 1 *a* (ii) n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 7 (383)). No sufficient grounds for idealist or transmigrationist explanations appear at this stage (Ap. G 1 *a*).

[8] i.e. the clear perception of the Law of Unity (Int. § 55 n). The *Jātaka* Introduction treats this final comprehension as Arahatship (see § 16 above; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 10). The mere perception of the transience of the Many cannot by itself constitute arahatship, which implies further a conviction of the permanence of the One and union with the same through transcendence of the self (Ap. F 2 *d*, *samādhi*). Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; see §§ 19 n above, 21 below; Ch. 11 *c* § 14 n. Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 5.

[9] Ch. 5 *c* § 7.

[10] Ap. E *a* i (*anicca*). The perception of the transitory nature of individuality is essential to Buddhist 'enlightenment' (Ch. 4 § 18, *transitory*). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7] (*origination*).

[11] Literally, 'path'. Cp. § 12 [5] above; Ap. C *b* § 11 (21).

[12] The only adequate interpretation of this ecstatic utterance implying the novelty (Int. § 9; Ap. G 1 *b*) as well as the sufficiency of the *Dhamma* appears to be that the Teacher had found an escape from the burdensome Indian doctrine of the ever-changing immortality of the Many (Ap. E *c* i § 5 [5]; also Ch. 4 § 16), and had revealed a new doctrine of present harmony and union with the deathless One (Ap. D *c*, *Arahat*).

[13] The Pāli word is *kappa* (Int. § 107). The passage conflicts with the theory that Gotama was the third Buddha of the present Kalpa (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*).

§ 21. [6] Then Sāriputta drew near to where the wandering philosopher Moggallāna was; and Moggallāna saw Sāriputta from afar approaching, and having seen him spoke thus: 'Thy faculties, friend, are clear, the colour of thy skin is bright and pure. Hast thou now, friend, come to the Deathless?'[1] 'Yea, friend, I have come to the Deathless.' . . .[2] [10] When he had heard the statement of the Law there arose in Moggallāna the stainless clear vision of the Law. . . .[3]

§ 22. [xxiv. 1] Then Moggallāna spoke thus to Sāriputta: 'Let us go, friend, to the presence of the Blessed One; he, the Blessed One, shall be our teacher.' Sāriputta replied: 'These two hundred and fifty Wanderers, friend, stay here on our account, looking to us; let us now inform them and as they think fit so let them do.' . . .[4] [2] Then Sāriputta and Moggallāna drew near to where the wandering-philosopher Sañjaya[5] was . . . and spoke thus: 'We go, friend, to the presence of the Blessed One; he, the Blessed One, will be our teacher.' 'Enough, friends,' said he, 'do not go; we three together will lead this company (*gaṇaṃ*)'[6] . . .[7] [3] Then Sāriputta and Moggallāna taking these two hundred and fifty Wanderers drew near to the Veḷuvana. . . .[8]

§ 23. [3 cd.] Then the Blessed One saw Sāriputta and Moggallāna from afar approaching, and having seen them spoke to the mendicant brothers and said: 'Here, mendicant brothers, are two friends arriving, Kolita[9] and Upatissa;[10] this will be a pair of disciples (*sāvaka-yugaṃ*) for me, the most excellent pair (*aggaṃ bhaddha-yugaṃ*).'[11]

§ 24. [3 cd.] They, being liberated[12] in the profound region of knowledge[13] by the supreme destruction of the bases (*upadhi-saṃkhaye*)[14] [of self], arrived at the Veluvana; and then the Teacher

[1] See § 18 [1] above. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2] (*añña*).

[2] Omitting repetitions and an account of the meeting with Assaji, together with the verses above.

[3] As in § 20 above.

[4] Omitting the assent of the Paribbājakas.

[5] Int. § 182.

[6] Ch. 3 § 5; see § 2 [1] above. Cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25] (*lead*).

[7] Omitting the usual double repetition of request and answer. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 8 *b* § 3. Cp. Ap. H 3 (*Assemblies*).

[8] Omitting the statement that blood issued forthwith from Sañjaya's mouth (cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 10 [3]). Sañjaya is the first of the Titthiyas or unorthodox Hindu teachers (Ap. G 2 *c*) whom Gotama encountered. That Gotama disliked and distrusted their metaphysical subtleties is evident. He wished to purify, not to abandon, the old Vedic religion. This is shown by his retention of the word Brāhman (Ap. F 2 *c*). It would appear that whilst Gotama differed from the Jaṭilas (Int. § 186) in that he denied personality to the One and to the Many, to Agni (see § 8 above) and to the individual soul (Ap. E *c* i), he differed from the sceptical Sañjaya in that he asserted the reality, though not the personality, of the One and of the Many, whereas the Sceptic denied all proof even of their reality. See § 18 above.

[9] Moggallāna; Ap. A 2 *b* (67).

[10] Ch. 14 *e* § 3 n; Ap. A 2 *b* (67); Ap. G 1 *c* § 1. Their better known names Sāriputta and Moggallāna were derived from their mothers; Ch. 10 *c* (2), (3); cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 (*Vedehi-putta*). See SBE, xiii, p. 149 n; ThB, pp. 94–5.

[11] Ch. 11 *c* § 26 [5] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [4] n.

[12] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[13] Pāli, *ñāṇa*. Cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] (*tisso vijjā*); also Ap. F 2 *d* (*samādhi*).

[14] See § 12 [5] above; cp. Ap. F 1 *b* § 5 (*foundations*). 'When (Sāriputta and Moggallāna), who had reached emancipation in the perfect destruction of the substrata (of existence), which is a profound subject accessible only to knowledge, came to the Veḷuvana', &c., SBE, xiii, p. 149.

explained about them saying: 'Here are two friends arriving, Kolita and Upatissa; this will be a pair of disciples for me, the most excellent pair.'[1] [4] . . .[2] Thus these venerable men received the *upasampadā*-ordination.[3]

b. Kapilavatthu re-visited:[4] Admission of members of Gotama's family to the Saṃgha

(i) *Commentarial account*

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (*Nidāna-kathā*), *JN*, 85 *ff*.[5]

§ 1. [JN, p. 85] Whilst the Leader[6] (*Tathāgate*) stayed there in the Veḷuvana, Suddhodana[7] the Rāja (*mahārāja*)[8] heard that his son, having practised austerities (*dukkara-kārikaṃ*)[9] for six years[10] and attained Supreme Enlightenment (*paramābhi saṃbodhiṃ*) and started the excellent Wheel of the Law,[11] was staying in the Veḷuvana at Rājagaha. . . .[12] [p. 86] Five months had passed since he departed from Benāres.[13] The cold season was over. . . .[14] On the full-moon day of Phagguna[15] the venerable Udāyin[16] . . . spoke to the Blessed One. . . . [p. 87] Then the Blessed One . . .[17] left Rājagaha and journeyed

[1] This slightly variant repetition illustrates how a text once embedded in the tradition was not easily uprooted, but was respected, however inconvenient and even inconsistent. IN 6 (*Canon*); see § 4 [23] n above.

[2] As in § 3 [19] above.

[3] Ch. 5 *c* § 8 (*admission*). The continuous narrative of the *Mahā-vagga* practically ceases here, though nominally this narrative is continued for a moment in Ch. 7 *c* §§ 1–2.

[4] Int. § 135.

[5] Continued from Ch. 7 *a* § 17.

[6] 'The Successor of the Buddhas', BBS, i, p. 119. Ap. A 2 *c*.

[7] Int. § 30; Ch. 1 §§ 4 n, 5. The name does not appear in the first four Nikāyas except in the legendary Suttanta 14 of *Dīgha Nik.*; it is used repeatedly in the Apadāna (Ch. 1 § 8 n), where he is termed *mahī-pati* or 'great lord' (ii, p. 501).

[8] Ch. 1 § 5; see § 7 [1] below. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84].

[9] Ch. 3 § 7.

[10] Ch. 2 § 5 n; Ch. 21 § 7 [25] n.

[11] *Pavatta-vara-dhamma-cakko*. Ch. 5 *b* § 1. 'Had founded the Kingdom of Righteousness', BBS, i, p. 119. See p. 215 of Mrs. Rhys Davids's new and revised edition of her husband's translation of the Jātaka Tales.

[12] Omitting the account of the nine messengers who were sent by Suddhodana to the Buddha, all of whom with their followers were converted and becoming Arahats (*arahattaṃ patvā*), immediately on hearing a single discourse by the Buddha (Ap. D *c*), forgot their message; also the sending of the tenth messenger Kāludāyin, who was similarly converted but succeeded in delivering the message begging the Buddha's return to Kapilavatthu.

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 1.

[14] Omitting details of the delivery of his message by Udāyin or Kāludāyin. The prefix Kāla means Dark. He is mentioned in the *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, vol. i, p. 25; Ch. 10 *c* [4], 38), and the verses cited in the JN text are attributed to him in *Thera-gātha* 527–36. See ThB, p. 97.

[15] February–March. Ch. 10 *d* § 2.

[16] Called also Kāl-udāyin; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (528) n; Ch. 13 *d* § 1.

[17] Omitting 'Attended by twenty thousand mendicants free from sin—ten thousand from the upper classes [Int. § 159] in Magadha and Aṅga [Int. § 162], and ten thousand from the upper classes in Kapilavatthu', see Mrs. Rhys Davids's edition of the *Nidāna-kathā*, p. 218, also Ch. 10 *c* (38) n, and Ch. 10 *d* § 2. Compare the much earlier traditional number of the Buddha's companions on his tours, namely 500, according to the first four Nikāyas (Int. § 121; Ch. 7 *a* § 5). The number was doubtless continuously raised by the enthusiasm of succeeding chroniclers. The original number no doubt was small.

onward a league a day, going slowly so as to reach Kapilavatthu,[1] sixty leagues[2] distant from Rājagaha, within two months.[3] . . .[4] [p. 89] He entered Kapilavatthu to beg for alms; and there no one came to him. . . .[5] Beginning at the first house he begged straight on. . . .[6]

§ 2. [p. 89 cd.] The Rāja . . . went quickly and stood before the Blessed One. . . .[7] [p. 90] Standing in the middle of the street he[8] uttered the verse:[9]

> 'One must rise, one must not be slothful (*na-ppamajjeyya*);[10] one must follow the law of good conduct (*su-caritaṃ*).[11]
> Who follows the Law lies down in bliss (*sukhaṃ*)[12] in this world and in that beyond (*asmim loke paramhi-ca*).'[13]

When the verse was uttered the Rāja attained the reward of conversion.[14] . . .[15] Then as soon as the Rāja was established in the reward of Conversion (*sotapatti-phalaṃ*) he took the Blessed One's alms-bowl and led the Blessed One and his followers to the palace. . . .[16]

§ 3. [p. 91] On the following day the anointing[17] of the Rāja's son

[1] Or Kapilapura. See § 3 below. Ch. 11 *c* § 3.

[2] Int. § 124; Ch. 2 § 7.

[3] i.e. travelling one league (about 8 miles) a day. Int. § 123.

[4] Omitting Udāyin's miraculous journeys (Int. § 94, iv) to prepare Suddhodana for the Buddha's reception; and also picturesque but inconsistent details of Gotama's reception by his kinsmen; and a display of miracles in the air (Int. § 94, iii) by the Buddha.

[5] Omitting details and Gotama's recollections of the former Buddhas (Ap. A 2 *c*). Regarding Gotama's first return to Kapilavatthu cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1] n.

[6] Omitting a description of the local curiosity, and of the halo proceeding from the Buddha, and Rāhula's mother's report to the Rāja.

[7] Omitting a dialogue in which the Rāja protests against a warrior (*khattiya*; Int. § 159) of his line begging bread, and Gotama speaks of the line of previous Buddhas from Dīpankara and Koṇḍañña to Kassapa and 'thousands of other Buddhas' (Ap. A 2 *c*).

[8] The Blessed One.

[9] *Dhammapada* (168).

[10] Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7] (Gotama's last words).

[11] Ap. G 1 *a*. 'The holy life', BBS, i, p. 126.

[12] This is scarcely the disinterested bliss of Nibbāna. Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]; Ap. E *b*, *Note*.

[13] Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169]; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]; Ap. C *a* § 2; Ap. F 1 *a* § 1. Contrast Ch. 5 *c* § 5. Compare *idha* and *paratrā* (Ap. G 1 *c* § 7).

[14] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[15] Omitting a parenthetical account of his attaining the stages of Once Returning and Never Returning, and finally on his death-bed Arahatship (*arahattaṃ*; Ap. D *c*). Thus Suddhodana attained Arahatship without becoming a monk (see § 5 below; Ch. 10 *b* § 2; Ap. C *b*, *Note*). The Rāja was not so zealous an early convert as to be included in the list of foremost lay-disciples (Ch. 10 *c* [6]).

[16] Omitting an account of the meal given by the Rāja, and later the Buddha's interview with Rāhula's mother, who had declined to attend at the meal (Int. § 190, *women*). During this interview the Rāja states that his daughter-in-law had refused the request of her relatives to return to them (apparently with a view to her remarriage). See Ch. 13 *c* § 11 [90].

[17] Pāli, *abhiseka*; literally, 'sprinkling'; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24]. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*consecrated*); Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [29], [34]; Ch. 22 *b* § 19 [30]. 'Coronation', BBS. No difficulty was raised when Nanda resigned office immediately hereafter, and, if this passage can be trusted, it may be inferred that he was a sharer in high office, not sole ruler. Int. § 164.

(*rāja-kumārassa*) Nanda[1] was being celebrated, together with the ceremonies of his house-entrance[2] and the carrying-away[3] [of his bride]. . . .[4] On the third day after reaching Kapilapura[5] the Blessed One conferred the renunciation-ordination[6] on Nanda (*Nandaṃ pabbājesi*).

§ 4. [p. 91 cd.] On the seventh day Rāhula's mother[7] . . .[8] sent him to the Blessed One. . . . And the boy followed the Blessed One saying: 'Give me, recluse (*samaṇa*), [my] inheritance.' . . . Then the thought came to the Blessed One: '. . . Come, let me give him the sevenfold Noble Treasure (*satta-vidhaṃ ariya-dhanaṃ*)[9] obtained on the throne of enlightenment (*bodhi-maṇḍe*),[10] and make him master of the inheritance of the higher world.'[11] Then he said to Sāriputta[12] [p. 92] 'Confer on the young[13] Rāhula the renunciation-ordination.

§ 5. [p. 92 cd.] When the boy (*kumāre*) had been ordained the Rāja . . . was unable to support his grief and expressed it to the Blessed One and asked a boon, saying: 'It would be well, Master (*bhante*), if the reverend [brothers][14] should not confer the renunciation-ordination on a son without the permission of his mother and father.'[15] And the Blessed One granted the boon. . . .[16]

[1] The Buddha's half-brother. See § 8 below; Int. § 165; Ch. 1 § 7 n; Ch. 10 *c* (43); Ch. 13 *c* § 11 [91]; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*.

[2] Pāli, *geha-ppavesana*. Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*).

[3] Pāli, *vivāha*. Int. § 190 (*marriages*); Ap. G 1 *c* § 4.

[4] Omitting the account of how Gotama handed his alms-bowl to Nanda and by delay in taking it back led him on to accepting ordination against his real wish. This unlikely story is doubtless based on Nanda's subsequent lack of zeal. An unwilling convert could only have been a source of inconvenience to Gotama.

[5] Kapilavatthu, see § 1 [87] above; Ch. 10 *d* § 2.

[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 1; Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [29].

[7] Ch. 1 § 8. This title does not appear in the first four Nikāyas, and appears only once in *Vin. Piṭ.*

[8] Omitting the contrivances of Rāhula's mother to make Gotama grant the boy his inheritance (see § 7 [1] below). These probabilities present obvious temptations to a narrator. See § 8 n below.

[9] i.e. *saddhā* (belief; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; cp. Ap. F 2 *d*, *right outlook*), *sīla* (duty; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]), *hiri* (shame; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]), *ottappa* (conscience; Ch. 20 § 4 [3]; Ch. 21 § 15 (5) n), *suta* (learning; Ch. 20 § 4), *cāga* (renunciation; Ch. 8 *l* § 2; cp. Ap. F 1 *a*) and *paññā* (insight; Ap. F 2 *a*, 132)—see Rhys Davids's Pāli Dict. under *cāga*. Ch. 14 *c* § 9 [1]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [1] and Ch. 15 *b* § 4 [2] n. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 8 (*seven parts of wisdom*); also Ch. 1 § 1 (*triple*), and Ap. A 2 *a* (4).

[10] Ch. 10 *d* § 3.

[11] Or, a wider, i.e. spiritual, sphere (*lok-uttara*).

[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 18; see § 7 below.

[13] Or, 'Prince' (Rāhula). Pāli, *Rāhula-kumāra*. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18]; Ch. 19 *b* § 2 [1]; and Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110] (*kumārī*); also Ch. 6 *a* § 1; Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [9]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*youths*); Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] (*prince*); Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [13]; Ch. 14 *d* § 2; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9. Compare also *kulaputta* (Ch. 6 *a* § 2); and *rāja* (Ch. 1 § 5 [52]).

[14] *Ayya* (noble ones).

[15] See § 8 below. It is implied that Rāhula was now only seven years old. This provides dramatic situations, but there seem to be good reasons for believing that he was born within the first few years after Gotama's marriage and had now reached an age to understand his father's teaching (Ch. 2 § 4).

[16] Omitting Suddhodana's establishment in the reward of Never Returning (Ap. B *a* § 6 [7] n) on hearing a Jātaka story. He had taken the second step immediately after taking the first (see § 2 n above). For the fourth step see Ch. 10 *b* § 2. On the outlook leading to Arahatship see Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [8] n.

§ 6. [p. 92 cd.] Then he returned to Rājagaha[1] together with the company of mendicant brothers, and stayed in the Sīta Grove (*Sīta-vane*).[2]

(ii) *Vinaya account*

Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, liv, 1[3]

§ 7. Then the Blessed One having stayed in Rājagaha as long as he wished proceeded to Kapilavatthu. Journeying gradually he came to Kapilavatthu, and there the Blessed One stayed among the Sakkas (*Sakkesu*),[4] at Kapilavatthu, in the Nigrodha Garden (*Nigrodh-ārāme*).[5] Then before noon the Blessed One wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe and alms-bowl went to where the dwelling[6] of Suddhodana[7] the Sakka (*Sakkassa*)[8] was, and having arrived he sat down on the seat indicated. Then the lady the mother of Rāhula (*Rāhula-mātā-devī*)[9] spoke thus to the young Rāhula (*Rāhula-kumāraṃ*):[10] 'This, Rāhula, is thy father; go and ask for an inheritance.' [2] Then the young Rāhula went to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near he stood in front of the Blessed One and said: 'Blissful (*sukha*) is thy shadow, O devotee.' And the Blessed One rising from his seat departed. And the young Rāhula followed the Blessed One supplicating: 'Give me, devotee, an inheritance; give me, devotee, an inheritance.' Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Sāriputta saying: 'Do thou then, Sāriputta, confer on the young Rāhula the renunciation-ordination.'[11] 'How, revered sir (*bhante*), should I confer the renunciation-ordination on the young Rāhula?' [3] Then in this connexion[12] and on this occasion (*pakaraṇe*)[13] the Blessed One delivered a discourse on the Law and instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'I sanction (*anujānāmi*),[14] mendicant brothers, a renunciation-ordination for novices (*sāmaṇera-pabbajjaṃ*)[15] with the three declarations of taking refuge (*tīhi saraṇa-gamanehi*). . . .[16]

§ 8. [4] Then the venerable Sāriputta conferred the renunciation-ordination on the young Rāhula.[17] And Suddhodana the Sakka went

[1] The JN narrative is continued in Ch. 10 *a* § 1.
[2] Int. § 130; Ch. 11 *c* § 3. Cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 1 n.
[3] From the ninth Bhānavāra or subdivision of *Khandhaka I* of the *Mahā-vagga*, on the *pabbajjā* ordination.
[4] Int. §§ 30, 148 (ii).
[5] Int. § 136.
[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 11; Ch. 7 *a* § 13 [15].
[7] This is the only passage in *Vin. Piṭ.* in which the personal name Suddhodana occurs. Ch. 1 § 4; Ch. 10 *b* § 2.
[8] No title is used here. Cp. § 1 above; Ch. 1 § 7 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].
[9] See § 4 n above; Ch. 1 § 8. For the title *devī* cp. Ch. 1 § 3.
[10] See § 4 above; Ch. 2 § 1; Ch. 10 *c* (22); Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (14th *vassa*); Ch. 11 *d* § 9; Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [1] n; Ch. 16 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 1.
[11] Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [29].
[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 15; Ch. 7 *c* § 2 n.
[13] See § 8 [6] below.
[14] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4] (*recognize*).
[15] For 'novices' see Ch. 8 *g* and *i*.
[16] Omitting a formula identical with that prescribed for use by the First Missioners (Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3–4]) except that here 'novices' are mentioned and no mention is made of the full admission-ordination (*upasampadā*). Ap. H 2 *a* § 1 [3].
[17] For Rāhula's age see § 5 n above.

to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near he exchanged greetings with the Blessed One and seated himself on one side.[1] Seated on one side Suddhodana the Sakka addressed the Blessed One thus: 'I ask, revered sir, a boon of the Blessed One. . . .[2] [5] Revered sir, when the Blessed One renounced [the world] my sorrow was great;[3] and so also when Nanda[4] did so; and it is beyond measure now that Rāhula also has done so. . . .[5] It would be well, revered sir, if the reverend [brothers][6] should not confer the renunciation-ordination on a son without the permission of his mother and father.' [6] Then the Blessed One instructed, informed, stirred, and gladdened Suddhodana the Sakka by discourse on the Law.[7] Then Suddhodana . . .[8] departed. Then in this connexion and on this occasion[9] the Blessed One having delivered a discourse on the Law instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Let not a son,[10] mendicant brothers, receive the renunciation-ordination without the permission of his mother and father. If any-one [so] confers the renunciation-ordination he is guilty of a grave offence (*āpatti dukkatassa*).'[11]

c. Return to Rājagaha: further conversions; summary account

Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, xxiv, 5–7[12]

§ 1. [MV, I. xxiv. 5] At that time many well-known[13] Māgadhan[14] clansmen (*kula-puttā*)[15] led a holy-life[16] with the Blessed One. People were vexed, disturbed and angry,[17] and said: 'The recluse Gotama

[1] Ap. B *b* § 3 [4].

[2] Omitting a passage in which the Buddha states that Tathāgatas (Ap. A 2 *c*) are above the granting of boons.

[3] There is no sign here of any fore-knowledge that his son would become a Buddha (Cp. Ch. 1 § 5 [54] n).

[4] See § 3 above.

[5] Omitting a passage which describes how piercing is the love for a son.

[6] Ch. 8 *a* [2]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15]. Literally, noble or worthy. The word *ayya* is a contracted form of *ariya* (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]).

[7] Ch. 6 *a* § 12.

[8] Omitting repetitions and stock phrases.

[9] See § 7 [3] above.

[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 6. This practical ruling, like the bulk of the resolutions recorded in the *Vinaya*, probably is given precisely in Gotama's own words. The 'connexion' or setting probably was repeated with more freedom until the Canon was finally fixed (IN 6; Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7] n; cp. § 4 n above). In *Mahā-vagga* I. xlix, he ruled that final (or *upasampadā*) ordination should not be conferred on youths under twenty years of age; and in I. l, he ruled that preliminary (or *pabbajjā*) ordination should not be granted to boys under fifteen. The practical spirit here revealed is not likely ever to have approved the ordination of a child of seven. Ch. 2 § 4 n.

[11] Ap. H 1 § 2. For *dukkaṭa*-offences and penalties see Ap. H 4 *c*. The succeeding section of the *Mahā-vagga* (I. lv) states that the Buddha proceeded from Kapilavatthu to Sāvatthi (Ch. 9), where he entrusted Sāriputta with further novice-pupils.

[12] Continued directly from Ch. 7 *a* § 24. This passage in the *Mahā-vagga* is doubtless based on the ancient ballad verses which it cites (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). The incident, if true, may have taken place before or after the visit to Kapilavatthu.

[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[14] Int. § 158 (2).

[15] Int. § 159 n.

[16] Ch. 3 § 5.

[17] Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1]. Contrast Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [8]. Regarding opposition to Gotama cp. Ap. G 2 *c*; also Ap. H 2 *b* § 2.

causes childlessness; the recluse Gotama causes widowhood; the recluse Gotama causes the breaking up of the family.[1] Now through him a thousand Jaṭilas[2] have gone forth (*pabbajjitaṃ*), and those two hundred and fifty Wanderers, followers of Sañjaya,[3] have gone forth; and these many well-known Māgadhan clansmen are leading the holy-life with the recluse Gotama.' Moreover, when they saw the mendicant-brothers they reproached them in this verse:

'The great recluse has come to Giribajja (*Giribajjaṃ*)[4] of the Magadhas,
Leading all the followers of Sañjaya. Whom now will he lead away?'

§ 2. [6] Some mendicant brothers heard those vexed, disturbed, and angry people; and these mendicant brothers reported the matter[5] to the Blessed One. 'This noise, mendicant brothers,' said he, 'will not be for long; it will be only for seven days; after seven days it will cease. If, mendicant brothers, they reproach you in this verse . . .[6] do you reply to them in this verse:

'"Great men (*mahā-vīrā*),[7] the Successors (*Tathāgatā*),[8] verily lead by the true Law (*sad-dhammena*).[9]
What envy is there of the wise (*vijānataṃ*) leading by the Law?" '

[7] . . .[10] Then people said: 'The devotees, disciples of the Sakyan (*Sakya-puttiya*),[11] indeed lead by law, not by un-law (*a-dhammena*).' Thus the noise was only for seven days; after seven days it ceased.[12]

(*See Appendix G containing texts supplementary to this chapter.*)

[1] Pāli, *kula*. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 3. Ap. F 2 *a* (134), and Ch. 8 *l* § 2 n.
[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 2.
[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 18.
[4] Literally, 'mountain-city'. The ancient name of Rājagaha, of which the original site is encircled by hills. Int. § 125; Ch. 11 *c* § 13.
[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 1; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 11 [ii. 1], 13 [1].
[6] Omitting repetition of the verse above.
[7] Int. § 187 n.
[8] Ap. A 2 *c*.
[9] i.e. the Law of selflessness or self-transcendence. Ap. G 1 *b*.
[10] Omitting a statement that the people repeated the first verse and that the brethren repeated the second.
[11] Literally, belonging to the son of the Sakyans. Ch. 7 *a* § 11; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 2. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [227] (*putta*); also Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii) n (*Nātha-puttiyā*).
[12] With this incident closes the strictly introductory portion of the *Mahā-vagga* presenting a continuous narrative (Int. § 1; Ch. 4 § 9 n; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 15 n, 24 n). The remainder of the *Mahā-vagga* and the whole of the *Culla-vagga* comprise administrative rules classified according to subject with their 'connexions' or 'occasions' (Ch. 7 *b* § 7; Ch. 8 *a* [4]), presented in piecemeal fashion (Int. § 13).
At this point the First Part of the Life of Gotama may fitly close. The truth has been found, the doctrine or natural law or norm (*Dhamma*) has been formulated, and the Society (*Saṃgha*) has been established, so that the truth may be perpetuated. The great creative effort of his mind has been made; what remains is to develop and organize rather than to create. During the remaining forty-five years of his life Gotama devoted himself ceaselessly, and with a consummate genius for organization (Int. § 5 n; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; cp. IN 10 n, and Ch. 6 *a* § 7 n), to the expansion and administration of the Society which he had founded for the obliteration of human

sorrow (Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 6 *b* § 1). The *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga*, i.e. the major and minor sections of the *Khandhaka* division of the *Vinaya Piṭaka* (or Code of Discipline), in which this activity is recorded, read (except for ill-founded interpolations) almost like the minutes of a modern assembly, though all decisions, when Gotama presides, are attributed not to the meeting but to the president (cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4], '*I sanction*'). They display an immense resourcefulness in dealing with contingencies as they arise, and a wonderfully moderate and judicial spirit. Gotama's habitually serene character by no means excluded a needful severity (Ch. 8 *g* § 1 [5]). In these records events are naturally classified under different heads, and the narrative form is now abandoned. (A continuous narrative is resumed in the *Mahāparinibbāna Suttanta* covering the last few weeks of the Teacher's life.) Many, if not most, of the decisions recorded in the *Vinaya Piṭaka* doubtless were formulated after Gotama's death, but the nucleus must be attributed to the Master himself. Some attempt to distinguish that nucleus is made in the summaries of the rules and practices of the *Saṃgha* given in Ch. 8 and Ap. H.

PART II

THE BUDDHA AND THE SAṂGHA

DEVELOPMENT OF THE SAṂGHA AND THE GREAT TOURS

CHAPTER 8 (A)

RĀJAGAHA: THE SAṂGHA[1] DEVELOPED; ORGANIZATION

a. Uposatha or Sabbath[2]

Vinaya Piṭaka,[3] *Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka II, i*

[1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Rājagaha, on the Vulture-Peak hill (*Gijjha-kūṭe-pabbate*).[4] Now at that time the wandering-philosophers (*paribbājaka*)[5] belonging to the different sects (*añña-titthiyā*)[6] used to hold [their several] meetings on the fourteenth–fifteenth[7] and eighth of the half-month[8] (*pakkhassa*) and expound [each his] doctrine (*dhammaṃ*).[9] The people went to hear their doctrine. They acquired an affection for, and faith (*pasādaṃ*) in, the wandering philosophers belonging to the different sects; and the wandering philosophers belonging to the different sects

[1] Int. §§ 13, 15; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 7 *c* final note; Ch. 11 *c* § 2 (*Veḷuvana*); Ch. 21 § 7 [23]; Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [15]; Ap. H 3. Literally, assembly or meeting. The word was not confined to the Buddhist confraternity; Ch. 22 *b* § 15. The Buddhist *Saṃgha* was essentially the community, society, or order of mendicant brothers. For the order of mendicant sisters see Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iv), (v), (vi). For the *Saṃgha* as offering occasion for criticism see Ch. 8 *c* § 4; as court of discipline, see Ch. 8 *b* § 7 [1]; as legislature, see Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; as court of appeal, see many instances, e.g. Ch. 8 *c* § 4; Ch. 8 *d* § 1; the same method was applied to the laity; see Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1]. The *Dhamma* (Law or Faith) being now fixed, the *Saṃgha* or organized society of believers from this point begins to take definite shape under Gotama's creative hand. That the organization of Jains or Nigaṇṭhas (Int. § 179) under Mahāvīra, Gotama's contemporary, was equally systematic and effective may be gathered from their sacred Canon (SBE, xx and xlv) and from the fact of their vigorous survival to the present day.

[2] Ch. 8 *b* §§ 2 [iii. 1], 4 [1]; Ch. 11 *a* § 3; Ch. 11 *d* § 11 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii); Ch. 17 *a* [1]; Ap. H 1; Ap. H 3, *Note*. Day of observance or of fast. It was originally 'the eve of the Soma sacrifice' (*Pāli Dict.*), in Brāhmanical ritual (Int. § 190, *fasts*). With the institution of the Buddhist *Uposatha* (day reserved or set aside) we have the first of the great body of administrative regulations adopted or invented by Gotama's strongly directive mind. In the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* the fifth division is called the *Uposatha-vagga*.

[3] Int. § 13; Ap. H 3, *Note*. For the commencement of the *Mahā-vagga* of *Vin. Piṭ.* see Ch. 4 § 9.

[4] i.e. in the Veḷuvana; Int. § 128. It would appear from Ch. 8 *j* § 10 that the brethren were still living as isolated ascetics.

[5] Int. § 187.

[6] Ch. 8 *c* § 1 [2]; Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 4 [1]; also Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*teachers*). Here the term *añña-titthiya* might include Brāhmanic Vedāntic philosophers, but it excludes the Vedic ritualists or subordinates them to the philosophic schoolmen. Compare *nānā-titthiya* (Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]); and *titthiya* (Ch. 8 *j* § 4).

[7] 'Fourteenth, fifteenth', SBE, xiii, p. 239. Sometimes the one and sometimes the other of these two days was observed, according to the position of the moon. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 1.

[8] i.e. on the 8th day of the waxing moon, the full-moon day, the 8th day of the waning moon, and the new-moon day. The 8th being a half-moon day has a secondary place. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (27); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii); Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [2]; cp. Ch. 13 *d* § 2 [2].

[9] As they were rival teachers they cannot have united for the occasion. Each utilized the Brāhmanical fast-day to teach his own creed.

acquired [each] a party[1] (*pakkhaṃ*). [2] Then as the Māgadhan king (*rañño Māgadhassa*)[2] Seniya Bimbisāra[3] was alone and quiet[4] a reflection arose in his mind thus: '. . .[5] What now if the fathers[6] (*ayyā*) also were to hold meetings. . . .' [3] Then . . . Seniya Bimbisāra spoke to the Blessed One thus: '. . . It would be well, revered sir, if the fathers also were to hold meetings on the fourteenth–fifteenth and eighth of the half-month.' [4] . . .[7] Then in this connexion[8] and on this occasion the Blessed One having delivered a discourse on the Law[9] instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'I sanction[10] (*anujānāmi*), mendicant brothers, the holding of meetings[11] (*sannipātituṃ*) on the fourteenth–fifteenth and eighth of the half-month.'

b. Pātimokkha,[12] or Profession of Faith and Confession

Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka II, ii–iii

§ 1. [II. ii] Now at that time considering that the Blessed One had sanctioned the holding of meetings on the fourteenth–fifteenth and eighth of the half-month the mendicant brothers held meetings . . . and sat in silence. The people went to hear their doctrine. They were vexed . . .[13] and said: 'Should not a doctrine (*dhammo*) be expounded by them when they hold a meeting?' Some mendicant

[1] Literally, side; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2].

[2] Int. § 158.

[3] Int. § 168; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [3]. See also Ch. 3 § 1 n.

[4] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [1]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1). Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19] (*noon-day rest*).

[5] Omitting repetition.

[6] *Ayya* is an honorific term derived from *ariya*. Ch. 7 *b* § 8 [5]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 1.

[7] Omitting Buddha's acceptance and the king's departure. Gotama showed his administrative greatness as much in accepting the suggestions of others—friends, followers, or opponents (Ch. 8 *c* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c*)—as in his own creative ideas. Like other great men he took his good where he found it, desiring it for its excellence and usefulness, as a contribution to the common cause and estimating it without any trace of the smallness of lesser minds which see things from a personal point of view.

[8] Ch. 7 *a* § 15; Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 1 (*Nidāna*). This phrase constantly recurs throughout the *Mahā-vagga*. It is the object of this portion of the sacred Canon to explain the 'occasion' on which, and the 'connexion' in which, each part of the *Vinaya* or Disciplinary Regulations originated (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*). Some of these occasions and connexions were doubtless supplied at a late date and are imaginary, but many are doubtless authentic. The more imaginative portions of these 'occasions' may perhaps have been added to the Pāli Canon of the *Vin. Piṭ.* on the authority of the ancient Sinhalese commentaries (Int. § 21).

[9] Or, moral discourse; *dhammi-kathā*. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 12; Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6]; Ch. 10 *c* [1] (9); Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [10] n; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3].

[10] 'I prescribe', SBE, xiii, p. 240. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 7 *c* (final footnote); Ch. 8 *b* §§ 1, 2, 7 [3]; Ch. 8 *c* §§ 1, 2, 4; Ch. 8 *d* §§ 1 [3], 2 [4], 5, 6 [1], 7 [2]; Ch. 12 *b* §§ 2 [2], 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [5]; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [162].

[11] A general meeting was called *sannipāta*; Ch. 7 *a* § 17; Ch. 20 § 2 (1). For local organization, see Ch. 8 *f*. See also Ch. 8 *d* § 3 (*gaṇa*); Ap. H 3 *a* § 1 (*sannipāta*), § 2 (*parisā*). For meeting-halls, see Ch. 8 *f* § 4 n.

[12] Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [9]; Ap. H 1; Ap. H 3, *Note*; Ap. H 4, *Note*. The literal meaning is perhaps Franchise-Rules; cp. Ap. D *a* § 6 (*mutti*). 'Words of Disburdenment', SBE, xiii, p. 1.

[13] The passage omitted attributes to the people vehement anger at the silence of the Buddhist monks, but this seems far less probable than public coldness and indifference, to which the monks would be sensitive.

brothers heard those vexed people . . . and these mendicant brothers announced this matter[1] (*attham*) to the Blessed One. Then in this connexion and on this occasion the Blessed One having delivered a discourse on the Law instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'I sanction,[2] mendicant brothers, the expounding of the Law (*dhammaṃ*)[3] when you hold meetings on the fourteenth–fifteenth and eighth of the half-month.'

§ 2. [iii. 1] Then as the Blessed One was alone and quiet[4] a reflection arose in his mind thus: 'What now if I were to sanction that the precepts (*sikkhāpadāni*)[5] taught by me to the mendicant brothers should be their Franchise-Rules recital (*pātimokkh-uddesaṃ*). This would be their Observance-day service (*uposathakammaṃ*).'[6] [2] Then the Blessed One, having arisen in the evening from his quiet [contemplation],[7] in this connexion and on this occasion having delivered a discourse on the Law instructed the mendicant brothers saying: '. . .[8] I sanction,[9] mendicant brothers, the reciting of Franchise-Rules (*pātimokkhaṃ*).[10]

§ 3. [iii. 3] And they must be recited thus. The assembly (*saṃgho*) must be directed[11] (*ñāpetabbo*) by a learned[12] and competent mendicant brother, saying: "Let the assembly, revered sirs (*bhante*), hear me. To-day is an Observance-day, the fifteenth.[13] If it please the assembly, let the assembly hold the Observance-day service, let it recite the Franchise-Rules. What must be done first by the assembly? Venerable sirs (*āyasmanto*), announce your purification (*pārisuddhiṃ*). I will recite the Franchise-Rules; let all of us present hear it well and pay attention. He in whom there is offence (*āpatti*),[14] let him make it manifest[15] (*āvi-kareyya*). In the absence of offence let him remain

1 Thing or substance. Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [6]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [ii. 1]; and Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]; also Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [8]. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10.

2 Ch. 8 *a* [4].

3 From this it is evident that a discourse or sermon was an essential part of the ceremony in its early form (cp. § 4 [3] below; also Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4], iii), though it does not find a place in the present *Pātimokkha* (Ap. H 1, *Note*). The 'expounding of the Law' here mentioned was evidently at a day meeting open to the public (Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1]); the *Pātimokkha* service was held on the preceding night and limited to the Bhikkhus. For the position given to the sermon in modern Buddhist ceremonial see H. G. Q. Wales, *Siamese State Ceremonies* (1931), pp. 152, 200; cp. *Mahā-vagga*, II. xv. 5. For the Essentials of the Dhamma see Ap. G 1 *b*.

4 Ch. 8 *a* [2]; Ch. 13 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1].

5 Ch. 8 *d* § 5; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [21] (*chief rule*); Ap. H 4 *b*. See Ch. 8 *e* § 1; see also § 6 below (*Pārājika*). Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [2] (*training*).

6 Ch. 8 *a*; and Ch. 8 *f* § 1; Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; Ap. H 1, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 8 [17] (*saṃgha-kamma*).

7 Ch. 11 *c* §§ 15, 17 [3] n; Ch. 11 *d* § 9; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* § 10 [205]; Ch. 13 *c* § 19 [110]; Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* § 2; Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [3]; Ch. 18 *b* §§ 3 [1], 5 [161]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [2]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (2); Ap. H 5 [94] (*meditation*); also Ch. 13 *e* § 1 [2]. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7].

8 Omitting repetition.

9 Ch. 8 *a* [4].

10 What follows appears to be of later date.

11 Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [14]; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3]; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [4]; Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [4].

12 Or, experienced.

13 Of the four possible days one is mentioned as an illustration. See § 5 below; Ch. 13 *d* § 2 [2].

14 Ap. H 3 *b* § 1.

15 Or, confess it.

silent. From your remaining silent I shall know, venerable sirs, that you are purified (*pārisuddha*). When in a meeting of this kind anything has been proclaimed thrice[1] the answer is [taken] as [that] of each individual. When the proclamation has been made three times, mendicant brothers, if anyone remembering an offence does not answer his is a conscious falsehood. Now, venerable sirs, a conscious falsehood[2] has been called by the Blessed One a prevention[3] (*antarāyiko dhammo*). Therefore when a mendicant brother who has offended remembers and is desirous of purification he must make manifest his offence. It is well (*phāsu*) for him that it be made manifest.[4] [4–8] . . .[5]

§ 4. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, Khandhaka IX, i. 1–3*[6]

[1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Garden (*Pubbārāme*)[7] in the storied-house (*pāsāde*)[8] of Migāra's mother.[9] Then at that time, the [following] day being Observance-day[10] (*tad-ah' uposathe*), the Blessed One was seated surrounded by an assembly of mendicant brothers. Then the venerable Ānanda[11] as the night advanced, when the first watch (*paṭhame yāme*)[12] had passed, rising from his seat, having adjusted his outer wrap[13] over one shoulder, raising his joined palms[14] (*añjalim*) towards the Blessed One, spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The night is advanced, revered sir, the first watch has passed, the assembly of mendicant brothers has sat long; let the Blessed One, revered sir, recite the Franchise-Rules (*pātimokkhaṃ*) to the mendicant brothers. On this being said the Blessed One remained silent.[15] A second time the venerable Ānanda . . . when the middle watch had passed . . . spoke to the Blessed One. . . . And a second time the Blessed One remained silent. And a third time[16] the venerable Ānanda . . . when the last

[1] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 7 *a* § 22 [2] n; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [6]; and Ap. H 3 *a*. 'As a single person that has been asked a question, answers it, the same is the matter if before an assembly like this a question has been solemnly proclaimed three times', SBE, xiii, pp. 242–3. 'Now to every separate question there must be an answer. In this way, in such an assembly as this, the question is put three times,' Baynes, *Way of the Buddha* (1914), p. 80.

[2] See § 6 [*d*] below.

[3] See § 7 [3] below; also Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [1]. 'An impediment', SBE, xiii, p. 243. The Commentary adds 'of the trances (see § 6 [d] n below; cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]) . . . and of good qualities'.

[4] Section 4 below implies that confession has taken place before the meeting and the exclusion of unpurified offenders. Ap. H 1, *Note* (*ch. xxii*), and Ap. H 1 § 4.

[5] Omitting a word-for-word commentary on the above. Ap. H 1, *Note*.

[6] Ap. C *b* § 3. The text appears also in the *Aṭṭhaka-nipāta* (the Eights) of the *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, iv, pp. 206–8.)

[7] Int. § 140; Ch. 18 *b*. The regulations formulated at Sāvatthi must be generally much later in date than those issued at Rājagaha. The Vinaya developed as Gotama's long administration proceeded.

[8] Int. § 190 (*architecture*); Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3); Ap. H 5 [93] (*landing*).

[9] Ch. 18 *b*. This building was presented late in Gotama's life.

[10] Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1]; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]; Ch. 19 *b* § 9; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [1].

[11] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1]; Ap. A 2 *b* (68).

[12] Ap. H 5 [94].

[13] Ch. 6 *b* § 2.

[14] Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*).

[15] Ch. 6 *a* § 9 n.

[16] Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [3].

watch had passed as the sun rose and night became day (*nandimukhiyā rattiyā*)[1] spoke to the Blessed One. . . . [The Blessed One] replied: 'The session (*parisā*)[2] is not purified.'[3] [2] .Then the thought came to the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna:[4] 'With reference to what individual did the Blessed One say "The session, Ānanda, is not purified"?' The venerable Mahā-Moggallāna considered the whole assembly of mendicant brothers attentively. Then he saw the undutiful individual . . . seated in the midst of the assembly, and having seen him he drew near and spoke to him thus: 'Rise, friend (*āvuso*), thou art seen by the Blessed One; thou hast not communion[5] (*saṃvaso*) with the mendicant brothers.' On this being said that individual remained silent. And a second . . . and a third time . . . on this being said he remained silent. Then the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna having taken that individual by the arm and put him outside the house-door and fastened the bolt[6] (*suci-ghaṭikaṃ*) drew near to the Blessed One and spoke to him thus: 'That individual, revered sir, has been put out by me, the session is purified; let the Blessed One, revered sir, recite the Franchise-Rules to the mendicant-brothers.' '[His action is] surprising, Moggallāna, and strange (*abbhutaṃ*);[7] until he is taken by the arm again let that deluded man wait.'[8] [3] Then the Blessed One instructed[9] the mendicant brothers. . . .[10]

§ 5. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Pātimokkha I,*[11] *Nidāna* (*Introduction*).[12]

Let the assembly,[13] revered sirs (*bhante*), hear me. To-day is an Observance-day, the fifteenth. If it please the assembly, let the

[1] Literally, as night became glad-faced. Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [2]. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4].

[2] Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [3].

[3] See § 3 above; Ap. H 1, *Note* (*chs. xxii, xxvii* and *cap. i*). By this time apparently the *Pātimokkha* ceremony had become formalized and confession was actually made beforehand. The public was excluded; then as the Rules became more numerous the confessions and penances were made individually prior to the ceremony.

[4] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [xxiii. 1].

[5] See § 6 [*a*] below.

[6] Int. § 190 (*architecture*); Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119].

[7] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

[8] Ap. H 3, *Note* (*CV*, 9).

[9] The sermon apparently followed the recital of the Rules. Cp. § 1 above; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3].

[10] See Ap. D *c* § 4. In the *Aṅg. Nik.* version the sermon proper is preceded by the following phrase, which is not in the *Culla-vagga* text: 'You should now, mendicant brothers, hold the Uposatha; you should recite the Pātimokkha. It is not fitting, it is not permitted, that the Tathāgata should recite the Pātimokkha to an unpurified session.'

[11] For the two Pātimokkhas see Ap. H 1, *Note*; *Mahā-vagga*, I. xxxvi. 14; *Culla-vagga*, IV. xiv. 19, IX. v. 1. Part I deals with Expulsion, and Part II with Penalties and Forfeits (SBE, xiii, p. ix).

[12] See SBE, xiii, pp. 1–2, and J. F. Dickson's translation in the JRAS for 1875; also MV, II. iii. 3, and § 7 [1] below. Cp. Ch. 1 § 1 n; Ch. 12 *d* § 4 n; Ch. 23 *b* § 8. This Introductory Formula is the only passage contained in the Pātimokkha which is not found also in the Sutta-vibhaṅga', SBE, xiii, p. xvi. The Pāli text of portions of the Ceylon *Kammavācā* (Formulary of Procedure regarding *Kathiṇa*-robes, the boundaries for *Uposatha*, &c.) is given by H. Baynes in *The Way of the Buddha* (1914), pp. 101–32; see Ap. H 1 § 4.

[13] 'Chapter', SBE, xiii, p. 1.

assembly hold the Observance-day service. . . .[1] *Revered sirs, the Introduction is now recited.*[2] [I ask you, revered sirs, 'Are you purified herein?' A second time I ask you. . . . A third time I ask you. . . . Venerable sirs, you are purified herein and therefore remain silent. Thus I take it.[3] *Here ends the recitation of the Introduction.*][4]

§ 6. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Sutta-vibhaṅga, Pātimokkha, Mahā-vibhaṅga, Pārājika.*[5]

[Here the four Rules regarding Expulsion come for recitation.][6]

[*a*] *Pārājika I.*[7] (*Vin. Piṭ., Oldenberg, iii, p. 21.*)

'Now thus, mendicant brothers, you should recite this precept (*sikkhāpadaṃ*). "Whatsoever mendicant brother shall commit sexual sin (*methunaṃ dhammaṃ*)[8] is expelled[9] (*pārājiko*) and is not in communion[10] (*a-samvāso*)." '

[*b*] *Pārājika II.*[11] (*Vin. Piṭ., Oldenberg, iii, p. 45.*)

'And thus, mendicant brothers, you should recite this precept. "Whatsoever mendicant brother shall take by stealth,[12] what is not given, taking things so that rulers (*rājāno*)[13] having seized him as a thief, would beat[14] or imprison or banish him, saying 'Thou art a thief . . .'[15]—a mendicant brother who takes in this manner what is not given, he too is expelled and is not in communion." '

[*c*] *Pārājika III.*[16] (*Vin. Piṭ., Oldenberg, iii, p. 71.*)

'And thus, mendicant brothers, you should recite this precept. "Whatsoever mendicant brother shall knowingly deprive of life the

[1] As in § 3 above.

[2] The formula which follows is plainly supplementary, and logically should precede this sentence.

[3] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [6]; Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [4]; Ap. H 2 *c* § 1.

[4] The sentences in square brackets are from the *Formulary*, and are not in the *Vin. Piṭ.* A similar formula, however, occurs at the close of each of the main divisions of the *Pātimokkha* proper in the Sutta-vibhaṅgas.

[5] [Transgressions involving] Expulsion. Etymologically perhaps, defeat or failure. Ch. 8 *d* § 7 n; Ch. 8 *e* § 3; Ch. 9 *c* § 3; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [9] n; Ap. H 1, *Note*; Ap. H 2 *b* (*Expulsion*); Ap. H 2 *c* (*Prohibitions*); Ap. H 3 *a*, *Note*; Ap. H 3 *b* (*Penalties*); Ap. H 4, *Note*. See § 2 above (*sikkhapadāni*).

[6] The formula in square brackets is from the *Formulary* and is not in the *Vin. Piṭ.* A similar formula, however, occurs at the beginning of each of the remaining divisions of the *Pātimokkha* in the Sutta-vibhaṅgas.

[7] SBE, xiii, pp. 3–4. This first precept is repeated in a fuller form at *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, pp. 22, 23, and MV, I. lxxviii. See Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii) n; Ch. 23 *b* § 7.

[8] Or, offence (Ap. H 3 *b* § 1). Literally, a lewd thing. For the many meanings of *dhamma* cp. Part I (title) n; also [*d*] below. It seems to mean here an item or particular thing in a systematized list. The sin is termed *a-brahmacariya* in the third of the Ten Precepts (Ch. 8 *d* § 5). See Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (4); Ap. H 4 *a* §§ 1 [3], 4 [8].

[9] Or, has failed.

[10] See § 4 [2] above; Ch. 8 *e* § 7. Cp. Ch. 8 *f* § 1.

[11] SBE, xiii, p. 4. See Ch. 23 *b* § 7.

[12] *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 46 adds 'from village or forest'. Cp. the second of the Ten Precepts (Ch. 8 *d* § 5); Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [3].

[13] Not necessarily sovereigns. Int. §§ 165, 172 (*ministers*); Ch. 8 *d* § 6; Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [ii. 1]; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] n; Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2] n; Ch. 14 *c* § 9; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 8 [15]; Ap. B *b* § 1. Cp. Ch. 1 § 5 [52]; Ch. 12 *a* § 3; Ch. 14 *d* § 2 (*noble*).

[14] 'Slay', SBE, xiii. Int. § 190 (*punishments*).

[15] Omitting terms of reproach.

[16] SBE, xiii, p. 4. See Ch. 23 *b* § 7.

human form, or shall seek out an assassin for the same,[1] he too is expelled and is not in communion." '

[*d*] *Pārājika IV.*[2] (*Vin. Piṭ., Oldenberg, iii, p. 90.*)

'And thus, mendicant brothers, you should recite this precept. "Whatsoever mendicant brother, not being conscience of capacity above [ordinary] human-nature (*uttari-manussa-dhammaṃ*),[3] shall claim as his own the knowledge and insight[4] of the truly noble[5] saying 'Thus I know, thus I see', and then at a later time, whether compelled or not compelled, being guilty and desirous of purification shall say thus: 'Not knowing, friends, I said that I knew, not seeing I said that I saw, telling an empty falsehood',[6] he too is expelled and is not in communion." '

[Venerable sirs, the four Rules regarding Expulsion (*pārājikā dhammā*)[7] have now been pointed out. . . .][8]

§ 7. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka II, xv. 1–3.*

[1] It occurred to the mendicant brothers: 'How many [kinds of] recitals of the Franchise-Rules are there?' They announced this matter to the Blessed One. He replied: 'There are these five [kinds of] recitals[9] of the Franchise-Rules. The Introduction (*nidāna*)[10] having been recited, the rest must be understood as having been heard:[11] this is the first recital of the Franchise-Rules. The Introduction and the four *Pārājikāni*[12] having been recited, the rest must be understood as having been heard: this is the second recital. The Introduction and the four *Pārājikāni* and the thirteen *Saṃghādisese*[13] having been recited . . . this is the third recital. The Introduction, the four *Pārājikāni*, the thirteen *Saṃghādisese*, and the two *Aniyate*[14]

[1] *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 73 expands the list and includes incitement to suicide; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 6 n. The prohibition against taking life is more general in the first of the Ten Precepts (Ch. 8 *d* § 5) and in Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [4], as in Ch. 8 *j* § 7.

[2] SBE, xiii, p. 5. See Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 10 *c* [4] (40) n; Ap. 1 *a* § 3; and Ch. 23 *b* § 7.

[3] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [4]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200]; Ap. 1, *Note*; Ap. 1 *b* (*Occultism*). 'Conscious of extraordinary qualities', SBE, xiii, p. 5. The Commentarial explanation mentions 'trance (see § 3 n above) . . . and escape of the mind from obstacles'. For some of the many meanings of *Dhamma* see Ap. B *b* § 3 [6] n.

[4] *Ñāṇa-dassana.* Ch. 4 § 16.

[5] Ap. E *c* 1 § 5 [8].

[6] See § 3 above. *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 91 adds 'excepting self-conceit'. The fourth of the Ten Precepts prohibits all false speaking (Ch. 8 *d* § 5).

[7] Dickson translates *Dhammā* as Offences. See [*a*] above; § 7 [1] below.

[8] This formula is taken from *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 109.

[9] Ch. 8 *e* § 1 [1]; Ap. H 1, *Note.*

[10] See § 5 above.

[11] 'As to the rest, it may be proclaimed: "Such and such rules are known (to the fraternity)" ', SBE, xiii, p. 260.

[12] Rules regarding expulsion. See § 6 above; cp. Ap. H 1, *Note* (*ch. iv*).

[13] Ch. 8 *e* § 3; Ap. H 3, *Note*; Ap. H 3 *b* § 1. Rules regarding offences requiring disciplinary supervision by an assembly; see Ch. 8 A, (*Saṃgha*); SBE, xiii, pp. 7–15. The procedure regarding these is detailed in *Khandhaka III* of the *Culla-vagga*; cp. Ch. 8 *e* § 5 (*abbhāna*).

[14] Rules regarding cases which are not clear; see SBE, xiii, pp. 16–17.

having been recited . . . this is the fourth recital. The fifth is in full.[1] These are the five recitals of the Franchise-Rules.'

[2] . . . 'The Franchise-Rules, mendicant brothers, should not (at all times) be recited in brief. He who [so] recites them is guilty of a grave offence (*dukkaṭassa*).'[2]

[3] . . . 'I sanction,[3] mendicant brothers, the reciting of the Franchise-Rules in brief through . . . preventions[4] (*antarāyesu*).'

c. The Institution of Vassa,[5] or Retreat during the Rainy Season; and the Pavāraṇa[6] Ceremony

Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka III, i–iii; Khandhaka IV, i–iii.

§ 1. [i. 1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo-Grove (*Veḷu-vane*), in the Squirrels' Feeding-ground (*Kalandaka-nivāpe*).[7] Now at that time residence during the rainy season (*vass-āvāso*) had not been ordained by the Blessed One for the mendicant brothers. The mendicant-brothers then went forth upon journeys in winter and in summer and in the rainy season. [2] People were vexed . . .[8] and said: '. . . Those philosophers indeed belonging to the different schools (*añña-titthiya*),[9] though the doctrine which they teach is wrong, are wont to observe

[1] The remaining Rules concern details and clearly were deemed less important (Ch. 8 *e* § 3). They include 30 *Nissaggiyā Pācittiyā* rules (regarding offences involving forfeit and repentance), 92 *Pācittiyā* rules (regarding offences involving expiation, arranged in 9 classes), 4 *Pātidesaniyā* rules (regarding offences involving confession, concerning food), 75 *Sekhiyā* rules (regarding discipline), and also 7 *Adhikaraṇa-samathā* (modes of settling cases), making up a total of 227 rules (Ap. H 1, *Note* and § 4). The last seven are not strictly rules and are not given in the *Sutta-vibhaṅga*, but appear in *Khandhaka IV* of the *Culla-vagga* (Ap. H 3, *Note*); see SBE, xiii, pp. 68–9. The Rules for the mendicant sisters (Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4]) are given in *Vin. Piṭ.* iv, pp. 211–351.

[2] Ap. H 3 *b* (*Penalties*).

[3] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[4] 'In the case of danger', SBE, xiii, p. 261. Cp. § 3 above; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11]; Ap. H 1, *Note* (*ch. xv*).

[5] See § 1 [3] below; Int. §§ 16, 123; Ch. 6 *b*, n; Ch. 8 *d* § 4; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [1]; Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7]; Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* § 19; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (ii), (iv); Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [22]; Ch. 14 *b* § 2; Ch. 14 *e* § 2; Ch. 21 § 6 [22]; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 (7); Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [3]. Ap. H 3, *Note.*

[6] Literally, Request. See §§ 4 [13], 5, below. C *b*, 8 *e* § 5; Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [1]; Ch. 10 *d* § 2; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [179]; Ap. H 3, *Note.*

[7] The meaning of the name is uncertain (see SBE, xiii, p. 298). 'In Bamboo Grove which is in Kalandakanivāpa', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 414. See Int. § 126.

[8] The passages omitted attribute to the people vehement anger at the injury caused by the monks to the herbage and to insect life. Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10]. The practical convenience of not travelling during the rainy season is a sufficient reason in itself. Apart from the great difficulties of transit during the Indian rains, regularly recurring periods of conference and study were plainly necessary if the movement was to retain its unity and purity.

[9] Ch. 8 *a* [1]. 'The ascetics who belong to Tiṭṭhiya schools', SBE 'The followers of heretical sects', Warren.

and keep residence[1] during the rainy season. . . .' [3] Some mendicant brothers heard . . . and announced this matter to the Blessed One.[2] Then in this connexion and on this occasion the Blessed One having delivered a discourse on the Law instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'I sanction,[3] mendicant brothers, the entering upon a rainy season [retreat] (*vassaṃ*).'[4]

§ 2. [ii. 1] Then this thought came to the mendicant brothers: 'When must the rainy season [retreat] be entered upon?' They announced this matter to the Blessed One. 'I sanction,'[5] he replied, 'the entering upon the rainy season [retreat] at the [coming of] the rains.'[6] [2] Then this thought came to the mendicant brothers: 'Now how many commencements are there of the rainy season [retreat]?' They announced this matter to the Blessed One. 'There are two commencements,' he replied; 'an earlier and a later.'[7] The earlier must be entered upon on the day following the Āsāḷha-full-moon (*āsāḷhiyā*);[8] the later must be entered upon a month after the Āsāḷha-full-moon. . . .

§ 3. [iii. 1] Then at that time the six dissentient mendicant brothers (*cha-bbaggiyā bhikkhū*)[9] having entered upon the rainy season [retreat] went forth upon journeys during the rainy season. . . . [2] The Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'When one has entered upon the rainy season [retreat], mendicant brothers, a journey must not be undertaken until one has stayed for either the earlier or the later period of three months.[10] He who undertakes such a journey is guilty of a grave offence.'[11]

§ 4. [IV. i] . . .[12] [13] 'The vow of silence (*mūga-bbalaṃ*), mendicant brothers, undertaken by the sectarians,[13] must not be undertaken. He who undertakes such is guilty of a grave offence.[14] I sanction,[15] mendicant brothers, the requesting [of criticism] (*pavāretuṃ*)[16] by the mendi-

[1] *Vass-āvāsa*; cp. Ch. 14 *e* § 1 [2]. 'Arrange places for themselves to live in', SBE after Buddhaghosha (Int. § 21).

[2] Ch. 8 *a* [4] n.

[3] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[4] Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [3]. See headline above.

[5] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[6] 'In the rainy season', SBE.

[7] In either case the period of residence was to last for three months. See §§ 3 [2], 5 below.

[8] 'The day after the full moon of Āsāḷha (June–July)', SBE. See Ch. 1 § 3.

[9] Or, the party of six troublesome monks. Ch. 8 *f* §§ 1, 3. Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Six Buddhist dissentients*); Ap. H 3 *b* § 2; Ap. 1 *b* § 1; Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [2] n.

[10] See § 2 [2] above. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [2]; Ch. 23 *b* § 6.

[11] Ap. H 1 § 2. The object of this rule apparently was to prevent the retreat from losing its specific character as a period of conference and study, and from degenerating into a *quasi* vacation during which discipline might be relaxed and absence might pass unnoticed. Observance of Retreat was compulsory (MV, III. iv. 1), and thus, as well as by the orderly precision of the *Vinaya* Code (Ch. 8 *e*), the bonds uniting the *Saṃgha* were kept firm.

[12] The scene is the Jetavana monastery at Sāvatthi (Ch. 17). The Buddha is consulted on the right way to spend *Vassa*.

[13] Pāli *Tiṭṭhiyā*. Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*teachers*).

[14] Ap. H 1 § 2.

[15] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[16] See headline above (*Pavāraṇā*); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iv). Throughout the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* one finds evidence of the skilful and practised manner in which the public business of the *Saṃgha* was organized and carried out (Ch. 8 A, *Saṃgha*). Anyone who has directed a large assembly will recognize the potency and value of the right

cant brothers after residence, on three points (*ṭhānehi*),[1] on what they have seen or heard or felt to be uncertain.[2] Thus there will come to you accord with one another, escape from guilt, and the observance of discipline. [14] And [criticism] must be requested thus. The assembly must be directed[3] by a learned and competent mendicant brother, saying: "Let the assembly, revered sirs, hear me. To-day is the day for requesting [criticism] (*pavāraṇā*). If it please the assembly, let the assembly request [criticism]." The senior mendicant brother[4] should adjust the outer wrap over one shoulder, sit upon his heels, raise his joined palms and say to the assembly thus: "Friends (*āvuso*), I request the assembly [for criticism] on what they have seen or heard or felt to be uncertain. Venerable sirs, taking compassion, address me; perceiving, I will make amends. A second time . . . a third time[5] I request the assembly. . . ." Then [each] junior[6] mendicant brother . . . should say to him thus: "Revered sir (*bhante*), I request the assembly [for criticism]. . . ."'

§ 5. [IV. iii. 1] Then the thought came to the Bhikkhus: 'How many *Pavāraṇā*[7] [services] are there?' They reported the matter to the Blessed One. He replied: 'There are two *Pavāraṇā* [services], that of the fourteenth and that of the fifteenth[8] of the shorter and longer half-months respectively.' . . .[9]

d. Upasampadā (Admission or Ordination Ceremony)[10] under the Saṃgha

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka*, *Mahā-vagga*, *Khandhaka I*, *xxviii*.

[1] Then at that time a certain Brāhman[11] having drawn near to the mendicant brothers asked for the *pabbajjā*-ordination (*pabbajjaṃ*).[12]

of criticism and independent motion here established. Doubtless such criticism might be diverted to petty personal points; but in a body of men of ability it could be made an instrument of great public utility, and as one peruses the records of the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga* of the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* one may well believe that it was utilized to bring forward many points of public interest and value.

[1] Ch. 9 *b* §§ 2 [3], 4; Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ap. E *b* § 3 (1).

[2] 'Suspected', SBE, xiii, p. 328.

[3] Ch. 8 *b* § 3 [3]; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4].

[4] Pāli *thera bhikkhu*. Ch. 8 *g* § 3. Cp. Ap. A 1 *b* (2).

[5] Ap. H 3 *a*.

[6] Ap. H 1 § 4.

[7] See headline above.

[8] i.e. full-moon day. See § 2 [2] above.

[9] As in Ap. H 1 § 1, except that *Pavāraṇā* is substituted for *Uposatha*. Thus the two services were held on the same day. Apparently the *Pavāraṇā* criticism, being of a general nature, succeeded the *Pātimokkha* confession of particular transgressions.

[10] Literally, admission (to the Order), more exactly, arrival. Ch. 22 *b* § 17; Ap. H 2; Ap. H 3, *Note*. See also Int. §§ 56, 58. The *Mahā-vagga* describes three forms of Ordination of Bhikkhus: that by the Buddha himself (Ch. 5 *b* § 8), that by the early individual missioners (Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3]), and that by the *Saṃgha* of each district as here set forth and still in use (Ap. H 2 *c*). For exclusion and expulsion from the Order see Ap. H 2 *b*. For the ordination of women see Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [1].

[11] Int. § 185.

[12] Literally, leaving (the world); see § 2 (1) below; Ch. 6 *a* § 1; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 11 [91], 12 [1]; Ap. H 2. The distinction between the *pabbajjā* and *upasampadā* ceremonies, originally united (see [3] below), came with

The mendicant brothers did not wish to confer the ordination on him. . . .[1] The Blessed One saw that Brāhman who had become emaciated. . . . [2] Then the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'Who now, mendicant brothers, remembers a service done by this Brāhman?' On this being said the venerable Sāriputta[2] said to the Blessed One: 'I indeed, revered sir, remember a service done by him. . . . Now this Brāhman, as I was going round for alms in Rājagaha, caused a ladleful of food to be given to me. . . .' [3] 'Then, Sāriputta, do thou confer on the Brāhman the *Pabbajjā* and *Upasampadā* ordination (*pabbajehi upasampādehi*).'[3] 'How, revered sir, shall I ordain him?' Then the Blessed One on this occasion, having delivered a discourse on the Law, instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'The admission-ordination (*upasampadā*) with the three declarations of taking refuge[4] sanctioned by me I prohibit from to-day. I sanction,[5] mendicant brothers, the conferring of the admission-ordination (*upasampādetuṃ*) by the fourfold procedure of resolution (*ñatti-catutthena kammena*).[6] [4] And the admission-ordination must be conferred thus. The assembly must be directed[7] by a learned and competent mendicant brother, saying: "Let the assembly, revered sirs, hear me. This [person] named so and so is desirous of admission-ordination under the venerable so and so.[8] If it please the assembly let the assembly confer the admission-ordination on so-and-so, with so-and-so as instructor (*upajjhāyena*).[9] This is the proposal[10] (*ñatti*): [5] ". . . The assembly confers the admission-ordination on so-and-so with so-and-so as instructor." To whatsoever venerable [brother] it seems good that admission-ordination should be conferred on so-and-so with so-and-so as instructor, let him remain silent;[11] to whomsoever it does not seem good, let him speak. And for the second time I state this matter (*atthaṃ*).[12] . . . [6] And for the third time.[13] . . . So-and-so has been admitted by the assembly with so-and-so as instructor. It seems good to the assembly; therefore it remains silent. Thus I take it." '[14]

the imposition of the probationary period (*parivāsa*; Ap. H 2 *a*). The *pabbajjā* formula is still repeated in the Ceylon *upasampadā* ceremony (Ap. H 2 *c*).

[1] Omitting the sufferings of the Brāhman.

[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].

[3] See [1] n above.

[4] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ap. H 1 *c*.

[5] Ch. 8 *a* [4]. The occasion stated seems unconvincing; but doubtless the want of system was felt (Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [5]).

[6] Namely, stating the proposal or resolution and putting it three times to the meeting (Ch. 8 *b* § 3; Ch. 8 *e* §§ 3, 5; Ap. H 2 *a* § 3 [3]; Ap. H 2 *c* § 1). See Ap. H 2, *Note* (*chapter*). For *kamma*, meaning proceedings, see Ap. H 1 § 4.

[7] Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [14].

[8] Or, with the venerable so-and-so as superior. Ap. H 2 *c* § 1.

[9] See § 6 below; Ch. 8 *g*; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3].

[10] Motion or proposed resolution; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [4]; Ch. 15 *b* § 12 [14] n; Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [4]. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2]. On the orderly transaction of public business cp. Ap. H 3 *a* (*Assemblies*).

[11] Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [4]; and Ch. 6 *a* § 9. On less formal occasions voting by ticket or tally was practised; Ch. 19 *b* § 9 [1].

[12] Ap. C *b* § 10 [2].

[13] Ch. 8 *b* § 3.

[14] Ch. 8 *b* § 5.

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga I, xxx. 4.*

. . .[1] [4] 'I sanction,'[2] he said, 'the announcing of the four Bases[3] (*nissaye*) by him who confers the admission-ordination. (1) Retirement (*pabbajjā*)[4] is maintained[5] by scraps[6] of food [given in alms]; to this thy endeavour must be made throughout life.[7] Allowed further are community-food[8] (*saṃgha-bhattaṃ*), special food by invitation,[9] food distributed by ticket,[10] fortnightly, on *Uposatha*-day[11] and on the first day[12] [of the fortnight]. (2) Retirement is maintained by clothing[13] taken from the dust-heap; to this thy endeavour must be made throughout life. Allowed further are linen,[14] cotton, silk (*koseyyaṃ*), wool, hemp (*sānaṃ*), and sacking (*bhaṅgaṃ*). (3) Retirement is maintained by abiding at the foot of a tree;[15] to this thy endeavour must be made throughout life. Allowed further are rest-house (*vihāro*),[16] hut (*addhayogo*),[17] storied-house (*pāsādo*),[18] house with sloped roof (*hammiyaṃ*),[19] and cave (*guhā*).[20] (4) Retirement is maintained by [unmade] medicine[21] [such as] stale urine;[22] to this thy endeavour must be made

[1] Omitting an account of a Brāhman who joined the Order solely for the excellent meals given by the laymen of Rājagaha. [2] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[3] Or, Maintenances; Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [475] (*reliances*); Ap. H 2 *c* (*Requisites*); also Ch. 8 *g* § 4, and Ch. 8 *j*. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3] (*parikkhāra*); Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101] (*requisites*). 'Necessaries', KM, p. 78; 'Four Resources', SBE, xiii, p. 173. The four Bases or Maintenances as stated in the MV are self-contradictory. First the ascetic rule is stated, and then appear exemptions which entirely annul it. Gotama's predilection for moderation or the 'middle way' (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ch. 8 *k*), and his aversion from asceticism, were shown throughout his life after the Enlightenment and were evidently the reason for Devadatta's schism from the Order. The Maintenances in their present form show every sign of being a later Hinduized version of Gotama's own moderate rules. They doubtless, however, represent Gotama's broad-minded permission to the ascetically minded to follow their own bent (Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [35]; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14] n), a permission which he freely gave to Devadatta, who, however, desired to impose ascetic practices on all. The four ascetic 'bases' appear as *an-avajjāni* (blameless) in the *Catukka-nipāta* (Fours) of the *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, ii, p. 26). [4] Or, renunciation of the world. See § 1 [1] above.

[5] Or based on.

[6] *Piṇḍiy-ālopa*. Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7] (*piṇḍa-pāta*); Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [1] (*piṇḍa*); and Int. § 190 (*food*). Cp. Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89] (*once*); also Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 6 *a* § 12; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [2]; and Ch. 8 *h* (*Bhikkhu*).

[7] Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11]; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]; and Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[8] 'Meals given to the Saṃgha', SBE, xiii, p. 173. Cp. Ch. 8 *j* (*food*).

[9] 'Meals given to certain persons, invitations', SBE. See Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13]; Ch. 8 *k* [7]; Ap. H 5 [92]. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 9.

[10] The ticket was a wooden tally (*salāka*) issued on certain occasions; Ch. 10 *c* [3] (24). [11] Ap. H 1 § 1.

[12] Pāli *pāṭipadikaṃ* (initial), i.e. the day after the fortnightly *Uposatha*.

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 11; Ch. 8 *k* [7]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [3]. The pieces were sewn together in patchwork upon a frame (*kaṭhina*) of a certain pattern (Ch. 8 *j*).

[14] Int. § 189 (*manufactures*), § 190 (*dress*); Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [iii. 1].

[15] Ch. 4 § 4; Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [4].

[16] Int. §§ 124, 127; Ch. 8 *g* (*Vihāra*); Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (1) n; Ch. 8 *j* §§ 6 [13], 10; Ch. 10 *a* § 2. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] (*lodge*).

[17] Apparently a bee-hive hut. Cp. SBE, xiii, pp. 173–4 n.

[18] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1].

[19] 'Attics', SBE. Cp. the Gable-roofed Hall at Vesāli (Int. § 133).

[20] Int. § 129. [21] Int. § 190 (*medicine*); Ch. 8 *j* § 9; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [7] (vi).

[22] Khandhaka VI of the MV treats of mendicaments; foul emetics were used as remedy for poison (VI. xiv. 6). The excrement used was apparently that of cattle.

throughout life. Allowed further are clarified-butter[1] (*sappi*), fresh butter, oil,[2] honey, sugar[3] (*phāṇitaṃ*).'

§ 3. *Mahā-vagga I, xxxi. 2.*

. . .[4] [2] 'The admission-ordination must not be conferred,' he said, 'by a chapter (*gaṇena*)[5] of less than ten.'[6]

§ 4. *Mahā-vagga I, xxxi. 5.*

[5] '. . .[7] The admission-ordination must not be conferred,' he said, 'by [a *bhikkhu* who has standing] of less than ten years (*ūna-dasa-vassena*).'[8]

§ 5. *Mahā-vagga I, lvi.*

[1] Then it occurred to the probationers[9] (*sāmanerānoṃ*) thus: 'Now how many precepts (*sikkhā-padāni*)[10] are there for us [under training], and in what must we train[11] (*sikkhitabbaṃ*) ourselves?' They announced this matter to the Blessed One. He replied: 'I sanction,[12] mendicant brothers, for the probationers ten precepts, and training for the probationers in these:

(1) Abstinence from the destruction of life (*pan-ātipātā*);[13]
(2) abstinence from taking what is not given (*a-dinnādānā*);[14]
(3) abstinence from unholy living (*a-brahmacariyā*);[15]
(4) abstinence from false speaking (*musāvādā*);[16]
(5) abstinence from intoxicating wine and spirits, causing negligence (*suramerayamajja-pamādaṭṭhānā*);[17]

[1] Int. § 190 (*food*).
[2] Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [2]; Ch. 22 *c* § 5 [18].
[3] Int. § 189 (*farmers*).
[4] Omitting doubtful matter.
[5] Ch. 11 *a* § 5 [3]; Ap. H 3 *b* § 1. Cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4].
[6] Ap. H 2 *a* § 5; Ap. H 2 *c* § 1. Cp. Ch. 8 *e* § 5 (*central*); Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [5]; Ap. H 1, *Note, ch. xxvi*.
[7] Omitting Buddha's reproof of Upasena Vaṇgantaputta. Ch. 8 *g* § 1.
[8] Ch. 8 *c*; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5.
[9] 'Novices', SBE, xiii, p. 211. Ch. 6 *b*, n; Ch. 8 *g* §§ 6, 7; Ap. H 1, *Note*, ch. xxxvi; Ap. H 2 *a* (*Parivāsa*). Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (25–6), where the rules are only eight.
[10] Ch. 8 *b* § 2; Ch. 14 *f* § 8 [4]; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [9] n; Ap. H 1, *Note* (*Prohibitions*); Ap. H 2 *a*; Ap. H 4, *Note*, Ap. H 4 *a* (*Abstinences*); Ap. H 4 *b c*, and Ch. 22 *b* § 23. When and by what stages the original four *Pārājikāni* were developed into these ten prohibitions is uncertain. They appear as (the first) five in *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, ii, p. 167), and as eight (uniting the prohibitions of shows and adornments and omitting the prohibition of gold and silver) in *Aṅg. Nik.* (i, p. 211; Ch. 17 *a* [1]), and as ten in various forms in other parts of the Nikāyas, e.g. *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 252. Cp. the ten Questions (Ap. G 2 *a* § 9); cp. also Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11] (*batta-padāni*).
[11] Or, discipline. Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [3] n; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (vi) *sikkhā*; Ch. 14 *f* § 8 [2] n; Ch. 21 § 8 [26] n; and on *sikkhā* see Ap. H 1 § 3. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3] n; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [261]; Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3]; also Ap. H 2 *a* § 5 (*taca-pañcakaṃ*).
[12] Ch. 8 *a* [4].
[13] Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [4]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3]. Cp. § 7 [4] below; Ch, 8 *b* § 6 (*Pārājikā III*). Also Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note* and § 6.
[14] Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 (*Pārājikā II*). Ch. 9 *b* § 8.
[15] Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8]; and Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 (*Pārājikā I*); Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11]; also Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]. See also Ap. F 2 *c* (*Brāhman*).
[16] Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [3] n; also Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]; Ap. F 2 *a* (147). Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 (*Pārājikā IV*), and § 7 [5] below; also Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (14).
[17] Int. § 190 (*drink*); Ch. 8 *l* § 3; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [4].

(6) abstinence from eating at wrong times (*vikāla-bhojanā*);[1]
(7) abstinence from dancing, singing, music,[2] and watching contortionists;[3]
(8) abstinence from wearing garlands,[4] and using scent and unguents[5] for adornment and ostentation;
(9) abstinence from high[6] or large beds;[7]
(10) abstinence from receiving gold and silver.'[8]

§ 6. *Mahā-vagga I, lxxvi.*

[1] . . . 'I sanction,'[9] he said, 'the asking [of the candidate] by him who confers the *upasampadā*-ordination regarding things that are impediments (*antarāyike dhamme*).[10] And he must ask thus: "Have you such afflictions[11] as leprosy, tumour,[12] eczema,[13] consumption, epilepsy? Art thou human (*manusso*),[14] art thou a male, art thou free[15] (*bhujissa*), art thou without debts, art thou not in the king's service[16] (*rājo-bhaṭo*), art thou [here] with the sanction of thy mother and father,[17] hast thou completed twenty years,[18] are thy bowl and robes[19] complete, what is thy name, what is the name of thy instructor?"[20] [2] . . . 'I sanction,' he said, 'previous direction[21] [as to the mode of answering] and afterwards the asking [of the candidate] regarding things that are impediments.'

[1] 'At forbidden times', SBE. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (25); Ap. H 4 *b* § 1 [14]; and Ch. 15 *a* § 14 (*evening-meal*).

[2] Int. § 190 (*arts*); cp. Ch. 22 *c* §§ 2, 3 (*dances*). For a list of prohibited amusements, including draughts and dice, see *Culla-vagga* I. xiii. 2.

[3] 'Seeing spectacles', SBE, xiii, p. 211. The Pāli word is *visūka*; cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 5 (1).

[4] Ch. 1 § 3 (*festival*); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [5]; Ch. 22 *c* § 2.

[5] Int. § 190 (*toilet*); Ch. 13 *d* § 8 [1].

[6] *Ucca.* Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [13].

[7] *Sayanāni.* Ch. 14 *f* § 14 [3]; also Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2]; Ap. H 3, *Note.* Cp. Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [2]; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] (*mat*); Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354] (*fourfold*); Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14] (*covering*); Ch. 19 *b* § 2 (*bedding*).

[8] The Pāli words are *jātarupa* and *rajata.* Int. § 189 (*money*); Ch. 8 *j* § 11; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ch. 13 *d* § 8 [1]; Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84]. Cp. § 7 [3] below; also Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [2].

[9] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[10] 'About the Disqualifications', SBE, xiii, p. 230. Ap. H 2, *Note*; Ap. H 2 *c* § 1; cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 3. For exclusions and expulsions from the Order see Ap. H 2 *b*.

[11] 'The following diseases', SBE. Int. § 190 (*medicine*); Ch. 16 *c* (39); Ap. H 2 *b* § 1.

[12] Pāli *gaṇḍa*; literally swelling. 'Boils', SBE.

[13] 'Dry leprosy', SBE.

[14] Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1. At what time this fairy-tale question was introduced can scarcely be ascertained. It reads strangely in the business-like context. It belongs probably to the same period as the *Yakkha* section of the *Saṃ. Nik.* (Ap. G 2 *b*, *Note*, n) and is in full accord with the ancient folk-tales woven into the *Jātaka* Birth-stories (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2).

[15] Int. § 190 (*slaves*); cp. Ch. 20 § 7 (5).

[16] i.e. in military service. 'In the royal service', SBE. *Rāja* may mean a ruler of any kind. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*]; Ch. 11 *a* § 5 [3]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2.

[17] Ch. 7 *b* § 8 [6].

[18] The minimum age for the second or *upasampadā* ordination. MV I. xlix.

[19] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9]; Ch. 8 *j*.

[20] Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4]; Ch. 8 *g* § 4.

[21] Ap. H 2 *c* § 1.

§ 7. *Mahā-vagga I, lxxviii.*

. . . [2] 'I sanction,'[1] he said, 'the appointment of an [older] associate[2] (*dutiyaṃ*) after conferring the *upasampadā*-ordination, and the announcing of the four interdictions[3] (*a-karaṇīyāni*):

'A mendicant brother who has received the *upasampadā*-ordination must not commit sexual sin (*methuno dhammo*),[4] including animals. Whatsoever mendicant brother commits sexual sin is no devotee (*a-ssamaṇo*)[5] and no disciple of the Sakyan[6] (*a-sakyaputtiyo*). Just as a man whose head has been cut off[7] is unable to live with the rest of the body, even so a mendicant brother who has committed sexual sin is no devotee and no disciple of the Sakyan. Throughout life this must not be done (*a-karaṇīyaṃ*) by thee.

[3] 'A mendicant brother who has received the *upasampadā*-ordination must not take by stealth[8] what has not been given, down to a blade of grass. Whatsoever mendicant brother takes by stealth what has not been given, whether a 'quarter'[9] (*pādaṃ*) or worth a 'quarter' or more than a 'quarter', is no devotee and no disciple of the Sakyan. Just as a dry leaf severed from the rest is unable to become green, even so a mendicant brother who has taken by stealth what has not been given . . . is no disciple of the Sakyan. Throughout life this must not be done by thee.

[4] 'A mendicant brother who has received the *upasampadā*-ordination must not knowingly deprive of life a living-being,[10] down to an ant. Whatsoever mendicant brother shall knowingly deprive of life the human form (*manussa-viggahaṃ*), including abortion, is no devotee and no disciple of the Sakyan. Just as a single stone when split in two cannot be united again, even so a mendicant brother who has knowingly deprived of life the human form is no devotee and no disciple of the Sakyan. Throughout life this must not be done by thee.

[5] 'A mendicant brother who has received the *upasampadā*-ordination must not claim [a power] above [ordinary] human-nature[11] even by saying "I delight in solitude".[12] Whatsoever mendicant

[1] Ch. 8 *a* [4].
[2] Ch. 8 *g* § 1; Ap. H 3 *a* § 3. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 10 [19] (*atta-dutiya*).
[3] Ap. H 2 *c* § 2 (3). These correspond with the first four rules of the *Pātimokkha* and involve expulsion from the Order (Ch. 8 *b* § 6); they are also practically equivalent to the first four rules of the *Cūla-sīla* (Ap. H 4 *a*). That the remaining rules of the *Pātimokkha* were later and subsidiary seems evident.
[4] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*]; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11].
[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [53]; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2. Cp. Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].
[6] See § 8 below; Ch. 7 *c* § 6 [7]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 4; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [2]. The name by which Gotama seems to have called himself was Sakyaputta (Cp. Ch. 1 §§ 6 [55], 7 [57] n; also Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2] n).
[7] With the similes in this section compare Marcus Aurelius, viii. 34 (see Int. § 114).
[8] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*].
[9] i.e. of the square coin called *kahāpaṇa*; Int. § 189 (*money*); see § 5 [10] above.
[10] The Pāli word is *pāṇa*. See § 5 (2) above; cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*c*].
[11] Ch. 9 *c* §§ 2 [2], 3 [1] and [3]; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*], and § 5 (4) above; also Int. § 94 (*d*), and Ap. *Ib.* § 3 (*superhuman*, Twice).
[12] Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7].

brother with ill intent and for a purpose falsely and baselessly claims [a power] above [ordinary] human-nature, whether trance (*jhānaṃ*)[1] or emancipation (*vimokkhaṃ*)[2] or self-transcendence (*samādhiṃ*)[3] or attainment (*samāpattiṃ*)[4] or [mastery of] the Way (*maggaṃ*)[5] or the fruit (*phalaṃ*),[6] is no devotee and no disciple of the Sakyan. Just as a palm-tree of which the top has been cut off is unable to grow again, even so a mendicant brother who with ill intent and for a purpose falsely and baselessly claims [a power] above [ordinary] human-nature is no devotee and no disciple of the Sakyan. Throughout life this must not be done by thee.'

§ 8. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, Khandhaka IX, i. 4.*[7] (*Oldenberg, ii, p. 239.*)

[4] '. . . Just as, mendicant brothers, all the great rivers,[8] namely Gangā,[9] Yamunā,[10] Aciravatī,[11] Sarabhū,[12] Mahī,[13] when they reach the great ocean, lose their former names and differences[14] and are denominated as the great Ocean, even so, mendicant brothers, these four castes[15] (*vaṇṇā*), Kshatriyas (*Khattiyā*), Brāhmans, Vaisyas (*Vessā*), Sūdras (*Suddā*), when they go forth from the household to the houseless[16] life under the doctrine and discipline (*dhamma-vinaye*)[17] made known by the Leader,[18] lose their former names and families (*nāma-gottāni*) and are denominated as "devotees (*samaṇa*), disciples of the Sakyan.[19]" '

(*The direct narrative found interspersed in the Vin. Piṭ. is resumed in Ch. 8 j § 10 and again in Ch. 100 § 6.*)

[1] Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8); Ap. I *a*. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 3 n.

[2] Or, liberation. Ch. 21 § 11 [33]; cp. Ap. D *a* § 6.

[3] Ap. F 2 *d*. 'One of the samādhis (states of self-concentration)', SBE, xiii, p. 236.

[4] Ch. 3 § 4; Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [8]. 'One of the samāpattis (the attainment of the four jhānas and four of the eight vimokkhas)', SBE. 'A state of absorption removed from all worldly influence', Baynes, *Way of the B.* (1914), p. 67.

[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[6] Ap. D *c* § 4 [*a*].

[7] Ap. H 4 *d*; also Ap. C *b* § 3. This discourse is also found in *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, iv, 200 ff, 206 ff).

[8] These were the five chief rivers of the 'Middle-land' (Int. § 158) not those of the Panjāb, whose names evidently were not famous among the Eastern clansmen.

[9] Int. § 121.

[10] Jamnā (Int. § 143; Ch. 15 *b* § 7 n), the great western tributary of the Ganges.

[11] Now the Rāptī; a tributary of the Gogra (*Ghāghrā*). Int. § 149; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11].

[12] Now the Gogra; one of the great northern tributaries of the Ganges. Ch. 14 *e* § 8.

[13] Now the Gandak (Int. § 148 (i) n; Ch. 2 § 6 n); or perhaps the name of the Ganges after junction with its great affluents.

[14] 'Lineage', SBE, xx. Pāli *gottāni*. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).

[15] Ap. F 2 *c*; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [22], [23]. Ordination cancelled caste; but the disregard of caste among religious ascetics was nothing new (Int. § 185; OB, p. 172). It is to be observed that among the Eastern clansmen the warrior caste is always placed before the Brāhmans. The latter were apparently brought in from the west.

[16] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 6 *b*, n.

[17] Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13]; and Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 12 *d* § 13 [3]; Ap. A 1 *b* (6).

[18] Or, Successor. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ap. A 2 *c* (*Tathāgatas*).

[19] See § 7 [2] above; and Ch. 13 *c* § 2.

e. The Vinaya[1] (Disciplinary and Administrative Code); Powers[2] of the Saṃgha and its Constitution[3]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka II, iii.*

[1] Then as the Blessed One was alone and quiet a reflection arose in his mind thus: 'What now if I were to sanction that the precepts[4] taught by me to the mendicant brothers should be their *Pātimokkha* rules for recital[5] (*pātimokkh-uddesaṃ*).' . . . [2] Then the Blessed One, having arisen in the evening from his quiet [contemplation] . . . instructed the mendicant brothers saying: '. . . I sanction the reciting of *Pātimokkha* rules (*pātimokkhaṃ*).'

§ 2. *Culla-vagga, VI, xiii.*

[1] Then at that time the Blessed One in different methods[6] addressed a discourse on the rules (*vinaya-kathaṃ*) to the mendicant brothers, spoke in praise (*vaṇṇaṃ*)[7] of the rules, spoke in praise of mastery of the rules, and spoke again and again in praise of the venerable Upāli.[8] Then the mendicant brothers [said to one another]: 'The Blessed One . . . speaks in praise of Upāli. Come, friends, let us attain mastery of the rules under the venerable Upāli.' Thereupon many mendicant brothers attained mastery of the rules under the venerable Upāli.

§ 3. *Culla-vagga, XI. 9.*

Then the venerable Ānanda[9] spoke thus to the Elders (*there*):[10] 'The Blessed One, revered sirs, at the time of his death[11] said thus to me: "If it so wishes, Ānanda, let the assembly (*saṃgho*) when I have passed away abolish the minor[12] precepts (*sikkhāpadāni*)." '[13] 'Didst thou, friend Ānanda, ask the Blessed One: "Which then, revered sir, are the minor precepts?" ' 'I did not ask, revered sirs. . . .' Thereupon some mendicant brothers said thus: 'Except the four *Pārājikāni*[14] rules, the remaining precepts are minor.' Some mendicant brothers

[1] Int. §§ 13, 56; Ch. 23 *b* §§ 3, 7; Ap. A 1 *a* and *b* (3); Ap. H 3, *Note.*
[2] Ap. H 3 *b*.
[3] Int. § 171. For references see Ch. 8 A (headline); Ap. H 3; see §§ 5, 6, and 7 below.
[4] Ch. 8 *b* § 2; § 3 below.
[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 7 [1].
[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 7. 'In many a way', SBE, xiii, p. xiii.
[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 9.
[8] In. *Aṅg. Nik.* I. xiv. 4 (PTS, i, p. 25), Upāli is placed at the head of those who keep the Vinaya (Ch. 10 *c* [4], 41). See § 4 below; Ap. A 1 *b* (3); Ap. H 4 *c* § 1.
[9] Ap. A 1 *b* (8); see § 4 below.
[10] Ap. A 1 *b* (2).
[11] This passage from the well-known account of the First General Council, held at Rājagaha soon after the death of the Buddha, appears both reasonable and probable, whether the narrative (in *CV* xi; Ch. 23 *b* § 7 [7] n) of this Council was written at the same time as or before or after the account (in *CV* xii) of the Second Council, held a hundred years after the First Council. Naturally it does not settle which precise texts were then approved, but these can scarcely have contained what was contrary to the teaching and instructions of the Founder. Ap. H 3, *Note.*
[12] Ch. 22 *b* § 13. See Ch. 23 *b* § 9 [9].
[13] See § 1 [1] above. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [9].
[14] Ch. 8 *b* § 6.

said thus: 'Except the four *Pārājikāni* and the thirteen *Samghādisese*[1] rules, the remaining precepts are minor.' Some said: 'Except the four *Pārājikāni*, the thirteen *Samghādisese*, and the two *Aniyate*[2] rules, the rest are minor.' Some said: 'Except the *Pārājikāni*, *Samghādisese*, *Aniyate* and the thirty *Nissaggiye Pācittiye*[3] rules, the rest are minor.' Some said: 'Except the *Pārājikāni*, *Samghādisese*, *Aniyate*, *Nissaggiye Pācittiye* and the ninety-two *Pācittiye*[4] rules, the rest are minor.' Some said: 'Except the *Pārājikāni*, *Samghādisese*, *Aniyate*, *Nissaggiye Pācittiye*, the ninety-two *Pācittiye* and the four *Pātidesaniye*[5] rules the rest are minor.'

Then the venerable Mahākassapa directed the assembly; saying: 'Let the assembly, friends, hear me. . . . If it please the assembly, that which was not ordained [by the Blessed One] let the assembly not ordain, and that which was ordained let it not cut off; let it remain devoted to the precepts as they were ordained. This is the proposal (*ñatti*).[6] . . . To whomsoever this does not seem good, let him speak. That which was not ordained [by the Blessed One] the assembly does not ordain, and that which was ordained it does not cut off; it remains devoted to the precepts as they were ordained. This seems good to the assembly. . . . Thus I take it.'

§ 4. *Dīpa-vaṃsa* (*Island Chronicle*)[7] *IV*, *v. 7.*

(7) Having questioned Upāli[8] regarding the Rules (*vinayaṃ*), and Ānanda[9] regarding the *Dhamma*,[10] the mendicant brothers made the *Dhamma* Collection and the *Vinaya*.[11]

§ 5. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga IX, iv. 1.*[12]

The Blessed One said: '. . . When, mendicant brothers, a chapter[13] (*bhikkhu-saṃgho*) is of four persons (*catu-vaggo*), [and acts] under the law and is in agreement[14] (*samaggo*), it is competent to act in all official proceedings[15] (*sabba-kammesu*) except three, the *upasampadā*-ordination,[16] *pavāraṇa*,[17] and *abbhāna*.[18] When a chapter is of five persons, [and acts] under the law and is in agreement, it is competent to act in

[1] Ch. 8 *b* § 7. [2] Rules regarding cases which are not clear.
[3] Rules regarding offences involving forfeit and repentance. Ch. 8 *b* § 7 n.
[4] Rules regarding offences involving expiation.
[5] Rules regarding food. The total of the rules here mentioned is 145; compare the ultimate list of 227 rules in the *Pātimokkha* in Ap. H 1 § 4.
[6] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3]. Cp. Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [4].
[7] Ap. A 1 *b*. [8] See § 2 above. [9] See § 3 above.
[10] The second of the three Piṭakas or Collections constituting the Canon. IN 6 (*Canon*).
[11] This sloka gives tersely the gist of *CV* xi. 7 and 8.
[12] The scene of *Khandhaka* IX is the bank of the lotus-pond Gaggarā, at Campā. Int. § 146; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; cp. Ch. 10 *a* §§ 2, 11.
[13] Ap. H 1, *Note, ch. xxvi.*
[14] See § 7 below; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [2]; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (2); Ch. 20 § 2 (2); Ch. 22 *c* § 10.
[15] Ap. H 1 § 4; Ap. H 3, *Note.* For further references see Ch. 8 *e* (*Constitution*).
[16] Ap. H 2. [17] Ch. 8 *c*.
[18] Rehabilitation after penance. Ch. 8 *b* § 7 (*Saṃghādisese*); Ap. H 3 *b* § 1.

all official proceedings except two, the *upasampadā*-ordination in the central[1] countries (*majjhimesu janapadesu*) and *abbhāna*. When a chapter is of ten persons, [and acts] under the law and is in agreement, it is competent to act in all official proceedings except one, *abbhāna*. When a chapter is of twenty persons (or more),[2] [and acts] under the law and is in agreement, it is competent to act in all official proceedings.'

§ 6. *Mahā-vagga I, xxviii. 3.*

'... I sanction, mendicant brothers, the conferring of the admission-ordination[3] by the fourfold procedure of resolution[4] (*ñatti-catutthena kammena*).'

§ 7. *Mahā-vagga I, lxxix.*

[2] '...[5] When he (a bhikkhu who has been suspended and re-ordained after admitting his fault) has been restored (*osaretvā*) this must be said to him: 'Repair that offence.' If he repairs it, it is well. If he does not repair it he must be suspended again, provided that agreement[6] (*sāmaggiyā*) is obtained [for the sentence]; if agreement is not obtained there is no offence (*an-āpatti*) in eating and dwelling with him.[7]

f. Institution of Parishes[8]

§ 1. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga II, v.*

[1] Then at that time the six dissentient[9] mendicant brothers used to recite the *Pātimokkha*-rules in their own residences, each company (*parisāya*)[10] sitting separately. They announced the matter to the Blessed One.... 'I sanction,' he said, 'the *Uposatha* service[11] of all

[1] Or, middle Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [6]; contrasted with border-land or frontier (Ap. H 2 *b* 21; Ap. H 3, *Note*). In remote districts ordination by a chapter of five was permissible (cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 3).

[2] We have here a congregational or decentralized system, united mainly by the Pātimokkha rules and by a somewhat variable Canon (Ch. 22 *b* § 23 n), together with the moral authority of the great centres. Hence doubtless arose the numerous Buddhist sects after the death of the founder (Int. § 87).

[3] Ordination is here specifically mentioned, but the 'fourfold procedure' was applied generally.

[4] The fourfold procedure comprised a statement of the proposal or motion and its submission to the meeting three times. When the proposal was submitted only once the procedure was called twofold (see SBE, xiii, p. 169; *MV* IX. iii. 3). Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3]; see also Ch. 8 *e* (*Constitution*).

[5] For the context see Ap. H 2 *b* § 5.

[6] 'Unanimity', SBE, xiii, p. 237. See § 5 above; for further references see Ch. 8 *e* (*Constitution*). A measure involving new action required unanimity. On certain occasions a majority sufficed (cp. Ap. H 1, *Note, ch. xxxiv*).

[7] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*].

[8] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (11) n; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [2] n; Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [4] n; Ap. H 1, *Note* (*ch. vi*). See KM, p. 82. Cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25] n; Ch. 23 *a* [9] n.

[9] Or party of Six (Ch. 8 *c* § 3). For references and varying lists of these dubious characters see KM, p. 82, and RhD, *Pāli Dict.* (*cha-bbaggiya*).

[10] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].

[11] Ch. 8 *b* § 2.

unitedly.'[1] [2] Then this thought came to the mendicant brothers: '... Now how far is there to be union (*sāmaggi*)? As far as one community (*ek-āvāso*)[2] or all the earth?' ... 'I sanction,' he said, 'union as far as one community.' [3] ...[3]

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga II, vi.*

[1] Then this thought came to the mendicant brothers: '... Now how far is one community [to extend]?' ... 'I sanction,' he said, 'appointing a boundary (*sīmaṃ*);[4] and it must be appointed thus: first the marks[5] (*nimittā*) must be announced—a mountain, rock, grove, tree, road, an ant-hill, a river, a sheet of water.[6] ...'[7]

§ 3. *Mahā-vagga II, vii.*

[1] Then at that time the six dissentient[8] mendicant brothers ... appointed very large boundaries, of four yojanas[9] or five yojanas or even six yojanas. The mendicant brothers coming to the *Uposatha*-ceremony came whilst the *Pātimokkha* was being recited or when it had been recited, or halted on the way ... 'I sanction,' he said, 'appointing a boundary of three yojanas at most.'

§ 4. *Mahā-vagga II, viii.*

[3] ... 'In one community,' he said, 'two *Uposatha*-halls (*uposathāgārāni*)[10] must not be appointed. Whosoever appoints [two] is guilty of a grave offence (*dukkaṭassa*). I sanction, mendicant brothers, abolishing one of them and keeping the *Uposatha*-ceremony in one place.'

(*See Appendix H containing texts supplementary to this chapter.*)

[1] 'By the complete fraternity', SBE, xiii, p. 247.
[2] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*]; Ch. 8 *a* § 2; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (11). 'One residence (or one district)', SBE.
[3] Omitting Buddha's miraculous journey through the air (Int. § 94, iii; Ap. I *b*) from the Gijjhakūṭa hill (Int. § 128) to visit Mahā-Kappina (Ch. 10 *c* [4], 44) in the Maddakucchi deer-park (Int. § 130).
[4] Sīmā means boundary, whether of a parish or of a meeting-ḥall. Ch. 11 *d* § 11 [1]; Ap. H 1 § 4.
[5] Or, signs. Cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25]; also Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [17].
[6] Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [23]; cp. Int. § 123.
[7] Omitting the formal resolution.
[8] Ch. 8 *c* § 3.
[9] Or, leagues. Ch. 2 § 7.
[10] Cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4]; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11] n; Ap. H 3 *a* § 3.

CHAPTER 8 (B)

THE SAṂGHA, CONTINUED; DUTIES AND DAILY LIFE UNDER THE ORDER

g. Grades[1] or Classes in the Saṃgha; Ācariya[2] or Director, Upajjhāya[3] or Instructor; Offices in the Vihāra (monastery)[4]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga I, xxxi.*

[3] The venerable Upasena Vaṇgantaputta,[5] when of one year's [standing], conferred the *Upasampadā*-ordination on [a pupil who thus became] his associate (*saddhi-vihārikaṃ*).[6] . . . [5] Then[7] the Blessed One spoke thus to the venerable Upasena Vaṇgantaputta: 'Of how many years [standing] art thou, mendicant brother (*bhikkhu*)?' 'I am of two years [standing], Blessed One,' he replied. 'And of how many years is this brother (who is with thee)?' 'Of one year, Blessed One.' 'What is this brother to thee?' 'My associate, Blessed One.' The Blessed Buddha rebuked[8] him: '. . . How canst thou, foolish man, who shouldst be exhorted and admonished by others, think of exhorting and admonishing another? . . . The admission-ordination must not be conferred,' he said, 'by [a Bhikkhu who has standing] of less than ten years[9] (*ūna-dasa-vassena*).'

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga II, x.*

At that time in a certain community (*āvāse*)[10] on *Uposatha*-day the junior[11] (*navakā*) mendicant brothers assembled first and saying 'The seniors (*therā*)[12] are not coming yet' they withdrew. The *Uposatha*-ceremony was delayed. They announced this matter to the Blessed One. 'I sanction,' he said, 'that on *Uposatha*-day the senior mendicant brothers assemble first.'

1 KM, p. 84.
2 See § 4 below; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4]; Ch. 9 *b* §§ 3, 5; also Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [13] n; Ch. 17 *e* [6]. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [13]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 13 [23], 15.
3 See §§ 4, 5 below.
4 See §§ 7, 8 below; Int. §§ 123 n, 127; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3); Ch. 8 *j* (*dwellings*); Ch. 10 *a* § 11; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119]; Ch. 15 *a* § 8; Ch. 18 *b*; also Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [4]; for communal life in the Vihāra see Ch. 20 § 7 (4). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 19 (*lodge*), where the word means a private dwelling. See KM, p. 83.
5 Ch. 8 *d* § 4; Ch. 10 *c* [3] (26).
6 Junior; literally fellow-resident. See §§ 4, 5 below; Ch. 8 *i*. See also Ch. 8 *d* § 7.
7 Next year.
8 See § 5 [6] below; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [5]; and Ch. 7 *c*, final note.
9 Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 6 [1] n.
10 Ch. 8 *f* § 1 [2]. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [3] (*a-vāsa*).
11 Ch. 8 *i*; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [3]; Ch. 19 *b* § 9; Ap. H 1 § 4; and Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]; see § 4 below. Cp. Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2] (*samaṇuddesa*).
12 Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [4]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [78]. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 9; Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [1]; and Ap. A 1 *b* (2).

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16 (MPS), VI, 1–2.*

[1] And the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: [2] '. . .[1] An elder[2] mendicant brother should address[3] a younger[4] mendicant brother by name or by family (*gottena*)[5] or as "friend". A younger mendicant brother should address an elder mendicant brother either as "revered sir (*bhante*)" or as "venerable (*āyasmā ti*)".'

§ 4. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga I, xxxii. 1.*

[1] At that time mendicant brothers when their instructors (*upajjhāyesu*)[6] went away . . .[7] lived without directors (*an-ācariyakā*),[8] without exhortation and without admonition . . . 'I sanction,' he said, '[that each newly ordained Bhikkhu[9] should choose] a director (*ācariyaṃ*). The director should regard the assistant[10] as a son; the latter should regard the former as a father. . . . I sanction living for ten years with support [by a teacher] and the granting of [such] support (*nissayaṃ*)[11] by a Bhikkhu of ten years [standing].'

§ 5. *Mahā-vagga I, xxv.*[12]

[1] Then at that [earlier] time mendicant brothers were without instructors (*an-upajjhāyakā*), without exhortation, and without admonition and went for alms ill-robed, ill-covered, and behaving unsuitably. . . .[13] [6] Then the Blessed One, having rebuked[14] those mendicant brothers, in different methods spoke in dispraise of being hard to support and hard to feed, and of covetousness, discontent, and gregariousness[15] of the slothful[16] (*kosajjassa*), and in different methods spoke in praise[17] of being easy to support and easy to feed, and of the uncovetousness and contentment[18] of the meditative, earnest, believing[19]

[1] As in Ch. 22 *b* § 22. Omitting the statement that hitherto the elder and younger Bhikkhus had addressed each other as *āvuso* (friend).
[2] Pāli *theratara*; senior. Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [14].
[3] Int. § 190; Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13] (*āvuso*).
[4] *Navakatara*; junior. Ap. H 1 § 4.
[5] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4). The use of the family name was more formal (see MV 1. lxxiv. 1); cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2] n.
[6] See headline above.
[7] Among the causes mentioned are joining other schools (Int. § 179) and straying back to the worldly life (Ap. H 2 *c* § 1 final note).
[8] See headline above; Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [4]. The titles *ācariya* and *upajjhāya* are constantly used as equivalents, but the latter appears to be applied specially to instructors of novices in the early stage (Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [1]). The name may have varied with the locality.
[9] Pāli *ante-vāsika*. The manner of choice is prescribed in [2] ch. xxxiii.
[10] *Antevāsika*; literally in-dweller; equivalent to *saddhi-vihārika* (see § 1 above and § 5 below) and to *navaka* (see § 2 above). Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2]; and Ch. 8 *i*; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 19 [30] n.
[11] See § 7 *c* [2] below. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4].
[12] Ch. 8 *i* § 1.
[13] Omitting their demands for food and their noisiness in dining-halls (Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [ii. 1]; cp. Int. § 190, food; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [i. 3]) and the remark that such behaviour resembled that of Brāhmans (Ap. F 2 *c*).
[14] See § 1 [5] above.
[15] Ch. 8 *k* [8] (*throng*); Ch. 13 *c* § 19 (*crowds*). Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (iii); Ch. 20 § 3 (4).
[16] Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13] (*third Obstacle*); cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (21).
[17] Ch. 8 *a* [4] (*discourse*).
[18] Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (ii).
[19] Ap. H 1 § 6 [5].

(*pāsādikassa*), humble, and strenuous; and . . .[1] instructed them saying: 'I sanction, mendicant brothers, [that each newly ordained Bhikkhu[2] should choose] an instructor (*upajjhāyaṃ*).[3] The instructor should regard the pupil[4] as a son; the latter should regard the former as a father.'

§ 6. *Mahā-vagga II, xxxvi.*[5]

[1] 'The *Pātimokkha*-rules must not be recited,' he said, 'at a session before[6] a mendicant-sister (*bhikkhuniyā*).[7] . . . The *Pātimokkha*-rules must not be recited at a session before a woman-student,[8] nor before a male novice,[9] nor before a female novice.[10] . . .'

§ 7. *Culla-vagga, II, i.*

[1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jeta Grove, the garden of Anāthapiṇḍika.[11] And at that time [older] Bhikkhus, placed [again] on probation[12] (*pārivāsikā*), used to accept from [younger] well-conducted[13] Bhikkhus greetings[14] [and the courtesies of] rising from seats, raising the joined palms,[15] and homage. . . .[16] The mendicant brothers announced this matter to the Blessed One. The Blessed One having caused an assembly of the mendicant brothers (*bhikkhu-saṃghaṃ*)[17] to meet, questioned the brothers. . . . 'I sanction,' he said, 'that Bhikkhus placed again on probation should accept from each other according to seniority[18] (*yathā-vuḍḍhaṃ*) greetings . . . and homage. . . . I sanction, mendicant brothers, for [older] Bhikkhus placed on probation five [things to be shared] according to seniority—the *Uposatha*-ceremony,[19] the *Pavāraṇa*-criticism,[20] the distribution of robes[21] in the rainy season, gifts dedicated[22] [to the *vihāra*],[23] and food-allowance.[24] [2]. . . They

[1] As in Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]. The discourse is based on Gotama's address to Mahā-Pajāpati, *Aṅg. Nik.*, iv, p. 280, where all the epithets occur.
[2] Pāli *saddhivihārika*. The manner of choice by mutual selection is prescribed in [7] of ch. xxv and is the same as that used in the case of an *ācariya*.
[3] See headline above; Ch. 8 *i* §§ 1 [8], 2 [4]; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [4].
[4] *Saddhi-vihārika*. See §§ 1 and 4 n above; Ch. 15 *b* § 5 [1].
[5] Ap. H 1 § 3.
[6] Literally, 'to'.
[7] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii) n.
[8] Pāli *sikkhamānā*; a female pupil studying for ordination. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (vi).
[9] *Sāmanera*; a probationer who had received the first ordination. Ch. 8 *d* § 5; Ap. H 4 *b*. Cp. *Samaṇ-uddesa* (Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [244] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2]).
[10] *Sāmanerī*.
[11] Ch. 8 *j* § 5; Ch. 14 *a*.
[12] Even senior Bhikkhus might be placed again on probation (*parivāsa*) for a period as a penalty. Ap. H 3 *b* § 1; Ap. H 4 *b*.
[13] Pāli: *pakatatta*. 'Regular', SBE, xvii, p. 384.
[14] Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*); Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[15] *Añjali-kamma*.
[16] Customary services of juniors to seniors follow.
[17] Ch. 8 (A) n; Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [3]; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2].
[18] Ap. H 1 § 4.
[19] i.e. the service or *Pātimokkha* recitation and confession. Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [1].
[20] Ch. 8 *c*.
[21] Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [3] (*Kaṭhena*).
[22] *Onojana*, a benefaction; literally 'washing away', i.e. a gift dedicated by a libation. Ch. 7 *a* §§ 10 [85], 14 [18]; also Int. § 190 (*legal procedure*).
[23] Ch. 8 *g*, headline.
[24] *Bhatta*. Ch. 8 *j*.

must not confer the *Upasampadā*-ordination, must not grant a *nissaya*-support,[1] must not maintain a *sāmanera*,[2] must not accept appointment to exhorting the mendicant-sisters[3] and one who has been [already] appointed must not exhort them . . . must not adopt a life dependent on alms.[4] . . .'[5]

§ 8. *Culla-vagga VI, xxi.*[6]

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove at Kalandaka-nivāpa.[7] At that time Rājagaha was short of food.[8] People could not give an allowance of food to the community[9] (*saṃgha-bhattaṃ*); they wished to make allowances of special food by invitation (*uddesa-bhattaṃ*) and of food distributed by ticket[10] (*salāka-bhattaṃ*), fortnightly, on *Uposatha-day* and on the first day [of the fortnight]. They announced this matter to the Blessed One. 'I sanction [these],' he said. . . . 'I sanction,' he said, 'appointing [in the Vihāra][11] a Bhikkhu, endowed[12] with the five qualities[13] (*pañcah' aṅgehi*), as food-controller,[14] who will not be led astray by liking,[15] by enmity, by misapprehension[16] or by fear,[17] and will know what is allotted and what is not allotted.' . . . [2] 'I sanction . . . a supervisor of lodgings[18]

[1] See § 4 above. [2] Ch. 8 *d* § 5.

[3] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii); Ch. 12 *c* § 6 [1]; Ap. H 1, *Note*.

[4] *Piṇḍapātik-aṅga*. Int. § 187 (*mendicancy*).

[5] The disabilities amount to 94 in all. Though Gotama may have heard of few of these, they present a detailed picture of early monkish life.

[6] Ap. H 3, *Note*.

[7] Int. § 126; Ch. 8 *j* § 1; Ch. 8 *k* [1]. This last may be the name of a village or spot near which the Veḷuvana Vihāra was situated.

[8] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1].

[9] i.e. to the Vihāra. 'Meals given to the Saṃgha', SBE, xiii, p. 173. This common allowance was supplementary to the food begged by individual monks for this and the other food allowances see Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1).

[10] (Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [13]); Tickets or wooden tallies for certain amounts of food were issued by donors to meet the requirements of the Saṃgha when general meetings took place.

[11] Ch. 8 *g*, headline.

[12] *Samannāgata* means one who has acquired or is associated with. Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* § 6 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 7 [240], 20 [7]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; Ap. 1 *b* § 6 [22]; cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [3].

[13] i.e. of proved character; literally, who has acquired the five parts. This qualification is required for each of the appointments following. See Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180] (*serve*). The qualities may be the five *aṅgāni* specified in *Dīgha* 33 (PTS, iii, p. 287), namely faith, health, honesty, energy in undertakings, and insight. There are five qualities known as Treasures (Ap. H 4 *a* § 1). The five *sampadā* or attainments are those of *sīla* (virtuous action), *samādhi* (self-transcendence; Ch. 20 § 5 [9, (6)] n), *paññā* (insight), *vimutti* (liberation); and *vimutti-ñāṇadassana* (clear knowledge which brings liberation; Ch. 4 § 16); see *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 145. Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; see also Ap. F 2, and Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 (*sampadā*).

[14] *Bhatt-uddesaka*; literally, distributer of allowances. Ch. 8 *j*.

[15] *Chanda*. Ch. 23 *b* § 4; and Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii). Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7] (*partisanship*).

[16] *Moha*. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[17] Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3] n. Cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (137).

[18] *Sen-āsana-paññāpaka*; literally, assigner of beds and seats. For *senāsana* see Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (16); Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1]; Ch. 8 *k* [6]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]; Ch. 10 *c* [3] (27); Ch. 11 *c* § 24 [4] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 19 [109]; Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [3]. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 2, §7 [15]; and Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9).

. . . (who) will know what is assigned and what is not assigned . . . a storehouse-keeper[1] . . . a receiver of robes.[2] . . .'[3]

h. Duties[4] of a Bhikkhu (mendicant)[5]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Saṃyutta 5 (Kassapa-saṃyutta), Sutta 3 (Candupama). PTS, ii, p. 197.*

[1] He was staying at Sāvatthi.[6] [2] 'Like the moon,[7] mendicant brothers,' he said, 'you should approach the folk (*kulāni*),[8] keeping aloof the body, keeping aloof the mind, ever modest, not intrusive among the folk. [3] Just as a man would view a decayed well, or rugged mountain, or an impassable river, keeping aloof body and mind, even so [tranquil] like the moon you should approach the folk. . . . [4] And what think you mendicant brothers? What kind of mendicant brother is worthy to approach the folk?' [5] 'Revered sir,' they replied, 'our thoughts (*dhammā*)[9] are rooted in the Blessed One, have the Blessed One as leader, take refuge in the Blessed One. Indeed, revered sir, whatever may seem right to the Blessed One is the answer to this question. Whatever they hear from the Blessed One the mendicant brothers will keep in mind.' [6] Then the Blessed One waved his hand in the air and said: 'Just as this hand[10] in the air is not attached[11] or caught or bound, even so, mendicant brothers, among the folk the mind (*cittaṃ*) of a Bhikkhu whenever he approaches the folk is not attached or caught or bound. "Let them gain," he thinks, "who are desirous of gain; let those desirous of merit do meritorious things (*puññāni*)."[12] [7] Kindly-minded (*su-mano*) he rejoices in the gain of others[13] as much as he rejoices in his own. Such kind of mendicant brother is worthy to approach the folk. . . . [10] And what think you, mendicant brothers? Of what kind of Bhikkhu is the expounding of the Law pure?' . . .[14] [13] 'Whatsoever Bhikkhu, mendicant brothers, expounds the Law to others, thinking thus: "O that they may hear from me the Law and having heard the Law may rejoice[15] (*pasīdeyyuṃ*), and rejoicing may they act gratefully[16] to me." Of such kind of Bhikkhu the expounding of the Law is impure. [14] And whatsoever Bhikkhu, mendicant

[1] *Bhaṇḍ-āgārika.* [2] *Cīvara-paṭiggāhaka.* Ch. 8 *j*.

[3] For the numerous remaining offices including a superintendent of gardeners (Int. § 136) and a distributor of fruit, see KM, p. 83.

[4] Ap. F; Ap. H 4 (*conduct*). Cp. Ch. 8 *k* [5] (*abstemious, &c.*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [1] n; Ap. H 5. [5] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1).

[6] Ch. 14 *b*. [7] Int. § 114. [8] Int. § 159.

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]. 'Beliefs', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 418.

[10] Int. § 114.

[11] Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*an-ālaya*); also Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [4] (*disinterested*).

[12] Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]; also Ap. F 1.

[13] Int. § 10 (*altruism*). Cp. Ch. 10 *c* (66) n.; Ap. F 1 *b*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Tat tvam asi*); also Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] (self). [14] Omitting repetitions.

[15] Ap. E *b*, *Note*. Or, may have clear faith (Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]).

[16] *Pasannā*; literally 'brightly'. Egoism, to be distinguished from gross and material selfishness or desirousness, could not be more clearly reprobated.

brothers, expounds the Law to others, thinking thus: "Well-announced[1] by the Blessed One[2] is the Law,[3] it is for this life (*san-diṭṭhiko*),[4] it is immediate (*a-kāliko*),[5] it says "Come and see," it is a guide [to Nibbāna] and must be perceived by the wise each by himself[6] (*paccattaṃ*). O that they may hear from me the Law, and then having heard the Law may understand, and then having understood may thus go on." Thus he expounds the Law to others because of the excellence of the Law, because of pitifulness[7] (*kāruññaṃ*), because of mercy (*anudayaṃ*), out of compassion[8] (*anukampaṃ*). Of such kind of Bhikkhu the expounding of the Law is pure.' [15] . . .[9]

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta,*[10] *Culla-vagga 14 (Dhammika-Sutta).*[11]

So was it heard by me: At one time Bhagavat dwelt at *Sāvatthī*, in Jetavana,[12] in the park of Anāthapiṇḍika. Then the follower (upāsaka)[13] Dhammika,[14] together with five hundred [other] followers, went to Bhagavat, and having gone to Bhagavat and saluted him, he sat down apart; sitting down apart the follower Dhammika addressed Bhagavat in stanzas:

(1) 'I ask thee, O Gotama of great understanding, How is a Sāvaka[15] (disciple) to act to be a good one? is it the one who goes from his house to the wilderness, or the followers with a house?[16]

[1] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.

[2] This term suggests that the reporter or later reviser of the Sutta has slightly altered the Teacher's words, doubtless out of respect, and thereby has diminished the selflessness of its tone. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171] n; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] n; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ap. B *c* § 5 [7] n.

[3] Part I (title) n.

[4] Cp. Ap. D *c* § 3 [18].

[5] Literally, not for a (future) time. 'Is immediate in its results', Warren. Ap. H 1 § 5 (*unlimited by time*), § 6 (*for all time*).

[6] Cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 1. Here it is precisely stated that the Dhamma is not dogmatic or traditionary but rationalistic and practical, and this statement can hardly have intended the great hypothesis of transmigration or Karma (IN 2; Ap. B), though it may well comprise the misery of egotism (Ch. 5 *b* § 5).

[7] Ap. F 2 *b* [6]; and Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (21) n.

[8] Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13].

[9] As in Ap. E *c* ii § 3.

[10] Ap. A 1 *a* (*Khudda Nikāya*). The *Sutta-Nipāta* verses are in tone less purely altruistic, less communal and social, more individualist, ascetic and tolerant of wonders, of spirits and of gods, and so more Hindu (IN 8) than the mass of the Sermons in the first four Nikāyas. They form the 5th Book of the 5th Nikāya and show signs of being later in date than the Sermons generally.

[11] The following translation is taken from SBE, X, Pt. ii, pp. 62–3. The second part of the Sutta is quoted in Ch. 8 *l* § 1.

[12] Int. § 138.

[13] Ch. 8 *l*.

[14] See *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 366.

[15] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18); Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6]. Sāvaka is a general term and includes any hearer or learner.

[16] Pāli, kathaṃkaro sāvako sādhu hoti, yo vā agārā anagāram eti agārino vā pan' upāsakāse. It is not clear whether monks dwelling in Vihāras are included or only lay householders, but conventionally the former were 'houseless' (Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3), *vihāra*). Buddha's reply avoids any comparison of status and by no means reserves salvation to the ascetic (Ap. C *b*, *Note*).

(2–9) . . .[1]

(10) Bhagavat: 'Listen to me, O Bhikkhus, I will teach you the Dhamma that destroys sin, do ye keep it, all of you; let him who looks for what is salutary, the thoughtful, cultivate the mode of life suitable for Pabbajitas.[2]

(11) 'Let not the Bhikkhu walk about at a wrong time, let him go to the village for alms at the right time;[3] for ties ensnare the one that goes at a wrong time, therefore Buddhas[4] do not go at a wrong time.

(12) 'Form, sound, taste, smell, and touch which intoxicate creatures, having subdued the desire[5] for (all) these things (dhammas), let him in due time go in for his breakfast.[6]

(13) 'And let the Bhikkhu, after having obtained his food at the right time and returned, sit down alone and privately; reflecting within himself let him not turn his mind to outward things, (but be) self-collected.

(14) 'If he speak with a Sāvaka[7] or with anybody else, or with a Bhikkhu, let him talk about the excellent Dhamma, (but let him) not (utter) slander, nor blaming words against others.[8]

(15) 'For some utter language contradicting others;[9] those narrow-minded ones we do not praise. Ties from here and there ensnare them, and they send their mind far away[10] in that (dispute).

(16) 'Let a Sāvaka of him with the excellent understanding (Buddha),[11] after hearing the Dhamma taught by Sugata,[12] discriminately seek for food, a monastery,[13] a bed and a chair,[14] and water[15] for taking away the dirt of his clothes.

(17) 'But without clinging[16] to these things, to food, to bed and chair, to water for taking away the dirt of his clothes, let a Bhikkhu be like a waterdrop on a lotus.'[17]

[1] Omitting praises of Buddha and mention of gods and spirits, including 'the king of elephants, Erāvana by name'. Int. § 93 (iii).

[2] Ch. 1 § 9 [59]; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [1]. Cp. Ap. H 2 (*Pabbajjā*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2.

[3] 'Let him not go in the night time', RDB, p. 157, quoting Sir Coomara Swāmy's translation.

[4] 'The wise', RDB.

[5] *Chanda*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).

[6] 'Take his noonday meal', RDB.

[7] 'A follower of the Buddha', RDB.

[8] Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (4).

[9] 'Some fortify themselves for controversy', RDB. Literally, Some put speech in battle-array.

[10] In the praise of concentration here trance is ignored (Ap. I *a*).

[11] 'One who follows the Buddha', RDB.

[12] Ap. C *b* § 11 (285).

[13] 'Lodging', RDB.

[14] 'Bed, seats', RDB. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2].

[15] Ch. 5 *a* § 10.

[16] 'He should not be careful about', RDB. Ascetic detachment is the ideal of the poem, not compassion.

[17] 'Like a water-drop which adheres not to the lotus-leaf', RDB; Ch. 5 *a* § 6. The whole poem, dealing with the essentials of religious life, completely ignores the idea of transmigration (IN 2). The beautiful simile relates the individual to the universal exactly as do the similes of the Ocean (Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5) and of fire (Ap. G 2 *a* § (8).

i. Duties[1] of Juniors[2] (Saddhivihārika[3] and Antevāsika)[4]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga I, xxv, 8–24.*

[8] 'A Saddhivihārika', he said, 'must conduct himself rightly towards his instructor (*upajjhāyamhi*);[5] and this is right conduct. Having risen betimes,[6] taking off his shoes,[7] arranging his upper-wrap[8] on one shoulder, he must give a tooth-stick[9] and water for the mouth [to the instructor], and must prepare a seat [for him]. If there is rice-gruel[10] he must wash the dish and hand the gruel. . . .[11] [9] If the instructor wishes to enter the village, a [lower] garment[12] (*nivāsanaṃ*) must be given him, the upper-garment[13] (*paṭi-nivāsanaṃ*) must be taken off, his girdle[14] (*kaya-bandhanaṃ*) and the [two outdoor] wraps[15] (*saṃghāṭiyo*) must be given him and fastened,[16] and the begging-bowl[17] (*patto*) after rinsing must be given to him. If the instructor desires an attendant[18] (*pacchā-samaṇaṃ*) then having garbed himself completely so as to cover the three circles,[19] having bound his girdle and put on and fastened his [two outdoor] wraps, having tied the knot[20] and having rinsed and taken his begging-bowl, he must be attendant to the instructor. He must keep neither too far nor too near. . . . [10] Returning, he must go in front, prepare a seat, bring water for the feet,

[1] Ap. F.

[2] These are not either novices or probationers, as they have received the second or full ordination, but they are still under the tuition of seniors. Ch. 8 *g* § 2; see also Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 11 *c* § 29 n (*novice*); Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2] (*novice*). Cp. Ap. A 2 *b* (68). Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 n.

[3] Ch. 8 *g* § 1.

[4] Ch. 8 *g* § 4; Ch. 9 *b* § 5; cp. Ch. 9 *a* [2] n; Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [1].

[5] Ch. 8 *g* § 5 n.

[6] Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6]. Exactly the same duties are prescribed for an *antevāsika* towards an *ācariya* in MV I. xxxii 3. SBE, xvii, p. 18 opines that 'the Upajjhāya is a more important person than the Ācariya—the former must have ten years, the latter need only have six years, seniority'.

[7] Int. § 190 (*dress*).

[8] *Uttar-āsaṅga*; Ch. 6 *b* § 2; Ch. 8 *j* § 3; Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1]; Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 7 [22]. The upper-wrap was fastened at the waist and brought up from behind over the left shoulder so as to leave the right hand free. In moments of leisure it was thrown over the right shoulder also (Ap. H 5 [94]; cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35] n).

[9] A twig frayed at the end. Int. § 190 (*toilet*); Ap. H 5 [91].

[10] *Yāgu*. Int. § 190 (*food*); Ch. 4 § 3; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [2].

[11] Omitting details.

[12] The waist-cloth (Ch. 8 *j* § 3). The context shows that this was a fresh garment to replace that used in the house.

[13] Worn in the house to cover the upper part of the body. There was a fresh garment to replace that used in the house. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [5].

[14] Ap. H 2 *a* § 5 (*yellow band*); Ap. H 5 [91], [94].

[15] The outdoor garment covering the upper part of the body and the outer wrap. Ch. 8 *j* § 3; Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [15].

[16] SBE, xiii (p. 155), after Buddhaghosha (Int. § 21), translates as laid 'upon each other'. *Saguṇaṃ* means literally 'strung'. Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [34] (*pair*); Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [5].

[17] Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [1].

[18] See § 2 [1] below; Ch. 6 *a* § 9; Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [5]; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [258]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 10 [19] (*atta-dutiya*).

[19] The knees and navel. The waist-cloth was arranged to fall below the knees.

[20] If there was only one knot, the outer and the inner wraps must have been tied at the same time and would conveniently be put on together.

a footstool and a towel,[1] and meeting him he must take back his bowl and [outer] robe,[2] give him the upper garment [used in the house], and take back his [lower] garment. . . .[3] [14] If [the instructor] desires to teach he must be heard; if he desires to be questioned, he must be questioned. . . . [20] If the instructor pursues a false theory[4] (*diṭṭhi-gataṃ*), the Saddhivihārika must dissuade him, cause him to be dissuaded, and discourse with him on the Law. [21] If the instructor transgresses a chief rule[5] (*garu-dhammaṃ*) and is deserving of *parivāsa*,[6] the Saddhivihārika must think earnestly "What if now the assembly should impose *parivāsa* on the instructor?" . . . [24] Without asking the instructor . . .[7] he must not attend upon anyone or receive attendance from anyone. . . .'

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga VIII, xxvi.*

[1] At that time a certain mendicant brother had an intestinal disease, and he lay amidst his own discharges. Then the Blessed One proceeding on a round of the lodgings[8] with the venerable Ānanda[9] as attendant[10] came to that mendicant brother's dwelling-place (*vihāro*). Then the Blessed One saw him where he lay, and having seen him went to him . . . and said 'What is thy disease, Bhikkhu?' 'I have an intestinal disease, Blessed One,' he replied. 'Then is there, Bhikkhu, anyone ministering[11] to thee?' 'No, Blessed One.' 'Why do the mendicant brothers not send someone to minister to thee?' he said. 'I am useless, revered sir, to the mendicant brothers; therefore they make no one minister to me.' [2] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda, saying: 'Go, Ānanda, and bring water; we will bathe this Bhikkhu.' The venerable Ānanda replied 'Even so, revered sir,' assenting to the Blessed One, and brought water, and the Blessed One poured the water while the venerable Ānanda washed [the mendicant brother]. The Blessed One standing at the head and the vener-

[1] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]; Ap. H 5 [93].
[2] *Patta-cīvara*. Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [4].
[3] Omitting here and below many precise details regarding the folding and drying of clothes, sweeping the room, airing carpets (Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1]; Ap. H 5 [93], *mat*) and furniture (Int. § 190), opening windows (Ch. 8 *k* [8]), plastering and colouring the walls and floor (Int. § 190, architecture), hot baths (Ap. H 5 [94]), soap (powder and clay), washing the begging-bowl, dyeing the robes, and other points which may or may not have attracted Gotama's attention. The humblest service to the senior was a privilege of the ordained junior. There is no trace of caste restrictions (Ap. H 4 *d*).
[4] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
[5] Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 2 (*sikkhāpadāni*); Ch. 12 *d* § 2 (*vatta-padāni*); also Ch. 22 § 23.
[6] i.e. being put again upon probation. Ap. H 3 *b* § 1.
[7] Among the points thus mentioned are shaving the hair of, and being shaved by anyone but the *upajjhāya*. Int. § 190 (*toilet*), and Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].
[8] *Sen-āsana*. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2].
[9] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1].
[10] *Pacchā-samaṇa*. See § 1 [9] above.
[11] *Upaṭṭhāka* means 'ministrant'. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [4]; Ch. 9 *b* §§ 5, 8. Ch. 10 *c* (36), (77); Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3]; Ch. 15 *b* § 6 [1]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2]; Ch. 21 § 7 [23]; Ap. A 2 *b* (68). Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 11; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [7] (v).

able Ānanda at the feet, they lifted him and laid him on a bedstead.[1] [3] Then the Blessed One . . . having caused an assembly to meet[2] questioned the Bhikkhus. . . . 'You have no mother, mendicant brothers, you have no father,' he said, 'who might minister to you. If you do not minister to each other, then who will minister? Whosoever, mendicant brothers, would minister to me, he should minister to the sick.[3] [4] If [the sick man] has an Upajjhāya[4] he must be ministered to by the Upajjhāya whilst life lasts and must be tended till recovery. If he has an Ācariya[5] . . . if he has a Saddhivihārika . . . if he has an Antevāsika . . . if he has a fellow-pupil under an Upajjhāya . . . under an Ācariya he must be ministered to . . . till recovery. If he has neither Upajjhāya . . .[6] nor fellow-pupil . . . he must be ministered to by the Saṃgha. He who does not minister is guilty of a grave offence.'[7] [5] . . .[8]

j. Necessaries:[9] Rules regarding Apparel,[10] Food,[11] Dwellings,[12] Medicines;[13] Kaṭhina;[14] Monastic Property[15]

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga VIII

§ 1. [i. 1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Rājagaha, in the Bamboo Grove at Kalandaka-nivāpa.[16] . . .[17] [34] Seated at one side Jīvaka Komārabhacca[18] spoke thus to the Blessed One: '. . . The Blessed One, revered sir, and the community of mendicant brothers have clothing taken from the dust-heap. . . . May the Blessed One, revered sir, accept from me a pair[19] of robes (*dussa-yugaṃ*) and sanction for the community of mendicant brothers robes

[1] *Mañcaka*, a platform or frame. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [8]; Ch. 22 *b* § 1 [1]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9).
[2] Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1].
[3] Ap. F 1.
[4] Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6].
[5] Ch. 8 *g* § 4 [1].
[6] Omitting repetition.
[7] Ap. H 1 § 2.
[8] An enumeration of the qualities of patient and attendant follows. Int. § 190 (*medicine*).
[9] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (*bases*).
[10] Int. § 190 (*dress*); Ch. 2 § 7 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 11 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 12 n; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]; Ap. H 3, *Note* (MV, 8); Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [7]; and Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [7] (i), (viii).
[11] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1); Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (25); Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [7] (vii); Ch. 15 *a* § 12 n (*meals*); Ch. 18 *a* § 1; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (7); Ap. H 3, *Note* (MV, 6); Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [12], § 2 (8).
[12] Cp. Ch. 8 *g* (*vihāra*).
[13] Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [7] (vi).
[14] Ap. H 3, *Note* (MV, 7); and Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (27).
[15] See § 11 below; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 10 *a* § 11; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [18].
[16] Ch. 8 *g* § 8. See Ch. 12 *c* § 1 [1].
[17] Omitting a discursive and plainly commentarial account of Jīvaka the court-physician, who prescribed for the diseases contracted by the Bhikkhus owing to unhealthy clothing—his lowly birth, his adoption by Prince Abhaya (Int. § 168), education (Int. §§ 137 n, 190) at Taxila (*Takkasilā*), appointment as physician to the five hundred women of King Bimbisāra's court (Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1]), his cure of King Pajjota of Avanti (Int. § 162), and his attendance on the Buddha. See Ch. 12 *c* § 1 [1] n.
[18] Int. § 185 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 17 *e* [6]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [1]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1].
[19] Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35]. Cp. Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9] (*fastened*).

[received] from laymen (*gahapati-cīvaram*).'[1] . . . [35] Then the Blessed One . . . instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'I sanction, mendicant brothers, robes [received] from laymen. Whosoever wishes may have clothing taken from the dust-heap;[2] whosoever wishes may adopt robes received from laymen. I am satisfied with either.'

§ 2. [ii. 1] Then at that time a Rāja[3] of Kāsi[4] (*Kāsika-rājā*) sent to Jīvaka Komārabhacca a woollen-outer-wrap (*kambalaṃ*). . . .[5] Then Jīvaka . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: '. . . May the Blessed One, revered sir, accept from me this woollen-outer-wrap; that would be to me for a long time a benefit[6] (*hitāya*) and a pleasure.' [iii. 1] . . .[7] 'I sanction,' he said, 'six [kinds of] robes[8] (*cīvarāni*)—linen,[9] cotton, silk, wool, hemp and sacking.'

§ 3. [xii. 1] . . .[10] [2] 'I sanction,' he said, 'an outer-wrap (*saṃghātiṃ*)[11] of torn pieces,[12] an upper-robe (*uttar-āsaṇgaṃ*)[13] of torn pieces and a waist-cloth (*antara-vāsakaṃ*)[14] of torn pieces.'

§ 4. [xxviii. 1] . . . 'The nakedness[15] adopted by Tiṭṭhiyas,'[16] he said, 'must not be adopted [by you]. Whosoever adopts it is guilty of a gross transgression[17] (*thull-accayassa*).' [2] . . .[18]

§ 5. *Mahā-vagga VII, on Kaṭhina* (*the provision of clothing*).

[i. 1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jeta Grove, the garden of Anāthapiṇḍaka.[19] And at that time about thirty Pāṭheyyaka[20] Bhikkhus . . . going to Sāvatthi to see the Blessed One, when the beginning of the rainy season was approaching, were unable to get to Sāvatthi by the beginning of the

[1] i.e. new robes. Ch. 8 *k* [7]; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14] (iii). According to Buddhaghosha (Int. § 21) this incident took place twenty years after the Enlightenment; SBE, xvii, p. 193.

[2] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 n (*bases*). Cp. Ch. 8 *k* [7]; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14] (iii).

[3] Possibly only a member of the ruling or warrior class. Int. § 164 n; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*]. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56] n; Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [2] n; Ch. 17*b* § 2 [83].

[4] 'The King of Kāsi', SBE, xvii, p. 195. 'Buddhaghosha. "This king was Pasenadi's brother, the same father's son." He appears to have been a sub-king of Pasenadi, for in the Lohikka-sutta (*Dīgha* 12) it is stated that Pasenadi's rule extended both over Kāsi and Kosala,' SBE. See Int. §§ 158 (3), 162, 169; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11]; also Ch. 15*a* ii § 13 [163] n. Cp. Ch. 13 *d* § 8 [1].

[5] Omitting the value, which is not clear.

[6] Int. § 113.

[7] Omitting similar offers.

[8] Int. § 189 (*manufactures*).

[9] For the same list see Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (2).

[10] Omitting an account of how the pattern of the Buddha's robes was taken from the shape of the rice-fields in Magadha. Ch. 11 *d* § 1.

[11] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9]; Ch. 8 *k* [7]; Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [5]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]; Ch. 22 *a* §§ 5 [21], 7 [35].

[12] Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [15].

[13] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [162]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [4].

[14] Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [5]. Cp. Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [2] (*nivāsanaṃ*).

[15] Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11].

[16] Int. § 179 (*Six*). Cp. *añña-tiṭṭhiya* (Ch. 8 *a* [1]).

[17] Ap. H 3 *b* (*penalties*). Cp. Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99].

[18] Omitting the prohibition of ascetic garments such as hair blankets and antelope-hide (Ap. F 2 *c* §§ 1 [394], 3 [11]; cp. Ch. 8 *k*), also adopted by Tiṭṭhiyas.

[19] Ch. 8 *g* § 7; see § 9 below. Generally the Sāvatthi rules must be of later date than those formulated at Rājagaha.

[20] Western; Int. § 155 n. Cp. Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [2]; see Ch. 14 *e* § 2 [1].

rainy season and entered upon *vassa*[1] at Sāketa[2] on the way.... Then those Bhikkhus at the end of three months, having observed *vassa* and performed *pavāraṇa*[3] . . . reached Sāvatthi and came to the Blessed One.... [2] Then the Blessed One spoke to those Bhikkhus thus: 'Is it well with you,[4] Bhikkhus, how do you fare; have you passed *vassa* pleasantly, in agreement (*sam-aggā*),[5] in unity, without disputes, and have you lacked not for alms?' 'It is well with us, Blessed One . . . we have passed *vassa* in agreement. . . .[6] Owing to the rainy weather,[7] floods and mud, we have finished the journey tired and with worn-out[8] robes.' [3] Then the Blessed One . . . instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'I sanction, mendicant brothers, that *kaṭhina*[9] be allowed (*kaṭhinam attharituṃ*) to Bhikkhus who have observed *vassa*. For you, mendicant brothers, to whom *kaṭhina* is allowed[10] five things are permitted—going round uninvited, going round without putting on (the three robes),[11] going in a body to receive meals (*gaṇa-bhojanaṃ*),[12] receiving as many robes[13] as needed, and as many robes as are bestowed shall belong to them [and be divided]. And thus, mendicant brothers, is the *kaṭhina* to be allowed.[14] [4] The assembly must be directed[15] by a learned and competent mendicant brother, saying: 'Let the assembly, revered sirs, hear me. This *Kaṭhina*-cloth[16] (*kaṭhina-dussaṃ*) has been bestowed on the assembly. If it please the assembly let the assembly give this *kaṭhina*-cloth to such and such a Bhikkhu to lay down the pattern[17] (*kaṭhinaṃ atthari-tuṃ*). This is the proposal;[18] let the assembly, revered sirs, hear me: "This *kaṭhina*-cloth has been bestowed on the assembly. The assembly gives this *kaṭhina*-cloth to such and such a Bhikkhu to lay down the pattern." . . . This *kaṭhina*-cloth has been given by the assembly to such and such a Bhikkhu to lay down the pattern. It seems good to the assembly; therefore it remains silent. Thus I take it.'

[1] Ch. 8 *c*.
[2] Int. § 149.
[3] Ch. 8 *c*.
[4] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2] n.
[5] Ch. 13 *a* § 6; Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [156]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9]; and Ch. 8 *e* § 5.
[6] Omitting an account of their hard journey.
[7] Or sky (*deva*). Ap. A 1 *a*.
[8] Or, drenched.
[9] Stock clothing. 'The Kaṭhina ceremony', SBE, xvii, p. 149. *Kaṭhina* means a hard framework, and so a set of wooden boards by the pattern of which the patchwork of the robes was marked, before the cloth was cut, stitched together and dyed. The robes were then distributed to all duly qualified members of each Saṃgha. See Wales, *Siamese State Ceremonies* (1931), p. 209. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* 7 [1] (*robes*).
[10] 'After the Kaṭhina ceremony has been held', SBE; but this seems doubtful.
[11] 'Without wearing the usual set of three robes', SBE after Buddhaghosha (Int. § 21).
[12] 'This is a relaxation of the 32nd Pākittiya Rule', SBE, xvii, p. 151; Ap. H 1 § 4 (*precepts*). ' "In a body" means four or more Bhikkhus going together to the same house', SBE, xiii, p. 38, on the 32nd *Pācittiya*. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [1] n.
[13] i.e. material for robes. The robes were merely oblong pieces of cloth.
[14] Literally, laid down; see [4] below. For the modern ceremony see Wales, pp. 200, 204.
[15] Ch. 8 *b* § 3.
[16] Stock or common cloth.
[17] See [3] above. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 19 [110] (*robe-making*).
[18] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4].

§ 6. *Mahā-vagga V, i.*

[1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Rājagaha on the Vulture Peak[1] (*Gijjha-kuṭe pabbate*). And at that time the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra[2] held rule and overlordship over eighty thousand villages.[3] ...[4] The king called a meeting of the overseers[5] of these eighty thousand villages. ... [3] Then the king ... dismissed the overseers saying: 'You now, I say (*bhaṇe*),[6] have been directed by me on matters of this world[7] (*diṭṭha-dhammike atthe*); go ye and attend the Blessed One; The Blessed One verily will direct you on matters beyond[8] (*sam-parāyike atthe*).' ... [4] And at that time the venerable Sāgata[9] was ministrant[10] (*upatthāko*) to the Blessed One. ...[11] [9] And the Blessed One ... addressed to them ... the graduated discourse. ...[12] [11] Then this thought came to Soṇa Koḷivisa:[13] 'As far as I understand the Law shown by the Blessed One it is not easy for one living a household life (*agāraṃ*)[14] to lead the altogether complete, pure, and radiant holy life (*brahmacariyaṃ*).'[15] ... [12] Soon after his *upasampadā*-ordination the venerable Soṇa was staying in the Sītavana (*Sītavane*).[16] [13] As he with excessive zeal walked to and fro (in meditation) his feet were hurt and the terrace[17] (*caṅkamo*) became covered with blood like a slaughter-house for kine[18] (*gav-āghātanaṃ*). ...[19] [15] And the Blessed One spoke thus to the venerable Soṇa: '...[20] [16] Excessive zeal leads to upliftedness,[21] too little zeal leads to sloth.[22] [17] Therefore, Soṇa, insist on evenness of exertion,[23] and come through to evenness (*samataṃ*)[24] of the moral

[1] Int. § 128.
[2] Int. § 168.
[3] The Pāli term is *gāma*. 'Townships', SBE, xvii, p. 1. Ch. 11 *a* § 4 [1]. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 13 *c* § 28.
[4] Omitting here and below the discursive and plainly commentarial account of the unusually tender feet of Soṇa Koḷivisa (see [11] below) of Campā (Int. § 146).
[5] Pāli *gāmika*. Int. § 172.
[6] Ch. 3 § 1.
[7] Ap. C *b* § 4. Literally, of the seen world.
[8] Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*. 'The things of eternity', SBE, too definitely.
[9] Ch. 10 *c* [4] (45); Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (*20th year*). The *thera* Sāgata preceded Ānanda as Buddha's attendant; Ap. A 2 *b* (68).
[10] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1]; Ap. A 2 *b* (68); Ap. H 5 [93].
[11] Omitting the appearances and disappearances and other aerial marvels (Int. § 94 (iv); Ch. 10 *c* [4] (45); Ap. I *b*) of Sāgata before the overseers. Contrast Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [4].
[12] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. See Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9].
[13] See [1] n above; Ch. 10 *c* [2] (18).
[14] Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 14 *c* § 3 [1]. It is not stated that it is impossible for a layman to lead the holy life; Ap. C *b*, *Note*, and Ch. 8 *l*.
[15] Ch. 3 § 5 [163]; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]; Ap. D *c* § 1. See Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [14].
[16] Int. § 130. The long passage which follows appears also in the Sixes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, pp. 374–9).
[17] Ch. 3 § 7. The terrace or platform for meditative walking was an essential feature of monastery and hermitage; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3).
[18] That the Eastern clansmen had no prejudice against the killing of cattle is evident (cp. MV, VI. xxxi. 13–14).
[19] Buddha miraculously appears before Soṇa. Ch. 11 *c* § 3 n; Ch. 13 *b* § 6 [1].
[20] Omitting the simile of the tuning of a lute (*vīṇā*).
[21] *Uddhacca*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).
[22] *Kosajja*; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3].
[23] *Viriya*; Ap. F 2 *a* (137).
[24] Cp. Ch. 8 *k*.

powers (*indriyānaṃ*),[1] and thus attain the goal[2] (*nimittaṃ*). . . .[3] [29] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Soṇa saying: 'Thou, Soṇa, wast nurtured delicately. I sanction for thee, Soṇa, sandals (*upāhanaṃ*) with a lining.[4] . . .'[5]

§ 7. *Mahā-vagga V, x.*

[10] . . . 'You shall not, Bhikkhus,' he said, 'cause the taking of life.[6] Whosoever shall cause it shall be dealt with under the rules.[7] Ox-hide must not be used; whosoever uses it is guilty of a grave offence. Nor is any hide[8] to be used; whosoever uses it is guilty of a grave offence.'

§ 8. *Mahā-vagga VI, xxxi.*[9]

[13] . . . A certain man drew near to where Sīha[10] the chief-general was and announced to him in his ear: 'Perhaps, revered sir (*bhante*),[11] thou shouldst know that many of these Nigaṇṭhas[12] in Vesāli[13] are crying from road to road, from crossway to crossway, with outspread arms: To-day Sīha the General, having slaughtered fat cattle (*pasuṃ*), is making a meal[14] for the Samaṇa[15] Gotama; and the Samaṇa Gotama knowingly eats meat killed for the purpose and the responsibility is his.'[16] 'Enough, sir (*ayyo*),'[17] he replied, 'these venerable[18] [Nigaṇṭhas] have long been desirous of the dispraise of the Buddha, of the Dhamma and of the Saṃgha. . . . We would not even for our lives intentionally deprive a living being of life.'[19] [14] (1) And Sīha the General, serving with his own hands the Saṃgha headed by the Buddha, satisfied them with choice food both hard and soft;[20] and when the Blessed One, having eaten, had withdrawn his hand from the bowl, he seated himself on one side, and the Blessed One instructed him. . . . (2) And

[1] Or, spiritual organs. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.

[2] i.e. Arahatship (Ap. D *c*). Cp. Ch. 8 *f* § 2 (*snarks*). This speech and the exertions and enlightenment of Soṇa are taken from *Aṅg. Nik.*, *Chakka-nipāta* 55 (PTS, iii, pp. 374–9).

[3] Omitting Soṇa's attainment of Arahatship, which is described in the difficult terms found also in Ch. 4 § 17. Omitting also Soṇa's discourse on the six things attained by the Arahat.

[4] Or, sock. Ch. 6 *a* § 3 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 12 n; Ch. 17 *a* § 2 [6]; Ap. H 3, *Note* (MV, 5).

[5] Omitting Soṇa's refusal to wear such sandals until they were allowed to the Saṃgha.

[6] Or, laws of the *Pātimokkha* (Ap. H 1). 'The Laws (Dhammas) referred to are the first [third] Pârâgika, the 11th Pâkittiya and the 61st and 62nd Pâkittiyas', SBE, xvii, p. 30.

[7] Int. § 49; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*c*]; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.

[8] Ap. H 3, *Note* (MV, 5).

[9] The narrative is continued from Ap. B *b* § 3 [10]; see also Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7].

[10] The Licchavi commander at Vesāli. Ap. B *b* § 3.

[11] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.

[12] Or, Jains. Int. § 184.

[13] Ch. 12.

[14] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1); Ch. 9 *a* [6] n.

[15] Ch. 7 *a* § 11.

[16] Or, the Karma passes on to him (*paṭicca-kammaṃ*). Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Nigaṇṭha*).

[17] Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1].

[18] The title *āyasmant* is applied to Jain elders as well as to Buddhists. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29].

[19] Int. § 49.

[20] Ch. 6 *a* § 12.

in this connexion the Blessed One . . . instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Meat killed for the purpose[1] must not knowingly be eaten; whosoever so eats is guilty of a grave offence. I sanction, mendicant brothers, the flesh of fish[2] when it is pure in three points, when [its special preparation is] not seen, not heard of, and not suspected.'

§ 9. *Mahā-vagga VI, i.*

[2] . . .[3] A reflection arose in the mind of the Blessed One thus: '. . . What medicine (*bhesajjaṃ*) should I sanction for the Bhikkhus, which may both be medicine and may come under [the class of] food[4] for occasions, but may not be considered as ordinary food?' And this thought came to the Blessed One: 'These five medicines,[5] namely clarified butter, fresh butter, oil, honey, sugar, both are medicines and come under [the class of] food for occasions, but are not to be considered as ordinary food.' . . . [3] 'I sanction', he said, 'accepting these five [as] medicines at the right time (*kāle*) and eating them at the right time.'

§ 10. *Culla-vagga VI, i.*

[1] . . .[6] The Bhikkhus then were dwelling here and there in the forest[7] at the foot of trees on the hill-side, in grotto or mountain-cave,[8] in cemetery[9] (*susāne*), in lonely grove, in the open air on a bed of grass. . . . [2] Then at that time the great merchant[10] (*seṭṭhi*) of Rājagaha went early to [his] pleasure-ground[11] (*uyyānaṃ*) and saw the Bhikkhus . . . and approaching them spoke to them thus: 'If, revered sirs, I were to cause dwellings (*vihāre*) to be made, would you stay in my dwellings?' . . . The Bhikkhus approached the Blessed One . . . and said: 'The great merchant of Rājagaha, revered sir, is desirous of causing dwellings to be made [for us]. How now, revered sir, must we proceed?' . . . 'I sanction', he said, five shelters (*lenāni*),[12] rest-house (*vihāraṃ*),[13] hut,[14] storied-house, house with sloped roof and cave.' [3] . . .[15]

1 Int. § 49; see § 11 below. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 3; Ch. 15 *a* § 12 n; also Ch. 6 *a* § 12.
2 Perhaps fish or meat. Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14] (v), [15].
3 The occasion was a general sickness in the Saṃgha at Sāvatthi (§ 5 above) during the hot season.
4 Or, diet.
5 Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (4); Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 8 (*condiments*).
6 The scene is in the hills near Rājagaha (Int. § 125) in the early days of the Saṃgha (Ch. 8 *a* [1]). The incident may be supposed to have followed shortly after the gift of the Veḷuvana (Ch. 7 *a* § 15). See close of Ch. 8 *d*.
7 Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ch. 11 *c* § 29; Ch. 20 § 2 (6).
8 Int. § 129.
9 A spot where corpses were exposed. Int. § 190 (*burial*); Ch. 8 *k* [7]; Ch. 9 *a* [7]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [5]. See Ch. 11 *c* § 4.
10 Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [vii. 1]; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 10 *a* § 1. Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (3).
11 Outside the city. Ch. 1 § 9.
12 Int. § 190 (*architecture*).
13 Int. § 127; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3).
14 *Addhayoga*; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [4] (*straw-house*), and Ch. 11 *c* § 29.
15 Ch. 10 *a* § 12 [2] n.

§ 11. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 1 (Brahmajāla-Sutta),*[1] *I, 10 (Cūlasīla)*[2]*; repeated in Suttas 2–13. (PTS. I, p. 5.)*

[10] . . . The Samaṇa Gotama refrains from accepting gold or silver;[3] the Samaṇa Gotama refrains from accepting uncooked grain . . .[4] uncooked meat[5] . . . wife or maid . . . female slave or male slave[6] . . . sheep or goats . . . fowls or pigs . . . elephants, cattle, horses or mares . . . fields or land.[7]

k. Gotama's Rejection of Strict Asceticism[8]

Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 77 (Mahā-Sakuludāyi-Sutta)

[PTS, ii, p. 1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, at Kalandakanivāpa.[9] And at that time many very well-known Wanderers[10] (*paribbājakā*) were living at Moranivāpa,[11] the Wanderers' Garden, namely Anugāra, Varadhara, and Sakuludāyin[12] the Paribbājaka and other very well-known Wanderers. Then in the morning[13] the Blessed One, wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe and alms-bowl, entered Rājagaha for alms. Then this thought came to the Blessed One: 'It is too early yet to go round for alms in Rājagaha. What if now I should draw near to Moranivāpa, the Wanderers' Garden,[14] where Sakuludāyin is?' . . . [p. 2] Then Sakulādayin the Wanderer spoke thus to the Blessed One: '. . .[15] [p. 5] Five things (*dhamme*), revered sir, I admire in the Blessed One, for which the disciples honour, respect, esteem, revere the Blessed One and . . . live depending on him. Which five? The Blessed One is abstemious[16] and praises abstemiousness. . . . [p. 6] And then further, revered sir, the Blessed One is contented[17] with any robes and praises contentment with any robes . . . and further is contented with any food given as alms and praises contentment with any food given as alms . . . and is contented with any lodgings[18] and praises

[1] Ch. 23 *b* § 8; Ap. A 2 *d*.
[2] Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*.
[3] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10). See Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10].
[4] Omitting repetition.
[5] See § 8 [14] above.
[6] See Ap. F 1 *c* [162], where the same things (except fields and land) are enumerated as *upadhayo* (Ch. 7 *a* § 8).
[7] *Khetta-vatthu*; 'Ackerland (ploughland)', OB, p. 404. Such land differs from the *ārāma* or garden (Ch. 7 *a* § 15). See Ch. 8 *j* (*monastic property*).
[8] Int. § 5; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] n. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ch. 9 *a* § 12; Ch. 9 *c* 1 [93]; Ap. H 4 *c*; and Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [17] (*evenness*).
[9] Ch. 8 *g* § 8.
[10] Wandering philosophic teachers. Int. §§ 126, 179; Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [1]; Ap. G 2 *c*. See Ch. 11 *c* § 9.
[11] Int. § 126.
[12] Ch. 11 *c* § 9.
[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 5. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (25); Ap. H 5 [91].
[14] The phrase *yena* (where was) *Moranivāpo Paribbājakārāmo* suggests that M. is the name of the garden. The passage also suggests that M. was within the city bounds.
[15] Omitting generalized criticism of Pūraṇa Kassapa, Makkhali Gosāla, Ajita Kesakambalin, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya Belaṭṭhiputta, and Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta (Int. § 179) attributed to Udāyin.
[16] Literally, 'little-eating'. Ch. 8 *h* (*Duties*).
[17] Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (ii).
[18] *Senāsana*; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2].

contentment with any lodgings . . . and is solitary and praises solitude. . . .' '[Some] disciples, Udāyin, may honour . . . me saying "The Samaṇa Gotama[1] is abstemious and praises abstemiousness." I have disciples who eat but one bowl[2] of food, or even half a bowlful, or who eat but one *beluva*-fruit or even half a *beluva*.[3] [p. 7] But I sometimes, Udāyin, eat as much food as fills a begging-bowl and sometimes I eat more. . . . [Some] disciples, Udāyin, may honour . . . me saying "The Samaṇa Gotama is contented with any robes and praises contentment with any robes." I have disciples who wear rags taken from the dust-heap[4] or coarse robes; they pick up rags from cemetery[5] or rubbish-pile or shop, and make them into an outer-wrap (*saṃghāṭiṃ*)[6] which they wear. But I sometimes, Udāyin, wear robes received from laymen,[7] strong, roughly sewn, [or soft].[8] . . . [Some] disciples, Udāyin, may honour . . . me saying "The Samaṇa Gotama is contented with any food given as alms and praises contentment with any food given as alms." I have disciples who live on food given as alms; ever going on their rounds they delight in broken food. They will not be satisfied [to eat] in a house, invited to a seat on equal terms. But I sometimes, Udāyin, on invitation[9] (*nimantane*) eat fine boiled [p. 8] selected [food], variously sauced, variously flavoured.[10] . . . [Some] disciples, Udāyin, may honour . . . me saying "The Samaṇa Gotama is contented with any lodgings and praises contentment with any lodgings." I have disciples who live at the foot of a tree[11] in the open air; for eight months[12] they do not take shelter. But I sometimes, Udāyin, stay in gabled halls (*kūṭāgāresu*),[13] plastered, protected from draught, with fastened bolts[14] and with closed windows.[15] . . . [Some] disciples, Udāyin, may honour . . . me saying "The Samaṇa Gotama is solitary and praises solitude." I have disciples who are forest-dwellers (*āraññakā*);[16] they live in solitary lodging, taking up solitary abodes in lonely forest or grove. They every half-month return to the midst of the Saṃgha for the *Pātimokkha*-recital.[17] But I sometimes, Udāyin, live in a throng[18] with mendicant brothers, mendicant sisters,[19] laymen, lay-women,[20] the king's chief ministers[21] (*rāja-mahā-mattehi*), philosophers (*titthiyehi*),[22] and the disciples of philosophers. . . .'

[1] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]. [2] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]. [3] A kind of citron.
[4] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (2); Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [35]. [5] *Susāna*. Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [1].
[6] Ch. 8 *j* § 3.
[7] Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [34]. 'Robes made for laymen', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 203.
[8] The last two epithets are doubtful; the MSS. vary.
[9] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1); Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [11].
[10] Int. § 190 (*food*). Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 8.
[11] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3); Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]. See below, *āraññakā*.
[12] Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [15]; and Ch. 8 *c* (*vassa*). [13] Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *c* § 1.
[14] Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [2]. [15] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10] n.
[16] Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [1]; Ch. 10 *b* § 2; Ch. 10 *c* (16); Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]; Ch. 20 § 2 (6); Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [1]. See above under *tree*. Cp. Ch. 10 *c* (14). [17] Ch. 8 *b*.
[18] Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 5 (*gregariousness*); and Int. § 121 n. [19] Ch. 12.
[20] Int. § 190 (*women*).
[21] Int. § 172; Ch. 11 *c* § 21.
[22] Int. § 179 (*Six*).

l. Duties of an Upāsaka (lay disciple)[1]

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta, Culla-vagga 14 (Dhammika-Sutta)*.[2]

(18) 'A householder's work I will also tell you, how a Sāvaka[3] is to act to be a good one; for that complete Bhikkhu-dhamma[4] cannot be carried out by one who is taken up by (worldly) occupations.[5]

(19) 'Let him not kill, nor cause to be killed any living being,[6] nor let him approve of others killing, after having refrained from hurting all creatures,[7] both those that are strong and those that tremble in the world.

(20) 'Then let the Sâvaka abstain from (taking) anything in any place that has not been given (to him), knowing (it to belong to another), let him not cause anyone to take, nor approve of those that take, let him avoid all (sort of) theft.

(21) 'Let the wise man avoid an unchaste life as a burning heap of coals;[8] not being able to live a life of chastity, let him not transgress with another man's wife.

(22) 'Let no one speak falsely to another in the hall of justice or in the hall of the assembly,[9] let him not cause (any one) to speak (falsely), nor approve of those that speak (falsely), let him avoid all (sort of) untruth.

(23) 'Let the householder who approves of this Dhamma,[10] not give himself to intoxicating drinks;[11] let him not cause others to drink, nor approve of those that drink, knowing it to end in madness.

(24) 'For through intoxication the stupid commit sins and make

[1] Ch. 9 *b* (*Laymen*); Ap. H 4, *Note*. See further: Ch. 6 *a* §§ 7 [10], 11 [3]; Ch. 10 *c* [6]; Ch. 11 *c* § 14 n; Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*five things*); Ch. 13 *c* §§ 20 [3], 21 [4]; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 1 [210] n, 5 n, 7 n; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 2 [3], 4 [8], 8 [15]; Ap. C *b*, *Note*; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6); also (lay-women) Ch. 10 *c* [7]; Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [4] n; Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [209] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 4 [3]. Cp. Ch. 13 *d* § 8 n (*house-holders*); Ap. H 4 *b* § 2; and Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; also Ap. F. The causes of the decline or welfare of an *upāsaka* are stated in the Sevens of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, p. 25).

[2] The following translation is taken from SBE, x, Pt. ii, pp. 63–5; see Ch. 8 *h* § 2

[3] 'Disciple', RDB, p. 138. The word *sāvaka* (hearer, learner) is a general term meaning disciple; the term *upāsaka* (one who sits near) is limited to the laity. Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (1); Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [17]; Ch. 12 *a* § 9 [1]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26]; Ch. 22 *b* § 20; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]; Ap. H 4 *b* § 1 [1]. Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; also Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3] n (*sekha*).

[4] 'Such duties as are peculiar to the mendicants', RDB.

[5] 'By one who has a family', RDB. Int. § 190 (*family*).

[6] Int. § 49.

[7] Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10].

[8] Marriage among the laity and civic ideals are never depreciated by Gotama. The monk must be celibate, not to save himself, but to be free to aid others (Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14]). Family life is the special consideration of the *Sigālovāda-Sutta* (Ch. 9 *b*). One of the most beautiful sayings in the Canon typifies the supreme virtue of kindness or *mettā* (Ap. F 1 *b*) by mother-love, the foundation of all love in the world: 'As a mother at the risk of her life watches over her own child, her only child, so also let everyone cultivate a boundless (friendly) mind towards all beings' (*Sutta-Nipātā*, *Metta-Sutta*, SBE, x, p. 25).

[9] 'A royal assembly or gathering, (That is an official inquiry)', RDB, p. 138 and n. Cp. Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3].

[10] 'Who delights in the law', RDB.

[11] Ch. 1 § 3.

other people intoxicated; let him avoid this seat of sin,[1] this madness, this folly delightful to the stupid.[2]

[(25)[3] 'Let him not kill any living being, let him not take what has not been given (to him), let him not speak falsely, and let him not drink intoxicating drinks, let him refrain from unchaste sexual intercourse, and let him not at night eat untimely food.[4]

(26) 'Let him not wear wreathes nor use perfumes, let him lie on a couch spread on the earth: this they call the eightfold abstinence (*uposatha*),[5] proclaimed by Buddha who has overcome pain.

(27) 'Then having with a believing mind kept[6] abstinence (*uposatha*) on the fourteenth, or fifteenth, and the eighth days of the half-month,[7] and (having kept)[8] the complete Pāṭihārakapakkha[9] consisting of eight parts.[10]

(28) 'And then in the morning, after having kept abstinence,[11] let a wise man with a believing mind, gladdening the assembly of Bhikkhus with food and drink, make distributions according to his ability.

(29) 'Let him dutifully maintain his parents,[12] and practise an honourable trade;[13] the householder who observes this strenuously goes to the gods by name Sayampabhas.'[14]]

§ 2. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 96 (Esukāri-Sutta). (PTS II, pp. 178–80.)*

. . .[15] [p. 178] 'If, Brāhman,' he said, 'one should ask a Kshatriya thus: "Him, on account of whose service thou wouldst be worse off

[1] 'Cause of demerit', RDB, p. 139.

[2] This completes the five prime duties laid upon all, lay and cleric alike. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3] (*defilements*). Ap. H 4, *Note*.

[3] The remaining verses have been placed in square brackets as they seem plainly a later addition, awkwardly repeating and altering the previous matter. They imply that the layman should on certain occasions in the Buddhist year observe all the rules imposed upon probationers in the monasteries (Ch. 8 *d* § 5). Regarding these first six rules cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (vi).

[4] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (6). Fasting (Ap. F 1 *a* [53]) consisted in abstaining strictly from food except at the one regular daily meal, which must be eaten before noon: Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 8 *k* [1]; also Ch. 8 *j* (*food*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10].

[5] Holy-day observances or duty (*uposatha-kamma*); Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]. Cp. Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; Ch. 17 *a* [1]; Ap. H 4, *Note* (*eight*); and Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10].

[6] 'Moreover . . . one should observe', RDB.

[7] Ch. 8 *a* [1]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (v).

[8] 'Should also be duly observed', RDB.

[9] 'Special fortnight', i.e. the first half of the *cīvara-māsa* or month for giving robes (Ch. 8 *j*, *kaṭhina*), which was specially to be observed; see RDB, p. 141.

[10] i.e. strict observance of the eight abstinences. Ap. H 4 *a*; cp. Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51] (*duty*).

[11] 'Kept the Sabbath (Uposatha)', RDB, p. 139.

[12] Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [viii].

[13] See § 3 below.

[14] 'Reaches the self-shining gods', RDB; Int. § 70 (*sphere*); Ch. 14 *d* § 3 n; Ap. C *b* § 9; cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 9 n. The phrase shows the comparatively late date of the passage as also does the priestly incitement to donations (Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]). The passage promises heaven and doubtless implies a hell, but pays no attention to Karma or re-birth (Int. § 48).

[15] The scene is the Jetavana at Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *b*). The Brāhman Esukāri maintains that the members of each of the four castes should serve their own caste and the castes above, placing the Brāhmans first, so that Brāhmans should serve Brāhmans only. Gotama replies, incidentally placing Kshatriyas first (Int. § 185).

not better, or him on account of whose service thou wouldst be better off not worse—which now of these wouldst thou serve?" [p. 179] The Kshatriya, if he answered rightly, would answer thus: "Him, on account of whose service . . . I should be better off not worse—him I would serve." And if one should ask a Brāhman . . . a Vaisya . . . a Sūdra . . . (he) if he answered rightly would answer thus: "Him, on account of whose service I should be worse off not better, him I would not serve; him, on account of whose service I should be better off not worse, him I would serve." . . .[1] [p. 180] Him, on account of whose service, when one serves him, faith[2] (*saddhā*) is increased, good conduct[3] (*sīlaṃ*) is increased, learning[4] (*sutaṃ*) is increased, renunciation[5] (*cāgo*) is increased, insight[6] (*paññā*) is increased—I say that him one should serve.'[7]

§ 3. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-Nipāta* (*the Fives*), *Sutta 177*.

'These five trades,[8] mendicant brothers,' he said, 'must not be carried on by a lay-disciple (*upāsakena*). Which five? Trade in swords,[9] trade in human-beings,[10] trade in meat,[11] trade in intoxicants,[12] trade in poisons.[13] These five trades, mendicant brothers, must not be carried on by a lay-disciple.'

§ 4. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, V, xx*.

[2] . . .[14] Vaḍḍha the Licchavi[15] drew near to where the Blessed One was . . . and spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'Here, revered sir, is a thing improper, unfit.' . . .[16] [3] Then the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Now, mendicant brothers, let the Saṃgha hold back the begging-bowl from Vaḍḍha the Licchavi and not allow him the company of the Saṃgha at meals. In eight cases, mendicant brothers, the begging-bowl is to be held back from an associated

[1] Omitting Gotama's statement that high-caste (*uccā-kulīnatā*; Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 7 *c* § 1) is not in itself either good or bad. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1] (*family*).

[2] 'Glaube', OB, p. 215. Ch. 10 *c* [2] (21); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [5]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 9 [1], 18 [4]; Ch. 20 § 4 (1); Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [1]; Ap. 1 *b* § 4 [5]. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 6 (*pasāda*); also Ap. G 1 *b*.

[3] Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [6] n; Ch. 20 § 8 (*discourse*).

[4] Literally 'heard (instruction)'. Ch. 9 *b* § 5; Ch. 20 § 4 (4). Cp. Ch. 10 *c* (32); Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2]; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]; also Ch. 5 *b* § 10, and Ch. 9 *a* § 8 (*learning*).

[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [5]; Ch. 13 *a* § 8 n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]. Cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (126, *nekkhamma*).

[6] Ap. F 2 *a* (132).

[7] For similar lists of virtues see Ap. F 2. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1] (*qualities*).

[8] See § 1 (29) above; Int. § 189. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (5).

[9] *Sattha*; Int. § 175.

[10] Int. § 190 (*slaves*). *Satta* (an intelligent) being; Ch. 5 *a* § 6.

[11] Or, flesh (*maṃsa*). Int. § 49; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [14].

[12] Ch. 1 § 3 [50]; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (5).

[13] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4) [429].

[14] Omitting the conspiracy of the followers of Mettiya and Bhummajaka against the venerable Dabba. These troublesome monks figure repeatedly in the *Vinaya-Piṭaka*, but not in the four Nikāyas. It is implied that their monastery was near Rājagaha (Ch. 11 *c*). Compare the Chabbaggiya Bhikkhus: Ch. 8 *c* § 3; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*dissentients*).

[15] Ch. 12 *a*.

[16] Omitting Vaḍḍha's false accusation against Dabba, and the Buddha's inquiry.

(*samannāgatassa*)[1] lay-disciple—[when] he strives against gifts to the brethren, against the advantage of the brethren, against the residence[2] of the brethren, [when] he rails or speaks against the brethren, [when] he divides brethren from brethren, [when] he speaks in dispraise of the Buddha, of the Dhamma, or of the Saṃgha. . . . [4] And thus, mendicant brothers, must the begging-bowl be held back. The assembly must be directed[3] by a learned and competent mendicant brother, saying: "Let the assembly, revered sirs, hear me. Vaḍḍha the Licchavi [slanderously] accuses the venerable Dabba Mallaputta[4] of want of asceticism and of failure in virtuous conduct. If it please the assembly, let the assembly hold back the begging-bowl from Vaḍḍha the Licchavi and not allow him the company of the Saṃgha at meals. . . .[5] The begging-bowl is held back from Vaḍḍha the Licchavi by the Saṃgha and the company of the Saṃgha at meals is not allowed to him. . . . Thus I take it." ' [5] . . . Then Vaḍḍha the Licchavi with wife and child, friends, kinsmen,[6] and near-relations,[7] with freshly washed[8] garments and hair drew near to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near fell down with his head at the feet[9] of the Blessed One and spoke to him thus: 'A transgression, revered sir, has overcome me in that I [slanderously] accused the reverend (*ayyaṃ*) Dabba Mallaputta of want of asceticism and of failure in virtuous conduct. May the Blessed One pardon my transgression,[10] for my restraint in future. . . .' [6] Then the Blessed One instructed the Bhikkhus saying: 'Now let the Saṃgha hold out the begging-bowl to Vaḍḍha the Licchavi and allow him the company of the Saṃgha at meals.'[11] . . .

[1] Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1].
[2] Literally for their non-residence (*a-vāsa*); cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 2.
[3] Ch. 8 *b* § 3.
[4] Ch. 10 *c* [3] (27).
[5] Omitting the formal motion and assent by silence.
[6] Ch. 9 *b* §§ 3, 5; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 12 (*friends*).
[7] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1].
[8] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [5]. Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 3.
[9] Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [17]; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [120]; Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].
[10] Or, take my fault as a fault. Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99].
[11] 'It is characteristic of the mildness of early Buddhism that this should be the only penalty imposed upon a layman. Compare H. O.'s remarks in his *Buddha* . . . pp. 391–3. The house of such a layman becomes then an agocaro, an "unlawful resort" ' [un-pasturable, cp. Ch. 3 § 5, 167]. Cullavagga VIII, 1, 2 (SBE, xx, p. 119 n). On clerical penalties see Ap. H 3 *b*, n.

CHAPTER 9

RĀJAGAHA: THE LAW DEVELOPED; THE DUTIES OF LAYMEN; JAINS AND TIṬṬHIYAS

a. The Law developed: Meditation and Concentration[1] Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 22 (Mahā-sati-paṭṭhāna-S.)[2]

§ 1. Thus was it heard by me.[3] [1] . . .[4] The Blessed One spoke thus: 'This, mendicant brothers, is the only path (*maggo*)[5] for the purification[6] of living beings, for the overcoming of grief and lamentation, for the transcending of sorrow[7] and dejection,[8] for reaching to method (*ñāyassa*),[9] for the realization of Peace (*nibbānassa*),[10] namely the four attentions[11] (*sati-paṭṭhāna*). What four? Here,[12] mendicant brothers, the Bhikkhu lives as regards the body[13] (*kāye*), contemplating the body . . . as regards the sensations[14] (*vedanāsu*), contemplating the sensations . . . as regards the mind[15] (*citte*), contemplating the mind . . .[16] as regards phenomena[17] (*dhammesu*), contemplating phenomena,

[1] Ap. I *a* (*Meditation*).

[2] Great Discourse on fixing the attention; or introspection; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 12 [2], 14 [4], 15 [2] n; Ap. C *a* § 3 [22]; also Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*sammā-sati*); and Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-knowledge*). See §§ 8, 13 (7) below; also Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (v); Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425] n; Ch. 20 § 4 (6); and Ap. F 2 *b* [6] (*sati*). This Sutta, like other systematizing treatises, is placed among the discourses delivered by Gotama to the Kurus at Kammāssadhamma (Ch. 16 *a*); but it is without local characteristics and may be applied generally as a summary of essential points (Ap. G 1 *b*). The discourse belongs to a time later than the early days in which Gotama established the Saṃgha at Rājagaha; but it surveys as a whole the doctrine which he must have inculcated from the first, and therefore is placed here. Its force is to establish that individuality is transient and in itself (that is, apart from others) unimportant; and that conduct must follow not the path of self but the Noble Eightfold Way (that is, the path of selflessness or altruism). The *Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-S.* occurs also as the *Satipaṭṭhāna-S.* in *Majjh. Nik.* (Sutta 10), but without the commentary on the Four Truths in the latter part of the discourse (see § 9 n below). The difference seems more likely to be due to commentarial addition than to omission (IN 6, *Canon*).

[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 10 [420].

[4] Omitting the scene.

[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[6] Ap. E *a* i (277); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].

[7] *Dukkha*. Ap. E *b*.

[8] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].

[9] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].

[10] Ch. 1 § 11 [163]; Ap. C *b*. By *sati* (self-knowledge), which is the seventh section of the Noble Path, is reached *samādhi* (self-transcendence), which is the eighth section and is the same as *Nibbāna* (Peace).

[11] Or, modes of fixing the attention. Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [3] n.

[12] In this respect.

[13] See §§ 2, 7, 13 [7] below; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [15]. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 2 (*rūpa*). The passage is repeated in Ch. 21 § 3 [12] and § 8 [26]. See also Ch. 21 § 15 (1); Ap. G 1 *b* § 4 (*meditations*). Cp. grammatically Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [3].

[14] Ap. E *a* ii § 2. See § 3 [11] below.

[15] Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]. See § 4 [12] below.

[16] Omitting repetitions.

[17] Objects of thought; concepts. 'The elements of being', Warren, *Bm.-in Tr.* (1922), p. 354. Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [21]; and §§ 5, 13 (7) below. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] (*ideas*); and Part I (title) n.

strenuous, comprehending, mindful (*satimā*),[1] having put away in this world (*loke*)[2] covetousness[3] and lamentation.

i. *Body*

§ 2. [2] *Breathing*. And how does the Bhikkhu live as regards the body,[4] contemplating the body? Here (*idha*) . . .[5] he trains himself (*sikkhati*),[6] thinking: 'I will exhale[7] understanding all the body. . . . I will inhale understanding all the body. . . . I will exhale tranquillizing the body-compound [8](*kāya-saṃkhāraṃ*). . . . I will inhale tranquillizing the body-compound' . . .[9] and lives independent (*a-nissito*)[10] and grasps at (*upādiyati*)[11] nothing in the world. Thus, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu lives as regards the body, contemplating the body.

[3] *Postures*. And further a Bhikkhu, either walking[12] . . . or standing . . . or sitting . . . or reclining . . . or however his body is disposed, so comprehends it. He lives as regards the body contemplating that which has by nature an origin[13] . . . contemplating that which is by nature perishable[14] . . . and then his meditation (*sati*) on the existence of the body is extended up to the measure of knowledge,[15] up to the measure of reflexion.[16] . . .

[4] *Functions*. And further a Bhikkhu in advancing or withdrawing . . .[17] in walking, in standing, in sitting, in sleeping, in waking, in speaking, in being silent, acts with comprehension.[18] . . .

[5] *Uncleanness*.[19] And further a Bhikkhu regards this body upwards from the sole of the foot and downwards from the hair of the head, enclosed by skin, full of various kinds of uncleanness.[20] . . .[21]

[6] *Elements*. And further a Bhikkhu regards this body however situated, however placed, according to the element (*dhātuso*),[22] saying:

[1] See § 13 (7) below; Ch. 21 § 16. Cp. *sat-ārakkha* (Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3], iii); *sata*, self-scrutinizing (Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]); *pati-ssata* (Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]); and *sati* (Ap. F 2 *d* [421]).
[2] Ap. C *b* § 11 (89).
[3] Pāli *abhijjha*. Ch. 21 § 3 [12]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2]; cp. Ap. D*a* (*grasping*).
[4] See § 1 [1] above.
[5] Omitting details on regulating the breathing.
[6] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1].
[7] Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [13], 7 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4; also Ch. 3 § 7 (*suppressed breathing*); Ap. I *a* § 2 [5]. See *Saṃ. Nik.*, v, pp. 325–6. Compare the tranquillizing exercises of the Stoic emperor Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, iv. 3; see IN 10 (*Stoicism*). For the *kasiṇa* method of self-hypnosis see Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3].
[8] Or, individuality in the body. Ap. E *a* ii § 2 [8] (*saṃkhāra*). See § 6 below.
[9] Omitting the simile of a lathe-turner (*bhamakāra*); Int. § 189 (*trade*) and his apprentice (*antevāsin*; Ch. 8 *i*) and much repetition.
[10] Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 5 *c* § 4; Ap. D *a* § 6 (*liberation*).
[11] Ap. D *a* (*Upādāna*).
[12] Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].
[13] Pāli *samudaya-dhamma*; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]. Cp. Ap. B *c* (*samuppāda*).
[14] Pāli *vaya-dhamma*. Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7]; cp. Ch. 4 § 11 [5]; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [8].
[15] *Ñāṇa*; Ch. 4 § 16,
[16] *Pati-ssati*. Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-knowledge*).
[17] Omitting details of daily life. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [2].
[18] Ch. 21 § 3 [13].
[19] 'Loathesomeness', Warren, p. 360.
[20] *A-suci*; cp. *a-subha* (Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424]; Ch. 20 § 6 [3]). Cp. Int. § 105.
[21] Omitting an enumeration of 31 parts of the body (excluding the brain, which is usually added, making 32). See the formula in Ap. H 2 *a* § 5 (*taca-pañcakaṃ*), which enumerates the first five only; also Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421] n.
[22] Cp. Int. § 105; Ap. E *b* § 3 (2); Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6].

'There is in this body the element of earth, the element of water, the element of fire, the element of air.' . . .[1] So he lives as regards the body, contemplating it either in respect of himself or in respect of what is outside himself[2] or in respect both of himself and of what is outside himself. . . .

[7–10] *Cemeteries*. . . .[3] [So] he lives independent and grasps at nothing in the world. Thus, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu lives as regards the body, contemplating the body.

ii. *Sensations*

§ 3. [11] And how does the Bhikkhu live as regards the sensations,[4] contemplating the sensations? Here a Bhikkhu feeling a pleasant . . . a painful . . . an indifferent[5] . . .[6] sensation understands the . . . sensation felt by him. So he lives as regards the sensations, contemplating them either in respect of himself or in respect of what is outside himself. . . . He lives as regards the sensations contemplating that which has by nature an origin . . . contemplating that which is by nature perishable. . . . [So] he lives independent and grasps at nothing in the world. Thus, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu lives as regards the sensations, contemplating the sensations.

iii. *Mind*

§ 4. [12] And how does the Bhikkhu live as regards the mind (*citte*),[7] contemplating the mind? Here a Bhikkhu understands a desirous mind as a desirous mind and a mind without desire as a mind without desire . . .[8] a liberated mind as a liberated mind and an unliberated[9] (*a-vimuttaṃ*) mind as an unliberated mind. . . . He lives as regards the mind contemplating that which has by nature an origin . . . contemplating that which is by nature perishable. . . . Thus, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu lives as regards the mind, contemplating the mind.

iv. *Phenomena or objects of thought*

§ 5. [13] *Five Obstacles*. And how does the Bhikkhu live as regards phenomena[10] (*dhammesu*), contemplating phenomena? Here

[1] Omitting the simile of the butcher and cow. Int. § 190 (*food*); Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13].

[2] Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3] (*both worlds*).

[3] Omitting four sections on meditation in cemeteries (*sīvathikā*), where bodies were exposed. Int. § 190 (*burial*); Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2 (*susānaṃ*); Ap. B *a* § 2 (*katasi*).

[4] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [39]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; Ap. I *a* § 2 [5]. See § 1 [1] above.

[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28].

[6] Omitting 'fleshly and pleasant', 'unfleshly and pleasant', and other variations of sensation.

[7] See § 1 [1] above; Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29] (*ceto*). Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [41] (*viññāna*); Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3] (*mano*).

[8] Omitting mention of hatred and delusion (which with desire constitute the Three Fires; Ap. D *a* § 10) and other characteristics of the mind, as in Ap. I *b* § 3 [7 (x)].

[9] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[10] Or, objects of thought, classes of things, divisions, categories. See § 1 [1] above, § 13 (6) below; Ch. 4 § 10 [i. 3]; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]; Ch. 14 *d* § 3; Ap. E *c* i § 1 (279); Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; also Ch. 14 *c* § 14 [4] n.

a Bhikkhu lives as regards phenomena contemplating phenomena, in respect of the five obstacles (*nīvaraṇesu*).[1] . . . Here a Bhikkhu understands sensuous desire (*kāma-cchandaṃ*)[2] . . . ill-will (*vyāpādaṃ*)[3] . . . slothful-torpor (*thīna-niddhaṃ*)[4] . . . ill-conceit (*uddhacca-kukkuccaṃ*)[5] . . . doubt (*vicikicchaṃ*)[6] as existing in himself . . . as not existing in himself . . . and how [these] . . . not having arisen arise[7] . . . and having arisen are abandoned[8] . . . and having been abandoned do not rise in future. . . . [So] he lives independent. . . .

§ 6. [14] *Five Grasping Aggregations.* And further, mendicant brothers, the Bhikkhu lives as regards phenomena, contemplating phenomena, in respect of the five grasping aggregations[9] (*upādāna-kkhandhesu*). . . . Here a Bhikkhu [thinks]: 'Such is material-form,[10] such is the origin[11] of material-form, such is the disappearance[12] of material-form; such is sensation . . . perception . . . individual-character (*saṃkhārā*)[13] . . . consciousness.[14] . . .' He lives as regards phenomena, contemplating that which has by nature an origin . . . contemplating that which is by nature perishable. . . . [So] he lives independent. . . .

§ 7. [15] *Six Organs and Objects of Sense.* And further, mendicant brothers, the Bhikkhu lives as regards phenomena, contemplating phenomena, in respect of the six inner[15] and outer spheres.[16] . . . Here a Bhikkhu understands the eye and understands material-forms and understands the bond (*saṃyojanaṃ*[17]) which arises proceeding[18] from both, and understands how the bond not having arisen arises, and understands how the bond having arisen is abandoned,[19] and understands how the bond having been abandoned does not arise in the future . . . understands the ear and sounds . . . the nose and odours . . . the tongue and tastes . . . the body[20] and tangible things . . . the mind and things that are thought (*dhamme*) [21]. . . and understands how

[1] Ap. D *a* § 9 (iv) [30]; see Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (*five points*). The Obstacles are vices; Ap. F 2.
[2] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *4th Fetter*).
[3] Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2].
[4] Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6].
[5] Ap. D *a* § 9 (iv) [30].
[6] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii); Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [23].
[7] See §§ 8, 13 (6) below. This arising (*uppāda*) is caused by desire; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*origin*); also Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5, *an-uppāda*).
[8] See § 7 below. Literally, 'has abandonment'. This abandonment (*pahāna*) is the cessation of craving; Ch. 20 § 6 (5); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (20). Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*cāga*).
[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ap. E *a* ii; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.
[10] Ch. 5 *c* § 1; Ap. E *a* ii § 2 (*rūpa*).
[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 6.
[12] *Attha-gama*; Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [12] n; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1). Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] (*cessation*); § 10 below (*antaradhāna*).
[13] Composite unity or will. Ap. E *a* ii § 2. See § 2 [2] above.
[14] Or, intellect. Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7].
[15] *Ajjhattika*. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 7; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; and Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6].
[16] The word *āyatana* (extent, realm) is applied to inner spheres or organs of sense and outer spheres or objects of sense. Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 9 (i, *five*); and Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [3] (*appearances*).
[17] Ap. D *a* § 9 (ii).
[18] Pāli *paṭicca*; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [10]; also Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [4]. Cp. Ap. B *c*. *Note* (*perpetuated*).
[19] See § 5 above.
[20] *Kāya*; here the human body, not bodily or material form. See § 1 [1] above.
[21] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].

the bond [between them] having been abandoned does not arise in the future. . . . He lives as regards phenomena, contemplating that which has by nature an origin . . . contemplating that which is by nature perishable. . . .

§ 8. [16] *Seven Parts of Wisdom.* And further the Bhikkhu lives as regards phenomena, contemplating phenomena, in respect of the seven parts of wisdom (*bojjh-aṅgesu*).[1] . . . Here a Bhikkhu understands the part of wisdom[2] [called] reflection[3] . . . the part of wisdom[4] [called] learning in the Law . . . the part of wisdom [called] energy[5] . . . the part of wisdom [called] joy[6] . . . the part of wisdom [called] calm[7] . . . the part of wisdom [called] self-transcendence[8] . . . the part of wisdom [called] serenity,[9] as existing in himself . . . as not existing in himself . . . and how [they] not having arisen arise[10] . . . and having arisen have fullness of development (*bhāvanāya*)[11] . . . [So] he lives independent and grasps at nothing in the world. . . .

§ 9. [17] *Four Noble Truths.* And further, mendicant brothers, the Bhikkhu lives as regards phenomena, contemplating phenomena, in respect of the Four Noble Truths.[12] . . . Here a Bhikkhu understands thoroughly (*yathā-bhūtaṃ*) what is sorrow; understands thoroughly that which is the origin of sorrow; understands thoroughly that which is the cessation of sorrow; understands thoroughly that which is the path leading to the cessation of sorrow.

§ 10. [18] *Sorrow.* And what is the Noble Truth as to Sorrow? Earthly-existence . . . decay . . . disease . . . death . . . grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair[13] . . . the wish that one does not fulfil, [are] sorrowful—in brief, desirous transient individuality[14] is sorrowful.

And what is earthly-existence (*jāti*)?[15] The separate-existence (*jāti*) of such and such living-beings (*sattānam*),[16] in such and such a group of

[1] Or, Constituents of Enlightenment. Ch. 11 *c* § 28 n; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3] n; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note* and § 4; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; also Ch. 20 § 5 (*conditions*). Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 (*sevenfold treasure*).

[2] Here *sam-bojjhaṅga* is used.

[3] *Sati.* For references see Ch. 9 *a* (*Mahā-sati-paṭṭhāna*).

[4] *Dhamma-vicaya.* 'Investigation of doctrine', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 367; 'search the truth', SBB, iii, p. 336. Ch. 20 § 5 (2); cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 2 (*learning*).

[5] *Viriya*; courage or resolution. Ap. F 2 *a* (137); Ap. I *b* § 6 [22].

[6] *Pīti*; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [10]; Ch. 20 § 5 [4]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

[7] *Pa-ssaddhi*; Ch. 20 § 5 (5); and Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (viii). Cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (285, *santi*); Ap. F 2 *a* (142; *khanti*).

[8] *Samādhi.* 'Concentration', Warren. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[9] *Upekhā.* Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (285, *santi*).

[10] See § 5 above.

[11] Or, of exercise; literally of production; see § 13 (6) below; Ch. 3 § 4; Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [6]. Cp. Ap. E *c* ii.

[12] Ap. G 1 *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9. On the commentary here expanding the Truths see Ch. 5 *b* § 10 n; Ch. 15 *a* § 8 n. The text of [18]–[21] below is found in a different context in *Majjh.* 141 (*Sacca-vibhaṅga-S.*) but is omitted from *Majjh.* 10 (*Sati-paṭṭhāna-S.*); see Ch. 9 *a*, n.

[13] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. These five represent 'union with the unpleasing and separation from the pleasing' in the *Saṃ. Nik.* version (Ch. 5 *b* § 5).

[14] Literally, the five grasping aggregations. Ap. D *a* (*grasping*).

[15] Or, life. Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[16] Ch. 5 *a* § 6.

living-beings—production (*sañjāti*), entrance [into the womb], coming into being (*abhi-nibbatti*),[1] manifestation[2] (*pātu-bhāvo*) of the aggregations,[3] acquisition of the organs of sense (*ayatanānam*)[4]—this is called earthly-existence.

. . .[5] And what is death (*maranaṃ*)?[6] The departure (*cuti*) of such and such living-beings, from such and such a group of living-beings —parting, breaking up, disappearance,[7] dying (*maccu*), death, decease (*kāla-kiriya*), the breaking[8] up (*bhedo*) of the aggregations, the casting away of the corpse—this is called death.

And what is a wish which one does not fulfil and which is sorrowful? In beings subject by nature to earthly-existence (*jāti-dhammānam*)[9] . . . to decay, disease, death, grief . . . there arises a wish thus: 'Oh that we were not subject by nature to earthly-existence . . . and oh that earthly-existence, decay, disease, death, grief . . . did not come to us!' But this cannot be attained by wishing. . . .

§ 11. [19] *Origin of Sorrow.* And what is the Noble Truth as to the Origin of Sorrow? It is this recurring[10] (*pono-bhavikā*) craving, associated with enjoyment and desire,[11] seeking enjoyment everywhere—namely, sense-craving,[12] the craving for individual existence, the craving for super-existence.[13]

And where, mendicant brothers, does this craving arise; where does it enter in? That which is dear and delightful to men (*loke*),[14] there this craving arises; there it enters in. What is dear and delightful to men? The eye is dear and delightful to men; there this craving arises, there it enters in; the ear . . . nose . . . tongue . . . body . . . mind (*mano*).[15] . . .[16]

Reasoning[17] about . . . and investigation[18] of material-forms . . .

[1] 'Rebirth', Warren. Ap. E *c* i § 5 [12]. The explanation here seems physical and natural, and not in any way mystical.

[2] Ch. 4 § 10.

[3] Ap. E *a* ii.

[4] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].

[5] Each term is now defined, except disease, which may be an interpolation.

[6] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1). The realism of the definition here contrasts with the tone in § 13 [21] below.

[7] *Antara-dhāna*; cp. § 6 (*attha-gama*) above.

[8] Or, dissolution; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [81]. There is no suggestion here of any personal survival.

[9] Ch. 1 § 11. For the sentiments compare Marcus Aurelius, bk. ii. 17 (IN 10, *Stoicism*).

[10] This word receives no explanation in the exegesis and may therefore be an interpolation. See § 14 n below, IN 1; Int. § 24; Ch. 5 *b* § 6. From the metaphysical or Mahāyāna point of view (Ap. D *b*) desire (*tanhā*) is the cause of the persistence of individuality; from the ethical point of view it is the origin of individualism, selfishness, and evil.

[11] Or, passion.

[12] Or, pleasure. Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2]; Ap. I *a* § 1.

[13] The commentarial explanation does not mention these three terms, which therefore may be an interpolation, or may be regarded as part of the commentary; Ch. 5 *b* § 6. In Buddha's mouth the last phrase might mean (1) craving to be rid of the realities of life, and (2) craving for the joys of heaven.

[14] Or, in the world. Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].

[15] Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [10]; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7].

[16] Omitting repetitions; also the six objects of sense, sensations, perceptions, &c.

[17] Or, doubt; *vi-takka*. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3).

[18] *Vicāra*; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

sounds . . . odours . . . tastes . . . tangible things . . . things that are thought[1] are dear and delightful to men; there this craving arises, there it enters in. This is called the Noble Truth as to the Origin of Sorrow.

§ 12. [20] *Cessation of Sorrow.* And what is the Noble Truth as to the Cessation of Sorrow? It is the cessation of this very craving, so that no remnant or trace of it remains—its abandonment, its rejection, liberation from it, detachment from it.

And where, mendicant brothers, is this craving abandoned[2] (*pahīyati*); where does it cease? That which is dear and delightful to men, there this craving is abandoned; there it ceases. What is dear and delightful to men? The eye . . . ear . . . nose . . . tongue . . . body . . . mind. . . .

§ 13. [21] *The Path.*[3] And what is the Noble Truth as to the road leading to the Cessation of Sorrow? It is indeed that Noble Eightfold Path, namely right outlook, right will, right speech, right action, right self-discipline, right activity, right self-knowledge, right self-transcendence.

(1) And what is right outlook? Knowledge (*ñāṇaṃ*)[4] as to sorrow, as to the origin of sorrow, as to the cessation of sorrow, as to the road leading to the cessation of sorrow. . . .

(2) And what is right will? The will to [practise] renunciation,[5] no ill-will,[6] harmlessness.[7] . . .

(3) And what is right speech? Abstinence[8] from false-speaking, from malicious speech,[9] from harsh speech, from frivolous talk. . . .

(4) And what is right action? Abstinence[10] from destruction of life,[11] from taking what is not given, from lustful misbehaviour.[12] . . .

(5) And what is right self-discipline? Here, mendicant brothers, the disciple of the noble,[13] abandoning ill-discipline, gets his living (*jīvikaṃ*) by right-discipline[14] (*sammā-ājīvena*). . . .

(6) And what is right activity?[15] Here a Bhikkhu forms a purpose[16] (*chandaṃ*), endeavours (*vāyamati*), exerts will[17] (*viriyaṃ*), applies the

[1] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]. All these are liable to be inflamed by selfish desire, hostility to others, and delusion as to the relations of the self with its environment (Ap. D *a* § 10).

[2] Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (20). This does not imply a rigid asceticism. To the moderate use of convenient things Gotama raised no objection (Ch. 8 *k*).

[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ap. F 2 *d*. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 10 [35].

[4] Ch. 4 § 16. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 2.

[5] *Nekkhamma*; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].

[6] *A-vyāpāda*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).

[7] *A-hiṃsā*; Int. § 49. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vii) n.

[8] Ap. H 4 *a*.

[9] Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9].

[10] Ap. H 4 *a*.

[11] Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3].

[12] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*].

[13] Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].

[14] Or, routine. 'Right occupation', Warren. The unlawful occupations for a layman are defined in Ch. 8 *l* § 3; trade-discipline can scarcely apply to Bhikkhus, for whom the way of life is self-discipline. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[15] Or, endeavour.

[16] Ap. I *b* § 6 [22].

[17] Or, energy. Ap. I *b* § 6 [22].

mind (*cittaṃ*), makes effort, so that evil and unrighteous qualities[1] not having arisen[2] may not arise, [or] . . . having arisen may be abandoned [and] . . . that righteous qualities not having arisen may arise, [and] . . . having arisen may . . . have full development.[3] . . .

(7) And what is right self-knowledge?[4] Here a Bhikkhu lives as regards the body,[5] contemplating the body . . . as regards the sensations, contemplating the sensations . . . as regards the mind, contemplating the mind . . . as regards phenomena[6] (*dhammesu*), contemplating phenomena, strenuous, comprehending, mindful (*satimā*),[7] having put away in this world covetousness and lamentation. . . .

(8) And what is right self-transcendence?[8] Here a Bhikkhu detached from pleasures, detached from evil thoughts[9] (*dhammehi*), attains and dwells in the first contemplation[10] (*paṭhama-jjhānaṃ*), with reasoning, with investigation, arising from detachment, joyous and blissful; by the subsidence of reasoning and investigation attains and dwells in the second contemplation, an internal clarity, a concentration of mind, without reasoning, without investigation, arising from transport[11] (*samādhijaṃ*), joyous and blissful; by the fading away of joy dwells serene, self-scrutinizing and comprehending, and experiences[12] bliss in the body, and attains and dwells in the third contemplation—that [state] which the noble (*ariyā*) describe as 'serene, self-scrutinizing, dwelling in bliss'; and by the giving up of bliss, by the giving up of sorrow, by the disappearance of gladness and dejection previously [felt], attains and dwells in the fourth contemplation, without sorrow, without bliss, the purification of self-scrutiny in serenity.[13] This is called right self-transcendence.

This, mendicant brothers, is called the Noble Truth as to the road leading to the Cessation of Sorrow.

So he lives as regards phenomena, contemplating them either in respect of himself or in respect of what is outside himself, or in respect both of himself and of what is outside himself. . . . Thus a Bhikkhu lives as regards phenomena, contemplating phenomena. . . .[14]

[1] *Dhammā.* Ch. 13 § 14 [92]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. § 5 above; Ap. H 1 § 6 [9].

[2] See § 5 above (*arise*).

[3] See § 8 above. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (iv).

[4] Or, reflection on the self, its nature and environment.

[5] See § 1 [1] above.

[6] See § 1 [1] above.

[7] See § 1 [1] above; and Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [21]. Thus the whole Sutta (Ch. 9 *a*) is an authoritative analysis of the 7th section of the Noble Path (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]).

[8] Elimination of personal feelings; tranquillity. Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 (*path*) n.

[9] Or, qualities. Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92].

[10] Or, trance; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 10 *c* (17); Ch. 13 *c* § 6 [246]; Ap. I *a* (*Trance*). There is no mention here of any mystical stages succeeding these four comparatively simple reveries; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2] n.

[11] Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

[12] Ch. 4 § 5.

[13] Thus *upekhā*, the fourth *Brahma-vihāra*, is the goal of the Meditations; Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265] n.

[14] Manuscripts here differ; one precisely states that *satipaṭṭhānaṃ* (the *Satipaṭṭhāna* Discourse) is ended.

§ 14. [22] . . .'[1] Thus spoke the Blessed One; the mendicant brothers, rejoicing, welcomed the word[2] of the Blessed One.

b. The Duties of Laymen[3]

Dīghā-Nikāya, Sutta 31 (Siṅgāl-ovāda-S.)[4]

§ 1. Thus was it heard by me. [1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo-grove, at Kalandaka-nivāpa.[5] Now at that time Siṅgālaka,[6] the householder's son,[7] arising betimes, having gone out from Rājagaha, with freshly washed[8] garments and hair and with outstretched hands[9] (*pañjaliko*) paid reverence to the regions[10] severally east,[11] south,[12] west,[13] north,[14] the nadir[15] (*heṭṭhimaṃ*) and the zenith[16] (*uparimaṃ*). [2] Then before noon[17] the Blessed One, wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe and alms-bowl, went in to Rājagaha for alms. Then the Blessed One saw Siṅgālaka . . . and spoke to him thus: 'Why dost thou, householder, (*gahapati-putta*)[18] pay reverence to the several regions?' 'My father, revered sir (*bhante*), dying said to me: "Pay reverence,[19] sir (*tāta*),[20] to the regions;" and I here, revered sir, respecting,[21] observing, remembering, honouring the word of my father . . . pay reverence to the regions severally. . . .' 'Not thus, householder, under the rule[22] (*vinaye*) of the

[1] As in Ap. C *a* § 3, where to those who practise the four Meditations even for one week the reward of never returning is promised. This is perhaps equivalent to the promise of a heaven to good, though still imperfect, Buddhists. This passage, which appears to be a setting added by a later commentarial hand, and the doubtful word *ponobhavikā* above (§ 11), are the only phrases in the Sutta which can be constrained to imply support to the doctrine of personal Karma. Int. §§ 7, 92; IN 1 (*ponobhavikā*); IN 2; Ch. 4 § 16; Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*vi-bhava*). Cp. Ap. B *a* § 6 [8]; also Ap. B *b* § 1 (*reformed*). Contrast § 10 (*death*) above.

[2] For this editorial formula see Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].

[3] Ch. 8 *l*; Ap. F. The spiritual side of a layman's duties is defined in the *Dhammadinna-S.* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, p. 406; Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [2] n).

[4] Int. §§ 12, 22, 29, 30; also Ap. G 1 *c* §§ 3 n, 4 n. Cp. Ch. 18 *d* § 1 (*Rāhul-ovāda*); Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [3] (*exhortation*).

[5] Int. § 126.

[6] Variants of this name are Sigālaka, Siṅgāla, and Sigāla. Ch. 10 *c* [5] (60). Siṅgāla means jackal. Similar primitive names are Mendaka or Ram (Ch. 11 *f* § 1) and Nakula or Mongoose (Ch. 13 *b* § 4). Compare matriarchal names such as Sāri-putta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]).

[7] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7]; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21]. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [xiv] n.

[8] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5].

[9] i.e. with joined palms. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].

[10] Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 3; Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [3]; Ap. F 2 *a* (116); Ap. F 2 *b* [6]; and Int. § 70.

[11] Literally, the region in front. Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 4 § 4.

[12] The right.

[13] Behind.

[14] Literally, the outer region.

[15] Literally, lowest.

[16] Uppermost.

[17] Ch. 8 *k* [1].

[18] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7].

[19] Int. § 190 (*prayer*). These rites are prescribed and performed by the head of the family (Int. § 190, *family*), not by the priest or Brāhman (Int. § 190, *priesthood*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1). Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5] (*devatā*); Ch. 13 *c* § 17 n.

[20] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210]; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [19]; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 4 [3], 6 [2]; Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [5]; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [54].

[21] Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i); Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [3]; Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 22 *c* § 2 [13].

[22] Ch. 8 *e* (*Vinaye*). Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [163].

Noble[1] should the six regions be reverenced.' 'How then, revered sir, under the rule of the Noble should the six regions be reverenced?' . . .

§ 2. [3] 'When, householder, the four defilements of action (*kamma-kilesā*)[2] are abandoned by the disciple of the noble,[3] and in the four [main] points[4] (*thānehi*) he does no ill-act (*pāpa-kammaṃ*),[5] and he does not follow the six courses[6] destructive of wealth (*bhogānaṃ*), he having thus quitted [these] fourteen evils,[7] protects the six regions; he wins and acquires both worlds[8] . . .[9] he attains welfare (*su-gatiṃ*),[10] heaven[11] (*saggaṃ*), the [whole] world (*lokaṃ*).[12]

What four defilements[13] of action are abandoned by him? The destruction of life . . . taking what is not given . . . lustful misbehaviour . . . false speaking. . . .

[4–26] . . .[14]

§ 3. [27] And how does the disciple of the noble protect the six regions? These six regions must be regarded. Mother and father[15] must be regarded as the east; teachers (*ācariyā*)[16] must be regarded as the south; children and wife[17] must be regarded as the west; friends and kinsmen (*mitt'-āmaccā*)[18] must be regarded as the north; slaves[19] and labourers[20] (*dāsa-kammakarā*) must be regarded as the region beneath;[21] religious-devotees (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*)[22] must be regarded as the zenith.

§ 4. [28] In five respects[23] (*thānehi*) mother and father[24] must be

[1] Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99]; cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6]. The Pāli word here is in the singular, 'the Ariyan'; compare 'the Sakyan' (Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]). For titles applied to, if not used by, the Buddha, see Part I (title) n.

[2] For their definition see below.

[3] Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6].

[4] Or, states; Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [13]. Defined below in [5–6] as *chanda, dosa, moha* (Ap. D *a* § 10 (*Three Fires*), and *bhaya* (fear); Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1]).

[5] Ap. D (*Evil*).

[6] Defined below in [7–14]; including drinking, gambling, and haunting assembly-rooms and streets at unseemly hours. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (5).

[7] Ap. F 2. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 5 (*fifteen practices*).

[8] Internal and external; spiritual and practical. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [6]; and Ch. 7 *b* § 2.

[9] Omitting: 'For him both this world (*ayañ c'eva loko*) is secure and the world beyond (*paro ca loko*) on the dissolution of the body after death (*paraṃ maraṇā*).' These words may have been added exegetically; they are inconsistent with *lokaṃ*, in the singular, which follows immediately. IN 6 (*Canon*).

[10] Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4]; Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n. Cp. Ap. C *a* § 2 (126).

[11] Or, Nibbāna. See § 9 below; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.

[12] *Lokaṃ* is grammatically separate from, not compounded with, the preceding word; it can scarcely be rendered as 'the next world'. Ap. C *b* § 11 (80). Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 13 [4] n.

[13] Ch. 1 § 11. These coincide with the first four rules of abstinence; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (24) n.

[14] Omitting definitions of terms used in [3] above, partly in prose and partly in verse. It is doubtful whether the prose or the verse is the earlier (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*; see § 10 [34] n below). Omitting also a definition of true and false friends (*mittā*; cp. Ap. F 1 *b* (*Mettā*).

[15] Int. § 190 (*family*); Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.

[16] Ch. 8 *g*.

[17] Int. § 190 (*women*); Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [3], see §§ 4, 6, below.

[18] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5]; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1] n; Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149]. See § 7 below.

[19] Ch. 1 § 7 [57].

[20] Int. § 190 (*servants*).

[21] i.e. supporting the Earth.

[22] Ap. A 2 *d* [21].

[23] Or, points, Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [13].

[24] Int. § 190 (*family*).

treated as the East by the child, saying: "I having been supported will support them; I will perform their duties; I will maintain the family tradition (*kula-vaṃsaṃ*);[1] may I enter upon their inheritance (*dāya-jjaṃ*)[2]; and hereafter I will give offering (*dakkhiṇaṃ*)[3] to the departed after their life[4] (*petānaṃ kālakatānaṃ*)."

And the mother and father, treated in these five respects as the east by the child, show goodwill[5] to the child in five respects. They turn him from evil (*pāpā*);[6] they establish him in virtue (*kalyāṇe*);[7] they cause him to be taught the arts (*sippaṃ*);[8] they cause him to be united to a suitable wife (*dārena*);[9] in due time they assign to him the inheritance.

... Thus is the east protected, peaceful (*khemā*),[10] without fears.

§ 5. [29] In five respects, householder, teachers[11] must be treated as the south by the pupil (*ante-vāsinā*)[12]—by rising[13] (in their presence); by ministering[14] (*upaṭṭhānena*) to them; by willingness to hear; by attendance; by carefully learning the arts[15] (*sippa-paṭiggahanena*).

And the teachers ... show goodwill to the pupil in five respects. They make him well-trained; they make him rightly attentive; they instruct him in the learning of all the arts (*sabba-sippa-sutaṃ*);[16] they make him acquainted with friends and kinsmen;[17] they give protection in [all] regions.[18] ...

§ 6. [30] In five respects the wife (*bhariyā*)[19] must be treated as the west by the husband (*sāmikena*)—by respecting her; by not neglecting her; by faithfulness (*an-aticariyāya*); by allowing authority to her; by providing her with adornments.[20]

And the wife ... shows goodwill to the husband in five respects. She arranges well the [household] work; she manages well the servants;[21] she is faithful; she guards carefully the provisions; and she is dexterous and energetic in all her duties. ...

§ 7. [31] In five respects friends and kinsmen[22] must be treated as the north by a clansman[23] (*kula-puttena*)—by generosity (*dānena*);[24] by

[1] Ch. 7 *c* § 1.

[2] 'I will make myself worthy to be their heir', RDB, p. 144.

[3] Offerings other than spiritual were traditional and Hindu, not Buddhist. Ch. 7 *a* § 8 (*sacrifice*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 1. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24].

[4] Or, the manes of the dead. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*ancestor-worship*).

[5] The verb used is *anukampati*; Ch. 6 *b* § 1.

[6] Ap. D.

[7] See § 9 below; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6].

[8] Ch. 1 § 8.

[9] See § 3 above.

[10] Cp. Ch. 1 § 11.

[11] Or, spiritual directors. Ch. 8 *g*.

[12] Literally, one who lives with (his teacher); Ch. 8 *i*. Here plainly lay pupils are intended. Cp. Ap. H 4, *Note* (*layman*).

[13] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4].

[14] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1].

[15] Int. § 137; Ch. 1 § 8.

[16] *Suta*: Int. § 190 (*education*); Ch. 8 *l* § 2 (*sutaṃ*). Cp. § 9 below.

[17] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5].

[18] By teaching all the duties.

[19] See § 3 above; Ch. 6 *a* § 12; Ch. 11 § 2 [3]. The honourable and important position of women under the Buddhist scheme is here clearly shown. The duties specified imply only a very moderate degree of seclusion.

[20] *Alaṃkāra*; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [3].

[21] The Pāli word used is *parijāni*. Int. § 190.

[22] See § 3 above.

[23] Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]; see § 9 below.

[24] Ap. F 1 *a*.

kind speech; by acting to their profit[1] (*attha-cariyāya*); by comradeship;[2] by not breaking his word.

And the friends and kinsmen . . . show goodwill to the clansmen in five respects. They guard him when careless (*pamattaṃ*);[3] they guard his property when he is negligent; they are a refuge to him in fear; they do not abandon him in misfortunes; and they honour his descendants. . . .

§ 8. [32] In five respects the slaves[4] and labourers[5] must be treated as the region beneath by their superior (*ayirakena*)[6]—by arranging their work according to their strength; by providing their food and hire;[7] by ministering[8] to them in sickness; by the distribution of ample condiments[9] (*rasānaṃ*); by allowing [leisure] seasons.

And the slaves and labourers . . . show goodwill to their superior in five respects. They rise early; they lie down late; they are honest (*dinn-ādāyino*);[10] they are efficient workers; and bring him renown and fame.[11] . . .

§ 9. [33] In five respects religious devotees[12] must be treated as the zenith by the clansman[13]—by loving-kindness[14] (*mettena*) in deed, by loving-kindness in word, by loving-kindness in thought;[15] by hospitality;[16] by providing for their material wants.

And the religious devotees . . . show goodwill to the clansman in six respects. They turn him from evil;[17] they establish him in virtue;[18] with virtuous mind they show goodwill to him; they teach him new learning (*a-ssutaṃ*);[19] they make clear what he has learnt; they announce the way to heaven[20] (*saggassa maggaṃ*). . . . Thus is the zenith protected, peaceful, without fears.' So said the Blessed One.

§ 10. [34] . . .[21] [35] . . .[22]

[1] Or, genuinely; see § 10 below. For *attha* cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2].

[2] Or, impartiality.

[3] Cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (19).

[4] Ch. 4 § 1 [69]; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3].

[5] Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [3]; and Int. § 190 (*servants*); also Int. 185 (*sūdra*).

[6] The word is a derivative of *ariya*; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].

[7] *Vetana*, wages; here evidently of agricultural labourers. Int. § 189 (*land*). Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [4].

[8] Ch. 8 i § 2 [1].

[9] Int. § 190 (*food*). Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 9 [2] (*medicines*); Ch. 8 *k* [8].

[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (2).

[11] 'Receiving or deserving praise', Rh.D.'s *P. Dict.* *kitti-vaṇṇa-hara*. 'They speak well of him (or perhaps properly to him)', RDB, p. 147.

[12] Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ch. 14 *f* § 5 n; Ap. A 2 *d* [21]; also Int. § 185 (*Brāhman*). 'Mendicants and Brāhmans'. RDB.

[13] See § 7 above. 'The honourable man', RDB.

[14] Or, friendliness. Ap. F 1 *b*; and Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14].

[15] Ap. B *b*, *Note*.

[16] Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4].

[17] Ap. D.

[18] See § 4 above.

[19] Or, religion. Cp. § 5 above. Another reading is *su-ssutaṃ* (good-learning).

[20] Or, Nibbāna. See § 2 [3] above; Int. § 29. Cp. Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3] n. It is observable that in this final case alone there are six points; and it is possible that this last point is an addition made by the priesthood, grasping at the keys of heaven in a very natural and instinctive manner but quite contrary to the spirit of Gotama himself (Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (29); Ch. 10 *a* § 7 n).

[21] Omitting verses (see § 2 [4] n. above) which may either summarize or be the basis of the Sutta, and which include a poetic comparison of the kindly qualities of generosity (Ap. F 1 *a*), kind speech, genuineness (see § 7 above) and equal-minded-

[For note 22 see next page.]

c. Jains[1] and Tiṭṭhiyas;[2] Magic,[3] and Spiritual Pretensions

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 14 (Cūla-dukkha-kkhandha-S.)*[4]

. . .[5] [PTS, i, p. 92] At one time, Mahānāma, I was staying at Rājagaha on the Vulture-peak hill.[6] Then at that time many Nigaṇṭhas[7] were on the side of the Seers'-mountain at the Black-Rock,[8] standing erect, refraining from sitting,[9] and were experiencing acute, painful, sharp, and bitter sensations. Then I in the evening having arisen from quiet [contemplation][10] (*pati-sallānā*) drew near to . . . where the Nigaṇṭhas were . . . and said: 'Friends (*āvuso*), the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta, [called] all-knowing, all-seeing, teaches a complete[11] knowledge and insight (*ñāna-dassanaṃ*).[12] [p. 93] He says thus: "You, Nigaṇṭhas, have formed[13] evil Karma[14] (*kammaṃ*) previously (*pubbe*); you must exhaust (*nijjaretha*) this by present (*imāya*) doing of bitter difficult[15] tasks. According as here now you are restrained[16] in deed, restrained in word, restrained in thought,[17] so there will be non-formation (*a-karanaṃ*) of evil Karma in future. Thus by penance (*tapasā*)[18] there will be an end of old Karma (*kammānaṃ*); by the non-formation of new Karma in future there will be no new outflow (*an-ava-ssavo*);[19] by [there being] no new outflow in future there will be

ness, to the linch-pin of a racing chariot (Ap. E *c* ii § 6, 222). These qualities are the four *Saṅgaha-vatthūni* (Ch. 10 *c*, 64).

[22] Omitting the usual speech attributed to converts becoming lay disciples of the Buddha, as in Ch. 6 *a* § 7. It is noticeable that Gotama has merely announced to Siṅgāla a doctrine of good deeds or universal charity, and that this is felt by the narrator to be sufficient to secure the conversion of a well-disposed mind. Charity, love, unity, or selflessness, this, the same thing expressed in different words, is indeed the one theme of Gotama's conversion sermons for laymen (IN 2 *a*). The layman's duties correspond closely with the practical injunctions of the Eightfold Path (Ch. 9 *a* § 13; cp. Ap. F 1, *action*).

---

[1] Or, Nigaṇṭhas. Int. § 184.

[2] Sectaries; independent (non-Brahmanical or Eastern) schools of thought. Int. § 179 (*Six*); Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [2–7]; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 22 *b* § 15; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*teachers*); and Ch. 22 *b* § 8 [15]. Cp. Wanderers (Ch. 11 *c* § 9); also Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] (*nānā-tiṭṭhiya*). The name is derived from *tittha* the landing-stage or steps used in crossing a river; Ch. 20 § 11 [32]. Cp. also *Tirthankara* (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Tathāgatas*, n).

[3] Ap. A 2 *d* (*practices*); Ap. I *b*. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 17 n (*charm*).

[4] Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [29] n.

[5] The scene is the Nigrodha-grove at Kapilavatthu; Ch. 13 *c*. The Buddha, addressing Mahānāma (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]), traces sorrow back to desire (*lobha*, greed), hatred, and delusion (Ap. D *a* § 10), i.e. to selfish individuality. The matter which follows is repeated with variations in *Majjh. Nik.* 101 (*Devadaha-S.*); ThB. p. 267. See Ch. 11 *c* § 8; Ch. 13 *c* § 14.

[6] Ch. 11 *a*.

[7] Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

[8] Int. §§ 128, 130.

[9] Int. § 187 (*ascetics*).

[10] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (2); Ap. H 5 [94].

[11] *A-pari-sesa*; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7.

[12] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28]. Cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5] (*claim*).

[13] Made or done.

[14] Action; activity, fulfilling itself in suffering hereafter. Int. §§ 4, 7; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [3]; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 10 [68] n, 12 [20] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] n; Ap. B *b* § 3 [2].

[15] Hard to do (*du-kkara*). Ch. 3 § 7; Ap. F 2 *d* (transcendence) n.

[16] Ap. G 2 § 3 (1) [29].

[17] Ap. B *b*, *Note*.

[18] Ap. 13 *b* § 3 [8]. Cp. Ch. 8 *k*; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1] n.

[19] Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [214]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [5] (*residue*); Ap. B *b* § 1 (*re-formed*); and Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [9] (*supports*).

destruction of Karma; by the destruction of Karma there will be the destruction of pain (*dukkha-kkhayo*);[1] by the destruction of pain there will be destruction of sensation; by the destruction of sensation all pain [of every kind] will be exhausted. This satisfies us and befits us; by this we are uplifted." '

Having said this, Mahānāma, I spoke to the Nigaṇṭhas thus: 'What then, friends, do you Nigaṇṭhas know that you were indeed existent previously,[2] and were not non-existent?' 'Not so, friend.' 'Do you know that you indeed formed evil Karma (*kammaṃ*) previously, and did not not-form it?' 'Not so, friend.' 'Do you know that you formed such and such evil Karma?' 'Not so, friend.' 'Do you know that this much pain has been exhausted, or this much pain is to be exhausted, or on this much pain having been exhausted all pain will be exhausted?' 'Not so, friend.' 'Do you know of the abandonment of un-virtuous ideas (*dhammānaṃ*)[3] in this life (*diṭṭhe va dhamme*),[4] and the attainment of virtuous (*kusalānaṃ*)[5] ideas?' 'Not so, friend.' . . .[6] 'This being so [granting your theory], the cruel bloody beings, following fierce occupations, who are re-born in this world (*loke*) among men, retire [from the world] among the Nigaṇṭhas.' 'Friend Gotama, happiness (*sukhaṃ*) cannot be entered upon through happiness, happiness can be entered upon through pain (*dukkhena*).' [94] . . .[7]

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, V, viii.*

[1] Then at that time a piece of fine sandal-wood was obtained by the great merchant (*seṭṭhissa*)[8] of Rājagaha. . . . Then the great merchant of Rājagaha caused a begging-bowl (*pattaṃ*) to be carved out of that piece of sandal-wood, and having attached a string to it fastened it to the top of a bamboo, and having done so said thus: 'Whatsoever Samaṇa[9] or Brāhman is a saint (*arahā*)[10] and is indeed possessed of power (*iddhimā*)[11] let him carry off the bowl as a gift.' Then Puraṇa Kassapa[12] approached the great merchant and said: 'I, householder, am a saint, indeed possessed of power; give me the bowl.' He replied: 'If, revered sir (*bhante*)[13] the venerable one (*āyasmā*) is a saint and

[1] Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*nirodha*).

[2] The question plainly repudiates the whole doctrine of re-birth (Int. §§ 7, 11; The argument is repeated verbatim in *Majjh. Nik.* 101 (Ch. 13 *d* § 4 [214]). Ap. B *a*). Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1].

[3] 'Principles', ThB. p. 205. Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6].

[4] Ap. C *b* § 4.

[5] Ap. F 1 *c* (*good*). The speaker evidently felt that here in its insistence upon ethical teaching lay the radical distinction between the Buddhist doctrine and all other contemporary Indian creeds (Ap. G 1 *b*; Ap. G 2 *c*). Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1] n; Ap. E *b* § 2 [3] n. and Int. § 25 (*responsibility*).

[6] Omitting repetitions.

[7] Omitting a discussion whether the Māgadhan king Bimbisāra (Int. § 168) could be happier than the venerable Gotama, which the Buddha emphatically denies. Ap. E *b*, *Note*.

[8] Int. § 189; Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2]; Ch. 10 *a* § 1.

[9] Ap. A 2 *d* [21].

[10] Ap. D *c*.

[11] Ap. I *b* (*Magic*).

[12] Int. § 179.

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 10 [15].

indeed possessed of power, let him carry off the bowl as a gift [by his own power].' Then Makkhali Gosāla, Ajita Kesakambalin, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya Belaṭṭhiputta,[1] and the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta[2] approached the great merchant. . . .[3] [2] . . . Then the Blessed One in this connexion[4] and on this occasion having caused an assembly[5] of the mendicant brothers to meet . . .[6] instructed the Bhikkhus, saying: 'Marvels of power (*iddhi-pātihāriyaṃ*)[7] above human-nature (*uttari-manussa-dhammaṃ*)[8] must not be displayed to laymen (*gihīnaṃ*).[9] Whosoever displays such is guilty of a grave offence.[10] . . .'[11]

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Sutta-vibhaṅga, Mahā-vibhaṅga,*[12] *Pārājika IV,*[13] *i. (Vin. Piṭ., Oldenberg, iii, pp. 87–90.)*

[1] . . .[14] Many Bhikkhus who were intimates and fared together[15] were staying for the rainy season on the bank of the river Vaggumudā. At that time the Vajjian country (*Vajjī*)[16] was short of food,[17] ill-provided,[18] starved, bare of herbage,[19] not easy to live in by charity and favour. . . . Then those Bhikkhus spoke to the laymen (*gihīnaṃ*)[20] in praise of the extraordinary [power][21] of each other, saying: 'Such-and-such a Bhikkhu is master of the first trance;[22] such-and-such a Bhikkhu is master of the second trance . . . of the third trance . . . of the fourth trance; such-and-such is a stream-attainer[23] (*sotā-panno*) . . . a once-returner (*sakad-āgāmī*)[24] . . . never to return (*an-āgāmī*)[25] . . . a saint

[1] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
[2] Int. §§ 41, 85, 179.
[3] Omitting repetition; also a superfluous account of how the venerable Piṇḍola Bhāradvāja (Ch. 10 *c* [1] (8)) by *iddhi* rose in the air, carried off the bowl, and floated thrice round Rājagaha; Int. § 94 (iv). In the later Northern legends the merchant is named Jyotishka, the bowl becomes jewelled, and the carving becomes an inscription, and Pūrana Kassapa's failure becomes Mahā-Kassapa's successful performance. Int. § 89; IN 6 (*Canon*); Rockhill, *The Life of the Buddha* (1884), pp. 68–9; Carus, *The Gospel of Buddha* (1910), pp. 99, 237.
[4] Ch. 8 *a* [4].
[5] Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1].
[6] Omitting Buddha's questioning and reproof of Piṇḍola.
[7] Magic; literally, (any) power-marvel (sing.). Ap. I *b* § 4 [5].
[8] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5].
[9] Or, householders. See § 3 [1] below; Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [197] n. Cp. *gahapati* (Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21]).
[10] Ap. H 1 § 2.
[11] Omitting the prohibition of wooden bowls. Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
[12] The *Mahā-vibhaṅga* and the *Bhikkhunī-vibhaṅga* constitute the *Sutta-vibhaṅga*. They are codes of rules for monks and nuns respectively. Ap. H 1, *Note* (*rules*).
[13] Ch. 8 *b* § 6; Ch. 12 *a* § 2.
[14] The Buddha was at Vesāli, in the Great Forest, in the Gabled-roof Hall (Int. § 133).
[15] Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [29]; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [2].
[16] The capital of Vajjī (Ch. 12; cp. Int. § 123 n) was Vesāli. Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15] (*Vajji-gāma*); Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11].
[17] Int. § 189 (*famines*); Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1].
[18] Or, perhaps infested by robbers; see [3] below.
[19] Or, figuratively living on grass.
[20] See § 2 [2] above. These were evidently rural householders.
[21] Pāli *utari-manussa-dhamma*; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5].
[22] Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8). The four Attainments are not included in the list here; Ap. I *a* (*Trance*) n.
[23] Ap. B *a* § 6 [7].
[24] Ap. B *a* § 6 [7].
[25] Ap. B *a* § 6 [7].

(*arahā*)[1] . . . [a master] of the triple knowledge (*te-vijjo*)[2] . . . [a master] of the six higher knowledges (*cha-ḷ-abhiñño*).[3] Then the people said: 'It is indeed an advantage to us, a happy advantage[4] to us among whom such Bhikkhus are spending the rainy season.' . . . They did not eat such food themselves or give such food to their parents, to wife and children, to slave and labourer, to friends and kinsmen[5] and near relations (*ñāti-salohitānaṃ*),[6] as they gave to the Bhikkhus. . . . [2] Then the Bhikkhus, having passed the rainy season, at the end of three months folded up their bedding[7] and assumed outer-robe and bowl and went to Vesāli. . . .[8] Then the Bhikkhus related the matter[9] to the Blessed One. 'Bhikkhus,' he said, 'was [that which you said] true?' 'It was untrue[10] (*a-bhūtaṃ*), Bhagavat,'[11] they replied. The Buddha, the Blessed One, reproved them . . .[12] and instructed the Bhikkhus, saying: [3] 'These five great thieves are found existing in the world. What five? Here, Bhikkhus, [just as] some great robber[13] thinks: "Verily I, surrounded by a hundred or a thousand men, will roam through villages, towns, and royal cities (*gāma-nigama-rāja-dhānīsu*),[14] striking, slaying, destroying, causing destruction, torturing, causing torture"—even so some evil Bhikkhu thinks: "Verily I, surrounded by a hundred or a thousand will journey by stages[15] through villages, towns, and royal cities, respected,[16] esteemed, revered, honoured, exalted, receiving both of householders and of those who have left the world (*pabbajitānaṃ*)[17] the requisites[18] of robes, alms,

[1] Ap. D *c* (*Stages*).

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482] n. In the 'Threes' of the *Ang. Nik.* (PTS, i, p. 164) Gotama is represented as distinguishing between the three Brāhmanic Vedas (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]) and the triple knowledge under his teaching, namely knowledge of previous existences, knowledge of future existences and certainty of emancipation (cp. Ap. B *c* § 1). The three parts of the triple knowledge there correspond with the fourth, fifth, and sixth *abhiññā* (Ap. I *b* § 3), the same terms being used though with some expansion, whilst in the last part the knowledge of emancipation is expressed in terms used in *Majjh.* 36 (Ch. 4 § 17). These three are preceded in *Ang. Nik.* and in *Majjh.* 36 as here by the four Trances. The simplex knowledge (*ñāṇaṃ*) of emancipation in *Majjh.* 26 (Ch. 4 § 16) grows in time into the threefold *vijjā* of *Majjh.* 36 and thence into the sixfold *abhiññā* of the present passage and elsewhere (IN 6, *Canon*); and at the same time liberation from the passions and isolation of selfishness grows into emancipation from future re-birth.

[3] Ap. A 1 *b* (9); Ap. I, *Note.* These six are formed by prefixing to the three *vijjā* the power of *iddhi*, the power of hearing everything, and the power of knowing all thoughts.

[4] Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] (*fortune*).

[5] Ch. 9 *b* § 3.

[6] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5]; Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149].

[7] *Senāsana*; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 15 [4], 16 [7]; Ch. 15 *b* § 6 [3]; and Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2]. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* §§ 1 [1] (*mat*), 3 [1] (*rolls*).

[8] Omitting details and a statement that the Buddhas though they know what has happened ask questions (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Buddhas*); also details of greeting as in Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [2].

[9] Ch. 8 *b* § 1.

[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (4).

[11] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 4 § 9.

[12] Omitting mention of states of future punishment—*apāya, duggati, vinipāta, niraya* (Int. § 92; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]).

[13] See § 1 n above; Int. § 189.

[14] Ch. 15 *a* § 5; and Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [4]; also Ch. 3 § 5 [166]; Ch. 13 *c* § 28. Cp. Ch. 20 § 11 [26] (*nagara*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).

[15] Int. § 124.

[16] Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7].

[17] Int. § 187.

[18] The Pāli word is *parikkhāra*. Ch. 2 § 7; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]; and Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] (*nissaya*).

lodgings, and medicine for sickness." . . . This is the first great thief found existing in the world. And again some evil Bhikkhu having learnt the law and discipline made known by the Tathāgata,[1] assumes it as his own (*attano*). This is the second great thief. . . . And again some evil Bhikkhu leading as a pure holy liver [professedly] the purest holy-life (*brahma-cariyaṃ*) corrupts it with worthless evil-living. This is the third great thief. . . . And again some evil Bhikkhu obtains and cajoles[2] from the laymen all sorts of material property[3] and requisites for the Saṃgha, namely garden (*ārāma*)[4] and site, rest-house (*vihāro*) and site, bedstead,[5] chair, bolster pillow, metal cauldron, metal jar, metal pot, metal vessel, knife, hatchet, axe, hoe, chisel, rope, bamboo, rush (*muñjaṃ*), grass [for slippers], grass thatch (*tiṇaṃ*), clay-brick[6] (*mattikā*), articles of wood, articles of clay. This is the fourth great thief. . . .[7] In the [whole] Samaṇa-Brāhmaṇa creation[8] (*pajāya*) with spirits[9] and men, this is the chief great thief—he who falsely and baselessly claims [a power] above [ordinary] human-nature.[10] And for what reason? The country's alms (*raṭṭha-piṇḍo*)[11] are eaten up by fraud. . . .'[12]

(*See Appendix I containing texts supplementary to this chapter.*)

[1] Ch. 8 *d* § 8 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 2.
[2] Cp. Ch. 10 *c* [2] (15); Ch. 11 *c* § 13 n; Ap. B *a* § 6 [9] (*gifts*).
[3] Ch. 8 *j* (*property*), and Int. § 190 (*furniture*).
[4] Ch. 7 *a* § 10 [85].
[5] *Mañca.* Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [2].
[6] Or, tile. Int. § 190 (*architecture*).
[7] Omitting the stock phrase or tag: 'In the [whole of the] divine world (*sadevake loke*; Int. § 93, vi) with Māra (Int. § 93, iv) and with Brahmā (Int. § 93, ii). The large number of stock phrases in the present passage suggests the comparatively late date of much of the language of the setting of the *Pārājika* rules.
[8] i.e. in the sublunary world headed by its religious teachers—not, plainly, by monks and orthodox Brāhmans. Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
[9] i.e. spirits of the earth. Int. § 70; Ch. 6 *b* § 1.
[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5].
[11] Int. § 187; Ap. B *a* § 7 (308). Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [2] (*piṇḍa-pātika*).
[12] Omitting verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) attributed to the Buddha. The fourth *Pārājika* rule or precept follows, as in Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].

CHAPTER 10

RĀJAGAHA AND SĀVATTHI: THE TWO CENTRES; SAKYAN CONVERTS; THE CHIEF DISCIPLES; THE GREAT TOURS

a. ANĀTHAPIṆḌIKA'S GIFT[1]

Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (*Nidāna-kathā*); *JN*, 92 *ff.*[2]

§ 1. [JN, p. 92] At that time Anāthapiṇḍika the householder brought merchandise in five hundred carts[3] to Rājagaha[4] and went to the house of the great merchant[5] (*seṭṭhino*), his close friend, there. There he heard that a Buddha, a Blessed One, had arisen.[6] And early in the morning he went to the Teacher . . .[7] and heard the Law (*dhammaṃ*); and after being established in the reward of conversion (*sotapatti-phale*)[8] on the next day he gave a great gift to the Saṃgha headed by the Buddha, and received the Teacher's promise that he would come to Sāvatthi.

§ 2. Then he built along the road [from Rājagaha to Sāvatthi], forty-five leagues[9] in length, rest-houses (*vihāre*)[10] at the cost of 100,000 [pieces] each. Then he bought the Jeta Grove[11] by spreading out eighteen koṭis of gold [pieces][12] (*atthārasa-hiraññа-koṭīhi*) and had a new building[13] constructed there. In the middle he made a perfumed abode (*gandha-kutiṃ*)[14] for the tenfold [Sage][15] (*dasa-balassa*), and round it he built separately placed dwellings for eighty chief elders[16] (*mahā-therānaṃ*), and other lodgings such as long halls with single or

[1] Int. §§ 30, 138; Ch. 10 *c* [6] (62); Ch. 11 *c* § 4 n; Ch. 14 *b* § 1; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 1 [8], 16; Ch. 18 *a* § 1. The date cannot be determined, but the language of the texts implies that the gift was made in the earliest years of Buddha's ministry; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1] n.

[2] Continued from Ch. 7 *b* § 6.

[3] Ch. 4 § 8 n; and Int. § 189 (*caravans*). Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2]. Pāli *sakaṭa*.

[4] Ch. 11 *c*.

[5] See § 6 below; Int. § 189 (*Seṭṭhi*); Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2]; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1].

[6] Int. § 187.

[7] Omitting 'the gate being opened by a spirit-power (*devat-ānubhāvena*)'; Int. § 93 (vi). See § 6 [3] below.

[8] Ap. D *c* § 3.

[9] Int. § 124.

[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3). Cp. § 9 below; the precise cost is now added (Int. § 89).

[11] Ch. 14 *c* § 1 [9] n.

[12] Int. § 189 (*money*); see § 10 [9] below; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 9; Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [475]. A *koṭi* was 100,000 or any very large number.

[13] See § 11 below.

[14] Ap. H 5 [93]. A *kuti* was a separate building or pavilion.

[15] Ch. 7 *a* § 10; Ch. 10 *a* § 3. Literally, one endowed with the ten powers. The ten powers of a Tathāgatā are defined in the Tens of *Aṅg. Nik.* (v, p. 33; *Gradual Sayings*, v, p. 24) beginning with investigation and culminating in liberation. The ten 'powers' which liberated a Bhikkhu are set forth in Sutta 90 of the 'Tens' of *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, v, p. 174) where they consist of knowledge of the transience of composite-unity, recognition of lusts as a furnace, detachment of mind, and the seven items mentioned as factors of liberation in *Saṃ. Nik.*, PTS, iii, p. 153 (Ap. G 1 *b* § 5). See SBE, xiii, p. 142 n; KM, p. 62. Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4 (*balāni*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 (*ten qualities*); also Part I (title) n.

[16] Ch. 1 § 2.

double walls[1] and ducks[2] and quails, with sheds and so on. He made also 'pools,[3] and platforms[4] for walking to and fro during the day or night.' Having thus built a pleasant dwelling-place in a fair spot at the cost of eighteen koṭis, he sent word to the tenfold [Sage] asking him to come.

§ 3. The Teacher (*satthā*), hearing the words of the messenger, departed from Rājagaha attended by a great multitude of mendicant brothers and in due course reached the city of Sāvatthi. Then the great merchant (*mahā-seṭṭhi*) decorated the *vihāra* and on the day of the Leader's arrival at the Jeta-vana . . .[5] [JN, p. 93] he himself wearing freshly washed garments, with five hundred merchants also wearing freshly washed garments went out to meet the Blessed One. The Blessed One . . . entered the Jetavana. Then Anāthapiṇḍika asked: 'How, revered sir (*bhante*), must I proceed as to this *vihāra*?' He replied 'Present this *vihāra*, householder, to the mendicant community, present and future.'[6] And the great merchant said 'It is well (*sādhu*), revered sir', and having brought a golden pitcher and poured water[7] over the hand of the tenfold [Sage], dedicated the *vihāra* saying 'I present[8] this Jetavana *vihāra* to the mendicant community, present and future, from the four quarters[9] [of the world].' Then the Teacher accepted the *vihāra*, and thanking him, explained the advantages of monasteries. . . .[10]

§ 4. [JN, p. 94] Anāthapiṇḍika commenced the festival of the *vihāra* (*vihāra-mahaṃ*)[11] on the next day. The festival of Visākhā's[12] *vihāra* ended after four months; the festival of Anāthapiṇḍika's *vihāra* lasted for nine months. . . .[13] Anāthapiṇḍika the great merchant

[1] Probably daub and wattle walls. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17].

[2] Ducks and geese are favourite ornaments in Buddhist friezes. Int. § 190 (*architecture*).

[3] Cp. Ch. 8 *e* § 5 n.

[4] Pāli *caṃkamana*. Ch. 3 § 7.

[5] Omitting a description of the procession consisting of the merchant's son with 500 youths, his two daughters with 500 maidens, and his wife with 500 matrons. Int. § 190 (*women*).

[6] Ch. 14 *b* § 1.

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 10. See § 12 [2] n below. The pitcher, whether gold or otherwise, is shown in the sculptures on the railings of the Bharhut Tope (RDBI, fig. 23; Int. § 22).

[8] Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [18]; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]. 'This formula has been constantly found in rock inscriptions in India and Ceylon over the ancient cave-dwellings of Buddhist hermits', BBS, i, p. 131 n.

[9] Or, regions. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; see § 12 [1] below. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [7] (*districts*); and Ch. 14 *c* § 3 (*points*).

[10] Omitting five verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) evidently intended to encourage laymen to give food, drink, clothes, and Vihāras to the Order (Ap. B *a* § 6 [9], *gifts*; see § 12 [2] n below). The last verse is interesting: 'They show him the Law (*dhammaṃ*) which dispels all sorrows; and having here perceived this Law one enters Nibbāna (*pari-nibbāti*), being without taint (*an-āsavo*).' Ap. C *b* § 11 (89); cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 5 [5] (*passions*).

[11] Int. § 190 (*feasts*).

[12] Ch. 10 *c* (72); Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [478].

[13] Omitting a statement that the festival cost 18 koṭis and that the total expenditure was 54 koṭis. Omitting also an account of previous purchases of this spot for the purpose of building much larger monasteries during the lives of six previous Buddhas (Ap. A 2 *c*).

bought that spot by spreading coins over it and made upon it a garden for the mendicant-community (*saṃgh-ārāmaṃ*)[1] eight *karīsa*-measures[2] in extent. . . .[3] And so the Blessed One lived in that place from the attainment of omniscience under the Bo-tree till his death.[4]

§ 5. This is [the close of] the period of the presence [of the Buddha among men] (*santike-nidānaṃ*).[5] . . .[6]

The end of the *Nidāna-kathā* (Introductory Narrative).[7]

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga VI, iv[8]

§ 6. [1] At that time Anāthapiṇḍika the householder[9] was married to the sister of the great merchant (*seṭṭhissa*)[10] of Rājagaha. And Anāthapiṇḍika went to Rājagaha on some business.[11] . . .[12] [2] Then the great merchant [before addressing his kinsmen] gave orders to his slaves and workers[13] and then approached Anāthapiṇḍika, and having exchanged courtesies[14] (*paṭisammoditvā*) with him seated himself beside him (*ekamantaṃ*).[15] . . .[16] 'A great offering[17] (*mahā-yañño*) is being prepared by me'; he said, 'the Saṃgha headed by the Buddha is invited by me for to-morrow.' 'Dost thou, householder, say "The Buddha"?' 'I say "The Buddha", householder,' he replied.[18] . . . 'Rarely met in the world, householder, is this cry, that is "Lo, a Buddha, a Buddha!"[19] Is it possible for us now at this time to approach and see that Blessed One, the saint (*arahantaṃ*), the supremely enlightened?'[20] . . . 'To-morrow early, householder, thou shalt approach and see the Blessed One,' he replied. . . . [3] Then [at

[1] Ch. 7 *a* § 10 [85].
[2] 'Thirty acres in extent', BBS, i, p. 133. The *karīsa* is a square measure of land.
[3] Omitting 'For that spot is a place which not one of all the Buddhas has deserted'.
[4] Cp. Ch. 10 *d* § 1, where it is stated that he settled in Sāvatthi permanently only after twenty years of wandering. It is difficult to determine whether, and if so when and how far, the new centre at Sāvatthi eclipsed that at Rājagaha during these first twenty years; Ch. 11 *c*, n.
[5] Ch. 1 § 1 n. (*nidāna*).
[6] Omitting 'And now we will tell the stories of all his births', at which point the *Nidāna-kathā* closes and the *Jātaka* stories with their commentary begin.
[7] Int. § 1.
[8] See close of Ch. 8 *d*.
[9] See Ch. 11 *c* § 5 [1]; also Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7]; Ch. 14 *c* § 3 n; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].
[10] See § 1 above; Int. § 189. 'The guildmaster of Rājagaha', ThB, p. 104. For contemporary guilds see RDBI, pp. 90–7.
[11] Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [20].
[12] Omitting the Seṭṭhi's preparations for a meal to be given to the Saṃgha headed by the Buddha and the list of dishes prepared. Int. § 190 (*food*).
[13] Int. § 190 (*servants*).
[14] Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237].
[15] Ap. B *b* § 3 [4].
[16] Omitting Anāthapiṇḍika's question whether a wedding-feast (Int. § 190, *marriages*) was toward or a great sacrifice (Ch. 7 *a* § 8) or a banquet to the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra (Int. § 168).
[17] Literally, sacrifice.
[18] The question and answer are given three times.
[19] Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502]; also Part I (title) n, and Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]. This is not contemporary evidence of the expectation of an approaching incarnation, but it is characteristic of the Indian monistic attitude of mind; Int. § 187. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23] (*Tathāgatas*).
[20] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.

dawn] Anāthapiṇḍika the householder approached the Sītavana-gate[1] . . .[2] and went out from the town. . . .[3] [4] and approached the Sītavana. At that time the Blessed One having risen in the night as dawn[4] approached was walking to and fro (*caṅkamati*)[5] in the open air. . . .[6] Then seating himself the Blessed One addressed Anāthapiṇḍika the householder thus, 'Come Sudatta.'[7] Then Anāthapiṇḍika rejoicing . . .[8] said 'Have you,[9] revered sir, Blessed One, rested pleasantly (*sukhaṃ*)?'

'Ever blissfully (*sukhaṃ*)[10] rests the holy man (*Brāhmano*)[11] who has attained Nibbāna (*pari-nibbuto*),[12]
Who is not smeared by sensuous pleasures (*kāmesu*), calm, without the bases of egoism (*nir-ūpadhi*);[13]
All dependence[14] (*āsattiyo*) he breaks off; he puts away fear from the heart;
Tranquil he rests in bliss, reaching tranquillity (*santiṃ*)[15] of mind,' he said.[16]

§ 7. [5] Then to Anāthapiṇḍika the householder the Blessed One addressed the graduated discourse. . . .[17] Then Anāthapiṇḍika having

[1] i.e. the city gate (Int. § 136) leading to the Sītavana (Int. § 130; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 3, 5). See § 1 n above.
[2] Omitting a statement that non-human beings (*a-manussā*) opened the gate. Int. § 93 (iv); cp. Ch. 2 § 6 n.
[3] Omitting the thrice-recurring miraculous darkness (Int. § 94, i) and the words uttered by Sīvaka the Yakka (or lesser earth-spirit; Int. § 93, vii; cp. Ch. 3 § 1; Ap. D *c* § 4; and Ap. A 2 *d*, *animistic practices*). The outlines of the narrative are probably correct, while the details are fantasies or conventional repetitions (IN 6, Canon; Ap. B *b* § 3 [4] n). Anāthapiṇḍika's visit to the Buddha is recounted also in the *Yakkha-saṃyutta* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, pp. 210–2).
[4] Or, at dawn during the night [watch]. Ch. 11 *c* § 16; Ch. 11 *a* § 8 [3]. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1].
[5] Ap. H 5 [94].
[6] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [4] up to the dialogue.
[7] The name means Well-given. The meaning of the sobriquet A-nātha-piṇḍika is the Almsgiver of the un-protected.
[8] Omitting the merchant's obeisance.
[9] The honorific plural is used here and may date the narrative as comparatively late. Int. § 190 (*address*).
[10] Ch. 7 *b* § 2; Ap. E *b* § 2.
[11] Ch. 4 § 10 [3]; Ap. F 2 *c*. 'Brāhmano parinibbuto. To translate the first of these words by "Brāhman" would mislead English readers. It is constantly used in early Buddhist texts for Arahat', SBE, xx, p. 182 n.
[12] Ap. C *b* § 11 (89). Cp. Ch. 2 § 2.
[13] Ch. 7 *a* § 8.
[14] 'Bars', SBE. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*an-ālaya*); Ap. D *a* § 8.
[15] Ap. C *b* § 11 (202), (285).
[16] The verses are borrowed from a very early source; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*. They represent Nibbāna as attainable here in this world by an ethical and non-ritualistic (Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172], *for yourselves*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1, *rites*) liberation from individualistic desires, not (i) in the next world, nor (ii) through one of a succession of enlightened Teachers, nor (iii) through re-births, nor (iv) in relationship with any spirits, whether the lesser spirits of ancient animism or divinities resembling those of Hinduism, nor (v) in an unreal world of thought. Here the least complex is demonstrably the earliest phase of the new religion. Cp. Int. § 2; Ap. C *b*; also IN 5 (Rebirth) and IN 6 (*Canon*), IN 8.
[17] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 6. This narrative of the conversion of Anāthapiṇḍika, like that of the conversion of Yasa and his father, contains no mention of the doctrine of Karma or re-birth, though it mentions *sagga*, which may or may not be in the next world (IN 2 *a*; Ch. 9 *b* § 9).

seen and attained and understood and immersed himself in the Law . . .[1] said: 'Let the Blessed One receive me as a lay-disciple taking refuge from to-day whilst life lasts. May the Blessed One, revered sir, consent to take with me a meal[2] to-morrow, together with the mendicant community.' The Blessed One accepted by his silence and Anāthapiṇḍika . . .[3] departed thence.

§ 8. [6] . . .[4] [7] Then Anāthapiṇḍika when that night had elapsed caused choice food both hard and soft to be prepared in the dwelling of the great merchant of Rājagaha and caused the time to be announced to the Blessed One, saying 'It is time (*kālo*),[5] revered sir; the meal is ready.' . . .[6] And when the Blessed One, having eaten, had withdrawn his hand from the bowl, Anāthapiṇḍika the householder seated himself at one side . . . and spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Let the Blessed One, revered sir, consent to reside during the rainy season[7] with me at Sāvatthi together with the mendicant community.' 'The Successors (*Tathāgatā*),[8] householder, delight in solitude (*suññ-āgāre*),'[9] he said. 'I understand, Blessed One, I understand, Righteous One[10] (*su-gata*)', he replied. Then the Blessed One, having instructed . . .[11] Anāthapiṇḍika the householder, rose from his seat and departed.

§ 9. [8] At that time Anāthapiṇḍika had many friends and acquaintances and his word was acceptable. When he had got through what had to be done in Rājagaha he departed for Sāvatthi. On his journey he caused men to be assembled and said: 'Make gardens (*ārāme*), sirs (*ayyo*);[12] establish rest-houses;[13] institute [your own] donations. A Buddha has arisen in the world; and that Blessed One has been invited by me; he will come by this road.' And these men incited by Anāthapiṇḍika the householder made gardens, built rest-houses, and instituted donations.

§ 10. Then Anāthapiṇḍika having come to Sāvatthi surveyed every side[14] of Sāvatthi. . . .[15] [9] And he observed the park[16] of Jeta the prince[17] (*kumārassa*) . . .[18] and when he had seen it he approached

[1] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 7.
[2] See § 12 [1] below; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91]; Ch. 14 *f* § 10; Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [15]. Cp. Ap. H 5 [92].
[3] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 9.
[4] Omitting the offers of the Seṭṭhi of Rājagaha, and of a townsman of Rājagaha (*Rājagahako negamo*), and of Seniya Bimbisāra (Int. § 168) to provide the means for the meal, since Anāthapiṇḍika was a stranger.
[5] Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [4].
[6] As in Ch. 6 *a* §§ 11, 12; Ch. 7 *a* § 13; Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [13]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]; Ch. 20 § 11 [29]; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]; Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [15] with necessary changes.
[7] Ch. 8 *c*.
[8] Ap. A 2 *c*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [32].
[9] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [16]; Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2]. Thus Gotama gives his assent, but requests solitude in Sāvatthi.
[10] Well-doer; or Well-farer. Ap. B *c* § 5 [7] n; Ap. C *a* § 2 (126); Ap. E *b* § 2.
[11] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 12.
[12] Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1].
[13] See § 2 above.
[14] Ch. 21 § 6 [22].
[15] As in Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [16].
[16] *Uyyāna*. Ch. 1 § 9 (*garden-house*).
[17] For the title cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92] n. See Ch. 14 *c* § 1 [9].
[18] Omitting repetitions.

Prince Jeta . . . and said 'Grant me, noble sir (*ayya-putta*),[1] the park so that I may make it into an *ārāma* [for a religious purpose].' 'The garden, householder, can be granted only for[2] hundreds of thousands spread out[3] [over the ground].' 'The garden is taken, noble sir,' he said. 'The garden is not taken, householder,' he replied. They asked the high legal officers[4] whether it had been taken or not. The high legal officers said thus 'As thou, noble sir, madest the price,[5] the garden is taken.' Then Anāthapiṇḍika caused gold (*hiraññaṃ*)[6] to be brought in carts[7] (*sakaṭehi*) and covered the Jetavana with hundreds of thousands [of pieces] spread out. [10] The gold first unloaded by him was not sufficient to [include] a small space near the gateway (*koṭṭhakaṃ*).[8] . . . Then Prince Jeta spoke thus to Anāthapiṇḍika the householder: 'It is enough, householder; do not cover this space. Grant me this space; this shall be my donation.' Then Anāthapiṇḍika . . .[9] granted that space to Prince Jeta. And Prince Jeta caused a gateway to be built on that space.

§ 11. Then Anāthapiṇḍika caused dwelling-places[10] to be made in the Jetavana and appurtenances[11] (*pariveṇāni*), gateways[12] (*koṭṭhake*), halls for attendants[13] (*upaṭṭhāna-sālāyo*), furnace-halls,[14] rooms for allowable stores, privies, terraces for walking (*caṅkame*)[15] and covered places for walking,[16] wells and covered places for wells, hot [bath] rooms[17] and heated halls, lotus-pools[18] (*pokkharaṇiyo*) and pavilions.[19]

§ 12. *Culla-vagga, VI, ix.*

[1] Then the Blessed One journeying gradually[20] (*anupubbena*) came to Sāvatthi. There at Sāvatthi the Blessed One stayed in the Jetavana, the garden of Anāthapiṇḍika. . . .[21] Then Anāthapiṇḍika . . . said: 'May the Blessed One, revered sir, consent to take with me a meal

1 Int. § 190 (*address*); cp. Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1].
2 'It is not, sir, for sale, even for —', SBE, xx, p. 187.
3 See § 2 above. Cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [478].
4 Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3].
5 As regards the implied promise cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].
6 Int. § 189 (*money*).
7 Int. § 190 (*vehicles*).
8 See § 11 below. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [1]; and Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [161].
9 Omitting the merchant's thoughts on the distinction of the *kumāra* and the advantage of the adherence of such men to the faith.
10 See § 2 above; Int. § 190 (*architecture*); Ch. 8 *g* (*monastery*); Ch. 8 *j* (*property*).
11 Or, cells for monks.
12 'Store-rooms (over the gateways)', SBE, xx, p. 188. See § 10 [10] above. Cp. Int. § 139.
13 These may have been junior monks (Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1] *ministering*), or laymen (Ch. 10 *c*, 67). Cp. Int. § 190 (*servants*); also Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163]; Ch. 20 § 2 [6]; Ch. 21 § 13 [49].
14 *Aggi-sālāyo*; perhaps refectories. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [ii. 1]; also Ch. 16 *a* § 1 (*agyāgāra*).
15 Ap. H 5 [94].
16 The word is *caṅkamana-sālā*; a hall for walking to and fro.
17 The *jant-āghara* was apparently a sudatorium. Int. § 190 (*bathing*).
18 Ch. 8 *e* § 5 n.
19 *Maṇḍapa* means a temporarily covered place.
20 Or, by stages; Ch. 3 § 5 [166]. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].
21 Omitting greetings, as in Ap. B *b* § 3 [4].

tomorrow together with the mendicant community.' The Blessed One accepted by his silence. . . .[1] When the Blessed One having eaten had withdrawn his hand from the bowl Anāthapiṇḍika seated himself at one side . . . and spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'How, revered sir, must I proceed as to the Jetavana?' [He replied] 'Now mayst thou, householder, present the Jetavana to[2] the mendicant-community, present and future, from the four quarters[3] [of the world].' Saying 'Even so, revered sir,' in assent to the Blessed One, Anāthapiṇḍika the householder presented the Jetavana to the mendicant-community, present and future, from the four quarters. [2] . . .[4] Then the Blessed One . . .[5] having risen from his seat departed.

b. KAPILAVATTHU REVISITED:[6] THE DEATH OF SUDDHODANA; SAKYAN CONVERTS

§ 1. *Madhurattha-vilāsinī*[7] (*Commentary*[8] *on the Buddha-vaṃsa*),[9] *Introduction* (*PTS*, *Buddhavaṃsa*, *Preface*, *p. viii*).

. . . How [did he spend] the first rainy season (*vassaṃ*)?[10] . . . Having started the wheel of the Law (*dhamma-cakka-ppavattetvā*) at Isipatana . . . he spent it near Benāres[11] (*Bārāṇasiyaṃ upanissāya*) at Isipatana in the deer-park.[12] [He spent] the second near Rājagaha in the great Veḷuvana[13] Vihāra, and there also[14] the third and fourth rainy seasons; the fifth near Vesāli in the Mahā-vana,[15] in the Kutagāra Hall. . . .[16]

[1] As in §§ 7 and 8 above.
[2] Literally, establish it for; settle it on.
[3] Ch. 14 *b* § 1.
[4] Omitting Buddha's reply in verse, as in § 3 n above. These verses appear also in the story of the donation of the Seṭṭhi of Rājagaha; Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [3] n.
[5] There is no mention here of the pitcher or libation; cp. § 3 above.
[6] Int. § 135.
[7] Int. § 16; Ch. 10 *d*; Ch. 11 *d* § 3; Ch. 12 *a* § 1; Ch. 12 *b* § 1; Ch. 13 *b* § 1; Ch. 14 *b* § 2; Ch. 16 *d* § 1; Ch. 18 *a* § 1.
[8] Int. § 14.
[9] Ch. 10 *d* § 2; Ap. A 2 *a*.
[10] i.e. after the Enlightenment. Ch. 8 *c*.
[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.
[12] Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171]; Ch. 10 *d* § 2.
[13] Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [17].
[14] Ch. 10 *d* § 1 (17th *vassa*); § 2.
[15] Or, Great Forest. Ch. 12.
[16] According to the Burmese tradition (Int. § 89 n; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n) recorded in Bigandet's *Legend of Gaudama the Buddha of the Burmese* (1866), p. 197, the death of Suddhodana took place in the fifth year after the Enlightenment. 'In the *4th year* Gautama . . . crossing the Ganges into Wesāli, lives for a time in the Mahāvana grove. Whilst there he hears of a quarrel between the Sākyas and the Koliyans about the water in the boundary river Kohāna (Int. § 136; Ch. 13 *c* § 9, 529; Ch. 13 *d*, *Koliyans*) and, flying to Kapilavastu through the air (Int. § 94, iii), he reconciles the two clans, and then returns to Mahāvana, and prepares to spend the rainy season there. *5th year*: In the middle of *was*, however, he hears of the illness of Suddhodana, and again returns to Kapilavastu, and is present at the death of his father, then ninety-seven years old, at sunrise of Saturday, the full-moon day of the month of August in the year of the Eetzana era, 107. After comforting his relatives, and carrying out the cremation of the body with due ceremony, Gautama returns to the Kuṭāgāra Wihāra at Mahāvana. He is there followed by his father's widow, Prājāpatī, Yasodharā, and other Sākya and Kolyan ladies, who earnestly ask to be allowed to take the vows (Ch. 12 *b* § 2; Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [1]). He is very unwilling to admit them to the Order, but at last yields to the earnest advocacy of Ānanda', RDB, p. 70. For Ānanda's conversion see § 3 [4] below. For other dates see Ch. 21 § 7 [25] n.

§ 2. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā); JN, p. 90* [1]

[JN, p. 90] [At Kapilavatthu] the Rāja [Suddhodana][2] . . . when he was dying, seated on the state couch under the white canopy,[3] attained to saintship (*arahattaṃ pāpuṇi*).[4] There was for the Rāja no obligation[5] to practise effort[6] (*padhān-ānuyoga-kiccaṃ*) by dwelling in [the loneliness of] the forest (*arañña-vāsena*).[7]

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga VII, i.*

[1] At that time[8] the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Anupiyā (*Anupiyāyaṃ*); Anupiya[9] (*Anupiyaṃ*) being a town of the Mallas.[10] Now at that time many well-known[11] Sakyan[12] young men (*kumārā*)[13] went forth [from the world][14] following the Blessed One who had gone forth. And at that time there were two brothers Mahānāma[15] the Sakkan[16] and Anuruddha[17] the Sakkan. Anuruddha

[1] From Ch. 7 *b* § 2 n; see also Ch. 7 *b* § 5 n; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 n.

[2] Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]; Ap. A 2 *b* (66). The date of Gotama's last visit to his father is quite uncertain, but it may well have been during his return journey from a visit to Sāvatthi.

[3] Or, umbrella. It is by no means certain that Suddhodana retained the headship of the Sakyan oligarchy in his extreme old age (Int. § 165). The *Vin. Pit.* and *Sutta-Piṭ.* are silent as to the death of the Buddha's father; not so the later northern legendary lives (Int. § 89; SBE, xix).

[4] Ap. C *b*, *Note.*

[5] This concession may have been extended to the Emperor Asoka (Ap. G 1 *c*), though his ultimate retirement from the world is generally supposed.

[6] Ap. I *b* § 6 [22].

[7] Ch. 8 *k* [8].

[8] According to the Burmese tradition this must have been before the first admission of women to the Order in the 5th year of Buddha's ministry, since Ānanda, whose admission is about to be narrated (see [4] below), took a leading part in that event. See § 1 above.

[9] Int. § 148 (i); Ch. 13 *c* § 13 [3] n. Anupiya or Anupiya is the spot where Gotama is said to have spent the first week after his renunciation of the world; Ch. 2 § 7.

[10] Ch. 13 *a*. The Mallan territory may have corresponded partly with the modern Bettia, a small Rāj in the Champāran district of North Bihar, adjoining Nepāl; cp. V. A. Smith, *Asoka* (2nd ed.), p. 147.

[11] Ch. 7 *c* § 1.

[12] Int. §§ 30, 164.

[13] Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92].

[14] Ch. 2 § 3.

[15] Ch. 9 *c* § 1 n; Ch. 10 *c* (65); Ch. 13 *c* §§ 8 [1] n, 14 [91], 21 [2] n, 23 [354] n. For references to commentarial accounts of the conversion of the Sakyan princes see ThB, p. 102 n. Mahānāma the Sakkan is to be distinguished from Māhānama, one of the first five converts (Ch. 5 *b* § 2); he was apparently one of the Sakyan rulers in the time of the Kosalan king Vidudabha (Int. § 169, iii). The families of these Sakyan Kumāras were closely connected. Tradition and commentaries add numerous inconsistent details on which the Canon is silent (cp. RDB, p. 52; ThB, pp. 102–3 n). They hold that Mahānāma and Anuruddha were the sons of Gotama's paternal uncle Amitodana (*Psalms of the Brethren*, pp. 325–49).

[16] Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1].

[17] Ch. 10 *c* [1] (5); Ch. 12 *e* § 10; Ch. 13 *b* § 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 12 [1], 14, 15; Ch. 14 *e* § 7; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 5 [1], 10 [155]; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 26, 27; Ch. 22 *c* § 1; Ap. A 1 *b* (4); Ap. F 1 *b* § 1 [3]. In *Majjh.* 68 Buddha questions Anuruddha, Kimbila, Bhagu, Ānanda, and three others regarding the motives which led them to the holy life.

was delicate (*su-khumālo*); he had three mansions, one for winter, one for summer, and one for the rainy season.[1] . . .[2] And Mahānāma the Sakkan . . . said to Anuruddha: 'Now, dear (*tāta*)[3] Anuruddha, many well-known Sakyan young men have gone forth [from the world] following the Blessed One who has gone forth; but from our family (*kulā*)[4] no one has gone forth from the household to the homeless life.[5] Therefore either do thou go forth or I will.' 'I am delicate,' he replied; 'I am unable to go forth from the household to the homeless life; do thou go forth.' [2] 'Come, dear Anuruddha, I will instruct thee as to the life [of the head] of a homestead. First he must have the land[6] (*khettaṃ*) ploughed; when he has had it ploughed he must have it sown . . . then irrigated . . . drained . . . weeded . . . reaped; having had the crop reaped he must have it moved . . . piled . . . trodden out . . . then he must have the straw separated . . . then have the husk separated . . . then have the grain winnowed . . . and stored. Again when the grain has been stored he must do just the same in future every year. . . .' 'Then do thou,' he replied, 'take thought for [the headship of] the homestead; I will go forth from the household to the homeless life.' 'Then Anuruddha went to his mother . . . and said: 'I wish, mother (*amma*), to go forth from the household to the homeless life; do thou sanction[7] (*anujānāhi*) my going forth.' . . .[8] [3] Now at that time Bhaddiya[9] the Sakyan Rāja (*Sakya-rājā*)[10] was ruling over the Sakyans (*Sakyānaṃ rajjaṃ kāreti*); he was a friend of Anuruddha the Sakkaṇ. And the mother of Anuruddha thinking 'Bhaddiya the Sakyan Rāja is ruling over the Sakyans and is a friend of Anuruddha; he cannot go forth from the household to the homeless life', said to Anuruddha: 'If, dear Anuruddha, Bhaddiya, the Sakyan Rāja goes forth . . . go thou forth also.' Then Anuruddha the Sakkan went to Bhaddiya the Sakyan Rāja . . . and said: 'My going forth [from the world] depends on thee, my friend (*samma*).'[11] 'If thy going forth,' he replied, 'depends, my friend, on me, let it be [as though] independent; I am with thee. At thy pleasure go thou forth.' 'Come then, my friend,' said he, 'we both will go forth from the household to the homeless life.' 'I cannot, my friend, go forth . . . to the homeless life; whatsoever else it is possible for me to do for thee, that will I do. Go

[1] Int. § 136 n; Ch. 1 § 8.
[2] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]; and repetition.
[3] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].
[4] Int. § 190 (*family*); Ap. F 2 *a* (134).
[5] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].
[6] Int. § 189.
[7] Int. § 190 (*women*); cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4].
[8] He asks three times (Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [3]) and his mother twice refuses because of her affection for both her sons.
[9] Ch. 10 *c* [1] (6). Bhaddiya the Rāja must be distinguished from the third convert to Buddhism (Ch. 5 *b* § 2). He either succeeded Suddhodana or shared the rulership with him and others (ThB, p. 104). His resignation was easily arranged within the family (Int. § 165).
[10] Ch. 1 § 5.
[11] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8]; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91]; Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [118]; Ch. 14 *f* § 10 [4].

thou forth.' 'My friend,' he said, 'my mother says thus: "If, dear Anuruddha, Bhaddiya the Sakyan Rāja goes forth . . . so also do thou go forth." Now thou hast declared ". . . I am with thee. . . ." Come then, my friend, we both will go forth.' . . .[1] Then Bhaddiya the Sakyan Rāja said to Anuruddha: 'Wait, my friend, for seven years,[2] at the end of seven years we both will go forth . . . to the homeless life.' 'Seven years, my friend, is too long a time. . . .' 'Wait for six years,' he said, '. . . five . . . four . . . three . . . two years . . . one year . . . seven months . . . six . . . five . . . four . . . three . . . two months . . . one month . . . half a month. . . . Wait, my friend, for seven days whilst I cause my office (*rajjaṃ*)[3] to be given over to the sons and brothers [of the family].' 'Seven days, my friend, is not too long a time. I will wait.'

[4] Then Bhaddiya the Sakyan Rāja and Anuruddha, and Ānanda,[4] and Bhagu,[5] and Kimbila,[6] and Devadatta,[7] with Upāli[8] [their] barber[9] as the seventh, just as on previous occasions they had gone out with a fourfold retinue[10] (*senāya*) to a pleasure-park (*uyyāna-bhumiṃ*),[11] so now they went out with fourfold retinue. Having gone to a distance they turned back their retinue; then they entered another district and discarding their adornments[12] and making up a bundle in an upper robe (*uttar-āsaṇge*)[13] they said to Upāli the barber: 'Now, good

[1] Omitting a passage which implies that the Rāja felt bound by the letter of his promise. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [9].

[2] This may indicate the customary termination of the period of rulership. Int. § 164.

[3] The office was apparently that of president of a council, consisting of members of the dominant family or families of the clan.

[4] See [1] n above; and § 1 n above; Int. § 30; Ch. 10 *c* (32); Ch. 11 *c* § 16; Ch. 11 *d* § 1; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 3 [237], 6 [1], 12 [21]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 6 [4], 10 n; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 13 [3] n, 19 [110], 23 [354], 25 [244], 29 [2]; Ch. 13 *d* § 9; Ch. 14 *f* § 2; Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [6]; Ch. 15 *b* § 2; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 2 [265], 3 [1], 4 [3] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [4]; Ch. 18 *a* §§ 1 n, 2 [258]; Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [160]; Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [2]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [4]; Ch. 19 *b* § 8; Ch. 20 § 2; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 7–8; Ch. 23 *b* § 7 [6] n; Ap. A 1 *b* (8). The commentary on the *Theragāthā* (cclvi, cclx) states that he was the son of Amitodana, who was the father of Mahānāma and Anuruddha and paternal uncle of Gotama. According to the Sanskrit *Mahavastu*, ii. 157, he was the son of Mrigī, i.e. Kisa Gotami (Ch. 2 § 2; ThB, p. 54 n). Tradition places his conversion in the fifth or in the first year of Gotama's ministry (Rh.D's article *Devadatta* in ERE; ThB, p. 123 n). He became Gotama's personal attendant in the 20th year (Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*). After Buddha's death the Sakyan party apparently put forward Ānanda's claim to the leadership: Ch. 11 *d* § 7 n; see also Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12]; Ch. 18 *f* § 1; Ch. 23 *a*; Ch. 23 *b* § 4.

[5] Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155].

[6] Ch. 12 *e* § 10; Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2].

[7] IN 7; Ch. 19 *b* §§ 2, 4 n.

[8] Ch. 10 *c* [4] (41); Ap. A 1 *b* (3).

[9] *Kappaka*; literally, one who arranges. Int. § 190 (*hair*). Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 10 [4]; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [1].

[10] i.e. elephants, chariots, cavalry, and footmen. These formed the divisions of the regular army (Int. § 175). Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [9]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [3]; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [12].

[11] Or, hunting ground. Ch. 1 § 9.

[12] *Ābharaṇa*. Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [162]; and Int. § 190 (*dress*). Cp. Ch. 2 § 7 n; Ch. 12 *e* § 11 [3].

[13] Ch. 8 *j* § 3 [2].

(*bhaṇe*)[1] Upāli, turn thou back. This will suffice for thee to live upon.' Then as Upāli turned back this thought came to him: 'The Sākiyans[2] (*Sākiyā*) are violent. Thinking "The young men have been brought to harm by this man" they may have me slain. And since these Sakyan young men go forth . . . to the homeless life, why should not I still more?' Having discarded the bundle . . . he approached the young men. . . .[3] 'Thou didst well, good Upāli,' they said. . . . Then taking Upāli the barber they drew near to where the Blessed One was [at Anupiyā] . . . and said: 'Revered sir, we Sākiyans being proud[4] and Upāli the barber here having long been our servant, may the Blessed One grant the *pabbajā*[5] ordination (*pabbājetu*) to him first. We [as juniors][6] will proffer him greetings,[7] [and the courtesies of] rising in his presence, raising the joined palms, and homage (*sāmīci-kammaṃ*); thus the Sākiyan pride of us Sākiyans will be abated.' Then the Blessed One conferred the *pabbajā* ordination on Upāli the barber first, and on the Sakyan young men afterwards. The venerable Bhaddiya within that rainy season realized the three knowledges (*tisso vijjā*);[8] the venerable Anuruddha acquired divine vision (*dibba-cakkhuṃ*);[9] the venerable Ānanda realized the reward of stream-attaining (*sotapatti-phalaṃ*),[10] and Devadatta developed power of the lower sort (*pothu-jjanikuṃ iddhiṃ*).[11]

(*The direct narrative found scattered in the* Vin. Piṭ. *is resumed in Ch. 12 d, Ch. 16 b, Ch. 18 b, and Ch. 19 a.*)

[1] Literally, say. Ch. 17 *e* [6]; Cp. Ch. 3 § 1; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18].
[2] Int. § 164.
[3] Omitting his explanation.
[4] Int. § 159 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [12].
[5] Literally, leaving the world. Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [1].
[6] Cp. Ch. 8 *i* (*Juniors*).
[7] Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1].
[8] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]. Cp. Rhys Davids's remarks, SBE, xi, pp. 161–2, on *Tevijja*, 'meaning one possessed of the knowledge of a fundamental threefold doctrine of Buddhism, the doctrine of impermanency, the inherent pain and the absence of any abiding principle (any Self) in the confections or component things' which interpretation though true in substance is perhaps not quite exact (Ap. E, *Three Characteristics*). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* §§ 16 (*arahatship*), 24 (*knowledge*).
[9] Ch. 4 § 4; Ap. I *b* § 3 (*divine eye*). This mystical power of seeing future births is elaborately set forth in *Majjh.* 6 (SBE, xi, pp. 216–18). Cp. Ch. 14 *e* § 7 [1] n.
[10] i.e. of conversion. Ch. 7 *a* § 8; Ch. 7 *b* § 2; Ap. D *c* § 3 [6]. Simple sincere conversion was developed in scholastic hands (IN 6, *Canon*) into the destruction of the three lowest Bonds or Fetters (Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; Ap. D *a* § 8), i.e. the delusion of Self, scepticism, and reliance on customary formalities or rites. All ten Bonds are developments of the Three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10), which in turn arise from an analysis of Craving (Ap. D *a*, *Taṇhā*).
[11] Ap. I *b* § 5 (*not-noble*). This magical power is described in *Majjh.* 6 (SBE, xi, pp. 214–15) as in *Dīgha* 34 (Ap. I *b* § 3). *Potthu-jjanika* means ordinary, lay, i.e. non-religious; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]. For Devadatta's powers see Ch. 19 *b* § 2 n.

c. The Principal Disciples[1] Classified

Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṇguttara-Nikāya, Eka-nipāta (Units),[2] *Vagga xiv (Etad-agga-vagga)*

'[1]. This, mendicant brothers, was the foremost[3] of my disciples (*sāvakānaṃ*), (i) who became Bhikkhus (*bhikkhūnaṃ*)— .

(1) of long standing (*rattaññūnaṃ*)[4]—Añña-Koṇḍañña;[5]
(2) having great insight (*mahā-paññānaṃ*)[6]—Sāriputta;[7]
(3) having [spiritual] power (*iddhi-mantānaṃ*)[8]—Mahā-Moggallāna;[9]
(4) practising the Dhutanga-precepts[10] (*dhuta-vādānaṃ*)—Mahā-Kassapa;[11]

[1] Int. § 30 n; Ch. 1 § 2 [49]. The classes of Bhikkhus specified amount to 47; the individual Bhikkhus number 40. The classification bears more marks of monkish and hagiological analysis than of the clear mind of the leader and founder. A list of 11 or 12 foremost disciples appears repeatedly in *Vin. Piṭ.* and elsewhere (Ch. 16 *c* § 2 n; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [78–9]). Other disciples are mentioned in Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 6, 7, 19, 29; Ch. 12 *a* § 9 [1] n; Ch. 13 *d* § 5 n; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 2, 9 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502]; Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [1]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [10]; Ch. 18 *c*; Ch. 22 *a* § 8 [39]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 3 [4], 20; see Int. § 30 (*convert*). Notable lay followers are named in Ch. 11 *d* § 10; Ch. 11 *e* § 1; Ch. 12 *e* § 13; Ch. 14 *a* § 7; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5] n; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 14 *d* § 4 n; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 3 [11], 13 [157]; Ch. 15 *b* § 14; Ch. 19 *c* §§ 1 [396] n, 2 [99]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26]; Ap. E *a* ii §4 (6). In the Twos and Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* (i, p. 88; ii, p. 164) four pairs of chief followers are enumerated, namely Sāriputta and Moggallāna, Khemā and Uppalavaṇṇā, Citta the householder and Hatthaka of Ālavi, and the lay-women Khujjuttarā and Nanda's mother Veḷukantakiyā. The *Thera-therī-gāthā* and *Apadāna* are in effect brief Lives of the Saints, and the same may be said partially of the *Udāna*, the third book of the fifth Nikāya (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Khudda-Nikaya*). The list of disciples in Ap. B *a* § 6 [6] may be conventional.

[2] Singles or Wholes. The chief subject of this first division of *Aṅg. Nik.* (Ch. 1 § 10; Ap. A 1 *a*, n) is the individual mind (*citta*) in various aspects; in the present extract the unit is to be found in each of the individual members of the early Saṃgha. The Discourses are to be attributed to the Buddha.

[3] *Agga*; chief or first.

[4] See (48) below.

[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [31]. The Canonical anthology of early sacred songs called the *Theragāthā* assigns a collection of verses, Song cclxiv, to Koṇḍañña, and he is mentioned in Song cclxiv.

[6] Ap. F 2 *a* (132). See (49) below; and Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [3].

[7] Ch. 7 *a* §§ 18 [1], 23; Ch. 11 *d* § 4 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 8; Ch. 15 *b* § 5 [1]; Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [2]; Ap. H 4 *b* § 2; Ap. I *b* § 3 n. The *Theragāthā* anthology assigns Song cclix to Sāriputta. The commentary on the same states that he was born in the Magadhan township of the Upatissas and was the son of Rūpasārī the Brāhmanī; see Mrs. Rhys Davids's *Psalms of the Brethren*, PTS, 1913.

[8] Ap. I *b* § 5 (*noble*). See (50) below.

[9] Ch. 7 *a* §§ 16, 18 [1], 23; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 8. *Theragāthā*, cclxiii; the commentary states that he was born in the Magadhan township of the Kolitas and was the son of Moggalī the Brāhmanī. '*Mahā-*' distinguishes the older among two or more persons of the same name; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [78] n.

[10] Or, austerities; literally, scruples. Ap. A 1 *b* (3).

[11] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 28; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 7; Ap. A 1 *b* (3). See (37) below. The *Theragāthā* anthology attributes Song cclxi to Mahā-Kassapa, whom the commentary states to have been Pippali-mānava (cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 11 n), a Magadhan Brāhman of Mahātittha, born after Gotama's enlightenment; it assigns Song ccx to Uruvela-Kassapa. The 16th Saṃyutta of *Saṃ. Nik.* is named after Kassapa, who is termed therein the Great Kassapa. The 'naked ascetic' (*acela*), Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [i. 15], who is convinced and utters his 'lion cry' of faith in *Dīgha Nik.*,

(5) having divine vision (*dibba-cakkhukānaṃ*)[1]—Anuruddha;[2]
(6) of high family (*uccā-kulikānam*)[3]—Bhaddiya,[4] son of Kāligodhā;[5]
(7) with sweet voice[6] (*manju-ssarānaṃ*)—Lakuṇṭaka-Bhaddiya;[7]
(8) with lion-roar[8] (*sīha-nādikānam*)—Piṇḍola-Bhāradvāja;[9]
(9) discoursing on the Law (*dhamma-kathikānaṃ*)[10]—Puṇṇa[11] the son of Mantānī;
(10) analysing the meaning[12] (*atthaṃ vibhajantānaṃ*) of a concise speech in detail—Mahā-Kaccāna;[13]

[2] This was the foremost of my disciples, who became Bhikkhus—
(11) making mental images[14] (*mano-mayaṃ kayaṃ*)—Culla-Panthaka;[15]
(12) strong and skilled in mind[16]—Culla-Panthaka;
(13) strong and skilled in perception[17]—Mahā-Panthaka;[18]
(14) living remote[19]—Subhūti;[20]
(15) worthy of donations[21] (*dakkhineyyānaṃ*)—Subhūti;
(16) dwelling in forests (*araññikānaṃ*)[22]—Revata Khadiravaniya;[23]
(17) practising meditation (*jhāyīnaṃ*)[24]—Kaṇkhā-Revata;[25]

Sutta 8 (*Kassapa-sīhanāda-S.*), appears to be a different person; he is mentioned also in *Saṃ. Nik.* (ii, pp. 19–22; iv, pp. 300–2). Members of the Brāhman clan were known also in Kosala; Ch. 14 *f* § 8.

[1] Ch. 4 § 4. See (55) below.

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n. *Theragāthā*, cclvi; the commentary thereon states that he was the son of Amitodana the Sakiyan, who was a brother of Suddhodana.

[3] Ap. F 2 *a* (134).

[4] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 13 [3], 14 [91] n. *Theragāthā*, ccliv.

[5] Kāligodhā Sākiyānī. *Saṃ. Nik.*, PTS, v, p. 396; cp. *Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 371 (*Godhā*).

[6] Or, eloquence.

[7] *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 279. Possibly the third convert; Ch. 5 *b* § 2. *Theragāthā*, ccxxv.

[8] Or, exultant declaration of faith. Ch. 11 *c* § 11 [7] n; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [55].

[9] Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [1]. *Theragāthā*, cxxii. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2].

[10] Cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4]. See (52) and (63) below.

[11] *Majjh. Nik.*, Suttas 24 (Ch. 14 *e* § 3) and 145; *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 155, iii, p. 105, (Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [3]), iv, p. 60. *Theragāthā*, iv.

[12] Or, matter. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]; and Ch. 15 *a* § 8 (*expansion*).

[13] Int. § 156; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 n; Ch. 17 *b* § 2; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [1]; Ap. A 1 *b* (5). *Theragāthā*, ccxxix; *Apadāna*, No. 528.

[14] Or, constructing bodies made by mind. If the phrase implies magic, this faculty comes under the head of 'ignoble *iddhi*' condemned by Gotama (Ap. I *b* § 5). Cp. E *c* ii § 6 (1).

[15] *Vin. Piṭ.* iv, p. 54 (*Sutta-vibhaṅga, Pācittiya* rules). *Theragāthā*, ccxxxvi.

[16] *Ceto*; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6].

[17] *Saññā.*

[18] Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* *Theragāthā*, ccxxxi.

[19] *Araṇa*; cp. Ch. 8 *k* [8].

[20] *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 337. *Theragāthā*; the commentary thereon states that he was the nephew of Anāthapiṇḍika.

[21] A *dakkhinā* was an honorific gift, such as was more approved by the monks than by Gotama; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3] (*cajoles*).

[22] Ch. 8 *k* [8].

[23] i.e. of the acacia-grove. Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [1] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n. The *thera* Revata appears frequently in *Vin. Piṭ.*, e.g. MV, VIII. xxxi; CV, I. xviii; and *Pācittiya* xxix; and in *Majjh. Nik.*, e.g. PTS, i, p. 462. *Theragāthā*, xlii, ccxliv.

[24] Or, absorption. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8). See (53) below.

[25] MV, VI. xvi. *Theragāthā*, iii. 'The Doubter', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Brethren.*

(18) making exertion (*āraddha-viriyānaṃ*)[1]—Soṇa Kolivīsa;[2]
(19) of fair conversation—Soṇa Kuṭikaṇṇa;[3]
(20) acquisitive[4] (*labhīnaṃ*)—Sīvali;[5]
(21) emancipated by faith[6] (*saddh-adhimuttānaṃ*)—Vakkali;[7]

[3] This was the foremost of my disciples, who became Bhikkhus—

(22) desiring instruction (*sikkhā-kāmānaṃ*)—Rāhula;[8]
(23) going forth in faith[9] (*saddhā-pabbajitānaṃ*)—Ratthapāla;[10]
(24) taking the first vote (*pathamaṃ salākaṃ*[11] *gaṇhantānaṃ*)—Kuṇḍadhāna;[12]
(25) possessing ready speech (*pati-bhāna-vantānaṃ*)[13]—Vangīsa;[14]
(26) all-pure[15] (*samanta-pāsādikānaṃ*)—Upasena Vangantaputta;[16]
(27) supervising lodgings (*senāsana-paññāpakānaṃ*)[17]—Dabba Malla-putta;[18]
(28) pleasing to the king (*devatānaṃ piya-manāpānaṃ*)[19]—Pilinda-vaccha;[20]
(29) with swift intuition (*khipp-ābhiññānaṃ*)[21]—Bāhiya Dārucīriya;[22]
(30) brilliant preachers (*citta-kathikānaṃ*)—Kumāra-Kassapa;[23]
(31) who have acquired the science of exegesis (*paṭisaṃbhida-ppattānaṃ*)[24]—Mahā-Koṭṭhita;[25]

[1] Ap. F 2 *a* (137). See (54) below; Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [3].
[2] Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11]. *Theragāthā*, ccxliii, where the spelling is Koḷivisa. Born at Campā (Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]).
[3] The personal attendant of Mahā-Kaccāna; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [1]. *Theragāthā*, ccviii.
[4] Of spiritual gains. See (60) below.
[5] Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ*. *Theragāthā*, lx.
[6] Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*. Cp. (23) below.
[7] Ch. 11 *c* § 20. *Saṃ. Nik.* iii, pp. 119–24. *Theragāthā*, ccv.
[8] Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 9; Ap. E *c* § 7 [2] n; *Theragāthā*, cxciii; the commentary states that he was the son of Yasodharā.
[9] Cp. (21) above.
[10] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [55]; *Vin. Piṭ*. iii, p. 148 (*Sutta-vibhaṅga*, *Saṃghādisesa* rules); *Theragāthā*, ccli.
[11] A wooden ticket for voting and other purposes. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1); Ch. 19 *b* § 9.
[12] *Majjh. Nik.* 68 (PTS, i, p. 462). *Theragāthā*, xv.
[13] See (46) below; cp. Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83].
[14] A poet and composer of Gāthas (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). Ap. A 1 *b* (4); *Saṃ. Nik.* i, pp. 185–96. *Theragāthā*, cclxiv.
[15] Or, radiant. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 6 [5] (*pasāda*); also (38) and (68) below.
[16] Ch. 8 *g* § 1 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* § 12 (*Upasena*); Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [1] n. *Theragāthā*, ccxxxviii; the commentary states that he was the brother of Sāriputta.
[17] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 (2).
[18] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [4]. Ch. 11 *c* § 24 [4]. *Theragāthā*, v.
[19] Cp. the title Devānampiya (Int. § 49). Cp. also (66) below.
[20] He was a favoured spiritual instructor of King Bimbisāra (Int. § 168; MV, VI. xv. 2, 8). Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (*Vaccha*). *Theragāthā*, ix.
[21] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6) *highest knowledge*. See (56) below.
[22] *Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 63, v, p. 165. The *Theragāthā* anthology does not assign any sacred song to him. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 5 [1], the commentary states that he was the son of a daughter of a Brāhman Councillor of Rājagaha. For the epithet see Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83].
[23] Or, Kulāra-Kassapa. Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [1] n; Ch. 14 *d* § 2; MV, I. lxxv; *Theragāthā*, clxi.
[24] Ap. A 1 *b* (5).
[25] Ch. 15 *a* n; Ap. A 1 *b* (5); Ap. D *c* § 3 [6] n. *Theragāthā*, ii.

[4] This was the foremost of my disciples, who became Bhikkhus—

(32) very learned[1] (*bahu-ssutānaṃ*)—Ānanda;[2]
(33) versed in meditation[3] (*sati-mantānaṃ*)—Ānanda;
(34) versed in conduct[4] (*gati-mantānaṃ*)—Ānanda;
(35) enduring[5] (*dhiti-mantānaṃ*)—Ānanda;
(36) ministering[6] (*upaṭṭhākānaṃ*)—Ānanda;
(37) holding great assemblies[7] (*mahā-parisānaṃ*)—Uruvela-Kassapa;[8]
(38) favouring the Clan[9] (*kula-ppasādakānaṃ*)—Kāl-Udāyin;[10]
(39) free from afflictions[11] (*app-ābādhānaṃ*)—Bakkula;[12]
(40) remembering former existence[13]—Sobhita;[14]
(41) upholding the Rules (*vinaya-dharānaṃ*)[15]—Upāli;[16]
(42) addressing the mendicant-sisters (*bhikkhun'ovādakānaṃ*)[17]—Nandaka;[18]
(43) having the doors of the faculties[19] guarded (*indriyesu-gutta-dvārānaṃ*)—Nanda;[20]
(44) addressing the mendicant-brothers[21]—Mahā-Kappina;[22]
(45) skilled in the fire-element[23] (*tejo-dhātu-kusalānaṃ*)—Sāgata;[24]

[1] i.e. in the discourses of the Master; Ap. A 1 *b* (3). Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]. See (73) below.

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ap. A 1 *b* (8). The *Theragāthā* anthology (cclx) includes a collection of verses attributed to Ānanda, and in these is a statement that he attended upon the Blessed One for 25 years (Ch. 10 *d* § 1, note to 20th year).

[3] Or, introspection; Ap. I *a*.

[4] Or, behaviour. Cp. Ap. E *b* § 2 (*Su-gata*).

[5] Or, patient.

[6] Ap. A 2 *b* (67), and Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1].

[7] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].

[8] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1]. See (4) above. *Theragāthā*, ccx.

[9] Or, family, i.e. of the Founder. Cp. (26) above.

[10] Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [86] n; Ch. 10 *d* § 2; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (528) n. That he was sent as messenger by Rāja Suddhodana to Gotama at Rājagaha is confirmed by his poem in *Therā-gāthā* (verse 536); see ThB, p. 97. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [1].

[11] Or, diseases. Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [1].

[12] Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ. Theragāthā*, clxxii; spelt Bākula.

[13] *Pubbe-nivāsa* means literally 'previous abode'. Ap. I *b* § 3 (*re-birth*); cp. Ap. B *a*. The mention of this mystical faculty may date the present list. See (57) below.

[14] *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 109 (*Pārājaka* rules, IV. ix. 7). He claimed to remember his births during five hundred Kalpas (Int. § 107). The fourth *Pārājaka* rule discountenances claims to extraordinary powers. *Theragāthā*, cxliii.

[15] Ap. A 1 *b* (3). See (51) below.

[16] Ch. 8 *e* § 2 [1]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]. *Theragāthā*, clxxx.

[17] Ch. 12 *c* § 6. Cp. (44) below.

[18] Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [1]. In *Majjh. Nik.* 146 Nandaka, as directed by Gotama, instructs Mahā-Pajāpatī and the mendicant sisters. *Theragāthā*, clxxxix; Nandaka of Sāvatthi is distinguished from Nandaka of Campā (cxlvii); see Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1].

[19] Or, senses. Ap. D *b* § 2 [7] (five). Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.

[20] Ch. 7 *b* § 3. *Theragāthā*, cxxxix; the commentary states that he was the son of Pajāpatī; Ch. 13 *c* § 11 [91].

[21] Cp. (42) above.

[22] Ch. 8 *f* § 1 [3] n. *Vin. Piṭ.* iv, p. 66 (*Pācittiya rules, xxix, 1*); *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 145, ii, p. 284, v, p. 315. *Theragāthā*, ccxxxv; the commentary states that he was 'Rāja of Kukkuṭa'.

[23] Ch. 11 *c* § 24 (11) n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23], [26]; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 8 (*aggi*). The miracle of breathing forth fire whilst appearing in the sky seems to be intended (Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [4] n).

[24] He preceded Ānanda as Gotama's personal attendant; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [4]. In the *Theragāthā* no sacred song is assigned to him.

(46) having ready speech (*paṭi-bhaneyyakānaṃ*)[1]—Rādha;[2]
(47) wearing coarse[3] robes—Mogharāja;[4]

[5] This, mendicant brothers, was the foremost of my women-disciples (*sāvikānaṃ*), (ii) who became mendicant-sisters—

(48) of long standing[5]—Mahā-Pajāpatī;[6]
(49) having great insight[7]—Khemā;[8]
(50) having [spiritual] power[9]—Uppalavaṇṇā;[10]
(51) upholding the Rules[11]—Paṭācārā;[12]
(52) discoursing on the Law[13]—Dhammadinnā;[14]
(53) practising meditation[15]—Nandā;[16]
(54) making exertion[17]—Soṇā;[18]
(55) having divine vision[19]—Sakulā;[20]
(56) with swift intuition[21]—Bhaddā Kuṇḍalakesā;[22]

[1] See (25) above.

[2] Buddha instructs him in *Saṃ. Nik.*, PTS, iii, pp. 79–80, pp. 188–90; iv, pp. 48–9. *Theragāthā*, ccxxvii. Ch. 14 *c* § 6.

[3] Or, shabby; *lūkha*. See (59) below.

[4] Ap. D *b* § 4 n. *Theragāthā*, clxiv; Brāhman pupil of Bāvariya.

[5] See (1) above.

[6] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2], [3]. The verses declaring her *aññā* (perception, understanding; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [31]) appear in *Therī-gāthā*, v; the commentary thereon states that she was born at Devadaha, in the family of Suppabuddha whose family name was Gotama, and that she was the younger sister of Māyā (Ch. 1 § 3).

[7] See (2) above.

[8] Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (6th *vassa*); Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83] n; Ap. A 2 *b* (68); Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [6]. Khemā the wife of King Bimbisāra (Int. § 168) is traditionally supposed to have been admitted to the Order in the sixth year of Buddha's ministry. An imaginative account of her conversion is given in the commentary on the *Therī-Gāthā* (*Paramattha-Dīpanī*, Pt. v, p. 133, vs. 66–70), see KM, p. 31; Int. § 14; In *Vin. Piṭ.* v, p. 3 (*Parivāra* or Supplement) Khemā is called *tipetakī* (learned in the Three Piṭakas). She is mentioned with Uppalavaṇṇā (No. 50 below) in the Twos and Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.*, and in a list of women disciples in the Eights; *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 88, ii, p. 164, iv, p. 347. She is associated with Uppalavaṇṇā also in *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 236. *Therī-gāthā*, lii; *Apadāna* (*Therī-ap.* 18).

[9] See (3) above.

[10] See (49) n above; Ap. A 2 *b* (68). In the *Sagātha-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik.* Uppalavaṇṇā and Māra (Ap. G 2 *b*) address each other in verse. She is mentioned in CV, x (*Vin. Piṭ.* ii, p. 261), and in the *Pārājaka* and *Nissaggiya* rules (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, pp. 35, 207). *Therīgāthā*, xiv; 'Lotus-hued', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Sisters.*

[11] See (41) above.

[12] Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* For commentarial accounts of her conversion see ThB, p. 111. *Therīgāthā*, xlvii.

[13] See (9) above.

[14] In *Majjh. Nik.* 44 Dhammadinnā instructs the layman Visākha. *Therīgāthā*, xii.

[15] Or, absorption. See (17) above, and (75) below.

[16] Ap. B *a* § 6 [6]. Legend makes her the daughter of Mahā-Pajāpatī (ThB, p. 110). *Therīgāthā*, xli; the commentary calls her Sundarī-Nandā, daughter of Pajāpatī, distinguishing her from Abhirūpa-Nandā, daughter of Khemaka the Sākiyan of Kapilavatthu (*Therīgāthā*, xix), and from Nanduttarā (xlii).

[17] See (18) above.

[18] The name occurs in the extended list of women disciples in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, p. 348). *Therīgāthā*, xlv.

[19] See (5) above.

[20] Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* *Therīgāthā*, xliv.

[21] See (29) above.

[22] Bhaddā the flower-haired. *Therīgāthā*, xlvi; 'Curly-hair', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Sisters.*

(57) remembering former existence[1]—Bhaddā Kapilānī;[2]
(58) having attained great intuition[3]—Bhaddā Kaccānā;[4]
(59) wearing coarse[5] robes—Kisā-Gotamī;[6]
(60) emancipated by faith[7]—Sigāla's mother;[8]

[6] This was the foremost of my disciples, (iii) being laymen (*upāsakānaṃ*)[9]—

(61) taking the first refuge (*paṭhamaṃ saraṇaṃ*)[10]—Tapassu with Bhallika,[11] merchants;
(62) benefactors[12] (*dāyakānaṃ*)—Sudatta Anāthapiṇḍika,[13] householder;
(63) discoursing on the Law[14]—Citta[15] of Macchikasaṇḍa,[16] householder;
(64) including the Saṃgha in fourfold sympathy (*catūhi saṅgaha-vatthūhi*)[17]—Haṭṭhaka[18] Āḷavaka;[19]
(65) distinguished donors[20] (*paṇīta-dāyakānaṃ*)—Mahānāma[21] the Sakkan;

[1] See (40) above.

[2] Bhaddā of the Kapila-family. Bhaddā Kapilānī is mentioned repeatedly in the *Sutta-vibhaṅga* of *Vin. Piṭ.* (iv, pp. 227, 268, 275, 290, 292). *Therīgāthā* xxxvii; the commentary states that she was born at Sāgal, (capital of the Maddas; RDBI, p. 39), and became the wife of Pippali-Mānava (Mahā-Kassapa).

[3] Or highest knowledge. Cp. (56) above.

[4] The name does not occur again in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* It is given to the wife of Gotama in the *Buddhavaṃsa* (Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*). Kaccāna is said to have been the name of her ancestor (Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2] n). For a discussion of the whole subject see ThB, p. 110. In the *Therīgāthā* no sacred song is assigned to her.

[5] See (47) above.

[6] Gotamī the slender; Ch. 2 § 2. In the *Sagātha-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, pp. 129–30) Kisā-Gotamī and Māra (Ap. G 2 *b*) address each other in verse. *Therīgāthā*, lxiii; 'Lean Gotamī' Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Sisters*. The beautiful story of how Buddha taught Kisā-Gotamī to control her grief for the death of her little son is found in the *Therīgāthā* commentary, which states that she was born at Sāvatthi. RDB, p. 133; ThB, p. 110.

[7] See (21) above.

[8] Sigāla-mātā or Singālakā mātā. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]. Not in the *Therīgāthā*.

[9] On omissions from this list see Ch. 6 *a* § 7 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 7 *b* § 2 n; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5] n. See also Ch. 8 *l*.

[10] i.e. the Buddha. There is here no mention of the Law, which the accounts in MV (Ch. 4 § 15 n) and the *Jātaka* Introduction include. See (71) below.

[11] Ch. 4 § 8 n. The spelling Tapussa also is used. In the Sixes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 451) the householder Bhallika heads a long list of lay disciples of which the next nine names are the same as (62)–(70) here; Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1] n.

[12] Or, donors. See (65), (66), and (72) below.

[13] Of, Sāvatthi. Ch. 10 *a*; Ch. 18 *a* § 2. See *Vin. Piṭ.* iv, p. 162 (*Pācittiya* 84); also *Brethren*, pp. 4, 20, 21.

[14] See (9) above.

[15] Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [4]. Citta in *Buddhavaṃsa* xxvi (Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*) is described as a lay attendant or *upaṭṭhāk-upāsaka* (cp. Ap. A 2 *b*, 68). He and Haṭṭhaka are included in the four pairs of the chief followers enumerated in *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 88, ii, p. 164. He must be distinguished from the Bhikkhu Citta (Ch. 15 *a* § 9).

[16] Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1].

[17] Literally, the four union-bases; Ap. F 2 (*Virtues*). These are liberality, kind speech, genuineness, and equal-mindedness (Ch. 9 *b* § 10 n).

[18] Ch. 16 *d* § 4 [3]. Haṭṭhāḷavaka in *Buddhavaṃsa* xxvi (Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*), like Citta, is described as a lay attendant (*upatthāk-upāsaka*); Ap. A 2 *b* (68).

[19] Int. § 157.

[20] See (62) above and (76) below. 'Those who give choice alms-food', *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 2.

[21] Of Kapilavatthu. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

(66) kindly donors[1] (*manāpa-dāyakānaṃ*)—Ugga,[2] householder of Vesāli;[3]
(67) attendants on the Saṃgha (*saṅgh-upatthākānaṃ*)[4]—Uggata,[5] householder;
(68) having perfect faith (*avecca-ppasannānaṃ*)[6]—Sūra Ambaṭṭha;[7]
(69) having faith in individuals[8] (*puggala-ppasannānaṃ*)—Jīvaka Komāra-bhacca;[9]
(70) trustworthy[10] (*vissāsākānaṃ*)—Nakula's father;[11]

[7] This was the foremost of my disciples, (iv) being lay-women (*upāsikānaṃ*)[12]—

(71) taking the first refuge[13]—Sujātā,[14] the daughter of Senāni;[15]
(72) benefactresses[16]—Visākhā, the mother of Migāra;[17]
(73) very learned[18]—Khujjuttarā;[19]
(74) dwelling in loving-kindness (*mettā-vihārīnaṃ*)[20]—Sāmāvatī;[21]

[1] Or, givers of [mutual] pleasure. See (62) above. For *manāpa* cp. (28) above, and Ch. 21 § 12 [48].
[2] Ugga of Vesāli in the Fives of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, pp. 49–51; Ap. F 1 *b* § 7) whilst bestowing gifts quotes Buddha's phrase 'Who grants a kindness receives a kindness to himself, *Manāpa-dāyī labhate manāpaṃ*' (Int. § 113; Ap. F 1 *a*; cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [7]). He is also the subject of a discourse in the Eights (*Aṅg. Nik.* iv, pp. 208–12).
[3] Ch. 12.
[4] Ch. 10 *a* § 11. Cp. (77) below.
[5] Or, Uggāta of Hatthigāma otherwise Ugga (Ch. 12 *e* § 2 [2]). He is the subject of a discourse in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, p. 212). Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 9 n.
[6] Cp. (26) above and (80) below; Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]. See (78) below.
[7] Like the other nine laymen here mentioned he is included in the longer list of commended lay-followers in the Sixes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 451). Ambaṭṭha is a family name; Sutta 3 of *Dīgha-Nik.* is called after a youth of this family (Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9]; cp. Ch. 14 *d* § 4 [2] n).
[8] Perhaps, having brilliant personality. *Puggala* means 'person' (Ap. E *b* § 2; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3, 3), and later came to mean 'self' or 'soul' (A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, pp. 81–4). Jīvaka can scarcely have accepted the doctrine of a permanent soul (Ap. E *a*, *saṃkhārā*), but certainly was a believer in individual exertion (Ap. E *c* ii) and in the care of persons.
[9] The great physician; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i). He is frequently mentioned in MV and CV, and is a leading personage in *Dīgha-Nik.* 2; *Majjh.* 55 is called after him, and he is the interlocutor in a discourse on the virtues of a layman in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv. p. 222).
[10] Or, confiding. See (79) below. 'Who converse intimately', *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 24.
[11] Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (8th *vassa*). Nakula-pitar of Suṃsumāra-giri (Int. § 148, iv; Ch. 13 *b* §§ 1, 4) figures in *Saṃ. Nik.* (iii, pp. 1–5; iv, p. 116), and frequently in *Aṅg. Nik.*; see Ch. 13 *b* § 4.
[12] Int. § 190 (*women*); Ch. 8 *l*.
[13] See (61) above.
[14] Ch. 4 § 1.
[15] Alternatively Senānī or Seniya (Cn. 7 *a* § 11 [2]). Ch. 3 § 5.
[16] See (62) above.
[17] Of Sāvatthi. Ch. 10 *a* § 4; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 1. In the *Apadāna* (PTS, ii, p. 546) the name appears in the following list: Khema (who speaks), Uppalavaṇṇā, Paṭācārā, Kuṇḍalā, Kisā-Gotamī, Dhammadinnā, Visākha.
[18] See (32) above.
[19] Mentioned elsewhere in *Aṅg. Nik.* (8, p. 88; ii, p. 164; iv, p. 347).
[20] Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 [368].
[21] This name occurs in the extended list of women disciples in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 347–8).

(75) practising meditation[1]—Uttarā, the mother of Nanda;[2]
(76) distinguished donors[3]—Suppavāsā, the daughter of Koḷiya[4] (*Koḷiya-dhītā*);
(77) ministering to the sick (*gilān-ūpaṭṭhākīnaṃ*)[5]—Suppiyā,[6] lay-woman;
(78) having perfect faith[7]—Kātiyānī;[8]
(79) trustworthy[9]—Nakula's mother,[10] householder's wife (*gahapatānī*);[11]
(80) having faith in tradition (*anussava-ppasannānaṃ*)[12]—Kālī,[13] lay-woman of Kurara-ghara (*Kurara-gharikā*).'[14]

d. Gotama's Annual Journeys

Madhurattha-vilāsinī[15] (*Commentary*[16] *on the Buddha-vaṃsa*), *Introduction* (*PTS, Buddhavaṃsa*,[17] *Preface, pp. viii–xii*)

§ 1. . . .[18] [He spent] the sixth rainy season at the Maṅkula-hill (*Maṅkula-pabbate*);[19]
the seventh in the Tāvatiṃsa region (*Tāvatiṃsa-bhavane*);[20]
the eighth in Bhagga (*Bhagge*)[21] near the Suṃsumāra-peak[22] at Bhesakalā-vana;[23]
the ninth at Kosambi;[24]
the tenth in the Pārileyyaka Grove (*Pārileyyake vanasaṇḍe*);[25]

[1] See (53) above.
[2] 'Nanda's mother' is mentioned repeatedly in *Aṅg. Nik.* (ii, p. 164, iii, p. 336, iv, 63 ff) and is included in the extended list of women disciples. She is called the chief woman lay-attendant in *Buddhavaṃsa xxvi.* 20 (cp. ii. 70).
[3] See (65) above. 'Who give choice alms-food', *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 25.
[4] Of Sajjanela, a township of the Koliyans (Int. § 148, iii; Ch. 13 *d* § 7 n); *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 62, iv, p. 348; cp. *Brethren*, p. 60. Gotama's mother and wife belonged to the Koliyan clan (Ch. 1 § 5 [52]; Ch. 10 *d* n; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3]).
[5] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1]. Cp. (67) above.
[6] *Vin. Piṭ.*, MV, vi. xxiii; *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, p. 348.
[7] See (68) above.
[8] Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.*
[9] See (70) above.
[10] *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 61, iii, p. 295, iv. pp. 268, 348.
[11] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7].
[12] Cp. (68) above.
[13] Ch. 17 *d* § 4.
[14] Literally, the Osprey's-house (Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [1]).
[15] Int. § 16; Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 14 *b* § 2; Ch. 16 *d* § 1.
[16] Int. § 14.
[17] Ap. A 2 *a*.
[18] As in Ch. 10 *b* § 1.
[19] Int. § 157. According to the Burmese tradition (Ch. 10 *b* § 1 n) based upon the Commentaries and recorded by Bishop Bigandet Gotama then returns to Rājagaha and 'there admits Kshemā [Ch. 10 *c* (49)] . . . to the Order'; RDB, p. 71.
[20] Int. §§ 70, 74; Ch. 1 § 5 [54] n. The Burmese tradition makes him descend to earth at Sankassa, thirty leagues away from Sāvatthi (see ThB, p. 114). Sankassa (Ch. 15 *a* § 12, ii) lay between Verañja (Int. § 157) and the river Ganges (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 11).
[21] Ch. 13 *b*. The Bhaggans were neighbours of the Sakyans.
[22] Int. § 148 (iv).
[23] This was near the home of Nakula's father and mother, who claimed Buddha as their son, nephew, or grandson, in many previous births (Ch. 10 *c*, 70).
[24] Int. § 150; Ch. 15 *b* (i). To this year are assigned the first dissensions in the Order.
[25] Int. § 150; Cp. Ch. 11 *a* § 1.

the eleventh at Nālā[1] a Brāhman village;[2]
the twelfth at Verañjā[3] (*Verañjāya*);
the thirteenth at Cāliya-hill (*Cāliya-pabbate*);[4]
the fourteenth at the great monastery, Jetavana (*Jetavana-mahā-vihāre*);[5]
the fifteenth at the great city of Kapilavatthu (*Kapilavatthu-mahā-nagare*);[6]
the sixteenth at Ālavī,[7] after he had tamed Ālavaka . . . ;[8]
the seventeenth at Rājagaha again;[9]
the eighteenth at the Cāliya-hill as before;[10]
and the nineteenth rainy season [he spent] at Rājagaha again.[11] So it is said that the Blessed One was for the first twenty years after the Enlightenment without a fixed residence; wheresoever he wished to go, there he went and stayed.

Thereafter he stayed near Sāvatthi,[12] both at the Jetavana Vihāra and at the Eastern Garden (*Pubb-ārāme*), living upon regular contributions.

§ 2. Now when the Teacher (*satthā*) had become Buddha and had spent the first rainy season (*vassaṃ*) at Benāres, at Isipaṭana in the deer-park[13] having completed the *vassa* he observed *pavāraṇa*,[14] and went to Uruvelā.[15] Having been there three months . . . on the full-moon day of the month Phussa[16] he went to Rājagaha[17] and stayed there

[1] Int. § 145; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 2 [1], 3. Or, Ekanālā, in the Magadha country (ThB, p. 117).

[2] Ch. 1 § 2 [49].

[3] Int. § 157. In the introductory chapters of the *Sutta-vibhaṅga* of *Vin. Piṭ.* (Ap. H 3, *Note*) Buddha is said to have explained the nature and stages of his Enlightenment (Ap. B *c* § 1) to the Brāhman Verañja living at this remote spot.

[4] Int. § 157; see below (18th *vassa*).

[5] Ch. 14 *b* § 1 n. The Commentaries, making Gotama's son Rāhula (Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [17]) now to be twenty years old, place his full ordination in this year.

[6] Int. § 135. In this year, according to tradition (RDB, p. 73), 'Gautama addressed to his cousin Mahānāma, who had succeeded Bhadraka, the successor of Suddhodana . . . a discourse' (*Majjh. Nik.* 14) on Sorrow; Int. § 169 (iii); Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91].

[7] Int. § 157.

[8] In the *Sagātha-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, pp. 213–15) and in *Sutta-Nipāta* (1. x) Ālavaka is described as a *yakkha* (Ap. G 2 *b*, *Note* n). These contain an ethical summary of the faith in the form of questions and answers resembling those in the *Devatā-saṃyutta* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, p. 42 § 3), and are as well suited to convince men as spirits (Ch. 6 *b* § 1).

[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 1; see below (19th *vassa*).

[10] See above (13th *vassa*).

[11] See above (17th *vassa*).

[12] Ch. 18 *a* § 1; Ch. 19 *b* § 1 n; cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 4 n. For estimating the years of residence cp. the verses in Ch. 22 *b* § 16 (MPS, v. 27). Doubtless the necessity of providing a permanent president at this great centre had become evident (Ch. 6 *b*, n). The commentators assign to the 20th year the conversion of the robber Angulimāla (*Majjh.* 86, Ch. 18 *c* § 1; Int. § 189, *robber bands*) and his meeting with the Kosalan king Pasenadi (Int. § 169, i). To this year also is assigned the appointment of Ānanda as Buddha's personal attendant (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ap. A 2 *b*, 68). He succeeded Sāgata (Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [4]), Meghiya (Ch. 16 *d* § 2), and the disobedient Nāgasamāla (*Udāna*, viii, 7; see ThB, p. 122), and others, including Upavāna (Ch. 13 *c* § 24 n; *Saṃ. Nik.*, i, p. 174), Nāgita (Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [2]), and Cundaka (Ch. 22 *a* § 8). If it is rightly assumed that Ānanda's verses in the *Theragāthā* (1039) were composed after Buddha's death the difficulty regarding his being 'twenty-five years a learner' seems to disappear (Ch. 10 *c*, 32).

[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 1.

[14] Ch. 8 *c*.

[15] Ch. 7 *a* § 1.

[16] Ch. 1 § 3 n.

[17] Ch. 10 *b* § 1.

for two months. From his leaving Benāres five months had passed, and the whole winter was over. After the arrival of the *thera* Udāyin[1] seven or eight days had elapsed, and it being the month of Phagguna[2] he thought: 'Winter has passed, it is springtime; the time is come for the Tathāgata to go to Kapilapura.' . . .[3] Then the Teacher . . .[4] set out from Rājagaha, and going a league a day . . . reached Kapilapura[5] in two months. . . .[6] Thereupon the Buddhavaṃsa[7] was revealed by him. . . .[8]

§ 3. . . . There are the 'remote period'[9] (*dūre nidānaṃ*), the 'less remote period'[10] (*avidūre nidānaṃ*) and the 'present period'[11] (*santike nidānaṃ*). . . . The narrative treating of [the period] from the Great Being's (*mahā-satassa*)[12] resolve made at the feet of the tenfold [Sage][13] Dīpankara until having passed on from the personality of Vessantara[14] he was re-born (*nibbatti*) in the Tusita-heaven (*Tusita-bhavane*) is called the 'Remote Period'. The narrative treating of [the period] from the passing-on from the Tusita-heaven until he attained all-knowledge on the wisdom-throne (*bodhi-maṇḍe*)[15] is called the 'Less Remote Period'. As for the 'Present Period'—the phrases 'At one time the Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana in Anāthapiṇḍika's garden', and 'he was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana at Kalandakanivāpa', and 'he was staying at Vesāli in the Great Forest in the Kūtāgāra-hall', and so on[16] regarding wherever the Blessed One stayed between the time of his attaining all-knowledge on the great wisdom-throne until his death-bed (*mahā-parinibbāna-mañco*)—these are to be understood as [making up the narrative of] what is called the 'Present Period'. . . .

[1] Ch. 10 *c* (38).
[2] Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [86]; also Ch. 1 § 3 n.
[3] Omitting mention of the 60 verses composed by Udāyin.
[4] Substantially as in Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [87].
[5] Or, Kapilavatthu. Int. § 135; Ch. 7 *b* § 3.
[6] Omitting the double marvel (*yamaka-pātihāriya*), i.e. a display of contradictory phenomena, performed by Gotama (Int. § 94, iii).
[7] Ch. 10 *b* § 1.
[8] Omitting a list of 10 Theras by whom the *Buddhavaṃsa* was handed down till the time of the Third Council (*tatiya-saṅgīti*), beginning with Sāriputta and Bhaddaji and ending with Revata; IN 6 (*Councils*).
[9] Ap. A 2 *a* (*Far Past*). Or, the 'far approach'. *Nidāna* means a connected series [of events]. The *Jātaka* animal-birth stories (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2) deal with a still more remote and legendary past (cp. Int. § 89).
[10] Or, the 'near approach'. Ch. 1 § 1.
[11] Or, the 'advent'. Ch. 4 § 5.
[12] Ch. 1 § 6 [56].
[13] Ch. 10 *a* § 2.
[14] Ap. A 1 *a* (*Vessantara Jātaka*). Imaginative and poetical tradition places the self-sacrifice of King Vessantara in the period of Kassapa, the 24th Buddha (*Jātaka* 547; *Buddhavaṃsa* xxv; and the *Vessantara-cariya* in *Cariyā-piṭaka*).
[15] Ch. 7 *b* § 4; Ap. A 2 *b* (64).
[16] Namely in the Suttas and *Vin. Piṭ.*

CHAPTER 11

AMONG THE MAGADHAS[1] AND AṆGAS;[2] AND EASTWARD[3]

a. Kingdom and Sub-kingdom; the Eastern Clans of the Middle-land[4] and Borders

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26.*

[PTS, i, p. 166] 'Pursuing the good[5] (*kim-kusala-gavesi*), seeking the supreme path of tranquillity, I journeyed by stages among the Magadhas (*Magadhesu*), and came to Uruvela[6] the army-township. [p. 167] There I saw . . . a fair grove (*vana-saṇḍaṃ*),[7] and a clear-flowing river,[8] delightful and easy of approach (*sū-patiṭṭhaṃ*),[9] and finally a village in which to beg food. . . . There I settled, here being everything needed for effort.'

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I, xix.*[10]

[1] At that time the great sacrifice (*mahā-yañño*)[11] of Uruvela-Kassapa the Jatiḷa[12] was at hand, and a vast concourse of Aṅgas[13] and Magadhas (*Aṅga-Magadhā*) were desirous of attending it, taking plentiful provisions hard and soft.[14] And Kassapa . . . thought: 'My great sacrifice is now at hand, and a vast concourse of Aṅgas and Magadhas will attend it. . . . If the great devotee (*mahā-samaṇo*)[15] should perform a marvel of power (*iddhi-pāṭihāriyaṃ*)[16] before the multitude his gain and honour would increase. . . . So now the great devotee must not come to-morrow.' And the Blessed One understood the reflection in the mind of Uruvela-Kassapa. . . .

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 70. (PTS, i, p. 205.)*

[1] . . .[17] 'There are these three Uposathas.[18] . . . Which three? The

[1] In what is now South Bihār. Int. §§ 18, 145, 158; Ch. 17 *a* [4].
[2] Int. § 146; Ch. 11 *e*.
[3] Ch. 11 *f*.
[4] Ch. 1 § 2.
[5] Ch. 3 § 5 [166]; also Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*).
[6] Ch. 11 *b*.
[7] Cp. Ch. 10 *d* (*10th vassa*); Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [501].
[8] The Nerañjarā; Ch. 4 § 3.
[9] Cp. Ch. 4 § 3 [70]; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 1, 16 n; also Ch. 20 § 11 [32] (*steps*).
[10] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [2] n.
[11] Ch. 7 *a* § 8; Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1]; Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2]; and Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 [1]. This was Brāhmanic and Vedic (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*).
[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1].
[13] Int. § 158; Ch. 11 *e*.
[14] Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4].
[15] The word *samaṇa* means a devotee who is not a Brāhman by caste and who teaches a non-Vedic religion. Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
[16] Ap. I *b* § 4 [5].
[17] The discourse was delivered to Visākhā in the Eastern garden (Ch. 18 *b*) by Gotama after he had settled permanently at Sāvatthi, but the statements hold equally good of the early days of his ministry.
[18] Or, Observances of holy-days. Ch. 8 *a*. Cp. Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [52].

pagan[1] *uposatha*, the *uposatha* of the Nigaṇṭhas,[2] and the *uposatha* of the Noble[3] [Way] (*ariy-ūposatha*). . . . [4] And what is the *uposatha* of the Noble [Way]? It is purification (*pariyodapanā*) by turning against the tainted mind. . . . [16] The *uposatha* of the Noble [Way] is very fruitful (*mahā-pphalo*),[4] very advantageous, very glorious, very stirring. [17] How far is it very fruitful . . . very stirring? It is as if one should hold the supreme lordship and government of the sixteen great countries (*soḷasannaṃ mahā-janapadānaṃ*)[5] rich in the seven great treasures,[6] namely of the Aṅgas, Magadhas, Kāsis (*Kāsīnaṃ*), Kosalas, Vajjis (*Vajjīnaṃ*), Cetis (*Cetīnaṃ*), Vaṅgas[7] (*Vangānaṃ*), Kurus (*Kurūnaṃ*), Pancālas, Macchas, Sūrasenas, Assakas, Avantis (*Avantīnaṃ*), Gandhāras, Kambojas—[his rulership] is not worth a sixteenth part[8] of the eightfold (*aṭṭhaṅga-samannāgatassa*) Uposatha.[9] And why? Poor is human rule in comparison with divine happiness (*dibbaṃ sukhaṃ*).'[10]

§ 4. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, V, i.*

[1] . . . At that time the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra held rule and overlordship over eighty thousand villages.[11] . . . The king called a meeting of the overseers[12] of those eighty thousand villages. . . . [3] Then the king . . . dismissed the overseers saying: 'You now, I say, have been directed by me on matters of this world . . . the Blessed One verily will direct you on matters beyond.'

§ 5. *Mahā-vagga, I, xl.*

[1] At that time the border[13] of the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra was disturbed. Then the king . . . caused the high military officers[14] (*senānāyake mahāmatte*) to be assembled and said: 'Go now and clear the border.' [3] The high military officers asked the [soldiers] in the king's service[15] (*rāja-bhate*) saying: 'How now, the

[1] Pāli *gopālika*, literally, 'herdsman's'; apparently the equivalent of 'pagan' (country) or 'heathen'. This description must cover the Vedic observances (Ap. G 2 *c* § 1). Cp. Ch. 1 § 2 (*village*); also Ch. 22 *c* § 2 (*dances*). 'The herdsman's sabbath', *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 185.

[2] Int. § 184 (*Jainism*); Ch. 11 *c* § 8; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

[3] i.e. Buddhist. Ch. 5 *b* § 5.

[4] Ch. 17 *a* [1]; also Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4; cp. Ap. D *c* § 4 [*a*].

[5] Int. § 158; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36] (*Bārāṇasi*) n; see Ch. 17 *a* [4] n. Cp. Ch. 18 *c*. § 1 [101]. It is doubtful whether Gotama was acquainted with the more westerly of these clans; Ch. 12 *e* § 6. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2].

[6] Or, jewels. For the seven treasures (*ratanāni*) see Ap. A 2 *a* (4).

[7] This is a slip for Vaṃsas; *Aṅg. Nik.*, PTS, iv, pp. 252, 256, 260. The Vaṃsa country is identified with modern western Bengal.

[8] Ap. F 1 *b* § 5; Ap. H 1 § 6 n.

[9] Or, 'the eightfold abstinence' required for Uposatha; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (26). *Samannā-gata* means 'having come up to', and so 'endowed with'; cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1]; Ch. 17 *a* [1] n.

[10] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8]; Ap. F 1 *c*, *Note* (*joy*).

[11] Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [1].

[12] Presumably only those of the surrounding district attended. Int. § 172; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]. See Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [3].

[13] Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [1].

[14] Int. §§ 172, 175 (*armies*).

[15] Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [1]. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [166] (*army-township*).

warriors so-and-so and so-and-so are not to be seen?' 'The warriors so-and-so and so-and-so, sir,' they replied, 'have been ordained by the mendicant brothers.' . . . Then the king asked the high legal officers[1] (*vohārike mahā-matte*): 'If anyone, now, ordains a [soldier] in the king's service to what is he liable?' They replied: 'The [religious] instructor's head, lord, should be cut off, the tongue of the [monk] presiding should be torn out, half the ribs of those attending the chapter[2] should be broken.' . . .

b. Uruvelā[3] and Gayā-Head[4]

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Saṃyutta IV (Māra-saṃ), § 5 [1–3].*[5]

. . .[6] [2] 'I have been liberated, mendicant brothers, . . . and ye also have been liberated. . . . Go forth, mendicant brothers, upon journeys for the benefit of the many, for the well-being of the many, out of compassion for the world. . . . Let not two go the same way. Make known the Law, good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, in the meaning, and in the letter; make clear the complete and pure holy-life. There are beings whose natures are scarcely tainted; through not hearing of the Law they are lost. They will comprehend the Law. I, mendicant brothers, will go to Uruvelā, the army township, to make known the Law.'

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I, xxi.*

[1] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Uruvelā as long as he wished proceeded to Gayā-Head (*Gayā-sīsaṃ*) with a great company,[7] a thousand mendicant brothers, all formerly matted-haired ascetics. There the Blessed One stayed at Gayā on Gayā-Head with the thousand mendicants. There the Blessed One instructed the mendicants. . . .[8]

§ 3. *Mahā-vagga, I, xxii.*

[1] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Gayā-Head as long as he wished proceeded towards Rājagaha. . . . Then journeying gradually the Blessed One came to Rājagaha. And there the Blessed One stayed . . . in the Laṭṭhivana-Park[9] (*Laṭṭhiyan-uyyāne*).

[1] Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3]. [2] Ch. 8 *d* § 3.

[3] Int. § 145; Ch. 11 *a* § 1. Also *Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 267; *Saṃ. Nik.* i, pp. 103, 106, 122, 136, v, pp. 167, 185, 232; *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, pp. 20, 22: all concerning the Buddha's Enlightenment or Kassapa's conversion.

[4] Int. §§ 119, 145; Ch. 19 *b* § 9 [1]. Also *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 39 (*Gayā*, in a list of towns and rivers). In *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 207, a dialogue between Buddha and certain Yakkhas (ogres) near Gayā is recounted. A visit of Buddha to Gayā is recorded, though indefinitely, in *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, p. 302. [5] Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] n.

[6] The scene is near Benāres at Isipatana. [7] Ch. 7 *a* § 5.

[8] The Fire Sermon follows here as also in *Saṃ. Nik.*, *Salāyatana-vagga*, *Saṃyutta* I, *Sutta* 28 (PTS, iv, p. 19).

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 11. This was six miles from the city (Ch. 7 *a* § 9).

c. Topography of Rājagaha;[1] its environs

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I, xxii.*

[1] . . . The Blessed One came to Rājagaha.[2] And there the Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha (*Rājagahe*) in the Laṭṭhivana-Park,[3] by the shrine[4] [called] Supatiṭṭha[5] (*Supatiṭṭhe cetiye*).

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga, I, xxii.*

[16] This thought came to the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra.[6] . . . 'Where now should the Blessed One stay, not too far from the town and not too near, suitable for coming and going, approachable for people having business with him, by day not crowded, by night free from noise, undisturbed, solitary, fit for rest away from men, suited for retirement? [17] . . . There is our park, the Veḷuvana[7] (*Veḷuvanaṃ uyyanaṃ*). . . .' [18] Then the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra having taken a golden pitcher made a gift to the Blessed One [by pouring out water], saying 'Revered sir, I give this Veḷuvana park to the mendicant-community headed by the Buddha.'

§ 3. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā).*

[JN, p. 87] The Blessed One . . . left Rājagaha and journeyed onward a league a day, going slowly by stages so as to reach Kapilavatthu,[8] sixty leagues distant from Rājagaha, within two months. . . .

[1] Int. § 125; Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [2] n. Discourses are occasionally introduced vaguely by 'Rājagaha connexion (*Rājagaha-nidānaṃ*)', or, 'At Rājagaha' (*Saṃ. Nik.*, PTS, i, pp. 54, 108); cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [1]; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 n. In MV specific mention is made of Rājagaha on approximately 28 occasions and of Sāvatthi on 21; in the CV the figures are approximately 15 and 27; in the rest of *Vin. Piṭ*. 31 and 40 (Ap. A 1, *Canon*). Of the 34 Suttas of the *Dīgha-Nik*. six are placed in Rājagaha and five in Sâvatthi, whilst the long narrative known as the MPS (DN 16) opens at Rājagaha and mentions Sāvatthi only in a list of cities. In *Majjh. Nik*. Rājagaha is the scene of only 22 discourses, whilst Sāvatthi is the scene of 76, the total number being 152. In *Saṃ. Nik*. mention of Rājagaha is made on about 37 occasions, and of Sāvatthi on some 112 occasions; the similar figures for *Aṇg. Nik*. being 28 and 58. The first General Council was held at Rājagaha. It is possible that one of the causes of dissension at Vesāli at the time of the second General Council (Int. §§ 56, 57) was the introduction of this mass of Sāvátthi literature, some of which, such as the very lengthy poetical *Sagātha-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik*. is of a markedly dubious character. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 4 n; Ap. B *c*, *Note* (*Nidānas*).

[2] In Gotama's perhaps imaginary earlier visit to Rājagaha he is said to have stayed at the Paṇḍava Rock (Ch. 3 § 2), which since it faced eastward was apparently in the range north-west of the old city. This Paṇḍava (pale, white) rock or 'hill' is mentioned in the *Pabbajā-S*. of *Sutta-Nipāta* (414, 416, 417), but does not appear in the first four Nikāyas or *Vin. Piṭ*.

[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 11. 'Near Rājagaha, in the Latthivana pleasure garden', SBE, xiii, p. 136; cp. § 25 (*Veḷuvane*).

[4] Int. § 134. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16].

[5] Cp. Ch. 11 *a* § 1. The name means 'Fair Bank', and the shrine may have been near a stream.

[6] See § 22 below.

[7] Int. § 126; Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [17]; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 7 n, 9. See below §§ 6, 7, 9, 18, 20, 21, 25 [43], 28, 29. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 1 (*vana-saṇḍa*); and the Veḷuvana at Kimbilā (Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [1]) and at Kajangalā (Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [1]). Here mainly was worked out the elaborate constitution of the Saṃgha; Ch. 8.

[8] Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [87].

[p. 92] He returned to Rājagaha, together with the company of mendicant brothers, and stayed in the Sīta-Grove (*Sīta-vane*).[1]

§ 4. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, VI, i.*

[1] . . . The Bhikkhus then were dwelling here and there. . . .[2] [2] And at that time the great merchant of Rājagaha went early to his pleasure-ground and saw the Bhikkhus . . . and spoke to them thus: 'If, revered sirs, I were to cause dwellings (*vihāre*) to be made, would you stay in my dwellings?' . . . The Bhikkhus approached the Blessed One . . . and said '. . . How now, revered sir, must we proceed?' . . . 'I sanction,' he said, 'five shelters (*lenāni*)—rest-house,[3] hut, storied-house, house with sloped roof and cave.'

§ 5. *Culla-vagga, VI, iv.*

[1] . . . Anāthapiṇḍika the householder[4] went to Rājagaha. . . . [2] Then the great merchant (*seṭṭhi*) of Rājagaha . . . said to him: '. . . The Saṃgha headed by the Buddha is invited by me for to-morrow. . . . To-morrow early, householder, thou shalt approach and see the Blessed One.' . . . [3] Then [at dawn] Anāthapiṇḍika the householder approached the Sītavana-gate (*Sītavana-dvāraṃ*)[5] . . .[6] and went out from the town . . . [4] and approached the Sītavana. . . . The Blessed One as dawn drew near was walking to and fro in the open air. . . .[7]

§ 6. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 144* (*Channovāda-sutta*).

[PTS, iii, p. 263] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[8] at Kalandakanivāpa[9] (*Veḷuvane Kalandaka-nivāpe*). And

[1] Int. § 130; Ch. 7 *b* § 6; see §§ 5, 12 below. It is apparent that the Sītavana was at a considerable distance from the Vulture-peak, since the Buddha miraculously transported himself between the two places (MV, v. i. 14, 17; Ch. 8 *j* § 6, and Int. § 94, iii). The city-gate leading to it was called after its name (Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3]). The spot included the Snake's Pool (Int. § 129), and apparently a cemetery (KM, p. 28). The texts suggest that it was on the southern slope of the range north-west of the old city.

[2] See Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [1] (*cemetery*).

[3] Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2]. This permission must have preceded the building of the Jetavana monastery, although not necessarily the gift of the Jeta-Grove itself (Ch. 10 *a*; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 10 n). Cp. § 9 n below.

[4] Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [1].

[5] Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3]; cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [209] n. See § 3 above. If the scene is the old city the walls may have consisted of a palisade as found on the site of Pātaliputta, supported by an earthen rampart as on the site of Bimbisāra's palace-fortress, together with the core of large boulders still in place on portions of the site of old Rājagaha; Int. § 136.

[6] Omitting the statement that the gates were opened for him by non-human beings. Thus the Seṭṭhi's house, in which Anāthapiṇḍika was lodging, was within the city-walls. If 'Rājagaha' is to be taken strictly the Seṭṭhi's house was in the new city.

[7] The conversion of Anāthapiṇḍika and his great gift at Sāvatthi follow.

[8] Or, Bamboo-Grove. See § 2 above.

[9] Or, Squirrels' Feeding-ground; Int. § 126. Kalandakanivāpa was perhaps a tract possibly equivalent to the Veḷuvana, or possibly including it; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 1 (*Grove*); also Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [8] n. The locatives are not necessarily in apposition; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 21 § 20.

at that time the venerable Sāriputta[1] and the venerable Mahā-Cunda[2] and the venerable Channa[3] were staying [elsewhere] on the Gijjhakūṭa[4] hill (*Gijjhakūṭe pabbate*). And at that time the venerable Channa was ill, suffering and greatly exhausted.[5] . . .[6] [p. 266] The venerable Sāriputta spoke to the Blessed One. . . . 'Whosoever, Sāriputta,' said he, 'lays aside this body, grasping at another body,[7] him I call blameworthy. . . .'

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Lakkhaṇa-Saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* *19*), *i*, *1* (*Aṭṭhīpesi*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[8] at Kalanda-kanivapa.[9] [2] And at that time the venerable Lakkhaṇa[10] and the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna[11] were staying [elsewhere] on the Gijjhakūṭa[12] hill. . . . [5] And the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna [and the venerable Lakkhaṇa] descended from the Gijjhakūṭa hill . . .[13] [7] and went begging for food in Rājagaha. And after their meal[14] having returned from their begging-round[15] they drew near to where the Blessed One was, and . . . having exchanged greetings with the Blessed One seated themselves at one side. [8] When they were seated the venerable Lakkhaṇa addressed [a question to] the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna. . . .[16]

1 Ch. 7 *a* § 18. See § 12 below.
2 Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*); Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [1] n; Ch. 16 *c* § 2 [1]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [244]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 1 (*Cunda the junior*).
3 Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*). This is not the Channa of MPS, vi. 4 (Ch. 22 *b* § 24 n); cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 16. The whole Sutta is found also in *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, iv, p. 55).
4 The Vulture-peak. Int. § 128; cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [1]. See below §§ 7, 8, 11, 13, 14, 15, 22, 24 (1), 25 [43], 26. The range of hills immediately north of the old city of Rājagaha is divided into two parts by a pass through which a stream runs northward to join the Ganges (Int. § 121 n). One of these was the Vulture-peak and upon its slope was situated the Veḷuvana Garden. The texts seem to favour the conclusion that the Vulture-peak was the eastern part of the range.
5 Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [4]; Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [2]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2].
6 Omitting Sāriputta's teaching on the transcience of the individual; and Channa's death or suicide (cp. § 20 [18] n below; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*c*]).
7 i.e. clinging to individuality. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*vi-bhava-taṇhā*).
8 See above § 2. The Veḷuvana seems to have been on the Gijjhakūṭa hill at a height considerably above the plain and at some distance below the summit (see § 20 below; Ch. 19 *d*, MPS, i, 1, 6, 12; CV, *Vin. Piṭ.* ii, p. 193, *Devadatta*; D. ii, p. 72, &c.) and above the Wanderers' Garden at Moranivāpa (see § 9 below), which was within the walls of the city. Whether the aspect was north or south the texts do not make sure
9 Int. § 126.
10 Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*). The incident is also recorded in *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 104.
11 Ch. 7 *a* § 18.
12 See § 6 above. In the *Yakkha-saṃyutta* of the *Sagāthā-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik.* the Gijjhakūṭa is said to be the haunt of a Yakkha (PTS, i, p. 206) as also the Indakūṭa (see § 27 below) and other parts of the Rājagaha hills.
13 Omitting an apparition (*sita*); Int. § 93 (vii). The spectre is pursued by vultures, crows, and kites.
14 Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 13 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 9; Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [153]; Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [2]; and Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3].
15 *Piṇḍa-pāta*; scrap-food. Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [160]; Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42]; Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1); also Ch. 11 *d* § 6.
16 Omitting an explanation of the apparition as that of a butcher re-born (Ap. B *a*).

§ 8. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 14.*

[PTS, i, p. 92] . . .[1] I stayed at Rājagaha on the Vulture-peak hill.[2] At that time many Nigaṇṭhas[3] (*Nigaṇṭhā*) were on the side of the Seers'-mountain[4] (*Isi-gilipasse*), at the Black-Rock[5] (*Kāḷa-silāyaṃ*) standing erect, refraining from sitting. . . . In the evening having arisen from quiet [contemplation] I approached the Nigaṇṭhas and spoke to them. . . .[6]

§ 9. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 77.*

[PTS, ii, p. 1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[7] in the Squirrels' Feeding-ground. At that time many very well-known Wanderers[8] (*paribbājakā*) were dwelling at the Peacocks' Feeding-ground, the Wanderers' Garden (*Mora-nivāpe Paribbājak-ārāme*).[9] . . . Then in the forenoon[10] the Blessed One . . . entered Rājagaha for alms. Then the Blessed One thought: 'It is early yet to go round for alms in Rājagaha. What if now I should draw near to the Peacocks' Feeding-ground, the Wanderers' Garden (*yena Moranivāpo Paribbājak-ārāmo*), where Sakuludāyin[11] is. . . .[12]

§ 10. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 140.* (*PTS, I, p. 291–2.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha, in the Peacocks' Feeding-ground,[13] the Wanderers' Garden, and there addressed the mendicant brothers. . . .[14]

§ 11. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 25* (*Udumbarika-sīhanāda-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha on the Gijjhakūṭa[15] hill.

1 Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92].
2 See § 6 above.
3 Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 6. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [227] (*Nigaṇṭha-putta*).
4 See § 24 (3) below. Int. § 128. Cp. Isi-patana (Ch. 5 *a* § 9); also Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13].
5 Int. § 130. See below §§ 20, 24 [3], 25 [43].
6 A discussion on Karma as a means of exhausting pain follows.
7 See § 2 above.
8 Wandering philosophic teachers. Int. § 126; Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]; Ch. 8 *k* [1]; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 4 [1], 8 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481]; Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23]. See below §§ 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 29. Cp. Titthiyas (Ch. 9 *c*).
9 Int. § 126; see § 7 n above; also below §§ 10, 11. The context shows that the Moranivāpa was a space on the outskirts of the city and within the walls, but whether within the old or the new city is not decisively shown. The Wanderers' *ārāma* appears to have existed before the gift of the Veḷuvana to the Buddha; and Buddha apparently stayed here before the Veḷuvana *vihāra* was built (see § 4 above). Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237] n.
10 Or, in the morning (early). Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 3 [237], 9 [481]; Ch. 23 *a* [7]. See Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 4 [1].
11 Ch. 8 *k* [1]; see § 15 below. Similar phrases are used of other visits; Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481] (*welcome*); Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [2].
12 A discussion on asceticism follows.
13 Int. § 126. See § 9 above. The text is repeated in the Elevens of *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, v, p. 326). Gotama and his followers availed themselves of this resthouse as did the *paribbājakas*.
14 A discourse on *sīla*, *samādhi*, and *paññā* follows; Ch. 20 § 8 n.
15 See § 6 above.

And at that time Nigrodha[1] the Wanderer[2] (*paribbājako*) was dwelling in the Wanderers' Garden[3] of Udumbarika[4] (*Udumbarikāya paribbājak-ārāme*) with a great company,[5] three thousand Wanderers. And Sandhāna the householder came out from Rājagaha day by day to see the Blessed One. . . . Then Sandhāna the householder went . . . to where Nigrodha the Wanderer was. . . . [6] Then the Blessed One descended from the Gijjhakūṭa hill and drew near to where the Moranivāpa[6] was on the bank of the Sumāgadhā[7] and having drawn near he walked to and fro on the bank of the Sumāgadhā in the Moranivāpa in the open air. And Nigrodha the Wanderer saw the Blessed One walking to and fro on the bank of the Sumāgadhā in the Moranivāpa in the open air, and having seen him directed his company saying: '. . . This venerable man (*āyasmā*) is desirous of quiet. . . . Surely he, seeing this company quiet, may think it worthy of being approached. . . .' [7] Then the Blessed One drew near to where Nigrodha the Wanderer was, and Nigrodha the Wanderer spoke to the Blessed One saying 'Let the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*)[8] come, revered sir; welcome, revered sir, to the Blessed One!' . . .[9]

§ 12. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 35), Sutta 69 (Upasena). (PTS, iv, p. 40.)*

[1] At one time the venerable Sāriputta[10] and the venerable Upasena[11] stayed at Rājagaha at the Sīta-Grove,[12] in the hill-cave of the Serpent's-Pool[13] (*Sappa-soṇḍika-pabbhāre*). [2] And at that time a deadly disease[14] fell upon the body of the venerable Upasena. [3] . . .[15] [8] Then the mendicant brothers having laid the body of the venerable Upasena upon a bed-frame (*mañcakaṃ*)[16] bore it outside. [9]

[1] Ap. G 2 *c*. Nigrodha is mentioned also in *Dīgha-Nik.*, 8 (PTS, i, p. 176).

[2] Int. § 178; see § 9 above.

[3] Int. § 126. See [6] below (*Moranivāpa*); cp. § 15 [1] below; Ch. 7 *a* § 10.

[4] Udumbarikā is called Queen in *Dialogues of the Buddha* (iii, p. 52). Udumbara is the name of a place (CV, XII. i. 9). Cp. 'the Vedehi (queen-)consort' (Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [1] n). See also Int. § 168.

[5] Cp. Ch. 7 *a* §§ 5 [1], 18 [1].

[6] See § 9 above. The context shows that this either was the same as Udumbarikā's Garden (see [1] above) or adjoined it.

[7] This was a lotus-pond (*pokkharinī*); *Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 447. Cp. § 16 n below; Ch. 5 *a* § 6; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1].

[8] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9]. The title *Bhagavat* is courteously used by an opponent.

[9] A discussion on asceticism follows, with Gotama's authoritative declaration (*sīha-nāda*, PTS, iii, p. 57; Ch. 10 *c* [1] 8) in favour of ethical purity. Finally Gotama returns to Gijjhakūṭa through the air; Int. § 94 (iii); and Ch. 13 *b* § 6 [1].

[10] See § 6 above.

[11] See Ch. 10 *c* (26).

[12] See § 3 above.

[13] Or, on the Snake-Pool declivity. Int. § 129. See below §§ 24 (5), 25 [43].

[14] Or, snake; but the context bears out this, the usual rendering of *āsīvisa*.

[15] The text states that Upasena had overcome all egoism, selfishness, and inclination to pride, *ahaṃkāra-mamaṃkāra-mānānusaya* (Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 1; Ap. E *c* i § 7 [3]; see § 17 n below; also Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n, and Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228] n), and any thought that the body or faculties (*indriyāni*) were 'I' or 'mine' (Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]; see Int. § 3, *non-egoism*). The step to Mahāyānism is short (Ap. D *b*).

[16] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [2]. See below § 20.

Then the body of the venerable Upasena there dissolved as if it were a handful of chaff.

§ 13. *Aṅguttara-Nikaya, Navaka-nipāta (the Nines), Sutta 8. (PTS, iv, p. 371.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha on the Vulture-peak[1] hill. Then Sajjha[2] the Wanderer[3] drew near to where the Blessed One was and . . . spoke thus: [2] 'At one time, revered sir (*bhante*), the Blessed One was staying here at Rājagaha, in Giribbaja[4] (*Rājagahe, Giribbaje*). There, revered sir, I heard and received from the mouth[5] of the Blessed One that whatsoever Bhikkhu is an Arahat (*arahaṃ*)[6] . . . liberated by perfect knowledge, cannot disregard five things. . . .'[7] [3] 'I said so formerly, Sajjha', he replied, 'and now I say so.' . . .[8]

§ 14. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 74 (Dīghanakha-S.).*

[PTS, i, p. 497.] The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha on the Vulture-peak[9] hill at Sūkarakhatā[10] (*Sūkarakhatāyaṃ*). Then Dīghanakha[11] the Wanderer[12] drew near to where the Blessed One was . . . and stood beside him. . . .[13] [p. 500] And at that time the venerable Sāriputta[14] was standing behind the Blessed One fanning[15] him. . . .

[1] See § 6 above. [2] Ap. G 2 *c*. [3] See § 9 above.

[4] Int. § 128 n; Ch. 7 *c* § 1. The same phrase is used by another *paribbājaka* in the preceding Sutta (PTS, iv, p. 369). Giri-bbaja (Hill-girt) was the ancient city surrounded by hills, of which the northern range separates it from Rājagaha (King's-house), Bimbisāra's palace-fortress. The visible site of the latter does not suggest a large city and it may have been occupied by the king's entourage only, whilst the poorer population may have remained in the ancient city. The name Rājagaha is used strictly, and perhaps almost invariably, for Bimbisāra's new town, but the present passage shows that it is extended sometimes to include the older city. Compare the *Pabbajjā-sutta* of the *Sutta-Nipāta*: 'The Buddha went to Rājagaha; Giribbaja of the Magadhas he visited for alms . . . Bimbisāra, standing on his storied house (*pāsādasmim*), saw him . . .' which verses do not represent clearly whether this palace was within or outside the ancient city; Ch. 3 § 3.

[5] Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [4]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42]. [6] Ap. D *c*.

[7] The first four prohibitions (Ap. H 2 *c*) and the fault of acquisitiveness (cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3], *cajoles*; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3], *covetousness*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2], *covetousness*) are then specified.

[8] To the previous five points are now added disregard for the Buddha, for the Dhamma, for the Saṃgha, and for the training (*sikkhā*; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1]; Ap. H 1 § 3); cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2] n. These four points have the appearance of a monkish addition to make up the required number of the nine vices (Ap. F 2 n).

[9] See § 6 above.

[10] Int. § 130. Also *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS) v, 233. This may have been near the foot of the northern slope.

[11] Ap. G 2 *c*. He is called also Aggivessana (see § 29 n below), which name is given to Saccaka the Nigaṇṭha-putta in *Majjh.* 35 and 36 (Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]). The commentary on *Theragāthā*, cclix, states that he was Sāriputta's sister's son. (Mrs. Rhys Davids's *Psalms of the Brethren*, pp. 341–2.)

[12] See § 9 above.

[13] In the discussion which follows Gotama expounds the transience of the body and of the sensations of pleasure, pain, and indifference. (Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [39]; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28].)

[14] Int. § 30; Ch. 7 *a* § 16 (month), § 20 (*dhamma-cakkhu*). Sāriputta now attains liberation from the 'taints' on realizing the transience of all sensations. Dīghanakha acquires the clear vision of the Law (*dhamma-cakkhu*) and becomes a lay-disciple (Ch. 8 *l*). Here liberation from sinful desires is a higher stage than clear vision.

[15] Int. § 190 (*fans*).

§ 15. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta (the Fours), Sutta 30. (PTS, ii, p. 29.)*

[1] 'The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha on the Vulture-peak[1] hill. At that time many very well-known Wanderers[2] were dwelling on the bank of the Sappinī[3] in the Wanderers' Garden,[4] namely Annabhāra, Varadhara, and Sakuludāy[5] in the *paribbājaka* and other well-known Wanderers. Then the Blessed One in the evening having arisen from quiet [contemplation][6] went to the bank of the Sappinī to the Wanderers' Garden, and having arrived he sat down on the seat arranged.[7] . . .[8]

§ 16. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 96. (PTS, v, p. 196.)*

[1] At one time the venerable Ānanda[9] stayed at Rājagaha in the Tapoda-Garden[10] (*Tapod-ārāme*). And the venerable Ānanda having risen in the night as dawn[11] approached went to Tapodā to bathe his limbs . . . and having got out stood in one robe. . . . Kokanuda[12] the *paribbājaka*[13] also . . . went to Tapodā to bathe his limbs . . . and seeing Ānanda spoke to him. . . .[14]

§ 17. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 35), Sutta 159 (Jīvakambavane). (PTS, iv, pp. 143–4.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha in Jīvaka's[15] mangogrove (*Jīvak-ambavane*).[16] [2] Then the Blessed One instructed

[1] See § 6 above. [2] See § 9 above.

[3] Int. § 130. Also MV, II. xii. 1 (Commentary, SBE, xiii, p. 254); *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS) i, p. 153; *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 176. The Sappinikā river (*nadī*) is mentioned in *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 109 (*Parājika* IV. ix. 6). The Sappinī river is apparently the stream flowing through the valley of old Rājagaha into the northern plain.

[4] Cp. § 11 [1] above. The various Wanderers' Gardens at Rājagaha may have been adjacent or may have formed parts of one whole.

[5] See § 9 above; Ap. G 2 *c*. These three wandering philosophers are mentioned again in *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 176. [6] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

[7] Or, appointed. Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [4]; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 3 [237], 9 [481].

[8] Buddha here explains the four *dhamma-padāni*, footsteps or roads to the *dhamma* (cp. Ap. B *a* § 7), namely uncovetousness (*an-abhijjhā*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2]), no hostility (*a-vyāpada*; Ap. D *a* § 8, ii, 5th fetter), right self-knowledge (*sammā-sati*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]), and right self-transcendence (*sammā-samādhi*; Ap. F 2 *d*). These four are plainly the opposites of the Three Fires (Ap. D a § 10). In the Fours also (*Saṃ. Nik.* ii, pp. 176–7) Gotama explains to the same audience on the same spot the four *Brāhmaṇa-saccāni* (sacred truths) of impersonality.

[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 3.

[10] Cp. Int. § 139 (*the Jetavana*). See below §§ 24 (9), 25 [43]. Also *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 8; *Vin. Piṭ.* iv, p. 116 (*Pācittiya* rules 57). In *Pārājika* IV. ix. 4 (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 108) Tapodā is termed a lake (*daha*) of clear water, full of fish and turtles, with steps (*su-patittha*; Ch. 11 *a* § 1) and lotuses; cp. § 11 [6] above.

[11] Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]. [12] Ap. G 2 *c*. [13] See § 9 above.

[14] The philosopher poses the usual metaphysical puzzles, which Buddha and his disciples refuse to solve; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii). [15] Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [1]; see § 23 below.

[16] Int. § 130. See below §§ 24 (10), 25 [43]. Also *Majjh.* 55 and *Aṅg. Nik.* 'Eights' (PTS, iv, p. 222), where Jīvaka the physician questions Buddha regarding the eating of meat and on the duties of a layman respectively; in the former his conversion is recorded.

the mendicant brothers. 'Bhikkhus,' he said; 'Venerable Sir (*bhadante*),'[1] they replied hearkening to the Blessed One. [3] 'Cultivate self-transcendence[2] (*samādhiṃ*), Bhikkhus,' he said; 'when a Bhikkhu has transcended self,[3] he is completely at rest (*yathābhūtam okkhāyati*). . . .'[4]

§ 18. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 22), *Sutta 88* (*Assaji*). (*PTS, iii, p. 124.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[5] at Kalandakanivāpa. [2] And at that time the venerable Assaji[6] was staying in the Kassapaka-Garden (*Kassapak-ārāme*),[7] ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted. [3] Then the venerable Assaji instructed his attendants (*upaṭṭhāke*)[8] saying: 'Go, friends (*āvuso*), to the Blessed One and . . . speaking for me salute[9] the feet of the Blessed One with the forehead (*sirasā*), and say "It would indeed be good, revered sir, if the Blessed One would come to the *bhikkhu* Assaji out of compassion." ' . . .[10]

§ 19. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 140* (*Dhātu-vibhaṅga-S.*).[11]

[PTS, iii, p. 237] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Magadhas[12] came to Rājagaha. He drew near to where Bhaggava[13] the potter (*kumbhakāro*)[14] was and . . . said 'If it is not inconvenient to thee, Bhaggava, I will stay in the house for the night.'[15] 'Indeed it is not inconvenient to me, revered sir[16] (*bhante*),' he replied; 'there is also here a celibate (*pabbajito*)[17] who has kept his first retreat[18] and if he

[1] Ch. 15 *a* § 8; and Int. § 190 (*address*). See Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 2 [261], 4 [2].

[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. Literally, 'com-posure'. In the Threes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, i, p. 132) the acquiring of *samādhi* is marked by the absence of 'egoism, selfishness, the sickness of conceit (*ahaṃkāra-mamaṃkāra-mānānusaya*)'; see above § 12 [3] n.

[3] Literally, is composed (*samāhita*).

[4] He speaks of every part of individuality as transient (*anicca*; Ap. E *a*, i). In the next discourse (Sutta 160), to the same audience on the same spot in the same terms, he speaks of union (*yoga*, harmony; Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*) in quietude (*paṭisallāne*; Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2]).

[5] See § 2 above.

[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 9; Ch. 7 *a* § 16. Also *Majjh.* 35 (PTS, i, p. 227). There is no reason to associate him with the troublesome monk Assaji mentioned in *Vin. Piṭ.* ii, pp. 9, 171, iii, p. 179, and *Majjh.* 70.

[7] Int. § 130. The place is not mentioned elsewhere in *Vin. Piṭ.* or the first four Nikāyas. After which Kassapa the garden was called can scarcely be decided.

[8] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1] (*ministering*).

[9] Ch. 6 *b* § 2; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91]; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [5]; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [258]; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 12 [22]; Ch. 22 *c* § 7 [22]. See § 20 [3] below.

[10] In the evening Buddha visits Assaji and speaks to him of the transience of body and sensations. He says that realizing this transience one comes to know that there is nothing beyond this existence' (*nāparam itthattāya*; Ch. 4 § 17), and compares individual life (*jīvita*; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73]) with a lamp which is lit and burns itself out (Ap. B *b* § 2, *light*; cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 4, *fire*).

[11] Ap. C *b* § 5.

[12] Ch. 3 § 5 [166].

[13] Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1].

[14] Ch. 22 *e* § 10; and Int. § 189 (*trade*)

[15] Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1].

[16] The context shows that the potter did not recognize Buddha. Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9]

[17] Ch. 1 § 9 [59].

[18] *Vāsa* (residence), i.e. retirement for the period of the rainy-season or *vassa* (Ch. 8 *c*).

permits, revered sir, stay as long as it is thy pleasure.' . . . [p. 238] Now a clansman (*kulaputto*) Pukkusāti[1] by name out of faith in the Blessed One had gone forth from the household to the homeless life. He then had kept his first retreat in the house of the potter. Then the Blessed One . . . said: 'If it is not inconvenient to thee, Bhikkhu, I will stay in the house for the night.' 'The potter's house,[2] friend (*āvuso*), is spacious,' he replied; 'stay, venerable sir (*āyasmā*), as long as it is thy pleasure.' . . .[3]

§ 20. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 22*), *Sutta 87* (*Vakkali*). (*PTS, iii, p. 119.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[4] at Kalandakanivāpa. [2] And at that time the venerable Vakkali[5] was staying in the potter's house,[6] ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted.[7] [3] Then the venerable Vakkali instructed his attendants saying: 'Go, friends, to the Blessed One and . . .[8] say "Would the Blessed One come to the *bhikkhu* Vakkali out of compassion." ' . . . [5] The Blessed One consented by his silence.[9] [6] . . .[10] [17] The Blessed One . . . having instructed the venerable Vakkali rose from his seat and returned to the Gijjhakūṭa hill.[11] [18] Then the venerable Vakkali not long after the Blessed One had gone instructed his attendants saying: 'Come, friends, lay me upon a bed-frame[12] and go to where the Black Rock[13] is on the slope of the Seers'-mountain[14] (*Isigilipassa-kālasilā*). How should such a one as I think it fitting to die within a house?' . . .[15]

§ 21. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta* (*the Fours*), *Sutta 35.* (*PTS, ii, p. 35.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[16] at Kalandakanivāpa.[17] And Vassakāra[18] the Brāhman,[19] the Magadha[20] chief-minister[21] (*Magadha-mahā-matto*), drew near to

[1] Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*).
[2] Int. § 130. The house may well have been in the old city.
[3] Buddha's questions and instruction regarding the highest knowledge follow, and he is recognized.
[4] See § 2 above.
[5] Ch. 10 *c* (21).
[6] Int. § 130.
[7] Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [4].
[8] As in § 18 [3] above.
[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 9.
[10] Buddha at once visits Vakkali and speaks to him of the transience of individuality and of the conviction that there is nothing beyond this existence (Ch. 4 § 17).
[11] i.e. to the Veḷuvana. See above § 7 [1] n.
[12] See above § 12.
[13] See above § 8.
[14] Int. § 128.
[15] Omitting the death or suicide (see above § 6 [263] n) of Vakkali and the statement attributed to Buddha, that Māra (Int. § 93, iv) in the darkness was seeking vainly for the soul (*viññāna*, Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [41]; Ap. E *a* ii § 2; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]), which was without place (*a-patitthita*), he being extinguished (*pari-nibbuta*, Ap. C *b*, *Note*).
[16] See § 2 above.
[17] Int. § 126.
[18] Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1].
[19] Int. § 172; Ch. 23 *a* [7] n.
[20] Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 8.
[21] Ch. 8 *k* [8]. Cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [iv].

where the Blessed One was . . . and sitting beside him addressed the Blessed One. . . .[1]

§ 22. *Vinaya-Piṭ a, Mahā-vagga, V, i.*

[1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Rājagaha on the Vulture-peak hill.[2] . . . [3] Then the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra[3] instructed the . . . [village] overseers[4] and dismissed them saying . . . 'You now have been directed by me on matters of this world . . . the Blessed One verily will direct you on matters beyond.' . . . [7] Then the . . . overseers drew near to where the Blessed One was. . . . [9] And the Blessed One . . . addressed to them . . . the graduated discourse. . . .[5] Then he made clear to them the special[6] (*sām-ukkaṃsikā*) religious teaching[7] (*dhamma-desanā*) of the Buddhas[8]—sorrow, origination, cessation, the path (*maggaṃ*).[9] . . .[10] There arose in them as they sat there the stainless clear vision of the Law (*dhamma-cakkhuṃ*).[11] 'Whatsoever has by nature an origin has by nature an end.'[12] [10] . . .[13]

§ 23. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 2 (Sāmaññaphala-S.).*[14]

[1] Thus was it heard by me. At one time the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the mango-grove of Jīvaka Komārabhacca[15] with a great company of Bhikkhus. . . .[16] At that time the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu,[17] the son of the Videhan consort[18] (*Vedehi-putto*),[19] on Uposatha-day[20] (*tadahu'-posathe*), the fifteenth of the fourth month at the time of the Lotus-moon (*Komudiyā*)[21] in the midst of the full-moon night, went to the roof of the palace[22] and sat there surrounded by the

[1] The discussion which follows is on great wise men. In Suttas 183 and 187 the minister returns and discusses harmful talk and how to distinguish good men from bad. In the latter of these mention is made of an Eleyya Rāja (cp. Eḷu, Int. § 21 n), who may have preceded King Bimbisāra (Int. § 168), and of Rāma-putta who may have been Gotama's early teacher (Ch. 3 § 4 [66]), and of his opponent the Todeyya-Brāhman (Ap. G 2 *c* § 2, i).

[2] See § 6 above.

[3] See § 2 above. Ch. 8 *a* [2]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [1].

[4] See Ch. 11 *a* § 4.

[5] As in Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [9].

[6] Or exalted. IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*). 'Principal', SBE, xiii, p. 104. 'Special', SBE, xvii, p. 4.

[7] Ap. G 1 *b*.

[8] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[10] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6].

[11] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29].

[12] i.e. the One alone is eternal. This is the message of the Second Sermon (Ch. 5 *c*) completing that of the First on the Four Truths.

[13] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[14] Ch. 19 *c* § 2; Ch. 23 *b* § 8 (ii); Ap. G 2 *c* § 3. Cp. Ap. D *c* § 4 [*a*] n (*phala*). A discourse on the Effects of Devotion; cp. Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2] (*samaṇa*).

[15] The physician. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 n; see § 17 above.

[16] The number is stated as 1250. Ch. 15 *a* § 12; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [1]; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [1].

[17] Int. § 166.

[18] Of Bimbisāra (Int. § 168).

[19] Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3]. The Videhan clan belonged to the Vajjian Confederacy; its capital was Mithilā: Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *e* § 13; see RDBI, pp. 26, 37. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 23 n (*Sāriputta*); Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83] (*Avanti-putta*).

[20] Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1].

[21] The midsummer moon; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79] n. Cp. Ch. 1 § 3. *Kumuda* means the white lotus. See Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n.

[22] Ch. 3 § 1. Cp. Ch. 2 § 2.

courtiers.[1] Then the king . . . exclaimed 'Truly delightful is this brilliant night, truly lovely . . . truly beautiful . . . truly resplendent . . . and auspicious is this brilliant night! What devotee or Brāhman (*samaṇaṃ vā brāhmaṇaṃ vā*)[2] should we visit this day so that the mind (*cittaṃ*) of him who listens may be illumined?' [2–7] . . .[3] [8] Then the king . . . said to Jīvaka Komārabhacca: 'Why art thou silent, friend (*samma*)[4] Jīvaka?' 'My lord (*deva*),'[5] he replied, 'the Blessed One, saint and all-enlightened, is staying in my mango-grove. . . . Let my lord visit the Blessed One. Well may the mind of my lord listening to him be illumined.' 'Then, friend Jīvaka, have riding-elephants made ready.' [9] . . . Then the king . . . causing all the court ladies[6] to mount on five hundred female elephants[7] mounted his riding-elephant and was conducted out of Rājagaha by uplifted torches, and with much royal state set out for Jīvaka Komārabhacca's mango-grove. [10] . . . [11] Then the king . . . having ridden as far as it was permissible[8] for the elephant dismounted and on foot approached the door of the circular hall[9] (*maṇḍala-māḷassa dvāraṃ*). . . .[10]

§ 24. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, IV, iv, 4.*[11]

[4] . . .[12] The Bhikkhus arriving . . . having approached the venerable Dabba Mallaputta[13] said 'Allot lodgings (*senāsanaṃ*) to us, friend Dabba.' The venerable Dabba Mallaputta said to them 'Where, venerable sirs, do you wish them; where should I allot them?' They . . . indicated [places] at a distance [from each other] saying:

(1) 'Allot us a lodging, friend Dabba, on the Gijjhakūṭa;[14]
(2) . . . at the Robbers' cliff[15] (*Cora-papāte*);
(3) . . . on the slope of the Seers' mountain[16] (*Isi-gili-passe*), at the Black Rock[17] (*Kāla-silāyaṃ*);

[1] Companions or ministers; the word used is *rāj-āmaccā*; Int. § 172; cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 3 (*mitt'-āmaccā*); Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18]. See Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [1].
[2] Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
[3] The courtiers recommend Purana Kassapa, Makkhali-Gosāla, Ajita Kesakambala, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya Belaṭṭhi-putta, and Nigaṇṭha Nāta-putta; Ch. 9 *c* (*Tiṭṭhiyas*). This scene, if historical, implies that the Magadhan court had not yet perceived the Buddha's pre-eminence.
[4] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].
[5] Ch. 1 § 5; Ch. 3 § 1; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18]; Ch. 19 *b* § 5; Ap. B *b* § 1; and Int. § 190 (*address*). Cp. Ch. 1 § 3 (*devī*). Ch. 15 *a* § 2 (*deva*).
[6] Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1].
[7] Cp. Int. § 189 (*transport*), § 190 (*vehicles*); Ch. 10 *b* § 3 (*retinue*).
[8] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [13].
[9] The *maṇḍala-māla* was a space set aside for assemblies. Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 9; Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2]; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [2]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [11] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 2; and Int. § 190 (*buildings*). Cp. Ch. 8 *f* § 4; cp. also Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [161] (*bahi-dvāra-kotthake*).
[10] The passage is continued in Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [13]. See also Int. § 170 (*teaching*).
[11] Int. § 131. This passage is found also in the *Saṃghādisesa* rules (viii. 4) in *Vin. Piṭ.* (iii, p. 159).
[12] Dabba has been appointed controller of the lodgings of the Bhikkhus in Rājagaha; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2]. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [22] and Ch. 23 *b* § 6 n.
[13] Ch. 10 *c* (27).
[14] See § 6 above.
[15] Int. § 130.
[16] Int. § 128.
[17] See § 8 above.

(4) . . . on the slope of Vebhāra[1] (*Vebhāra-passe*), in the Sattapaṇṇi cave[2] (*Sattapaṇṇi-guhāyam*);
(5) . . . in the Sīta grove[3] (*Sīta-vane*), by the Serpent-pool-steep[4] (*Sappa-soṇḍika-pabbhāre*);
(6) . . . in the Gomata grotto[5] (*Gomata-kandarāyaṃ*);
(7) . . . in the Tinduka-tree grotto[6] (*Tinduka-kandarāyaṃ*);
(8) . . . in the Tapoda grotto[7] (*Tapoda-kandarāyaṃ*);
(9) . . . in the Tapoda garden[8] (*Tapod-ārāme*);
( ) . . . in Jīvaka's mango-grove;'[9]
( ) . . . [and others said] 'Allot us a lodging at Maddakucchi[10] in the deer-park[11] (*Maddakucchismiṃ miga-dāye*)'. . . . [12] .

§ 25. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16* (*Mahā-parinibbāna-S.*) *iii, 43.*[13]

[43] . . .[14] Delightful,[15] Ānanda, is Rājagaha—delightful is the Gijjhakūṭa hill,[16] delightful the Gotama banyan-tree (*Gotama-nigrodho*),[17] delightful the Robbers' cliff,[18] delightful the Sattapaṇṇi cave[19] on the slope of Vebhāra,[20] delightful the Black Rock[21] on the slope of Isigili,[22] delightful the Snake-pool-steep[23] in the Sīta grove[24] (*Sīta-vane Sappa-soṇḍika pabbhāro*), delightful the Tapoda-garden,[25] delight-

[1] Int. § 128. See § 25 [43] below.
[2] Int. § 129.
[3] Int. § 130.
[4] See § 12 above.
[5] Int. § 129.
[6] Int. § 129. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1].
[7] Int. § 130. 'Tapoda Ghāt', SBE, xx, p. 7.
[8] Int. § 130. See § 16 above, § 25 [43] below.
[9] Int. § 130. See § 17 [1] above.
[10] Int. § 130.
[11] Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171].
[12] Omitting Dabba's miraculous powers over the element of light (*tejo-dhātu*). Int. § 94 (iv); cp. Ch. 10 *c* (45).
[13] Int. §§ 131, 133; Ch. 21 § 12 n [41–7].
[14] In a passage heightened by an interview with Māra (Int. § 93, iv) and by an innocuous but miraculous earthquake (Int. § 94, i; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n; Ap. B *c* § 1, 1, *quaked*; also Int. § 189), Buddha is represented as stating that he will die within three months and that Ānanda is to blame for not having used many opportunities at different places to persuade Buddha to live on to the end of the era (Int. § 107, *kappa*; Ch. 23 *b* § 9 n). This unlikely avoidance of responsibility by the Leader dates the present passage, which may be attributed to later commentarial anxiety to reconcile the death of Buddha with his divinity. IN 6 (*Canon*); Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2] n; cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 6 [21] n.
[15] Ch. 3 § 5 [167]; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [161].
[16] See § 6 above.
[17] In [42] we have '*Nigrodh-ārāma*' (Nigrodha garden). See Int. § 136; Ch. 13 *c* § 18.
[18] Int. § 130.
[19] Int. § 129.
[20] See § 24 (4) above. Vebhāra is mentioned along with Paṇḍava (Int. § 128; Ch. 3 § 2) in *Theragāthā*, xli. These are 'Two of the five crests in the group of hill ranges rising above Rājagaha (Rājgir); the former name persists as Baibhāra or Vaibhāra, which rises to the East', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 45.
[21] See § 8 above.
[22] Int. § 128.
[23] Or, Snake-pool hill-cave. See § 12 above.
[24] Int. § 130.
[25] See above §§ 16, 24 (9). In *Majjh. Nik.* 133 it is stated that Gotama stayed in the Tapoda Garden and that the venerable Samiddhi (§ 29 below) went there at night and having bathed his limbs in Tapoda (*Tapode gattāni parisiñcitvā*) perceived a spirit which filled the place with light. In *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 8, the name is Tapodā.

ful the Kalandaka-nivāpa[1] at the Veḷuvana[2] (*Veḷuvane*), delightful the Jīvaka mango-grove,[3] delightful the deer-park at Maddakucchi[4] (*Maddakucchismiṃ miga-dāyo*). [44] . . .[5]

§ 26. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Anamatagga-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 15*), *Sutta 20* (*Vepulla-pabbata*). (*PTS, ii, p. 190.*)

[1] Once the Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha on the Gijjhakūṭa hill.[6] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the Bhikkhus. . . . [4] 'Long ago the designation of this Mount Vepula[7] (*imassa Vepulassa pabbatassa*) was Eastern-bamboo [ridge].[8] At that time, Bhikkhus, the designation of the folk was Tivarā. The life-span, Bhikkhus, of the Tivaran men was forty thousand years.[9] The Tivaran men, Bhikkhus, used to ascend the Eastern-bamboo hill (*pabbataṃ*) in four days and descend it in four days. [5] At that time, Bhikkhus, Kakusandha,[10] the Blessed One, saint and supremely enlightened, was in the world. . . .'[11]

§ 27. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Saṃyutta x, Sutta 1* (*Indaka*). (*PTS, i, p. 206.*)

[1] Once the Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha on the Inda-kūṭa[12]

[1] Int. § 126.

[2] Or, near the Veḷuvana; cp. § 1 above (*Rājagahe*), and Ch. 5 *b* § 10 (*Bārāṇasiyaṃ*); also Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] n. See § 2 above. The relation of these two places, usually both in the locative case, is difficult to determine.

[3] Int. § 130. See § 17 [1] above.

[4] Int. § 130. In the *Sagātha-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, pp. 27, 110) the Buddha is said to have been addressed in verse by tempting Spirits and Māra (Int. §§ 69 and 93, iv) severally, whilst he was staying here in the deer-park at or near Rājagaha (*Rājagahe*). The texts suggest that it was in the plain near the new city.

[5] Omitting a statement that he who has mastered the four paths to *iddhi* (*iddhi-pādā*; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]) may live if he wishes till the end of the cycle (*kappa*), and that the Tathāgata had so mastered them. On the irrelevancy of this passage and its inconsistency with the context see SBE, xi, p. 59 n.

[6] See § 6 above.

[7] Int. § 128. In two previous Suttas (PTS, i, p. 67, ii, p. 185) Vipula or Vepulla is mentioned as the chief of the hills of Rājagaha. This may be because it was the highest or because the Veḷuvana *vihāra* was situated upon it. The present passage implies that the Vulture-peak was either near or on Mount Vepulla (Great, Abundant), cp. *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 185, *uttaro Gijjhakūṭassa Magadhānaṃ giribbaje*. The tradition that it had formerly been called the Eastern Mountain seems to indicate that it was the most easterly height of the northern range, and as this position is attributed to Vebhāra it seems possible that the two names are given to the same hill.

[8] 'To this Mount Vipula the name East Ridge was given', Mrs. Rhys Davids's *Book of Kindred Sayings*.

[9] Ch. 1 § 1 n.

[10] The 22nd named Buddha. The names of 24 Previous Buddhas were discovered before the *Buddhavaṃsa* was written. Those of the last three (Ap. A 2 *c*, 18) were perhaps known to the reactionary schismatic Devadatta (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*), wh[illegible] was influenced by Jain traditions.

[11] Omitting the statement that Kakusandha had a pair of distinguished disciples called Vidhura and Sajīva (cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 23) and other similar information regarding *saṃsāra* (Ap. B).

[12] Int. § 128; cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [1]. As the hill was haunted it was doubtless remote from the city; cp. § 7 above.

hill (*Indakūṭe pabbate*), the abode of Indaka *yakkha*.[1] [2] And Indaka *yakkha* . . . addressed the Blessed One in verse[2] (*gāthāya*). . . .

§ 28. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Bojjhanga-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 46), *Sutta 14* (*Gilāna 1*). (*PTS. v, p. 79.*)

[1] Once the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[3] at Kalandakanivāpa. [2] And at that time the venerable Mahā-Kassapa[4] was staying in the Pipphali-cave[5] (*Pipphaḷī-guhāyaṃ*), ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted. [3] And the Blessed One in the evening . . . went to where Mahā-Kassapa was. . . .[6]

§ 29. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 136* (*Mahā-kammavibhaṅga-S.*).

[PTS, iii, p. 207] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[7] at Kalandakanivāpa. And at that time the venerable Samiddhi[8] was dwelling in a forest-hut[9] (*arañña-kuṭikāya*). And Potaliputta[10] the Wanderer[11] whilst roaming[12] and wandering on foot came to where the venerable Samiddhi was and said: 'From his own mouth,[13] friend Samiddhi, I have taken this saying of the devotee Gotama; "Doing[14] (*kāya-kammaṃ*) is vain, speech[15] (*vacī-kammaṃ*) is vain, what is thought[16] (*mano-kammaṃ*) is true (*saccaṃ*). . . ." ' 'Friend Potaliputta,' he replied, 'do not misrepresent the Blessed One.' . . . Then the venerable Samiddhi went to where the venerable Ānanda[17] was . . . and the venerable Ānanda and the venerable Samiddhi went to the Blessed One. . . .[18]

[1] 'An Indaka ogre', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Book of Kindred Sayings*. Int. § 93 (vii) n. Cp. Int. § 93, iii (*Indra*); Ch. 11 *d* § 12. In the next Sutta a *yakkha* called Sakka (Int. § 69) addresses Buddha.

[2] The prose setting was doubtless written to fit the ballad verses which follow; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*. The subject is the origin of individual life (*jīva*), Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1). The explanation is purely naturalistic (cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [2] n).

[3] See § 2 above.

[4] Ch. 10 *c* (4); Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [73].

[5] Int. § 129; cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 11 n. Another minor cave, unnamed, is mentioned in MV, VI. xv. 1. Groups of such caves, still occupied by recluses, are to be seen in the cliff opposite Akbar's fort at the junction of the Ganges and Jumna.

[6] He speaks of the Seven Parts of Wisdom; Ch. 9 *a* § 8.

[7] See § 2 above.

[8] See § 25 [43] n above; Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*). Mentioned also in *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, p. 385) and frequently in *Saṃ. Nik.*

[9] Int. § 130; Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [1]; Ch. 13 *e* §§ 1 [1], 2 [1]; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [1]; also Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1]; cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2]. In Sutta 125 Aciravata, a novice (*samaṇuddesa*; Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [244]; Ch. 8 *i*, *Juniors*), is said to have occupied such a hut near Rājagaha and to have been visited by Prince Jayasena (Int. § 168; also Sutta 125). The novice is addressed as *Aggivessana* (see § 14 n above), a title by which in the *Samaññaphala-Sutta* King Ajātasattu addresses the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [29]; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]).

[10] Ap. G 2 *c*.

[11] See § 9 above.

[12] Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237].

[13] Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2].

[14] Literally, action by the body. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6].

[15] Action by speech.

[16] Action by the mind. Cp. Ap. D *b* § 3 (*No doer*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*illusion*).

[17] Ap. A 2 *b* (68).

[18] Buddha is represented as saying that he teaches responsibility and retribution (*vipāka*) in this life (*diṭṭhe va dhamme*) and otherwise, in states of well-being and suffering, with mention of *sagga* (Ap. C *a* § 2) and *nirāya* (Ap. B *a* § 7), which possibly are exegetical additions. He may consistently have said that deeds, words, and thoughts have endless consequences of joy and sorrow to be experienced here

d. Visits to minor places in the Magadha country. Admission of Mahā-Kassapa

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VIII, xii.*[1]

[1] And the Blessed One having stayed at Rājagaha as long as he wished proceeded towards Dakkhinā-giri.[2] And the Blessed One saw the Magadhan arable-land (*Magadha-khettaṃ*)[3] divided into lines, arranged in rows, with boundaries[4] and grouped in squares,[5] and pointing them out directed the venerable Ānanda[6] saying '. . . Canst thou, Ānanda, make up robes of such a kind for the Bhikkhus?' 'I can, Blessed One,' he replied. . . . And the venerable Ānanda made up robes of such a kind for many Bhikkhus.

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Brāhmana-Saṃyutta (Saṃ. vii), Sutta 11 (Kasi).*[7] *(PTS, i, p. 172.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying among the Magadhans in Dakkhiṇāgiri,[8] at Ekanālā,[9] a Brāhman village (*Brāhmaṇa-gāme*).[10] [2] And at that time the five hundred ploughs[11] of the Brāhman[12] farmer Bhāradvāja[13] (*kasi-bhāradvājassa*) were yoked in the sowing-season (*vappa-kāle*). [3] And the Blessed One in the morning . . . drew near to where the work[14] of the Brāhman farmer Bhāradvāja was. [4] At that time the farmer's distribution [of food][15] was proceeding.

and hereafter by succeeding generations (Ap. B *b* § 1, *hereafter*). Sutta 135 states that men depend for their condition of life on their own action (*kamma-ssakā sattā*) and on other forms of *kamma* (Ap. B *a*); but with dubious additions to the original theory (cp. Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 129).

[1] Ch. 8 *j* § 3.

[2] The Southern Mountain or, more correctly, mountainous region (see § 2 below; Int. § 132). Visits to Dakkhiṇāgiri by Gotama are mentioned also in MV, I. liii; by Sāriputta in *Majjh.* 97 (PTS, ii, p. 184); by Sāriputta and Moggallāna in *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, p. 63); by Ānanda in *Saṃ. Nik.* (ii, p. 217); and by Purāna in CV, XI. i. 11. The phrase 'touring' (*cārikaṃ caramāno*) is used in some of these passages, showing that the region was extensive.

[3] Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1] n.

[4] The mud divisions which regulate the flooding of rice-fields. Int. § 189 (*land*); cp. *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 239 (*Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 219).

[5] 'Divided into short pieces, and in rows, and by outside boundaries (or ridges), and by cross boundaries', SBE, xvii, pp. 207–8, where Buddhaghosha's commentarial explanations are given (Int. § 21).

[6] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].

[7] 'Tillage'. The narrative is repeated word for word in the *Sutta-Nipāta* (SBE, x, p. 11) with the addition of a miracle (IN 8 *b*) and of a concluding statement that Bhāradvāja became an Arahat, plainly intended to heighten the effect (IN 6, *Canon*).

[8] See § 1 above.

[9] Tradition identifies this with Nālā (RDB, p. 72; ThB, p. 117). See § 3 below; Ch. 10 *d* § 1, 11th year.

[10] Ch. 1 § 2.

[11] Ch. 1 § 7. For the conventional number cp. Int. § 121; Ch. 10 *a* § 1; Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [1]; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].

[12] Ch. 1 § 2 n; Ch. 23 *a* [7] n. He is spoken of solely as a farmer, though possibly some member of the family may have performed the sacrificial or magical rites required by the neighbourhood; Ap. A 2 *d* (*practices*).

[13] Int. § 30; Bhāradvāja was a common Brāhman clan (*gotta*) name; Ch. 10 *c* (8); Ch. 14 *f* §§ 15 [2], 16; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [1]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (1).

[14] Ch. 13 *c* § 6 [246].

[15] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]; and Int. § 190 (*food*). Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 8 (*hire*).

[5] And the Blessed One came to the distribution. . . . [6] The farmer saw the Blessed One standing for alms and seeing him said to the Blessed One: 'Now I, devotee (*samaṇa*), both plough and sow, and having ploughed and sown I eat. Thou also, devotee, shouldst plough and sow, and having ploughed and sown shouldst eat.' [7] 'I too, Brāhman, both plough and sow, and having ploughed and sown I eat.' [8] 'Truly we do not see the respected Gotama's (*bhoto Gotamassa*)[1] yoke, or plough, or ploughshare, or goad, or oxen.' . . .[2] [9] The Brāhman farmer addressed the Blessed One in verse:[3]

'A ploughman (*kassako*) thou declarest thyself; and yet I do not see thy tillage (*kasiṃ*).
Questioned as a ploughman explain how we should understand this tillage.'

[10] 'Belief (*saddhā*)[4] is the seed, self-rule (*tapo*)[5] is the rain, insight (*paññā*)[6] is my yoke and plough;
Meekness (*hiri*)[7] is the pole, the mind (*mano*)[8] is the yoke-tie; self-knowledge (*sati*)[9] is my share and goad.

Guarded in body, guarded in speech, abstinent in the eating of food,
I make truth (*saccaṃ*)[10] the reaping (*niddānaṃ*),[11] kindliness (*soraccaṃ*)[12] my rendering.[13]

Vigour (*viriyaṃ*)[14] is my burden-bearer carrying to the union that is peace;[15]
Not turning back it goes to where, when one has arrived, grief is not.

Thus is this tillage (*kasī*) tilled; its fruit is the deathless.[16]
Having tilled this tillage one is released from every sorrow.'

[11] 'Let the respected Gotama eat,' he said, 'he is a ploughman; the tillage which Gotama tills has the reward of immortality (*amatapphalaṃ*).'[17]

1 See [12] below.
2 Omitting repetition.
3 Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.
4 'Faith', SBE, x (*Sutta-Nipāta*), p. 12; ThB, p. 117. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 *n*; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]. The Sutta summarizes the essentials (IN 5 *b*) of early Buddhistic doctrine.
5 'Penance', SBE, x. Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] (*austerity*); Ap. B *b* § 3 [5] (*tapassitā*). Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3].
6 'Understanding', SBE, x. Ap. F 2 *a* (132).
7 Or, self-effacement. 'Modesty', SBE, x. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [91] n; Ch. 20 § 4 (2); Ch. 21 § 15 (5) n. Cp. *nekkhamma* (Ap. F 2 *a*, 126).
8 Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7].
9 'Thoughtfulness', SBE, x; 'Mindfulness', ThB, p. 117. Ap. F 2 *d* seventh division.
10 Ap. F 2 *a* (147).
11 'To cut away (weeds)', SBE, x; 'my hoe to cut away', ThB.
12 'Tenderness', SBE, x. Cp. *Mettā* (Ap. F 1 *b*); *khanti* (Ap. F 2 *a*, 142).
13 *Pamocana*, that which releases. 'Deliverance', SBE, x.
14 'Exertion', SBE, x. Ap. F 2 *a* (137).
15 *Yoga-khema*; Ch. 1 § 11.
16 *Amata*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 6.
17 Cp. Ap. D c § 4 [*a*] (*reward*); Ap. G 1 *c* § 4; also Ap. A 2 *a* (15).

[12] 'That which is sung in songs[1] is not to be enjoyed by me; it is not the Law of the discerning.
That which is sung in songs the Buddhas[2] reject; whilst Law exists, Brāhmans, this is [their] conduct (*vuttir*).

With other oblations[3] must thou serve the perfect great seer[4] (*mah-esiṃ*),
Taintless, released from sin; that is the field (*khettaṃ*)[5] for one who looks for merit (*puñña-phekkhassa*).'

On this being said the Brāhman spoke to the Blessed One thus: '. . .[6] Let the respected Gotama (*bhavaṃ Gotamo*)[7] receive me as a lay disciple taking refuge from this day forth whilst life lasts.'

§ 3. *Madhurattha-vilāsini*,[8] *Introduction.* (*PTS*, *Buddhavamsa*, *Preface*, *p. ix.*)

He spent . . . the eleventh rainy season at Nālā[9] (*Nālāya*), a Brāhman village.

§ 4. *Sutta-Piṭaka*, *Aṅguttara-Nikāya*, *Dasika-nipāta* (*the Tens*), *Sutta 65.* (*PTS*, *v*, *pp. 120–1.*)

[1] At one time the venerable Sāriputta[10] was staying among the Magadhans at Nālaka-gāmaka.[11] And Sāmaṇḍakāni[12] the Wanderer[13] drew near to where the venerable Sāriputta was . . . and sitting beside him spoke thus: 'What now, friend Sāriputta, is happiness (*sukkhaṃ*), what is sorrow (*dukkhaṃ*)?'[14] [2] 'Re-birth (*abhi-nibbatti*),[15] friend, is

[1] 'What is acquired by reciting stanzas', SBE, x. The phrase may mean the Vedic Hymns (Ap. G 2 *c* § 1) celebrating oblations and personal immortality. The *Sutta-Nipāta* version regards it as the farmer's alms-gift, and adds that this was thrown into a stream and exploded there (Int. § 94, iii).

[2] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[3] Literally, other food and drink; i.e. other than Vedic sacrifices. Cp. the *Sundarika-Bhāradvāja-S.* (*Saṃ*. vii, Sutta 9, and *Sutta-Nipāta*, SBE, x, p. 78).

[4] Or Rishi. Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13].

[5] i.e. proper recipient; Ap. B *a* § 6 [9] (*field of merit*). Cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 4 (*fruit*).

[6] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[7] See [8] above; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3]; Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [5]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [162]; Ch. 19 *d* § 2 [3]; Ch. 20 § 11 [29]; Ch. 23 *a* [9]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [39]; also Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [35]; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [11]; Ch. 23 *a* [7]; and Int. § 190 (*address*). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3] n; Ap. E *a* § 4 (2); and Ch. 5 *c* § 8 (*bhante*). The title is unusual in this formula and suggests the poetical non-canonical origin of the story (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note* (*ballads*). The vocative sing. of *bhavaṃ* is *bho* (Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2], Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 2) and the voc. plural is *bhonto* (Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524]).

[8] Ch. 10 *b* § 1.

[9] Tradition identifies this with Ekanālā (see § 2 [1] above; Ch. 10 *d* § 1). See § 4 below.

[10] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].

[11] Or, Nālaka village; Int. § 145. This seems to be identical with Nālā (see § 3 above); cp. § 5 n below. The commentary on the *Theragāthā* states that it was the home of Vanganta and Rūpasārī, the parents of Sāriputta (Ch. 10 *c*, 2), Mahā-Cunda (Ch. 11 *c* § 6), Upasena (Ch. 10 *c*, 26), and Revata (Ch. 10 *c*, 16); see Mrs. Rhys Davids's *Psalms of the Brethren*, pp. 45, 118, 261, 340–1.

[12] Ap. G 2 *c*.

[13] Int. § 126; Ch. 11 *c* § 9.

[14] Ap. E *b*. In Sutta 66 Sāriputta answers the same interlocutor somewhat differently.

[15] The statement here attributed to Sāriputta implies that future re-birth is not a necessity. It seems also to imply a widespread belief in the dogma of previous

sorrowful, no re-birth is bliss. On there being re-birth, friend, sorrow is to be expected. . . . [3] When there is no re-birth, friend, bliss is to be expected—neither cold nor heat, neither hunger nor thirst, no natural needs, no wound from fire or staff or sword, nor relatives and acquaintances, nor going and coming disturb.'

§ 5. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 28* (*Sampasādaniya-S.*).[1]

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Nāḷandā[2] in the Pāvārika mango-grove (*Pāvārik-ambavane*).[3] And the venerable Sāriputta[4] came to the Blessed One . . . and sitting beside him spoke thus: 'Thus have I faith, revered sir (*bhante*), in the Blessed One—there neither has been, nor will there be, nor does there exist now, another religious teacher (*samaṇo vā brāhmaṇo vā*)[5] having more of the higher knowledge[6] than the Blessed One, that is, regarding Enlightenment (*sambodhiyaṃ*).' . . .[7]

§ 6. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 56* (*Upāli-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 371] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Nāḷandā[8] in the Pāvārika mango-grove. Now at that time the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta[9] was dwelling at Nāḷandā with a great company of Nigaṇṭhas.[10] And Dīgha the ascetic (*Dīgha-tapassī*), the Nigaṇṭha, went begging[11] for food in Nāḷandā. And after his meal returning from his begging round he drew near to the Pāvārika mango-grove, where the Blessed One was and . . . stood beside him. . . . And the Blessed One spoke to him saying: 'There are seats here, ascetic (*tapassī*); if thou desirest, be seated.' . . .[12]

re-births, but not necessarily that the speaker shared in this belief. One of the chief characteristics of early Buddhism was that it freed the faithful from the terrors of future re-births, if not from the whole incubus of the doctrine of personal Karma. Ch. 4 § 16 (*survival*); Ap. B *a* § 6 [8] (*Mirror*); cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 27 n.

1 Ap. I *b* § 5. Discourse on clear-faith; Ap. I *a* § 1 (*clarity*).

2 Int. § 145. The site of Nāḷandā is about 8 miles due north of Rājagaha. Some authorities identify it with Nālaka (see § 4 above); 'Sāriputta's village . . . was Nālaka, or in Sanskrit works Nāḷandā', ThB, p. 95. Nāḷandā had not yet become a famous seat of learning.

3 Ch. 20 § 10 [15]. *Dīgha-Nik.* 11 has the same setting (Ap. G 2 *a* § 1; Ap. I *b* § 4); also *Saṃyutta*, xxxv. 125 (*Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 110) and *Saṃyutta* xlii. 6 and 7, of which last two the former (iv, p. 312) mentions 'the Brāhmans from the west, *Brāhmaṇā pacchābhūmakā*' (Ch. 1 § 2 n); these probably were Brāhmans from Gandhāra (Ch. 17 *e*).

4 Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]; Ap. G 1 *e* § 1 (*Upatishya*).

5 Ap. A 2 *d* [21]. Literally, 'another devotee or Brāhman', i.e. another teacher whether non-Brāhman or Brāhman.

6 *Abhiññā*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).

7 Sāriputta's *sīha-nāda* (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [55]) or outburst of faith follows; repeated in shorter form in *Saṃyutta* xlvii of *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, pp. 159–61), and in the MPS (Ch. 20 § 10 [16–17]).

8 Int. § 145.

9 Int. § 179; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [29].

10 Ch. 11 *c* § 8. Other discussions with followers of the Nigaṇṭhas at the same spot are recorded in *Saṃyutta* xlii. 8 and 9 (iv, pp. 317, 322).

11 Int. § 187. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7].

12 They compare the Nigaṇṭha doctrine of restriction in its effects on evil Karma with Buddha's doctrine of action, thus contrasting austerities, especially physical penance (Ch. 3 § 7) with conduct, especially conduct of thought. Dīghatapassin reports the conversation to Nātaputta, who sends the householder Upāli to ask

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Kassapa-Saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xvi*), *Sutta 11* [*13–17*]. (*PTS, ii, p. 219.*)

. . .[1] [13] The venerable Mahā-Kassapa[2] spoke thus to the venerable Ānanda: '. . . From the time, friend, Ānanda, when I cut off hair and beard and assumed the yellow robes,[3] having gone forth from the household to the houseless life, I did not think of recognizing any other teacher than the Blessed One, saint and all-enlightened. [14] Earlier, friend, when I had become a house-owner[4] this thought came to me: "A household life is thronged, full of things that soil; [like] the open air is renunciation [of the world] (*pabbajjā*). It is not easy for one living a household life to lead an altogether complete, pure, and radiant[5] holy life.[6] What now if I should cut off hair and beard and assuming the yellow robes should go forth from the household to the houseless life." [15] And I thereafter having made a wrap (*saṃghātiṃ*)[7] of rags of cloth (*pata-pilotikānaṃ*),[8] went forth to those places where arahats[9] were. . . . [16] I thus having gone forth, reaching half-way[10] [to Rājagaha], saw the Blessed One between Rājagaha and Nāḷandā[11] seated at the Bahuputta shrine (*Bahuputte cetiye*).[12] Seeing him I thought: "Oh, that I should see the Teacher, that I should see the Blessed One indeed, the Welfarer[13] . . . the supremely enlightened. . . .!" [17] And I, friend, even there fell down with my head at the feet[14] of the Blessed One and spoke to the Blessed One thus: "Master (*bhante*), the Blessed One is my Teacher; I am a learner (*sāvako*).[15]" ' . . .

Buddha whether thoughts can be as effective as deeds upon evil Karma. Buddha converts Upāli by his 'graduated discourse' (PTS, i, p. 379; see Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5], *anupubbi-kathā* and *sagga*); and Nātaputta's death ensues (Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [243]; Ch. 19 *b* § 10 [3]; Ch. 19 *c* § 1 n).

1 The scene is the Veḷuvana (Ch. 11 *c* § 2 [17]) at Rājagaha, after the Buddha's death. Dissension has arisen between the followers and admirers of Ānanda (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]), whom they here call *vedeha-muni* ('the learned sage'; cp. *Apadāna*, p. 7; and Ap. A 1 *b*, 3) and Mahā-Kassapa the Buddha's successor, who is charged with being *añña-titthiya-pubba* ('formerly an unorthodox teacher'). Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 6 n; Ch. 23 *b* § 9 n.

2 The Buddha's successor. The facts conflict with the idea that he was the same as Uruvela-Kassapa (Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1]). See § 11 [1] below; Ch. 11 *c* § 28; Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ap. A 1 *b* (3).

3 Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].

4 *Āgārika*; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]. Kassapa was a Brāhman householder (Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 359).

5 *Saṅkha-likhita*; literally, shell-carved or polished like a shell.

6 Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11].

7 Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].

8 Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 3 [2].

9 i.e. *Therā* (Elders). Ap. D *c*.

10 *Addhāna-magga* (see § 8 below). Better, 'in the course of my journey': Ch. 5 *a* § 4; Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 14 *d* § 1; Ch. 17 *b* § 1; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [98]. Cp. Ch. 21 §§ 7 [25], 14 [50], 17 [2] n and Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8] n.

11 Int. § 145.

12 Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 1. The Maṇimālaka *cetiya* in the Magadhan country also is mentioned in *Saṃ. Nik.* x. 4 (i, p. 208). Another Bahuputta shrine existed in or near Vesāli (Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2]).

13 Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].

14 Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5]; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 12 [22].

15 Ch. 7 *a* §§ 6, 12 [6]; also Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18).

§ 8. *Dīgha-Nikāya*, *Sutta 1* (*Brahmajāla-S.*).[1]

[1] . . . The Blessed One had reached half-way[2] between Rājagaha and Nāḷandā[3] with a great assemblage, five hundred[4] mendicant brothers. And Suppiya[5] the Wanderer[6] also had reached half-way between Rājagaha and Nāḷandā with his assistant (*antevāsinā*),[7] the [Brāhman] youth (*māṇavena*) Brahmadatta. And there Suppiya . . . in different methods spoke in praise of the Buddha . . . the *Dhamma*, and . . . the *Saṃgha*. Then Brahmadatta . . . spoke in [their] praise . . . So they both, instructor[8] and assistant, directly contradicted each other regarding[9] the Buddha and the community of the Bhikkhus. [2] And the Blessed One made a stay of one night at Ambalaṭṭhikā[10] in the king's pleasure-house (*rāj-āgārake*)[11] with the assemblage of mendicant brothers. Suppiya the Wanderer also made a stay of one night at . . . the king's pleasure-house with his assistant. . . . And there they both, instructor and assistant, directly contradicted each other regarding the Buddha and the community of Bhikkhus. [3] Then many mendicant brothers having risen in the night as dawn[12] approached sat together in the circular enclosure (*maṇḍala-māle*).[13] . . .[14] [4] Then the Blessed One . . . came to the circular enclosure and sat on the seat appointed.[15] . . .[16]

§ 9. *Majjhima-Nikāya*, *Sutta 61* (*Ambalaṭṭhika-Rāhul-ovāda-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 414] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana[17] at Kalandakanivāpa. And at that time the venerable Rāhula[18] was staying at Ambalaṭṭhikā.[19] And the Blessed One in the evening having risen from quiet [contemplation][20] went to Ambalaṭṭhikā where the venerable Rāhula was. Then the venerable Rāhula saw the Blessed One from afar as he approached, and seeing him assigned a seat and [brought] water for the feet.[21] The Blessed One sat on the seat assigned and washed his feet. And the venerable

1 Ap. E *c* i § 2. 'A Net for the Divine [Origin of Things].'

2 'Going along the high road', *Dial of the B.*, 1. Better, 'was in the course of a journey'. See § 7 [16] above.

3 Int. § 145.

4 Int. § 121; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12].

5 Ch. 23 *b* § 8; and Ap. G 2 *c*.

6 Ch. 11 *c* § 9.

7 Ch. 8 *i*.

8 *Ācariya*. Ch. 8 *g*.

9 Or, following closely behind.

10 Int. § 145; Ch. 20 § 9; Ch. 23 *b* § 8. See § 9 below. Cp. § 10 [1] below.

11 Ch. 1 § 9.

12 Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4].

13 Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11].

14 They discuss the above dispute.

15 Ch. 11 *c* § 15; Ch. 21 § 14 [50].

16 Buddha's discussion of praise and dispraise is followed by the often repeated and now shapelessly expanded exposition of the Sīlas or Duties (Ap. H 4, *Note*), and an enumeration of erroneous views on the universe and the soul (Ap. E *c* i § 2 n).

17 Ch. 11 *c* § 2.

18 Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]; Ch. 10 *c* (22); Ap. G 1 *c* § 1. Rāhula is addressed by Buddha also in Suttas 62 (Ch. 18 *d* § 1) and 147, and in *Saṃ. Nik.* xxii. 91 (iii, p. 135) and xxxv. 121 (iv, 105 of which the last repeats *Majjh.* 147).

19 Int. § 145.

20 Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

21 Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].

Rāhula having exchanged greetings with the Blessed One seated himself at one side. Then the Blessed One keeping a little water left in the water-pot instructed the venerable Rāhula. . . .[1]

§ 10. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 5* (*Kūṭadanta-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Magadhas with a great assemblage . . . came to Khānumata,[2] a Brāhman village[3] of the Magadhas (*Magadhānaṃ*). There the Blessed One at Khānumata stayed in the Ambalaṭṭhika[4] [garden]. And at that time Kūṭadanta[5] the Brāhman occupied Khānumata, a royal [demesne] (*rāja-bhoggaṃ*),[6] populous, [well supplied] with grass, wood, and water and with grain, given by the Magadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra,[7] a royal grant,[8] a sacred gift[9] (*brahma-deyyaṃ*). And at that time a great sacrifice[10] (*yañño*) was being made ready for Kūtadanta the Brāhman; seven hundred bulls, seven hundred steers, seven hundred heifers, seven hundred goats, seven hundred rams, had been led to the post for sacrificing. . . .[11]

§ 11. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, II, xii.*

[1] At that time the venerable Mahā-Kassapa,[12] going from Andhakavinda[13] to Rājagaha to [observe] Uposatha,[14] on the way crossing a river was nearly carried away, and his robes were wetted. . . . They reported this matter to the Blessed One. 'Whatsoever boundary,'[15] he said, 'is assigned by the Saṃgha for the residence of equals and for

[1] Buddha likens the empty water-pot to the priesthood (*sāmañña*) of those whose professions are false, and enjoins intentness in deed, word, and thought. Cp. Int. § 114 (*vessel defiled or cracked*).

[2] Int. § 145.

[3] Ch. 1 § 2.

[4] Cp. § 8 [2] above.

[5] Ap. G 2 *c*; and Ch. 10 *c*, n.

[6] Int. § 189 (*revenues*).

[7] Int. § 168.

[8] Or, grant of rulership.

[9] i.e. free of feudal services (cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [166]; Ap. H 2 b § 2 [3] n) and taxes (Int. § 168 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 16 n; V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., pp. 199–200). Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 14 *d* §§ 2, 4; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 7, 10 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11] n. Cp. Ap. F 2 *c* (*Brāhman*) n.

[10] Ch. 11 *a* § 2 [1]; and Int. § 185 (*ritual*); see Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2]. On the maintenance of a corps of Brāhman priests by a Buddhist-court for auspicious ceremonial rites and for the preservation of ancient legal lore, and not for religious purposes, see H. G. Q. Wales's *Ancient Siamese Government and Administration* (1934), pp. 99, 180–1, 188, and *Siamese State Ceremonies* (1931), pp. 61–2. (Cp. Int. § 172, *Ministers*; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1], *Brāhman*). It may be conjectured that the compilation of the legal codes of northern India in the Sanskrit language, despite their profession of greater antiquity, was part of the movement which gradually superseded the Pāli (Hīnayāna) Buddhist sacred books by the subtler Sanskrit (Mahāyāna) Buddhist Canon (Int. § 21 n).

[11] Buddha denounces sacrifices and commends a better way. The Sutta includes the Sīlas (Ap. H 4, *Note*) and the often repeated 'graduated discourse' (i, p. 148; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]). The Brāhman becomes an *upāsaka* (Ch. 8 *l*).

[12] See § 7 [13] above.

[13] Int. § 145; Ch. 15 *a* § 12. See also MV, VI. xxiv–xxvi, VIII. xv. 10; *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 154; *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 138. 'Buddhaghosa's note on this passage contains some details . . . Andhakavinda is three gāvuta [six miles] distant from Rājagaha . . .', SBE, xiii, p. 254. MV, VI. xxvi, narrates how Buddha performed near Andhakavinda the miracle of the inexhaustible pot of sugar (Int. § 94, iii).

[14] Ch. 8 *a*.

[15] Ch. 8 *f* § 2 [1].

common [observance of] Uposatha (*ek-uposatha*), let the Saṃgha assign [at the centre of] that boundary [a place[1] for] the care of triple-robes.'[2]

§ 12. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 21* (*Sakka-pañha-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Magadhas, [where][3] to the east of Rājagaha [was] Ambasaṇḍā,[4] a Brāhman village;[5] to the north of this [village] on the Vediyaka hill (*Vediyake Pabbate*),[6] in the Inda-sāla cave (*Indasāla-guhāyaṃ*).[7] . . .[8]

§ 13. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 26* (*Cakkavatti-Sīhanāda-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Magadhas at Mātulā.[9] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers . . . thus: 'Abide self-reliant,[10] mendicant brothers, taking refuge in yourselves,[11] not taking refuge in others; reliant on the Law (*dhamma-dīpā*), taking refuge in the Law,[12] not taking refuge in another (*an-añña-saraṇā*)[13] . . .[14]

§ 14. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Māra Saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 4*), *Sutta 18* (*Piṇḍa*). (*PTS, i, p. 113.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Magadhas at Pañcasālā,[15] a Brāhman Village.[16] . . .[17]

§ 15. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI. xxviii. 1–13.*[18]

[1] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Rājagaha as long as he wished proceeded towards Pāṭaligāma[19] with a great assemblage of

[1] Cp. MV, II. xii. 3 and 5.

[2] *Ti-cīvara*; Ch. 8 *j* (*Apparel*).

[3] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[4] Or, Sambasaṇḍa. Int. § 145.

[5] Ch. 1 § 2.

[6] 'Cornice-hill'. Cp. Int. § 128 (*Vepulla*).

[7] Int. § 129. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 27.

[8] Sakka (Int. § 93, i), lord of spirits (*devānaṃ inda*), perceives and questions Buddha.

[9] Int. § 145; Ch. 21 § 8 [26] n.

[10] Ap. E *c* ii § 4; Cp. Ch. 21 § 10 (*myself*). 'Relying on your own exertions.' i.e. not on rites (Ap. G 2 *c* § 1, *sacrifices*) or tradition (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8, *Veda*).

[11] Cp. Marcus Aurelius, iv. 3; Int. § 106.

[12] IN 5 *b*; Ch. 21 § 8 [26]. The Law is here identified with reason, linked with conduct and exertion; cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 3 (*paññā*).

[13] Ap. H 2, *Note* (*Refuges*).

[14] The legend of the Emperor Daḷhanemi follows; also a fantastic prophecy regarding Gotama's destined successor Metteyya (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*). On a previous page (PTS, iii, p. 72) *metteyya* is used as an adjective meaning 'mother-reverencing', together with *petteyya*, 'father-reverencing'. Metteyya is not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or *Vin. Piṭ.*

[15] Int. § 145.

[16] Ch. 1 § 2.

[17] Māra here endeavours to intercept Buddha. Int. § 93 (iv).

[18] This passage appears also in MPS, i. 19–34 (Ch. 20 § 11) with slight variations and seems to have been borrowed from the MPS or from its sources (Ch. 20, *Suttanta*).

[19] Int. §§ 71, 145. This village became the great city of Pāṭaliputta (see [4] n below), the modern Patna. The Kukkuṭ-ārāma there is mentioned in MV, VIII. xxiv. 6; and in *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 349; *Saṃ. Nik.* v, pp. 15, 171; *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 57, v, p. 342. See also *Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 84; *Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 163 (Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163]).

mendicant brothers. . . .[1] And the lay-disciples (*upasakā*) of Pātaligāma heard that the Blessed One had arrived . . . and came to where the Blessed One was. . . . And as they sat by his side the Blessed One instructed, informed, stirred, and gladdened the lay-disciples of Pātaligāma by discoursing on the Law.[2] [2] . . . Then they spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'May the Blessed One, revered sir, accept [the use of] our assembly-house[3] (*āvasath-āgāraṃ*) together with the assemblage of mendicant brothers.' The Blessed One accepted by his silence.[4] Then the lay-disciples . . . went to the assembly-house . . . and having spread[5] the whole [floor of the] assembly-house they arranged[6] seats, set a water-vessel[7] near by, and put up an oil-lamp.[8] [3] . . . Then the Blessed One in the forenoon[9] having robed himself . . . went to the assembly-house and having arrived washed his feet, entered the assembly-house and seated himself near the central prop (*thambhaṃ*)[10] with his face to the east.[11] And the assemblage of mendicant brothers also washed their feet, entered the assembly-house and seated themselves near the western wall (*bhittiṃ*) with their faces to the east, keeping the Blessed One in front of them. And the lay-disciples of Pātaligāma also washed their feet, entered the assembly-house and seated themselves near the eastern wall with their faces to the west, keeping the Blessed One in front of them.[12] [4] . . .[13]

e. AMONG THE AṆGAS[14]

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka*, *Dīgha-Nikāya*, *Sutta 4* (*Soṇadaṇḍa-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Aṇgas with a great assemblage . . .[15] came to Campā.[16] There the Blessed One at Campā stayed on the bank of the Gaggarā lotus-pool[17] (*pokkharaniyā*). And

[1] Omitting the number, 1250 (Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [1]), and details. Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [10]; Ch. 13 *a* § 7 [1].

[2] Ch. 6 *a* § 12.

[3] 'Rest-house', SBE, xvii, p. 98; 'village rest-house', SBE, xi, p. 15. Cp. Int. § 171 and Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163] n.

[4] Ch. 6 *a* § 9.

[5] Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92]. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1]; Ap. H 1 § 4 (*mats*); also Int. § 190 (*furniture*).

[6] Or assigned; Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[7] Ch. 5 *a* § 10.

[8] Ap. H 1, *Note* (MV, ii, ch. xx). See Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [3] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 23.

[9] The time is not specified in the MPS version.

[10] Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [11] n; and Int. § 190 (*architecture*).

[11] Ch. 3 § 2.

[12] See Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [3] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 23.

[13] A discourse on the five disadvantages of wrongdoing follows, including re-birth in *niraya* (Ap. B *a* § 7). There is also an account of the earth-spirits (Int. §§ 70, 93, vi, n) present at the founding of the city of Pātaliputta (see [1] n above), with a prophecy of the city's greatness, clearly made after the event (IN 6, *Canon*); and of Buddha's miraculous crossing of the Ganges (Int. § 94, iii). The MV narrative is continued in Ch. 12 *c* § 11.

[14] In what is now the Bhāgalpur Division of Bihār. Int. § 158; Ch. 11 *a* § 2.

[15] Omitting the conventional number, 500. Int. § 121.

[16] Int. § 146. Ch. 8 *e* § 5 n; Ch. 10 *c* (18), (42); Ch. 15 *a* §§ 1 [36], 15 [1]. Ap. I *b* § 3 n. See below §§ 2, 3. Also *Dīgha*. 34; *Majjh*. 51; *Saṃ. Nik*. i, p. 195; *Aṇg. Nik*. iv, p. 168, v, p. 151. Campā was near the modern city of Bhāgalpur on the south bank of the Ganges.

[17] Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169]; Ch. 11 *c* § 11 (*Sumāgadhā*) n.

at that time Soṇadaṇḍa[1] the Brāhman occupied Campā (*Campaṃ*), a royal [demesne] (*rāja-bhoggaṃ*),[2] populous, [well supplied] with grass, wood, and water and with grain, given by the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra,[3] a royal grant, a sacred gift.[4] [2] And the Brāhmans[5] and householders[6] (*brāhmaṇa-gahapatikā*) of Campā heard [the news]: 'The devotee (*Samaṇo*) Gotama,[7] sir (*bho*),[8] the Sakyan (*Sakya-putto*), having gone forth from the Sakyan clan (*Sakya-kulā*)[9] . . . has reached Campā. . . . Now concerning the Blessed Gotama the good report has gone forth: "So it is indeed; he is the Blessed One, saint, supremely enlightened,[10] having attained wise living, the Well-farer,[11] world-knowing (*loka-vidū*), unsurpassed, the driver and trainer of men (*purisadamma-sārathī*),[12] the teacher of spirits and men, the Enlightened,[13] the Blessed One. He having learnt for himself (*sayaṃ abhiññā*)[14] realizes and makes known this universe[15] (*imaṃ lokaṃ*) of [ethereal] spirits[16] with Māra,[17] with Brahmā,[18] and the [terrestrial] generation (*pajaṃ*) of spirits [of earth] and men with the religious-teachers (*sa-ssamaṇa-brāhmaṇiṃ*).[19] . . . It is good to look upon such saints." '[20] Then the Brāhmans and householders of Campā going out from Campā in crowds flocking together came to the Gaggarā lotus-pool. [3] And at that time Soṇadaṇḍa the Brāhman went to [his noon] day-rest[21] on the upper [terrace of his] mansion[22] and saw the Brāhmans and householders of Campā going out from Campā. . . .[23]

§ 2. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Sattaka-nipāta (the Sevens), Sutta 49.* (*PTS, iv, p. 59.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Campā[24] on the bank of the Gaggarā lotus-pool. And many lay-disciples of Campā drew

[1] Ap. G 2 *c*; and Ch. 10 *c*, n.
[2] Int. § 189 (*revenues*).
[3] Int. § 168.
[4] Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1]. The introductory details of this Sutta are used also in *Majjh.* 95 (Ch. 14 *f* § 7).
[5] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54]; and Int. § 185. Campā was apparently a Brāhman colony; Ch. 1 § 2 n.
[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [3].
[7] Ch. 1 § 6 (*name*), Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]. For *Samaṇa* see Int. 178 n; Ch. 22 *b* § 16 n; Ap. A 2 *d* [21] n; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 (*Sāmañña*).
[8] Int. § 190 (*address*). Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 22 *c* § 10. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [24]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2). *Bho* is voc. sing. of *bhavaṃ* (Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]).
[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 1.
[10] Int. § 187; Part I (title) n.
[11] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].
[12] Ap. H 1 § 6 [5].
[13] *Buddha*; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].
[14] Ap. E *c* ii § 1.
[15] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28] n.
[16] Int. § 35.
[17] Int. § 69.
[18] The first part of this long and complex phrase is appropriate enough in the mouth of the people, but is directly opposed to Gotama's teaching in the *Tevijja-Sutta* (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 18 n; and Ch. 15 *a* § 8 [248] n. See Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n.
[19] Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
[20] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [11] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1]; Ch. 14 *d* § 4 [2] n; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 4 [1] n, 5 n, 7, 9, 13 [2], 14 [1] n; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83].
[21] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [160]. See Ch. 14 *f* § 7.
[22] Ch. 2 § 1.
[23] Soṇadaṇḍa visits Gotama. A discourse on the true Brāhman follows (Ap. F 2 *c*). Soṇadaṇḍa becomes a lay-disciple. After conversion he still uses the friendly form of address *bho Gotama*; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2). Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n, and Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12] n; also Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1].
[24] See § 1 above.

near to where the venerable Sāriputta[1] was . . . and spoke thus: 'It is long, revered sir, since we have heard a discourse on the Law from the mouth of the Blessed One; it would be well, revered sir, if we should receive from the mouth of the Blessed One a discourse on the Law for our instruction.' 'For this, friends, you should come on the Uposatha[2] day (*tad-ah' uposathe*); then you might receive from the mouth of the Blessed One a discourse[3] on the Law for instruction. . . . And those lay-disciples of Campā came on Uposatha day (*tad-ah' uposathe*) to the venerable Sāriputta. . . . And the venerable Sāriputta with those lay-disciples went to the Blessed One. . . .[4]

§ 3. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dassaka-nipāta* (*the Tens*), *Sutta 94.* (*PTS, v, p. 189.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Campā[5] on the bank of the Gaggarā lotus-pool. And Vajjiyamāhita[6] the householder early one day[7] came out from Campā to see the Blessed One. And this thought came to Vajjiyamāhita: 'It is not time yet for seeing the Blessed One; the Blessed One is [contemplating in] quiet[8] (*paṭisallīno*). And it is not time for seeing anyone of the Bhikkhus who train the mind; such Bhikkhus are [contemplating in] quiet also. What if now I were to go to the garden (*yena ārāmo*)[9] of the wandering philosophers[10] belonging to the different schools (*añña-tiṭṭhiyānaṃ*).[11] And so he went to the garden. . . .[12]

§ 4. *Majjhima-Nikaya, Sutta 39* (*Mahā-Assapura-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 271] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Aṅgas, where [there was][13] a township[14] of the Aṅgas called Assapura.[15] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[16]

[1] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
[2] Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]. The day of Uposatha seems to have been reckoned from moonrise to moonrise or nightfall to nightfall, not from midnight to midnight.
[3] See Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [160]; also Ch. 8 *b* § 1 (*dhamma*); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii) n. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 6 [7].
[4] A discourse on giving (*dāna*) and reward (*phala*) follows. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. B *a* § 8 [9] (*gifts*); also Ap. D *c* § 4 [*a*] (*reward*).
[5] See § 1 above.
[6] He is in the long list (*Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 451) of householders who attained perfection and realized the *amata* (Ap. C *b* § 11, 374); Ch. 10 *c* (61). Cp. Ap. B *b* § 4 (*Meṇḍaka*); Ap. C *b*, *Note* (*layman*).
[7] *Divādivassa.* Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [2]; Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4]; Cp. Ap. H 5 [91].
[8] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
[9] Int. § 126.
[10] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
[11] Ch. 8 *a* [1].
[12] Vajjiyamāhita confutes the philosophers.
[13] For the elliptical construction cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 12 [1]; Ch. 11 *f* § 5; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [1]; Ch. 13 *d* § 3. Compare also Ch. 13 §§ 28 [1], 29 [1], 30. See also Ch. 6 *a* § 3 n; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1] n.
[14] *Nigama*: Ch. 14 *f* §§ 2 [1], 4 [1], 6 [1], 8 [1]; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 1, 6 [54]; Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [1]; and Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).
[15] Int. § 146.
[16] A discourse on the duties of a devotee follows.

f. Beyond the Aṅgas[1]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI, xxxiv.*

[1] . . . At Bhaddiya-nagara[2] dwelt Meṇḍaka[3] the householder. . . .[4] [5] And the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra[5] instructed a certain general minister[6] (*mahā-mattaṃ*) saying: 'In the land conquered[7] (*vijite*) by us, good sir (*bhaṇe*),[8] they say, there dwells at Bhaddiya-nagara the householder Meṇḍaka. . . .[9] Go, good sir, and enquire.' [9] . . . And that minister on returning to Rājagaha reported on the matter to the king. [10] And the Blessed One having stayed at Vesāli[10] as long as he wished proceeded towards Bhaddiya with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers. . . .[11] There at Bhaddiya the Blessed One stayed in the Jātiyā Grove (*Jātiyā-vane*). [11] And Meṇḍaka the householder heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . has reached Bhaddiya and is staying in the Jātiyā Grove. . . .'[12] [12] . . .[13] [13] Having ridden on a chariot as far as the ground [was permissible][14] for a chariot he dismounted and on foot approached to where the Blessed One was. . . .[15] [14] And the Blessed One in the morning having robed himself . . . went to where the dwelling of Meṇḍaka the householder was. . . .[16]

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-nipāta (the Fives), Sutta 33. (PTS, iii, p. 36.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Bhaddiya[17] (*Bhaddiye*) in the Jātiyā Grove. And Uggaha the grandson of Meṇḍaka[18] came to where

[1] On the northern or left bank of the Ganges.

[2] Int. § 146; see below § 3. Also MV, v. viii. 1. ix. 1; and *Pārājika* 1. x (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 37). Khandhaka v, ix, of MV records a journey from Bhaddiya to Sāvatthi (Int. § 149, *b*), and MV, v. viii (Ch. 15 *a* § 12), a journey from Benāres to Bhaddiya. In Buddhaghosha's commentary on the *Dhammapada* it is stated that Bhaddiya was (in his time) in the kingdom of Bengal (Ch. 18 *b* § 2), but in Canonical times it was within the Magadhan kingdom (see [5] below) eastward of which lay an unknown land.

[3] Ap. B *b* § 4 [12]. See § 2 [1] below; and Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [161] n. Meṇḍa-ka means 'ram-like'; cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1] n.

[4] Omitting his miraculous powers and those of his family. Int. § 94 (iv).

[5] Int. § 168.

[6] Int. § 172; Ch. 23 *a* [8]. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1] (*envoys*); Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [iv].

[7] Int. § 162; see [1] n above. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 3; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (7); Ch. 15 *a* § 4; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [97]. 'In our kingdom', SBE, xvii, p. 122. Literally, 'in our province'.

[8] Ch. 3 § 1.

[9] Omitting marvels performed by Meṇḍaka and members of his household; Int. § 94 (v).

[10] North of the Ganges in what is now Tirhoot. Ch. 12.

[11] Omitting the number, 1250. Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [1].

[12] As in Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]. See Ch. 14 *f* §§ 7, 9, 13 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 1 [502], 6 [55].

[13] See Ap. B *b* § 4.

[14] Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119]. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [11]; Ch. 19 *d* § 2 [3].

[15] The 'graduated discourse' and the householder's admission as a lay-disciple follow, as in Ch. 6 *a* §§ 6, 7; also his invitation and preparations, as in Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7].

[16] An account of the meal and the conversion of Meṇḍaka's household follows, as in Ch. 6 *a* §§ 11, 12; also his promise to feed the Saṃgha during its stay.

[17] Int. § 146.

[18] See § 1 [1] above.

the Blessed One was . . .[1] [2] . . . And when that night had elapsed the Blessed One in the morning having robed himself . . . went to the dwelling of Uggaha. . . .[2] Seated by his side Uggaha the grandson of Meṇḍaka spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'These my young [daughters],[3] revered sir, will go to their husbands' families (*pati-kulāni*).[4] May the Blessed One, revered sir, address them . . . which would long be for their profit and happiness.'[5] Then the Blessed One spoke to those young women thus: [3] 'Thus, young women,[6] must your duty[7] be learnt by you: "To the husband, to whom our mother and father, desirous of our profit, wishful of our advantage, compassionate, out of kindness, shall give us, to him we will be (rising early and retiring late) in all things attentive, gracious in behaviour, loving in speech."[8] . . . "Those who shall be to our husbands of importance, mother or father or religious-teachers[9] (*samaṇa-brāhmanā ti*), them we will respect,[10] esteem, revere, and honour; and guests[11] we will honour with seats and water [for the feet]."[12] . . . "Whatever are the occupations within our husband's house, say wool or cotton,[13] in them we will be dexterous, diligent, bestowing attention in every way to make and provide enough." . . . "Those who are inmates of our husband's house, slaves (*dāsā*),[14] messengers, work-people, of the work which they do and of the work which they do not do we will take cognizance, and of the strength and weakness of those that are sickly, and we will distribute food according to each one's share." . . . "What the husband shall acquire, treasure or grain or silver or gold,[15] we will exert ourselves in watching and guarding this, and therein will be not fraudulent, not dishonest, not reckless." . . .'[16]

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI, xxxiv.*

[17] And the Blessed One having stayed as long as he wished at Bhaddiya[17] . . . proceeded towards Aṅguttarāpa[18] (*yena Aṅguttarapo*). . . .

[1] Uggaha's invitation to a meal is accepted by Gotama, as in Ch. 6 *a* § 9.

[2] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 12 with necessary differences.

[3] *Kumāriyo*. Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92].

[4] Ap. F 2 *a* (134).

[5] Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3].

[6] Int. § 190 (*women*); Ch. 9 *b* § 6; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1] n; also Ap. F 1 (*Ethics*). The virtues of women are similarly described in Suttas 46, 47, 48, 49 of the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.*

[7] Ap. F.

[8] Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84].

[9] Ch. 9 *b* § 9 [33]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [6].

[10] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7].

[11] Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24] (*closed*).

[12] Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24].

[13] Int. § 189 (*manufactures*); cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 5 [18].

[14] Int. § 190; Ch. 9 *b* § 8; Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [3].

[15] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10). For 'treasure' and 'grain' see Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [2].

[16] To women who practise these five qualities the companionship of the gracious gods (*devānaṃ sahavyataṃ*) is promised (Int. § 93, vi; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14]); cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 9 (*sagga*). Verses follow (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*, *ballads*).

[17] See above § 1 [1].

[18] See below § 5. The word is in the singular; it may here indicate a district. This would justify the use of such names as Aṅga, Kosala, and Magadha (Int. §§ 123, 158, *clans*) for the countries of the great clans of the Middle-land; cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1] n. The text states that the locality was 'difficult to traverse, with little water or food'. It was part of the dense forest shutting off the unknown East; Ch. 1 § 2.

§ 4. *Mahā-vagga, VI, xxxv.*

[1] And the Blessed One journeying by stages[1] came to Āpaṇa.[2] . . .

§ 5. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 66 (Laṭukikopama-S.).*

[PTS, i, p. 447] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Aṅguttarāpas[3] (*Aṅg-uttarāpesu*), [where there was][4] a township of the Aṅguttarāpas called Āpana.[5] . . .[6]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Indriya-Saṃyutta (Saṃ. xlviii), Sutta 50 (Saddha). (PTS, v, p. 225.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Aṅgas[7] (*Aṅgesu*) [where there was] a township of the Aṅgas called Āpaṇa.[8] . . .[9]

§ 7. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI, xxxvi.*

[1] Then the Blessed One having stayed as long as he wished at Āpana[10] proceeded towards Kusinārā.[11] . . .

[1] Ch. 3 § 5 [166]. Though the context may seem to suggest that he came from Aṇguttarāpa it is more probable that this latter was the district in which Āpana was situated and that Gotama was journeying from Bhaddiya.

[2] Int. § 146; Ch. 13 *a* § 7 [1] n. See below §§ 5, 6, 7. Gotama is on a long journey from Bhaddiya to Kusināra. At Āpana he meets Keniya the Jaṭila (Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1]).

[3] See above § 3. Also *Majjh. Nik.* 54 and 92; and the *Sela-Sutta* of the *Sutta-Nipāta*. 'Among the Northern Aṇgans' is a possible translation. The modern district of Bhagalpur lies on both sides of the Ganges.

[4] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[5] See above § 4.

[6] A discourse on the right times of eating follows; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [12]. *Majjh.* 54 opens in identical terms and after describing a meeting with the retired householder Potaliya, who is dressed in full array with cloak and sandals and umbrella (Int. § 190, *dress*), shows that true retirement is the giving-up of self.

[7] Cp. Above § 5 n.

[8] See above § 4.

[9] A discourse to Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18) on faith (*saddhā*) follows; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*.

[10] See § 4 above.

[11] Int. § 148 (i). A town of the Mallas in the sub-mountainous region north of the Vajjian country.

CHAPTER 12

THE VAJJIAN[1] CONFEDERACY; THE CITY OF VESĀLI[2]

a. THE LICCHAVIS;[3] THE GOVERNMENT OF VESĀLI; THE NIGAṆṬHA SECT[4] (JAINS)

§ 1. *Madhurattha-vilāsinī*[5] *(commentary on the Buddha-vaṃsa), Introduction.*

. . . How [did he spend] the first rainy season? . . . Having started the wheel of the Law at Isipatana . . . he spent it near Benāres at Isipatana in the deer-park. [He spent] the second near Rājagaha . . . and there also the third and fourth rainy seasons; [he spent] the fifth near Vesāli in the Mahā-vana, in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[6]

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Sutta-Vibhaṅga, Mahā-vibhaṅga, Pārājika IV,*[7] *ix. (Vin. Piṭ., Oldenberg, iii, p. 108.)*

[5] And at that time[8] the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra[9] being at war with the Licchavis was defeated. And later the king having collected an army gained a victory over the Licchavis. . . .[10]

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 86 (Aṅgulimāla-S.).*[11]

[PTS, ii, p. 100] And the Kosalan king Pasenadi[12] . . . said: [p. 101] 'The Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra[13] has no quarrel with me, nor [have] the Licchavis of Vesāli, nor other rival rulers[14] (*paṭirājāno*). But there is in the land acquired (*vijite*)[15] by me a robber,[16] Aṅgulimāla by name, cruel, bloody-handed, confirmed in violence, merciless to living beings.'

[1] Int. §§ 18, 158, (5), 161; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 (*Vajjī*); Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2]; Ch. 19 *b* § 9; Ch. 19 *d*.

[2] Int. § 133; Ch. 10 *c* (66); Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (i) and (ii); Ap. F 1 *b* § 7.

[3] Int. § 161; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 7 [3], 8 [1], 10 [68], 11 [3]; Ch. 12 *d* § 5; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (2). See also *Vin. Piṭ.* (*Sutta-Vibhaṅga*), iii, pp. 18, 40, iv, p. 225; *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, p. 2.

[4] Int. § 184. See below §§ 4 [2], 5 [i. 15] n. The Nigaṇṭha leader Nātaputta was probably a member of the Licchavi clan, whose capital was the stronghold of his sect. His religion, or that of Pārsvanāth which he reformed, seems to have been prevalent throughout the eastern clans of the Middle-land at the time of Gotama's renunciation of the world.

[5] Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 12 *b* § 1.

[6] Int. §§ 123 n, 133; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 3 [237], 4 [1], 5 [1], 6 [1], 7 [1], 8 [1], 9 [481], 11 [6].

[7] Ch. 9 *c* § 3.

[8] The time is not specified. Fighting between Bimbisāra and his northern neighbours was recurrent. It was not till the reign of his son Ajātasattu (Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3]; Ch. 19 *d*, *Vajjians*) and after the death of Buddha that the northern confederacy was vanquished.

[9] Int. § 168.

[10] Moggallāna (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]) questions the news of the victory.

[11] Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [97]. See Ch. 14 *a* § 3. The scene is the Jetavana at Sāvatthi.

[12] Int. § 169 (i). For Kosalan envoys in Vesāli see Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1].

[13] Int. § 168.

[14] Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*]. See Ch. 14 *a* § 3 [101].

[15] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5].

[16] Int. § 189.

§ 4. *Anguttara-Nikāya, Aṭṭhaka-Nipāta (the Eights), Sutta 12.*[1] *(PTS, iv, p. 179.)*

[1] . . .[2] At that time many eminent Licchavis having assembled sat together in the council-hall (*santh-āgāre*),[3] and were praising in many ways the Enlightened One, his Law, and his community. [2] On that occasion Sīha[4] the chief-general (*Senā-pati*),[5] a follower of the Nigaṇṭha,[6] was seated in their assembly; and Sīha the General thought: 'This doubtless must be the Blessed One, the Saint and All-Enlightened One, since so many eminent Licchavis assembled and sitting together here in the council-hall praise in so many ways [him as] the Enlightened, his Law and his community. . . .' [3] Then Sīha the General went to where the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta[7] was and . . . said: 'Reverend sir, I am desirous of going to see the devotee Gotama.' 'Why, Sīha, shouldst thou, who art a believer in Karma[8] go and see the devotee Gotama, who is not a believer in Karma (*a-kiriya-vādaṃ*)?'[9] . . . [5] And Sīha the General went out from Vesāli to see the Blessed One. . . . Seated at one side he addressed the Blessed One thus: 'I have heard, revered sir, that the devotee Gotama has no belief in Karma. . . .' [6] 'There is a way, Sīha, in which one speaking rightly (*sammā*)[10] might say of me "The devotee Gotama has no belief in fulfilment[11] of action." . . . Again, there is a way in which one speaking rightly might say of me "The devotee Gotama has belief in fulfilment of action.' . . . [7] I indeed, Sīha, teach non-fulfilment [in the sense of the not doing] of unrighteous action by deed, by word, or by thought; I teach non-fulfilment [in the sense of the not forming] of the many evil thoughts[12] (*dhammāmaṃ*) opposed to good. . . . I teach fulfilment [in the sense of the doing] of righteous action. . . . I announce the annihilation[13] (*ucchedaṃ*) of desire, of enmity, of delusion;[14]

[1] Repeated in MV, vi. xxxi (Ap. B *b* § 3).

[2] Gotama was staying at the Kūtāgāra Hall; Ch. 12 *c* § 3.

[3] Or, meeting-place; Int. § 171; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [353]; Ap. H 3 *d* § 3. See below § 7 [228]; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [1] n; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (1); Ch. 13 *a* § 7 [1] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [13].

[4] Int. § 30; IN 4; see also § 10 [1] n below. Also in *Ang. Nik.*, iii, p. 38, iv, p. 79.

[5] Literally, army-lord. Int. § 175; see § 10 [1] below. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [167]. In medieval Buddhist Siam the term was applied to high civil administrative officers; see Wales's *Ancient Siamese Government*, p. 79.

[6] Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]. For references see Ch. 12 *a* (*Jains*). See below § 7 [227].

[7] Int. § 179.

[8] 'Who believe in the result of actions (according to their moral merit)', SBE, xvii, p. 109. Literally, believing in the fulfilment [of what has been done]. Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93].

[9] 'Who denies the result of actions', SBE, xvii. Ap. B *b* § 3 [2].

[10] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[11] The Jains taught a doctrine of Karma or the fulfilment of deeds done in past lives.

[12] Principles or ideas; or conditions. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]; also Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [11]; and Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2]; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 5 [7], 8 [2]. Cp. Ch. 14 *e* § 7 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [7]; Ch. 21 § 15 (2) n; also Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [7] (*qualities*). 'The manifold conditions (of heart)', SBE, xvii, p. 112.

[13] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9]. The Jains opposed the doctrine of annihilation after death. Plainly they charged Gotama with this doctrine.

[14] i.e. as to the importance of the Ego. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii); cp. Ap. E *c* i § 7 [1].

I announce the annihilation of the many evil thoughts opposed to good . . . and I teach contempt[1] of unrighteous action. . . . I teach contempt of approach to the many evil thoughts opposed to good. . . . I teach dissolution[2] [in the sense of the destruction] of desire, of enmity, of delusion . . . and I teach [penance in the sense] that all evil thoughts opposed to good, all unrighteous actions by deed, by word, and by thought, are to be burnt away.[3] . . . And in what way may one speaking rightly say of me "The devotee Gotama is unfixed (*a-pagabbho*)[4]? . . . For the Tathāgata[5] return to birth hereafter and to re-existence[6] is abandoned,[7] made like an up-rooted up-torn palm-tree, made non-existent, not able to arise in the future." In this way one speaking rightly may say of me "The devotee Gotama is unfixed; he teaches a law of unfixedness[8] and instructs his disciples in it." And in what way may one speaking rightly say of me "The devotee Gotama is confident[9] (*assattho*) . . . ?" I indeed, Sīha, am confident with the utmost confidence, and teach a doctrine of confidence and instruct my disciples in it.' . . .[10]

§ 5. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 24* (*Pāṭika-S.*), *i, 15–19; ii, 1–2.*

[i. 15] 'Once, Bhaggava,[11] I was staying . . . at Vesāli in the Mahāvana, in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[12] And at that time the unclothed ascetic (*a-celo*)[13] Pāṭika-putta[14] was dwelling at Vesāli having acquired high gain and fame in Vajji-gāma.[15] . . .[16] [19] And Sunakkhatta[17] the

[1] The Jains contemned this life and body. They accused Gotama of self-indulgence and recklessness as to the future.

[2] *Vinaya*; cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [6]. His opponents charged Gotama with being a nihilist (*venayika*); Int. § 4 (*transmigration*).

[3] The Jains practised self-torture (*tapa*), which Buddha condemned. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].

[4] Or, undecided; Ap. B *b* § 3 [9]. The difference is between *a-pagabbha* (not firm) and *apa-gabbha* (loosed from the womb).

[5] Ap. A 2 *c*. The term evidently has a wider connotation than 'the devotee Gotama'.

[6] *Punabbhav-ābhinibbatti*; Ch. 4 § 16.

[7] Ap. B *a* § 4 [2].

[8] This appears to be a radical repudiation of the doctrine of re-birth rather than a claim to exemption. Int. § 7 (*karma*).

[9] The Nigaṇṭhas evidently claimed to be *kiriyavādā*, *jegucchi*, *tapassī* and *assatthā*, and regarded Gotama as a non-believer in Karma or retribution, a denier of the future state, a believer of the dissolution of the soul and a doubter or sceptic (IN 1, *transmigration*). He taught, however, the transience of individuality (Ap. E *a*) and the divinity of virtue (Ap. C *b* § 4, *brahmacariya*; Ap. F 2 *b*, *brahma-vihārā*). The Nigaṇṭhas taught a dogmatic metaphysic and accused Gotama of agnosticism. Gotama, however, claims as much certainty as his opponents.

[10] As in Ap. B *b* § 3 [10] and Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13–14 (1)].

[11] Bhaggava-gotta the *paribbājaka* (Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [i. 1]) is addressed by Gotama at Anupiyā (Int. § 148, i). See Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11].

[12] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.

[13] Ch. 10 *c* (4) n; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11]; Ch. 13 *d* § 5 [387]; Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [29] n; and Int. § 187 (*ascetics*). The 'unclothed' ascetics may have included Jains of the Dig-ambara (sky-clad or naked) sect, but this is not stated in the text (see Ch. 12 *a*, *Jains*). Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1] (*ājīvaka*).

[14] Ap. G 2 *c*.

[15] The Vajjian country-side. See *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, pp. 5, 9, and SBB, iv, p. 10 n. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 (*Vajjī*).

[16] Gotama encounters the ascetic.

[17] Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68]; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11] n; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2].

Licchavi (*Licchavi-putto*) hurriedly entered Vesāli and went to the most distinguished Licchavis . . . and said: "Friends (*āvuso*), the Blessed One having gone begging for food in Vesāli, after his meal returning from his begging round has gone to the garden of the unclothed ascetic Pāṭika-putta for [his noon] day-rest.[1] Go, sirs (*āyasmanto*),[2] go, sirs; there will be a marvel[3] of superhuman[4] power by proficient devotees." . . . He went also to the most distinguished Brāhmans[5] with large halls[6] [and followings], rich householders and religious teachers[7] of various sects.[8] . . . And they [all] went to the garden of the unclothed ascetic Pāṭika-putta. . . . [ii. 1] Then, Bhaggava, a certain Licchavi chief-minister (*mahā-matto*)[9] rising from his seat spoke thus to the assemblage (*parisaṃ*):[10] "Stay, sirs (*bho*), a while till I return; perhaps I may be able to bring the unclothed ascetic Pāṭika-putta before this assemblage." Then Bhaggava, the Licchavi chief-minister, went to the Tindukkhānu-garden[11] of the Wanderers where the unclothed ascetic Pāṭika-putta was. . . . [2] When he [had requested him and] had finished speaking the unclothed ascetic Pāṭika-putta said "I come, friend, I come, friend". Having spoken he writhed there and was unable to rise from his seat. . . .'[12]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sotāpatti-Saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 55*), *Sutta 30.* (*Licchavi.*) (*PTS, v, p. 389.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Vesāli in the Mahā-vana, in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[13] [2] And Nandaka[14] the Licchavi chief-minister (*mahāmatto*)[15] came to where the Blessed One was. . . . And the Blessed One spoke to the chief-minister thus: 'A disciple of the noble[16] who attains the stream[17] (*sota-panno*) is endowed[18] with four qualities.[19] . . .'[20] [6] When he had finished speaking a certain man said to the chief-minister:

[1] See § 10 [1] below; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3]; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 18 [108], 19; Ch. 14 *c* § 13 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [501]. Cp. Ap. H 5 [93] n, [94] (*meditation*); also Ch. 8 *a* [1] (*quiet*); see Int. § 190 (*noon*).

[2] The title is here applied to Kshatriyas. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [7]; also Int. § 190 (*address*).

[3] *Iddhi-pāṭihāriya*; Ap. I *b* § 4 [5].

[4] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5].

[5] These were Vedic ritualists. Int. § 185; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 5 [5], 6 [2].

[6] Ch. 14 *d* § 6 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [2].

[7] *Samaṇa-Brāhmaṇā*. Ch. 9 *b* § 9 (*religious devotees*); Ch. 13 *d* § 4; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ap. E *c* i § 2.

[8] *Nānā-titthiyā*; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6]. Cp. Ch. 8 *a* [1] (*añña-titthiyā*). The term here apparently is applied very widely to religious philosophers both non-Brāhman and Brāhman (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*).

[9] See below § 6 [2]. Cp. § 8 [1] below.

[10] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].

[11] Int. § 126. See Ch. 12 *c* (*topography*).

[12] The discomfiture of the pretentious ascetic is completed in a comedy of magic or superhuman power (Int. § 94, iii) such as Gotama elsewhere denounces (Ap. I *b* § 4 [5]).

[13] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.

[14] See § 10 [1] n below.

[15] See above § 5 [ii. 1]; Int. § 171.

[16] Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7].

[17] i.e. of conversion. Ap. D *c* § 3 [6].

[18] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1].

[19] Or, things. Ap. H 1 § 6 [9].

[20] Gotama declares these to be clear faith (*pasāda*, Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]) in the Buddha, in the Dhamma, and in the Saṃgha and the practice of the Sīlas; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 13 [3] n, § 21 [5].

'It is bathing-time,[1] respected sir (*bhante*).'[2] 'For the present, good sir (*bhaṇe*),[3] put off (*alaṃ*)[4] this bathing of the outside,' he said; 'this bathing of the inner-self[5] (*ajjh-attaṃ*), that is faith (*pasādo*) in the Blessed One, will be sufficient.'

§ 7. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 35* (*Culla-Saccaka-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 227] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Vesāli in the Mahā-vana, in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[6] And at that time Saccaka,[7] a disciple of the Nigaṇṭha (*Nigaṇṭha-putto*),[8] was dwelling at Vesāli, eloquent, clever, and much respected by the populace. . . . Now the venerable Assaji[9] in the morning . . . entered Vesāli for alms. And Saccaka, the disciple of the Nigaṇṭha, walking and going to and fro in Vesāli saw the venerable Assaji from afar approaching [p. 228]. . . . Standing beside him he addressed him thus: 'How indeed, respected (*bho*) Assaji, does the Samaṇa Gotama instruct his disciples; what sort of injunction (*anu-sāsanī*)[10] prevails among the disciples of the Samaṇa Gotama?' 'The Blessed One thus, ascetic (*Aggivessana*),[11] instructs his disciples; this sort of injunction prevails[12] among the disciples of the Blessed One: "Form,[13] mendicant brothers, is transient (*aniccaṃ*),[14] sensation is transient, perception is transient, individuality is transient, mind is transient. Form, mendicant brothers . . . sensation . . . perception . . . individuality . . . mind is without permanent-self (*an-attā*). All individualities[15] (*saṃkhāra*) are transient [being compounded[16] and therefore originated, and naturally dissolve[17] into that imperishable[18] from which they originated and which is the fundamental[19] substance[20] and impulse];[21] all separate-natures (*dhammā*)[22] are without permanent-self."[23] The Blessed One thus, ascetic, instructs

[1] Int. § 190; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].
[2] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [8].
[3] Ch. 3 § 1.
[4] Literally, enough about.
[5] i.e. the five senses and the mind. Ch. 9 *a* § 7; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [8]; also Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8], Ch. 21 § 11 [33]. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 10 (*souls*), Ap. E *c* i (*an-atta*); also Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9] (*satta*).
[6] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.
[7] Ch. 4 § 17 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]; Ap. G 2 *c*.
[8] Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [165]; also Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7]. For the meaning of *putta* (disciple, or son) see ThB, p. 59. The 'unfettered' disciples are termed *nigaṇṭhā* simply in *Majjh.* 14 (Ch. 11 *c* § 8); Sīha is called *Nigaṇṭha-sāvako* (see § 4 [2] above).
[9] Ch. 5 *c* § 9 [36]; Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [2].
[10] Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 7 (*sāsana*); also Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [3] n.
[11] Ch. 11 *c* §§ 14 [497] n, § 29 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237] n. Rhys Davids (SBB, ii, p. 195) treats this as the name of a family or *gotta*; cp. Chalmers's note (SBB, v, p. 162).
[12] IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*); Ch. 7 *a* § 19 (*declares*); Ch. 13 *c* § 18 (*proclaim*); Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] (*announce*). Cp. IN 2 (*re-birth*).
[13] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [38].
[14] Ap. E *a* i. The opposition of the Jains shows that Gotama's theory was not the ultimate but the proximate dissolution of personality.
[15] Literally, compounds; compositions, i.e. dispositions. Ch. 4 § 18 [1].
[16] Ap. E *a* ii § 2.
[17] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1, *disappearance*).
[18] Ap. G 2 § 5 (*a-saṅkhata*).
[19] Cp. Ap. B *c* § 3.
[20] Ap. C *b* § 10 [1] (*real*).
[21] As in the harmonious activities called *Brahma-vihārā* (Ap. F 2 *b*), which are opposed by the disruptive Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10), the craving, hostility, and fancies of egoism (*ahaṃkāra*, Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [3] n). Cp. Int. § 117.
[22] Ap. E *c* i § 1 (279).
[23] Int. § 4.

his disciples; this sort of injunction prevails among the disciples of the Blessed One.' 'An ill-sound indeed, respected Assaji,' he said, 'is this in our hearing, who hear that the Samaṇa Gotama thus teaches; certainly at this time or another we must encounter this venerable Gotama....' And at that time five hundred[1] Licchavis had assembled in the meeting-place (*santhāgāre*)[2] for some business. And Saccaka ... went to where they were and said: 'Will the respected (*bhonto*) Licchavis come. ... To-day there will be a disputation (*kathā-sallāpo*) between me and the Samaṇa Gotama. ...'[3] [229] Then Saccaka the disciple of the Nigaṇṭha, surrounded by the five hundred Licchavis went to the Mahāvana to the Kūṭāgāra Hall (*yena Mahāvanaṃ Kūṭāgārasālā*).[4] ...[5]

§ 8. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-nipāta (the Fives), Sutta 194. (PTS, iii, p. 236.)*

[1] ... The Blessed One was staying ... in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[6] And at that time the Brāhman[7] Kāraṇapāli was managing the business[8] (*kammantaṃ kareti*) of the Licchavis. And Kāraṇapāli the Brāhman saw the Brāhman Piṅgiyāni[9] from afar approaching ... and addressed him thus: 'Well (*handa*), whence comes the respected (*bhavaṃ*) Piṅgiyāni this early morning?'[10] 'I have just come, sir (*bho*),'[11] he said, 'from the presence of the devotee Gotama.'[12] 'Then what does the respected Piṅgiyāni think of the devotee Gotama's distinction in wisdom[13] (*paññā-veyyattiyaṃ*)?' 'A sage (*paṇḍito*), I think.' ...[14]

§ 9. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 72. (PTS, v, p. 133.)*

[1] ... The Blessed One was staying ... in the Kūṭāgāra Hall[15] together with many well-known elder disciples (*therehi sāvakehi*).[16] ...[17] [2] And at that time many well-known Licchavis on sumptuous chariots[18] in succession with much loud noise dashed up to the Mahāvana to see the Blessed One. Then this thought came to those vener-

[1] Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [1].
[2] See § 4 [1] above.
[3] Omitting picturesque boasts.
[4] Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]. Here the two names may be in apposition; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 3 n; also Ch. 13 *b* § 1 n.
[5] In the discussion which follows Saccaka is convinced.
[6] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.
[7] Int. § 190; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *a* §§ 2 [1], 7.
[8] See § 5 [ii. 1] above.
[9] See *Aṅg. Nik.* v. cxcv (PTS, iii, p. 239), in which he praises Buddha before an assembly of 500 Licchavis.
[10] Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1]; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [2]; Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4]. Cp. Ap. H 5 [91].
[11] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].
[12] Cp. Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3] n.
[13] Or, insight.
[14] After hearing Piṅgiyāni's five similes Kāraṇapāli goes to the Buddha and kneeling upon his right knee (cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3]) becomes a lay disciple.
[15] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.
[16] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18).
[17] Among others are mentioned Cāla and Upacāla (see Mrs. Rhys Davids's *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 46). Ch. 10 *c*.
[18] Ap. B *b* § 4 [12]; cp. Ch. 21 § 4 [14] n.

able [elders]: 'These many Licchavis . . . come with much loud noise to see the Blessed One; whilst contemplation[1] is said by the Blessed One to be impeded by noise.[2] What now if we were to go to the Gosiṇga[3] Sāl-tree wood?[4] There we should abide in comfort without noise or commotion.' [3] Then those venerable [elders] departed to the Gosiṇga Sāl-tree wood. . . .[5]

§ 10. *Aṇguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-nipāta (the Fives), Sutta 58. (PTS, iii, p. 75.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[6] And the Blessed One . . .[7] sat for [his noon] day-rest[8] (*divā-vihāraṃ*) at the foot of a certain tree. And at that time many Licchavi youths[9] with strung bows[10] and surrounded by a number of hounds whilst roaming and wandering to and fro in the Great Forest (*Mahā-vana*)[11] saw the Blessed One and unstringing their bows and fastening their hounds aside drew near to where the Blessed One was . . . and saluting[12] (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One raising their joined palms (*pañjalikā*)[13] attended on the Blessed One in perfect silence. And at that time Mahānāma[14] the Licchavi, roaming[15] and wandering on foot in the Great Forest, saw these Licchavi youths attending in silence . . . and sat beside the Blessed One. . . .[16] 'In whatsoever young clansman (*kula-puttassa*),[17] Mahānāma,' said he, 'are found five things[18] (*dhammā*) there prosperity is to be expected and no decline,[19] whether he be a consecrated[20] king of the warrior-caste[21] or hereditary noble[22]

[1] *Jhāna*. Ap. I *a* (*Trance*).
[2] Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 19 (*crowds*).
[3] Near Nādika. Ch. 12 *e* § 10.
[4] *Sāla-vana-dāya*. Int. § 133.
[5] Gotama instructs the Bhikkhus on the ten impediments (*kaṇṭakā*) to meditation, of which the fifth is noise. Impediments to the first five stages of Jhāna are enumerated (Ap. I *a*, Trance).
[6] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.
[7] After eating the food which he had begged in Vesāḷi. See Ch. 16 *a* § 1.
[8] See § 5 [19] above.
[9] *Kumārakā*. Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92] n.
[10] Int. § 175 (*arms*).
[11] Int. § 133. Or, near Mahāvana.
[12] Ch. 12 *b* §§ 2 [4] (i), 3; and Int. § 190 (*address*). Perhaps, exchanging salutations with (Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [4]). Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237] (*courtesies*).
[13] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].
[14] Other Licchavis mentioned by name are: Abhaya (*Aṇg. Nik.* i, p. 220, ii, p. 200); Bhaddiya (*Aṇg. Nik.* ii, p. 190); Mahāli (*Dīgha*. 6; *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 230, iii, p. 68; *Aṇg. Nik.* v, p. 86; see Ch. 12 *c* §§ 4 [3] n, 5); Nandaka (see § 6 above); Sālha (*Aṇg. Nik.* ii, p. 200); Vaddha (CV, v. xx); also Sunakkhatta Licchavi-putta (Ch. 12 *c* § 10); and Sīha the General (see § 4 [2] above).
[15] Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [108]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [158]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502].
[16] He describes their usual rough behaviour.
[17] Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [vii. 1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [2] n.
[18] Ch. 8 *l*; Ch. 12 *c* § 6 [1]. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 6 [9]. The 'things' here are duties: Ap. F (*System*).
[19] Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2]; Ch. 20 § 2 (1). Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].
[20] *Muddh-ābhisitta*; literally, head-besprinkled. Ch. 7 *b* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 16. Cp. Int. § 162 (*government*); Ch. 1 § 5 [52] (*mahārāja*).
[21] *Khattiya*. Int. § 159.
[22] Or, landholder, *raṭṭhika*; literally, one who belongs to a kingdom; possibly an official.

or general[1] of an army or village-overseer[2] or head of a corporation[3] or those who exercise individual-rule[4] in families (*kulesu*).[5] What five? [2] Here[6] (*idha*), Mahānāma, a clansman respects[7] . . . mother and father.[8] . . . [3] And further he respects . . . child and wife[9] and slave[10] and labouring-folk. . . . [4] Further he respects . . . trade connected with the work of agriculture.[11] . . . [5] Further he respects . . . whatever spirit (*devatā*)[12] should receive dues[13] . . . . [6] Further he respects . . . religious teachers[14] (*samaṇa-brāhmane*).' . . .

b. The Admission of Women to the Order at Vesāli; the Duties of the Bhikkhunīs (Nuns)[15]

§ 1. *Madhurattha-vilāsini*[16] *(commentary on the Buddhavamsa), Introduction.*

He spent . . . the fifth rainy season near Vesāli in the Mahā-vana, in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[17]

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, x, i.*[18]

. . .[19] [2] [After visiting Kapilavatthu] he journeyed by stages[20] [back] to Vesāli . . . and stayed there in the Mahāvana, in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[21] Then Mahā-Pajāpatī[22] the Gotamid[23] (*Gotamī*) having cut off[24] her hair

[1] *Senā-patika.* See § 4 [2] above. Probably a commander of a local clan or feudal levy, though possibly of a centralized 'fourfold array' (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3]); cp. H. G. Q. Wales, *Ancient Siamese Government* (1934), pp. 44–5.

[2] *Gāma-gāmika.* Ch. 11 *a* § 4 [1].

[3] *Pūga-gāmanika.* A *pūga* was a guild or association. Int. § 189 (*trade*); Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1] (*merchant*).

[4] As *patresfamiliarum*. Pāli *paccek-ādhipacca.* Int. § 190 (*family*).

[5] Ap. F 2 *a* (134).

[6] In this regard; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3].

[7] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (1).

[8] Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [viii].

[9] Ch. 9 *b* § 3.

[10] Ch. 1 § 7 [57].

[11] Int. § 189 (*land*).

[12] Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [2] n. In the *Tevijja-Sutta* (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8) Gotama scoffs at belief in Brahmā and the great Vedic gods. His attitude towards the animistic lesser spirits (Int. § 35) is not so clearly defined; but in the *Singālovāda-Sutta* (Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]) he repudiates the worship of the spirits of the several regions. The worship of spirits may much more probably be attributed to his later followers than to himself (IN 8 *a*). Possibly ancestor-worship (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*) may be intended or included.

[13] *Bali*; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (6); Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 8 (*sacrifice*); Ch. 9 *b* § 4 (*offering*).

[14] Or, devotees. Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3].

[15] Ch. 12 *c* § 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 11 [2], 12 [1] n, 13 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1] n (*Channa*); also Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [1] n; Ap. B *a* § 6 [6] (*Nandā*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [6]. In *Saṃ. Nik.* the 5th *Saṃyutta* is named after the Bhikkhunīs. The regulations for Bhikkhunīs constitute the second part of the *Sutta-vibhaṅga* of *Vin. Piṭ.* (iv, pp. 209–351).

[16] Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 12 *a* § 1.

[17] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.

[18] This passage appears also in *Aṅg. Nik.*, *Aṭṭhaka-nipāta* (Eights), Sutta 51. (Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [4]).

[19] During a brief visit to Kapilavatthu at or about the time of his father's death (Ch. 10 *b* § 2) Gotama refuses Mahā-Pajāpati's request for the admission of women to the Order (Ch. 10 *b* § 1, 5th year, n).

[20] Ch. 3 § 5 [166].

[21] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.

[22] The maternal aunt and stepmother of Gotama. Ch. 10 *c* (48); Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [1].

[23] Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 441. Cp. Ch. 1 § 6 n; Ch. 2 § 2.

[24] Int. § 190; Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].

and assumed yellow garments[1] with many Sākiyan[2] women (*Sākiyānīhi*) proceeded towards Vesāli . . . and came to the Kūṭāgāra Hall . . . And the venerable Ānanda[3] saw Mahā-Pajāpatī and spoke to her thus: 'Why dost thou, Gotami,[4] with swollen feet and dust-covered limbs, sorrowful, dejected, tearful, stand weeping outside the gateway (*dvāra-kotthake*)?'[5] 'Because, revered (*bhante*)[6] Ānanda,' she said, 'the Blessed One does not sanction (*anujānati*)[7] for womankind retirement (*pabbajjaṃ*)[8] from the household to the houseless life under the law and discipline made known by the Leader.'[9] 'Then Gotami,' said he, 'stay here for a time whilst I entreat the Blessed One. . . .' [3] Then the venerable Ānanda drew near to where the Blessed One was and . . . seated beside him[10] spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Revered sir (*bhante*), Mahā-Pajāpatī the Gotamid is here. She is standing . . . weeping outside the gateway and says "The Blessed One does not sanction for womankind retirement . . . under the law and discipline made known by the Leader". . . .'[11] 'Enough, Ānanda,' he replied, 'do not demand the retirement of women from the household to the houseless life. . . .'[12] Then the venerable Ānanda thinking '. . . What if now I should entreat the Blessed One by another method[13] . . .' spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Are women capable, revered sir, if they retire from the household life of realizing the reward of conversion[14] (*sota-patti-phalaṃ*) . . .[15] or saintship[16] (*arahattaṃ*)?' 'Women are capable, Ānanda, if they retire from the household life . . . of realizing the reward of conversion . . . and saintship', he replied. 'If, revered sir, women are capable . . . of realizing saintship,' said he, '[let the Blessed One consider that] Mahā-Pajāpatī[17] the Gotamid has been of great service, revered sir, for she, being the sister of the mother[18] of the

[1] Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].
[2] Int. § 164. See § 3 [1] below. There is no mention of the mother of Rāhula among these women (Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 10 *c*, 58).
[3] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[4] Int. § 190 (*address*).
[5] Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [10]; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92].
[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [8]; see [5] below. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [8].
[7] Ch. 8 *a* [4].
[8] Ch. 2 § 3; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [1].
[9] *Tathāgata*. Ch. 8 *d* § 8 [4].
[10] See § 3 below.
[11] Ānanda thrice (Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [2] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [3]) endeavours to persuade Buddha.
[12] The repetition of the phrase 'under the law and discipline made known by the Tathāgata' is doubtless editorial. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [1] n.
[13] Gotama is nowhere else shown as exhibiting deficient authority. His nature indeed, in spite of its deep tenderness and benevolence, must have been intensely resolute (Ch. 3 § 6, *effort*; Ch. 21, MPS, SBE, xi, p. 35) and seems to have been unwittingly imperious (Ch. 19, CV, VII. iii) as might be expected in one possessed of so great a genius for leadership. Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [3] (*Ānanda*) n.
[14] Literally, of stream-attaining, Ap. D *c* § 3 [6].
[15] Omitting 'or the reward of once-returning, or that of not-returning', phrases which seem to show the comparatively late date of the narrative. Ap. D *c* § 3 (*arahatta-phala*) n.
[16] Ap. D *c*. Gotama's reply establishes the spiritual equality of women with men (Int. § 190, *women*; Ap. C *b*, *Note*, n).
[17] Ch. 1 § 7 n; Ch. 10 *c* (48). This sentence is attributed to Ānanda again in *Majjh.* 142 (PTS, iii, p. 253).
[18] Ch 1 § 3.

Blessed One, suckled the Blessed One when his mother died, being to him guardian, nurse, and giver of milk. It would be well, revered sir, that women should be allowed retirement from the household to the houseless life.' . . .

[4] 'If Ānanda,' he said, 'Mahā-Pajāpatī the Gotamid accepts eight rules (*garu-dhamme*)[1] this [form of] admission (*upasampadā*)[2] may be [allowed] to her:—

(i) A mendicant-sister though she may have been ordained a hundred years must offer to a mendicant-brother even though he may have been ordained only a day salutation[3] (*abhi-vādanaṃ*), rising[4] in his presence (*pacc-uṭṭhānaṃ*) with joined palms (*añjali-kammaṃ*),[5] doing obeisance[6] (*sāmīci-kammaṃ*). And this law (*dhammo*), respected,[7] observed, remembered, and honoured, throughout life must not be transgressed.

(ii) A mendicant-sister must not keep the rainy-season [retreat][8] in a locality (*āvāse*)[9] where there are no mendicant-brothers. . . .

(iii) Every fortnight[10] a mendicant-sister must seek of the assembly[11] of mendicant-brothers two things (*dhammā*)—the fixing of Uposatha[12] and attendance for sermons.[13] . . .

(iv) Having kept the rainy-season [retreat][14] a mendicant-sister must request[15] [criticism] in each assembly[16] in three points—what has been seen or what has been heard or what has been suspected. . . .

(v) A mendicant-sister having contravened a rule[17] (*garu-dhammaṃ*),

[1] See (v) below; and Ch. 8 *b* § 7 [1] n. Cp. the Ten Precepts (Ap. H 2 *a*). The subordination of the Order of Bhikkhunīs to the Order of Bhikkhus from the outset is clear. It is probable that we have here within the Eight Rules for Nuns, a picture of what were considered the essentials of the Buddhist discipline. The chief features, in addition to the two Saṃghas and *upasampadā* (ordination), are *vassa* (retreat), the Uposatha-days, the preaching of the Dhamma, and *pavāraṇā* (criticism). It is noticeable that preaching of the Dhamma on Uposatha-days is emphasized (Ap. H 1, *Note*).

[2] Ch. 8 *d*, n. See below (vi) and cp. [6].

[3] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5]; Ch. 14 *c* § 11 [2]; and Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 12 [22] (*presented*).

[4] Ch. 9 *b* § 5. Cp. § 3 below.

[5] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].

[6] Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8]; and Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*). 'And perform all respectful offices', Warren, p. 444. 'Ihn nach Gebühr ehren (honour him according to duty)', Oldenberg, *Buddha* (1923), p. 425.

[7] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [2]; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (4), (6); Ch 20 § 2 (4).

[8] Ch. 8 *c*.

[9] 'District', Warren; 'Districkt', Oldenberg. Ch. 8 *f* § 1 [2].

[10] Ch. 8 *a* [1].

[11] The *Bhikkhu-saṃgha* of the parish (Ch. 8 *f*).

[12] *Uposatha-pucchaka*. Ch. 8 *a*.

[13] *Ovād-upasaṃkamana*. Ch. 8 *b* § 1 (*dhamma*). Sermons were delivered to the *Bhikkhunī-saṃgha* separately (Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [2]; cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [3] n). Nuns were excluded from the Pātimokkha ceremony of the Bhikkhus (Ch. 8 *g* § 6; Ap. H 1 *a* § 3) and this may imply that they could not attend the subsequent discourse, though this was open to the public (Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1]). The nuns had their own Pātimokkha rules (Ap. H 3, *Note*) and on the eve of Uposatha they had their own Pātimokkha (recital and confession) ceremony; CV, x. vi.

[14] *Vassaṃ vasati* means keeps, completes, observes, or passes the rainy-season period of residence in a centre of religious instruction. Ch. 8 *c*.

[15] *Pavāretabbaṃ*. Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [13]. See (viii) below.

[16] The *Bhikkhu-saṃgha* and the *Bhikkhunī-saṃgha*. Ch. 8 A; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [7] (viii).

[17] 'Who has been guilty of a serious sin', Warren. See [4] above.

must undergo penance for a half-month (*pakkha-mānattaṃ*)[1] in each assembly.[2] . . .

(vi) Admission (*upasampadā*)[3] must be sought in each assembly[4] by a woman-student (*sikkhamānāya*)[5] [at the close] of a training[6] in the six laws (*chasu dhammesu*)[7] for two years. . . .

(vii) A mendicant-sister must in no way revile or defame a mendicant-brother. . . .

(viii) From this day forth the speech[8] (*vacana-patho*) of mendicant-sisters towards mendicant-brothers must be restricted [by humility]; the speech of mendicant-brothers towards mendicant-sisters shall not be restricted. And this rule . . . throughout life must not be transgressed. . . .'

[5] Then the venerable Ānanda went to Mahā-Pajāpatī the Gotamid. . . . 'As if (*seyyathāpi*),[9] revered[10] Ānanda,' she said, 'a woman or a man in fresh youth naturally inclined to adornment, having bathed the head[11] and received a garland[12] of blue lotuses[13] or jasmine or *atimuttaka* and accepting it in both hands, should place it on the head, the noblest part, even so, I, revered Ānanda, accept these eight rules which throughout life must not be transgressed.' [6] Then the venerable Ānanda went to where the Blessed One was . . . and spoke thus: 'The eight rules, revered sir, have been accepted by Mahā-Pajāpatī the Gotamid; the sister of the mother of the Blessed One has been admitted (*upasampannā*).'[14] . . .[15] 'As if a man providently,

[1] Ap. H 3 *b* § 1. For *pakkha* (wing or section) see Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (27).
[2] Ch. 8 A.
[3] See [4] above.
[4] Ch. 8 A.
[5] Ch. 8 *g* § 6 [1].
[6] *Sikkhā*. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1]; Ap. H 2, *Note*.
[7] The first six Abstinences (Ch. 8 *l* § 1 [25] n). Cp. Oldenberg, *Buddha*, p. 426.
[8] 'Der Pfad der Rede (the path of speech)', Oldenberg, p. 427. 'Priestesses shall not be allowed to reprove the priests officially', Warren. Reference perhaps is made 'criticism'; see (iv) above.
[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 7. Compare Gotama's own simile in Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169].
[10] See [2] above.
[11] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5]; Ch. 22 *c* §§ 3, 6.
[12] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (8); and Int. § 190 (*dress*).
[13] Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n.
[14] See [4] (*upasampadā*) above, and § 3 [2] below. Cp. the *Ehi Bhikkhu* ordination (Ap. H 2, *Note*); also § 3 [1] below.
[15] Omitting a passage in which Gotama is represented somewhat improbably as condemning his own weakness in admitting women to the Order against his better judgement whilst on the other hand disclosing no case against their admission save that women are physically unable to repel robbers, and such reasons as may be gathered from comparisons in which they are likened to mildew and rust in fields of rice and sugarcane (Int. § 189, *land*). It may be observed that these comparisons are altogether inconsistent with the final simile in which the 'eight rules' are likened to an embankment prudently built to prevent a pond from overflowing. One may suspect that the passage so uncomplimentary to women and to Buddha's action in admitting them to ordination was added by later followers less liberally inclined than the Founder (IN 6, *Canon*). At the same time if Gotama hesitated before admitting them, and judged that special restrictions were necessary, it may have been because of the tenderness in their nature which inclines them to personal adoration or *bhakti* (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*), very marked in Hinduism but eliminated from his creed. The unwillingness to admit women to the Order, here attributed to Gotama, conflicts very markedly with the passage in the MPS, iii, 7, in which

Ānanda,' he said, 'should build an embankment to a great pond to prevent the water from overflowing, even so have I providently appointed for mendicant-sisters eight rules which throughout life must not be transgressed.'

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, X, ii.*

[1] Then Mahā-Pajāpatī the Gotamid drew near to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near and saluted[1] the Blessed One she stood at one side;[2] and standing[3] at one side she spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'How may I, revered sir, proceed with regard to these Sākiyan[4] women?' . . . Then the Blessed One in this connexion (*nidāne*) . . . instructed the mendicant-brothers saying: 'I sanction,[5] mendicant-brothers, the ordaining (*upasampadetum*)[6] of mendicant-sisters by mendicant-brothers.'

[2] Then those mendicant-sisters spoke to Mahā-Pajāpatī the Gotamid thus: 'The noble lady (*ayyā*)[7] is un-admitted (*an-upasampannā*), we are admitted; thus was it decreed by the Blessed One: "Mendicant-sisters must be ordained by mendicant-brothers." ' . . . Then the venerable Ānanda went to the Blessed One. 'At that time, Ānanda,' he said, 'at which the eight rules were accepted by Mahā-Pajāpatī the Gotamid, she was admitted.'[8]

c. The Topography of Vesāli[9]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VIII, i.*

[1] . . .[10] At that time Vesāli was powerful (*iddhā*) and wealthy, populous, crowded, and plentiful in alms; there were 7,707[11] storied-

Gotama is represented as declaring to Māra that he will not die until he has established the brethren and sisters, laymen, and laywomen, in the Doctrine (SBB, iii, p. 112). The omitted passage includes a statement that had women not been admitted the 'good doctrine would have lasted a thousand years, whereas after their admission it would endure no longer than five hundred years'. The terms of this prophecy suggest that it may have been made after the event (Int. § 95; Ch. 22 *b* § 24 n). The real causes of the decay of the Good Doctrine (*saddhamma*) are discussed in *Ang. Nik.* (iii, pp. 247, 338; iv, p. 84).

1 Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1].

2 Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [9], 12 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 11 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [158]; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 20 § 11 [29]. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [1]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [4]; see § 2 [3] above.

3 Cp. § 2 [4] (i) above. See Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*).

4 See § 2 [2] above.

5 Ch. 8 *a* [4].

6 Cp. § 2 [6] above.

7 Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [6]; and Ch. 4 § 2; also Int. § 190 (*address*).

8 See § 2 [6] above.

9 Int. § 147. Vesāli is mentioned without topographical details on several occasions, e.g. MV, vi. xxxi, xxxii, viii. i, xiii, and CV, v. xii, xiv, where the town provides a somewhat vague 'connexion' for minor rules; see also Ch. 13 *b* § 3.

10 Gotama was then staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana (Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [1]). The period intended is evidently early.

11 The passage here included in the Canon is plainly commentarial (IN 6, *Canon*) and the commentator evidently drew upon his imagination for the statistics.

houses,[1] 7,707 gabled-houses,[2] 7,707 gardens,[3] and 7,707 lotus-ponds.[4] . . .[5]

§ 2. *Culla-vagga*, *V*, *xiv*.

[1] Now at that time in Vesāli a succession of choice foods was insisted upon; the mendicant-brothers enjoying choice foods became very unhealthy from fullness of body. And Jīvaka Komārabhacca[6] came to Vesāli on some business . . . and went to the Blessed One . . . and seated at one side said: 'Here, revered sir, the mendicant brothers have become very unhealthy from fullness of body. It would be well if the Blessed One were to sanction for them both exercise[7] (*cankamaṃ*) and the hot-bath[8] (*jant-āgharaṃ*); so the mendicant brothers will be healthy.' . . . In this connexion and on this occasion the Blessed One . . . instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'I sanction[9] the terrace for walking and the bath-house.'

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka*, *Majjhima-Nikāya*, *Sutta 36*. (*Mahā-Saccaka-S.*).[10]

[PTS, i, p. 237] Thus was it heard by me. At one time the Blessed One was staying at Vesāli in the Mahāvana,[11] in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[12] And at that time the Blessed One in the morning[13] was fully dressed (*su-nivattho*), having assumed his outer-robe and alms-bowl, and was intending to enter Vesāli for alms. Now Saccaka,[14] the disciple of the Nigaṇṭha[15] whilst roaming[16] and wandering on foot came to the

[1] Pāli *pāsāda*. Ch. 1 § 8. Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].

[2] Pāli *kūṭ-āgāra*. Ch. 8 *k* [8]; see § 3 [1] below and Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [4]. Literally, pointed-houses. 'Pinnacled buildings', SBE, xvii, p. 171. Possibly gable-windowed buildings are meant as seen in figs. 3, 4, and 5 in RDBI.

[3] *Ārāma*; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 10, 15.

[4] Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169].

[5] Omitting a lengthy gossiping and obviously fabulous account of Ambapālikā the courtesan of Vesāli and of her younger rival Sālavatī the courtesan (Int. § 190) of Rājagaha and of the birth and early career of Jīvaka the great physician, who is here said to have been the illegitimate son of the latter (Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [1] n). If there is any basis of fact in this fanciful narrative, then Ambapālikā must have been an aged woman when the Ambapāli-vana was presented to the Order in the last year of the Buddha's life (see § 11 [xxxi] below). She is, however, probably a wholly exegetical benefactress.

[6] Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [34].

[7] Or, the terrace for walking. Ch. 3 § 7.

[8] Or, steam bath-house. Ap. E 5 [94].

[9] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[10] Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [161] n.

[11] Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [229] n. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 1 (*vana-saṇḍa*).

[12] See § 1 above. Int. § 126; Ch. 12 *a* §§ 1, 4 n, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10; Ch. 12 *b* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11]; Ch. 16 *b* § 1; Ch. 21 § 13 [49] n; Ap. C *b* § 4. See also § 1 above. The Kūṭāgāra Hall at Vesāli is mentioned in 2 Suttas in the *Dīgha-Nik.*, 5 in *Majjh. Nik.*, 15 in *Saṃ. Nik.*, and 20 in *Aṅg. Nik.*; in the MV of *Vin. Piṭ.* the name is used specifically on one occasion only, in the CV on four occasions and in the *Sutta-Vibhaṅga* on some eleven occasions. The place, or part of it, is called a *vihāra* in § 4 [4] below. 'The Gabled Hall', SBB, v, p. 170. Literally, peaked dwelling hall; cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 15 [1] (*āgāra*).

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 9 [1].

[14] Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [227].

[15] Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1].

[16] Ch. 11 *c* § 29; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1].

Mahāvana to the Kūṭāgāra Hall (*yena Mahāvanaṃ Kūṭāgāra-sālā*).[1] And the venerable Ānanda[2] saw Saccaka the disciple of the Nigaṇṭha from afar approaching and . . . said to the Blessed One: 'Here, revered sir, comes Saccaka, the disciple of the Nigaṇṭha, eloquent, clever, and much respected by the populace. He speaks in dispraise of the Buddha, of the Dhamma, and of the Saṃgha. It would be well, revered sir, if the Blessed One would stay awhile and take compassion[3] [on him]. The Blessed One seated himself on the appointed[4] seat. Then Saccaka . . . having drawn near exchanged courtesies[5] (*sammodi*) with the Blessed One and having gone through the current phrases[6] of courtesy seated himself at one side. . . .[7]

§ 4. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 6* (*Mahāli-S.*).[8]

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Vesāli in the Mahāvana in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[9] Now at that time many Brāhmans,[10] being Kosalan[11] and Māgadhan[12] envoys,[13] were dwelling at Vesāli for some business.[14] And they heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . is staying at Vesāli. . . .'[15] [2] And they proceeded to the Mahāvana, to the Kūṭāgāra Hall (*yena Mahāvanaṃ Kūṭāgāra-sālā*). Now at that time the venerable Nāgita[16] was the Blessed One's attendant[17] (*upaṭṭhāko*). . . . 'It is not the time, friends (*āvuso*),' he said, 'to see the Blessed One; the Blessed One is contemplating (*patisallīno*).'[18] Then the Brāhmans . . . sat down there aside (*ekamantaṃ*).[19] . . . [3] Oṭṭhaddha[20] the Licchavi also together with a great company of Licchavis proceeded to the Mahāvana, to the Kūṭāgāra Hall. [4] Then the Blessed One having come out[21] from the *vihāra*[22] seated him-

1 Here the two names may be in apposition; the text suggests that Mahāvana here may be not the great forest but a particular spot in it. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 3 n (*Isipatana*); Ch. 11 *c* § 6 (*Veḷuvane Kalandakanivāpe*); Ch. 11 *c* § 9 (*Moranivāpa*); Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91] (*migadāya*); Ch. 14 *a* (*Jetavana*); and § 9 [481] below.

2 Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

3 Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14].

4 *Paññatta*; indicated, special. Ch. 11 *c* § 15; see § 4 [4] below.

5 Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (15); Ch. 13 *d* § 5 [387]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [2]; and Int. § 190 (*address*). Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*saluting*).

6 Or, correct interchange of speech (*kathaṃ sārāṇīyaṃ*). See § 4 [5] below; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [2]; Ch. 20 § 11 [29]; Ch. 22 *b* § 15; and Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9]; Cp. Ch. 20 § 7 [11] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 22. For details see Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91]; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2].

7 After a discussion on the training (*bhāvanā*) of body and mind Gotama enters upon the famous narrative of his renunciation and enlightenment; Ch. 2 § 5 n. He addresses Saccaka throughout as Aggivessana; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228].

8 Ap. C *b* § 4. See Ch. 14 *a* § 2.

9 Ch. 12 *a* § 1.

10 Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1].

11 Int. § 158 (4), Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 3 (*Pasenadi*).

12 Int. § 158 (2).

13 Pāli *dūtā*. Ch. 14 *a* § 2 [1]; and Int. § 172; cp. Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5].

14 Ch. 14 *a* § 7; and Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [20].

15 As in Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].

16 See *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, pp. 31, 341, iv, p. 341; also Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (20th year). He is also called Kassapa below. For the clan name Kassapa cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1].

17 Ministrant or body-servant; Ap. H 5 [93].

18 Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

19 Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].

20 He is also called Mahāli below; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] n.

21 Contrast the superfluous marvels at Rājagaha; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [4] n. The simpler style doubtless is not only nearer the truth but earlier in date (Int. § 3; IN 6, *Canon*).

22 Ch. 8 *g*; and Int. § 133. See § 3 (*Kūṭāgāra Hall*) n above.

self on the appointed[1] seat in the shade[2] of the *vihāra*. [5] Then those Brāhmans, the Kosalan and Māgadhan envoys . . . having drawn near exchanged courtesies with the Blessed One and having gone through the current phrases[3] of courtesy sat down at one side. And Oṭṭhaddha the Licchavi together with the great company of Licchavis . . . having drawn near and saluted[4] (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One sat down at one side. And seated at one side Oṭṭhaddha the Licchavi addressed the Blessed One. . . .[5]

§ 5. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-Saṃyutta (Saṃ. 22), Sutta 60 (Mahāli). (PTS, iii, p. 68.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[6] [2] And Mahāli[7] the Licchavi came to the Blessed One . . . and sitting at one side spoke thus to the Blessed One: [3] 'Pūrana Kassapa,[8] revered sir, says thus: "There is no cause (*hetu*),[9] there is no condition-precedent[10] (*paccayo*) for the impurity[11] (*saṃkilesāya*) of beings, beings are impure without cause or precedent condition. There is no cause, there is no condition-precedent for the purity[12] (*visuddhiyā*) of beings, beings are pure without cause or precedent condition." About this[13] (*idha*) what does the Blessed One say?' [4] 'There is cause, Mahāli, there is condition-precedent. . . .'[14]

§ 6. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Aṭṭhaka-Nipāta (the Eights), Sutta 52. (PTS, iv, p. 279.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[15] And the venerable Ānanda[16] came to the Blessed One . . . and sitting

[1] See § 3 [237] above.

[2] Possibly in a raised veranda; Ch. 21 § 7 [24]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119]; Ap. H 5 [93] (*staircase*).

[3] See § 3 [237] above.

[4] Or, exchanged greetings with. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2]; Ch. 21 § 9 [2]. Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (1), *abhivādanaṃ*.

[5] In the ensuing dialogue Gotama declares that his teaching offers higher things than heavenly sights and sounds (*dibbāni rupāni, dibbāni saddāni*; Ap. C *b* § 4 [13]); cp. Ap. C *b* § 9, and Ap. B *c* § 1 (1, *divine vision*) and that the way thereto is the Eightfold Path (Ap. F 2 *d*). He also refers to a discourse given by him at Kosambi; Ch. 15 *b* (i) in which he declined to discuss metaphysical questions (Ap. G 1 *a*, ii) distracting the mind from its quest of impersonality through the four Jhānas (Ap. I *a*).

[6] Ch. 12 *a* § 1.

[7] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] n. In the *Sagātha-vagga* of the *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, i, p. 230) Buddha gives Mahāli an account of Sakka's previous existence as a virtuous man (Int. § 69).

[8] Int. § 179. The opinions here attributed to him are elsewhere attributed at least in part to Makkhali Gosāla; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [20].

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 19; Ap. E *c* i § 9.

[10] Or, dependence; Ch. 4 § 11 [i. 5] (*bases*). Cp. Ap. B *c* (*samuppāda*).

[11] Depravity or defilement. Ch. 1 § 11 [163].

[12] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]; and Ap. E *a* i (277). Compare *vi-mutti* (Ap. D *a* § 6), and *samādhi* (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]); also Int. § 3 (*non-egoism*) and Ch. 5 *c* § 4 [46] (*nibbindati*).

[13] Ch. 12 *a* § 19 [2]; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].

[14] The discourse explains that impurity and purity arise from attachment to and detachment from form, sensation, perception, individuality (*saṃkhārā*, Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]), and the ego-mind (*viññāna*, Ap. B *c* § 3 [18]; Ap. E *a* ii, *Khandhas*). This is an ethical and non-metaphysical answer; and implies the freedom of the will to choose (*Int.* § 8).

[15] Ch. 12 *a* § 1.

[16] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].

at one side spoke thus: 'With what things[1] (*dhammehi*), revered sir, should a mendicant brother be endowed[2] who is appointed as preacher[3] to the mendicant-sisters[4] (*bhikkhunovādako*)?' 'With eight things, Ānanda,' he said. . . .[5]

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Opamma-Saṃyutta*[6] (*Sam. 20*), *Sutta 8* (*Kalingara*). (*PTS, ii, p. 267.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed . . . in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[7] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . . [3] 'The Licchavis[8] now use a log pillow,[9] are zealous and fervent[10] (*ā-tāpino*) in service.[11] Against them the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu,[12] the son of the Videhan[13] consort, gets no chance, gets no opening. [4] Some time hence the Licchavis will become delicate, soft-handed, tender-footed. . . . Against them the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu . . . will get an opening. [5] The mendicant brothers now use a log-pillow, are zealous and fervent in service. Against them Māra[14] the Evil (*pāpimā*) gets no chance, gets no opening. [6] Some time hence[15] the mendicant brothers will become delicate, soft-handed, tender-footed. . . . Against them Māra the Evil . . . will get an opening.'

§ 8. *Anguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-Nipāta* (*the Fives*), *Sutta 143.* (*PTS, iii, p. 167.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed . . . in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[16] And at that time the Blessed One in the morning . . . entered Vesāli for alms. Now at that time this informal conversation[17] arose among five hundred[18] Licchavis[19] who were assembled and sitting together at the Sārandada[20] shrine[21] (*Sārandade cetiye*): [2] 'Of five treasures[22] (*rata-*

[1] Or, qualities. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [7]; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5]; cp. Part I (title) n.

[2] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1].

[3] Or, instructor. Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [2].

[4] Ch. 10 *c* (42); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii).

[5] The final qualification is that he should have been ordained for at least twenty years (*vīsati-vassa*, cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 1 [5]). The other qualifications are dutifulness, learning, eloquence, kindliness, good character and the like.

[6] Book of Comparisons.

[7] Ch. 12 *a* § 1.

[8] Ch. 12 *a*; Ch. 19 *d* (*Vajjians*).

[9] *Kalingar-ūpadhāna*; perhaps a plank bed is meant. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]; Ch. 23 *b* § 7 [6] n. See Int. § 190 (*furniture*).

[10] Or, strenuous. Ch. 21 § 3 [12]. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10] (*tapa*)

[11] In the martial arts. Cp. 1 § 8 (*sippa*).

[12] Int. § 166; Ch. 12 *a* § 2 n.

[13] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 12 *e* § 13.

[14] Ap. G 2 *b*.

[15] *An-āgataṃ*, in the future; cp. Ap. A 1 *a* (*Anāgata-Vaṃsa*). Plainly this prophetic Sutta was composed after Ajātasattu's conquest and Buddha's death; IN 6 (*Canon*), and Int. § 95.

[16] Ch. 12 *a* § 1.

[17] *Antarā-kathā*; possibly, debate.

[18] Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]; see also *Ang. Nik.* iii, p. 239, where also 'five hundred Licchavis' are mentioned. The figure may be conventional (cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2]) but may indicate the regular number of the Licchavi public assembly (Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1]).

[19] Ch. 12 *a*.

[20] Int. § 134; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2].

[21] Int. § 134.

[22] Or, jewels; Ap. A 2 *a* (4).

nānaṃ) the manifestation is rare in this world (*lokasmiṃ*). Of which five? The elephant treasure . . . the steed . . . the gem . . . the consort . . . the treasurer[1] . . .' [3] . . .[2]

§ 9. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 71 (1st Vacchagotta-S.).*[3]

[PTS, i, p. 481] . . . The Blessed One stayed . . . in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[4] Now at that time Vacchagotta[5] the Wanderer[6] (*paribbājako*) was dwelling at Ekapuṇḍarīka,[7] the Wanderers' Garden (*Ekapuṇḍarike paribbājakārāme*).[8] Then in the morning[9] the Blessed One . . . entered Vesāli for alms. Then the Blessed One thought: 'It is too early yet to go round for alms in Vesāli. What if now I should go to Ekapuṇḍarīka, the Wanderers' Garden (*yena Ekapuṇḍarīko paribbājakārāmo*), where Vacchagotta the Wanderer is.' . . . And Vacchagotta the Wanderer saw the Blessed One approaching from afar and . . . said: 'Let the Blessed One come, revered sir; welcome[10] (*sāgataṃ*), revered sir, to the Blessed One. . . .' The Blessed One seated himself on the appointed[11] seat and Vacchagotta the Wanderer [482] choosing a lower[12] (*nīcaṃ*) seat sat down at one side. . . .[13]

§ 10. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 12 (Mahā-Sīhanāda-S.).*[14]

[PTS, i, p. 68] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Vesāli outside the city in the Avarapura[15] Grove (*avarapure vana-saṇḍe*).[16] Now at that

[1] Or, banker; *gahapati-ratana*. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* §§ 2 [1], 5 [7].

[2] Gotama on his way back from the city is invited to the meeting and after asking what has been the subject of conversation (or debate) states that the five treasures are as follows, a Tathāgata (Ap. A 2 *c*), a teacher of his Law, one who understands such a teacher, one who attains the essence of the Law (*dhamm-ānu-dhamma*; Ap. G 1 *b*; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228] (*injunction*)—one who perceives (*kata-ññū*) and is mindful of the past (*kata-vedī*). It would appear that the last has learnt the essence of the Law.

[3] Or, *Tevijja-Vacchagotta-Suttanta*.

[4] Ch. 12 *a* § 1.

[5] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1); Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [2]; also Ap. G 2 *c*. Vacchagotta the wandering philosopher figures also in *Majjh*. 72 at Sāvatthi and *Majjh*. 73 at Rājagaha as well as in *Saṃyutta* xliv of *Saṃ. Nik.* (iv, pp. 398–401) at a place unspecified and in the same *Saṃyutta* (iv, pp. 401–2) at Ñātika (Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [2]; also in the Threes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (i, p. 160) without location. *Saṃyutta* xxxiii is named after him, the scene of all the Suttas being Sāvatthi. The name Vaccha is very common; see Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 101.

[6] Int. § 126; Ch. 11 *c* § 9 [1].

[7] Int. § 133. This garden was allotted specifically to the Wanderers; their rights in the Kūṭāgāra Hall are not so clear.

[8] Int. § 126. Cp. § 3 [237] n above.

[9] Ch. 11 *c* § 9 [1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1].

[10] Int. § 190 (*address*). Similar phrases are used of other visits; Ch. 11 *c* § 9 n.

[11] Ch. 11 *c* § 15; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [5].

[12] Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [5]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]; Ch. 23 *a* [7]. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*place*); Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] (*mat*); Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [13] (*high*).

[13] Gotama on being questioned states that he is *te-vijjo* (Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ap. I *a*, *knowledge*) or possessed of threefold knowledge, namely knowledge of the past (Ap. B *c* § 1, 1), the divine eye (Ap. I *b* § 3) or knowledge of the future, and knowledge which is the liberation of the mind through the destruction of the taints (Ap. D *a* § 7).

[14] Greater Discourse called *Declaration of Faith*. Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [55] n.

[15] Apparently an outlying village. Int. § 133. 'In the dense forest to the west', SBE, v, p. 45.

[16] Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1].

time Sunakkhatta[1] the Licchavi[2] (*Licchavi-putto*) had recently seceded[3] from that doctrine and discipline[4] [of the Niganṭhas], and in a meeting at Vesāli he stated that: 'The devotee Gotama's noble knowledge and insight is not superhuman, the devotee Gotama teaches a doctrine based upon reasoning.'[5] . . .[6]

§ 11. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI, xxix–xxx.*

[xxix. 1] Now[7] the Blessed One came to Koṭigāma.[8] There he stayed . . . and instructed the mendicant brothers. 'Through not understanding, mendicant brothers, through not penetrating[9] four noble truths,[10] thus this long time [our] course of straying has been run[11] (*sandhāvitaṃ saṃsaritaṃ*), mine and yours. . . . [2] But, mendicant brothers, when the noble truth as to sorrow is understood and penetrated; and the noble truth as to the origin of sorrow . . . the noble truth as to the cessation of sorrow . . . the noble truth as to the road leading to the cessation of sorrow . . . the craving for individual-existence[12] (*bhavataṇhā*) is broken up;[13] the conduit[14] of individual-existence (*bhava-nettī*) is destroyed;[15] there is not now individual-re-existence[16] (*puna-bbhavo*). . . .[17]

[1] Ch. 12 *a* §§ 5 [19], 10 [1] n. He is mentioned as a recent convert in *Dīgha-Nik.* 6 (i, p. 152). As a former Jain he inquired specially regarding liberation (Ch. 4 § 17 [249] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]). He subsequently seceded from the Buddhist community, but the present text apparently relates to an earlier period.

[2] Ch. 12 *a*.

[3] Or, was soon to secede.

[4] *Dhamma-vinaya*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii).

[5] *Takka*; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3). Cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 1 (*sayaṃ*). The subsequent repudiation of this rational view of Buddha for a more mystical conception of him later in this Sutta is plainly due to changing orthodoxy (IN 6, *Canon*).

[6] Buddha on being told restates to Sāriputta various points of his doctrine and recounts his early austerities (Ch. 3 § 7; Ch. 4 § 17 [249] n).

[7] In the last year of his life. The narrative is continued from the close of Ch. 11 *d* § 15.

[8] Ch. 12 *e* §§ 4, 5. An outlying village between the north bank of the Ganges and the city of Vesāli; the discourse here given is found also in *Saṃyutta* lvi of *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, p. 431), where it is located 'among the Vajjī' (Ch. 12 *d*), and appears again in MPS, ii. 1 (Ch. 21 § 1 [2]). See (xxx. 1) below.

[9] Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7].

[10] Ch. 4 § 17.

[11] Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*); see Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [2] n; Ch. 21 § 17 [2]. 'We have had to run so long, to wander so long in this weary path of transmigration', SBE, xvii, p. 104, and xi, p. 23. Gotama may have said this of mankind in general (cp. Ap. B *a* § 2 [8]), not of individuals. Only thus would the statement be logical, or even accordant with the *Milinda-pañha* (Ap. B *b* § 1). The Jains taught the end of Karma through penance (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]); Gotama did not merely substitute for penance the Truths. He replaced, at least for his times, the egoistic *karma* doctrine by the monistic and altruistic *an-atta* creed (Int. § 3), though the persistent ego-centred doctrine re-entered and returned to power. The obvious and even materialistic egoism of the later Mahāyāna school caused a second reaction which led to the subtler quietism of idealistic Mahāyānism (Ap. D *b*).

[12] Or, selfhood. Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ap. D *a* § 1 [421]. Cp. § 12 [20] (*bhav-āsava*) below.

[13] This breaking up of selfhood is plainly the goal of the fourth Truth; Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-transcendence*).

[14] Or, channel; Ch. 21 § 17 [2]. Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73]. Cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (80).

[15] Or, ended; *khīnā*. Ch. 4 § 17 [249]. 'That which leads to renewed existence is destroyed', SBE, xvii, p. 105 and xi, p. 23.

[16] Or, survival of individuality. This is eradicated when the oneness of all things is perceived (Ch. 4 § 18 [3]; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]). 'There is no more birth', SBE. Cp. Ch. 4 § 16 [167].

[17] Omitting verses; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

[xxx. 1] And Ambapāli[1] the courtesan[2] (*gaṇikā*) heard that the Blessed One had come to Koṭigāma;[3] and . . . having caused many sumptuous chariots[4] to be made ready mounted one and went out from Vesāli . . . to see the Blessed One. . . .[5] [3] And the Licchavis[6] of Vesāli heard that the Blessed One had come to Koṭigāma; and . . . having caused many sumptuous chariots to be made ready each mounted one and went out from Vesāli . . . to see the Blessed One. Some of the Licchavis were blue[7] (*nīlā*), blue in colour, clothes, and ornaments;[8] some were yellow[9] (*pītā*), yellow in colour, clothes, and ornaments; some were red (*lohitakā*), red[10] in colour, clothes, and ornaments; some were white (*odātā*), white[11] in colour, clothes, and ornaments. . . .[12] [5] . . .[13] [6] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Koṭigāma as long as he wished went to Ñātikā,[14] and there at Ñātikā (*Ñātike*) the Blessed One stayed in the Brick-house[15] (*Giñjak-āvasathe*). Now when the night had elapsed Ambapāli the courtesan in her own garden (*ārāme*) caused choice food . . . to be prepared and . . . informed the Blessed One that it was time. Then the Blessed One in the morning[16] came to where the food-distribution[17] (*parivesanā*) of

[1] See § 1 [1] n above. The MV and MPS accounts of these events differ in details whilst agreeing in substance and language. The MV is the more consistent account, but is not necessarily therefore the earlier. Both accounts plainly are compilations (IN 6, *Canon*). It is possible that both narratives are purely products of commentarial fancy, arising out of the chance name of the 'Mango-keeper's orchard' (Ch. 21 §§ 3 [11], 4 [14]); cp. Ch. 14 c § 1 [9] n. In the commentary on *Psalms of the Sisters* (lxvi) Ambapāli is said to have been born spontaneously at the foot of a mango tree and to have been converted in her old age by her son.

[2] Int. § 190.

[3] See [xxix. 1] above. In the MPS (*Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 95) the place is Ambapāli's mango-grove at Vesāli (Ch. 21 § 4 [14]).

[4] Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [7]; Ch. 19 *d* § 2 [3]; Ap. B *b* § 4 [12]. See Ch. 21 § 4 [14–18] n.

[5] Omitting Buddha's religious instruction to Ambapāli and his acceptance of her invitation to a meal.

[6] Ch. 12 *a*.

[7] Indigo. 'Dark', SBE, xvii, p. 106 and xi, p. 31. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4), *black*.

[8] *Alaṃkāra*. Ch. 9 *b* § 6; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [161]. Cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; also Int. § 190 (*dress*).

[9] Perhaps golden. 'Fair', SBE. It seems possible that these colours indicate factions; this would spare the absurdity of wearing ornaments to match the skin; but fairies or spirits (*devatā*; Int. § 35) of these four colours are mentioned in *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, p. 263); cp. Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [5] n. Cp. *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 273), where Pūrana Kassapa (Int. § 179) is said to distinguish six classes of people according to colour; the present four, black and purest white Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524] n. The four colours appear also in MPS, iii. 29–32, and in the *kasiṇa* modes of self-hypnosis (Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3]). Cp. also Ap. D *a*, *Note* (*attitude*).

[10] 'Ruddy', SBE.

[11] 'Pale', SBE. Cp. Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84] (*fair*).

[12] Omitting their encounter with Ambapāli on the road.

[13] Omitting Gotama's comparison of the approaching Licchavis to the Tāvatiṃsa gods (Int. § 70) and his refusal of their invitation as he had accepted that of Ambapāli.

[14] Int. § 147. The name is here plural. This visit is placed in another context in the MPS account (Ch. 21 § 4 [14]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [6]). The present context suggests that Ñātika was in the immediate neighbourhood of Vesāli.

[15] Ch. 12 *e* § 5 [6]; Ch. 21 § 2 [5]; and Int. § 190 (*architecture*).

[16] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[17] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [4]. The SBE (xi, p. 33) translation of the MPS account has 'Ambapāli's dwelling-house', reading *nivesanaṃ* (cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]). This would place the meal in her city house instead of in the garden.

Ambapāli the courtesan was. . . .[1] And when the Blessed One having eaten had withdrawn his hand from the bowl,[2] she sat down[3] at one side . . . and said: 'I give,[4] revered sir, this Ambapāli-grove (*Ambapāli-vanaṃ*)[5] to the mendicant-community headed by the Buddha.' The Blessed One accepted the garden. And the Blessed One having enlightened . . . Ambapāli with a discourse on the Law,[6] rose from his seat and went to the Mahāvana.[7] . . .

§ 12. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya 16 (Mahā-parinibbāna-S.), ii. 20–22.*[8]

[20] And there also staying at Vesāli in the Ambapāli-grove[9] the Blessed One delivered that full[10] (*bahulaṃ*) religious discourse[11] to the mendicant brothers: 'Such is duty[12] (*sīlaṃ*), such is self-transcendence[13] (*samādhi*), such is insight[14] (*paññā*). When infused by[15] duty self-transcendence is greatly fruitful, greatly commendable; when infused by self-transcendence insight is greatly fruitful, greatly commendable. The [whole] mind (*cittaṃ*)[16] infused by insight [thus pervaded by self-transcendence and by duty] is completely liberated (*vimuccati*)[17] from the taints,[18] that is to say from the taint of desire,[19] from the taint of individuality,[20] from the taint of wrong-outlook,[21] from the taint of ignorance.[22]

[21] And the Blessed One having stayed as long as he wished in the Ambapāli-Grove instructed the venerable Ānanda[23] saying: 'Come, Ānanda, we will go to Beluva-gāmaka.'[24] . . . And the Blessed One with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to Beluva-gāmaka. . . . [22] And there[25] the Blessed One instructed the mendicant

1 As in Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7] with necessary changes.
2 Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4]; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]; also Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1] n.
3 Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].
4 Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [18].
5 See § 12 [20] below. SBE (xi, p. 33) erroneously has 'mansion' for 'garden', reading *ārāmaṃ*.
6 Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4].
7 Ch. 12 *a* § 1. The MPS account merely states that he departed, whilst the next section recounts a sermon to the brethren in the garden, and the following section takes him to Beluva-gāmaka (see § 12 below; Ch. 21 § 4 [19]).
8 SBE, xi numbers as ii. 25–7.
9 See § 11 [6] above.
10 Literally, abundant, abounding [in instruction]. 'Comprehensive', SBE, xi, pp. 11, 24, 28, 34.
11 Int. §§ 29, 30, 53; Ch. 20 § 8; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3.
12 Ap. H 4 *a*; and Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4].
13 Ap. F 2 *d*.
14 Ap. F 2 *a* (132).
15 'Set round with', SBE, xi, p. 34.
16 Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].
17 Cp. Ch. 4 § 16 (*vimutti*).
18 Ap. D *a* § 7.
19 It is hardly possible to distinguish *kāma* from *rāga*; the four (sometimes three) Taints are equivalent to the three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10).
20 Bhav-āsava; cp. § 11 [2] (*bhava-taṇhā*) above.
21 The foremost *diṭṭhi* here denounced must be the false view of Karma (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]) taken by the Jains. Cp. Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 ii [29] (*views*).
22 *Avijjā*; Ap. D *b*.
23 Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
24 Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] n; Ch. 21 § 6 [21]; Ap. E *c* ii § 4. Also *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 349; *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 342.
25 This and the four succeeding sections of the MPS are found in and may be borrowed from *Saṃyutta* xlvii of *Saṃ. Nik.* (v. pp. 152–4).

brothers saying: 'Come, mendicant brothers, do you in every part of[1] Vesāli keep the rainy season[2] (*vassaṃ upetha*), [grouping yourselves] according as you are friends and intimates faring together.[3] I for my part will enter upon the rainy season [retreat] here at Beluva-gāmaka.'

d. The Vajjian[4] Shrines[5]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya 16 (MPS), iii. 1–2.*[6]

[1] . . . The Blessed One entered Vesāli for alms . . . and after his meal[7] returning from his begging-round he instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Take a mat[8] (*nisīdanaṃ*), Ānanda; I will go to the Cāpāla[9] shrine (*Cāpālaṃ cetiyaṃ*) for the [noon] day-rest.'[10] 'Even so, revered sir,' replied the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One, and taking up the mat he followed closely after the Blessed One. [2] And the Blessed One . . . having arrived sat down on the appointed seat and the venerable Ānanda, having saluted[11] (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One, sat down at one side. Then . . . the Blessed One spoke thus: 'Delightful,[12] Ānanda, is Vesāli, delightful is the Udena[13] shrine (*Udenaṃ cetiyaṃ*), delightful the Gotamaka[14] shrine, delightful the Sattambaka[15] shrine, delightful the Bahuputta[16] shrine (*Bahupattuṃ cetiyaṃ*), delightful the Sārandada[17] shrine, delightful the Cāpāla[18] shrine. . . .[19]

[1] 'Round about', SBE. [2] Ch. 8 *c*.

[3] Ch. 21 § 6 [22]; and Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]. Compare the arrangements made by Dabba in Rājagaha (Ch. 11 *c* § 24 [4]). In neither case is there mention of the parishes (Ch. 8 *f*) prescribed for Uposatha. [4] Int. § 133. [5] Int. § 134.

[6] This passage follows immediately after Buddha's sermon on self-reliance delivered at Beluva-gāmaka (Ap. E *c* ii § 4) after his sickness there. It occurs also in *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, pp. 259–63) and *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 308–13) where the opening scene is the Kūṭāgāra Hall. See Ch. 21 § 9 [2], and § 12 n [41–7].

[7] Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 18 [108], 19; Ch. 21 § 9 [1]; also Ch. 3 § 2.

[8] Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171] (*place*); Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [9]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482] (*lower*). Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2] (*lower*); Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354] (*fourfold*); Ch. 16 *a* § 1 (*ballet*); Ch. 19 *b* § 2 (*bedding*). 'Here', says *Comy*, 'a skin is meant', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 230.

[9] Int. § 134. See [2] below; and Ch. 21 § 9 [1]. The shrine must have been within easy walking distance of the village of Beluva (Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [21]), or according to other authority the Kūṭāgāra Hall, perhaps without inconsistency.

[10] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]. 'To spend the day', SBE, xi, p. 40. [11] Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5].

[12] Int. § 133; Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43]. [13] See § 2 below.

[14] See below §§ 2, 3, 4. Also *Sutta-vibhaṅga, Nissaggiya*, i. 1 (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 195).

[15] See § 2 below.

[16] See § 2 below. A shrine of this name existed also near Nālandā (Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16]).

[17] Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [1]. See § 5 below. [18] See [1] above.

[19] The greater part of the rest of this chapter (*Bhāṇavāra* iii) of the MPS, in which Buddha promises Māra that he will die shortly and then blames Ānanda (Ch. 21 § 12 n [41]) for having failed earlier to persuade him to live for the rest of the age (*kappa*), is evidently a comparatively late addition to the narrative (Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n; and IN 6, *Canon*), which it delays and greatly confuses. Its intention plainly is to explain the Buddha's mortality away by a monkish exegesis on his plain statement that to die is natural to him as to all (SBE, xi, p. 59). The earlier portion of the passage is found also in *Saṃyutta* li of *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, pp. 259–63), and somewhat more extensively in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 308–13). For the last portion of the *bhāṇavāra* see Ch. 21 § 12 [48].

§ 2. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 24 (Pātika-S.), I, 11–14.*

[11] 'Once, Bhaggava,[1] I was staying . . . in the Kūṭāgāra Hall.[2] And at that time the unclothed ascetic[3] Kandaramasuka[4] was dwelling at Vesāli having acquired high gain and fame[5] in Vajji-gāma[6] (*Vajji-gāme*). His seven items of observance (*vatta-padāni*)[7] performed and undertaken by him were: "Throughout life[8] (*yāva-jīvaṃ*) let me be an unclothed ascetic; let me not wear a garment. Throughout life let me be holy-living (*brahma-cārī*);[9] let me not commit sexual sin.[10] Throughout life let me live on intoxicants and flesh;[11] let me not eat boiled-rice and clotted-milk (*odana-kummāsaṃ*).[12] Let me not pass beyond the Vesāliyan shrine called Udena[13] on the east. Let me not pass beyond the Vesāliyan shrine called Gotamaka[14] on the south. Let me not pass beyond the Vesāliyan shrine called Sattamba[15] on the west. Let me not pass beyond the Vesāliyan shrine called Bahuputta[16] on the north." ' . . .[17]

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VIII, xiii.*

[1] . . . During the course of the journey[18] between Rājagaha and Vesāli the Blessed One saw many Bhikkhus overloaded with robes. They were going along bearing rolls[19] of clothes on head, shoulder, and hip. . . . [2] At Vesāli the Blessed One stayed at the Gotamaka[20] shrine. Now at that time the Blessed One in the cold winter nights between the Eights[21] (*antar-aṭṭhakāsu*), in the season when the frost occurs, sat during the night in the open air wearing one robe. . . . When the first watch[22] had passed the Blessed One felt cold; the Blessed One put on a second robe. . . . When the middle watch had passed, the Blessed One felt cold; the Blessed One put on a third robe. . . . When the last watch had passed, as the sun rose and night became day,[23] the Blessed One felt cold and put on a fourth robe. . . . [3] Now

[1] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15]. [2] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.
[3] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15]. [4] Ap. G 2 *c*.
[5] *Yasa*; Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7]. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524] (*gain*).
[6] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 (*Vajjī*).
[7] Cp. *sikkhā-padāni* (Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1]); Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [21] (*chief rule*).
[8] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] (1). [9] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (3).
[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]. [11] This may be sectarian humour.
[12] Int. § 190 (*food*); and Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [7]. [13] See § 1 [2] above.
[14] See § 1 [2] above. [15] See § 1 [2] above. [16] See § 1 [2] above.
[17] The ascetic is admired by the volatile Sunakkhatta Licchavi-putto (Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]), but oversteps the bounds of the 'Vesāliyan shrines', eats boiled rice and junket, and dies in obscurity. The whole incident, meant to illustrate Gotama's superhuman powers (Int. § 94, iii), appears to be an interlude due to commentarial humour and intended to combine amusement with edification. IN 6 (*Canon*).
[18] *Addhāna-magga*; 'On the high road', SBE, xvii, p. 210. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16].
[19] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2] (*bedding*); also Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3] (*requisites*).
[20] See § 1 [2] above. This must have been in the early days of Buddha's ministry.
[21] i.e. during the half-month between the eighth day preceding the full moon and the eighth day succeeding it (Ch. 8 *a* [1]). Cp. SBE, xiii, p. 130 n, where three such fortnights are mentioned. [22] Ch. 4 § 4; Ap. H 5 [94].
[23] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]. 'When dawn was breaking and the night was far spent', SBE, xvii, p. 211.

this thought came to the Blessed One: 'Those clansmen (*kula-puttā*)[1] who are under this law and discipline,[2] though affected by cold and shunning it, are able to manage with three robes. . . .' In this connexion . . . the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers: [4] . . . [5] 'I sanction,[3] mendicant brothers,' he said, 'three robes (*ti-cīvaraṃ*)[4]—a twofold outer-wrap (*di-guṇaṃ saṃghātiṃ*),[5] a single upper-robe (*ekacciyaṃ uttar-āsaṇgaṃ*),[6] a single waist-cloth (*antara-vāsakaṃ*).'[7]

§ 4. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṇguttara-Nikāya, Tika-Nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 123. (PTS, i, p. 276.)*

. . . The Blessed One stayed at Vesāli, at the Gotamaka[8] shrine. There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . . 'I teach, mendicant brothers,' he said, 'a Law of higher knowledge (*abhiññāya*),[9] not one without higher knowledge; I teach, mendicant brothers, a connected (*sa-nidānaṃ*)[10] Law, not without continuity; I teach, mendicant brothers, a marvellous (*sa-ppātihāriyaṃ*)[11] Law, not without marvels. . . . You then have, mendicant brothers, enough[12] [cause] for rejoicing, enough [cause] for elation, enough [cause] for happiness[13] (*so-manassāya*).' . . .[14]

§ 5. *Aṇguttara-Nikāya, Sattaka-nipāta (the Sevens), Sutta 19. (PTS, iv, p. 16.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed Vesāli, at the Sārandada[15] shrine. And many Licchavis[16] came to where the Blessed One was. . . . When they were seated at one side the Blessed One spoke to them thus: 'I will teach you, Licchavis, seven conditions[17] securing welfare[18] (*aparihāniye dhamme*). [2] . . . (1) As long, Licchavis, as the Vajjians[19]

1 Ch. 3 § 5 [167]; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13].
2 Ch. 8 *d* § 8 [4].
3 Ch. 8 *a* [4].
4 Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]. On the dress of monks and nuns see SBE, xvii, p. 212 n.
5 Ch. 8 *j* § 2. Cp. Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9] (*fastened*).
6 This apparently was worn indoors only; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9] (*upper-garment*).
7 Ch. 8 *j* § 3 [2].
8 See § 1 [2] above.
9 Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).
10 Ap. B *c*, *Note* (*Nidānas*). Cp. Ch. 1 § 1 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 15; Ch. 8 *b* § 5 (*Introduction*); Ap. B *a* § 4 [1] (*conditions*). The connexions or steps appear to be the links between birth, craving, and sorrow, and between the eradication of craving and the serenity of Nibbāna; but they might be the logical stages of reasoning upon which the Dhamma is based (Ap. E *c* ii § 1, *by yourselves*). The phrase might be rendered 'I teach a well-based Law, not without foundation.'
11 The reference is to the marvel of teaching (Ap. I *b* § 4 [8]), contrasted with the marvels of power (Ap. I *b* § 4 [5]).
12 Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3).
13 Ap. E *b*, *Note* (*joy*); Ap. F 1 *c*, *Note* (*joy*).
14 Omitting a statement that 'On this explanation being made the thousand-world-system (*loka-dhātu*) quaked.' Cp. Int. §§ 70, 93 (vi).
15 See § 1 [2] above; § 6 [3] below; Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [5].
16 Ch. 12 *a*.
17 Things or points; Ch. 20 § 2. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 6 [9], and Ap. D *c* § 3 [10].
18 Literally, non-decline. This whole passage is incorporated in the succeeding Sutta (see § 6 below) and also in MPS, i. [4] (Ch. 20 § 1). It seems clear that this is the original text and the more involved narratives are adaptations (IN 6, *Canon*).
19 Ch. 12 (*Vajjian Confederacy*).

frequently hold meetings,[1] favouring[2] meetings, so long, Licchavis, is the prosperity (*vuddhi*)[3] of the Vajjians to be expected, and no decline[4] (*parihāni*). (2) As long as the Vajjians shall meet together in concord[5] (*samaggā*) and rise in concord, and the Vajjians shall transact business together in concord. . . . (3) As long as Vajjians shall not appoint what is against that which has been appointed previously, shall not break up what has been appointed previously, according as they shall continue to conform to the old appointed (*paññatte*)[6] Vajjian laws[7] (*Vajji-dhamme*). . . . (4) As long as the Vajjians shall respect . . .[8] the ancestors[9] of the Vajjians and shall think of them reverently.[10] . . . (5) As long as the Vajjians shall not carry off forcibly and keep any clanswomen[11] (*kul-itthiyo*) or maidens of the clans.[12] . . . (6) As long as the Vajjians shall respect . . .[13] Whatsoever Vajjian shrines (*Vajji-cetiyāni*) they possess, both within and without,[14] and shall not allow diminution in the customary[15] dues (*baliṃ*)[16] given and presented of old. . . . (7) As long as rightful[17] care, defence, and protection shall be well-provided for the saints (*arahantesu*)[18] of the Vajjians, [and they say] "Saints who have not yet arrived may come to the realm (*vijitaṃ*)[19] and saints who have arrived may live in the realm at ease",[20] so long is the prosperity of the Vajjians to be expected and no decline.

As long, Licchavis, as these seven conditions securing welfare shall endure among the Vajjians and the Vajjians shall be instructed in these seven conditions securing welfare, so long is the prosperity of the Vajjians to be expected and no decline.

§ 6. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Sattaka-nipāta (the Sevens), Sutta 20.*[21] *(PTS, iv, p. 17.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha on the Gijjhakūṭa Hill.[22] Now at that time the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu,[23] the son of the Videhan[24] [consort of Bimbisara], was desirous of overcoming the

[1] Or, assemblies; *sannipātā*. Ch. 20 § 2 (i); Ap. H 3 *a*; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1] (*council-hall*). See Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4].

[2] Ap. H 3 *a* § 1.

[3] Literally, waxing. Cp. Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [100].

[4] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [2]. See § 6 [2] below.

[5] Ch. 8 *e* § 5.

[6] Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4] (*ñatti*).

[7] Or, institutions of an ancient Vajjian nature; cp. Ap. F 1 *c* [161] (*system*).

[8] As in Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i).

[9] *Vajji-mahallakā*; literally, the Vajjian great. 'The Vajjian Elders'. SBE, xi, p. 3.

[10] 'Hold it a point of duty to hearken to their words', SBE, xi, p. 3.

[11] Int. § 190 (*women*).

[12] Ch. 3 § 5 [167].

[13] As in Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i).

[14] 'In town or country', SBE, xi, p. 4.

[15] Or, lawful; *dhammika*. Cp. (7) *rightful*, below; Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4] n (*moral*); also Part I (title) n.

[16] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5]; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 16 n.

[17] Or, lawful; *dhammika*. Cp. (6) *customary* above.

[18] i.e. Buddhist Elders; Ap. D *c*. There is no thought of duty to Brāhmans; Int. § 185 (*ritual*).

[19] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5].

[20] Ch. 20 § 2 (7).

[21] See § 5 [1] n above; Ch. 20 § 1.

[22] Int. § 128.

[23] Int. § 166; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17] n.

[24] Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3].

Vajjians. Thus said he: 'I will break up these Vajjians, so great in power (*mah-iddhike*),[1] so mighty, I will annihilate the Vajjians, I will bring the Vajjians ruin and destruction.' And the Māgadhan king . . . instructed Vassakāra[2] the Brāhman,[3] the chief-minister[4] (*Magadha-mahāmattaṃ*), saying: 'Come thou, Brāhman; go to where the Blessed One is . . . and say thus: "The Māgadhan king, revered sir . . . is desirous of overcoming the Vajjians. . . ." So far as the Blessed One may answer[5] (*vyākaroti*) gather well [his words] and report to me. . . .' 'Be it so, sir (*bho*),[6] replied Vassakāra the Brāhman . . . and went to where the Blessed One was . . . and seated himself at one side. . . . [2] Now at that time the venerable Ānanda[7] was standing behind the Blessed One fanning[8] him. Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Doubtless thou hast heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians are much-given to meetings. . . .[9] As long, Ānanda, as the Vajjians are much-given to meetings, favouring meetings, so long is the prosperity of the Vajjians to be expected, and no decline. . . .'[10] [3] Then the Blessed One instructed Vassakāra . . . saying: 'At one time, Brāhman, I stayed at Vesāli at the Sārandada[11] shrine. There I taught the Vajjians the seven conditions securing welfare. As long, Brahman, as these seven conditions securing welfare shall endure among the Vajjians and the Vajjians shall be instructed in these seven conditions securing welfare, so long is the prosperity of the Vajjians to be expected and no decline.' . . .[12]

e. Minor places in the Vajjian[13] country; Visits to Mithilā and the Videhas

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta (the Fours), Sutta 1. (PTS, ii, pp. 1–2.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Vajjians (*Vajjīsu*) at Bhaṇḍagāma.[14] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant

[1] Ap. I *b* § 3 n. See Ch. 19 *d* §§ 1 [1] n, [2] n, 2 [3] n.

[2] Int. §§ 170, 175 (*war*); Ch. 11 *c* § 21; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2]; Ch. 20 § 11 [26]; Ch. 23 *a* [8]. Also MV, vi. xxviii. 7; *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 43 (*Pārājaka* ii, 4); *Majjh. Nik.* iii, p. 8; *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, pp. 172, 179.

[3] The context shows that the preference of Kshatriya kings for Brāhman ministers was not due to religious causes. Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1] n; Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1]; and Int. § 185 (*Brāhman*).

[4] Int. § 172. 'The prime-minister of Magadha', SBE, xi, p. 2. Magadha may be used here as the name of the country rather than of the people (Int. § 123; Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [3] n; Ch. 11 *f* § 3 n; Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 1).

[5] 'May predict', SBE, xi, p. 2.

[6] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]. See Ch. 19 *d* § 2 [3], where the narrative recurs.

[7] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[8] Int. § 190.

[9] As in Ap. H 3 *a* § 1.

[10] As in § 5 [2] (1–7) above with necessary changes.

[11] See § 5 [1] above.

[12] As in Ch. 20 § 2 [6].

[13] Int. § 133.

[14] Int. § 147. This and the following nine Suttas form the *Bhaṇḍagāma-vagga*; all the ten discourses appear to have been delivered in the same place. Bhaṇḍagāma (Ch. 21 § 18), Hatthigāma (see § 2 below), Ambagāma (Ch. 21 § 19 [5]), Jambugāma (Ch. 21 § 19 [5]) and Bhoganagara (see § 3 below) are mentioned in this order in the MPS (SBE, xi, p. 66) as being on Gotama's route between Vesāli and the Mallan country.

brothers. . . .[1] The Blessed One spoke thus: [2] '. . .[2] [4] So, mendicant brothers, when noble[3] duty[4] (*sīlaṃ*) is understood and penetrated,[5] when noble self-transcendence[6] (*samādhi*) is understood and penetrated; when noble insight[7] (*paññā*) is understood and penetrated; when noble liberation[8] (*vimutti*) is understood and penetrated, the craving for individual-existence is broken up; the conduit of individual-existence is destroyed; there is not now individual-re-existence.[9] . . .[10]

§ 2. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-Saṃyutta (Sam. 35), Sutta 125 (Vajji). (PTS, iv, p. 109.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed among the Vajjians at Hatthigāma.[11] [2] And the householder Ugga[12] of Hatthigāma came to the Blessed One . . . [3] and seated at one side spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'What now, revered sir, is the cause, what the reason, why some beings do not attain to Nibbāna (*parinibbāyanti*)[13] in this world (*dittheva dhamme*)?[14] What then, revered sir, is the cause, what the reason, why some beings do attain to Nibbāna in this world?' [4] . . .[15]

§ 3. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta (the Fours), Sutta 180. (PTS, ii, pp. 167–70.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Bhoganagara[16] at the Ānanda-cetiya.[17] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . . 'These four great indications[18] (*mah-āpadese*), mendicant brothers, will I set forth; listen then, attend well, and I will speak. . . . And what, mendicant brothers, are the four great indications?[19] [2] Here, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu may say: "This, friends, was heard by me from the mouth[20] (*sammukkhā*) of the Blessed One, taken

[1] As in Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [2].
[2] As in Ch. 21 § 17 [2]. The opening sentence is also in Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxix. 1).
[3] i.e. according to the Noble Doctrine or Path; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].
[4] Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20]; Ch. 20 § 8 [12] n.
[5] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxix. 1].
[6] Ap. F 2 *d*.
[7] Ap. F 2 *a* (132).
[8] Ap. D *a* § 6. These four terms may be taken as summarizing the Doctrine (Ap. G 1 *b*).
[9] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2]; Ch. 21 § 17 [2].
[10] Omitting verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) which foretell the Teacher's death.
[11] See § 1 n above; Int. § 147; Ch. 21 § 19 [7]. Also *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, pp. 212–6.
[12] Ch. 10 *c* (67).
[13] Ap. C *b* § 11 (89).
[14] Ap. C *b* § 4.
[15] The discourse which follows is the same as Sutta 118, in which Buddha informs Sakka (Int. § 69) that Nibbāna is attained in this world by those who detach themselves from the five senses and the individualizing mind (Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*senses*). The same questions are answered in the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.*, ii, p. 167.
[16] See § 1 n above. Int. § 147; Ch. 13 *a* § 1 [13]; Ch. 21 § 19 [5].
[17] Int. § 134.
[18] Pointers, criteria, or tests (Int. § 3 n; IN 6, *Canon*). See Ch. 21 § 19 [7]. 'Great References', 'true authorities', SBE, xi, p. 66 and note, where Buddhaghosha's Commentary (Int. § 21 n) is quoted and supports the derivation from *apadesa* (argument) rather than from *padesa* (limit).
[19] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].
[20] Or, in the presence. Ch. 11 *c* §§ 13 [2], 29.

from his mouth. This is the Law, this [accords with] the discipline,[1] this is the doctrine of the Teacher (*satthu-sāsanaṃ*)"[2] . . .[3] [3] The words and letters[4] (*pada-vyanjanāni*) having been thoroughly examined . . . if the [words] conform with the Sayings (*sutte*) and harmonize with the Discipline[5] (*vinaye*) the deduction must be reached—truly this is rightly accepted[6] by that Bhikkhu as an utterance (*vacanaṃ*)[7] of the Blessed One. . . .[8] [4] Then here a Bhikkhu may say thus: "In a certain abode a community (*sangho*) dwells with elders[9] and a head (*sa-pāmokkho*).[10] It was heard by me from the mouths of that community, taken from their mouths: 'This is the Law, this [accords with] the discipline, this is the doctrine of the Teacher.' " . . .[11] [6] Then here a Bhikkhu may say thus: "In a certain abode many elder Bhikkhus (*therā Bhikkhū*) dwell, very learned, acquainted with the Traditions (*āgaṭ-āgama*),[12] preserving the Law,[13] preserving the Discipline,[14] preserving the Digests[15] (*mātikā-dharā*). It was heard by me from the mouths of those elders, taken from their mouths: 'This is the Law, this [accords with] the discipline, this is the doctrine of the Teacher.' " . . .[16] [8] Then here a Bhikkhu may say thus: "In a certain abode an elder Bhikkhu (*thero bhikkhu*) dwells, very learned, acquainted with the Traditions,[17] preserving the Law, preserving the Discipline, preserving the Digests.[18] It was heard by me from the mouth of that elder, taken from his mouth: 'This is the Law, this [accords with] the Discipline, this is the doctrine of the Teacher.' " . . . [9] If the words conform with the Sayings and harmonize with the Discipline, the deduction must be reached—truly this is rightly accepted by that elder (*therassa*) as an utterance of the Blessed One. . . .'

[1] *Vinaya*; the body of disciplinary rules of the Order. Ch. 15 *b* § 12 [v. 11]; Ch. 23 *b* § 3; Ap. A 1 *b* (3); cp. Ap. A 1 *b* (6).

[2] Ch. 19 *b* § 9 [1]; Ap. A 1 *b* (10).

[3] As in Ch. 21 § 19 [8], excepting formal phrases.

[4] Literally, smearing. Cp. Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [1] (*writing*); and Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [2] (*literally*).

[5] 'If they harmonize with the scripture and fit in with the rules of the order' SBE, xi, p. 67.

[6] See below [4], [6].

[7] Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [11]; Ch. 22 *b* § 21.

[8] Omitting 'the Saint, the Supremely Enlightened'. All such titles were doubtless conferred upon Gotama by his followers, not by himself (Part I, title, n; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 5 *b* § 10). When they are placed in the mouth of Gotama the text may be suspected (IN 6, *Canon*).

[9] Seniors. Ch. 8 *g* § 2. Cp. Ap. A 1 *b* (2).

[10] Ch. 8 *g* (*vihāra*). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [17].

[11] As in [3] above.

[12] Ap. A 1 *b* (12).

[13] Or, Doctrine.

[14] Or, Rules. Ch. 15 *b* § 12 [v. 11].

[15] Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2]; Ch. 21 § 19 [10]. Registers or Tables. 'Versed in the summaries of the doctrines and the law', SBE, xi, p. 68. The *mātikā* were summaries which apparently afterwards developed into the *Abhidhamma-Piṭaka* (Int. § 14; Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*). See SBE, xvii, pp. 285, 345.

[16] As in [3] above.

[17] Ap. A 1 *b* (12).

[18] Ch. 16 *b* (MV, x. i. 2).

§ 4. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sacca-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 56), *Sutta 21* (*Vijjā 1*). (*PTS, v, p. 431.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Vajjians at Koṭigāma.[1] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .

§ 5. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI, xxx.*

[6] . . . The Blessed One having stayed at Koṭigāma[2] as long as he wished went to Ñātikā,[3] and there at Ñātikā (*Ñātike*), the Blessed One stayed in the Brick-house[4] (*Ginjak-āvasathe*). . . .[5]

§ 6. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 18* (*Janavasabha-S.*).[6]

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Nādika[7] (*Nādike*) at the Brick-house. Now at that time the Blessed One explained regarding the followers[8] (*paricārake*) in the folklands[9] (*janapadesu*) round about, who had died and passed on in rebirths[10] (*uppattīsu*)—among the Kāsis[11] and Kosalas (*Kāsi-Kosalesu*), among the Vajjis and Mallas, among the Cetis[12] and Vaṃsas, among the Kurus[13] and Pañcālas,[14] among the Macchas and Sūrasenas—saying: 'So and so has reached (*uppanno*) here, so and so has reached there.' . . .[15] [2] And the followers at Nādika . . . were rejoiced and gladdened and filled with pleasure and delight on hearing the Blessed One's explanations to questions. . . . [4] And this thought came to the venerable Ānanda:[16] 'Then there were also those Māgadhan followers, both many and long faithful, who died and passed on. One might think the Aṅgas and Magadhas (*Aṅga-Magadhā*)[17] devoid of followers . . .[18] who have died

[1] Most probably between the Ganges and Vesāli. Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxix. 1]; Ch. 21 § 1. The discourse on the Four Truths which follows is found also in MV, vi. xxix, and in MPS (*Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 90). The next Sutta, containing a second discourse on the Four Truths, was delivered at the same place.

[2] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxix. 1].

[3] Or, the Ñātikas. Int. § 147; Ch. 21 § 2 [5]. The place seems to have been between Koṭigāma and Vesāli and near the southern outskirts of that city. Buddhaghosha (Int. § 21) states that there were two villages here (*Dial. of the B.* ii, p. 97 n)

[4] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6].

[5] Ambapāli's feast and gift at Vesāli are recounted.

[6] Int. § 158. See Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36] n. Ap. 1 *b* § 6.

[7] Int. § 147. See Ch. 16 *b* § 1; and Ap. B *a* § 6 [6].

[8] Literally, those moving round or attending; the term apparently is general. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* (*upāsaka*).

[9] Ch. 13 *c* § 4 (5); also Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; and Ch. 15 *a* §§ 2 [3], 15 [1]. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [12].

[10] Literally, in attainments or arrivals. Cp. Ap. B *a* § 4 [1] (*uppajje*); Ap. C *a* § 2 (126). 'Was wont to make declarations as to the rebirths of such followers (of the doctrine) as had passed away in death among the tribes round about on every side', *D. of the B.* ii, p. 237.

[11] Int. §§ 158 (3), 162; also Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11].

[12] Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [1].

[13] Ch. 16 *a*.

[14] Ch. 16 *b* § 1.

[15] Omitting statements regarding more than 50, 90, and 500 unnamed followers belonging to Nādika, as in Ap. B *a* § 6 [7], where the narrative is improved by the addition of numerous personal names (IN 6, *Canon*), taken from the *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, pp. 356, 358).

[16] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[17] Int. §§ 158 (2), 162.

[18] MSS. add *Māgadhakehi* or preferably *Aṅga-Māgadhakehi*. Though the Aṅgas and Magadhas are not included in the short stock list of clans they are associated with it by way of supplement here and so are differentiated from the four extra-Gangetic clans which appear in the longer list only (Ch. 17 *a* [4] n).

and passed on. . . . Explanation regarding them too would be good. Much folk would believe (*pasīdeyya*) and then would reach happiness[1] (*suggatiṃ*).' . . .[2]

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Nidāna-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 12), Sutta 45 (Ñātikā). (PTS, ii, p. 74.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Ñātikā[3] at the Brick-house. [2] And the Blessed One . . . spoke this formal-discourse[4] on the Law (*dhammo-pariyāyaṃ*). [3] 'Depending (*paṭicca*)[5] on both the eye and material-forms (*rūpe*) there arises the seeing-faculty[6] (*cakkhu-viññāṇaṃ*), the meeting of [these] three is [called] impression[7] (*phasso*); because (*paccayā*)[8] of [this] impression there is sensation; because of sensation there is craving (*taṇhā*). With the cessation of this very craving, so that no remnant or trace[9] of it remains, there is the cessation of grasping;[10] with the cessation of grasping there is the cessation of separate-individuality;[11] with the cessation of separate-individuality there is the cessation of [the thought of] individual-being;[12] with the cessation of [the thought of] individual-being cease [the thoughts of] decay and death,[13] grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair.[14] Thus there is origination of this whole aggregation[15] of sorrow.' [4] . . .[16] [9] Thus there is cessation of this whole aggregation of sorrow.'

§ 8. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Avyākata-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 44), Sutta 11 (Sabhiya). (PTS, iv, p. 401.)*

[1] At one time the venerable Sabhiya Kaccāna[17] was staying at Ñātikā[18] at the Brick-house. [2] And Vacchagotta[19] the Wanderer

[1] Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]. Literally, welfare. The present Welfare (Ap. C *b*; cp. Int. § 117) of the original doctrine of Selflessness (Ap. E *c* i, *an-attā*) has become Heaven hereafter, and the latter has become a heaven attained after one or more returns to earth (Ap. D *c*, *Stages*). *Suggati* (or *Su-gati*) is the opposite of *duggati* (Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n), a state of suffering associated with *niraya* (Ap. B *a* § 7) and other regions of punishment, e.g. in *Ang. Nik.* i, pp. 97, 138 (Ap. B *c* § 4 [1]).

[2] This grave introduction leads up to the strange story of the *yakkha* Janavasabha (Int. § 93, vii, n; cp. Int. § 74 n) who states that he is the spirit of the dead king Bimbisāra (Int. § 168), now dwelling 'in the society of the great king Vessavaṇa' (Int. § 70, *Four Kings*).

[3] Int. § 147.

[4] Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 3 (*discourse*).

[5] Ap. B *c*.

[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]. 'Visual consciousness', Chalmers, *Further Dial. of the B.* (SBB, v, p. 77).

[7] Or, contact. Ap. D *b* § 2 [6].

[8] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].

[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 7.

[10] *Upadāna*. Ap. D *a* § 5.

[11] *Bhava*; the sense of separateness (cp. Ap. C *b* § 10, *attā*). Ap. D *a* §§ 5 [6], 7 (*bhav-āsavā*).

[12] *Jāti*; Ch. 1 § 9 [59]; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2], and Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2].

[13] Ch. 1 § 10 [2] n.

[14] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].

[15] Ap. B *c* § 4 [3].

[16] So also with the remaining four senses and the mind (Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*saḷāyatana*). This shorter chain of causation may be regarded as a rational form from which the metaphysical intricacies of the *paṭicca samapāda* later evolved (Ap. B *c*, *Note*; cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n); it is repeated in the *Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta* (PTS, iv, p. 90).

[17] 'Sabhiya of the Kaccānas', *Bk. of K.S.* iv, p. 282. Sabhiya is also called Saddha; *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 153. Kaccāna is a well-known clan name; Ap. B *c* § 5 [3].

[18] Int. § 147.

[19] Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1). Suttas 7–11 of the present Saṃyutta all deal with analytical questions put by Vaccha.

(*paribbājako*) came to where the venerable Sabhiya Kaccāna was. . . . [3] Seated at one side . . . he spoke thus: 'What now, respected (*bho*)[1] Kaccāna, does the Follower (*tathāgato*)[2] continue to be after death?'[3] 'This is not declared,[4] Vaccha, by the Blessed One: "The Follower continues to be after death." ' [4] 'What then, respected Kaccāna, does the Follower not continue to be after death?' 'This also is not declared, Vaccha, by the Blessed One: "The Follower does not continue to be after death." ' . . .[5]

§ 9. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Chakka-Nipāta* (*the Sixes*), *Sutta 20.* (*PTS, iii, p. 306.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Nādika[6] at the Brick-house. There the Blessed One instructed the Mendicant brothers. [2] 'Meditation on death (*maraṇa-sati*),[7] mendicant brothers, when exercised,[8] when frequently practised, is greatly fruitful,[9] greatly advantageous (*mah-ānisaṃsā*),[10] entering the deathless (*amat-ogadhā*), ending in the deathless[11] (*amata-pariyosānā*). . . .'

§ 10. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 31* (*Cūḷa-Gosinga-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 205] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Nādika.[12] . . . Now at that time the venerable Anuruddha[13] and the venerable Nandiya[14] and the venerable Kimbila[15] were staying in the Gosinga[16] Sāl-tree[17] wood-

[1] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).

[2] Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32]. All Vaccha's other questions are general; it is not likely that this question is particular, relating to the soul or individuality of Buddha alone and not to the souls of Buddhist believers. And indeed if there is no individual 'self' (Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [3]) the reply must be true of all individuals (Int. § 7, *personality*).

[3] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

[4] Ap. G 1 *a* (ii).

[5] The reason stated is that after death the *tathagata* cannot be described as with or without form, with or without perception. Clearly individuality is not retained.

[6] Int. § 147.

[7] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*sammā-sati*); and Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [7–10] n. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1) [426] and Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] (*cessation*). Meditation on death is also the subject of the preceding Sutta and Suttas 73 and 74 of the Eights.

[8] *Bhāvitā*; developed or trained; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2]; Ch. 20 § 5 (1); cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [7] n; Ap. E *c* ii § 2 (*bhāvanā*).

[9] Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [16]; Ap. C *a* § 3 [22] (*results*).

[10] Or, blessed (Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]). Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42]. Cp. Ap. B (*Results of Action*).

[11] The universal; or, the deathless state of Nibbāna. Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ap. C *b* § 11 (374). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4] (*self-surrender*). For the epithets see Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [3].

[12] Int. § 147. Also *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 153; *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 391, v, p. 322.

[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[14] The Sakkan. Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155]; further *Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 397; *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 334. Also *Majjh. Nik.* 68; and *Vin. Piṭ.* i, p. 351.

[15] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[16] Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *a* § 9 [2]. In the succeeding Sutta the Gosinga Wood is visited by Gotama with Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]), Mahā-Moggallāna (Ch. 7 *a* § 16), Mahā-Kassapa (Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [13]), Anuruddha (Ch. 10 *c*, 5), Revata (Ch. 10 *c*, 16), Ānanda (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]) and others. The credible part of the present Sutta is repeated in MV, x. iv regarding the Buddha and the same three Theras when in another place, Bālakalonakāra-gāma (Ch. 15 *b* §§ 10, 11 [iv. 1]).

[17] Cp. Ch. 1 § 2.

land-park (*Gosinga-sāla-vanadāye*).[1] And the Blessed One having arisen in the evening from quiet [contemplation][2] went to the Gosinga Sāl-tree woodland-park. And the keeper[3] saw the Blessed One approaching from afar and seeing him said to the Blessed One: 'Do not enter this wood, devotee (*samaṇa*); here at peace dwell three clansmen (*kulaputtā*) who[4] seem to seek [the welfare of] their souls[5] (*atta-kamarūpā*); do not disturb them.' The venerable Anuruddha hearing the keeper conversing with the Blessed One . . . said: 'Friend keeper, hinder not the Blessed One; our Teacher, the Blessed One is arrived.' . . .[6]

§ 11. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Sāmaṇḍaka-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 39), Sutta 1 (Nibbāna). (PTS, iv, p. 261.)*

[1] Once the venerable Sāriputta[7] was staying among the Vajjians at Ukkavelā[8] on the bank of the river Ganges.[9] [2] And Sāmaṇḍaka the Wanderer[10] came to where the venerable Sāriputta was. . . . [3] Seated at one side . . . he said: ' "Nibbāna,[11] Nibbāna," so one says, friend Sāriputta. But what is Nibbāna, friend?' 'The destruction of lust, the destruction of hatred, the destruction of delusion,[12] that, friend, is called Nibbāna.' [4] 'Then, friend, is there a path, is there a way, for the realization of this Nibbāna?' . . . [5] 'There is indeed the noble eightfold Path[13] for the realization of this Nibbāna. . . .'

§ 12. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 83 (Makhadeva-S.).*

[PTS, ii, p. 74] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Mithilā[14] in the Makhādeva mango-grove (*Makhādev-ambavane*). . . .[15]

§ 13. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 91 (Brahmāyu-S.).*

[PTS, ii, p. 133] . . . The Blessed One journeyed by stages among

[1] Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 9 (*miga-dāya*); also Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1].

[2] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

[3] *Dāya-pāla*; Ch. 7 *a* § 7. Cp. Int. § 126. See Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155] n.

[4] Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [vii. 1].

[5] Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6] (*ajjh-atta*). 'Three young men are living there for their souls' good', Chalmers, SBE, v, p. 149; 'Here dwell three noble youths accustomed to comfort and ease', SBE, xvii, p. 309.

[6] Anuruddha describes their experiences, including the nine stages of profound contemplation (Ap. I *a*, *Jhāna*; cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [156] n) and the spirits of all the spheres from the lowest or terrestrial sphere to the highest or Brahmā-world rejoice (Int. § 70), prompted by the *yakkha*, Dīgha (Int. § 93, vii). The less credible details seem plainly additions (IN 6, *Canon*) as they are omitted from the MV version. (SBE, xvii, p. 309.)

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 18.

[8] Int. § 147. The name is variously spelt Ukkācelā (*Majjh.* 34) and Ukkacelā (Ch. 19 *a* § 2.)

[9] Int. § 121.

[10] Ap. G 2 *c*.

[11] Int. § 3 n; Ch. 1 § 11 [163]; Ap. C *b*.

[12] These are the Three Fires of egoism; Ap. C *b* § 7.

[13] Ap. F 2 *d*

[14] Int. § 147; see § 13 below. Mithilā of the Videhans is mentioned in *Dīgha* 19 (Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]) in verses which though ancient appear to be subsequent to Gotama's times.

[15] Buddha tells the story of himself as Makhādeva who lived for 336,000 years and of succeeding kings of the Videhans similarly long-lived (Ch. 1 § 1 n).

the Videhans[1] (*Videhesu*) with a great assemblage, five hundred mendicant brothers. Now at that time the Brāhmaṇ Brahmāyu[2] dwelt at Mithilā[3] . . . well versed in the three Vedas,[4] accomplished in ritual[5] with the explanations[6] and in [their] etymology[7] with phonology[8] and in annals[9] the fifth [code of knowledge]; an expounder,[10] expert in disputation[11] and in the signs[12] of a Great Maṇ.[13] And the Brāhman Brahmāyu was told: 'The devotee Gotama, Sir (*khalu bho*), the Sakyan, he who has gone forth from the Sakyan clan[14] is journeying by stages among the Videhans with a great assemblage.' . . .[15] [p. 140] And the Blessed One . . . stayed at Mithilā in the Makhādeva mango-grove. . . . [p. 145] Then the Blessed One addressed to the Brāhman Brahmāyu a graduated discourse;[16] namely, a discourse on charity, a discourse on conduct, a discourse on the heavenly bliss [of Nibbāna], and made clear the misery, the worthlessness, and the defilement of the passions and the blessing in [their] renunciation. . . .

[1] Int. § 168; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]; Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [1]. 'The Vajjians included eight confederate clans, of whom the Licchavis and the Videhans were the most important . . . Mithilā was about thirty-five miles north-west from Vesāli', RDBI, pp. 25–6. The relation of the Videhans to the Licchavis or the Vajjis is not stated in *Vin. Piṭ.* or the first four Nikāyas. Mithilā may have occupied a site in the neighbourhood of the modern Chapra. King Ajātusattu used his position as son of a Videhan lady to overthrow the Vajjian confederacy (Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3]). The 'northern Kurus' are mentioned along with the 'eastern Videhas' as the two ends of a wide region at *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 59.

[2] He became a believer; Ch. 10 *c*. See Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Ps. of the Br.*, p. 52.

[3] See § 12 above.

[4] Int. § 176; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 n. See Ch. 14 *a* § 7 n; Ch. 14 *d* § 4 [2] n; Ch. 14 §§ 1 [209], 7 n; also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] (*learning*).

[5] *Keṭubha*.

[6] *Nighaṇḍu*; rubrics.

[7] *Pabheda*.

[8] *Akkhara*. Cp. 'We explain what constitutes pronunciation. It comprises letters, accent, quantity, articulation, rhythm, and lastly sequence of letters', *Taittirīya-Upanishad* (*Ten Principal Upanishads*, tr. Shree Purohit Swāmi and W. B. Yeats, 1937, p. 63).

[9] *Itihāsa*; literally 'so-said', i.e. tradition. Cp. 'History and tradition called the fifth Veda', *Chāndagga-Upanishad, vii, 1* (*Ten Pr. Upanishads*, p. 96).

[10] *Veyya-karaṇa*. 'A grammarian', SBE, x, p. 97; 'he knew exegesis', Chalmers, SBE, vi, p. 70.

[11] Or, natural science; *layāyata*. 'Casuistry', SBB, vi, p. 70. The word seems to have meant at that time physical or natural science, and hence later empiricism, materialism, or agnosticism; cp. Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Vaisheshika*). On the later meanings of the term see Rhys Davids's learned note in SBB, ii, pp. 166–72. The *Mundaka-Upanishad* sets forth what is perhaps a later Brāhman curriculum. 'The lower [knowledge] is the knowledge of the four Vedas and such things as pronunciation, ceremonial, grammar, etymology, poetry, astronomy; the higher knowledge is the knowledge of the Everlasting.' (*Ten Principal Upanishads*, pp. 49–50.)

[12] Thirty-two in number as enumerated in the Sutta; including golden colour, a 'turban-like' head (*uṇhīsa-sīsa*), hair curling to the right, a tuft (*uṇṇā*) between the eyes, long arms, long heels, and the wheel-mark on the soles. Ch. 1 § 6 [55]; Ch. 14 *c* § 3 [2] n. Cp. Coomaraswamy, *Buddha*, 1928 (1916), pp. 330–2, on Buddhist iconography.

[13] *Mahā-purisa*; Ch. 14 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3].

[14] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 1.

[15] The Brāhman sends his disciple who observes all the 32 signs on the Buddha, and Brahmāyu is convinced.

[16] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].

CHAPTER 13

THE SAKKAS AND THEIR NEIGHBOURS

a. THE MALLAS[1]

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16 (MPS), iv. 13.*

[13] The Blessed One having stayed as long as he wished at Bhoganagara[2] . . . proceeded with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers to Pāvā.[3]

§ 2. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-Nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 176. (PTS, v, p. 263.)*

[1] Once the Blessed One stayed at Pāvā[4] in the mango-grove of Cunda[5] the metal-worker[6] (*kammāra-puttassa*). . . . When Cunda the metal-worker was sitting by his side the Blessed One spoke thus: 'Now whose purifications (*soceyyāni*), Cunda, dost thou approve?' 'The Brāhmans of the West[7] (*pacchā-bhūmakā*), revered sir, carrying spouted water-pots,[8] bearing garlands,[9] tending fire[10] [with offerings] and bathing,[11] teach purifications; their purifications I approve.' 'How far then, Cunda, do the Brāhmans of the West . . . teach purifications?' 'Here, revered sir, the Brāhmans . . . enjoin a disciple (*sāvakaṃ*)[12] thus: "Come thou, man (*ambho purisa*),[13] rising early touch the earth by prostration; or (*no ce*) . . . touch fresh products[14] of the cow; or . . . touch green grasses (*tiṇāni*);[15] or . . . tend the fire (*aggiṃ*)[16] [with offerings]; or if thou dost not tend the fire do honour to the sun with joined palms[17] (*pañjaliko*); or . . . descend into the water in the evening for the third time."[18] Thus, revered sir, the Brāhmans . . . teach purifications.' . . .[19]

[1] Int. §§ 148 (i), 158 (6). The Mallan country lay to the east and south-east of the territory of Gotama's clan. 'The Mallas, a confederation of independent clans located by the two great Chinese chroniclers on the mountain-slopes eastward of the Buddha's own clan,' *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 10 n.

[2] Ch. 12 *e* § 3.

[3] Int. §§ 148 (i), 166 (7); Ch. 13 *c* § 25; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (7). See below, §§ 2, 3, 4; also *Saṃ. Nik.* (*Kindred Sayings*, ii, p. 126).

[4] See § 1 above.

[5] See § 3 below. Ch. 22 § 1 [13].

[6] Int. § 189 (*manufactures*).

[7] Int. § 185 (*Brāhmans*); Ch. 1 § 2 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24] n.

[8] *Kamaṇḍalukā*; Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [4]. These characteristic vessels are still used in ablutions.

[9] *Sevāla-mālakā*; possibly carrying rosaries. 'Wearers of lily-garlands', *Bk. of K.S.* iv, p. 218. Int. § 190.

[10] *Aggi-paricārikā*. Ch. 7 *a* § 3 [19].

[11] *Udak-orohakā*; literally, descending into the water. 'purifiers by water', *Bk. of K.S.* iv, p. 218. Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210] n; and Int. § 185 (*ritual*).

[12] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 [18].

[13] Int. § 190 (*address*).

[14] 'Droppings', SBB, v, p. 55.

[15] Cp. *tiṇa-bhakkho*, grass-eating, *Majjh. Nik.* 12 (PTS, i, p. 78).

[16] Ch. 7 *a* § 8.

[17] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].

[18] Bathing three times daily is among the practices of ascetics enumerated in *Dīgha-Nik*, Sutta 8, at the close of the long [14].

[19] Gotama expounds the ten rules of conduct for body, speech, and thought; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] n.

§ 3. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 33* (*Saṅgīti-S.*).

[I. 1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Mallas (*Mallesu*) with a great assemblage, five hundred mendicant brothers came to a town of the Mallas called Pāvā.[1] And there the Blessed One stayed in the mango-grove of Cunda[2] the metal-worker. [2] Now at that time a new council-hall[3] (*santhāgāram*) called Ubbhaṭaka[4] had recently been built for the Mallas of Pāvā and had not yet been lived in either by devotee (*samaṇena*)[5] or by Brāhman or by any man whatever. . . . And the Mallas of Pāvā came to where the Blessed One was . . . and seated at one side spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Here, revered sir, a new council-hall has recently been built for the Mallas of Pāvā. . . . Let the Blessed One, revered sir, enjoy the first use of it; its being first used by the Blessed One will afterwards long be to the Mallas of Pāvā a profit and pleasure.' The Blessed One accepted by his silence.[6] [3] Then the Mallas . . . went to the council-hall. . . .[7] [4] And the Blessed One . . . having instructed, informed, stirred, and gladdened the Mallas of Pāvā by discourse[8] on the Law till late at night[9] dismissed them saying: 'The night is far advanced, Vāseṭṭhas'[10] . . .[11]

§ 4. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, XI, i.*

[1] The venerable Mahā-Kassapa[12] instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Once, friends, I was in the course of a journey[13] from Pāvā[14] to Kusinārā[15] with a great assemblage, five hundred[16]

[1] See § 1 above.
[2] See § 2 above.
[3] Int. § 171; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [20].
[4] 'Thrown-aloft-er', SBB, iv, p. 201.
[5] Ap. A 2 *d* [21]. See Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [335] n.
[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 9.
[7] As in Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2], [3], with necessary changes.
[8] Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4].
[9] Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354]; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [1].
[10] Ch. 22 *b* § 10 [19]. 'Apparently a leading family name among the Mallas both of Pāvā and the neighbouring village, Kusinārā', SBB, iv, p. 202 n. In the *Tevijja-Sutta* (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]) Vāseṭṭha is a Brāhman name. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354] n (*Gotamas*); also Ch. 13 *d* § 8 [1] n.
[11] The conventional phrases of leave-taking follow: 'Now for what ye think seasonable' and 'Be it so, revered sir' (Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101]). Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [2] n) later, after the departure of the citizens, addresses the monks. He speaks of the recent death of Nāthaputta (Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [243]) and the dissensions which have broken out among his followers; he then contrasts the concord of those who accept the Dhamma and classifies the chief tenets of the faith under ten groups with subdivisions or points, including the One or unity (Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; cp. *Dīgha* 34, PTS, iii, p. 272), the nine abodes of beings (Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; cp. *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, p. 288) and the ten qualities of a Saint (Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [2]; and Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; cp. *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, p. 292). 'The one thing (*eko dhammo*)' is defined as 'all beings existing by food [or, originated], all beings existing by individuality (*saṃkhāra-ṭṭhitikā*; cp. Ap. E *a*)'.
[12] Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [13]; Ap. A 1 *b* (3). This account couched in the indirect form appears also in MPS, vi [19–20] (Ch. 22 *c* § 6 n).
[13] Or, I had reached halfway; Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16]; Ch. 17 *b* § 1.
[14] See § 1 above, Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n.
[15] See § 5 below; and Ch. 23 *b* § 1.
[16] Int. § 121.

mendicant brothers. And I, friends, resting on the journey sat down at the foot of a certain tree. Then at that time a certain naked-ascetic (*ājīvako*)[1] . . . had reached half-way from Kusinārā to Pāvā. . . . Seeing the naked-ascetic I said to him "Dost thou, friend, know our Teacher?" "Yes, friend, I know him," he said; "to-day the devotee Gotama has been dead (*parinibbuto*)[2] seven days" . . .[3] Those mendicant brothers who were free from passion[4] (*vīta-rāgā*) remained self-scrutinizing (*satā*)[5] and comprehending. "Individuals are transient,"[6] they said; "then how here [is anything else] possible?"[7] Then I, friends, spoke to the mendicant brothers thus: "Enough, friends; mourn not, lament not. Has it not been announced already[8] by the Blessed One: 'There is in all, even the beloved and kind, the principle of change, of separation, of transience.'[9] Then how, friends, here [is anything else] possible? That which is born, produced, compounded, dissolvable by nature—that this indeed should not be dissolved, such a thing[10] is not found." '

§ 5. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 44. (PTS, v, p. 70.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Kusinārā[11] in the Sacrificial[12] Grove (*bali-haraṇe vana-sande*).[13] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers . . . thus: [2] '. . .[14] [8] What five thoughts[15] (*dhammā*) must be present in oneself[16] (when admonishing others)? [9] "I will speak at the right time, not at the wrong time; I will speak truly, not untruly; I will speak gently, not harshly; I will speak profitably (*an-attha-saṃhitena*);[17] I will speak with loving-friendliness (*metta-citto*),[18] not with hatred (*dos-antaro*)." '[19]

[1] Int. § 183. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 5 (*acela*). [2] Ap. C *b*, *Note*.
[3] Omitting mention of the fall of heavenly Mandārava flowers (Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [2] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 3 n) and the unrestrained lamentations of some of the brethren (as in Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21]).
[4] Or, desire; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).
[5] Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].
[6] *Aniccā saṃkhārā*. Ap. E *a* (i).
[7] 'How is it possible that [they should not be dissolved]?' SBB, iii, p. 184.
[8] Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [8]; Ch. 21 § 12 [48]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 7 [14], 28 [11] (*ere this*). See SBB, iii, pp. 126, 158, 184–5.
[9] '*Nānā-bhāvo, vinā-bhāvo, aññathā-bhāvo*.' 'It is in the very nature of things . . . that we must divide ourselves from them, leave them, sever ourselves from them', SBE, xi, p. 128. Cp. Ch. 4 § 18 [1] (*aniccā*).
[10] '*Thānam*'; literally, state [of things]. Ap. E *b* § 3 (1). Cp. Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [13]; Ap. B *a* § 7 (309).
[11] Int. §§ 148 (i), 157; Ch. 22 *a* § 3. See above § 4; also *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 274. There was evidently a direct road between Kusinārā and Sāvatthi (Int. § 139) with the township of Ātumā lying on the route (Int. § 157; Ch. 16 *d* § 6; MPS, iv, 30).
[12] Literally, 'oblation-making'. See below § 6; and Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (6) *dues*; also Int. § 185 (*ritual*).
[13] Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [164]; also Ch. 12 *c* § 10; Ch. 12 *e* § 10; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [501].
[14] Omitting five things to be considered by a Bhikkhu before admonishing another.
[15] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].
[16] 'Ajjh-attam', the inner self; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6].
[17] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6). Literally, taking hold of the substance. 'I will speak about the Goal, not about what is not the Goal', *Bk. of Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 145.
[18] Ap. F 1 *b*. [19] Ap. F 1 *b* § 2 [127]; and Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

§ 6. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 103* (*Kinti-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 238.] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Kusinārā[1] in the Sacrificial[2] Grove. There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers . . . saying 'Now have you, mendicant brothers, [the idea][3] about me; "The devotee Gotama[4] teaches the Law because of the robes, or . . . because of the alms of food, or . . . because of the lodgings, or . . . because of such and such a [future] existence[5] or non-existence?" '[6] 'We have not [such an idea], revered sir, about the Blessed One. . . . Compassionate and helpful[7] (*hitesī*), the Blessed One out of compassion[8] teaches the Law.' 'Therefore indeed, mendicant brothers, those Laws[9] (*dhammā*) concerning the higher knowledge (*abhiññā*)[10] which have been taught to you by me, namely the four earnest meditations,[11] the four right efforts,[12] the four roads to mental power, the five faculties, the five moral forces, the seven parts of wisdom, and the Noble Eightfold Path[13]—therein must all be instructed in agreement,[14] in unity, and without disputes. . . .[15]

§ 7. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga VI, xxxvi.*

[1] . . .[16] The Mallas of Kusinārā[17] heard that the Blessed One was coming to Kusinārā with a great assemblage of twelve hundred and fifty[18] mendicant brothers. They made an agreement[19] that whoever should not go out to meet the Blessed One [should pay] five hundred [pieces][20] as a penalty. . . . [2] Then the Mallas of Kusinārā went out to meet the Blessed One. . . .[21]

[1] Int. § 148 (i).
[2] See § 5 above.
[3] Or, does it occur to you (*kinti vo hoti*)? Cp. Ch. 1 §§ 10, 11.
[4] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n; and § 8 (*Buddha*) below; also Int. § 1 n.
[5] i.e. with a view to any reward (Int. §§ 8, 113) present or future. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 9 (Spirit-world); and Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*bhava-taṇhā*).
[6] *Iti bhav-ābhava hetu.* 'To secure some future or other hereafter', SBB, vi, p. 136. Ch. 13 *c* § 18. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 1 (*vibbhava-taṇhā*), § 8 (ii, *arūpa-rāga*).
[7] Ap. F 1 *b*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 7.
[8] *Anukampā*; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1]. Cp. Ap. F 2 *b* [6] (*pity*).
[9] Or, things. Ch. 21 § 14; Ap. H 1 § 6 [9].
[10] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).
[11] Ch. 20 § 10 [17]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.
[12] Or, forces. Ap. G 1 *b* § 5 n. See § 9 below.
[13] This whole list of essential points is found again in Ch. 21 § 15.
[14] Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [2]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 1 [3].
[15] Omitting directions regarding the settlement of dissensions. Ch. 16 *b*; Ch. 19.
[16] Buddha is proceeding from Āpana (Ch. 11 *f* § 4) by stages to Kusinārā. In the next chapter he leaves Kusinārā for Ātumā (Int. § 157), which in the following chapter is said to be on the way to Sāvatthi and was apparently on a direct course within the kingdom of Kosala; Int. § 121.
[17] Int. §§ 148 (i), 166.
[18] Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [1] n.
[19] Doubtless in Council; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1].
[20] Int. § 189 (*money*); Ap. A 1 *a* (*kahāpaṇa*). 'The square kahāpaṇas of copper, or bronze . . . see Rh. D.'s "Ancient Coins and Measures", p. 4 § 5', SBE, xv ii p. 135 n.
[21] Omitting the story of the sceptical Roja, who visited Buddha to avoid the fine and became a devoted follower.

§ 8. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta (the Fours), Sutta 76. (PTS, ii, p. 79.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Kusinārā[1] at the Bend (*Upavattane*)[2] of the Mallas in the Sāl-tree Grove[3] (*sāla-vane*) between the twin[4] sāl-trees, at the time of his death. There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers . . . saying: [2] 'Now there may be, Bhikkhus, in [the mind of] some mendicant brother a doubt or perplexity concerning the Buddha[5] or the Law or the Community or the Path or the [Middle] Road (*paṭipadāya*).[6] Enquire, Bhikkhus; do not afterwards reproach yourselves and say "The Teacher was present with us, and we could not question the Blessed One when face to face".' . . . [4] 'Perhaps, Bhikkhus, you may not enquire because of respect for the teacher; then let friend speak to friend.'[7]

§ 9. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Indriya-Saṃyutta (Saṃ. 48), Sutta 52 (Mallika). (PTS, v, p. 228.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Mallas (*Mallikesu*) [where there was][8] the township (*nigamo*) of the Mallas called Uruvelakappa (*Uruvelakappaṃ*).[9] [2] And there the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: [3] 'As long, mendicant brothers, as the knowledge of the noble (*ariya-ñānaṃ*)[10] has not come to the disciple of the noble (*ariya-savakassa*),[11] so long is there [in him] no stability of the [remaining] four moral-faculties,[12] no abiding of [these] four faculties. . . . [4] Just as until the roof-tree (*kūṭaṃ*)[13] of a peaked-house (*kūṭ-āgārassa*) is put up so long is there no stability of the beams (*gopānasīnaṃ*). . . . Of what four [moral-faculties]? Of faith,[14] of

[1] Int. § 148 (i).

[2] Ch. 22 *b* § 1 [v. 1]: the Commentary (see *Bk. of Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 88 n) states that the Upavattana was so called because it was situated where the Sāl-forest turned northwards. The 'bend' may have been due to the river Hiranyavati which was near the town and was a minor northern tributary of the Ganges (Int. § 121 n). 'At the Bend in the Sāl-Grove of the Mallas', *Bk. of Gradual Sayings*.—The whole Sutta reappears in MPS, vi. 5–6 (Ch. 22 *b* § 24).

[3] Int. § 133 n.

[4] Or 'a pair of'. For an elaborate and perhaps ill-founded commentarial explanation see SBE, xi, p. 85 n, SBB, iii, p. 149 n.

[5] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]. Cp. § 6 (*Gotama*) above.

[6] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]. 'The Practice (going to the Way)', *Bk. of Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 88. 'The method', SBB, iii, p. 172.

[7] Ch. 22 *b* § 24 [5]. It would increase the beauty of the passage if the teacher here spoke of himself as friend, but the commentary and perhaps the *Aṅg. Nik.* and *Dīgha-Nik.* texts are against this. The monks perhaps were bidden to put their questions indirectly.

[8] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[9] Int. § 148 (i). See also *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, p. 438, where the clansmen of the town are called Mallas and *Saṃ-Nik.* iv, p. 327, where they are called Mallatas.

[10] i.e. perception of the transience of the individual and of the futility of egoistic craving (Ch. 4 § 16; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [2]; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6], *dhamma-cakkhu*). From *Saṃ. Nik.* PTS, v, p. 219 it may be concluded that *ñāna* is the same as *paññā* (Ap. E *c* i § 6 [3]; Ap. F 2 *a*, 132; Ch. 20 §§ 4 [8] (7) n, 8 [12]; see [5] below.

[11] Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].

[12] Or, forces (*indriyāni*). Ch. 3 § 5 [164] n; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; and Ch. 14 *c* §§ 18 [2], 19 [3]. See § 6 above; and Ap. F 2. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [3].

[13] Ap. B *c* § 1 (2); also Ch. 12 *c* § 1 [1] n, and Int. § 190 (*architecture*).

[14] *Saddhā*; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180].

energy,[1] of self-knowledge,[2] of self-transcendence.[3] [5] In the disciple of the noble who has [such] insight (*paññāvato*)[4] corresponding faith is established, corresponding energy . . . corresponding self-knowledge . . . corresponding self-transcendence. . . .'

§ 10. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 24* (*Pātika-S.*).

[I, 1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Mallas [where was] the township of the Mallas called Anupiyā[5] . . .[6] And the Blessed One went to the garden[7] of Bhaggava-gotta[8] the Wanderer,[9] where Bhaggava-gotta the Wanderer was. [2] And Bhaggava-gotta . . . spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'Let the Blessed One come, revered sir; welcome, revered sir, to the Blessed One. It is long since the Blessed One has passed this way (*pariyāyaṃ*),[10] that is [so as] to come here. Let the Blessed One be seated; this is the distinguished (*paññataṃ*)[11] seat.' The Blessed One sat down on the appointed seat, and Bhaggava-gotta the Wanderer choosing some lower[12] (*nīcaṃ*) seat sat down at one side . . . and said: 'Some days ago, revered sir, some time ago Sunakkhatta[13] the Licchavi[14] . . . said to me: "I have now Bhaggava, disavowed the Blessed One; I do not look up to [him as] the Blessed One." Is this so, revered sir, even as Sunakkhatta said?' 'This is so, Bhaggava,' he replied, 'even as Sunakkhatta said. [3] Sunakkhatta said to me "I now disavow the Blessed One. . . . [4] The Blessed One works for me no marvel[15] above human nature[16]. . . . [5] The Blessed One does not make known to me the Beginning (*aggaññaṃ*)" '[17] . . .[18]

[1] *Viriya*; Ap. F 2 *a* (137).

[2] *Sati*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. 'Mindfulness', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 204.

[3] Samādhi; Ap. F 2 *d* [421]. 'Concentration', *Kindred Sayings*. It may be observed that the somewhat venturesome interpretations here given to *ñāna*, *sati*, and *samādhi* give the passage sense and fittingness, and that the usual renderings do not.

[4] See above, [3] n; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [4].

[5] Int. § 148 (i). In CV, VII. ii. 1, Buddha goes from Anupiyā direct to Kosambi. See Ch. 15 *b* (i); and Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5] n.

[6] As in Ch. 11 *c* § 9 and Ch. 12 *c* § 9 with necessary changes.

[7] *Ārāma*; Int. § 126 (*gardens*).

[8] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [i. 15]; also Ap. G 2 *c*. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 19 [237]. This philosopher became a follower of the Buddha. For *gotta* see Ap. E *b* § 2 [5].

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].

[10] See Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [5]; Ch. 23 *a* [7].

[11] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 9.

[12] Or, inferior. Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482]. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] (*mat*).

[13] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].

[14] *Licchavi-putta*. 'Of the Licchavis', SBB, iv, p. 8. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26]; Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21] n.

[15] Or, magic; Ap. I *b* § 4 [5].

[16] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].

[17] Ch. 18 *b* § 3. Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [I. 29]. *Saṃyutta* xv of *Saṃ. Nik.* is called the *Anamat-agga* (immeasurable beginning) *saṃyutta*.

[18] Gotama replies as in the *Māluṅkya-S.* (Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [3], *denounce*) that he has not claimed such capacity, and states that his object is the ending of sorrow (*sammā-dukkha-kkhaya*; IN 5 *b*, *Essentials*; Ap. E *b*) to which such matters are irrelevant. The next portion of the Discourse inconsistently proceeds to give instances to the contrary, doubtless supplies by later redactors (IN 6, *Canon*). The latter portion of Part II sets forth various contemporary theories of the origin of things (Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [1]) and of Brahmā (Int. §§ 35, 69, 70, 93, ii); cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [7] n.

b. The Bhaggans[1]

§ 1. *Madhurattha-vilāsini*[2] *(commentary on the Buddha-vaṃsa), Introduction.*

He spent . . . the eighth rainy season in Bhagga (*Bhagge*)[3] near the Suṃsumāra Peak[4] (*Suṃsumāra-giriṃ*) at Bhesakaḷā-vana.[5]

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 85 (Bodhi-rājakumāra-S.).*

[PTS, ii, p. 91.] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Bhaggans (*Bhaggesu*) on the Suṃsumāra Peak[6] (*Suṃsumāra-gire*) at Bhesakaḷā-vana, in the deer-park (*miga-daye*).[7] And at that time prince[8] Bodhi's[9] mansion[10] called Kokanada[11] had recently been built and had not yet been lived in either by devotee[12] or by Brāhman or by any man whatever. And prince Bodhi instructed a youth[13] named Sañjikāputta saying: 'Come, friend (*samma*)[14] Sanjikāputta, go to the Blessed One . . . and say "Revered sir, prince Bodhi salutes[15] the feet of the Blessed One with the forehead and enquires after [his] health,[16] freedom from sickness, well-being, strength, and comfort and begs the Blessed One to consent to take a meal[17] with him to-morrow together with the mendicant-community".' . . . [p. 92] Then when that night had elapsed prince Bodhi in his own house caused choice food both hard and soft to be prepared and ordered that the Kokanada mansion should be spread[18] with white cloths (*dussehi*) down to the lowest step

[1] Int. § 148 (iv). The Bhaggan lands may have lain to the west of the Vajjian country and may have been situated between Vesālī and Kosambi (see below, §§ 2 [92] n, 3 [1]; also Ch. 13 *a* § 10 n). See also *Vin. Piṭ.* v, p. 144 (*Parivāra*, viii. 1).

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 1.

[3] Ch. 10 *d* § 1. The name of the clan is here given to the country; cp. Int. § 123 n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 1 n (*Vedhañña*).

[4] Crocodile-peak; probably so-called from its shape. Ch. 10 *c* (70) n. See below §§ 2, 3 [1], 4, 5, 6; also *Vin. Piṭ.* iv, p. 15 (*Pācittiya*, lvi. 1). Visits by Moggallāna (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]) are recorded in *Majjh. Nik.* 15 and 50.

[5] Cp. Veḷuvana (Ch. 7 *a* § 10), Jetavana (Ch. 14 *c* § 1 [9] n), Mahāvana (Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [229]; Ch. 13 *c* § 17), Sītavana (Ch. 7 *b* § 6), and Gundāvanā (Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83]).

[6] See § 1 above; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] n.

[7] *Migadaye* may or may not be in apposition to Bhesakaḷāvane; Ch. 5 *a* § 9 n. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237] n; Ch. 14 *c* § 1 [9] n.

[8] *Rāja-kumāra*; Ch. 19 *c* § 1. Literally, son of a Rāja or ruler, not necessarily a king. Cp. Ch. 1 § 5 [52]; and Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*] (*rājāno*); also Ch. 7 *b* § 4 (*young*).

[9] See § 3 below. His mansion became the Buddhist headquarters, *Vin. Piṭ*, iv, pp. 198, 199.

[10] Pāsāda; storeyed-hous·, not necessarily a palace. Ch. 12 *c* § 1.

[11] Red lotus; Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169] n. See also *Vin. Piṭ.*, iv, p. 199 (*Sekhiya*, 55, 56).

[12] See Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [2].

[13] *Mānava*; usually a youth of the Brāhman caste. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9]; Ch. 14 *a* §§ 7 [2], 8 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210]; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [31]; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2]; Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [4]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [196]; Ch. 23 *b* § 8; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4]; and Int. §§ 185, 190 (*Brāhman*).

[14] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].

[15] Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3]. See Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2].

[16] Ch. 12 *c* § 3 (*phrases*); and Int. § 190 (*address*).

[17] Ch. 10 *a* § 7.

[18] Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2]; Ap. H 1 § 4 (*mats*). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2] n (*santhara*).

of the staircase.[1] . . . Then prince Bodhi stood outside the gateway (*bahi-dvārakoṭṭhake*)[2] and awaited the Blessed One. . . .[3]

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, v, xxi–xxii.*

[xxi. 1] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Vesālī[4] as long as he wished journeyed to where were the Bhaggans (*Bhaggā*). . . . And there the Blessed One stayed among the Bhaggans on the Suṃsumāra Peak[5] at Bhesakaḷāvana in the deer-park. . . .[6] [xxii. 1] Then the Blessed One having stayed among the Bhaggans as long as he wished journeyed to Sāvatthi.[7]

§ 4. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xxii*), *Sutta 1* (*Nakulapitār*). (*PTS, iii, p. 1.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Bhaggans on the Suṃsumāra Peak.[8] . . . [2] And Nakula's father[9] (*Nakula-pitā*) the householder came to the Blessed One. . . . [3] and seated at one side spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'I am a decrepit old man, revered sir, aged, advanced in years, approaching the end, wretched in body (*ātura-kāyo*), racked by disease. Now seldom do I see, revered sir, the Blessed One and thoughtful Bhikkhus. May the Blessed One, revered sir, address me, may the Blessed One direct[10] me, which would long be for my profit and happiness[11] (*sukhāye*). [4] '. . . Thus must thou learn, householder: "Though I may be wretched in body, my mind (*cittaṃ*)[12] shall not be wretched." Thus, householder, must thou learn,' he said. . . .[13]

§ 5. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Chakka-nipāta* (*the Sixes*), *Sutta 16.* (*PTS, iii, p. 295.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Bhaggans on the Suṃsumāra Peak.[14] . . . And at that time Nakula's father[15] the house-

[1] Int. § 190 (*architecture*). Cp. Ch. 1 § 8 (*pāsāda*). [2] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2].

[3] Buddha refuses to walk upstairs till the carpet is removed. The Sutta subsequently tells the story of his austerities and enlightenment (Ch. 2 § 5 n; Ch. 4 § 17 n), combining much that is found in *Majjh.* 26 and 36 and also in § 4 below, each of which Suttas preserves its own characteristics amid a patchwork of long passages found word for word in one or more of the others (IN 6, *Canon*). Bodhi is admitted as a lay disciple; he states that his mother when pregnant dedicated him yet unborn to the Blessed One at Kosambi and this may show that Suṃsumāragiri was not far from that town (See § 1 n above; Ch: 15 *b*, i).

[4] Ch. 12 *c*; Ch. 13 *b*, n. [5] See § 1 above.

[6] He visits Bodhi's mansion, as in § 2 [91–2] above. Buddha then formulates certain rules for the Order; Ap. H 3, *Note* (*Culla-vagga*, 5).

[7] Ch. 10 *a* and Ch. 10 *d*, n.

[8] See § 1 n above. 'A town so called, says Comy., because when it was a-building "a crocodile made a noise"', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 1 n; see Int. § 14.

[9] Or Nakula-father. Ch. 10 *c* (70). See § 5 below; also *Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 116, and *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 61. Nakula means mongoose; cp. 9 *b* § 1 [1] n. For the gossip of the Commentary see ThB, p. 115. [10] *Anusāsatu*; cp. § 5 [3] below.

[11] Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [2]; and Ap. E *b*, *Note* (*joy*).

[12] Ap. E*c* i § 4 [6]; and Int. § 109; cp. Int. § 111 (*control*). Cp. also Ap. D*a* § 6 (*liberation*); Ap. E *c* ii § 1 (*yourselves*). 'The mind is its own place', Milton, *P.L.*

[13] Sāriputta (Ap. E *c* i § 8 n) later explains in detail to the householder.

[14] See § 1 above. [15] See § 4 above.

holder was ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted. Then Nakula's mother[1] (*Nakula-mātā*) the wife of the householder spoke thus: . . . [2] 'Do not thou, householder, die [filled] with craving.[2] . . . The death of one [filled] with craving is censured by the Blessed One. . . . [3] Then Nakula the householder having recovered from his exhaustion soon after his recovery leaning on a staff went to where the Blessed One was . . . and to him seated at one side the Blessed One spoke thus: 'It is an advantage[3] to thee, householder, it is a gain to thee, householder, to whom thy wife Nakula's mother [has been compassionate, wishful of thy profit, a counsellor[4] (*ovādikā*) and a guide[5] (*anusāsikā*).'

§ 6. *Aṇguttara-Nikāya, Sattaka-nipāta (the Sevens), Sutta 58. (PTS, iv, p. 85.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Bhaggans on the Suṃsumāra Peak.[6] At that time the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna[7] was sitting drowsily in the village of Kallavāḷamutta[8] among the Magadhas (*Magadhesu*). And the Blessed One saw with the divine eye[9] (*dibbena cakkhunā*) . . .[10] the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna sitting there . . . and as if[11] (*seyyathā pi*) a man should stretch out his bent arm or bend his outstretched arm even so he withdrew[12] from the Suṃsumāra Peak . . . and appeared in front of the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna in the village of Kallavāḷa-mutta. . . .[13]

c. The Sakkans;[14] Kapilavatthu; Minor Townships

(i) *The Clan; Gotama's family and position*

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I. xxii.*

[2] 'Verily the devotee Gotama the Sakyan (*Sakya-putto*), he who has gone forth from the Sakyan clan (*Sakya-kulā*),[15] has arrived.'

[1] Or, Nakula-mother. See also *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, p. 268. In another passage (*Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 61) this amiable couple beg that they may 'behold each other in the life to come (*abhisamparāyam*)' and are assured that devoted spouses meet hereafter (Int. § 33, *sagga*; Ap. C *b*, *Note, state*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3, 1, *death*; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note, heaven*).

[2] *Sāpekha*; full of anxiety. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*taṇhā*). *Apekhā* is contrasted with *upekhā* (Ap. F 2 *b* [6]).

[3] Ch. 3 § 5 [164].

[4] One who addresses or teaches. The privilege of instructing was usually limited to the Bhikkhus; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii) n. On the position of the wife see Int. § 190 (*women*).

[5] One who directs; cp. § 4 [3] above.

[6] See § 1 above.

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].

[8] Int. § 145.

[9] Ap. I *b* § 3 [7].

[10] Omitting 'purified, superhuman'; Int. § 94 (iii).

[11] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6].

[12] Or, vanished; *antara-hita*, literally, '(was) drawn within', cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21] (*disappear*). For this magic flight cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [13] n; Ch. 11 *e* § 11 [7] n; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [2] n. Buddha is said (*Aṅg. Nik.* iv, p. 229) to have flown thus from Suṃsumāragiri to visit Anuruddha (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]) in the Eastern Bamboo Forest among the Cetis (Int. § 154).

[13] A discourse on mental exercises and on the transience of things completes the enlightenment of Moggallāna (Int. § 30; Ch. 7 *a* § 16, *arahatship*).

[14] Int. §§ 18, 30, 164.

[15] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* § 13.

§ 2. *Culla-vagga, IX. i.*

[4] 'The four castes (*vaṇṇa*), Kshatriyas, Brāhmans, Vaisyas, Sūdras, when they go forth from the household to the houseless life under the doctrine and discipline made known by the Leader,[1] lose their former names and families and are denominated as "devotees [who are] disciples of the Sakyan (*samaṇā Sakya-puttiyā*)."[2]

§ 3. *Mahā-vagga, I. xxxviii.*

[11] 'If, mendicant brothers, a Sākiyan (*Sākiyo*) by birth formerly belonging to one of the different philosophical schools[3] comes, he must receive *Upasaṃpadā*-ordination, and no probation-period need be given him. This I grant as a special privilege to kinsmen.'[4]

§ 4. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta,*[5] *Mahā-vagga 11* (*Nālaka-Sutta*).

[5] 'The Bodhisatta,[6] the best of gems, unmatched, is born in the world of men for their help and happiness[7] near the town (*gāme*)[8] of the Sakyas, in the Lumbinī[9] district[10] (*janapade Lumbineyye*); therefore are we[11] glad, rejoicing exceedingly. [6] He . . . shall turn the wheel[12] [of the Law] in the Isivhaya grove (*Isivhaye vane*).[13] . . .'

§ 5. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*).

[JN, p. 58] In due course the Bodhisatta[14] came to be sixteen years of age[15]. . . . These words were said in the assembly of his kinsmen (*ñāti-saṃghassa*):[16] 'Siddhattha's[17] life is devoted to pleasure, not one [practical] art does he learn. If war broke out what could he do?'

[1] *Tathāgata*; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]. Sutta 23 of the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 25) states four reasons for which this title is given. With all these the general term Leader or Right-goer seems to fit.

[2] Ch. 8 *d* § 8; and Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7].

[3] Ap. H 2 *a* § 3 [1].

[4] Ap. H 2 *a* § 4.

[5] Buddha's early years afford much scope to the poetical authors of the *Nālaka*, *Pabbajjā*, and *Padhāna* Suttas of the *Sutta-Nipāta* (Ch. 4 § 3 n) and these poems have received from later compilers the respect due to historical evidence (Ch. 1 § 2 n). Cp. Ch. 2 § 2 (*udāna*).

[6] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*; see § 5 below.

[7] Or, well-being. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [3].

[8] Near or in the town; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 10 n.

[9] Int. § 135; Ch. 1 § 5; see § 16 below (*Rummiṇḍei*). In the *Apadāna* (ii, p. 501) the place is called *Lumbini-kānana* (glade).

[10] Or, folkland; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]. 'In the country of Lumbinī', SBE, x, p. 124. *Janapada* may mean the country-side as opposed to the town.

[11] The company of the Thirty [and three] Gods, *tidasa-gaṇe deve* (Int. § 70, *Tāvatiṃsa*), are speaking to the Rishi Asita (Ch. 1 § 5 n).

[12] Ap. C *b* § 2 [8].

[13] Ch. 5 *a* § 9.

[14] See § 4 above.

[15] Ch. 1 § 8. The authorities for this period are poetical.

[16] Int. § 171 (*council-chambers*); Ap. H 3 *a*. See § 10 [13] below.

[17] Ch. 1 § 8 n.

§ 6. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 36 (Mahā-Saccaka-S.).*[1]

[PTS, i, p. 246.] . . .[2] 'I remember that where the work[3] (*kammante*) of my father[4] the Sakkan (*Sakassa*) was I sat in the cool of a jambu-tree, and being quite aloof from sense-pleasures, aloof from evil thoughts (*dhammehi*),[5] I attained and dwelt in the first [stage of] contemplation (*jhānaṃ*),[6] which abides with reasoning, with investigation, the joyous and blissful [state] arising from aloofness.[7] . . .'[8]

§ 7. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 36.*[9]

[PTS, i, p. 240.] . . . 'Later whilst I was quite young, with glossy black hair, when endowed[10] (*samannāgato*) with high youth in early prime,[11] though my father and mother were unwilling and they wept and lamented, I caused my hair and beard to be shaved, and I assumed the yellow robes, and went forth from the household to the homeless life. And having thus gone forth [from the world], pursuing the good, seeking the supreme path of tranquillity, I went to where Ālāra Kālāma was.'[12]

§ 8. *Aṇguttara-Nikaya, Tika-Nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 124. (PTS, i, p. 276.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One journeying among the Kosalas (*Kosalesu*)[13] came to Kapilavatthu.[14] And Mahānāma[15] the Sakkan[16] heard that the Blessed One had arrived at Kapilavatthu. Then Mahānāma the Sakkan went to where the Blessed One was. . . . The Blessed One spoke to him as he stood at one side, saying, 'Go, Mahānāma,

[1] Ch. 4 § 17.

[2] Buddha describes his austerities and states that with them he 'failed to rise to truly noble knowledge and vision'.

[3] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [3]; Ch. 23 *a* [7].

[4] Ch. 1 § 7 n. See § 9 (534) below.

[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].

[6] Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8).

[7] Or detachment (*viveka*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

[8] The four Jhānas are then described.

[9] Ch. 4 § 17. The present passage is found word for word in *Majjh.* 26 (Ch. 2 § 5) and in *Majjh.* 85 (SBB, vi, p. 48).

[10] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1].

[11] Ch. 2 § 5 [163] n.

[12] See § 8 below.

[13] Int. § 158 (4); cp. Ch. 13 *e* §§ 1, 2. See below §§ 15 (18) 30 [118], [120] n. This phrase implies here that the territory of the Sakkas had already been absorbed by the powerful neighbouring kingdom of Kosala (Int. § 169, iii; Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8]; cp. Ch. 13 *d* §§ 2 n, 3 n). The context seems to indicate a very early period in Gotama's ministry; cp. Ch. 10 *a*, n; also Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [89] n.

[14] Int. § 135.

[15] Distinction must be drawn between (1) Mahānāma, one of the first five disciples (Ch. 5 *b* § 2); (2) Mahānāma the Sakkan who became chief of the clan (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; see § 14 below); and (3) Mahānāma, a Sakkan who was an early and zealous lay believer and whose marked piety appears to be of a different order from that of the ruler and benefactor. See § 13 [3] n below; also *Kindred Sayings* (*Saṃ. Nik.*), v, pp. 320, 321, 322, 323, 326; and *Gradual Sayings* (*Aṅg. Nik.*), i, p. 198, iii, pp. 204, 314 (where M. is mentioned among householders). Mahānāma in most of these Suttas enquires regarding the distinctive tenets (Ap. G i *b*) of an Ariyan disciple (Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7]), (*ariya-sāvaka*). The answers are illuminating but are plainly marred here and there by medieval interpolations (see below §§ 20 [2], 21 [3], 22 [2]).

[16] Besides the well-known members of Gotama's family other Sakkans are mentioned by name Dandapāni (see § 18 below); Kāla-Khemaka (see § 19 [109] below); Ghatāya (see § 19 [110] below); and the Vedhañña family (see § 24 below).

find in Kapilavatthu such a lodging where we may stay to-day for the night'.[1] 'Even so, revered sir', said Mahānāma. . . . Having roamed through the whole of Kapilavatthu he did not see therein such a lodging where the Blessed One might stay for the night. Then Mahānāma the Sakkan went to where the Blessed One was [outside the city] . . . and said [2] 'There is not, revered sir, such a lodging where the Blessed One may stay to-day for the night in Kapilavatthu. Here there is Bharaṇḍu[2] the Kālāman,[3] a former companion of the Blessed One in holy living[4] [under Ālāra Kālāma] to-day let the Blessed One spend the night in his hermitage (*assame*).' 'Go, Mahānāma', he said, 'arrange a resting-place[5] [for me there].' . . .[6]

§ 9. *Khuddaka-Nikāya*,[7] *Thera-gāthā, verses 528, 529, 534.* (*Psalms of the Brethren*, Mrs. Rhys Davids, *PTS, 1913; pp. 249–50.*)

(528) 'Verdure and blossom-time in every tree . . .[8]
"'Tis time, O Hero, that we set out hence.

(529) Not over hot, nor over cold, but sweet,
O Master, now the season of the year.
O let the Sākiyans[9] and the Koliyans[10]
Behold thee with thy face set toward the West,[11]
Crossing the [border-river] Rohinī" '[12] . . . .

(534) 'Suddhodana[13] is named the mighty prophet's sire,
And mother of the Buddha was [our queen] Māyā'[14] . . .[15]

[1] Ch. 11 *c* § 19 [237].
[2] Ap. G 2 *c*.
[3] Ch. 3 § 4 [66], § 5 [163]; Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [1].
[4] Or, companion in religious life; Ch. 20 § 2 (7). The term does not connote any particular creed (Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 15 *b* § 4 [2]).
[5] Santhara; literally, a place spread. Cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92].
[6] A dispute regarding three kinds of teachers follows. It may be gathered that the Kālāman was an idealistic philosopher maintaining that matter (*rūpa*), sensation (*vedanā*) and sense-desire (*kāma*) were one, i.e. thought-process (Int. § 178; IN 8 *c*), and that Gotama maintained their diversity.
[7] Ap. A 1 *a* (*Khudda-Nikāya*).
[8] The verses are attributed to Kāludāyin (Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [86]; Ch. 10 *c*, 38). The scene is Rājagaha, and Kāludāyin invites Gotama to return to his kinsmen. The translation is that of Mrs. Rhys Davids. In the *Apadāna* two sets of verses are allotted to Kāludāyin.
[9] Int. § 148 (ii).
[10] Int. § 148 (iii).
[11] i.e. coming from the east on the route from Rājagaha.
[12] Int. § 136; Ch. 10 *b* § 1 (5th *vassa*) n; Ch. 13 *d* § 1. Dhammapāla in his Commentary (5th or 6th century A.D., Int. § 14) states that the river flows 'through the land of these two clans, from north to south' (*Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 249). The stream was one of the minor northern affluents of the Ganges (Int. § 121 n).
[13] Ch. 1 § 4. Cp. § 6 above.
[14] Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*.
[15] In verse 536 the speaker declares himself to be 'son of the Buddha', i.e. son in religion; cp. Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note* (*Rāhula*), and Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1] n. He also applies to Buddha the title Angīrasa (Radiant, see *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, p. 196, and *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 239). The name Angīrasa is a Brāhman clan name (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8); see ThB, p. 22. For Buddha's varied titles see Part I (title) n.

§ 10. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 3 (Ambaṭṭha-S.).*

[i. 9] . . .[1] The young[2] [Brāhman] Ambaṭṭha[3] entered. The [other] young [Brāhmans] also entered . . . and seated themselves at one side. But Ambaṭṭha walking to and fro whilst the Blessed One was seated spoke some current phrase or other of greeting[4] (*kañci kañci kathaṃ sārāṇīyaṃ*) and standing[5] spoke . . . whilst the Blessed One was seated. . . . [10] Then the Blessed One spoke thus. . . [6] [11] . . . 'Untrained[7] indeed is this young Ambaṭṭha whilst proud of his training. Wherefore, except from want of training?' [12] Then the young Ambaṭṭha on being called untrained by the Blessed One was agitated and displeased. Sneering . . . he said 'Boorish (*caṇḍā*, O (*bho*) Gotama, is the Sakya folk (*Sakya-jāti*), rough . . . quick-tempered . . . violent[8] is the Sakya-folk. . . . [13] Once, O Gotama, I went to Kapilavatthu on some business of my director (*ācariyassa*)[9] the Brāhman Pokkharasādi,[10] and came into the council-hall (*santhāgāraṃ*)[11] of the Sakkans (*Sakkānaṃ*). At that time many [elder] Sakyas and Sakkan young men (*Sakyā-kumārā*)[12] were seated in the council-hall on high[13] (*uccesu*) seats laughing together . . . no one invited me to a seat. This is not fitting, this is not seemly, that these Sakyas, being menials, or like menials, should not respect Brāhmans [14] . . . [15] There are, O Gotama, these four castes[14] (*vaṇṇā*), Kshatriyas, Brāhmans, Vaisyas, Sūdras. Of these four castes three, the Kshatriyas and the Vaisyas and the Sūdras, undeniably prosper as attendants (*paricārakā*) of the Brāhman.'[15] . . .[16] [24] Then the

[1] The scene is the wood near the Brāhman village of Icchānaṇkalā (Int. § 149 *a*) in Kosala.

[2] Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].

[3] Ch. 14 *d* § 4 [2] n. Ambaṭṭha and others have been sent by the Brāhman teacher Pokkharasādi (Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2, i [2]) from the village of Ukkaṭṭha (Ch. 14 *d* § 3) to inquire. Cp. Ch. 10 *c* (68).

[4] Ch. 12 *c* § 3. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*greetings*).

[5] Int. § 190 (*address*). Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].

[6] Omitting Ambaṭṭha's retort deriding monks as black menials and as shavelings (*muṇḍakā*; see § 28 [6] below). Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1]; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3]. Cp. Ch. 2 § 5 from which it appears that non-Buddhist ascetics also generally shaved the head and beard and assumed yellow robes; and Ch. 14 *a* § 7 (*vutta-sira*).

[7] *A-vusita-vant*; literally, one who has not lived [the religious life]. Ap. C *b* § 10 [1]. 'Ill-bred', SBB, ii, p. 112.

[8] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] (*proud*).

[9] Ch. 8 *g*.

[10] Ap. G 2 *c* § 2, i [2].

[11] See § 5 above; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1]. Cp. § 13 [3] n below.

[12] Cp. [24] and [25] below; also Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92]; and § 11 [91] below.

[13] Or, 'the superior'. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482] (*lower*), and Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; also Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9).

[14] Or. classes; literally, colours. Int. § 185.

[15] Int. § 190.

[16] Gotama is made to state that the Sakyas are pure descendants of King Okkāka, and that Ambaṭṭha, belonging to the Kaṇhāyana *gotta* of Brāhmans, is descended from Okkāka's daughter by a black magician, the son of a slave girl. Varied derivations of the name Sakya are offered incidentally. It seems likely that these historical hypotheses were part of the most ancient commentary on the Canon (Int. § 21). Okkāka is called Ikshvāku king of Sāketa (or of Sāvatthi; ThB, p. 10) in Prakrit legends (Int. § 159 n; cp. § 15 (18) n below). Buddhaghosha's commentary states that in a previous birth Gotama was Kapila the Brāhman, after whom Kapilavatthu was named (ThB, p. 8; Int. § 135), and that the Koliyans (Ch. 13 *d*) were descended from King Rāma of Benāres and the eldest daughter of Okkāka (ThB, p. 9).

Blessed One instructed the young [Brāhman] Ambaṭṭha saying: 'Then what thinkest thou, Ambaṭṭha? In this regard (*idha*)[1] if a Kshatriya young man[2] should dwell with a Brāhman maiden and in consequence of their union a son should be born, now would that son . . . receive either seat or water[3] among the Brāhmans?' 'He would receive them Gotama.' 'Now would the Brāhmans let him partake of funeral-repast[4] (*saddhe*) or rice-dish[5] (*thāli-pāke*) or sacrifice[6] (*yaññe*) or oblation[7] (*pāhuṇe*)?' 'They would let him partake, Gotama.' 'Now would the Brāhmans let him recite the sacred-texts[8] (*mante*) or not?' 'They would let him recite them.' 'Now among the women would [the door] be closed[9] (*āvaṭaṃ*) to him, or open?' 'It would be open to him.' 'Now would the Kshatriyas consecrate (*abhisinceyyuṃ*) him with the Kshatriya anointment[10] (*Khattiyābhisekena*)?' 'Not so indeed, Gotama.' 'Wherefore?' 'On account of his mother, Gotama, he is not admitted[11] (*an-uppanno*).' [25] '. . . In this regard if a Brāhman young man[12] should dwell with a Kshatriya maiden and . . . a son should be born, would that son . . . receive either a seat or water among the Brāhmans?' 'He would.' . . . 'Now would the Kshatriyas consecrate him with the Kshatriya anointment?' 'Not so.' 'Wherefore?' 'On account of his father, Gotama, he is not admitted.' [26] 'And so, Ambaṭṭha, whether setting woman by woman, or man by man, the Kshatriyas[13] are better, the Brāhmans[14] lower (*hīna*). . . .[15] [ii. 1] . . . There is not, Ambaṭṭha, in the highest perfection[16] of knowledge and virtue[17] any talk of birth[18] (*jāti-vādo*) or of family[19] (*gotta-vādo*) or a pride[20] which says either "Thou art as worthy as I" or "Thou art not as worthy as I".[21] Where there is taking in marriage[22] or giving in marriage, or weddings, there there is

[1] Ap. E c i § 8 [19].
[2] *Khattiya-kumāra*; cp. [13] above.
[3] Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3].
[4] Sanskrit *shrāddha*. Ch. 9 *b* § 4.
[5] Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5]; and Int. § 190 (*food*). Cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [1].
[6] Or, sacrificial offering. Ch. 7 *a* § 8.
[7] Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 3 [19]; and Ch. 9 *b* § 4 [28] (*offering*); also Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 [11].
[8] Mantras; verses of the Vedas. Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]; cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n; also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] (*learning*).
[9] Cp. SBB, v, p. 274; and Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3] (*guests*). See Int. § 19c (*women*).
[10] Ch. 7 *b* § 3. See § 11 [91] below.
[11] 'He is not of pure descent', SBB, ii, p. 119. It would appear that the Brāhmans were regarded as foreigners by the martial clansmen of the Middle-land (Ch. 1 § 2 n; Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]).
[12] *Brāhmaṇa-kumāra*; cp. [13] above.
[13] Int. § 185.
[14] Int. § 185; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [157]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84].
[15] King Pasenadi's haughtiness to the Brāhman Pokkharasādi is adduced later (SBB, ii, p. 128). Int. § 169 (1).
[16] *Sampadā*, attainment. Ap. H 4 *a* § 2; cp. Ch. 3 § 4 [66] (*samāpatti*).
[17] *Caraṇa*, conduct; cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6] n; also Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*kammanta*), and Ap. F 2 (*Positive Virtues*). Compare Dhp. 144 (*sampanna-vijjā-caraṇā*, perfect in knowledge and in behaviour).
[18] Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [9]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 2 (21). Cp. Ch. 1 § 11 [163] n.
[19] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4). Cp. Int. § 185 (*castes*); Ap. F 2 *a* (134) *kula*; also Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [179] n, and Ap. H 4 *d*.
[20] *Māna*. Ap. E c i § 7 [3] (*conceit*).
[21] Ap. C *b* § 10 [1].
[22] *Āvāha*; literally, carrying away. Int. § 190.

such talk. . . . Those who are in the bonds[1] of considerations of birth or of family . . . are far from the highest perfection of knowledge and virtue. After abandoning the bonds of considerations of birth . . . there is realization[2] of the highest perfection of knowledge and virtue' . . .[3]

§ 11. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*). *JN, pp. 90–1.*

[JN, p. 90.] As soon as the Rāja[4] was established in the reward of conversion[5] he took the Blessed One's alms-bowl and led the Blessed One and his followers to the palace. . . .[6] [p. 91] On the following day the annointing[7] of the Rāja's son (*rāja-kumārassa*)[8] Nanda[9] was being celebrated, together with the ceremonies of his house entrance and the carrying away [of his bride]. . . . On the third day after reaching Kapilapura the Blessed One conferred the renunciation-ordination[10] on Nanda.

§ 12. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Atthaka-nipāta* (*the Eights*), *Sutta 51.*[11] (*PTS, iv, p. 274.*)

[1] . . .[12] The Blessed One was staying among the Sakkans at Kapilavatthu in the Banyan-tree Garden (*Nigrodh-ārāme*).[13] Then Mahā-Pajāpatī[14] the Gotamid drew near to where the Blessed One was and . . . having saluted the Blessed One she stood at one side[15] and . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'It would be well, revered sir, if women-folk[16] (*mātu-gāmo*) might adopt retirement[17] from the household to the houseless life under the Law and discipline made known by the Leader.' 'Enough, Gotamī,' he said, 'do not demand the retirement of women from the household to the houseless life. . . .'[18]

[1] *Vinibandhā*; Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii).

[2] *Sacchi-kiriyā*, literally, visualizing, i.e. direct vision. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 16 (*seen*).

[3] The threefold treatise on Virtuous Conduct (*Sīla*) is here introduced, as in all the first thirteen Suttas of the *Dīgha-Nik.* (Ap. H 4, *Note*). The true aim of the Sutta now appears. The elaborate expansions of the introductory part may be attributed to commentarial desire to explain (IN 6, *Canon*).

[4] Buddha's father.

[5] 'Had realized the Fruit of Conversion', BBS, revised ed. (1925), p. 224.

[6] As in Ch. 7 *b* § 2 [90] n.

[7] See § 10 [24] above.

[8] Cp. § 10 [13] (*Sakya-kumāra*) above.

[9] Ch. 7 *b* § 3. He was Gotama's half-brother, being the son of Suddhodana and Pajāpatī; see § 12 [1] below, and Ch. 10 *c* (43).

[10] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [1]. The ordination of the Rāja's only remaining son as a mendicant was thus without political significance (Int. § 165).

[11] This passage appears also in *Vin. Piṭ., Culla-vagga*, x. i. 1.

[12] The time is not defined but must have been shortly after Suddhodana's death; Ch. 10 *b* § 1, *5th year*, n.

[13] See below § 18; and Ch. 7 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43].

[14] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2]; see above, § 11 [91] n.

[15] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].

[16] Ch. 8 *d*, n; Ch. 22 *b* § 5 [9]; and Int. § 190 (*women*).

[17] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [1].

[18] As in Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] n.

[2] And a second time . . . [3] and a third time[1] Mahā-Pajāpati spoke to the Blessed One. . . . Then Mahā-Pajāpatī [saying to herself] 'The Blessed One does not sanction for womankind retirement from the household to the houseless life . . .' sorrowful, dejected, tearful, weeping, having saluted (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One and so moving as to keep her right side[2] towards him departed. [4] . . .[3]

§ 13. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, VII, i.*

[3] . . .[4] Anuruddha[5] the Sakkan went to Bhaddiya[6] the Sakyan Rāja . . . and said: 'My going forth [from the world] depends on thee, my friend.' '. . . I am with thee', he replied; 'at thy pleasure go thou forth.' 'Come then, my friend', said he, 'we both will go forth from the household to the homeless life; whatsoever else it is possible for me to do for thee, that will I do. Go thou forth.' . . . 'My friend', he said, '. . . thou hast declared ". . . I am with thee . . ." Come then, my friend, we both will go forth.' . . . Then Bhaddiya the Sakyan Rāja said to Anuruddha: 'Wait, my friend, for seven years . . .' 'Seven years, my friend, is too long a time . . .' 'Wait for six years', he said, '. . . one year . . . one month. . . . Wait, my friend, for seven days whilst I cause my office (*rajjaṃ*) to be resigned to the sons and brothers[7] [of the family].' 'Seven days, my friend, is not too long a time. I will wait.'

§ 14. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 14* (*Cūla-dukkhak-khandha-S.*).[8]

[PTS, i, p. 91.] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans . . . in the Banyan-tree Garden.[9] Then Mahānāma[10] the Sakkan

[1] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [2] n; also Int. § 190 (*address*). For the threefold repetition compare Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4].

[2] Ch. 6 *a* § 9 [14].

[3] As in Ch. 12 *b* § 2.

[4] Gotama had proceeded from Kapilavatthu to Anupiyā, as in Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]. The present scene is in the former town; the year is that of Ānanda's admission to the Order (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]).

[5] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; see § 14 [91] n below.

[6] Ch. 10 *c* (6). Sutta 48 of *Saṃyutta* lv (*Saṃ. Nik.*, v, p. 403) is addressed to Bhaddiya the Sakka, the preceding and succeeding Suttas being addressed to Nandiya the Sakka (see § 8 [1] n above) and Mahānāma (see § 8 [1] above) respectively at Kapilavatthu. The *Apadāna*, No. 43, treats of Bhaddiya, Kāli-Godhā's son, who is identified with Bhaddiya the Rāja in the *Thera-Gāthā* commentary (*Brethren*, p. 315).

[7] '*Putte ca bhātare ca rajjam niyyādemi.*' His office, apparently that of president, would be resigned into the hands of the Council, consisting of members of the dominant family or families of the clan (Ch. 1 § 8; see above, § 10 [13], *santhārāra*).

[8] Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92] n.

[9] See below § 18.

[10] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; see § 8 n above. This Mahānāma is generally said to have been the brother of Anuruddha (see § 13 [3] above) and so the cousin of Gotama. Tradition holds that he succeeded Bhaddiya (Ch. 10 *c*, 6) in the headship of the clan. The present discourse is said to have been delivered in the 15th year of the ministry (Ch. 10 *d* § 1), and to the same year is assigned a miracle (Int. § 94, iii) destroying Suprabuddha, Rājā of the Kolis (RDB, p. 73; KM, p. 36), who is held by late tradition or commentarial ingenuity (Int. § 14) to have been the father of Yasodhara, Gotama's wife (Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 13 *d*, n and § 2 n).

(*Sakko*) drew near to where the Blessed One was and . . . having saluted the Blessed One seated himself at one side and . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Long have I known, revered sir, the Law[1] (*dhammaṃ*) thus shown by the Blessed One: "Greed[2] [is] a defilement (*upakkileso*)[3] of the mind;[4] hate a defilement of the mind; delusion[5] a defilement of the mind." And yet sometimes thoughts of greed (*lobha-dhammā*)[6] . . . and thoughts of hate . . . and thoughts of delusion remain mastering my mind. This thought comes to me, revered sir, "What notion (*dhammo*) within my consciousness (*me ajjhattaṃ*) is not cast out through which sometimes thoughts of greed . . . and hate . . . and delusion remain mastering my mind?" '. . . [92] 'I too, Mahānāma, before my enlightenment, being not yet enlightened . . .[7] saw this rightly (*su-diṭṭhaṃ*), thoroughly comprehending: "Sense-pleasures (*kāmā*)[8] have little flavour, bring much sorrow,[9] bring much despair[10] (*bah-upāyāsā*), here misery[11] [is ever] more"; but I still did not attain to joy and bliss (*pīti-sukham*)[12] sense-pleasures being set aside, evil thoughts[13] (*dhammehi*) being set aside, or to any further [state] better than that; and then I recognized [that I was] even yet not disentangled from sense-pleasures. But [afterwards] when I saw this rightly, thoroughly comprehending: "Sense-pleasures have little flavour . . . here misery is ever more, I did [at last] attain to joy and bliss, sense pleasures being set aside, evil [or deluded egoistic] thoughts being set aside, and to a further [state] better (*santataraṃ*)[14] than that, then I recognized [that I was] disentangled from sense-pleasures' . . .[15]

§ 15. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta, Mahā-vagga I* (*Pabbajjā-S.*), *15–19*.[16]

(15) The king[17] (*rājā*) sitting exchanged with him the current phrases of courtesy[18] . . . and thus spoke:

1 Int. § 3 (*non-egoism*); Ap. G 1 b.
2 *Lobha*. Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13]. Cp. *rāga*, Ap. D *a* § 10 [ii].
3 Ch. 1 § 11 [163]. The defilements here mentioned are the Three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10) of egoism.
4 Or, heart (*citta*); Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29] (*ceto-vimutti*).
5 i.e. the delusion of self-importance.
6 Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3] (*dhammā*); cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [3].
7 Omitting 'while yet a Bodhisatta'. Ch. 1 § 11 [163] n.
8 Ch. 4 § 17 [249]; Ap. D *a* § 1 [421]. See § 18 below.
9 Ap. E *b*.
10 Tribulation or trouble; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].
11 Ādīnava; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].
12 Or, principles. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (6) and (8); Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93].
13 Ap. 1 *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. Ap. F 1 *c*, *Note*.
14 i.e. Nibbāna, extinction of self. Ch. 4 § 16 [167]; Ap. C *b*. The whole apparatus of the four Trances (Ap. I *a*) is ignored here.
15 An analysis of the five kinds of sense-pleasures follows (Ap. D *a* § 9 [i]; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2], *eye*). The self-mortification of the Niganṭhas is then described, as in Ch. 9 *c* § 1; and the Sutta ends with an inapposite and doubtless interpolated (IN 6, *Canon*) comparison of psychic bliss and the pleasures of King Bimbisāra (Int. § 168).
16 Ch. 3 § 1 [66] n.
17 Bimbisāra; Int. § 168.
18 Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]

(16) 'Thou art youthful (*yuvā*) and tender (*daharo*)[1] . . . with fine complexion, like a well-born Kshatriya (*Khattiyo*).[2]

(17) Gracing the forefront of the army, heading the assembly of the Wise,[3] I will grant [thee] wealth; take it, and tell thy birth (*jātiṃ*) at my request.'

(18) 'There is a people, King, dwelling just by the side (*passato*) of Himavanta[4] among the Kosalas (*Kosalesu*),[5] endowed with wealth and power.

(19) By descent (*gottena*)[6] called [kinsmen] of the Sun (*Ādiccā*),[7] by tribe (*jātiyā*)[8] called Sākiyas. From that clan (*kulā*),[9] King, have I gone forth, not caring for sensuous pleasures.'

§ 16. *The Rummiṇḍeī*[10] *Pillar-edict*[11] *of the Emperor Asoka.*[12]

The Gods' Beloved,[13] the Gracious[14] the King[15] (*lājina*), [now] twenty years consecrated,[16] coming [here] himself did reverence. [Remembering] 'Here was the Buddha born,[17] the sage of the Sakyas (*Sakyamunī*),'[18] he caused a stone-built platform[19] to be made and a stone pillar to be set up.

[1] Ch. 2 § 5. [2] Int. § 185.

[3] *Nāga-saṃgha*; council of ministers. Int. § 172; cp. Ap. H 3 *a*; also Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [34] n. The Asokan inscriptions mention Council of chief ministers, with debates and resolutions (see V. A. Smith's *Asoka*, 3rd ed., p. 172). 'Assembly of chiefs', SBE, x, p. 67. [4] Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [1].

[5] See § 8 [1] above. Compare the legend which traces the Sakkans back to the sons of Okkāka and makes him Rāja of Sāvatthi (see § 10 [15] n above; Int. § 18).

[6] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).

[7] i.e. Solar Rājputs. Int. § 159. Cp. ThB, pp. xxii, 20, 217.

[8] Ch. 1 § 11 [163] n.

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2] (*Sakya-kula*). Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [167] (*kula-putta*); Ap. F 2 *a* (134), *kulāni*.

[10] Rummiṇḍei is the modern form of the name Lummini or Lumbini; see § 4 (5) above; Ch. 13 *d* § 2. The place is 4 miles within the Nepalese border northward of the British Indian district of Basti and is a little westward of the Tilar River (see A. C. Woolner, *Asoka*, 1924, p. xvi). The pillar was discovered here evidently *in situ* and its position seems to decide the approximate situation of Kapilavatthu; see Ch. 13 *c* (ii). Fa-hien and Hiuen-tsung, the Chinese travellers, evidently were shown a different site, perhaps more suited to the details of later poetic legendary history.

[11] Vincent A. Smith's translation and notes (*Asoka*, 2nd ed. 1909, p. 199; 3rd ed., 1920, pp. 221–3) should be consulted; also Hultzsch's *Inscriptions of Asoka* (1925), pp. 164–5. The text in the original Brāhmī (Sacred) script with a Roman transliteration is given by V. A. Smith (plate 2) and Woolner gives the Roman transliteration (p. 51) with a Glossary.

[12] Int. § 18; Ap. G 1 *c*. [13] Or, His Sacred Majesty (Ap. G 1 *c* § 2).

[14] Piyadasin, the Gracious (literally of gracious mien), is not part of a royal title (Ap. G 1 *c* §§ 1 n, 4) but is the personal name adopted by Asoka at his consecration. Compare Ajātasattu or foeless (Int. § 168).

[15] *Rāja*; cp. Ch. 1 § 5 (*mahārāja*). In the Māgadhī dialect of the inscriptions *l* replaces *r*. The passive construction used in the text requires the instrumentive case or ablative of the agent. [16] *Abhisita*; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1].

[17] From MPS, v. 8; see Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8]. [18] Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (1).

[19] 'A great (?) railing of stone', V. A. Smith (2nd ed.); 'A stone bearing a horse', Smith (3rd ed.), following Charpentier. The horse is admittedly conjectural. A possible alternative is 'wall'; but neither wall nor railing is appropriate to a pillar and either would dwarf it.

[And remembering] 'Here was the Blessed One born' he made the Lummini[1] village free of [feudal] dues[2] and [caused it to be endowed with the royal share consisting] of the eighth part[3] [of the annual produce].

(ii) *Topography of Kapilavatthu.*[4]

§ 17. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 20* (*Mahā-samaya-S.*).[5]

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed amongst the Sakkans at Kapilavatthu in the Great Grove (*Mahāvane*)[6] with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers . . .[7] all being Saints (*arahantehi*)[8] . . .[9]

§ 18. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 18* (*Madhupiṇḍika-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 108.] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans at Kapilavatthu in the Banyan-tree Garden.[10] And the Blessed One in the forenoon[11] having dressed and assumed his outer robe and alms-bowl entered Kapilavatthu for alms . . . and after his meal[12] returning from his begging round he came to where the Great Grove (*Mahāvanaṃ*)[13] was for the [noon] day-rest[14] and having entered . . . he sat down at the foot of a Beluva sapling.[15] And Daṇḍapāna[16] the Sakkan

[1] Ch. 1 § 5 [52].

[2] Bali; cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (6). 'Religious cesses', V. A. Smith; but excuse from religious dues seems inappropriate. The dues or 'offerings' may have been secular and may have consisted of personal services rather than taxes. Cp. Wales, *Ancient Siamese Government*, pp. 46–7, 53–4, 199–202.

[3] '*Bhāga* was the technical term for what we now call "land-revenue" ', V. A. Smith (2nd ed.), Int. §§ 168 n, 189 (*revenue*). Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 10 (*sacred gift*). Hultzsch (p. 165) translates *atha-bhāgiye* as 'paying (only) an eighth share (of the produce)'.

[4] See § 16 n above (*Rummindei*); Int. § 135; also § 4 (5) n above; and Ch. 1 § 5 [52]. Kapilavatthu is mentioned on one occasion only in MV, once in CV, and some nine times in the remaining parts of *Vin. Piṭ.*; it is mentioned in 5 Suttas of *Dīgha-Nik.*, in 6 of *Majjh. Nik.*, in 14 of *Sam. Nik.*, and in 10 of *Ang. Nik.*

[5] Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note.*

[6] It is not clear whether this was a grove near the city or part of the Great Forest extending from Vesāli northward to the Himālayas (Int. §§ 133, 136). See § 18 below; cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 1 n.

[7] Omitting the conventional number 500. Int. § 121.

[8] Ap. D *c*.

[9] A long list of gods or spirits (*devatā*; IN 8 *a*; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] n), who come to reverence Buddha, follows. In the *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, i, p. 26) the first part or introduction of this Sutta is reproduced. In *Dīgha-Nik.* 32 (Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*) there appears a similar list of gods or spirits who present themselves before Buddha on the Vulture Peak hill (Int. § 128) at Rājagaha and teach him a protective charm (*rakkha* or *paritta*; cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2] n); Ch. 9 *c* (*Magic*) against malignant spirits of the four quarters. These Suttas are mainly in verse (Ap. A 2, *Note*) and may be attributed to comparatively late and ill-instructed followers not yet emerged from a rustic animism (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*) which Buddhism found everywhere and into which it has frequently lapsed.

[10] See §§ 12, 14 above; and §§ 19, 20, 21, 22, 23 below. Int. § 136; Ch. 11 *c* § 25.

[11] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 21 § 9 [1].

[12] Or, after noon, i.e. after the midday meal. Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1].

[13] See § 17 above. Also *Saṃ. Nik.* iii, p. 91 where Brahmā Sahampati (Int. § 93, ii) appears before Buddha here.

[14] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].

[15] Beluva-latthikā; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 7 [83].

[16] See § 8 [1] n above; Ch. 13 *d* § 2 [52] n.

roaming[1] and wandering on foot came to the Great Grove . . . and drew near to where the Blessed One was . . . and standing at one side leaning on his staff . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'What does the devotee (*samaṇo*) believe;[2] what does he proclaim?'[3] 'He who believes, friend,' he said, 'in this [creed] is not at discord[4] (*viggayha*) . . .[5] with anything in the world (*loke*); through this [creed] the perceptions (*saññā*)[6] do not obsess the [true] Brāhman,[7] no longer living yoked to sense-pleasures,[8] not doubting (*a-kathaṃkathiṃ*),[9] no longer troubled, without craving for any [form of] existence[10] (*bhav-abhave*). Such [creed] I believe, friend; such I announce' . . .[11]

§ 19. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 122* (*Mahā-suññāta-S.*).

[PTS, iii, p. 109.] . . . The Blessed One stayed . . . in the Nigrodha-garden.[12] . . . After his meal[13] returning from his begging round he came to where the lodge (*vihāro*)[14] of Kāla-Khemaka[15] the Sakkan was for the [noon-] day-rest.[16] Now at that time there were many couches[17] (*senāsanāni*) prepared in the lodge. . . . [p. 110] Seeing them the Blessed One thought '. . . Many mendicant brothers are staying here' . . . Then the Blessed One in the evening rising from quiet [meditation][18] came to where the lodge of Ghatāya[19] the Sakkan was. . . . And having sat down the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda[20] saying: 'There are many couches prepared in the lodge of Kāla-Khemaka the Sakkan. Are many mendicant brothers staying there?' 'Revered sir,' he replied '. . . many brethren are staying there. It is the season for robe-making,[21] revered sir.' 'A mendicant brother, Ānanda,' he said, 'does not shine when he takes pleasure in crowds.[22] . . .'

[1] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [2].
[2] Or, 'What does he teach (*kiṃ-vādī*)?' Cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [2] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [1. 30].
[3] Ch. 5 *c* § 8 [33]. It is possible that we have in the Kapilavatthu discourses the nearest rendering of Buddha's own teachings. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]; Ap. G 1 *b*.
[4] Cp. Ch. 1 § 11 (*peace*); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*). The phrase implies a fundamental harmony.
[5] Omitting the conducing conventional explanatory formula—'in the [supra-mundane] world of gods, of Māra, of Brahmā, in the [terrestrial] creation (*pajāya*) of religious-teachers and of [earthly] spirits and men'. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28] n; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].
[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40].
[7] Or, devout man. Int. § 45; Ap. F 2 *c*.
[8] See § 14 [92] above.
[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 7.
[10] Ch. 13 *a* § 6. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*bhava-taṇhā*); also Ch. 4 § 16 (*puna-bbhava*); Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*sagga*), and Ap. C *a* § 2 (*heaven*).
[11] Mahā-Kaccāna (Ch. 10 *c*, 10) then explains to the Bhikkhus Buddha's concise statement as implying liberation from the five physical senses acting with the mind (Ap. B *c* § 2 [2], *senses*), i.e. from the percipient individuality.
[12] See § 18 above.
[13] Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1].
[14] Cp. Ch. 8 *g* (*Vihāra*).
[15] See § 8 [1] n above.
[16] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].
[17] Or, lodgings; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2].
[18] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].
[19] See § 8 [1] n above.
[20] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[21] Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [4] (*pattern*); see § 21 [2] below.
[22] The word used is *gaṇa*. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 5; and Ch. 12 *a* § 9 [2] (*noise*); also Int. § 121 n.

§ 20. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sotapatti-saṃyutta (Saṃ. lv), Sutta 37 (Mahānāma). (PTS, v, p. 395.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed . . . in the Nigrodha-garden.[1] [2] And Mahānāma the Sakkan spoke to the Blessed One thus:[2] [3] 'By what measure[3] now, revered sir, has one become a lay-disciple (*upāsako*)?'[4] 'In as far as, Mahānāma, he goes for refuge[5] to the Buddha[6] . . . the Law . . . the Community, so far, Mahānāma, he has become a lay-disciple.' [4] 'By what measure then, revered sir, has a lay-disciple attained to right-conduct[7] (*sīla-sampanno*)?' 'In as far as, Mahānāma, the lay-disciple abstains[8] from the destruction of life[9] . . . from taking what is not given . . . from lustful misbehaviour[10] . . . from false speaking . . . from intoxicating wine and spirits[11] causing negligence—so far, Mahānāma, a lay-disciple has attained to right conduct.' [5] . . .[12] [7] 'By what measure then, revered sir, has a lay-disciple attained to insight?'[13] 'Thus far (*idha*),[14] Mahānāma, is a lay-disciple possessed of insight—he is endowed[15] with insight concerning origination[16] and ending,[17] [an insight] noble[18] (*ariyāya*), penetrating,[19] leading[20] to the complete[21] destruction[22] of sorrow. So far, Mahānāma, a lay-disciple has attained to insight.'

§ 21. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sotāpatti-saṃyutta (Saṃ. lv), Sutta 54 (Gilāyana). (PTS, v, p. 408.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed . . . in the Nigrodha-garden.[23] [2] Now at that time many mendicant brothers were engaged in robe-

[1] See § 18 above. [2] See § 8 [1] above.
[3] *Kittāvatā*; Ap. B *c* § 5 [3]. 'How far', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 338.
[4] Ch. 8 *l*.
[5] Ap. H 1 *c*.
[6] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4].
[7] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; see § 21 [5] n below.
[8] Ap. H 4 *a* (*Abstinences*); Ap. H 4 *b* § 2 [2] (*five precepts*).
[9] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (1); and Int. § 49.
[10] Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3].
[11] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (5).
[12] Omitting definitions of faith (*saddhā*; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*) and generosity (*cāga*; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [1]; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5], *dāna*).
[13] *Paññā*. Ch. 14 *c* §§ 6 [4], 7 [3], 18 [4]; Ch. 21 § 17 [3]; Ap. C *b* § 4; Ap. E *c* i § 6 [3]; Ap. F 2 *a* (132); Ap. G 1 *b* § 3. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (x); Ch. 20 § 4 (7); and IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).
[14] Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].
[15] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1].
[16] *Udaya*; Int. § 4 n. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*sam-udaya*). This term may be interpreted realistically (Ch. 7 *a* § 20, *cessation*), or ethically (Ch. 5 *b* § 6), or metaphysically and idealistically (Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]).
[17] *Attha-gāminī* is the adjectival form of *attha-gama* (Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [1], *disappearance*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2], *ending*). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 19 (*nirodha*).
[18] Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ap. C *b* § 5.
[19] Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [12]; and Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1].
[20] Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 8 (*road*).
[21] Pāli *sammā*. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 n.
[22] *Khaya*. Ch. 20 § 7 (6), and Ch. 4 § 11 [5]; also Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3]. The cessation of sorrow is present Nibbāna and selflessness (Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5], *sagga*).
[23] See § 18 above.

making[1] for the Blessed One, thinking, 'The Blessed One should set forth on his journeying in three months time[2] (*te-māsa-ccayana*) with robes complete. [3] . . . Seated beside him Mahānāma[3] the Sakkan spoke to the Blessed One thus: [4] . . . It has not been heard, revered sir, from the mouth[4] of the Blessed One, taken from his mouth, how a believing[5] lay-disciple[6] when ill, suffering and much exhausted,[7] should be exhorted by another believing layman.' [5] '. . .[8] [7] Should he say "I have a longing for my parents" he should be answered thus: "You (*māriso*),[9] sir (*āyasmā*),[10] are mortal by nature (*maraṇa-dhammo*)[11]. . . . It were well to put away[12] longing for thy parents". [8] . . . If he should say "I have a longing for child and wife" he should be answered: "You are mortal by nature. . . . It were well to put away longing for child and wife. [9] . . .[13] [18] It were well to concentrate the mind (*cittaṃ*)[14] on the cessation[15] of selfhood (*sakkāya-*[16] *nirodhe*)". [19] If he should say thus ". . . I concentrate my mind on the cessation of selfhood", I say, Mahānāma, that between a lay disciple thus declaring, his mind being liberated, and a Bhikkhu whose mind has been liberated from taint (*āsavā*)[17] there is no distinguishing,[18] that is liberation[19] [of the one] from liberation [of the other].'

[1] Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [2]; see § 19 [110] above. The same scene and season recur in Suttas 12 and 13 of the Elevens of *Aṅg. Nik.* (v, pp. 328, 332), where Mahānāma (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]) is instructed on eleven states of mind (*vihārā*; cp. § 22 [3] below; also Ap. F, *System*) suitable to clansmen (*kulaputtā*; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]). These eleven states conclude with respect for the gods (*devā*; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5]), whose ranks and virtues are enumerated (Int. § 70). Here the seventh sphere is that of the *devā Brahmakāyikā* or spirits of the Brahma-body, and higher still appear the *devā Tat-uttarī*.

[2] 'When the rains are over', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 349. Cp. Ch. 8 *c* § 3 [2].

[3] See § 8 [1] above; Ap. C *b* § 8.

[4] Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [2].

[5] *Sa-ppañña.* Cp. Ch. F 2 *a* (132).

[6] Ch. 8 *l*.

[7] Ch. 11 *c* §§ 6 [263], 20 [1].

[8] The reply begins with the four consolations of faith in the Buddha, Dhamma and Saṃgha, and in the Duties (*Sīlāni*, see § 20 [4] above) dear to the Āriyas (Ch. 5 *b* § 5 [19]), conducing to self-transcendence (*samādhi*, Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3). Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] n.

[9] Int § 190 (*address*).

[10] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ch. 22 *b* § 22; Ap. B *c* § 5 [1].

[11] Subjected to death; or, belonging to the system of death. Cp. *jāti-dhamma*, Ch. 1 § 11 [163]; Ap. F 1 *c* [161]; and below, [18] (*selfhood*).

[12] Ap. C *a* § 1 (90). Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 4 (*indifferent*).

[13] Omitting mention of the five human sense pleasures, divine pleasures (*dibbā kāmā*; Ap. H 4 c § 2 [3]), and of the four Great Kings (Int. § 93, v; Ch. 17 *a* [4] n), the Thirty-three, the spirits of the world of Death (*Yāmā devā*; Int. § 70, *spheres*, n), the Tusitā devā, the gods who construct (*Nimmānarati-devā*), the Lords of the work of others (*Paranimmita-vasavattino devā*; Ap. H 5 [93] n) and the Brahma-loka (Int. § 93, vi), from all of which in turn the sick man must avert his mind, as it aspires higher.

[14] Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6].

[15] Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]; see § 29 [4] below.

[16] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii); and Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [11] n. Cp. Ap. E, *Note* (*samkhārā*). Ap. E *c* i § 7 (*conceit*) n; and above, [7] (*mortal*); also Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n.

[17] Ap. D *a* § 7.

[18] Ap. C *b*, *Note* (*layman*).

[19] Ap. D *a* § 6; and Ap. C *b* § 8.

§ 22. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Ānāpāna-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. liv*), *Sutta 12* (*Kaṅkheyya*). (*PTS, v, p. 327*.)

[1] At one time the venerable Lomasa-vangīsa[1] was staying among the Sakkans at Kapilavatthu in the Nigrodha-garden.[2] [2] And Mahānāma the Sakkan[3] drew I near . . .[4] Seated at one side he spoke to the venerable Lomasa-vangīsa thus: [3] 'Is now, revered sir (*bhante*),[5] a learner's[6] attitude the same as the attitude of a Tathāgata[7] (*tathāgata-vihāro*)?'[8] . . .[9]

§ 23. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 53* (*Sekha-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 353] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . in the Nigrodha-garden.[10] And at that time a new council-hall[11] had recently been built for the Sakyas[12] of Kapilavatthu (*Kāpilavatthavānaṃ*) and had not yet been lived in . . .[13] And the Sakyas of Kapilavatthu came to where the Blessed One was . . . and spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Here, revered sir, a new council-hall has recently been built. . . . Let the Blessed One, revered sir, enjoy the first use of it; its being first used by the Blessed One will afterwards long be to the Sakyas of Kapilavatthu a profit and pleasure.' [p. 354] The Blessed One accepted by his silence. . . .[14] And the Blessed One having enlightened, informed, stirred, and gladdened the Sakyas of Kapilavatthu by discourse[15] on the Law till late at night[16] instructed the venerable Ānanda[17] saying 'Let this be made clear, Ānanda, to the Sakyas of Kapilavatthu, [namely] what learner enters the path (*sekho*[18] *pāṭipado*);[19] my back is weary, I will rest it.' . . . Then the Blessed One having arranged his outer-wrap (*saṅghāṭiṃ*)[20] fourfold[21] lay down on his right side in the lion-posture[22] placing foot on foot. . . .[23]

[1] He is mentioned as Lomasa-kaṅgiya in *Majjh. Nik.* 134.
[2] See § 18 above.
[3] See § 8 [1] above.
[4] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].
[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9].
[6] *Sekha*; see § 23 [354] below; Ch. 6 *a* § 8 [13]; Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1] (*train*); also Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18, *sāvaka*).
[7] The text below makes it clear that this is not a Buddha but a saint or Arahat (Ap. D *c*); cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5).
[8] Cp. Ap. F 2 *b* (*Brahma-vihārā*); see also § 21 [2] n above (*vihāra*).
[9] The reply is that the learner abandons the five obstacles (*pañca-nivaraṇā*; Ap. D *a* § 9, iv) whilst Arahats (*arahanto*) not only abandon but uproot them (Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [5] n).
[10] See § 18 above.
[11] *Santhāgāra*; Int. § 171; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1].
[12] Int. § 148 (ii).
[13] As in Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [2].
[14] As in Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2], [3], with necessary changes.
[15] Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4].
[16] Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4]; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [1].
[17] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[18] See § 22 [3] above.
[19] The adjectival form of *paṭipadā* (the road or discipline); cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].
[20] Ch. 8 *j* § 3.
[21] Ch. 22 *a* §§ 5 [21], 8 [39]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9); Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] (*mat*).
[22] *Sīha-seyya*, Ap. H 5 [93].
[23] Ānanda then addressing Mahānāma by name (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]) delivers a discourse on liberation, the senses, and other matters. Buddha's approval at the close is the conventional cover to later invention (IN 6, *Canon*). The scene and occasion are repeated word for word in *Saṃ. Nik.* (iv, p. 182), where, however, Moggallāna (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]) instead of Ānanda is the speaker and he addresses

§ 24. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 29* (*Pāsādika-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans in the storied-building (*pāsāde*)[1] in the mango-grove of [certain] Sakyans who were named Vedhaññā.[2] . . .[3]

(iii) *Minor townships*

§ 25. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 104* (*Sāmagāma-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 243.] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans at Sāmāgama.[4] Now at that time Nātaputta[5] the Nigaṇṭha had recently died at Pāvā.[6] On his death the Nigaṇṭhas were split and divided in two. . . .[7] [p. 244] Those who were householders,[8] lay (*odāta-vasanā*) disciples of the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta, became indifferent, detached from and opposed to the [ascetic] followers of the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta, as being under a wrongly-proclaimed, ill-taught doctrine and discipline, without deliverance, not conducing to tranquillity,[9] not taught by one supremely enlightened, without head[10] (*bhinna-tthūpe*), without refuge. And Cunda[11] the novice[12] having spent the rainy season at Pāvā came to Sāmagāma, to where the venerable Ānanda[13] was . . . and told the venerable Ānanda. . . . On this being told the venerable Ānanda said to Cunda the novice: 'This, friend Cunda, is news to be told to the Blessed One.' . . .[14]

the Bhikkhus on the senses and the mind, after the Sakyas have been dismissed late at night. It is to be observed that in this latter Sutta Buddha addresses his fellow-clansmen as 'Gotamas' (Ch. 1 § 6 n; cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4], *Vāseṭṭhas*).

[1] Ch. 2 § 2. Rhys Davids in *Dial. of the B.* (vol. iii, p. 111) translates as '[at the technical college] in the Mango Grove of the Sākyan family named the Archers', and in a footnote quotes from the Commentary (Int. § 14), 'There is a long terraced mansion made for the learning of crafts.' It has been assumed that this crafts-school (Int. § 137) was at Kapilavatthu, but it may have been at Sāmagāma (Int. § 148, ii) near by.

[2] See § 8 [1] n above.

[3] News of Nātaputta's death is brought to Ānanda at Sāmagāma (as in § 25 below; see Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, ii) and he reports it to Buddha, who delivers an address on imperfect and perfect teachers and disciples and on disputes and on the essentials of his own teaching (Ap. G 1 *b* § 4). This incident apparently took place whilst Gotama was on an occasional tour during the long period when his headquarters were at Sāvatthi, but it may have happened before his permanent residence in Sāvatthi. The discourse is addressed to Cunda the novice (*samamuddesa: D. of B.*, vol. iii, p. 112 n); Upavāna is in attendance (Ch. 10 *d* § 1, *20th year*, n; Ch. 22 *b* § 3 [4]).

[4] See § 24 n above; Int. § 148 (ii). Also *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 220, where the place is called Sāmagāmaka and Buddha stays by the lotus-pool.

[5] Or, Nāthaputta; Ch. 11 *d* § 6 n; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii); and Int. §§ 179, 184.

[6] Ch. 13 *a* § 1.

[7] Omitting conventional reproaches; cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [152].

[8] Ap. H 4 *b* § 2 [2].

[9] *Upa-sama*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].

[10] 'Now reft of foundations', SBB, vi, p. 140; 'Now wrecked as it was of his support', *D. of B.*, vol. iii, p. 112.

[11] He was present at the death-bed of Sāriputta (*Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 161; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2]). Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 6 (*Mahā-Cunda*); also *Psalms of the Brethren*, pp. 118, 350, and *Apadāna*, i, p. 101.

[12] *Samaṇ-uddesa*; Ch. 11 *c* § 29 n. Cp. *sāmaṇera*; Ch. 8 *g* § 6.

[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[14] Buddha delivers to Ānanda a discourse on the essentials of his teaching (Ap. G 1 *b* § 4) and on the means of avoiding dissensions (Ch. 19).

§ 26. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 67 (Cātumā-S.).*

[PTS, i, p. 456.] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Cātumā[1] (*Cātumāyaṃ*) in the Āmalakī-grove.[2] And at that time five hundred mendicant brothers . . .[3] arrived at Cātumā to see the Blessed One. . . .[4]

§ 27. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Māra-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 4) Sutta 21 (Sambahulā). (PTS, i, p. 117.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans at Silāvati,[5] [2] and many mendicant brothers, diligent, fervent (*ātāpino*), resolute-minded, stayed near the Blessed One. . . .[6]

§ 28. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Brāhmaṇa-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 7), Sutta 22 (Khomadussa). (PTS, i, p. 184.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans in a township (*nigame*)[7] of Sakyas (*Sakyānaṃ*) called Khomadussa.[8] . . . [3] At that time the Brāhman[9] householders (*gahapatikā*) of Khomadussa were assembled in the meeting-hall (*sabhāyaṃ*)[10] for some business and the sky[11] (*devo*) was drizzling slightly. [4] The Blessed One drew near to where the meeting-hall was. . . . [6] Seeing him they said: 'Who are the shaveling[12] devotees[13] that they should know about the nature of [our] meetings (*sabhā-dhammaṃ*)?'. . . .[14]

§ 29. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Magga-saṃyutta (Sam. 45), Sutta 2 (Upaḍḍha). (PTS, v, p. 2.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakyas (*Sakyesu*), [where there was] a township (*nigamo*)[15] of Sakyas called Sakkara.[16] [2] . . . Seated beside him the venerable Ānanda[17] spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'Half (*upaḍḍhaṃ*) of the holy life,[18] revered sir, is this, that is to say love for goodness,[19] association with goodness, intimacy

[1] Int. § 148 (ii). [2] 'In the myrobalan wood', SBE, v, p. 324.

[3] Omitting 'headed by Sāriputta and Moggallāna'; Ch. 7 *a* § 16. These two elders evidently do not lead but introduce them.

[4] The visitors being inexperienced are noisy and Buddha at first refuses to see them, but relents on the intercession of Brahmā Sahampati (Int. § 93, ii), who seems to personify thought (Ap. G 2 *b*), and of the Sakyans of Cātumā.

[5] Int. § 148 (ii). Also in Sutta 22 of the same *Saṃyutta*.

[6] The brethren are tempted by Māra (Int. § 69) in the guise of an old and immoral Brāhman. The prose is merely a setting to the final verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*).

[7] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [1].

[8] Int. § 148 (ii). *Khomadussaṃ nāma*; compare the construction in Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[9] Ch. 1 § 2 [49] n. [10] Int. § 171; cp. Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].

[11] Literally, God. Ap. A 1 *a* (*devo*). Cp. Ap. G 2 *b* (*Power*).

[12] *Muṇḍakā*; see § 10 [10] n above; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [3].

[13] *Samaṇakā*; Ap. A 2 *d* [21].

[14] Buddha reproves them in verses attributable to a later follower.

[15] Ch. 11 *e* § 4. [16] Int. § 148 (ii). [17] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[18] *Brahma-cariya*; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].

[19] The good, or virtue; *kalyāna* (Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6]). 'Friendship with what is lovely', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 2. The ethical side rather than the emotional or mystical aspect of religion is intended (Int. § 3, *non-egoism*; Ap. G 1 *a*).

with goodness.' [3] 'Not so, Ānanda, not so', he said; 'the whole, Ānanda, of the holy life is this, that is to say love for goodness, association with goodness, intimacy with goodness. Of a mendicant brother who is a lover of goodness, an associate of goodness, an intimate of goodness, this is foreknown, that he will pursue (*bhāvessati*) and frequent the noble eightfold Path (*maggaṃ*).[1] [4] . . . In this regard, Ānanda, the mendicant brother exercises (*bhāveti*)[2] right outlook,[3] consequent on detachment,[4] consequent on absence of desire,[5] consequent on cessation,[6] reaching [self-]surrender;[7] he exercises right will . . .[8] right speech . . . right action . . . right self-discipline . . . right activity . . . right self-knowledge . . . right self-transcendence,[9] consequent on detachment, consequent on absence of desire, consequent on cessation, reaching [self-]surrender. . . . [5] In such manner then, Ānanda, must this be understood, how the whole of the holy life is this, that is to say love for goodness, association with goodness, intimacy with goodness. Indeed, Ānanda, following the[10] lover of goodness beings belonging to the system of individual-existence[11] are liberated from individual-existence (*jātiyā*)?[12] . . . from decay . . . from death . . . from grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair.'[13]

§ 30. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 89* (*Dhammacetiya-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 118.] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans [where there was][14] a township of Sakyas called Medalumpa (*Medalumpaṃ*).[15] Now at that time king Pasenadi[16] the Kosalan (*Kosalo*)[17] arrived at Nangaraka[18] on some business. . . . Then King Pasenadi the Kosalan addressed Dīgha Kārāyana,[19] saying: '. . . Where then, friend (*samma*)[20] Kārāyana, is the Blessed One now staying?' [p. 119] 'There is, Mahārāja, a township of Sakyas called Medalumpa; there the Blessed One is now staying, the saint all-enlightened.' 'How far then, friend Kārāyana, from Nangaraka is Medalumpa? . . .' 'Not far, Mahārāja, three leagues[21] (*yojanāni*); it is possible to go in what

1 Ch. 5 *b* § 8.
2 Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2].
3 Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].
4 *Viveka*; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].
5 *Virāga*; literally, absence of stain, fading [of desire]; cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).
6 Of, individualistic desire. See § 21 [18] above; Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [13].
7 *Vossagga*; cp. *nekkhamma*, Ap. F 2 *a* (126); also *amata* (Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]).
8 Omitting repetitions only.
9 Ap. F 2 *d* [421].
10 'Because of my friendship with what is lovely', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 3. The PTS text (v, p. 3) has the following footnote, 'Sı mammaṃ here only'. The added 'my' is not in character with the Teacher or the teaching.
11 Isolated earth-born mortals; Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. F 1 *c* [161]. 'Beings liable to re-birth', *Kindred Sayings*.
12 i.e. by self-surrender. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 6.
13 Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].
14 Ch. 11 *e* § 4.
15 Int. § 148 (ii). Spelt variously Medaḷumpaṃ, Medalumpaṃ, and Medālupam.
16 Int. § 169 (i).
17 See § 8 above. Pasenadi's informal visit to Medalumpa seems to imply that the Sakyas were already under the domination of Kosala.
18 In the Kosalan country (Int. § 149) near the borders of the Sakyas.
19 His Charioteer.
20 Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].
21 About 24 miles; Ch. 2 § 7. Ch. 14 *d* § 5.

remains of the day.' . . . Then King Pasenadi the Kosalan having mounted a sumptuous chariot set forth [in company] with many sumptuous chariots from Nangaraka. . . . Having ridden on the chariot as far as the ground [was permissible][1] for a chariot he dismounted and entered the garden (*ārāmaṃ*). . . . Then King Pasenadi the Kosalan gave both sword and turban[2] (*unhīsaṃ*) to Dīgha Kārāyana . . . and silently drew near to where the closed dwelling (*vihāro*)[3] was, quietly entered the verandah[4] (*āḷindaṃ*), coughed and tapped the bolt[5] (*aggaḷaṃ*). The Blessed One [gave permission and someone] opened the door. [p. 120] Then the king . . . having entered the dwelling fell down with his head at the feet[6] of the Blessed One, kissed repeatedly the Blessed One's feet and stroked them with his hands, and declared his name. . . .[7]

d. The Koliyans;[8] Devadaha, and Minor Townships

§ 1. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Thera-gāthā, verse 529.*[9]

'Not over hot, nor over cold, but sweet,
O Master, now the season of the year.
O let the Sakiyans and the Koliyans
Behold thee with thy face set toward the West,
Crossing the [border-river] Rohinī.'[10]

§ 2. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā).*

[JN, p. 52.] The lady Mahā-Māyā[11] . . . desiring to visit her parents' home said to Suddhodana the Rāja: 'I wish, lord, to go to the city

[1] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [13]; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83] n. [2] Int. § 190 (*dress*).
[3] Ch. 8 *g* (*monastery*). [4] Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [4] n; and Int. § 190 (*architecture*).
[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [161]; Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13] n. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [2] (*key*). [6] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5]; and Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*).
[7] The Rāja gives many 'memorable' reasons (*dhamma-cetiyāni*) why he shows such signs of respect and affection, one of these being that the Blessed One is like himself a Kshatriya (Int. § 185) and a Kosalan (see § 8 above), and 80 years of age. If the age is stated correctly then the dialogue must have taken place in the last year of Gotama's life (Ch. 21 § 7; Ch. 22 *b* § 16 [27]) but the Sutta has a somewhat fanciful air.
[8] Int. § 148 (iii); Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [15] n; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (5). 'A clan separated from the Sākiyans by the river Rohinī', *Brethren*, p. 144. On their quarrel over the river see Ch. 10 *b* § 1 (5th *vassa*) n and *Brethren*, p. 93. Gotama's mother (see § 2 below) and wife (Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91] n) are said to have been and probably were daughters of Koliyan Rājas.
[9] Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [86] (*Udayin*). The translation is taken from Mrs. Rhys Davids's *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 249.
[10] Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (529). The river apparently did not separate these two clans (see below, § 2).
[11] Ch. 1 § 3; Ch. 13 *d*, n. Commentarial speculation has made Mahā-Māyā a daughter of Añjana or Suprabuddha the elder, a son of Devadaha of Koli; see RDB, p. 52, where authorities are cited. The same authorities make the younger Yasodharā a daughter of Suprabuddha the younger or Daṇḍapāni (Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91] n, § 18). Other and equally speculative commentators make Mahā-Māyā a daughter of Añjana, son of Devadaha the Sakya, whose township also called Devadaha, was in the Sakyan territory (see ThB, pp. 24–5). Cp. *Psalms of the Sisters*, p. 88. For the close association of Sākiyans and Koliyans in Devadaha see *Brethren*, p. 77 (*Rakkhita*).

of my family, Devadaha.'[1] The Rāja assented. . . . He caused the road[2] from Kapilavatthu to Devadaha to be levelled and adorned with plantain-arches. . . . Between the two cities there is a pleasure park of sāl-trees, called the Lumbini Grove (*Lumbini-vanaṃ*),[3] belonging to the inhabitants of both towns. . . . Her attendants bearing her entered the Grove. Having reached the foot of a noble sāl-tree she wished to take hold of one of its branches. . . . She stretched out her hand and took hold of the branch; and at that moment her pains began. . . . Thus grasping the branch of the sāl-tree, and standing, she was delivered. . . . [p. 54] Then the inhabitants of both towns took the Bodhisatta and carried him to Kapilavatthu.

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka*, *Saṃyutta-Nikāya*, *Khandha-vagga*, *Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ*. *xxii*), *Sutta* 2 (*Devadaha*). (*PTS*, *iii*, *p*. 5.)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans [where there was][4] a township of Sakyas called Devadaha[5] [2] and many West-faring (*pacchābhūma-gāmikā*)[6] mendicant-brothers came to where the Blessed One was. . . . [3] Seated at one side they spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'We wish, revered sir, to go to the West country (*janapadaṃ*), to make our residence in the West country.' 'Has Sāriputta[7] then, mendicant brothers', he replied, 'overseen you?[8] . . . Sāriputta is wise (*paṇḍito*), the support[9] (*anuggāhako*) of mendicant-brothers living the holy life with him.' . . . [5] Then those mendicant brothers . . . came to where the venerable Sāriputta was . . . and sat down at one side. . . . [7] 'Now, friends', he said, 'there are people who question a mendicant brother who goes from one realm to another . . . wise men, friends, who may enquire saying "What doctrine does your teacher, venerable sirs, declare; what does he announce?" '[10] . . .[11]

[1] Int. § 148 (iii); Ch. 1 § 5. Devadaha is termed in *Majjh. Nik.* and *Saṃ. Nik.* a town of the Sakyas or Sakkans (see below §§ 3, 4). It is perhaps the same as Rāmagāma of the Koliyans; Int. § 166 (5) and Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (5). The fact that it is called a town of the Sakyas may show only the dominance of the latter; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 (*Kosalas*) n.

[2] Cp. § 1 above.

[3] Ch. 13 *c* § 16 (*Rumiṇḍei*).

[4] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[5] See § 2 above. So also in the first Sutta of the *Devadaha-vagga* (*Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 124). The name Sakyas here possibly includes the Koliyans just as the name Kosalas seems to include the Sakyas (Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1] n).

[6] Cp. *pacchābhūmakā* (Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]). Cp. also Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [1] n; and Ch. 1 § 2 (*west*).

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].

[8] Or, 'inspected you'. 'Have ye got leave from Sāriputta?' *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 6.

[9] 'Patron', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 6, v, p. 161.

[10] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [4]. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228] (*prevails*).

[11] Sāriputta instructs them to reply that the Teacher puts an end to excitement and desire (*chanda-rāga*) (Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [10]; cp. Ap. D *a* § 8, ii, § 10, ii) pointing out the instability of the five constituents (*khandhā*; Ap. E *a* ii) of the individual. The Sutta makes no reference to rebirth (Ap. B *a*, *karma*; cp. IN 2), but at the end there is mention of a state of happiness (*sugati*; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]; cp. Ap. C *a* § 2, *heaven*) or of woe (*duggati*; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n; cp. Ap. B *a* § 7, *niraya*) after death (cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [1]), though not of the purgatorial stages (Ap. D *c* § 3 [15] n) so much stressed in later theory.

§ 4. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 101* (*Devadaha-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 214.] . . . The Blessed One was staying among the Sakkans [where there was] a township of Sakkans (*Sakkānaṃ*) called Devadaha[1] (*Devadahaṃ*). There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . . 'There are some religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*)[2] believing and theorizing thus: "Whatever a person (*purisa-puggalo*) experiences . . . all is caused by former action;[3] so by penance (*tapassā*)[4] tending to put an end to old actions (*kammānaṃ*), by the non-committal of new actions, there is [for him] no transmission[5] [of the results of action] in a future [individual life]; by there being no transmission [of the results of action] in the future there will be destruction of action (*kamma-kkhayo*);[6] by the destruction of action there will be destruction of pain; by the destruction of pain there will be destruction of sensation; by the destruction of sensation all pain will be exhausted." The Niganṭhas[7] believe thus. . . .[8] [220] Among the Niganṭhas teaching thus I observe nothing which presents a rightful doctrine.'[9] . . .[10]

§ 5. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 57* (*Kukkara-vatika-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 387.] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Koliyans [where there was] a township of Koliyans called Halidda-vasana[11] (*Haliddavasanaṃ nāma*). And Puṇṇa the Koliya-putta who lived like an ox (*go-vatiko*)[12] and the unclothed-ascetic (*acelo*)[13] Seniya who lived like a dog[14] (*kukkara-vatiko*) came to where the Blessed One was. . . . Puṇṇa Koliya-putta having saluted the Blessed One sat down at one side; then the unclothed-ascetic Seniya who lived like a dog exchanged courtesies[15] with the Blessed One and having gone through the current phrases of courtesy twisted himself like a dog and sat down at one side. . . . Then Puṇṇa spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'This unclothed-ascetic Seniya living like a dog, revered sir, lives painfully (*dukkara-kārako*); he eats what is cast on the ground. His dog-vow

1 See § 2 above.

2 Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [29]; and Ap. A 2 *d* [21]. The term includes the Jains (*Niganṭhā*). 'Some recluses and brahmins', SBE, vi, p. 123.

3 *Pubbe-kata*, what was done formerly; Int. § 4 (*transmigration*).

4 Ap. B *b* § 3 [8].

5 *An-avassava* (perhaps *a-nava-ssava*), no outflow; as in *Majjh.* 14 (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]).

6 See § 5 n below.

7 Int. § 184.

8 A refutation of the Niganṭhas' theory of rebirth (Ap. B *a*, *Karma*), word for word as in Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93], follows. Other arguments against them are added.

9 'Nothing in the way of an effectual answer', SBB, vi, p. 126.

10 The Buddhist theories of purification which follow are largely compiled, not always consistently, from *Majjh. Nik.* 4 and 27.

11 Int. § 148 (iii). Also in Saṃ. 46 of *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, v, p. 115).

12 Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*asceticism*).

13 Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15], and Int. § 187 (*ascetics*).

14 'A Canine', SBB, v, p. 178. IN 10 (*cynics*).

15 Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237].

has been long and thoroughly observed. What will be his course, what will be his future state?'[1] . . .[2]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Gāmini-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 42), *Sutta 13* (*Pātali*). (*PTS, iv, p. 340.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying among the Koliyans at a township of Koliyans called Uttara[3] (*Uttaraṃ nāma*). . . .[4]

§ 7. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta* (*the Fours*), *Sutta 57*.

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Koliyans [where there was] a township of Koliyans called Sajjanela[5] (*Sajjanelaṃ nāma*). . . .[6]

§ 8. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Aṭṭhaka-nipāta* (*the Eights*), *Sutta 54*.

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed among the Koliyans [where there was] a township of Koliyans called Kakkarapatta (*Kakkarapattaṃ nāma*).[7] And Dīghajānu Koliya-putta came to where the Blessed One was. . . . Seated at one side he spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'We householders (*gihī*), revered sir, are dominated by sense-pleasures (*kāma-bhogī*),[8] our couch teems with children, we seek after Kāsi-muslins[9] and sandalwood[10] (*Kāsika-candanaṃ*), we use garlands, scents, and unguents,[11] we delight in gold and silver.[12] To us here now, revered sir, let the Blessed One teach the Law.' . . .[13]

§ 9. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta* (*the Fours*), *Sutta 194*.

[1] At one time the venerable Ānanda[14] stayed among the Koliyans at a township of Koliyans called Sāpūga[15] (*Sāpūgannaṃ*). And many

[1] Ap. B *a* § 6 [6].

[2] The Sutta makes Buddha say that there are four kinds of action, of which three lead to a maturing (*vipāka*), dark, bright, or mixed, whilst the fourth being indifferent conduces to the destruction of previous action (*kamma-kkhaya*). It is to be observed that 'the putting an end to old actions' or 'the destruction of action (*kammakkhaya*'; Ap. B *a*, *Karma*) is the aim of the Niganṭhas (see § 4 above) and not of Gotama. The two ascetics are converted and Seniya the cynic becomes a saint (Ch. 10 *c*).

[3] Int. § 148 (iii).

[4] Pātaliya the headman (*gāmani*) visits Buddha. In the dialogue mention is made of the Koliyan police (*lamba-cuḷakā bhatā*, long-locked retainers) who are denounced as utter rogues. Int. § 175; cp. Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]; see RDBI, p. 21.

[5] Int. § 148 (iii); Ch. 10 *c* (76) n.

[6] Buddha receives food at the house of Suppavāsā, the Koliyan lady or daughter of Koliya (Ch. 10 *c*, 76). and praises the givers of food.

[7] Int. § 148 (iii).

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].

[9] Ap. B *a* § 2 [6]. Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [1]; Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35].

[10] Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [2] n; and Int. § 190 (*toilet*).

[11] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (8).

[12] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10). See Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] n.

[13] Buddha lays down eight principles to assure for householders (*gihī*; Ap. H 4 *b* § 2 [2]; cp. Ch. 8 *l*) welfare and happiness in this world and hereafter (*samparāya*; Ch. 14 *b* § 8 [2] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [6]; cp. Ap. C *a* § 2, *heaven*, and Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*). The four unworldly principles are faith (*saddhā*), duty (*sīla*), self-renunciation (*cāga*) and reason (*paññā*); which makes *cāga* (Ch. 8 § 2) equivalent to *samādhi* (Ap. G 1 *b* § 3, and Ap. F 2 *d*) in the 'comprehensive discourse' of the MPS. Buddha addresses the Koliyan by his family name as Vyaggha-pajja (see § 9 below; 'Tigerfoot', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 187); cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] (*Vāseṭṭha*).

[14] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[15] Int. § 148 (iii).

Koliyans (*Koliya-puttā*) of Sāpūga came to the venerable Ānanda. . . . To them seated at one side the venerable Ānanda spoke thus: 'Rightly, O Vyagghapajjas,[1] have these four parts of the effort towards complete purification been announced by the Blessed One . . . for the realization of Nibbāna.[2] What four? That part of the effort towards complete purification which concerns conduct;[3] that part . . . which concerns the will;[4] that part . . . which concerns opinion;[5] that part . . . which concerns liberation.[6]

e. The Himālayan Region north of Kosala

§ 1. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Māra-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 4), Sutta 10 (Rajja). (PTS, i, p. 116.)*

[1] Once the Blessed One stayed among the Kosalas[7] (*Kosalesu*) in the Himavant[8] region (*Himavanta-padese*) in a forest hut.[9] [2] And as the Blessed One was alone and quiet[10] a reflection arose in his mind thus: ' 'Tis possible[11] now to bear rule (*rajjaṃ*) not slaying, not causing to slay, not conquering, not causing to conquer, not grieving, not causing to grieve, [ruling] by the Law[12] (*dhammena*). . . ,[13]

§ 2. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Devaputta-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 2), Sutta 5 (Jantu). (PTS, i, p. 61.)*

[1] Thus have I heard. At one time many Bhikkhus were staying among the Kosalas[14] on the slope of Himavant (*Himavanta-passe*)[15] in a forest hut,[16] arrogant,[17] vain, unsteady, talkative, random in speech, unreflecting, ignorant, distracted, divided in mind, with undeveloped faculties.[18] [2] Then Jantu, a spirit[19] (*deva-putto*), on the day of Uposatha (*tad-ah'uposathe*)[20] on the fifteenth[21] [of the month] came to

[1] See § 8 n above. 'Men of the Leopard's Path', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 205.
[2] Or, Peace; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].
[3] *Sīla*, right conduct or duty; Ap. H 4 *a*.
[4] *Citta*, feeling or thought; the wishing or feeling rather than the thinking mind; Ap. H 4 *a* § 2. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]; also Ch. 4 § 17 and Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].
[5] *Diṭṭhi*, view or outlook; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].
[6] *Vimutti*, emancipation from the self, release from the passions of the individual; Ap. D *a* § 6.
[7] Ch. 14; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1].
[8] Himālaya. Int. § 148 (v).
[9] Ch. 11 *c* § 29.
[10] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [1], and [2]; cp. Ch. 20 § 7 (1).
[11] 'Is it possible', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 145.
[12] Of non-enmity; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5). Cp. the first two Sīlas (Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3]).
[13] Māra (Int. § 93, iv) tempts Buddha in verse (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) with thoughts of wealth.
[14] Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1].
[15] Int. § 148 (v); Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (18).
[16] Ch. 11 *c* § 29.
[17] Or, confused; *uddhatā*. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii), *uddhacca*.
[18] *Pākat-indriyā*; 'uncontrolled in faculties', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 6. The faculties are powers of sense or of spirit; cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 2, and Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.
[19] Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [262]; Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [5] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [2] n; and IN 8 *a*.
[20] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1].
[21] Ch. 8 *a* [1] (*half-month*); Ch. 8 *b* § 3 [3].

where those Bhikkhus were. When he had come he addressed the Bhikkhus in the verses:[1]

'Happy of old (*pure*) were the Bhikkhus, disciples of Gotama;[2]
Seeking alms without desire, without desire a lodging;
Perceiving transience (*aniccataṃ*)[3] in the world they made an end of sorrow.[4]

Those who make themselves hard to support, like to a headman[5] in a village,
Eat, eat, and sleep, infatuate with others' houses.

I salute the Sangha; to some here I pay honour.
Rejected, leaderless, are some; like the departed (*petā*)[6] there are they.
Those who live slothfully (*pamattā*), to them have I spoken;
But those who live zealously,[7] to them I utter homage (*namo*).'[8] So (*ti*).

[1] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*. The setting apparently was written after the verses, which themselves avowedly were composed when Gotama's day was 'long ago (*pure*)'.

[2] Ch. 1 § 6 [55] n.

[3] The impermanence of individuality; Ch. 20 § 6 (1); Ap. E *a* i. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] (*cessation*); Ch. 7 *a* § 19 (*declares*); also Ch. 4 § 11 (*destruction of the bases*).

[4] Ch. 21 § 16.

[5] Ch. 11 *a* § 4; cp. Ch. 13 *d* § 6 n.

[6] Cp. Ap. B *a* § 6 [8] (*ghost*).

[7] Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7].

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.

CHAPTER 14

THE KOSALAN[1] KINGDOM

a. KOSALA; GOVERNMENT AND INSTITUTIONS; PUBLIC AFFAIRS

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dassaka-nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 29. (PTS, v, p. 59.)*

[1] . . .[2] Wherever the Kāsis and Kosalas (*Kāsi-Kosalā*)[3] are, wherever the dominion of King Pasenadi[4] the Kosalan is, there King Pasenadi the Kosalan is proclaimed as foremost. . . .

§ 2. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 6 (Mahāli-S.).*[5]

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Vesāli in the Mahāvana. . . . At that time many Brāhmans,[6] who were Kosalan and Māgadhan envoys,[7] were dwelling at Vesāli for some business . . . [2] and they proceeded to the Mahāvana . . . and exchanged courtesies with the Blessed One. . . .

§ 3. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 86 (Aṅgulimāla-S.).*[8]

[PTS, ii, p. 101.] . . . 'The Māgadhan King Seniya Bimbisāra[9] has no quarrel with me, nor [have] the Licchavis of Vesāli, nor other rival rulers,'[10] said the Kosalan King Pasenadi;[11] 'but there is in the land acquired by me a robber, Aṅgulimāla[12] by name. . . .'

§ 4. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 3), Sutta 9 (Yañña). (PTS, i, pp. 75–6.)*

[1] Sāvatthi.[13] [2] At that time a great sacrifice[14] was being made

[1] Int. § 158 (4).
[2] The scene is not stated. See Ch. 15 *a* § 4 [1].
[3] The ancient kingdom of Kāsi had been absorbed by its northern neighbour Kosala; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11].
[4] Int. § 169 (i). See below §§ 3, 4, 5; Ch. 14 *d* § 5; Ch. 14 *e* §§ 1 [3], 3; Ch. 14 *f* § 12; Ch. 18 *c* §§ 1 [97], 2 [8]. 'The whole of the Third Saṃyutta [*Kindred Sayings*, i, pp. 93–127] consisting of twenty-five anecdotes, each with a moral bias, is devoted to him [Pasenadi]. And there are about an equal number of references to him in other parts of the literature', RDBI, p. 8. There are in the first four Nikāyas but six Suttas (in the *Dīgha* and *Majjh. Nik.*) which mention the Magadhan King Bimbisāra and ten mentioning his successor and deposer Ajātasattu; whilst Pasenadi's son and successor and deposer, the Vidūdabha of the commentaries (Int. § 169, iii), is barely mentioned in the Nikāyas (*Majjh. Nik.*, ii, pp. 110, 127). Cp. Ch. 3 § 1 n.
[5] See Ch. 12 *c* § 4.
[6] Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; see § 7 below. Their duties seem to have been of a clerkly or literate nature rather than clerical or priestly.
[7] Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1].
[8] See Ch. 12 *a* § 3.
[9] Int. § 168.
[10] Ch. 12 *a* § 3 [101].
[11] See § 1 above.
[12] Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [97].
[13] Ch. 18 *e* § 1 n; and Ch. 14 *c*.
[14] *Mahā-yañña*. Int. § 185 (*ritual*); Ch. 7 *a* § 8 (*aggi-hutta*); Ch. 11 *a* § 2 (*yañña*). See Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1] where the details are the same except as regards numbers.

ready for King Pasenadi[1] the Kosalan (*Pasenadi-kosalassa*);[2] five hundred bulls, five hundred steers, five hundred heifers, five hundred goats, and five hundred rams had been led to the post for sacrificing. And those of his people who were termed slaves[3] and servants[4] (*pessā*) and labourers,[5] scared by blows and by fear, with tearful faces lamenting made the preparations for the sacrificing. . . .

§ 5. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 3*), *Sutta 10* (*Bandhana*). (*PTS, i, pp. 76–7.*)

[1] And at that time a great crowd of people had been by [the orders of] King Pasenadi[6] the Kosalan bound, some with ropes, some with fetters, some with chains.[7] . . . [3] The Blessed One learning of this matter at that moment uttered these verses (*gāthāyo*):[8]

Not that is the strong bond,[9] the wise declare,
Of iron, wood, or twisted rope contrived;
But that desire (*apekkhā*)[10] infatuate with treasures,[11] children, wives,[12]
'Tis that is the strong bond, the wise declare. . . .

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 3*), *Sutta 12* (*Pañca-rājāno*). (*PTS, i, pp. 79–80.*)

. . .[13] [2] Now at that time among five Rājas[14] (*rājūnaṃ*), [who had met together] with Pasenadi at their head and who were familiar with, provided with, and surrounded by the five elements of the sense-pleasures (*kāma-guṇehi*)[15] this informal[16] (*antarā*) conversation arose: 'What is the peak (*aggaṃ*)[17] of the sense-pleasures?'[18] [3] Then someone said 'Sights (*rūpā*)[19] are the peak of sense-pleasures'; someone said 'Sounds . . .' someone said 'Scents . . .' someone said 'Tastes . . .' someone said 'Contacts . . .' Whereupon those Rājas were unable to

[1] See § 1 above.
[2] Or, 'the king, the Kosalan commander'. See § 6 [4] below; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [2]–§ 8 [2]; Ch. 14 *d* §§ 2, 4; Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8].
[3] Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3], where the same three terms for menials are used.
[4] Int. § 190.
[5] Ch. 9 *b* § 8.
[6] See § 1 above.
[7] Int. § 190 (*punishment*).
[8] Here as usual in the Sagātha series the prose portion is composed as a setting to the moral verse (Ap. A 2 *a*, Note) at the close, and no great reliance can be placed upon it as strictly contemporary evidence.
[9] *Bandhana*; Ap. D *a* § 9.
[10] Cp. Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [3] n; Ap. D *a* (*upadāna*).
[11] Literally, jewelled earrings; i.e. trinkets.
[12] Cp. Ap. F 1 *c* [162] (*upadhayo*).
[13] The scene is Sāvatthi.
[14] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*]. The word *rāja* means ruler and is by no means definite. The four minor Rājas here may have been the sons of Rājput families such as would consort with the king, whether closely related to him or not; cp. Int. § 159 (*Rājput*). This seems more likely than that they were members of council or governors of subordinate or of neighbouring states. Cp. Ch. 14 *d* § 2 (*noble*).
[15] Ap. D *a* § 9, i, [27].
[16] Ch. 15 *b* § 4 [2].
[17] 'Which of the pleasures of sense is the highest?' *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 106.
[18] Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*kāma*); Ch. 9 *a* § 11; Ap. D *a* § 1 (*kāma*).
[19] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2].

persuade each other. [4] Then King Pasenadi the Kosalan (*Pasenadi-kosalo*)[1] spoke to the Rājas thus: 'Come, my friends (*mārisā*),[2] let us go to where the Blessed One is . . . we will question him on this matter.' . . .[3]

§ 7. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 93* (*Assalāyana-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 147.] . . . At that time some five hundred Brāhmans[4] coming from different countries were dwelling in Sāvatthi[5] for some business.[6] And this [idea] came to those Brāhmans: 'This devotee Gotama[7] teaches that purity[8] belongs to [all] the four castes (*cātu-vaṇṇiṃ*.[9] Who now is able to argue with the devotee Gotama on this subject? . . . Now a young Brāhman (*mānavo*)[10] named Assalāyana[11] is dwelling in Sāvatthi, a youth with shaven head (*vutta-siro*)[12] about sixteen years of age. . . .[13] He is able to argue with the devotee Gotama on this subject.' . . . The young Assalāyana replied to those Brāhmans: 'Indeed sirs (*bho*), the devotee Gotama is a teacher of a [new] system[14] (*dhamma-vādī*) and teachers[15] of systems are hard to argue with. I cannot argue with the devotee Gotama on this subject.' . . .[16]

b. King Pasenadi[17] and Gotama

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, VI, ix.*

[1] The Blessed One journeying gradually came to Sāvatthi. There at Sāvatthi the Blessed One stayed in the Jetavana, the garden of Anāthapiṇḍika.[18] . . . Then Anāthapiṇḍika . . . said: 'May the Blessed One, revered sir, consent to take with me a meal to-morrow together with the mendicant community?' The Blessed One accepted by his silence. . . . When the Blessed One having eaten had withdrawn his hand from the bowl Anāthapiṇḍika seated himself at one side . . . and spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'How, revered sir, must I proceed

[1] See § 4 [1] above.
[2] Int. § 190 (*address*).
[3] The answer is ambiguous but may mean that the limit of pleasure in each case is satiety and surfeit.
[4] Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; and Int. § 185. See § 2 [1] above.
[5] Ch. 14 *c*.
[6] Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1]. It would seem that foreign relations were in the hands of Brāhmans as the literates and graduates of the time.
[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].
[8] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].
[9] Int. § 185.
[10] Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].
[11] Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Viṇ. Piṭ.* The Sutta records his request for admission as a lay-disciple; Ch. 10 *c*, n.
[12] i.e. a priest or novice. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [10] n.
[13] As in Ch. 12 *e* § 13, where the qualifications of a Vedic scholar are enumerated.
[14] Part I, title (*Dhamma*) n.
[15] Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i), *philosophers*.
[16] Assalāyana reluctantly encounters Gotama, admits all his points and is converted. In the discussion the order of mention remains Kshatriya, Brāhman, Vaisya, Sūdra, or Candāla (pp. 152, 157). It is stated that among the Yonas (Greeks) and Kambojas (Ch. 17 *a* [4] n) and their neighbours there are only two interchangeable classes; this dates the Sutta as late (IN 6, *Canon*). A telling argument is that members of all four castes go to hell or to heaven (*sagga-loka*), doubtless direct (Int. § 19, and Ch. 14 *b* § 8 [2] n) for otherwise the argument fails.
[17] Int. § 169 (i). Cp. Ch. 3 § 1 n.
[18] Ch. 10 *a*. See § 4 [1] below.

as to the Jetavan?' [He replied] 'Now mayst thou, householder, present the Jetavana[1] to the mendicant-community, present and future,[2] from the four quarters [of the world].'

§ 2. *Madhurattha-vilāsini,*[3] *Introduction* (*PTS, Buddhavaṃsa, Preface, p. ix*).

... [He spent] the fourteenth [rainy season][4] at Jetavana[5] the great monastery (*Jetavana-mahāvihāre*).

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 3*), *Sutta 1* (*Dahara*). (*PTS, i, p. 68.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . in Anāthapiṇḍika's Garden.[6] [2] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan (*Pasenadi-kosalo*)[7] came to where the Blessed One was . . . and having gone through the current phrases[8] of courtesy seated himself at one side [3] and . . . spoke thus: 'Is the respected (*bhavaṃ*)[9] Gotama not [what is termed] "fully enlightened in the supreme[10] enlightenment[11] (*sammā-sambodhiṃ*)?"' [4] 'If one indeed, Mahārāja,[12] speaking rightly could say of anyone that he is "fully enlightened in the supreme enlightenment" then he might rightly say it of me. . . .'[13] [5] 'Those religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*)[14] indeed, O Gotama, [heads] of Orders, [heads] of companies, instructors of companies, well-known, renowned, founders of sects,[15] well thought of by the multitude, namely Pūrana Kassapa,[16] Makkhali-Gosāla,[17] the Nigaṇṭha[18] Nāṭaputta, Sañjaya Belaṭṭhiputta,[19] Pakudha[20] Kaccāyana, Ajita Kesakambalin[21]—these indeed on being asked by me whether they were "fully enlightened . . ." did not acknowledge [the claim of][22] being fully enlightened in the supreme enlightenment. How then [is this]? The

[1] Ch. 14 c § 2 [1]. The phrase here implies that the Jetavana and Anāthapiṇḍika's Garden and Vihāra are identical (see § 2 below; Ch. 10 *d, fourteenth vassa*). Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 9; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].
[2] See Ch. 10 *a* §§ 3 and 12 [1], from which the present extract is repeated.
[3] Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 10 *d*.
[4] Ch. 8 *c*.
[5] See § 1 above; Ch. 14 *c* § 2.
[6] Ch. 14 *c* § 2; Ch. 14 *d* § 8; Ch. 18 *b* § 5; Ch. 18 *c* § 1; Ch. 18 *f* § 1.
[7] Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2].
[8] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.
[9] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].
[10] *An-uttara*, unsurpassed. Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 3 § 5 [163]; Ch. 4 § 16; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].
[11] Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; and Ch. 5 *b* § 10; also Ch. 4 § 4 [76] (*omniscience*); Ap. B *c* § 1 (2).
[12] Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [100].
[13] Omitting 'I am fully enlightened in the supreme enlightenment'. If this sentence be retained, the preceding sentence it would seem should be omitted.
[14] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [37]; and Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*teachers*).
[15] Ch. 22 *b* § 15; and Ch. 9 *c* (*Titthiyas*).
[16] Int. § 179.
[17] Int. § 183.
[18] Int. § 184.
[19] Int. § 182.
[20] Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [26]. PTS (i, p. 68) reads Kakudha.
[21] Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23]. PTS (i, p. 68) reads *kesakambalo* as suffix.
[22] These terms may apply to the more sceptical thinkers but are scarcely applicable to Nāṭaputta (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92]).

respected Gotama is both young[1] in years (*jātiyā*)[2] and new (*navo*)[3] in renunciation [of the world.]' . . .[4]

§ 4. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 3), Sutta 2 (Purisa). (PTS, i, p. 70.)*

[1] At Sāvatthi[5] in the Garden[6] (*ārāme*). [2] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan[7] came to where the Blessed One was. . . . [3] and seated at one side spoke thus: 'Now how many things (*dhammā*),[8] revered sir, arising within the self (*ajjhattaṃ*)[9] of a man give rise to harm, to sorrow, to unease?'[10] [4] '. . . Greed,[11] Mahārāja . . . hate . . . delusion[12] . . . these three things arising within the self of a man give rise to harm, to sorrow, to unease.

[5] Greed and hatred and delusion, these devour the man of evil mind,
For they himself become, just as the bamboo[13] [fades] into its seed.'[14]

§ 5. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 3), Sutta 3 (Rāja). (PTS, i, p. 71.)*

[1] At Sāvatthi.[15] [2] Seated at one side King Pasenadi the Kosalan[16] spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'Now is there, revered sir, for one who is born (*jātassa*) [any state] other than[17] [that of] decay and death (*jarā-maranā*)?'[18] [3] 'There is not, Mahārāja, [any state] other than [that of] decay and death. [4] Even nobles[19] with great halls[20] . . . [5] even Brāhmans[21] with great halls, and householders[22] with great halls . . . even for them [since they are] born there is no [state] but decay

[1] *Dahara*; Ch. 2 § 5. The text seems to imply that the interview took place in the earliest years of Gotama's ministry; but as the prose is a setting to verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) and is decidedly inapposite a close consideration of its terms may not be necessary.

[2] Literally, in existence; Ch. 1 § 11.

[3] 'A novice', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 94.

[4] Omitting a statement that a prince (*khattiya*), a snake, a fire, and a Bhikkhu though young must not be despised; also verses to the same effect and equally remote from the narrative. Pasenadi begs to be admitted as a lay follower (Ch. 10 *c*, n) in the customary terms attributed to the first lay convert (Ch. 6 *a* § 7) and others. Though King Pasenadi is represented as a zealous follower he is not included in the list of foremost laymen (Ch. 10 *c* [6]).

[5] Ch. 18 *e* § 1 n; and Ch. 14 *c*.

[6] See § 1 above; Ch. 14 *c* § 2. For the abbreviated phrase cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [100].

[7] Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2].

[8] Thoughts, or principles. Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91]; cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6].

[9] Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6].

[10] *A-phāsu-vihāra*; Ch. 15 *a* § 14 (*comfort*); Ch. 20 § 2 (7). For *vihāra* (state) cp. Ap. F 2 *b*, n.

[11] Lobha; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91]. *Lobha* here replaces *rāga*, the first of the three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10).

[12] Regarding the self; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[13] Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].

[14] The verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) and the whole Sutta reappear as the 23rd Sutta of this *Saṃyutta*, but there concern 'worldly things (*lokassa dhammā*)'.

[15] Ch. 14 *c*.

[16] Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2].

[17] *Aññatra*; except.

[18] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3, i (*param maraṇā*); and Ap. E *a* (*transience*). The Sutta appears to be an unqualified denial of rebirth (Int. § 11).

[19] The word is *Khattiya*; Int. § 185 (*three*).

[20] Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17].

[21] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].

[22] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].

and death. [6] Even Bhikkhus who are saints (*arahanto*)[1] in whom [all] taints have been destroyed[2] (*khīṇ-āsavā*), who live the [holy] life,[3] who have done that which ought to be done, having laid down the burden,[4] having gained the real[5] (*anuppatta-sad-atthā*), having destroyed the fetters[6] of individual-existence, being freed by the highest knowledge[7]—even for them this body must by its nature break up[8] and be cast aside.

[7] The chariots[9] of the king wear out though they are gay in hue:
so doth the body move unto its end.
But virtuous thought (*satañ ca dhammo*)[10] comes not unto an end:
the good for ever teach it to the good.'[11]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 3), *Sutta* 7 (*Attha-karaṇa*). (*PTS, i, p.* 74.)

[1] Seated at one side Pasenadi the Kosalan[12] spoke thus to the Blessed One: [2] 'Now I, revered sir, sitting in judgement (*attha-karaṇe*)[13] see even nobles[14] with great halls[15] and Brāhmans[16] with great halls and householders[17] with great halls, wealthy, with much treasure, with great resources, with much gold and silver,[18] with ample property and means, with much treasure and grain,[19] consciously telling lies for the sake of self-gratification, as a means to self-gratification, for the purpose of self-gratification.[20] [At times,] revered sir, I have thought thus: Enough now for me of [sitting here in] judgement (*attha-karaṇe*). Henceforth a [professional] lawyer (*bhadra-mukho*)[21] shall be appointed in [the seat of] judgement.' [3] . . .[22]

[1] Ap. D *c*.
[2] Or, cancelled. Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2]; Ap. A 1 *b* (1); Ap. C *b* § 11 (89). For *āsava* see Ap. D *a* § 7. For *khīna* see Ch. 4 § 17.
[3] *Vusita-vanto*; Ap. C *b* § 10 [1].
[4] *Ohita-bhārā*; Ap. E *b* § 2 [3].
[5] Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10]. 'Who have won their own highest good', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 97.
[6] Ap. D *a* § 8. The Pāli word rendered individual-existence is *bhava* (Ap. D *a* § 1).
[7] *Sammad-aññā*; right understanding, perception. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2] (*aññā*).
[8] Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14] (*dissolvable*).
[9] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx]. These verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) appear also as Dhp. 151.
[10] Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]. 'The virtues of good people', SBE, x (Dhp., p. 42). Contrast Ap. E *c* i § 9 (*suddha-dhammā*) where a less ethical view is taken.
[11] *Santo*; cp. Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*). Thus the unending transmission of thought is the true transmigration (Ap. B *b*, *impersonal Kamma*). 'The good, in sooth, one to another tell this', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 97. 'Thus do the good say to the good', SBE, x.
[12] Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2].
[13] Alternatively *aṭṭa-karaṇe*. 'In the judgement-hall', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 100. Int. § 190 (*legal procedure*); cp. Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3].
[14] Int. § 185 (*three*).
[15] Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17].
[16] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].
[17] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].
[18] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10).
[19] Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3].
[20] Ap. D *a* § 1.
[21] The meaning is conjectural. Literally, auspicious in appearance. The term is used in respectful address as equivalent to *bhante*: Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210]; *Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 53. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 2 (*bhaddaka*). 'My valiant friend', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 100.
[22] Gotama declares that the deliberate falsehoods (Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [4], *musā*) of these nobles, Brāhmans, and householders will bring a long train of harm and sorrow. Verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) to the same effect follow. Cp. Int. §§ 25, 26; Ap. B (*Results of Action*).

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 3), Sutta 19 (Aputtaka i). (PTS, i, p. 89.)*

[1] Sāvatthi series (*Sāvatthi-nidānaṃ*).[1] [2] Now King Pasenadi the Kosalan[2] early in the day (*divā-divassa*)[3] went to where the Blessed One was. . . . The Blessed One spoke to King Pasenadi the Kosalan thus: 'Well (*handa*), whence now comest thou, Mahārāja, [thus] early in the day?' [3] 'As to that (*idha*),[4] revered sir, in Sāvatthi a householder, a great merchant[5] (*seṭṭhi*) has died. He being childless,[6] I come from transferring his property to the inner palace,[7] eight millions in gold[8] not to speak of the silver.[9] And that great merchant's mode of eating was in this wise: he lived on husks (*kanājakaṃ*) helped down by gruel (*bilaṅga-dutiyaṃ*).'[10] . . .[11]

§ 8. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 3), Sutta 17 (Appamāda i). (PTS, i, p. 86.)*

[1] At Sāvatthi.[12] [2] . . . King Pasenadi the Kosalan[13] spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Now is there, revered sir, one principle (*dhammo*)[14] which gains and secures both advantages (*atthe*),[15] worldly[16] advantage and an advantage beyond?'[17] . . . [5] 'Diligence (*appamādo*),[18] Mahārāja, is the one principle which gains and secures both advantages, worldly advantage and an advantage beyond.' . . .[19]

[1] Ch. 14 *c* § 13; Ch. 14 *f* § 11; Ch. 18 *e* §§ 1, 2; and Ch. 11 *c* (*Rājagaha*) n.
[2] Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2].
[3] Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [100].
[4] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].
[5] Int. § 189; Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1].
[6] *A-puttaka*; 'intestate', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 115. Int. § 190 (*legal procedure*).
[7] *Rāj-antepura*; Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4].
[8] *Hirañña*; Ch. 10 *a* § 2.
[9] *Rūpiya*; Ch. 14 *c* § 9; cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10); see Int. § 189 (*money*).
[10] Int. § 190 (*food*).
[11] His miserly dress and vehicle are described. Meanness is censured and generosity praised (cp. Ap. F 1 *a*) in prose and verse (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*); the generous man is said to attain to heaven (*saggaṃ ṭhānaṃ*; Ap. C *a* § 2, 126; and § 8 [2] n below). 'This and the following Sutta together form the *Mayhaka Jātaka* (iii, 299), where a more graphic and detailed account is given. Some of the details are supplied in our *Comy*', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 116, n. The prose is evidently a fanciful setting to the verses which generalize on the moral theme (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 n; and IN 6, *Canon*).
[12] Ch. 14 *c*.
[13] Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2].
[14] Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7].
[15] *Attha* means not only 'gain' or 'profit' but more literally 'the thing' or 'the real' (Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] n).
[16] *Diṭṭha dhammika*; Ap. C *b* § 6.
[17] *Samparāyika*; literally further; probably meaning heavenly (Ch. 13 *d* § 8 [1]). A possible meaning is spiritual and this would be in accord with Buddha's teaching. 'Welfare in . . . life to come', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 111. Personal heavenly reward though renounced by Buddha (Ap. C *b* § 9, *life*) receives considerable stress in Suttas emanating from Sāvatthi (see § 7 [3] n above; Ch. 14 *a* § 7 n; also Ch. 18 *a*). Cp. Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note* (*heaven*).
[18] Ap. C *b* § 11 (21).
[19] The Sutta closes with verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) which are found slightly changed in a different setting in *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 48). IN 6 (*Canon*).

c. Sāvatthi;[1] Topography

(i)

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga VI, iv.*

[8] . . . Anāthapiṇḍika[2] the householder having reached Sāvatthi surveyed every side of Sāvatthi thinking 'Where now should the Blessed One stay, not too far from the town and not too near . . .[3] fit for rest away from men, suited for retirement?' [9] And Anāthapiṇḍika the householder observed the park (*uyyānaṃ*) of Jeta[4] the prince (*kumārassa*), not too far from the town and not too near . . . fit for rest away from men, suited for retirement. . . .[5]

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 14 (Mahā-'padāna-S.).*[6]

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana,[7] Anāthapiṇḍika's[8] garden (*ārāme*),[9] in the Kareri[10] lodge (*Kareri-kuṭikayaṃ*).[11] And many mendicant brothers after their meal having returned from their begging round[12] were sitting assembled together in the Kareri circular meeting-place (*Kareri-mandala-māḷe*)[13] and among them a religious discourse connected with prior existence arose, one saying 'Prior existence (*pubbe-nivāso*)[14] is thus', another

[1] Int. § 138; Ch. 1 § 2 n; Ch. 14 *a* §§ 4, 7; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 4, 5, 8; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [7] n, 4 [1] n, 5 [1] n; Ch. 17 *a* [1] n; Ch. 18 *a*. Of the 34 Suttas of *Dīgha-Nik.* nos. 9, 10, 14, 27, and 30 are located at Sāvatthi.

[2] Ch. 10 *a*. See below § 2.

[3] As in Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [16].

[4] See § 2 [1] below. The stories connected with the donations of the Jetavana at Sāvatthi and the Ambapāli-vana at Vesāli (Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx, 1]) have perhaps the same amount of authenticity and may arise from commentarial expansion of the names (Ch. 12 *c* § 3 n). The Jetavana was situated outside the South gate of the city; Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [476]; and Ch. 13 *b* § 1 n.

[5] The sale of the park by Jeta the prince follows. See Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [9] (*Jeta*); also Ch. 10 *a* § 2.

[6] The *Great Legend Discourse*: Ap. B *c* § 3 [18]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2.

[7] See above § 1 [9]; see below §§ 3, 4, 5, 7, 16, 17. Int. § 138; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 18 *a* § 2; Ap. H 5 [93]. This famous monastery was the scene of more Suttas than can conveniently be enumerated. Besides the sermons of the Buddha discourses were delivered in the monastery by Sāriputta (*Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 189, iii, pp. 109, 135–8, iv, p. 103, v, pp. 70, 346; and Ch. 10 *c*, 2), Moggallāna (*Saṃ. Nik.* iv, pp. 262, 268, v, pp. 318–19; Ch. 10 *c*, 3), Mahā-Kassapa (*Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 214; Ch. 10 *c*, 4), Anuruddha (*Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 294, p. 296; Ch. 10 *c*, 5), Ānanda (*Saṃ. Nik.*, i, p. 188, iii, p. 105, v, p. 362; Ch. 10 *c*, 32), and other disciples, some of these homilies being addressed to gods and spirits (Int. § 35, ii).

[8] See § 1 [8] above.

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 10 [85] n; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 3, 4; see § 10 [1] below.

[10] The name of a tree or plant; see Brethren, p. 363.

[11] Ch. 11 *c* § 29; cp. *vihāra* (Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13] and Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [3]). In [12] the word *vihāra* is used for *kuṭikā*.

[12] Ch. 15 *a* § 9.

[13] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11]; cp. § 10 [1] below (*debate-hall*). 'Buddhaghosa describes this as a nisīdana-sālā, or sitting room, built near the cottage', SBB, iii, p. 4.

[14] Literally, previous residence: Ap. C *a* § 2 (423); Ap. I *b* § 3 [7] (x); and Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*). 'Previous births', SBB, iii, p. 4. This Suttanta does not treat of 're-birth' in the ordinary sense (Int. § 11). The six previous Buddhas whose remarkably similar lives are here sketched must not be confused with Bodhisattas (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*), that is to say previous births of one destined to become in time a Buddha. The predecessors of Buddha were not previous births of Gotama but manifesta-

saying 'It is thus'. [2] And the Blessed One . . . overheard their conversation . . .[1] and addressed them saying. . . . [3] 'Do you wish, mendicant brothers, to hear from me a religious discourse connected with prior existence.' . . .[2]

§ 3. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 30* (*Lakkhana-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana,[3] Anāthapiṇḍika's garden. There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: '. . . There are, mendicant brothers, in a Great Man[4] (*Mahāpurisassa*) these thirty-two marks[5] of greatness with which endowed the Great Man has but two courses [possible]. If he lives the household life (*agāraṃ*)[6] he becomes an emperor (*rājā cakkavattī*),[7] the rightful king of right,[8] [lord] of the four points[9] . . . endowed with the seven jewels. . . .[10] But if he goes forth[11] from the household to the houseless life he becomes a Saint supremely enlightened (*arahaṃ sammā-sambuddho*),[12] manifest[13] in the world (*loke*).' [2]. . . .[14]

§ 4. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 2* (*Sabb-āsava-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 6.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana[15]. . . There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: '. . . [p. 7] I will show you, mendicant brothers, the

tions of the universal power (Ap. G 2 *a*, Unity) which reveals itself in repetitions (Int. § 107, *kappa*). The naming of his predecessors was probably as alien to the mind of Gotama (Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8]) as was the idea of climbing through long ages towards the attainment of a supreme personal reward (Ap. C *b* § 9, *attain*).

[1] Omitting a statement that the Master heard by his divine ear (*dibbāya sota-dhātuyā*); Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n and Int. § 94 (iii). In the similar narrative in Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [3] this miraculous intervention is not considered necessary.

[2] Stories of the six last Buddhas (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*) preceding Gotama follow. Sāvatthi appears to have been or become a centre attuned to the reception of such information (cp. Ch. 18).

[3] See § 2 [1] above.

[4] Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133].

[5] *Lakkhanāni*. Ch. i § 6 [55] n. See below [2] n.

[6] A worldly life, the life of a layman; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11].

[7] Literally, Ruler turning the wheel (of empire); Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10] n; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 1 n.

[8] *Dhammiko dhamma-rājā*; righteous lord of justice, peace, and harmony. See Part I (title) n.

[9] *Cārur-anta*; cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 3 [93].

[10] The Jewels (Ap. A 2 *a*, 4) are enumerated; the wheel, elephant, horse, gem, wife (*itthi*), banker (*gahapati*; Ch. 10 *a* § 1), and adviser (*pari-ṇāyaka*; cp. Int. § 172). Omitting a statement that he will have more than a thousand sons and will rule the earth (Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [35]) up to its ocean boundary.

[11] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].

[12] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.

[13] *Vivatta-cchadda*; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14), *veil*. 'Rolling back the veil from the world', SBB, iv, p. 137. Either the active or the passive sense of the phrase seems allowable.

[14] The marks (see [1] above) are explained in verse (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) and prose. In *Majjh.* 91 (Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133]) a knowledge of the 32 marks of a Great Man is included among the accomplishments of a well-trained Brāhman. The compilers of the present Suttanta seem to have thought that the Sāvatthi Buddhists should not be without such information. IN 6 (*Canon*).

[15] See § 2 [1] above.

way to control all the taints.[1] . . .. Here the uninstructed ordinary[2] man unacquainted with the Noble without knowledge of the Noble Law (*ariya-dhammassa*)[3] . . . [p. 8] thinks incorrectly (*ayoniso*) thus: "Did I exist in time past,[4] or not? What was I in time past? How did I exist in time past? What having been did I become in time past? Shall I exist (*bhavissāmi*)[5] in time to come,[6] or not? What shall I be in time to come? How shall I exist in time to come? What having been shall I be in time to come?" And now as to the present time[7] he is in doubt about himself (*ajjh-attaṃ*)[8] saying: "Do I exist, or not? What am I? How do I exist? Whence has this being (*satto*)[9] come? Whither will it go?"

(To him thus thinking incorrectly one or other of these six views[10] (*diṭṭhīnaṃ*) presents itself as true and firm: "I have a [permanent] self";[11] or "I have not a [permanent] self"; or "By the [permanent] self I perceive the [permanent] self (*attānaṃ*)"; or "By the [permanent] self I perceive the non-[permanent] self (*an-attānaṃ*)"; or "By the non-[permanent] self I perceive the [permanent] self"; or his view is "This my [permanent] self which speaks and feels and experiences the result (*vipākaṃ*)[12] of good and bad deeds [committed] everywhere—this my [permanent] self, lasting (*nicco*),[13] constant, eternal, unchanging, will stand so eternally." This, mendicant brothers, is called theorizing,[14] [and is] a jungle,[15] a maze, a contortion, a writhing, a fetter.)

Bound with the fetters of [such] views the uninstructed ordinary man is not liberated[16] from [the notion of] individual-existence (*jātiyā*),[17] from decay and death, grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair; I say he is not liberated from sorrow. . . .[18] [p. 9] For him

[1] *Āsavā*; Ap. D *a* § 7. These are defined [p. 7] as *kām-āsava, bhav-āsava*, and *avijj-āsava*. The extract below applies more particularly to *bhav-āsava*.

[2] Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6].

[3] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].

[4] *Atītaṃ addhānaṃ*; cp. Ap. B *a* § 3 [3] (*addhunā*). The present passage decisively repudiates the theory of rebirth (Int. § 11). *Addhāna* means a space (of time or place), cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16] n.

[5] Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*bhāva-taṇhā*).

[6] *An-āgataṃ addhānaṃ*, in time not-come.

[7] *Paccuppannaṃ addhānaṃ*, in the period attained. Cp. §§ 5 [189], 6 [4] below.

[8] Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6].

[9] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9].

[10] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1). The passage enclosed in round brackets interrupts the thought and may have been interpolated. The latter portion appears also in *Majjh.* 72 (PTS, i, p. 485) where it is apposite.

[11] *Atthi me attā*; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42].

[12] Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 [23].

[13] Cp. Ap. E *a* i.

[14] *Diṭṭhi-gata*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1). 'Perversion to error', SBB, v, p. 5; 'view-issue', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 39.

[15] This and the following epithets are found in *Majjh.* 72 (Ap. G 1 *a* § 5 [1]).

[16] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[17] Birth (as an ego). The word apparently comprises all the succeeding terms of suffering; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].

[18] The views of the instructed disciple of the Noble (Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7]) are expounded, including, especially, the four Noble Truths (Int. § 24). The difference is between the individualistic or egoistic and the monistic or self-transcending points of view of the world.

who thinks correctly the three fetters[1] are destroyed—the notion of individuality,[2] doubtfulness,[3] and the perversion of duties into [self-interested] ritual.[4] . . .[5]

§ 5. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 131* (*Bhaddekaratta-S.*).

[PTS, iii, p. 187.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana.[6] . . . There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: '. . .[7] [p. 189] How, mendicant brothers, is one not entangled in present[8] phenomena (*dhammesu*)?[9] Now here, mendicant brothers, the instructed disciple of the Noble, acquainted with the Noble Law,[10] well-disciplined in the Noble Law . . . does not regard matter as [the permanent]-self (*attato*),[11] nor the self as material (*rūpavantaṃ*), nor matter as the permanent-self,[12] nor the permanent-self as in matter. He does not regard sensation . . . perception . . . individual-will (*saṃkhāre*) . . . intellect (*viññānaṃ*) as [the permanent]-self . . . nor the permanent-self as in [sensation, perception, will or] intellect. Thus he is not entangled in present phenomena.

The past do not pursue, the future do not seek;
That which is past is gone, the future unattained.

Who in the present (*paccupannaṃ*) everywhere perceives the Law (*dhammaṃ*)[13]
Seeing let him pursue the Unmoved the Unshaken.'[14] . . .[15]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 22), Sutta 21* (*Rādha*). (*PTS, iii, pp. 79–80.*)

[1] Sāvatthi, in the Garden[16] (*ārāme*). . . . [3] Seated at one side the venerable Rādha[17] spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'How, revered sir, should one understand, how should one regard [things], so that both in this body with the intellect[18] and also in all external appearances[19] there are for him no impulses to egoism,[20] selfishness, and self-conceit?'

[1] *Saṃyojanāni*; Ap. D *a* § 8. [2] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [3], *sakkāya-diṭṭhi*.
[3] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [3], *vicikicchā*. Cp. *katham-kathā*, questioning (Ch. 6 *a* § 7 n).
[4] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [3], *sīla-bbata-parāmāsa*.
[5] Seven ways of destroying the Āsavas are explained in all.
[6] See § 2 [1] above.
[7] The views of the ordinary man on rebirth (Int. § 4) in the past and in the future and on the nature of the Soul in the present are stated.
[8] See § 4 [8] above.
[9] Ch. 4 § 18 [3]. 'Swept away by present states of consciousness', SBB, vi, p. 262.
[10] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19]. [11] Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [3]; and Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42].
[12] See Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].
[13] The fundamental Law, the basis. Part I (title) n; cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] n (*attha*).
[14] '*A-saṃhīraṃ a-saṃkuppaṃ*'. Cp. *amata* (Ap. G 2 *a* § 6); also Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*pariyosāna*). 'Eternal Changelessness', SBB, vi, p. 261.
[15] A similar verse follows naming such an one as Blest and Sage. The argument of the verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) is made less clear in the prose expansion; IN 6 (*Canon*). [16] Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [1].
[17] Ch. 10 *c* (46). [18] Ap. E *c* i § 7 [3].
[19] The word is *nimitta*; Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 7 (*spheres*).
[20] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).

[4–8] 'When one regards all material form whatsoever, Rādha, . . . all sensation . . . all perception . . . all individual-will[1] . . . all intellect (*viññānaṃ*) whatsoever, whether past, future, or present[2] . . .[3] and thinks "This is not mine,[4] I am not this, this is not my permanent self", then one regards it with right insight[5] as it really is'. . . .[6]

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 35), Sutta 1 (Anicca i: ajjhatta).*[7] *(PTS, iv, p. 1.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana.[8] . . . [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: '. . . [3] The eye,[9] mendicant brothers, is impermanent[10] (*a-niccaṃ*); that which is impermanent is suffering; that which is suffering is without permanent-self[11] (*an-attā*); that which is without permanent-self is to be regarded with right insight[12] as it really is thus: "This is not mine,[13] I am not this, this is not my permanent-self." [4–8] The ear . . . nose . . . tongue . . . body . . . the mind (*mano*)[14] should be regarded thus. . . . [9] Regarding them thus an instructed disciple of the Noble [Law][15] becomes indifferent[16] to the eye, and ear, and nose, and tongue, and body, and mind. Becoming indifferent he becomes free from desire; through non-desire[17] he is liberated;[18] when he is liberated there arises in him the knowledge "I am liberated". He knows: "Ended is individual-existence (*jāti*);[19] lived is the holy-life; done is what should be done; there is nothing [individual] beyond this state (*n'āparaṃ itthattāya*)." '[20]

1 Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

2 See § 4 [8] above.

3 As in Ap. E *c* i § 7 [8], where the same discourse is delivered to Rāhula; the two discourses may have been similar in substance and edited into identity (IN 6, *Canon*). See Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [44].

4 i.e. is not a lasting possession. This and the next following phrases are often repeated; Ch. 5 c § 2 [42].

5 Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]. See below §§ 7 [3], 9 [1].

6 On hearing this discourse upon selflessness Rādha becomes 'yet another of the Saints (*arahataṃ*)'; Ap. D *c*; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 10 n; also Ch. 7 *a* § 16; Ch. 7 *b* § 5 n. Rebirth is not mentioned but is inferentially repudiated; cp. IN 2 *a* (*Conversion Sermons*).

7 'On the transient: personal.' Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 7 (*inner*).

8 See § 2 [1] above.

9 Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]. From the parallelism of the passages it would appear that the Aggregates or Khandhas (Ch. 5 *c*) are equivalent in general to the five physical senses and the mind.

10 Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42].

11 Ap. E *c* i. 'Void of the self', *Kindred Sayings*, iv, p. 2.

12 Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]. See § 6 [4] above.

13 Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42].

14 Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7]; and Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*six seats*) n. See Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4].

15 See Ch. 5 *c* § 4; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4]; also Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7]; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].

16 Ch. 5 *c* § 4; cp. § 9 (*treasures*) below.

17 Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii) n.

18 Ap. D *a* § 6.

19 More justly, the sense of egoistical isolation is lost. '*Rebirth is destroyed*', *Kindred Sayings*, iv, p. 2. Ch. 4 § 16.

20 This climax here is reached through indifference to the five senses and the mind; elsewhere it is attained by the destruction of the Taints (Ch. 4 § 17), by indifference to the Khandhas (Ch. 5 *c* § 5), and by indifference to the organs of Sense and the mind and their objects (Ch. 7 *a* § 6 [4]). It seems clear that the culmination is reached not by the cessation of this personal existence at long last but by its disappearance when viewed with insight.

§ 8. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta (the Fours), Sutta 21. (PTS, ii, p. 20.)*

[1] . . .[1]

[2] The All-enlightened Ones long past,
The All-enlightened Ones to come,
The All-enlightened One who now
The sorrows of the many hath dispelled,
All lived, do live, will live,
Honouring true-law:[2] such is the Buddhas'[3] rule
Therefore should he who loves the soul,[4] seeking the [Goal] Supreme,[5]
Honour true-law, keeping the Buddhas' Word.

§ 9. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Sattaka-nipāta (the Sevens), Sutta 7. (PTS, iv, p. 6.)*

[1] . . .[6] Ugga,[7] the king's chief minister,[8] came to where the Blessed One was . . . and spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'It is surprising, it is strange,[9] revered sir, how wealthy, how rich, how opulent is this Migāra[10] Rohaneyya.' 'How wealthy then, Ugga, how rich, how opulent, is Migāra Rohaneyya?' '[To the amount of] ten millions in gold,[11] revered sir, not to speak of the silver.'[12] 'And is this riches (*dhanaṃ*), Ugga? I do not say that it is not; yet this treasure is exposed to fire, water, rulers (*rājūhi*),[13] thieves, enemies, or heirs. But there are seven treasures (*dhanāni*)[14] which are not exposed to fire, water, rulers, thieves, enemies, or heirs. . . . The treasure of belief,[15]

[1] Gotama informs the disciples in the Jetavana that after his enlightenment he decided to serve under no teacher save the Dhamma (cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 4 [8]). Brahmā Sahampati (Int. § 93, ii) commends the choice in prose and verse (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). The story is taken from *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 140.

[2] *Saddhamma*; Ap. A 1 *b* (9), (16). Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* (*Dhamma*).

[3] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[4] *Atta-kāma*, or *attha-kāma*. 'He to whom the self is dear', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 21; 'whoso fain is for his good', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 176. Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [8]; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42] (*self*).

[5] Literally, greatness; Pāli *mahantaṃ*, or *mahattaṃ*. 'The great Self', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 22. Cp. Int. § 35, i (*Paramātman*); Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*pariyosāna*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 6 (*amata*); and Ch. 5 § 4 [18] (*samādhi*).

[6] The scene is not mentioned, but seems to have been at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana.

[7] Cp. the Uggas of Vesāli and Hatthigāma; Ch. 10 *c* (67) n.

[8] *Mahāmatta*; Int. § 172. '*Comy*. to rājah Pasenadi of Kosala', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 4.

[9] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

[10] '*Comy*. grandson of Rohaṇa Chetty', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 5. His relationship to Migāra the father-in-law of Visākhā may be merely commentarial; Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [162].

[11] Ch. 10 *a* § 2. If this figure be accepted as an estimate in copper *kahāpaṇa* currency (Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163] n) and the *kahāpaṇa* be valued at an anna or about one penny, this and similar figures become credible. On this basis a gold piece worth 1,000 ks. would be equivalent approximately to four pounds sterling.

[12] Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3].

[13] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*].

[14] Ch. 7 *b* § 4. These virtues (Ap. F 2, *Note*) are plainly deemed to need no extraneous reward. Cp. Int. § 111 (*indifferent*); see above § 7 [9] (*indifferent*).

[15] Or faith; Ch. 8 *l* § 2.

the treasures of duty,[1] of meekness, of conscience, of learning, of renunciation, and of insight.'[2] . . .[3]

(ii)

§ 10. *Dīgha-Nikāya*, *Sutta 9* (*Poṭṭapāda-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . in Anāthapiṇḍika's Garden.[4] At that time Poṭṭhapāda[5] the Wanderer (*paribbājako*)[6] was dwelling at the public-debate-hall[7] (*samaya-ppavādake*) bordered by Tindūka-trees,[8] [known as] the Lone-Hall[9] (*eka-sālake*) in [Queen] Mallikā's[10] Garden,[11] together with a great party of Wanderers three hundred in number.[12] [2] And the Blessed One in the forenoon[13] . . . entered Sāvatthi for alms. . . .[14] The Blessed One came to . . . the Lone-Hall in Mallika's Garden. [3] At that time Poṭṭhapāda the Wanderer was sitting with the great party of Wanderers. . . .[15] [4] And Poṭṭhapāda the Wanderer . . . quieted the party . . . [5] and spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Let the Blessed One, revered sir, come; welcome to the Blessed One. . . .[16] Let the Blessed One be seated; this is the chief (*paññatam*)[17] seat.' The Blessed One sat down on the chief seat and Poṭṭhapāda the Wanderer choosing some lower[18] seat sat down at one side . . .[19] [6] and said to the Blessed One: 'On previous occasions repeatedly, revered sir, among religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇānaṃ*)[20] of various sects (*nānā-titthiyānaṃ*)[21] sitting

1 *Sīla*; Ap. F 2 *a* (122).
2 *Paññā*. Ap. G 1 *b* § 3; see § 6 [4] above.
3 Omitting verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) of which the prose is an expansion.
4 See § 2 above.
5 Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas. He is converted [54] and becomes a lay disciple; Ch. 10 *c*, n.
6 Int. § 126.
7 Cp. § 2 [1] above (*mandala-māḷa*), and [6] below; also Int. §§ 141, 171. Such chambers for public discussion are evidence that religious orthodoxy and priestly domination (Int. § 185, *Brāhmans*) had not been established in the Middle-land.
8 Ch. 11 *c* § 24 (7).
9 'Known by the name of "The Hall"', SBB, ii, p. 244; 'the original (Discussion-) Hall', SBB, vi, p. 13.
10 Int. §§ 126, 142. Mallikā devī, wife of King Pasenadi (Int. § 169, i) appears also in *Saṃ. Nik.* (Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [2]), and *Majjh.* 87 (Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110]), where mention is made also of his daughter Vajīrī, another wife Vāsabhā, and of Vidūdabha (Int. § 169, iii) his general (*senāpati*; Int. § 175) whom he declared to be dear to him. See Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [126] n, also *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 86.
11 *Ārāma*; Ch. 7 *a* § 10. The garden and hall are the stage for a similar scene in *Majjh.* 78.
12 Int. § 121 n.
13 Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
14 As in the accounts of visits to Sakuladāyin (Ch. 11 *c* § 9) and others.
15 As in Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513] (*vulgar talk*). The two narratives continue on similar lines.
16 As in Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2]; Ch. 23 *a* [7].
17 Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481].
18 Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482].
19 Buddha asks what is the subject under discussion and his host replies that it may be postponed.
20 Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
21 Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; also Ch. 9 *c* (*Titthiyas*). At *Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 398 the phrase is *nānatitthiyā samaṇabrāhmaṇā-paribbājakā*, thus making the three terms equivalent; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*teachers*) n.

assembled together in the discussion-hall[1] talk has arisen about the cessation of perception.[2] . . . How, revered sir, does the cessation of perception come about?'. . . .[3]

§ 11. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sotapatti-sayutta* (*Saṃ*. 55), *Sutta 11* (*Sahassa*). (*PTS*, *v*, *p*. *360*.)

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Sāvatthi in the Royal Garden (*rājak-ārāme*).[4] [2] And an assemblage of a thousand mendicant-sisters[5] came to where the Blessed One was. Having drawn near and saluted[6] (*abhivādetva*) the Blessed One they stood[7] at one side. [3] The Blessed One addressed the mendicant-sisters standing there. . . .[8]

§ 12. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Anuruddha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ*. 52), *Sutta 10* (*Bālha-gilāya*). (*PTS*, *v*, *p*. *302*.)

[1] At one time the venerable Anuruddha[9] was staying at Sāvatthi in the Andha-vana,[10] ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted.[11] [2] And many mendicant brothers came to where the venerable Anuruddha was and . . . said: 'In what state[12] (*vihārena*) does the venerable Anuruddha live that when painful bodily feelings arise they do not retain mastery[13] over his mind (*cittaṃ*)?' 'Because, friends, I live with mind well fixed on the four attentions[14] (*sati-paṭṭhānesu*), painful

[1] *Kutūhala-sālā*. This term and the accompanying phrases appear also with slight variations at *Majjh. Nik*. ii, p. 2, and *Saṃ. Nik*. iv, p. 398. Cp. [1] above.

[2] *Abhi-saññā-nirodha*. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] (*non-perception*); and Ap. E *a* ii § 2 (*saññā*). 'Trance', SBB, ii, p. 246.

[3] The ensuing discourse is like other Suttantas (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*) composite and highly complex, and includes such matters as the coming of a Buddha (as in *Dīgha* 2 [40–2]; see Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1] n), the three treatises on Duty (as in *Dīgha* 1, I [8–27], and *Dīgha* 2 [43–62]; see Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*), the guarding of the five physical senses and the mind (as in *Dīgha* 2 [64–6]), the five Obstacles (*nīvaranā*; as in *Dīgha* 2 [67–74]; see Ap. D *a* § 9, iv), the four Jhānas (as in *Dīgha* 2 [75–81]; see Ap. I *a*), the 4 Attainments (*samāpattiyo*; Ch. 3 § 4 [66]), the nature of the Self (*attan*; [21–4]; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]), the Unanswered Questions (Ap. G 1 *a*, ii), the Four Truths ([29–30]; Ap. G 1 *a*, i), and the abandoning of selfhood ([40–5]; cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]).

[4] Int. § 142; Ch. 7 *a* § 10.

[5] Ch. 12 *b*. The exaggerated number (Int. § 121 n) as well as the use of the title Buddha in [4] seems to indicate the comparative lateness of the Sutta; IN 6 (*Canon*); and Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1] n.

[6] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i).

[7] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].

[8] The discourse deals with the four principles with which a stream-attainer (*sota-panna*; Ap. D *c* § 3 [6]) is endowed; see Ap. H 1 § 6 [5] n. Once-returners and never-returners are not mentioned.

[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]. *Saṃ*. 52 comprising 24 Suttas is called after his name.

[10] Dark Wood or Blind-man's Wood. Int. § 142; Ch. 14 *e* § 3 n; Ap. C *b* § 10 [1] n. See also *Majjh*. 147 where Buddha walks with Rāhula (Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]) in the wood and discourses to him there on the five physical senses and the mind (Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2] *eye*) and their processes; *Majjh*. 23 where the venerable Kumāra-Kassapa (Ch. 10 *c*, 30) meets a Deva (IN 8 *a*); *Saṃ. Nik*. i, pp. 128, 129, where certain nuns (Ch. 12 *b*) encounter Māra (Ap. G 2 *b*); *Aṅg. Nik*. v, p. 9; also *Vin. Piṭ*. i, p. 298, iii, pp. 38, 64, 208.

[11] Ch. 11 *c* § 6.

[12] Or, way; cp. Ap. F 2 *b*, n.

[13] 'Make no impression on his mind', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 268. Cp. Int. § 109.

[14] 'Arisings of mindfulness', *Kindred Sayings*, Ch. 9 *a*.

bodily feelings when they arise do not retain mastery over my mind. On what four? [3] As to this, friends, I live as regards the body, contemplating the body . . . as regards [its] sensations, contemplating sensations . . . as regards the mind, contemplating the mind, . . . as regards [its] objects[1] (*dhammesu*), contemplating objects, strenuous, comprehending, mindful, having put away in this world covetousness and lament.

§ 13. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Bhikkhunī-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 5), *Sutta 3* (*Gotamī*). (*PTS, i, p. 129.*)

[1] Sāvatthi series.[2] Now the mendicant sister[3] Kisā-Gotamī[4] in the forenoon having robed herself and assumed bowl and outer robe entered Sāvatthi for alms. [2] Having gone round Sāvatthi begging she after her meal[5] returned from her begging-round and went to the Andha-vana[6] for the [noon] day-rest.[7] Having plunged into the wood she sat down for rest at the foot of a certain tree. [3] And Māra[8] the Evil One . . . approaching addressed her. . . .[9] [6] Then the mendicant sister Kisā-Gotamī answered Māra the Evil One in verses:[10]

'Forever childless I: men are but far away.
I sorrow not, nor weep: nor do I fear thee, friend (*āvuso*).
Sped is all worldly-joy (*nandi*): pierced is the outer dark.[11]
Defeating Death's[12] array I bide here without stain.'

§ 14. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Aṇuruddha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 52), *Sutta 3* (*Sutanu*). (*PTS, v, p. 297.*)

[1] At one time the venerable Anuruddha[13] was staying at Sāvatthi on the bank of the Sutanu.[14] [2] And many mendicant brothers came to where the venerable Anuruddha was [3] . . . and said: 'By the exercise and practice[15] of what ideas (*dhammānaṃ*)[16] has the venerable Anuruddha attained to the great higher knowledge (*mah-ābhiññā-taṃ*)?'[17] [4] 'By the exercise and practice of the four attentions[18] (*satipaṭṭhānānaṃ*), friends, I have attained to the great higher knowledge. Of what four? . . . I live . . . contemplating the body . . . [its]

[1] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 (*phenomena*). 'Mind-states', *Kindred Sayings*. See § 14 [4] below. All individual things are derivative and transitory.
[2] Ch. 14 *b* § 7.
[3] Ch. 12 *b*.
[4] Ch. 2 § 2. Her name may be authentic; the stories about her are perhaps due to explanatory expansion.
[5] Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7].
[6] Int. § 142.
[7] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].
[8] Ap. G 2 *b*.
[9] Omitting Māra's verses.
[10] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.
[11] *Tamo-kkhandha*, the mass of ignorance. Cp. *avijjā* (Ap. D *b*).
[12] *Maccu* (Death) here is Māra; Ap. D *b* § 4.
[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].
[14] *Sutanu-tīre*; Int. § 142. Not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ*.
[15] Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2]; see § 18 [2] below.
[16] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].
[17] Cp. Ap. I *b* § 3 (*abhiññā*). 'Great supernormal power', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 264. The doctrine of the assimilation of the transient individual to the eternal source (Ap. C *b*, n) from which all things arise is here perhaps passing into the notion of the power of the individual to dominate nature.
[18] Ch. 9 *a*.

sensations . . . the mind . . . and [its] objects,[1] strenuous, comprehending, mindful, having put away in this world covetousness and lament.' . . .[2]

§ 15. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Anuruddha-saṃyutta (Sam. 52), Sutta 8 (Salaḷāgāra). (PTS, v, p. 300.)*

[1] . . . The venerable Anuruddha[3] stayed at Sāvatthi in the Salaḷa-house (*Salaḷ-āgāre*).[4] [2] There the venerable Anuruddha instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[5]

§ 16. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Sattaka-nipāta (the Sevens), Sutta 50. (PTS, iv, p. 91.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana.[6] . . . And the Blessed One in the forenoon[7] . . . went to the dwelling of Anāthapiṇḍika[8] the householder . . . and sat down on the seat prepared. Now at that time people in Anāthapiṇḍika the householder's dwelling were making a great noise and uproar. And Anāthapiṇḍika the householder came to the Blessed One . . . and sat at one side . . . and the Blessed One said: 'Why, householder, are people in thy dwelling making a great noise and uproar? One might think they were fisherfolk[9] with a haul of fish.' 'That is Sujātā, revered sir, the daughter-in-law of the house;[10] she is rich, coming from a rich family,[11] and heeds not her mother-in-law, heeds not her father-in-law, and heeds not her husband.' . . .[12]

§ 17. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VIII, xv.*

[1] . . .[13] The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana.[14] . . . And Visākhā[15] Migāra's mother came to where the Blessed One was and . . . having greeted[16] (*abhivādetva*) the Blessed One she

[1] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 (*phenomena*). See § 12 [3] above.

[2] He claims also power to recognize low, middle, and pre-eminent ideas or states (*dhammā*) as such. Cp. Ap. I *b* § 3 (*mind*); also Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13] ((*dhammā*).

[3] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[4] The *salaḷa* was a fragrant tree. 'At Sāl-tree Hut', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 266. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [4] (*bhus-āgāra*); and Ch. 12 *c* § 3 (*Kūt-āgāra*).

[5] He informs them that it is as impossible for rulers to deflect a Bhikkhu who cultivates the four attentions (Ch. 9 *a*, *satipaṭṭhāna*) as for a crowd of folk with spades and baskets to make the Ganges (Int. § 121) flow west instead of east.

[6] See § 2 [1] above.

[7] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[8] Ch. 10 *a*. In Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [258] Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 16) visits the great householder on his deathbed.

[9] Int. § 189 (*occupations*).

[10] *Ghara-suṇhā*; Int. § 190 (*family*).

[11] *Aḍḍha-kulā*; cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (134).

[12] Buddha calls Sujātā who is instructed in verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) which plainly gave rise to the prose setting.

[13] Buddha journeys by stages from Benāres (Ch. 15 *a* § 12 [xv, 1]).

[14] See § 2 [1] above.

[15] Int. § 140; Ch. 10 *c* (72); see below § 18 (*Migāra's mother*). For Visākhā's great gift of the Eastern Garden see Ch. 18 *b*.

[16] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].

sat down[1] at one side. . . .[2] [6] Seated at one side Visākhā, Migāra's mother, spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'I ask eight boons,[3] revered sir, of the Blessed One. . . . [7] I wish, revered sir, throughout my life[4] (i) to give to the assembly (*saṃghassa*) dress for the rainy weather,[5] (ii) to give food for those arriving, (iii) to give food for those departing, (iv) to give food for the sick, (v) to give food for the attendants[6] on the sick, (vi) to give medicine[7] for the sick, (vii) to give a regular supply of milk-rice,[8] (viii) to give to the assembly of Nuns (*Bhikkhunī-saṃghassa*)[9] dress for bathing.[10] . . . [11] As to this, revered sir, the mendicant sisters bathe in the river Aciravatī[11] along with courtesans[12] (*vesiyāhi*) at the same landing-stage[13] naked. . . . Impure, revered sir, is nakedness.'[14] . . .

§ 18. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Indriya-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 48*), *Sutta 45* (*Pubbārāma i*). (*PTS, v, p. 222.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Garden (*Pubbārāme*)[15] in the storied house (*pāsāde*)[16] of Migāra's mother.[17] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'Through the exercise and practice[18] of what moral faculties (*indriyānaṃ*),[19] mendicant brothers, does a mendicant brother in whom the taints have been destroyed[20] explain [his attainment of] perception (*aññaṃ*),[21] which is [announced in the words]: "I know: Ended is individual existence, lived is the holy-life, done is what should be done, there is nothing [individual] beyond this state (*n'āparaṃ itthattāyā-ti*)?"'[22] 'Our opinions (*dhammā*),[23] revered sir, are rooted in the Blessed One. . . .'[24] [3] 'By the exercise and practice of a

[1] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].

[2] Omitting Visākhā's invitation to the Buddha and the brethren for the morrow's meal. Omitting also a universal rain-storm during the night and Visākhā's messenger's difficulties on the following morning; also the miraculous passage of the Buddha and the monks through the air (Int. § 94, iii) to the feast. After the meal Visākhā makes her request.

[3] *Varāni*; Int. § 113.

[4] Ch. 6 *a* § 7 [10].

[5] *Vassika-sāṭika*; Ch. 8 *j*.

[6] *Upaṭṭhākā*; Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1] (*ministering*).

[7] *Bhesajja*; Ch. 8 *j*.

[8] *Yāgu*; Ch. 8 *j* (*food*).

[9] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iv).

[10] *Udaka-sāṭika*; Ch. 8 *j*.

[11] An affluent of the Gānges (Int. § 121 n). Int. § 138 n; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 14 *d* § 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 2. Also *Mahā-vagga*, v. ix. 2; *Dīgha-Nik.* i, p. 235. See Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [1] n.

[12] Int. § 190.

[13] *Tittha*; Ch. 20 § 11 [32].

[14] Ch. 8 *j* § 4.

[15] Int. § 140; Ch. 18 *b*. For *ārāma* see Ch. 7 *a* § 10 n.

[16] Ch. 2 § 2.

[17] See above, § 17 [1] (*Visākhā*).

[18] Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2]. See § 14 [3] above; § 19 [3] below.

[19] Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4. Contrast the wider application of the word in Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [3].

[20] *Khīn-āsava*; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6].

[21] Perception (of the *amata* or immortal): Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 7 *a* § 21. See Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]; cp. Ap. C *a* § 3; also Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*aññāta*); Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]; and IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

[22] Ch. 4 § 17. The moral faculties enumerated below would seem better calculated to lead to the transcendence of Egoism than to the evasion of rebirth.

[23] Ideas, thoughts; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7].

[24] The monks ask Buddha to explain.

single [comprehensive] moral-faculty, mendicant brothers. . . . Of what single moral-faculty? [4] In a disciple of the noble [Law][1] who has insight[2] there is established faith[3] in consequence thereof, energy in consequence thereof, self-knowledge (*sati*) in consequence thereof, self-transcendence (*samādhi*)[4] in consequence thereof.' . . .[5]

§ 19. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Indriya-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 48*), *Sutta 44* (*Pubbakoṭṭhaka*). (*PTS, v, p. 220*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Enclosure (*Pubba-koṭṭhake*).[6] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the venerable Sāriputta[7] saying: [3] 'Dost thou believe, Sāriputta, that the moral-faculty[8] of faith[9] . . . the moral-faculty of energy . . . of self-knowledge . . . of self-transcendence . . . the moral-faculty of insight, when exercised and practised, immerses [one] in the deathless, leads to the deathless, finds fulfilment in the deathless?'[10] [4] '. . . Those, revered sir, by whom this is not known, not seen,[11] not felt, not realized,[12] not touched through insight,[13] they must proceed by faith in others as to this. . . . But I, revered sir, know it . . . and am free from doubt[14] and without uncertainty (*ni-bbicikiccho*)[15] as to this. . . .'

d. Minor Townships northward and eastward of Sāvatthi

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta* (*the Fours*), *Sutta 36*. (*PTS, ii, p. 37*.)

[1] At one time the Blessed One journeyed on the road[16] between Ukkaṭṭhā[17] and Setabbyā.[18] And the Brāhman Doṇa[19] also was journeying on the road between Ukkaṭṭhā and Setabbyā. And the

[1] *Ariya-sāvaka*; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].
[2] *Paññā*, insight into the transcience of individuality; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]. See Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [5].
[3] *Saddhā*, Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]; the religious sense of immortal unity (*amata*, Ch. 5 *a* § 10), opposed to the habit of doubt (*vi-cikicchā*, Ap. D *a* § 8, ii). See § 19 [3] below.
[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. In Sutta 46 of this series the word *vimutti* (*ariyā vimutti*, Aryan liberation, Ap. D *a* § 6) takes the place of *samādhi*.
[5] The situation of this spot can scarcely be determined (Int. § 140). The word *koṭṭhaka* indicates an enclosure or space, usually a room, but possibly a shed or an enclosed space including a pool for bathing. This Eastern Enclosure may have been either near or in the Eastern Garden, outside the wall near the eastern gate of the city. See *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 160 (Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [161]) and *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 345; cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [10]. 'Eastern Gatehouse', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 195; 'Eastern bath', SBB, v, p. 113; 'bathing-place', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 243.
[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 16.
[7] Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.
[8] See § 18 [4] above.
[9] See § 18 [2] above.
[10] Ap. G 2 *a* § 6. For the adj. *amata-pariyosāna* see Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]; cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].
[11] *A-diṭṭha*; cp. Ch. 4 § 16.
[12] *A-sacchikata*; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].
[13] Ap. F 2 *a* (132).
[14] *Ni-kkaṅkha*; cp. Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (ii); and Ch. 6 *a* § 7 (*doubt*).
[15] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).
[16] *Addhāna-magga*; Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16].
[17] See below, § 3.
[18] See below, § 2.
[19] Ch. 22 *c* § 10 n.

(Brāhman Doṇa saw in the footsteps of the Blessed One the wheels *cakkāni*).[1] . . .[2]

§ 2. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 23* (*Pāyāsi-S.*).

[1] . . . The venerable Kumāra-Kassapa[3] journeying among the Kosalans (*Kosalesu*)[4] together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers . . .[5] came to where Setavyā[6] a [walled] town (*nagaraṃ*)[7] of the Kosalans was. And there at Setavyā the venerable Kumāra-Kassapa stayed to the north of Setavyā in the Simsapā-tree Grove (*Simsapāvane*).[8] At that time Pāyāsi, a [feudal] noble,[9] occupied Setavyā . . . a royal demesne given by King Pasenadi the Kosalan (*Pasenadi-Kosalena*),[10] a royal grant, a sacred gift (*brahma-deyyaṃ*).[11] . . .[12]

§ 3. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta i* (*Mūla-pariyāya-S.*).[13]

[PTS, p. 1.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Ukkaṭṭhā[14] (*Ukkaṭṭhayaṃ*) in the Subhaga Grove (*Subhaga-vane*)[15] at the foot of the Great Sāl-tree.[16] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: '. . . I will set forth for you, mendicant brothers, a discourse on the basis of all phenomena'.[17] . . .[18]

§ 4. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 3* (*Ambaṭṭha-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans (*Kosalesu*)[19] together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers . . .[20] came to

[1] Ch. 7 *a* § 7 n.

[2] Doṇa concludes that these signs indicate a *deva* (Ch. 3 § 1), *gandhabba* (Ap. B *c* § 4 [4]), or *yakkha* (Int. § 93, vii).

[3] Young Kassapa; Ch. 10 *c* (30). Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92]. He is later called Kassapa (*bho Kassapa*).

[4] Int. § 149.

[5] Omitting the conventional number 500; Int. § 121.

[6] Int. § 149 (*a*); see § 1 above. Alternatively Setavyaṃ (neu.) or Setabyā. The town was on the regular route between Sāvatthi and Kapilavatthu; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [35] n.

[7] Ch. 20 § 11 [26]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).

[8] Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 8.

[9] *Rājañña*; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*] (*rājā*); Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2].

[10] Ch. 14 *a* § 4.

[11] i.e. free of taxes; Ch. 11 *d* § 10. 'A full gift', SBB, ii, p. 108 n.

[12] Pāyāsi heretically denies a life after death (Int. § 19), and Kumāra-Kassapa refutes him. He is reborn in the realm of the Four Great Kings (Int. § 70) where he is seen by the venerable Gavampati who frequents this region during his noonday rest.

[13] Discourse on the Basis (*Mūla*).

[14] See § 1 above; § 4 below; Int. § 149 (*a*); Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9] n. Also *Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 50.

[15] Happy or Pleasant Grove; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200].

[16] *Sāla-rāja*; Int. § 133.

[17] *Sabba-dhamma-mūla-pariyāya*. 'How all states of consciousness originate', SBB, v, p. 1. For *dhamma* cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]. *Pariyāya*, course, process, or discourse; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 7 (*method*); Ch. 14 *f* § 13 [5].

[18] The categories specified are mostly unreal, namely, besides the four elements and living beings, spirits (*devā*), Pajāpati, Brahmā (Int. § 69), the Abhassarā (shining gods), Subhakiṇṇā (radiant gods, cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1, 29), Vehapphalā and Abhibhū (conquerors; cp. Int. § 70, *sphere*), the realms of infinite space, infinite consciousness, nothingness, and neither perception nor non-perception (Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]), the seen, heard, thought and known, Oneness, multiplicity, the Whole (*sabbaṃ*), and nibbāna (Ap. C *b* § 1). The list is a late amalgam; IN 6 (*Canon*). Cp. Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149] n.

[19] Int. § 149.

[20] Omitting the conventional number 500; Int. § 121.

where [there was] a Brāhman village[1] of the Kosalans called Icchānankala[2] (*Icchānankalaṃ*); and there at Icchānankala the Blessed One stayed in the Icchānankala woodland.[3] Now at that time the Brāhman[4] Pokkharasādi[5] occupied Ukkaṭṭhā[6] . . . a royal demesne given by King Pasenadi[7] the Kosalan, a royal grant, a sacred gift[8] (*brahmadeyyaṃ*). [2] . . .[9]

§ 5. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 89* (*Dhammacetiya-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 118.] . . . King Pasenadi[10] the Kosalan arrived at Nangaraka[11] on some business. . . . Then King Pasenadi the Kosalan addressed Dīgha Kārāyana[12] saying: '. . . Where then, friend Kārāyana, is the Blessed One now staying?' [p. 119] 'There is, Mahārāja, a township of the Sakyas[13] called Medalumpa;[14] there the Blessed One is now staying. . . .' 'How far then, friend Kārāyana, from Nangaraka is Medalumpa? . . .' 'Not far, Mahārāja, three leagues;[15] it is possible to go in what remains of the day.' . . .[16]

§ 6. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 13* (*Tevijja-S.*).[17]

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans (*Kosalesu*) . . . came to where [there was] a Brāhman-village[18] of the Kosalans called Manasākata[19] (*Manasākataṃ*). And there at Manasākata the Blessed One stayed on the bank of the river Aciravati[20] to the north of Manasākata in a mango-grove. [2] At that time many very well-known and much-attended[21] Brāhmans[22] were visiting Manasākata, namely Caṇki . . . Pokkharasāti[23] . . . the Tudi[24] Brāhman and others. [3] . . .[25]

[1] Ch. 1 § 2.

[2] Int. § 149 (*a*). Also *Majjh.* 98, *Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 325 and *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 30, where the spelling is Icchānangala.

[3] *Vana-saṇḍa*; dense scrub or wilderness.

[4] Int. § 185.

[5] Ap. G 2 *c* § 2, i [2]; see § 6 [2] below. He becomes a lay-disciple; Ch. 10 *c*, n.

[6] See § 3 above.

[7] Ch. 14 *a* § 4.

[8] Free of service and taxes; Ch. 11 *d* § 10.

[9] Pokkharasādi hears the news of Buddha's arrival (as in Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]). The accomplishments of his pupil and envoy the young Brāhman Ambaṭṭha are described (as in Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133], *Vedas*) and also his visit to Buddha, Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9]; cp. Ch. 10 *c* (68).

[10] Ch. 14 *a* § 1.

[11] Int. § 149 (*a*).

[12] His charioteer. See Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [118].

[13] The inclusion of the Sakya country in the Kosalan kingdom seems implied by the context; Int. § 169 (iii).

[14] Int. § 148 (ii).

[15] Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119].

[16] The journey is made.

[17] Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*; n. Ap. G 1 *a* § 8; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2.

[18] Ch. 1 § 2.

[19] Int. § 149 (*a*).

[20] Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11].

[21] With large halls, Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]. See Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [4] n.

[22] Int. § 185; and Ch. 14 *f* § 7 [164] (*Caṇki*).

[23] See § 4 [1] above.

[24] Int. § 149 (*a*). *Todeyya*: 'Buddhaghosa says that . . . Todeyya lived at Tudigāma', SBB, ii, p. 300. See § 7 below.

[25] The famous *Tevijja-Suttanta* proceeds to a discussion upon union with Brahmā (the Brahmās) or on the other hand unity with Brahman; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2.

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 35), Sutta 133 (Verahaccāni). (PTS, iv, p. 121.)*

[1] At one time the venerable Udāyin[1] stayed at Kāmaṇḍā[2] (*Kāmaṇḍāyaṃ*) in the mango-grove of the Tudi[3] (*Todeyassa*) Brāhman. [2] And a young[4] [Brāhman], a pupil (*antevāsī*)[5] of Verahaccāni-gottā,[6] a Brāhmanī,[7] came to where the venerable Udāyin was. . . . [3] The venerable Udāyin enlightened that young man seated at his side and informed, stirred, and gladdened him by discourse on the Law.[8] [4] . . .[9]

§ 8. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 10 (Subha-S.).*

[1] . . . The venerable Ānanda[10] stayed at Sāvatthi . . . in Anāthapiṇḍika's garden[11] not long after the death of the Blessed One. At that time the young[12] (*mānavo*) Subha, son of the Tudi[13] [Brāhman] visited Sāvatthi on a certain business. . . .[14] [5] And the venerable Ānanda . . . with a Ceti[15] mendicant brother as attendant (*pacchā-samaṇena*)[16] went to the dwelling of the young Subha, son of Todeyya. . . . Seated at one side Subha . . . spoke to the venerable Ānanda thus: '. . . The esteemed (*bhavaṃ*) Ānanda would know what doctrines (*dhammānam*)[17] the revered (*bhavaṃ*) Gotama[18] praised and wherein he informed, settled, and established this [many] people. What doctrines, O (*bho*) Ānanda, did the revered Gotama praise and in what did he inform, settle, and establish these people?' [6] 'Three aggregates[19] [of doctrine], young man, the Blessed One was wont to praise. . . . What three? The noble[20] aggregate of duty; the noble aggregate of self-transcendence; the noble aggregate of insight'.[21] . . .[22]

[1] Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [1].
[2] Int. § 149 (*a*).
[3] See § 6 above, § 8 below; Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [196]; also *Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 202; *Ang. Nik.* ii, p. 180.
[4] *Mānavaka*; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].
[5] Resident (pupil or assistant); Ch. 8 *g* § 4.
[6] Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6).
[7] Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [209]; also Int. § 185 (*Brāhman*); and Int. § 190 (*women*).
[8] Ch. 6 *a* § 12.
[9] The pupil informs his instructress who ultimately becomes a lay disciple (Ch. 8 *l*).
[10] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[11] Ch. 14 *b* § 3.
[12] Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].
[13] *Todeyya.* See § 7 [1] above. For Subha see Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [196].
[14] Subha sends a messenger with a request that Ānanda will visit him.
[15] *Cetika*; Ch. 16 *c* § 1.
[16] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].
[17] Ap. G 1 *b* § 4 (*laws*).
[18] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].
[19] *Khandhā*; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7].
[20] *Ariya*; Ch. 5 *b* § 5.
[21] These are *sīla, samādhi, paññā*, the three points of the comprehensive discourse often repeated in the MPS (Ch. 20 § 8, *discourse*); see also Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180] (*good conduct*).
[22] The three terms are then explained and elaborated.

e. Southward of Sāvatthi

§ 1. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, A-vyākata-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 44*); *Sutta 1* (*Khemā-therī*). (*PTS, iv, p. 374.*)

[1] The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi. . . . [2] Now at that time Khema[1] the mendicant sister . . . entered upon residence[2] at Toraṇavatthu.[3] [3] And King Pasenadi[4] the Kosalan going from Sāketa[5] to Sāvatthi between Sāketa and Sāvatthi resided for one night at Toraṇavatthu. [4] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan instructed a certain man, saying: 'Go, good sir,[6] get to know in Toraṇavatthu some devotee (*samaṇaṃ*) or Brāhman[7] upon whom I may attend to-day. . . .[8]

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, vii, i.*

[1] The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi. . . . And at that time about thirty Western (*Pāṭheyyaka*)[9] Bhikkhus . . . when the beginning of the rainy season was approaching, were unable to get to Sāvatthi by the beginning of the rainy season and entered upon vassa[10] at Sāketa[11] on the way. They spent the rainy season fretting, thinking 'Quite near us the Blessed One is staying, six leagues (*yojanesu*)[12] from here; and we cannot get to see the Blessed One'. . . .[13]

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 24* (*Ratha-vinīta-S.*).

. . .[14] [PTS, i, p. 148.] I will make thee a comparison[15] (*upamaṃ*). . . . It is as if when King Pasenadi (*Pasenadissa*)[16] the Kosalan was sojourning at Sāvatthi some emergent business should arise at Sāketa[17] [p. 149] and they should arrange for him a succession of seven chariots[18] between Sāvatthi and Sāketa, and King Pasenadi the Kosalan departing from Sāvatthi should mount the first chariot at the door of the inner-palace[19] . . . and in the seventh chariot in the succession he should arrive at the door of the inner-palace at Sāketa. When he was entering the palace his friends and kinsmen[20] and near

[1] Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [6].
[2] *Vāsam upagatā hoti*, resided (perhaps for the rainy season); cp. Ch. 8 *c* § 1 [2]. One MS. prefixes *eka-ratti* (for one night).
[3] Int. § 149.
[4] Ch. 14 *a* § 1.
[5] See below §§ 2, 8 (*Ayojjhā*).
[6] *Ambho purisa*; Int. § 190 (*address*).
[7] Ap. A 2 *d* [21]. Cp. Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [196].
[8] The Sutta proceeds as in Ap. G 2 *a* § 3.
[9] Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [1].
[10] Ch. 8 *c*.
[11] See above, § 1; see below, §§ 3, 4, 5, 6, 7; Int. § 149 (*b*); also in MV, I. lxvi. 1, VIII. i. 8, xiii. 7. Sāketa is mentioned frequently in the *Sutta Vibhaṅga* of *Vin. Piṭ.*, and in the *Psalms of the Early Buddhists* (*Brethren* and *Sisters*).
[12] About 48 miles; Ch. 2 § 7 [66].
[13] They reached Sāvatthi after three months.
[14] The interlocutors are Puṇṇa Mantāni-putta (Ch. 10 *c*, 9) and Sāriputta, at Sāvatthi in the Andhavana (Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [1]). Sāriputta calls himself (p. 150) Upatissa son of Sāri (Ch. 7 *a* § 23).
[15] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].
[16] Ch. 14 *a* § 1.
[17] See § 2 above.
[18] The word used is *ratha*: Ch. 1 § 9; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 ; and Int. § 190 (*vehicles*).
[19] *Antepura*; Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4].
[20] Ch. 9 *b* § 3.

relations[1] might ask him whether he had arrived from Sāvatthi in that chariot at the door of the palace at Sāketa. How should King Pasenadi the Kosalan rightly reply? . . .[2]

§ 4. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Bojjhaṅga-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 46), Sutta 6 (Kuṇḍali). (PTS, v, p. 73.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Sāketa[3] in the Añjana-Grove, the deer-park (*Añcana-vane Migadāye*).[4] [2] And Kuṇḍaliya[5] the wandering philosopher[6] came to where the Blessed One was. . . . Seated at one side he spoke to the Blessed One thus: [3] 'I, O (*bho*) Gotama,[7] dwell [here] in a garden[8] and attend meetings.[9] This is my procedure: after the meal[10] eaten in the morning I roam and wander from garden to garden, from park to park (*uyyānaṃ*).[11] There I see certain religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇe*)[12] discoursing on the advantage of free discussion and on the advantageousness of controversy. Now in what does the respected (*bhavaṃ*) Gotama find advantage?' . . .[13]

§ 5. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta (the Fours), Sutta 24. (PTS, ii, p. 24.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Sāketa[14] in the Kāḷaka-Garden (*Kāḷak-ārāme*).[15] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[16]

§ 6. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-nipāta (the Fives), Sutta 144. (PTS, iii, p. 169.)*

[1] The Blessed One stayed at Sāketa[17] in the Ti-kaṇḍaki Grove (*Tikaṇḍakivane*).[18] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[19]

[1] *Ñāti-salohita*; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1].
[2] The answer is that he arrived by means of seven chariots in succession. In the same way *parinibbāna* (Ap. C *b* § 11, Dhp. 89) is reached by means of purity of conduct (*sīla-visuddhi*), of heart, of view, of victory over doubt, of clear vision distinguishing way from way, of clear vision of the Path and of [boundless] clear vision (*ñāna-dassana*, Ch. 4 § 16; cp. Ap. F 2 *d*, *self-transcendence*) successively. Compare Ch. 14 *d* § 3 [1] n, where the steps are not confined to one world.
[3] See § 2 above.
[4] Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171]. At *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 54, and v, p. 219, and *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, p. 427, the spelling is Añjana.
[5] He becomes a lay-disciple; Ch. 8 *l*.
[6] Int. § 126.
[7] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).
[8] *Ārāma*; Int. § 126.
[9] *Parisā*; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 (*sessions*).
[10] *Pacchā-bhattaṃ*; Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7]. See Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [126].
[11] Ch. 1 § 9 [58].
[12] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [29].
[13] Buddha expounds the Seven Parts of Wisdom (Ch. 9 *a* § 8) and the conditions favourable to their development.
[14] See § 2 above.
[15] Ch. 7 *a* § 10 (*ārāma*).
[16] What follows is an expansion of the closing verses which treat of a Tathāgata's detachment from the illusory world. Here the title Tathāgata (Right-farer) seems applicable to any truly enlightened follower: Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5); cp. Ch. 4 § 18.
[17] See § 2 above.
[18] In the *uddāna* (list of contents) of the Fives the 15th *vagga* consisting of ten discourses is called the *Tikaṇḍi-vagga*.
[19] The address enjoins avoidance of *rāga, dosa, moha* (Ap. D *a* § 10, *Three Fires*).

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Anuruddha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 52), *Sutta* 4 (*Kaṇṭakī*). (*PTS, v, p.* 298.)

[1] At one time the venerable Anuruddha[1] and the venerable Sāriputta[2] and the venerable Mahā-Moggallāna[3] stayed at Sāketa[4] in the Kaṇṭakī Grove (*Kaṇṭakī-vane*).[5] . . . [3] Seated at one side the venerable Sāriputta said to the venerable Anuruddha 'What ideas (*dhammā*),[6] friend Anuruddha, can a mendicant brother who is a learner put aside when he has attained them?' . . .[7]

§ 8. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 22), *Sutta* 95 (*Phena*). (*PTS, iii, p.* 140.)

[1] Once the Blessed One stayed at Ayojjhā[8] on the bank of the river Gaṅgā.[9] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[10]

f. Minor places in Kosala visited by Buddha and his Disciples

§ 1. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta* 100 (*Sangārava-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 209.] . . . The Blessed One was journeying among the Kosalans (*Kosalesu*)[11] together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers. Now at that time there was sojourning at Caṇḍalakappa[12] a Brāhmanī[13] named Dhānañjāni[14] who had clear faith in the Buddha[15] and the Law and the Community. . . .[16] [210] And the Blessed One journeying by stages among the Kosalans arrived at Caṇḍalakappa, and there at Caṇḍalakappa the Blessed One stayed in the mango-

1 Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].
2 Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
3 Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
4 See § 2 above.
5 This is the scene of the next two Suttas, of which the first deals with the same subject and the second with Anuruddha's 'higher' knowledge (*abhiññā*; Ap. I *b* § 3 [7 (x)], and Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4], *vision*).
6 Or, principles; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] (*thoughts*). 'What states', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 265.
7 Anuruddha cites the four Satipaṭṭhānā (modes of fixing the attention; Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]).
8 Otherwise Ayujjhā, or Ayojjhāyā; Int. § 149 *b*; Ch. 15 *b* § 7 n (*Ganges*). Ayojjhā became later the capital of Kosambi; it was possibly in the immediate neighbourhood of Sāketa (see § 1 above). See RDBI, p. 39; ThB, pp. 10, 11, 15.
9 Ayojjhā was not on the Ganges (Int. § 121) but on the river Sarabhū or Sarayū (Ch. 8 *d* § 8; *Brethren*, p. 43), a northern tributary of the Ganges. See RDBI, p. 34; cp. below, Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [1] n.
10 Buddha points to a mass of foam with which and with a bubble, a juggler's illusion (*māyā*, Ap. D *b*; and Int. § 190, *amusements*) and other transient things he compares unsubstantial (*a-sāraka*) individuality; cp. Ch. 4 § 18 [3].
11 Int. § 149.
12 Int. § 149 *c*.
13 Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [2].
14 *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 160; *Sisters*, p. 177 n; a pious lay-woman (Ch. 8 *l*, n). Cp. *Majjh.* 97 (PTS, ii, p. 184) which concerns the Brāhman Dhānañjāni living at the Taṇḍulapāla Gate at Rājagaha (cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 5 [3], *Sītavana Gate*).
15 Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4].
16 She encounters Saṅgārava a young Brāhman whose qualifications are described as in Ch. 12 *e* § 13.

grove of the Todeyya Brāhmans.[1] And Dhānañjāni the Brāhmanī heard that the Blessed One had reached Caṇḍalakappa . . . and she went to where the young[2] Sangārava[3] was and . . . said 'Fair sir,[4] the Blessed One has reached Caṇḍalakappa. . . . Now [is the opportunity] for what thou, fair sir, thinkest seasonable (*kālaṃ*).'[5] Then Sangārava . . . went to where the Blessed One was. . . .[6]

§ 2. *Aṇguttara-Nikaya, Chakka-nipāta* (*the Sixes*) *Sutta 62.* (*PTS, iii, p. 402.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there was] a township (*nigamo*)[7] of the Kosalans called Daṇḍakappaka (*Daṇḍakappakaṃ*).[8] And the Blessed One pausing on the journey sat down at the foot of a certain tree on a seat prepared[9] for him while the mendicant brothers entered Daṇḍakappaka to seek a lodging. And the venerable Ānanda[10] together with many mendicant brothers went to the river Aciravati[11] to bathe their limbs. . . .[12]

§ 3. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Māra-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 4*), *Sutta 4* (*Patirūpa*). (*PTS, i, p. 111.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Kosalans at Ekasālā,[13] a Brāhman village.[14] On that occasion the Blessed One surrounded by a great gathering of laymen (*gihi-parisāya*)[15] made plain the Law to them. . . .[16]

1 These presumably were a branch of the family mentioned in Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [1] and were perhaps its neighbours.

2 *Mānava*; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].

3 Ap. H 4 *a* § 3. This young Brāhman apparently is not the Saṅgārava who appears in the Suttas at *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 182, v, p. 121, and *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 168, iii, p. 230, v, pp. 232, 252. At *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 182, the Brāhman is described as a believer in purification by bathing (Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]); at *Aṅg. Nik.* v, pp. 232, 252, Buddha instructs him regarding 'the hither and the further' shores (*orimaṃ tīraṃ, pārimaṃ tīraṃ*), e.g. wrong view and right view, taking life and abstaining therefrom (Int. § 48 n; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note, next world*).

4 *Tāta bhadra-mukha*; Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2], and Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [2].

5 Ch. 20 § 2 [6].

6 In the discourse which ensues Gotama gives an account of his enlightenment in part identical with the narrative in *Majjh.* 26 (Ch. 2 § 5), that is up to the arrival at Uruvelā; and in part with that in *Majjh.* 4 (SBB, v, pp. 14–17) and in *Majjh.* 36 (Ch. 4 § 17), regarding the three watches of the night. Saṅgārava is convinced and becomes a lay disciple (Ch. 8 *l*).

7 Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

8 Int. § 149 *c*.

9 Ch. 17 *b* § 1.

10 Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].

11 Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11].

12 A discussion arises regarding Gotama's final condemnation of Devadatta as lost beyond redemption (Ch. 19 *c* § 1 [393]; cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 1 n).

13 Int. § 149 (*c*).

14 Ch. 1 § 2.

15 Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21]; and Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [1] (*householders*).

16 Māra (Int. § 93, iv) appears and a dialogue in verse ensues (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) on the risks of teaching.

§ 4. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 65. (PTS, i, p. 188.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there was] a township[1] of the Kālāmans[2] (*Kālāmānaṃ*) called Kesaputta.[3] And the Kālāmans of Kesaputta heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . has arrived. . . .'[4] And the Kālāmans of Kesaputta came to the Blessed One . . . and seated at one side spoke to the Blessed One thus: [2] 'There are, revered sir, some religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*)[5] who come to Kesaputta. They illumine and illustrate their own teaching (*vādaṃ*), but [each] others' teaching they denounce . . . and mutilate. . . . Of these, revered sir, there arises in us doubt and uncertainty (*vicikicchā*)[6] as to which of these respected instructors (*samaṇānaṃ*) speaks truly and which falsely.' . . .[7]

§ 5. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 150 (Nagaravindeyya-S.).*

[PTS, iii, p. 290.] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there was] a Brāhman village[8] of the Kosalans Nagaravinda (*Nagaravindaṃ*)[9] by name. And the Brāhman householders (*brāhmaṇa-gahapatikā*)[10] of Nagaravinda heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . has arrived [p. 291]. . . .'[11] And the Brāhman householders of Nagaravinda came to the Blessed One . . . and as they sat at one side the Blessed One spoke to them. . . .[12]

§ 6. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 67. (PTS, v, p. 122.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there

[1] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.
[2] Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2].
[3] Int. § 149 *c*. For the termination *-putta* (hollow) cp. Pātali-putta (Int. § 145).
[4] As in Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].
[5] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [37], and Ap. G 2 *c* (*Opponents*).
[6] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).
[7] In the ensuing discourse Buddha propounds an ethical criterion; he speaks of the three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10), the four Brahma vihāras (Ap. F 2 *b*), and the consolations of the true believer, including assurance of attaining a blissful place (*sugatiṃ saggaṃ lokaṃ*; Ap. C *a* § 2 [126]) in the next world if such there is (*sace kho pana atthi paraloko*; Int. §§ 12, 48 n; see § 9 [401] n below) and if there is not (*sace kho pana n'atthi paraloko*) then in this life happiness arising from well-doing (Int. § 100, *atoms*). The Kālāmans are converted (IN 2 *a*); see § 5 [291] n below.
[8] Ch. 1 § 2.
[9] Int. § 149 *c*.
[10] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54]. On p. 291 these are addressed as *bho gahapatayo* and again as *gahapatayo*; it would seem therefore that here the householders are Brāhmans and not clansmen; see below §§ 9 [401], 13 [5]; also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [196].
[11] As in Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].
[12] Distinction is made between religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*; Ch. 9 *b* § 9) who deserve honour and those who do not. The hearers are converted and become lay-followers; see § 4 [2] n above, § 13 [5] n below; and Ch. 8 *l*. The mass conversion of Brāhmans may indicate the affinity between the Brāhmanic philosophy and the fundamental ideas of Gotama; Ch. 7 *a* § 3 [19] (*sacrificial fires*), and Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 (*jatilakā*).

was] a township[1] of the Kosalans called Nāḷakapāna[2] (*Nāḷakapānaṃ*) and there at Nāḷakapāna the Blessed One stayed in the Palāssa Grove (*Palāsa-vane*). Then at that time the [following] day being Observance-day[3] the Blessed One was seated surrounded by an assemblage of mendicant brothers. And the Blessed One having enlightened . . . the mendicant brothers by discourse on the Law till late at night[4] instructed the venerable Sāriputta[5] saying . . . 'Let a discourse on the Law be addressed now to the mendicant brothers [by thee], Sāriputta; my back is weary I will rest it.' . . . Then the Blessed One lay down on his right side in the lion-posture.[6] . . . [2] Then the venerable Sāriputta spoke thus: [3] 'In whomsoever, friends, there is no faith[7] as to good principles (*dhammesu*),[8] no meekness . . . no conscience (*ottappam*)[9] . . . no vigour . . . no insight as to good principles, in him decline in good principles by night and by day is to be expected and not progress (*vuddhi*).'[10] . . .[11]

§ 7. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 95* (*Canki-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 164.] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there was] a Brāhman village[12] of the Kosalans, Opasāda (*Opasādaṃ*)[13] by name. And there at Opasāda the Blessed One stayed to the north of Opasāda in the sacred grove (*deva-vane*)[14] of Sāl-trees (*sāla-vane*).[15] Now at that time Caṇki[16] the Brāhman occupied Opasāda, a royal [demesne] . . .[17] a sacred gift.[18] And the Brāhman householders (*brāhmaṇa-gahapatikā*)[19] of Opasāda heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . has reached Opasāda. . . .[20] It is good to look upon such saints.'[21] . . . At that time Caṇki the Brāhman went to [his noon] day-rest[22] on the upper [terrace of his] mansion[23] and saw the Brāhman householders of Opasāda going out from Opasāda in crowds flocking together going towards the north to the sacred grove of Sāl-trees. And Caṇki the Brāhman said to his companion. . . . 'Then, comrade (*bho khatte*),[24] go to the Brāhman householders and

[1] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.
[2] Int. § 149 *c*. Also Sutta 68 of the Tens; and *Majjh.* 68.
[3] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1].
[4] Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354].
[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
[6] Ap. H 5 [93].
[7] *Saddhā*; cp. Ch. 20 § 4 (1).
[8] Thoughts or ideas; qualities: Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]. Cp. grammatically Ch. 9 *a* § 1.
[9] Ch. 21 § 15 (5) n.
[10] Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].
[11] The subject is expanded; Buddha confirms Sāriputta's teaching.
[12] Ch. 1 § 2.
[13] Int. § 149 *c*.
[14] Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1] (*sacrificial grove*). Perhaps more simply 'at Devavana, the Sāl-tree Grove'.
[15] Ch. 1 § 2 (*Mahā-sāla*) n.
[16] Caṇki is the first of the 'much-attended' Brāhmans mentioned in *Dīgha* 13 (Ch. 14 *d* § 6 [2]) as residing at Manasākata.
[17] As in Ch. 11 *d* § 10 with necessary changes.
[18] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1].
[19] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54].
[20] As in Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [11].
[21] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].
[22] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3].
[23] Ch. 2 § 2.
[24] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2) n.

say: "Let the respected [householders] wait; Caṇki the Brāhman also will go to see the devotee Gotama".' . . .[1]

§ 8. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 90. (PTS, i, p. 236.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there was] a township[2] of the Kosalans called Pankadhā,[3] and there at Pankadhā the Blessed One stayed. . . . At that time a mendicant brother Kassapa-gotta[4] by name was resident in Pankadhā. And there the Blessed One enlightened . . . the mendicant brothers with religious discourse connected with the precepts.[5] And Kassapa-gotta . . . was sceptical, thinking 'This devotee is too constrained'.[6] [2] Then the Blessed One . . . set forth on the way towards Rājagaha.[7] And there at Rājagaha the Blessed One stayed on the Gijjhakūta hill. . . .[8]

§ 9. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 60 (Apaṇṇaka-S.).*

[PTS, i, p. 400.] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there was] a Brāhman village[9] of the Kosalans called Sālā.[10] And the Brāhman[11] householders of Sālā heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . [p. 401] has reached Sālā . . .[12] It is good to look upon such saints.'[13] And the Brāhman householders of Sālā went to where the Blessed One was. . . . To them seated at one side the Blessed One spoke thus: 'Is there with you, householders (*gahapatayo*)[14] any teacher agreeable (*manāpo*) to you in whom your faith (*saddhā*) is held firm?' 'There is not, revered sir. . . .' 'By you, householders, who have not found an agreeable teacher this sure Law (*apaṇṇako dhammo*) should be acquired and practised. . . .[15] [p. 411]

[1] Brāhman visitors from abroad try to dissuade Caṇki. They enumerate his high Brāhman qualifications (Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 n), his pure descent for seven generations, the respect in which he is held by King Pasenadi (Int. § 169, i) and King Bimbisāra (Int. § 168). He however persuades them and they are present at a debate between Buddha and the young Brāhman Kāpathika on the truth of the Vedic verses (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]). The young man becomes a lay disciple (Ch. 8 *l*)

[2] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[3] Int. § 149 *c*.

[4] On this widely known Brāhman clan see Ch. 10 *c* (4) n. On *gotta* see Ap. E *b* § 2 [5].

[5] Prohibitions. Ch. 8 *d* § 5.

[6] *Sal-likhata*, austere; literally, rubbed or polished. See *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 217, n. Cp. Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]; also *sallekhatā*, *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, p. 115; and *sallekhā*, *Majjh.* 8.

[7] Int. § 125.

[8] Kassapa-gotta feels remorse and follows Gotama to Rājagaha. A discourse on discipline (*sikkhā*) follows; Ch. 8 *d* § 5.

[9] Ch. 1 § 2.

[10] Int. § 149 *c*. Also *Majjh.* 41; *Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 144, p. 227.

[11] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54].

[12] As in Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [11].

[13] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].

[14] See § 5 [290] n above.

[15] The sure Law is set forth by Gotama. In the discourse mention is made of belief in a world beyond (see § 4 [2] n above), in the results of actions (Ap. B) and in the survival of individual existence (Int. § 12 n); it is stated that a wise man believing in these will gain the benefit of them if they exist (Int. § 12), and whether they exist or not he will surely gain the good opinion of other men. The outlook is for the most part individualistic, self-interested, and desirous, and may be attributed

Those religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*)[1] who announce the theory that there is cessation of individual-existence altogether (*atthi sabbaso bhava-nirodho*)[2]—if the dictum of these religious teachers is true this position[3] is found, that in the present existence (*diṭṭhe va dhamme*)[4] I should attain peace (*parinibbāyissāmi*).[5] As to those religious teachers who announce the theory that there is not cessation of individual-existence altogether—this theory of theirs is nigh to desire, nigh to bondage,[6] nigh to enjoyment,[7] nigh to clinging, nigh to grasping.'[8] . . . One thus reckoning proceeds to develop indifference[9] [to the transient ego], non-desire, cessation[10] [of selfhood] . . .[11] [p. 413] When thus he perceives and understands . . . he knows that . . . there is nothing [individual] beyond this [existence] (*n'āparaṃ itthattāya*).'[12] . . .

§ 10. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 12* (*Lohicca-S.*).

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers . . .[13] came to Sālavatika.[14] At that time Lohicca[15] the Brāhman[16] occupied Sālavatikā, a royal [demesne] . . . a sacred gift.[17] . . . [4] And Lohicca the Brāhman instructed Bhesika the barber[18] saying 'Go, good (*samma*)[19] Bhesika . . . and say "May the respected Gotama consent to take with Lohicca the Brāhman a meal[20] to-morrow together with the company of mendicant brothers." ' [5] . . .[21]

§ 11. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sotapatti-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 55), *Sutta 6* (*Thapatayo*). (*PTS, v, p. 348.*)

[1] Sāvatthi series.[22] [2] At that time many mendicant brothers were engaged in robe-making [*cīvara-kammaṃ*)[23] for the Blessed One saying: 'The Blessed One should set forth on his journeying in three months time with robes complete.' [3] Now at that time Isidatta and

to later Buddhists readmitting as innocuous the older theories discarded by Gotama (IN 5, *Canon*). Other metaphysical subjects are raised, such as negativism (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i [23]), cause (Ap. G 2 *c* § 2, ii [30], § 3, i [20]), the formless (*āruppa*; cp. Ap. D *a* § 8, ii [4], and Ch. 21 § 11 [33] 3) and the corporeal gods (IN 8*a*), but are not decided.

[1] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [37].

[2] Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6; also Ch. 4 § 16 (*puna-bbhavo*) and § 17. (*n'āparaṃ itthattāya*). See Int. § 4 (*an-attā*).

[3] *Thāna*; Ap. E *b* § 3 (1).

[4] Ap. C *b* § 4.

[5] Ap. C *b* § 11 (89).

[6] *Saṃyoga*; cp. Ap. D *a* § 8.

[7] *Abhi-nandana*; Ch. 5 *b* § 6.

[8] *Upadāna*; Ap. D *a*.

[9] *Nibbidā* (aversion); cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 4 (*nibbindati*).

[10] *Nirodha*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).

[11] Passages on harmfulness recurring in *Majjh.* 4 and 27 and 51, ending with the comprehension of the nature, origin, and cessation of the *āsavā* (Ch. 4 § 17; Ap. D *a* § 7).

[12] As in Ch. 4 § 17.

[13] Omitting the conventional number 500 (Int. § 121).

[14] Int. § 149 *c*.

[15] Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11].

[16] Int. § 185.

[17] As in Ch. 11 *d* § 10 with necessary changes, the donor being King Pasenadi (Int. § 169, i).

[18] *Nahāpita*; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[19] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3].

[20] Ch. 10 *a* § 7.

[21] The narrative is continued in Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11].

[22] Ch. 14 *b* § 7.

[23] Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [2]. Gotama's company was perhaps included among the beneficiaries.

Purāṇa[1] the [royal] attendants (*thapatayo*)[2] were staying at Sādhuka (*Sādhuke*)[3] on some business . . . and heard that . . . 'the Blessed One should set forth on his journeying in three months time.' [4] Then Isidatta and Purāṇa . . . placed a man on the road saying 'When thou, good (*am-bho*)[4] man, shalt see the Blessed One approaching, the saint all-enlightened, then report to us'. [5] The man having stood there for two or three days saw the Blessed One approaching from afar. . . . [7] And the Blessed One pausing on the journey towards the foot of a certain tree and having reached it sat down on a seat prepared[5] for him. . . . Isidatta and Purāṇa . . . having saluted the Blessed One sat down at one side. . . .[6]

§ 12. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 90 (Kaṇṇakatthala-S.).*

[PTS, ii, p. 125.] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Ujuññā (*Ujuññāyaṃ*)[7] in Kaṇṇakatthala the deer-park.[8] At that time King Pasenadi[9] the Kosalan arrived at Ujuññā on some business. . . .[10] [126] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan after the meal[11] eaten in the morning (*pacchā-bhattaṃ bhutta-pātarāso*) came to the Blessed One. . . . [p. 126] Seated at one side King Pasenadi the Kosalan spoke thus to the Blessed One, 'The sisters[12] Somā and Sakulā, revered sir, salute the feet of the Blessed One with the forehead[13] and enquire after his health,[14] freedom from sickness, well-being, strength, and comfort.' . . And the Blessed One replied 'May they, Mahārāja, be happy (*sukhiniyo*).' [p. 127]. . . .[15]

§ 13. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sotapatti-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 55), Sutta 7 (Veḷudvāreyya). (PTS, v, p. 352.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there

[1] 'At A. iii, 348, Isidatta is uncle of the woman disciple Migasālā. Her father was Purāṇa', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 303 n. Their duties are described at *Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 123, and include attendance on the sleeping king.

[2] House-lords; nom. pl. of *tha-pati*. Int. § 172 n.

[3] Int. § 149 *c*.

[4] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [258]; cp. *bho* (Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).

[5] Ch. 17 *b* § 1.

[6] Gotama's recent journeys (IN 11 *a*) from the Kosalans to the Mallans, thence to the Vajjians, thence to Kāsi, thence to the Magadhans, and so back by the same route to Sāvatthi are summarily recounted. Later the characteristics of a stream-attainer (*sotā-paṇna*; Ap. D *c* § 3 [6]) are stated.

[7] *Uruññā* or *Udaññā*. Int. § 149 *c*. Also in *Dīgha* 8 [1]. The place seems to have been near Sāvatthi.

[8] Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 9.

[9] Ch. 14 *a* § 1.

[10] The king sends a messenger with polite inquiries and a request for an interview.

[11] Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3].

[12] They were members of the king's family; sufficient authority for calling them queens is not apparent. See Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [1] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110] (*Vāsabhā*).

[13] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3] (*salute*).

[14] Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2].

[15] Vidūdabha the General (Int. § 169, iii; Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [110]) and Sañjaya Ākāsagotta, a Brāhman (Int. § 190; cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [4] n) employed in the palace, are then introduced. The compiler having thus included all his characters proceeds to a conversation in which all take part except the women. The subjects include the basic equality of the four castes (Int. § 185). The equivalence of sons and daughters (Int. § 190, *women*) is declared elsewhere (*Saṃ. Nik.*, i, p. 110–11).

was] a Brāhman village[1] of the Kosalans, by name Veḷudvāra (*Veḷudvāraṃ*).[2] [2] And the Brāhman[3] householders of Veḷudvāra heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . has reached Veḷudvāra. . . .[4] It is good to look upon such saints.'[5] [3] And the Brāhman householders of Veḷudvāra went where the Blessed One was and when they had arrived some having saluted (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One sat down at one side . . .[6] and some sat down in silence. [4] Seated at one side those Brāhman householders . . . spoke to the Blessed One. . . .[7] [5] 'I will show you, householders,[8] a religious train of thought (*dhamma-pariyāyaṃ*)[9] regarding the self', he said. . . .[10]

§ 14. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 63.* (*PTS, iii, p. 180.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One journeying among the Kosalans together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to where [there was] a Brāhman village[11] of the Kosalans, by name Venāgapura.[12] And the Brāhman[13] householders of Venāgapura . . .[14] [2] went to where the Blessed One was. . . .[15] Seated at one side the Brāhman Vaccha-gotta[16] of Venāgapura spoke thus to the Blessed One: [3] ' . . . I suppose, respected (*bho*) Gotama, that high and wide couches[17] . . . [18] such resting-places the respected Gotama, I suppose, can obtain at pleasure, without effort, without trouble.' [4] ' . . . There are three high and wide resting-places,[19] Brāhman, which I can obtain now (*etarahi*)[20] at pleasure, without effort, without trouble.' . . .[21]

§ 15. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Brāhmaṇa-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 7), *Sutta 10* (*Bahu-dhīti*).[22] (*PTS, i, p. 170.*)

[1] . . . At one time the Blessed One was staying among the Kosalans in a certain woodland (*vana-saṇḍe*).[23] [2] Now at that time fourteen

[1] Ch. 1 § 2.
[2] Int. § 149 *c*.
[3] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54].
[4] As in Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [11].
[5] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].
[6] Four modes of salutation are described; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. See § 14 [2] below.
[7] They ask for a doctrine profitable in this world and leading to heaven (*sugatiṃ saggaṃ lokaṃ*; IN 2 *a*; cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]).
[8] See § 5 [290] n above.
[9] Ch. 14 *d* § 3.
[10] The discourse which follows opens with the other regarding Sīlas (Ap. H 4 *a*). The villagers become lay-disciples; see § 5 [291] n above.
[11] Ch. 1 § 2.
[12] Int. § 149 *c*.
[13] Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [54].
[14] As in Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].
[15] As in § 13 [3] above.
[16] Apparently not the Vaccha-gotta converted elsewhere; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6).
[17] *Sayanāni*; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9).
[18] Different kinds of couches, divans, coverlets, and rugs are enumerated; Int. § 190 (*furniture*).
[19] *Sayanāni* (*couches*).
[20] Cp. Ap. C *b* § 4 (*ditthe va dhamme*).
[21] Gotama explains that these are the Jhānas (Ap. I *a*), the Brahma-vihāras (Ap. F 2 *b*) and freedom from the vices elsewhere called the Three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10).
[22] 'Many daughters.'
[23] Other such apocryphal woodland spots in Kosala are mentioned at *Saṃ. Nik.* i, pp. 197–205.

of a certain Brāhman Bhāradvāja's[1] oxen were lost [3] and the Brāhman Bhāradvāja-gotta seeking the oxen came to where that woodland was. On coming he saw the Blessed One . . . seated with crossed legs, holding his body erect and fixing his thought[2] intently. [4] . . . In the Blessed One's presence he spoke these verses:[3]

Of this recluse the last six days
No fourteen oxen have been lost;
So the recluse is happy.
Not in his field the sesamum
Rots grain by grain and leaf by leaf;
So the recluse is happy.
For him no mice in hollow barn
Disport themselves in frolic dance . . .
For him there are no seven daughters
Each widowed with a child or two . . .
And not to him do creditors
Cry out at dawn 'Repay, repay!',
So the recluse is happy . . .[4]

§ 16. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Brāhmaṇa-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 7), *Sutta* 9 (*Sundarikā*). (*PTS, i, p. 167.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed among the Kosalans on the bank of the river Sundarikā.[5] [2] Now at that time Sundarikā-Bhāradvāja[6] the Brāhman[7] was pouring out [a libation] to Agni (*aggiṃ*)[8] in attendance on the sacrificial fire (*aggi-huttaṃ*);[9] [3] and . . . having risen looked on every side to the four regions[10] thinking 'Who now should enjoy this remainder of the oblation?'[11] [4] And Sundarikā-Bhāradvāja the Brāhman saw the Blessed One seated at the foot of a tree with his head covered; and . . . holding in the left hand the remainder of the oblation and in the right hand his water-pot[12] he drew near to where the Blessed One was. . . [8] and said 'What is the respected [recluse] by birth?' [9] 'Ask not of birth',[13] [replied the Blessed One]; 'ask thou of virtue.[14] . . .'[15]

[1] A more prosperous farmer is depicted in Ch. 11 *d* 2 [2]. See Int. § 189 (*land*).
[2] *Sati*; Ap. F 2 *b* [6].
[3] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.
[4] It is said that turning from the world Bhāradvāja becomes a saint.
[5] Int. § 149 *c*. This Sutta appears in fuller form in *Sutta-nipāta*, iii. 4 (PTS, pp. 79–86). The river is mentioned also in *Majjh.* 7 where it is in a list of seven rivers or bathing-places considered by the Brāhmans to be efficacious for the purification of sins (Int. § 185, *ritual*; cp. Ap. D *c* § 5 [6], *stream-attaining*). Its position in the Kosalan river system is not clear (Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11]; Ch. 14 *e* § 8 [1]).
[6] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2].
[7] Ch. 1 § 6 [55].
[8] Int. § 186.
[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 8.
[10] Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1.
[11] Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 3 [19].
[12] Ch. 13 *a* § 2.
[13] *Jāti*; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii, 1].
[14] *Carana*; Ap. F 2 *c* § 2 (21).
[15] The Brāhman becomes a saint.

CHAPTER 15

THE LANDS OF THE KĀSIS AND VACCHAS; BENĀRES; DISSENSIONS IN KOSAMBI

a. THE KĀSIS[1] AND BENARES[2]

(i) *The legendary city; the First Sermon*

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 19* (*Mahā-Govinda-S.*).[3]

[29] . . .[4] In days gone by (*bhūta-pubbaṃ*) there was a king called Disampati. King Disampati's chief-minister[5] (*purohito*) was a Brāhman[6] named Govinda. . . . The Brāhman Govinda having died . . . [31] King Disampati consecrated[7] (*abhisiñci*) the young[8] Jotipāla in the office of governor (*govindiye*)[9] in his father's place . . . and to the young Jotipāla the appellation Mahā-Govinda came to be given. . . . [34] King Disampati having died those who had the right to confirm the king (*rāja-kattāro*)[10] consecrated[11] Renu the king's son in the kingship (*rajje*) . . . [35] and King Renu spoke thus to Mahā-Govinda who was seated at one side: 'Let the honoured (*bhavaṃ*)[12] Govinda go and divide this great earth[13] . . .[14] in fair division[15] making seven equal

[1] Int. § 158 (3); Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1] n; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [1]; and Int. § 121 n.

[2] Int. § 119. Ch. 5 *a* § 1; Ch. 6 *a* § 2; Ch. 6 *b*, n. See also *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 105, where Buddha encounters Māra (Int. § 69) : Isipatana. In Sutta 15 of the Threes of *Aṅg. Nik.* Gotama staying at Isipatana tells his disciples the fable of the wheelwright. *Pārājika* rule ii (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 67) mentions Buddha's presence in Benāres. See also *Vin. Piṭ.* iv, p. 203 (*Sekhiya* 69). In *Saṃ Nik.* (*Kindred Sayings*, ii, p. 79, iii, pp. 143–4, 147–8, iv, pp. 101, 272–6) Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]) gives instruction to Mahā-Kotthita (Ch. 10 *c*, 31) in the Deer-park. In MV, VIII. i. 21–2 mention is made of a *seṭṭhi* (Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]) of Benāres.

[3] Discourse on the Great Governor (literally, Master of Cattle). Buddha is represented as saying that he himself in a former birth was the Brāhman Great Governor. The story, however, is not included in the *Jātaka* Birth-stories (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2; SBB, iii, p. 280 n); it appears with some differences in the *Mahāvastu*, the comparatively late Story of Buddha in Sanskrit (SBB, iii, p. 256). See Ch. 17 *c* [36] n.

[4] The heavenly minstrel (*Gandhabba-putta*, Ap. D *c* § 4) Pañcasikha appears to Buddha on the Vulture-peak (Int. § 128) and describes his visit to the heaven of the Thirty-three (Int. § 70) and recounts a story told there to the Thirty-three and to Sakka (Int. § 69) by Brahmā Sanaṃ-kumāra (Int. § 93, ii), who assumes a visible form for the occasion.

[5] Int. § 172. 'Minister', SBB, iii, p. 266; literally prefect or (religious) preceptor.

[6] Int. § 190.

[7] Ch. 7 *b* § 3.

[8] *Mānava*, young (*Brāhman*); Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].

[9] Govinda may be the name of an office or a personal name.

[10] 'The king-makers', SBB, iii, p. 268. They may have had the right to veto or approve, and may have held a council for the purpose. See Int. § 162 (*government*); cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (17).

[11] Ch. 7 *b* § 3.

[12] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].

[13] *Mahā-paṭhavī*, i.e. northern India. Ch. 14 *c* § 3 [1] n.

[14] Omitting obscure terms as to northern and southern limits. As the eastern and western limits are set by the Kālingas on the east coast and the Sovīras on the west coast but no northern or southern limits are indicated it may perhaps be taken that the omitted terms merely signify vague and immense extent.

[15] Ch. 22 *c* § 10.

parts' . . . and Mahā-Govinda divided the great earth . . .[1] making seven equal parts and constituted them all.[2] . . . [36] And there in the middle was the country (*janapado*)[3] of King Renu.

'Dantapura[4] of the Kāliṅgas[5] and of the Assakas[6] [the city] Potana;[7]
Māhissatī[8] of the Avantis[9] and of the Sovīris[10] Roruka;[11]
Mithilā[12] too of the Videhas;[13] Campā[14] among the Aṅgas[15] founded;
And Bārāṇasi[16] of the Kāsis. These were Govinda-founded'. So 'tis said. . . .[17]
Sattabhu and Brahmadatta, Vessabhu with Bharat,
Renu and the two Dhataratthas [these were the seven kings].[18] Then were there seven Bhāratas'[19]. . . .[20]

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Maha-vagga, x, ii.*

. . .[21] [3] In days gone by there was in Benāres a king of Kāsi (*Kāsi-*

[1] Omitting obscure terms as before.

[2] Omitting a doubtful term as above, possibly meaning 'wide-open (to the south or north)'.

[3] Int. § 158 (*clans*); Ch. 1 § 2 n. Cp. § 15 [1] below.

[4] On the east coast of India; RDBI, p. 31. See Ch. 17 c [36].

[5] *Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 167 (MPS, vi, 28); *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 260; *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 107 (*Pārājika*, iv). The Emperor Asoka (Ap. G 1 c) in Rock Edict XIII expresses his remorse for his devastating conquest of the Kāliṅgas early in his reign (V. A. Smith's *Asoka*, 3rd ed., pp. 25, 185). In *Majjh.* 56 (i, p. 378) it is stated that the Kāliṅga forest (*Kāliṅg-āraññaṃ*) and similar wildernesses were made by 'mental wrath of Seers (*Isīnaṃ manopadosena*)'; cp. Int. § 94 (v).

[6] Int. § 158 (13). See *Sutta-Nipāta* (977).

[7] On the river Godhāvarī; RDBI, p. 27. The place is not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.*

[8] RDBI, p. 103. In the *Pārāyana-vagga* of the *Sutta-Nipāta* (SN, 1011–13) the route (IN 11 a) followed by the pilgrims from the river Godhāvari northward is—Patitthāna of Alaka, Mahissatī, Ujjenī, Gonaddha, Vedisā, Vanasavhaya, Kosambī, Sāketa (Int. § 149, b), to Sāvatthi; and thence to Setavya (Ch. 14 d § 2), Kapilavatthu, Kusinārā, Pāvā, and Vesāli 'the Magadhan town' where Buddha is staying in the Pāsānaka (stone) shrine. The link between S.W. India and the Middle-land was Kosambi; Ch. 15 b (i).

[9] Int. § 156.

[10] On the west coast of India. The modern Surat appears to be connected with Sovīra (RDBI, p. 38).

[11] Neither this western port nor the people is mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.*

[12] Ch. 12 e § 12.

[13] Ch. 12 e § 13 [133].

[14] Ch. 11 e § 1 [1].

[15] Int. § 158 (1).

[16] The name by metathesis has become Benāres. The prose setting with its strange mythology is certainly of comparatively late date. The verses (Ap. A 2 a, *Note*) may possibly be earlier, but show signs of latter-day origin and seem to be rather a confused corruption than an earlier version of the stock list of sixteen (Ch. 11 a § 3 [17]) or the abbreviated list of ten clans (Ch. 12 e § 6). The verses in any case show the legendary fame of Benāres.

[17] Omitting a prose expansion.

[18] If the same order is preserved then Renu ruled in Mithilā.

[19] i.e. kingdoms in northern India. Bhārata as a name for India is derived from Bharat the nobly loyal brother of Rāma.

[20] The first Part ends here. In Part II Mahā-Govinda continues to advise the kings of the seven countries. Finally he leads them and many others to a religious life little short of Buddhism. Parting with his numerous wives he advises them to remarry (Int. § 190, *women*), but they prefer to follow him as disciples.

[21] The scene is the Ghositārāma at Kosambī (Int. §§ 143, 144); the story is attributed to Buddha.

rājā)[1] called Brahmadatta.[2] . . . The king of Kosala (*Kosala-rājā*) was called Dīghīti[3] . . . and Brahmadatta the king of Kāsi having arrayed a fourfold[4] army went out against Dīghīti the king of Kosala. And Brahmadatta the king of Kāsi conquered and took over the army and transport and country (*janapadaṃ*)[5] and treasury and storehouse of Dīghīti the king of Kosala. . . . And Dīghīti with his consort[6] abode in Benāres in a certain outlying quarter in a potter's house in concealment in the guise of a wandering-ascetic.[7] [4] . . .[8] [18] Then Brahmadatta the king of Kāsi having entered Benāres caused his intimate councillors (*amacce-pārisajje*)[9] to meet and spoke thus: 'If, sirs (*bhaṇe*),[10] you should see the son of Dīghīti the king of Kosala, Prince Dīghāvu[11] (*Dīghāvukumāraṃ*),[12] what would you do to him?' Some of them spoke thus: 'We, my lord (*deva*),[13] would cut off his hands'; 'We, my lord, would cut off his feet'; 'We, my lord, would cut off his hands and feet'; 'We, my lord, would cut off his ears'; 'We, my lord, would cut off his nose'; 'We, my lord, would cut off his ears and nose'; 'We, my lord, would cut off his head'.[14] 'This, sirs,' said he, 'is the son of Dīghīti the king of Kosala, Prince Dīghāvu; it is not permissible to do anything to him.' . . .[15] [91] Then . . .[16] [Prince Dīghāvu said] 'What, my lord, my father at the time of his death said, "[Look][17] not long", signified "Do not keep enmity for long"; this indeed, my lord, my father at the time of his death said saying "Not long". What my father at the time of his death said, "Not short", signified "Do not be divided soon from friends"; this indeed, my lord, my father at the time of his death said saying "Not short". What my father at the time of his death said saying: "Not indeed, dear (*tāta*)[18] Dīghāvu, through enmity[19] are enmities appeased; but enmities, dear Dīghāvu, are appeased through non-enmity", signified . . . that my life now

[1] Kāsi seems here to be the name of the kingdom, not of the people; Int. § 123 n.

[2] The reign of King Brahmadatta is of great importance in the fabulous period of the *Jātaka* Birth-stories (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2). King Kiki is similarly important in the legendary history of Benāres (*Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 7; *Majjh. Nik.* ii, p. 49).

[3] 'Long-suffering'. Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [154] n, § 11 [ii. 3].

[4] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[5] Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1].

[6] The term here is *pajāpatī*; in a passage immediately above the queen's title is *mah-esī* (Ch. 1 § 8).

[7] *Paribbājaka*; Int. § 187.

[8] Dīghīti and his wife are betrayed at last to King Brahmadatta and executed. Their young son Dīghāvu escapes and secretly enters the king's service, becoming his lute-player (Int. § 190, *arts*) and charioteer. He drives the king to a lonely forest and there lulls him to sleep and draws his sword but refrains from slaying him. On the king's awaking the two forgive each other and swear mutual friendship.

[9] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1] (*courtiers*); and Int. § 172. For *pārisajja* cp. Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21] (*parisā*).

[10] Ch. 3 § 1; cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[11] 'Long-life.'

[12] Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92] n.

[13] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8].

[14] Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3]; and Int. § 190 (*punishments*).

[15] Omitting a statement that each has granted life to the other.

[16] Omitting questions.

[17] The phrase has been repeatedly used and is here abbreviated.

[18] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].

[19] These famous phrases appear in verse form as *Dhammapada* 5 (Ap. F 1 *b* § 4).

being granted by the king (*devena*)[1] and the king's life being granted by me,[2] thus enmity through non-enmity is appeased. This indeed, my lord, my father at the time of his death said saying: "... Enmities are appeased through non-enmity." ' [20] Then Brahmadatta ... returned to him his father's army and transport and country and treasury and storehouse and gave him his daughter. ...[3]

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 12* (*Lohicca-S.*).

[11] '...[4] Does not King Pasenadi[5] the Kosalan occupy Kāsi and Kosala (*Kāsi-Kosalaṃ*)?'[6] 'Even so, O (*bho*) Gotama.'[7] 'Now he who, Lohicca,[8] should say "King Pasenadi the Kosalan occupies Kāsi and Kosala; whatsoever the revenue and produce[9] of Kāsi and Kosala may be, let King Pasenadi the Kosalan alone enjoy it and not give anything to others"—would or would not he who should say this be a source of danger[10] to those, whether thyself or others, who depend upon King Pasenadi the Kosalan?' 'He would be a source of danger, O (*bho*) Gotama.' ... [13] 'In this regard[11] if a devotee or Brāhman[12] should come to possess a good principle (*kusalaṃ dhammaṃ*)[13] and should not inform another, thinking "[The idea of] what one man should do for another"[14] is as though a man having broken through an old bond (*bandhanaṃ*)[15] should form a new one, and such [altruistic] development[16] I call bad and of the nature of desire[17] (*lobha-dhammaṃ*) ..."—he who should say this would be a source of danger to those clansmen[18] who have come to the Doctrine and Discipline[19] made known by the Follower.[20] ...[21]

[1] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8].
[2] Dīghāvu had spared the sleeping king.
[3] Monks are advised to emulate these legendary kings in mildness and avoidance of dissension.
[4] The scene is Sālavatikā (Int. § 149). The Brāhman Lohicca who has been endowed by King Pasenadi with a royal estate (Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1], *gift*) entertains Buddha and maintains that one who has mastered a noble idea need not teach it. Buddha by examples convinces him. See Ch. 14 *f* § 10 [5].
[5] Int. § 169 (i).
[6] See § 4 below; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [111]; also Int. § 123 n; and Ch. 8 *j* § 2 (*Kāsi*). The long rivalry of Kāsi and Kosala ended with the conquest of Kāsi by King Kaṃsa, known as 'the conqueror of Benāres' (RDBI, p. 25), before the time of Buddha. Sisunāga the ancestor of Bimbisāra and founder of the Magadhan kingdom (V. A. Smith, *Oxford H. of I.*, pp. 45, 70) was apparently a fugitive from Benāres, possibly at this time; Int. § 158 (2).
[7] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).
[8] Ch. 14 *f* § 10 [1]; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2] n; and Ap. G 2 *c*. After opposing Buddha he becomes a lay disciple; Ch. 10 *c*, n.
[9] *Samudaya-sañjāti*; Int. § 189 (*revenues*).
[10] *Antarāya*; literally hindrance or prevention. Cp. MV, II. xv. 4 (Ch. 8 *b* § 7 [3]).
[11] *Idha*; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].
[12] Ap. A 2 *d* [21] n.
[13] Cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6].
[14] Cp. F 1 *b* § 7 (*kindness*).
[15] Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii).
[16] *Sampadā*, attainment; Ap. H 4 *a* § 2. Cp. *indriya-bhāvanā* (Ap. E *c* ii § 2).
[17] Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91] (*greed*).
[18] *Kula-puttā*; Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [3].
[19] Ch. 8 *d* § 8 [4].
[20] *Tathāgata*; Ap. A 2 *c*. This title seems to imply the developed and comparatively late theory of many Buddhas; IN 6 (*Canon*).
[21] The passage which follows is somewhat remotely exegetical and mentions the four stages culminating in Arahatship (Ap. D *c*) and proceeds with sectarian zeal to threaten dissentients with rebirth as animals or in Hell (Ap. B *a* § 6 [8]).

§ 4. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dassaka-nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 29. (PTS, v, p. 59.)*

[1] . . .[1] Wherever the Kāsis and Kosalas (*Kāsi-Kosalā*)[2] are, wherever the dominion (*vijitaṃ*)[3] of King Pasenadi[4] the Kosalan is, there King Pasenadi the Kosalan is announced as foremost. Yet even for King Pasenadi the Kosalan there is alteration (*aññathattaṃ*)[5] and decline (*viparināmo*).[6] . . .[7]

§ 5. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā), JN, p. 67.*

The five recluses[8] (*pañca pabbajitā*), headed by Kondañña, begging alms of food through villages, towns, and royal cities,[9] met the Bodhisatta. . . .[10] And during six years, while he undertook the Great Effort, they remained with him. . . . Then the band of five mendicants thought 'He was not able even by the austerity of six years to reach all-knowledge (*sabbaññutaṃ*). . . . What is he to us?' Then taking their robes and begging-bowls they left the Great One; and going eighteen leagues[11] away they entered Isipatana.[12]

§ 6. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26 (Ariya-pariyesana-S.).*

[PTS, i, p. 170.] '. . .[13] Then having stayed as long as I required at Uruvelā I went on my way towards Benāres.[14] . . . [p. 171] And journeying from place to place I came to Benāres, to Isipatana[15] the deer-park, where the Five Mendicants were. . . . Thereupon I said to the Five Mendicants: " . . . [p. 172] Hearken, mendicants, the Immortal (*amataṃ*)[16] has been attained. I teach, I show the Law.[17] If you walk as I teach you will ere long and in the present life learn fully for yourselves, realize and having attained abide in the supreme fulfilment[18] of the holy life. . . ."'

[1] The scene is not stated; Buddha addresses the brethren. See Ch. 14 *a* § 1.
[2] See § 3 [11] above.
[3] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5].
[4] Int. § 169 (i).
[5] Cp. Ch. 21 § 12 [48].
[6] Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]; and Ap. E *a* i (*anicca*).
[7] The Sutta states that Brahmā (Int. § 69) and the thousandfold world-system (Int. § 70 n) also suffer alteration and decline.
[8] Ch. 1 § 6 [57]. See Ch. 3 § 7.
[9] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4). Cp. Int. § 175 (*cities*). 'Royal cities' might be more literally rendered 'royal strongholds' or 'royal treasuries'; Int. § 189 (*revenues*).
[10] At Uruvelā.
[11] About 144 miles; Ch. 3 § 8 [68]. Cp. Ch. 2 § 7 [66].
[12] On the outskirts of Benāres; see §§ 6 [171], 10 [1], below.
[13] See Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [170].
[14] Ch. 5 *a* § 3 [5]; Ap. C *b* § 2 [8].
[15] Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171]; see § 5 above.
[16] The divine which is in all things and is their origin and end. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] (*dhamma-cakkhu*); also Ap. B *c* § 1 (1) where the 'divine vision' (*dibba-cakkhu*) may have meant originally the power to see all lives past and present as one (Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] *attha*).
[17] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].
[18] This ideal is 'extinction', i.e. transcendence of selfhood: Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1), *egoism*.

§ 7. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā), JN, pp. 81–2.*

[p. 81] The Five Mendicants saw the Leader[1] (*Tathāgataṃ*) from afar as he approached. . . . [p. 82] And the Blessed One filled them with his loving mind. . . . Then he pronounced to them the *Dhamma-cakka-ppavatana-Sutta* (Discourse of the starting of the wheel of the Law).[2] . . . Then on the fifth day he summoned the Five together and pronounced to them the *An-atta-lakkhaṇa-Suttanta* (Discourse on the absence of signs of [separate] Selves]).[3] . . . He sent forth the Sixty[4] [first disciples] in different directions saying 'Go forth, mendicant brothers, on your travel' . . . and he himself proceeded [on the way from Benāres] to Uruvelā.[5]

(ii) *Benāres revisited; topography*

§ 8. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 141 (Sacca-vibhaṅga-S.).*

[PTS, iii, p. 248.] Thus have I heard. At one time the Blessed One was staying at Benāres, at Isipatana[6] the deer-park. There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. 'Bhikkhus', he said; 'Venerable sir (*bhadante*)',[7] they replied hearkening to the Blessed One. The Blessed One spoke thus: 'At Benāres, at Isipatana the deer-park the Leader,[8] the Saint[9] all-enlightened, started the supreme wheel[10] of the Law . . .[11] that is the explanation of the four Noble Truths[12] by announcement . . .[13] and analysis. . . .[14]

Attend upon Sāriputta[15] and Moggallāna,[16] mendicant brothers; associate with Sāriputta and Moggallāna; wise[17] mendicants [such as they] are helpful[18] to those who lead the holy life (*brahma-cārīnaṃ*).[19] Just as[20] a mother, even so is Sāriputta; just as a child's foster-mother, even so is Moggallāna. Sāriputta, mendicant brothers, leads on to the fruit of conversion (*sota-patti-phale*),[21] Moggallāna leads on to the highest goal (*uttam-atthe*).[22] Sāriputta, mendicant brothers, is competent to announce . . . analyse and explain the four Noble Truths

[1] See Ch. 5 *b* § 1 [82].
[2] See Ch. 5 *b* § 1 [82].
[3] See Ch. 5 *b* § 2.
[4] See Ch. 6 *a* § 1.
[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 1.
[6] Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171]; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1] n.
[7] Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [2].
[8] Ap A 2 *c* (*Tathāgata*). The personal titles, the repetition of place-names, and the confused mention of devotees, gods, Māra and Brahmā, suggest that the date of the narrative is comparatively late; IN 6 (*Canon*).
[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 10 (*arahat*).
[10] Ch. 5 *b* § 1.
[11] Omitting 'not to be turned back by devotee or Brāhman (Ap. A 2 *d* [21]) by [celestial] spirit or Māra (Int. § 69) or Brahmā (Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]) or by any in the universe (*lokasmim*)'. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28] n.
[12] Ap. G 1 *a* (i).
[13] Omitting equivalents.
[14] The concise form of the First Sermon follows here (Ch. 5 *b* § 10 n).
[15] Ch. 10 *c* (2).
[16] Ch. 10 *c* (3).
[17] *Paṇḍitā*; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3).
[18] *Anuggāhakā*; literally, lifting up. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* 1 [1] (*compassion*).
[19] Cp. Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7].
[20] *Seyyathāpi*; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6] n.
[21] Ap. D *c* § 3 [6]. The fruit was doubtless arahatship; the two great disciples may be supposed to have reached the same height of teaching.
[22] Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]. 'Trains in the highest good', SBB, vi, p. 296.

by expansion.'[1] Thus spoke the Blessed One. Having thus spoken the Welfarer (*Sugato*)[2] rose from his seat and entered the lodge (*vihāraṃ*).[3] . . .[4]

§ 9. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Chakka-nipāta* (*the Sixes*), *Sutta 60.* (*PTS, iii, p. 392.*)

. . . The Blessed One stayed at Benāres, at Iṣipatana[5] the deer-park. At that time many elder (*therā*)[6] mendicant brothers after their meal[7] having returned from their begging round[8] were sitting assembled together in the circular hall (*maṇḍala-māle*)[9] holding discourse on the higher Law (*abhidhamma*[10]*-kathaṃ*). And there the venerable Citta[11] Hatthisāri-putta whilst the elder Bhikkhus were holding discourse on the higher Law continually interrupted their discourse. Then the venerable Mahā-koṭṭhita[12] spoke to the venerable Citta Hatthisāri-putta thus: ' . . . Let the venerable Citta await the conclusion[13] of a discourse.'[14] . . .[15]

§ 10. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 126.* (*PTS, i, p. 279.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Benāres at Isipatana[16] the deer-park. Then before noon the Blessed One having put on his under-robes and assumed his outer-robe[17] and alms-bowl entered Benāres[18] for alms (*piṇḍāya*). And the Blessed One whilst going round for alms in the market (*goyoga-pilakkhasmiṃ*)[19] saw a certain mendicant brother who took pleasure in empty and outward things . . . with faculties untrained, and having seen him said to him: 'Bhikkhu, Bhikkhu, make not thyself like what has turned sour (*katuviyaṃ*).[20] The self (*attānaṃ*) that has become like what has turned sour

[1] Or, in detail. Ch. 10 *c* (10) n.
[2] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].
[3] Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13]. This may have been a separate hut or the main building of a monastery; Ch. 8 *g*. Cp. § 16 [2] below.
[4] Sāriputta explains the Four Truths in detail, using the same words as are attributed to Buddha elsewhere (Ch. 9 *a* § 9 n), except that the second and third Truths are stated here without commentary.
[5] Int. § 126.
[6] Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 2; and Ap. A 1 *b* (2).
[7] Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7].
[8] 'Who had returned from alms-gathering, and fed', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 280. Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2].
[9] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11]. This *maṇḍala-māla* is mentioned also in Suttas 28 and 61 of the Sixes; in the latter Sutta Buddha's presence at Isipatana is also recorded.
[10] Metaphysics; or the implications of the law. Cp. Ap. A 1 *a*.
[11] See *Dīgha* 9 (i, p. 190); SBB, p. 256. He is to be distinguished from Citta the householder; Ch. 10 *c* (63).
[12] Ap. A 1 *b* (5).
[13] *Pariyosāna*; Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [161]; cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].
[14] Or, speech; Ap. H 3 *a*.
[15] Citta afterwards falls away but eventually attains clear knowledge and becomes an *arahat*.
[16] See § 5 above. No mention is made of the river Barna, a considerable stream which lies between the spot marked by Asoka's pillar and the modern city of Benāres. Possibly some part of the ancient city lay on the east bank of the Barna.
[17] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
[18] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1).
[19] Literally, cattle-tethering or ox-yoking tree; apparently the centre of a market-place.
[20] The precise meaning is doubtful.

"reeking[1] with the odour of flesh (*āma-gandhe*),[2] such surely the flies will settle upon; such they will not quit"—this is not possible (*n'etaṃ thānaṃ vijjati*).[3] [2] . . .[4] [3] Like what has turned sour is covetousness;[5] the odour of flesh[6] is ill-will;[7] the flies are bad and evil[8] notions'.[9] . . .[10]

§ 11. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya*, *Mahā-vagga*, *Sotapatti-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ*. 55), *Sutta* 53 (*Dhammadinna-S*.). (*PTS*, *v*, *p*. 406.)

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . in the deer-park. [2] . . .[11] Seated at one side Dhammadinna the lay-disciple[12] spoke thus to the Blessed One: [3] 'Let the Blessed One, revered sir, address us; let the Blessed One direct us, which would long be for our profit and happiness.'[13] 'Therefore[14] in this regard, Dhammadinna, thus should ye train[15] yourselves saying: "We will live acquiring from time to time whatever discourses (*suttanta*)[16] have been spoken by the Leader,[17] profound, profound in meaning,[18] belonging to the highest sphere,[19] relating to that which is void[20] [of the characteristics of individuality]. . . ." '[21]

§ 12 (i). *Vinaya-Piṭaka*, *Mahā-vagga*, *V*. *vii*, *viii*; *VI*. *xxiii*, *xxiv*; *VIII*. *xiv*.

[v. vii. 1.] Then when the Blessed One had stayed as long as he required at Rājagaha[22] he set forth on the way[23] (*cārikaṃ*) towards

[1] *Ava-ssuta*, oozing; cp. *ā-sava*, taint (Ap. D *a* § 7).
[2] Corruption or defilement; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3. See [3] below.
[3] Ap. E *b* § 3 (1).
[4] Buddha on his return narrates the incident and is requested to explain.
[5] *Abhijjhā*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2].
[6] *Āmagandha*; see [1] n above.
[7] *Vyāpāda*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).
[8] Ap. B *b* § 3 [6].
[9] *Vitakkā*; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. These are delusive notions regarding self; (cp. Ap. D *a* § 10, ii, *delusion*); the three faults specified correspond to the Three Fires.
[10] Verses follow containing phrases loosely quoted above.
[11] Five hundred lay disciples visit Buddha; Int. § 121.
[12] The spiritual side of a layman's duties is defined in this discourse; in *Dīgha* 31 the practical side is emphasized (Ch. 9 *b*).
[13] Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [2].
[14] *Tasmā*, 'from this'; Ch. 21 § 14 [50]. Reasons apparently have been given but are omitted from the discourse in its present form.
[15] Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3].
[16] Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*.
[17] *Tathāgata*; Ap. A 2 *c*.
[18] *Gambhir-attha*; cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] (*attha*).
[19] *Lok-uttara*, unworldly, spiritual; see *Majjn*. 96 and 122 (PTS, ii, p. 181, iii, p. 115). In the *Abhidhamma-Piṭ*. the word is used frequently with the meaning 'metaphysical', but in the earlier books of the Canon this meaning can scarcely apply (Ap. G 1 *a*, *views*). For *loka* see Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
[20] *Suñña-ta*, literally emptiness; Ap. E *c* i § 9, 6th verse. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [266] (*solitudes*); also Ch. 21 § 7 [25] (*outward-things*), and § 11 [33] (4, *space-infinity*). '*Suñña-Nibbāna*', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 348 n. *Majjh*. 121 and 122 (*Mahā-suññata-S*. i and ii) treat respectively of Infinitude and Solitude. Compare also Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45] (*not this*); Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*) and § 7 (*uncreated*). This abstract notion resembles the *Neti*, *neti* (*Not so*, *not so*) of Vedāntic idealistic monism; W. S. Urquhart, *The Upanishads and Life* (Calc. 1916), pp. 47, 132, 133.
[21] Dhammadinna points out the difficulties (Ch. 13 *d* § 8 n) in the way of laymen and Buddha then is said to prescribe four guiding principles (Ap. G 1 *b*), as elsewhere in the *Sotapatti-saṃyutta* of *Saṃ*. *Nik*. (Ap. H 1 § 6); see Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [5] n.
[22] Int. § 125.
[23] Ch. 3 § 5 [166] (*stages*); Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [iv, 6], § 12 [v, i].

Benāres . . [1]. [viii. 1] Then having stayed as long as he required at Benāres the Blessed One set forth on the way towards Bhaddiya.[2] . . .[3]

[vi. xxiii. 1.] Then when the Blessed One had stayed as long as he required at Rājagaha he set forth on the way towards Benāres. . . .[4] [xxiv. 1] Then having stayed as long as he required at Benāres the Blessed One set forth on the way towards Andhakavinda[5] together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers, twelve hundred and fifty[6] Bhikkhus. . . .[7]

[viii. xiv. 1.] Then when the Blessed One had stayed as long as he required at Vesāli[8] he set forth on the way towards Benāres. . . .[9] [xv. 1] Then having stayed as long as he required at Benāres the Blessed One set forth on the way towards Sāvatthi.[10] . . .

(ii) *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Sutta-vibhaṅga, Mahā-vibhaṅga, Pārājika I, iv* (*Vin. Piṭ., Oldenberg, III, p. 11*)

Then when he had stayed as long as he required at Verañjā[11] (*Verañjāyaṃ*) the Blessed One returning to Sorreyya,[12] Saṃkassa,[13] and Kaṇṇakujjā[14] came to where the Payāgapa-ford[15] was, and having arrived at the Payāgapa-ford he crossed the river Ganges[16] and went on to Benāres. Then having stayed as long as he required at Benāres the Blessed One set forth on the way towards Vesāli.[17] . . .[18]

§ 13. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 94* (*Ghoṭamukha-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 157.] . . . The venerable Udena[19] was staying at Benāres

1 In Benāres Buddha passes orders regarding foot-gear (Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [29]).

2 Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [1].

3 At Bhaddiya Buddha passes further orders regarding foot-gear.

4 In Benāres Buddha passes orders forbidding the eating of flesh; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [14] (2).

5 Ch. 11 *d* § 11 [1].

6 Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1].

7 At Andhakavinda Buddha passes orders regarding meals; Ch. 8 *j* (*food*).

8 Ch. 12.

9 At Benāres Buddha passes orders on clothing; Ch. 8 *j* (*apparel*).

10 Int. § 138; see Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [1] n.

11 Int. §§ 155, 157; Ch. 10 *d* (12th *vassa*); Ch. 16 *d* § 1. Sutta 42 of *Majjh. Nik.* is named after this place. Sutta 53 of the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* states that a highroad connected Verañjā and Madhura (Int. § 155; Ch. 17 *b* § 1; RDBI, p. 36). See also *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, pp. 172, 197; *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 1.

12 CV, xii. i. 9 records that the venerable Revata stayed here at the time of the second Great Council.

13 CV, xii. i. 9; and Ch. 10 *d* § 1 (*seventh vassa*) n.

14 Kanauj. CV, xii. i. 9. These four places lay in a line between the rivers Jamna and Ganges in what is now known as the Doāb and appear to have been within the Kuru or Pañcāla country (Ch. 16 *b* § 1 n).

15 *Titthāna*, a crossing-place or ferry; cp. Ch. 20 § 11 [32] (*steps*). He seems to have crossed the Ganges higher up than the junction with the Jamna. If so the remaining journey by road or river to Benāres was considerable—These bare accounts of long journeys on administrative business are evidence at least of the ancient routes (IN 11 *a*).

16 Int. § 121.

17 Ch. 12.

18 A long narrative leading up to the first *Pārājika* rule (Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [1]) follows.

19 He apparently is not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* There was a devout layman of this name at Sāvatthi (MV, iii. 5); and the ruler of Kosambi was Rāja Udena (Ch. 15 *b* § 14).

in the Khemiy-ambavana.[1] Now at that time Ghoṭamukha[2] the Brāhman[3] had reached Benāres on some business. [158] And Ghoṭamukha the Brāhman strolling[4] and wandering on foot came to the Khemiyambavana. Now at that time the venerable Udena was walking to and fro[5] in the open air. And Ghoṭamukha . . . walking to and fro at one side[6] spoke to the venerable Udena. . . .[7] When he had spoken the venerable Udena withdrawing from his walk entered the lodge (*vihāraṃ*)[8] and sat down on the seat prepared[9] (*paññatte*). Ghoṭamukha the Brāhman also withdrawing from the walk entered the lodge and stood at one side.[10] And the venerable Udena spoke thus to Ghoṭamukha the Brāhman as he stood at one side: 'Here, Brāhman, are seats; if you wish be seated.' 'Thus indeed is it; we who are visitors of the respected (*bhoto*)[11] Udena do not take a seat [unbidden]. How indeed should one like me think it right to sit down on a seat beforehand unbidden?' Then Ghoṭamukha the Brāhman taking some low (*nīcaṃ*)[12] seat sat down at one side. . . .[13] [162] 'Where then, O (*bho*) Udena', said the Brāhman, 'does the revered (*bhavaṃ*)[14] Gotama the saint all-enlightened now abide?' 'Brāhman', he replied, 'that Blessed One the saint all-enlightened is now dead.' . . .[15] [163] 'The ruler of Aṅga (*Aṅga-rājā*)[16] grants me a daily pension (*nicca-bhikkhaṃ*),[17] O (*bho*) Udena, from which I would grant a pension to the respected Udena.' . . .[18] 'It is not fitting, Brāhman, for us to accept gold and silver.'[19] . . .[20] Then Ghoṭamukkha the Brāhman with that pension and further [sums] caused to be built in Pātaliputta for the Community (*saṃghassa*) an attendance-hall (*upaṭṭhānasālaṃ*),[21] which now is called the Ghoṭamukkhī.

[1] Peace-mango-grove; Int. § 121; cp. Int. § 130.
[2] He becomes a lay-follower and benefactor; Ch. 10 *c*, n.
[3] The passage following seems intended to depict conscious inferiority of status. Int. § 185; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [26].
[4] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*roaming*).
[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [4].
[6] Conventional courtesies as in Ch. 20 § 11 [29].
[7] The Brāhman questions the sincerity of religious retirement so far as he knows it as yet.
[8] Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13].
[9] Here plainly the chief seat (Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [13]).
[10] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].
[11] Ch. 23 *a* [7] (*bhavaṃ*); and Ch. 19 *d* § 2 [3].
[12] Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482].
[13] A discussion on worldly life and retirement ensues and the Brāhman is convinced.
[14] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].
[15] The Brāhman becomes a lay-disciple.
[16] Apparently a representative of the Magadhan king. Int. § 162; cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [ii. 1] n. 'The king of the Aṅga country', SBB, vi, p. 92.
[17] Ch. 18 *c* § 5 [5]. Literally, constant alms. Evidently paid to him not as a priest but as a minister or civil servant (Int. § 172).
[18] He states that his daily pension is 500 'kahāpaṇas'; Int. § 189 (*money*). If one places the approximate modern value of the copper *kahāpaṇa* at one anna or about a penny some intelligible calculations can be built up though doubtless with insecure foundations; Ch. 14 *c* § 9 n; Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [475]. Cp. RDBI, p. 101.
[19] Or money. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10).
[20] Udena suggests that the Brāhman should confer a benefaction on the Order.
[21] Ch. 10 *a* § 11; Ch. 20 § 2 [6]. 'Assembly-hall', SBB, vi, p. 93. Compare the *āvasath-āgāra* mentioned in Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2].

(iii). *The Kāsi Country: minor townships and tours*

§ 14. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 70 (Kītāgiri-S.).*

[PTS, ii, p. 473.] . . . The Blessed One was proceeding on a journey among the Kāsis (*Kāsīsu*) together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers. Then the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'I indeed, Bhikkhus, fare without an evening-meal;[1] now faring without an evening-meal I find freedom from sickness, freedom from ill-health, lightness, strength, and a state of comfort (*phāsu-vihāraṃ*).[2] Come ye also, Bhikkhus; fare ye too without an evening-meal; then faring without an evening-meal ye also will find freedom from sickness . . . and a state of comfort.' . . . Then the Blessed One journeying by stages[3] (*anupubbena*) among the Kāsis came to where there was a township[4] of the Kāsis called Kīṭāgiri.[5] And the Blessed One stayed there at Kīṭāgiri the Kāsi township. . .[6]

§ 15. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, IX, i.*

[1] At that time the Enlightened and Blessed One (*Buddho Bhagavā*)[7] was staying at Campā[8] on the bank of the Gaggara lotus-pool. And at that time there was among the Kāsis in the country parts (*jana-padesu*)[9] a [place] Vāsabhagāma[10] by name. There a mendicant brother Kassapa-gotta[11] by name was resident, bound [as it were] by a string,[12] busying himself saying 'Now earnest Bhikkhus who have not yet arrived may come, and earnest Bhikkhus having come should dwell at ease,[13] and this sojourn (*āvāso*), may [help them to] attain growth,[14] increase, and fullness.'[15] And at that time many Bhikkhus journeying among the Kāsis came to Vāsabha-gāma; and

[1] Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10]; and Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (25).
[2] Cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [3] (*unease*); and Ap. F 2 *b*, n.
[3] Ch. 3 § 5 [166]. [4] *Nigama*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).
[5] Or, Kīṭāgiri; Int. § 151. See also CV, I. xiii; VI. xvi, xvii; *Vin. Piṭ.* iii, pp. 179, 180 (*Saṃghādisesa* XIII).
[6] Two notoriously unruly monks (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*, *Dissentients*), Assaji and Punabbasuka, residing here refuse to comply and are admonished by Gotama. The township is always associated with the ill-behaviour of these two, whose misdeeds are specified in CV, I. xiii and include such amusements as games with eight pieces and ten pieces (with a board of 64 or 100 squares), hop-scotch, dice, chariot-races, marbles, thought-reading and mimicry, swordmanship, wrestling and boxing. The whole list is found also in the *Majjhima-Sīla* (SBE, xi, pp. 192–3; *Dīgha-Nik.* i, p. 6); Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note* (*Sīla*), and Int. § 190 (*Sports*).
[7] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 1], § 13 [1]; Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [5]; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [1]; also Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (534) n; Ch. 14 *c* § 11 [2] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [11] n; Ap. A 1 *b* (10). The title Buddha does not seem to have been in use among Gotama's personal followers. The context suggests the comparative lateness of the passage. [8] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1].
[9] Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [101]. Cp. § 1 [36] above; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; also Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2].
[10] Int. § 151. [11] For *gotta* see Ap. E *b* § 2 [5]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1] n.
[12] 'By the string (of the religious duties which he had to perform there)', SBE, xvii, p. 256. [13] Ch. 20 § 2 [6] (7).
[14] *Vuddhi*, prosperity; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].
[15] These three terms make up a formula used to express moral progress or merely development; MV, I. xxxii. 1, and *Saṃ. Nik.* iii, p. 53 (Ap. E *b* § 3 [1]).

the mendicant brother Kassapa-gotta saw those Bhikkhus from afar as they approached, and seeing them he assigned [for each] a place, prepared water for the feet,[1] a footstool, and towel; and having gone to meet them took from them bowl and robe, then inquired about drinking-water, and made busy with bath[2] and with rice-gruel,[3] and solid food[4] for the meal. . . .[5] [4] Then the mendicant brother Kassapa-gotta folded his bedding,[6] assumed outer-robe and bowl and departed . . . and by stages arrived at Campā where the Blessed One was. . . .[7]

§ 16. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 22) Sutta 90 (Channa). (PTS, iii, p. 132.)*

[1] At one time many mendicant brothers were staying at Benāres at Isipatana[8] the deer-park. [2] And the venerable Channa[9] in the evening having risen from quiet [contemplation][10] took a key[11] and going from lodge to lodge[12] spoke to the elder Bhikkhus thus: 'Let the venerable elders preach to me, let the venerable elders instruct me, let the venerable elders discourse to me on the Law, so that I may perceive the Law.'[13] . . .[14] [6] Then the venerable Channa thought: '. . . What now if I were to go to where the venerable Ānanda[15] is?' [7] Then the venerable Channa folded his bedding[16] assumed outer-robe and bowl and went to the Ghosita Garden at Kosambi[17] where the venerable Ānanda was. . . .[18]

[1] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10]; Ch. 11 *d* § 9.

[2] *Nahāna*; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6]; and Int. § 190. Cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [6].

[3] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8].

[4] *Khādaniya*, Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4]. Meat and fish being prohibited, solid (or dry) food as distinguished from soft (or fresh) food would consist of grain; Ch. 6 *a* § 12.

[5] The visitors misuse the monk's hospitality and finally suspend (*ukkhipiṃsu*) him for not acknowledging error; Ap. H 3 *b* (*Penalties*).

[6] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]. 'Put his resting-place in order', SBE, xvii, p. 258.

[7] He lays his case before Buddha and is exonerated; the other party follows and is censured. The delinquents' sins are confessed and pardoned in well-known formulas; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99] (*confession*).

[8] Int. § 126.

[9] He has been identified improbably with Channa the charioteer (Ch. 2 § 4 n), with Channa who committed suicide (Ch. 11 *c* § 6) and with the Channa whose punishment was fixed by the dying Buddha (Ch. 22 *b* § 24 n). He may have been the author of *Psalm* lxix, but the commentary attached thereto scarcely seems applicable (*Brethren*, p. 70).

[10] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

[11] *Avāpurana*; apparently a crooked stick for opening latches. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119] (*bolt*).

[12] See § 8 [248] above.

[13] Dhamma; IN 5 *b*.

[14] The elders speak to him of the transience of the five Khandhas (Ap. E *a* ii) constituting the individual. Channa perceives, but feels that something is lacking and asks himself 'What then is my self (*ko me attā ti*)?' Ch. 5 *c* §§ 2 [42], 3 [45].

[15] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[16] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2].

[17] *Kosambi-Ghositārāma*; Ch. 15 *b* (i).

[18] After Channa's account of his experiences Ānanda satisfies him by repeating the discourse given by Buddha to Mahā-Kaccāna on 'being' and 'not being' (as in Ap. B *c* § 5) and on what is elsewhere called 'dependent origination' (Ap. B *c*) tracing sorrow back to ignorance (*avijjā*) and individuality (*saṃkhārā*). The first of these two cruxes perhaps may be interpreted as meaning that individual life is real but delusory and is not as it appears. The second may be interpreted as meaning that within the fundamental unity (cp. Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*, *māyā*) the parts acquire individuality and assume desirous selfhood which is the cause of all sorrow.

b. THE VAṂSA[1] KINGDOM; KOSAMBI AND THE VACCHAS[2]

(i) *Kosambi*[3] *visited by Buddha; topography*

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka*, *Dīgha-Nikāya*, *Sutta 7* (*Jāliya-S.*).

[1] 'Thus was it heard by me. At one time the Blessed One was staying at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden (*Ghosit-ārāme*).[4] And two ascetics (*pabbajitā*),[5] Mandissa the Wanderer,[6] and Jāliya a Dārupattika[7] pupil,[8] came to where the Blessed One was. . . .[9] Standing at one side[10] they spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'What now, friend Gotama (*āvuso Gotama*),[11] is the soul[12] [the same as] the body or is the soul other than the body? . . .'[13] [5] 'The Bhikkhu', he replied, 'who fully knows and perceives that "there is no [separate existence] beyond this (*nāparaṃ itthattāyā-ti*)"[14]—would it now be fitting (*kallaṃ*)[15] for him to declare this: "The soul is [the same as] the body", or "The soul is other than the body"? . . .[16] Now I, friends (*āvuso*),[17] know this, I perceive this; and I now do not declare: "The soul is [the same as] the body", or "The soul is other than the body." ' . . .[18]

[1] Or, Vatsa (RDBI, p. 3). Int. § 158 (8).

[2] 'The Vacchas or Vaṃsas of Kosambi', RDBI, p. 7. 'Vaṃsa is the country of the Vacchas, of which Kosambi, properly only the name of the capital, is the more familiar name', RDBI, p. 27. 'Kosambi, the capital of the Vatsas or Vaṃsas . . . was on the Jumna, and thirty leagues, say 230 miles, by river from Benāres', RDBI, p. 36.

[3] Int. §§ 143, 150; Ch. 10 *d*, 9th *vassa*; Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [7]. 'Identified by Cunningham with the two villages of Kosam on the Jumna, some ninety miles west of Allahabad', ThB, p. 15. Kosambi was an important trade-centre on the route between the west coast and the countries of the Middle-land; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36] n (*Māhissati*). Kosambi figures frequently in the *Sutta-vibhaṅga* of *Vin. Piṭ.* as the scene of disciplinary pronouncements. Ch. 12 *c* § 4 n.

[4] Int. § 144; also Ch. 7 *a* § 10 (*ārāma*); Ch. 19 *b* § 1 [VII. ii. 1]. See also *Saṃ. Nik.* v, pp. 224, 229; *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 82, iii, p. 132, iv, p. 262—where further visits by Buddha to the Garden are recorded. In the course of two of these (*Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 82 and iv, p. 262) the qualities and duties of women are enumerated (Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]).

[5] Ch. 1 § 9.

[6] Int. § 126.

[7] 'Wooden-bowl.'

[8] *Antevāsin*; Ch. 8 *g* § 4 (*assistant*).

[9] As in Ch. 20 § 11 [29].

[10] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].

[11] Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2). For *āvuso* see Ch. 3 § 5 [163].

[12] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

[13] Buddha's reply commences with an explanation of the Buddhist learner's outlook, as in *Dīgha* 2, §§ 40–75 (SBB, ii, pp. 78–84; see Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [33] n, and Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n). This is followed by a brief exposition of the four Jhānas (Ap. I *a*) and Buddha states that they do not incline the adept to consider the difference between soul and body.

[14] Ch. 4 § 17. 'After this present life there will be no beyond', SBB, ii, p. 204. In this passage the essential distinction between the monistic (Vedantist) and the individualistic (Soul) theories is evident; Ch. 21 § 16 (*perishable*).

[15] 'Would that make him ready to take up the question', SBB, ii, pp. 203, 294.

[16] Gotama's two interlocutors reply in the negative, or according to some manuscripts affirmatively. There has been a series of similar questions which they have answered in the affirmative, being unpersuaded till the conclusion.

[17] Ch. 3 § 5 [163].

[18] As in Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29]. The whole of this Sutta appears also in *Dīgha* 6 (§§ 15–19) with additions. The compressed 2nd section also appears as §§ 40–75 of *Dīgha* 2. On the general principle that Canonical borrowers do not abbreviate but expand one may judge that *Dīgha* 6 borrowed from *Dīgha* 7 and *Dīgha* 2 from both; IN 6 (*Canon*).

§ 2. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 76 (Sandaka-S.).*

[PTS, i, p. 513.] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden.[1] Now at that time Sandaka the Wanderer[2] was dwelling at the Pilakkha Cave[3] (*Pilakkha-guhāyaṃ*) with a great party[4] of Wanderers. . . .[5] And the venerable Ānanda[6] in the evening having risen from quiet [contemplation][7] addressed[8] the mendicant brothers saying 'Come, friends, let us go to the Devakaṭa-pool[9] to see the cave. . . . Now at that time Sandaka the Wanderer was sitting with a great party of Wanderers who were noisily with much shouting and great uproar holding varied and vulgar[10] talk. . . .[11] [p. 524] 'These ascetics (*ājīvikā*),'[12] [said Sandaka to the venerable Ānanda], 'are sons of [a cause] whose children are dead; they merely extol themselves and contemn others, and three Guides forsooth show forth[13] [this method], namely Nanda Vaccha, Kisa Saṇkicca, Makkhali Gosāla.'[14] Then Sandaka the Wanderer exhorted his own party (*parisaṃ*)[15] saying: 'Come, sirs (*bhonto*),[16] the holy life is lived with the devotee Gotama; though now it is not easy for us to give up gain,[17] honour, and reputation.' Thus Sandaka the Wanderer dissolved his own party in the holy-life under the Blessed One.

[1] Int. § 144.

[2] Int. § 126; see below § 4 [1]. Compare *Ājīvika* in [524] below. Sandaka became a believer (Ch. 10 *c*).

[3] Int. §§ 129, 144.

[4] *Parisā*; cp. Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21] (*sessions*).

[5] Omitting the conventional number 500 (Int. § 121).

[6] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; see below §§ 3, 4, 5, 6 [3], 15.

[7] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

[8] *Āmantesi*; the verb is used of authoritative speech (Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1]).

[9] *Sobha* means pool or pond or tank. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169].

[10] *Tiracchāna*; literally, crawling or animal; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [3] n. See *Gradual Sayings*, v, pp. 86–7. Cp. § 4 [2] (*informal*) below; and Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 [5] (*talk*).

[11] Sandaka quiets the noisy assemblage and invites Ānanda to be seated and to discourse on the tenets of his teacher. Ānanda specifies four theories opposed to the Teacher's doctrine: (i) the theory of non-existence (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i [23]), (ii) the theory that there is no evil or good (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i [17]), (iii) the theory of causeless evil and good (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i [20]), (iv) the theory of seven elements combined temporarily by predestination (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i [26]). Thereafter he explains the general outlook of the Buddhist convert and then the four Jhānas culminating in liberation from the Āsavas, as in *Dīgha* 2 (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i [33] n). Sandaka is convinced.

[12] Int. § 183. The term *ājīvika* is here used as equivalent to *paribbājaka* (see [513] above). Makkhali Gosāla who here is classed as an Ājīvika is termed elsewhere a *tiṭṭhiya* (Ch. 22 *b* § 15, *sects*). Sañjaya also is termed both *tiṭṭhiya* and *paribbājaka* (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]).

[13] 'Yet have only produced three shining lights', SBB, v, p. 371.

[14] Int. § 183. These three are here classed as *ājīvikā* (Ch. 5 *a* § 4 [7]). In *Majjh.* 36 (i, p. 238) all three are termed *acelakā*, i.e. 'unclothed' (Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15]). They are also mentioned together in the Sixes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 384) where Pūraṇa Kassapa (Int. § 179) is said to have classed them in the 'purest white' grade or the highest of the six orders reckoned by colours (Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx. 3] n). The first two seem otherwise unknown.

[15] Cp. Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21] (*sessions*).

[16] *Bhonto* is the vocative pl. of *bhavaṃ* (Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]), nom. sing. of *bhavant*.

[17] *Labha*; Ch. 16 *d* § 4 [1] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 2: Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 2 (*gain and fame*).

§ 3. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-nipāta (the Fives), Sutta 159. (PTS, iii, p. 184.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden.[1] And at that time the venerable Udāyin[2] was seated surrounded by a great gathering of householders[3] (*gihi-parisāya*)[4] and making plain the Law. . . . And the venerable Ānanda[5] spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The venerable Udāyin, revered sir, is . . . making plain the Law [to householders].' 'It is indeed not easy, Ānanda,' he replied, 'to make plain[6] (*desetuṃ*) the Law to others. The Law, Ānanda, must be made plain to others by one who is attended by five qualities (*dhamme*)[7] in himself before making it plain to others. What five? [2] The Law must be made plain to others by one who thinks (1) I will hold discourse progressively[8] (*anupubbi-kathaṃ*); (2) I will hold discourse keeping in view method[9] [of thought or illustration]; (3) I will hold discourse proceeding (*paṭicca*)[10] from pity[11] (*anudayatā*); (4) I will not hold discourse from motives of profit;[12] (5) I will hold discourse not hurting[13] others or myself. . . .[14]

§ 4. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Sattaka-nipāta (the Sevens), Sutta 40. (PTS, iv, p. 37.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden.[15] And the venerable Ānanda[16] in the forenoon . . .[17] entered Kosambi for alms. Then the venerable Ānanda thought: 'It is full early[18] yet to go round for alms in Kosambi. . . .' And the venerable Ānanda went where the garden (*ārāmo*)[19] of wandering philosophers[20] of different sects[21] (*añña-tiṭṭhiyānaṃ*) was. . . . [2] Now at that time among those Wanderers of different sects sitting assembled there this informal conversation (*antara-kathā*)[22] arose: 'If any one leads

[1] Int. § 144.

[2] Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [1]. The name is common; see *Brethren*, p. 287. Cp. Ch. 10 *c* (38). *Majjh.* 79 is named after Sakul-Udāyin the Wanderer who is addressed as Udāyin by Buddha and enters the order.

[3] Or, laymen: Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2]; Ch. 14 *f* § 3.

[4] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21] (*sessions*).

[5] See § 2 above.

[6] To show, or teach. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*show*).

[7] Ch. 12 *c* § 6 [1].

[8] Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; but the 'comprehensive discourse' in the MPS (Ch. 20 § 8) presents a clearer order.

[9] *Pariyāya*; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 7. 'With the way in view', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 136.

[10] Ap. B *c* (*dependent*).

[11] i.e. an altruistic motive; Int. § 3 (*non-egoism*). Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [7]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8]; cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] (*anukampā*).

[12] *Na āmis-antara*; not actuated by gain or personal advantage. The same is said of physicians; MV, VIII. XXVI. 7. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 2 (*gain*); Ap. C *b* § 9 (*attain*); and Ap. B *a* § 6 [9] (*gifts*); also Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [4] (*disinterested*).

[13] By denunciation or by flattery; by enmity, falsehood, or greed.

[14] Omitting repetition.

[15] Int. § 144.

[16] See § 2 above.

[17] As in Ch. 11 *c* § 9 [1].

[18] *Ati-ppago*.

[19] Int. § 126.

[20] See § 2 [513] above.

[21] Ch. 8 *a* [1].

[22] Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2]. Cp. § 2 [513] (*vulgar*) above.

for twelvey ears a full pure holy-life[1] is it sufficient for saying "he is a distinguished[2] Bhikkhu"'?[3] . . .[4]

§ 5. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta* (*the Fours*), *Sutta 241.* (*PTS, ii, p. 239.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden.[5] . . . And the Blessed One spoke thus to the venerable Ānanda[6] seated at one side: 'And now, Ānanda, is that dispute[7] pacified?' 'How, revered sir, shall that dispute be pacified? The venerable Anuruddha's pupil,[8] revered sir, Bāhiya[9] by name, is altogether set on splitting up the Community (*saṅgha-bhedāya*). On this the venerable Anuruddha[10] does not think a single word need be spoken.' 'When now, Ānanda, does Anuruddha join in disputes amongst the Community? Do not you, Ānanda, thyself and Sāriputta[11] and Moggallāna[12] pacify whatever disputes arise?' [2] . . .[13]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 22*), *Sutta 81* (*Pārileyya*). (*PTS, iii, p. 94.*)

[1] The Blessed One was staying . . . in the Ghosita Garden.[14] . . . [3] And a certain mendicant brother shortly after the Blessed One had gone forth came to the venerable Ānanda[15] . . . and said: 'The Blessed One here, friend Ānanda, having by himself folded his bedding[16] and assumed outer-robe and bowl, without instructing his attendants (*upaṭṭhāke*)[17] and without notifying the mendicant assembly is going forth on a journey (*cārikaṃ*) alone.' [4] 'When, friend, the Blessed One . . . goes forth on a journey alone without another, then the Blessed One desires to dwell alone. At such a time the Blessed One must not be joined by anyone. [5] And the Blessed One journeying by stages[18] went on to Pārileyyaka,[19] and there at Pārileyyaka the

[1] *Brahmacariya* is used of non-Buddhist as well as of Buddhist religious life; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2].

[2] *Niddasa*; marked out, remarkable. 'Praiseworthy', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, pp. 21–2; similarly in the preceding Sutta, iv, p. 20.

[3] The term is here used of non-Buddhists; Ch. 5 *c* § 8 [32] n.

[4] Buddha later lays down seven grounds of distinction, namely belief, shame, conscience, learning, energy (*viriya*), mindfulness (*sati*), and insight. Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [91] n.

[5] Int. § 144.

[6] See § 2 above; Ch. 22 *b* § 8 [16] n.

[7] *Adhi-karaṇa*; transaction or case. See below, § 10 [152] (*strife*).

[8] *Saddhi-vihārin*, dwelling with; Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6].

[9] The context indicates that this contentious person was still a junior. It is not impossible that he was the Bāhiya who became an Arahat (*Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 63, v, p. 165); cp. Ch. 10 *c* (29).

[10] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[11] Ch. 10 *c* (2).

[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 16.

[13] Buddha points out four incentives of dissentients in the Order—evil ways, wrong views, wrong pursuits, and desire for gain and honour.

[14] Int. § 144.

[15] See § 2 above.

[16] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2]. See § 10 [153] below.

[17] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1] n.

[18] Ch. 3 § 5 [166].

[19] Or, Pārileyya. The context suggests that the spot was near Kosambi (Int. § 150). MV, x. iii–iv (see § 11 [iv. 6] below) expands the Pārileyyaka incident beyond the bounds of verisimilitude; IN 6 (*Canon*).

Blessed One stayed at the foot of a Sāl-tree.[1] [6] And many mendicant brothers drew near to where the venerable Ānanda was . . . [7] and spoke thus: 'It is long, friend Ānanda, since we have heard a discourse[2] on the Law from the mouth of the Blessed One; we wish, friend Ānanda, to hear a discourse on the Law from the mouth of the Blessed One.' [8] And the venerable Ānanda with those mendicant brothers went to Pārileyyaka to the foot of the Sāl-tree where the Blessed One was. . . .[3]

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 35), Sutta 200 (Dārukkhandha 1). (PTS, iv, p. 179.)*

[1] The Blessed One stayed at Kosambi on the bank of the river Ganges.[4] . . .[5]

§ 8. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sacca-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 56), Sutta 31 (Siṃsapā). (PTS, v, p. 437.)*

[1] The Blessed One stayed at Kosambi in the Siṃsapā-grove.[6] . . .[7]

§ 9. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 22), Sutta 89 (Khema). (PTS, iii, p. 126.)*

[1] At one time many elder (*therā*)[8] Bhikkhus were staying at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden.[9] [2] Now at that time the venerable Khemaka[10] was staying in the Badarika Garden (*Badarik-ārāme*)[11] ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted.[12] [3] And the elder Bhikkhus . . . instructed the venerable Dāsaka[13] saying 'Come, friend Dāsaka; go to where the mendicant brother Khemaka is and say thus. . . .[14] [7] "The elders, friend Khemaka, say to thee thus: 'Friend, these five grasping-aggregates (*upādāna-kkhandhā*),[15] as they are called by the Blessed One . . .[16]—in these five grasping-aggregates does the venerable Khemaka discern any self (*attānaṃ*)[17] or what is of the nature of a self

[1] *Bhadda-sālu*, i.e. noble Sāl-tree; cp. Ch. 1 § 2 n. In MV, x. iv. 6 the tree is said to be 'in the Rakkhita Grove (*Rakkhita-vanasaṇḍe*).'

[2] *Dhammi-kathā*; cp. Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1].

[3] Buddha addresses them on the destruction of the *Āsavā* (Ap. D *a* § 7).

[4] Int. § 121. The city of Kosambi was on the river Jamna (Ch. 8 *d* § 8); the territory of the state may have extended to the Ganges (Int. § 143). An alternative reading for Kosambi is Ayojjha (Ch. 14 *e* § 8).

[5] Buddha bases a moral lesson on the logs floating in the stream.

[6] Int. § 144. Cp. Ch. 14 *d* § 2.

[7] As in Ap. G 1 *a* § 6.

[8] Ch. 8 *g* § 2.

[9] Int. § 144.

[10] He appears to be the same as the Khema mentioned in the Sixes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 254). A Khema is mentioned in the *Parivāra* of *Vin. Piṭ* (v, p. 3). See Ch. 10 *c*.

[11] Int. § 144; and Ch. 7 *a* § 10 (*ārāma*). 'In Jujube Tree Park', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 107.

[12] Ch. 11 *c* § 6.

[13] The name means Slave. There seems no reason to identify him with the Dāsaka of the *Theragāthā* (*Brethren*, p. 21). A Dāsaka is mentioned in the *Parivāra* of *Vin. Piṭ.* (v, pp. 2, 49).

[14] Omitting inquiries concerning Khemaka's health.

[15] Ch. 5 *b* § 5. 'Fivefold grasping-group', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 108.

[16] The Khandhas are enumerated as in Ap. E *b* § 2 [4].

[17] Int. § 4 (*an-attā*); Ch. 4 § 18 [3]; cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2].

(*attaniyaṃ*)?' " ' [8] . . . [9] 'In these five grasping-aggregates, friends, I do not discern any self or anything of the nature of a self', replied [the venerable Khemaka]. [10]. . .[1]

(ii) *Dissensions*[2] *at Kosambi*

§ 10. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 128* (*Upakkilesa-S.*).

[PTS, iii, p. 152.] The Blessed One was staying in the Ghosita Garden.[3] . . . Now at that time the mendicant brothers at Kosambi were quarrelsome, contentious, and given to strife[4] (*vivād-āpannā*), and were continually assailing each other with sharp taunts.[5] And a certain mendicant brother went to the Blessed One [153] . . . and standing at one side said: '. . . It would be well, revered sir, if the Blessed One taking compassion on them would go to where those mendicant brothers are.' . . . Then the Blessed One went to where those mendicant brothers were and on arriving said to those mendicants 'Enough, Bhikkhus; let there be no quarrel, let there be no contention, let there be no dispute (*viggahaṃ*), let there be no strife.' . . .[6] Then the Blessed One in the forenoon . . . went begging for food in Kosambi and after his meal[7] having returned from his begging round he folded his bedding,[8] assumed outer-robe and bowl and standing uttered these verses[9] (*gāthā*):

[p. 154] . . .

'Not at any time through enmity[10] are enmities appeased here;
But they are appeased through non-enmity: this is an eternal law.

. . . .

Those who break bones, those who take life, those who steal[11]
cattle, horses, treasure,
Plundering the realm—even among these accord is known.
Why amongst you should there be none?

[1] Khemaka in spite of his illness instructs the elders further on the origination and disappearance (Ch. 9 *a* § 6 [14]; Ap. F. *a* ii § 4, 1; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29], *nirodha*; also Ch. 4 § 10, *cessation*, and § 11, *destruction*) of the Khandhas and the gradual extinction of the notion 'I am (*asmī-ti māno, asmī-ti chando, asmī-ti anusayo*).' Ap. D *b* § 1, and Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45] (*not this*); also Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [3] n.

[2] Int. § 143; Ch. 19 *b* § 1 [1] n. It was in Kosambi that Devadatta's schismatic schemes (Ch. 19 *b*) first took form. Cp. Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Dissentients*). *Culla-vagga*, iv, deals with the settlement of disputes among the fraternity.

[3] Int. § 144.

[4] Cp. § 5 [1] above (*dispute*). See § 11 [ii. 1 and 2] below.

[5] These phrases are similarly used among others to describe the quarrels of the Nigaṇṭhas (Ch. 13 *c* § 25). *Majjh.* 48 opens in identical manner, but there Buddha sends for the disputants, admonishes them mildly, and restores peace.

[6] The admonition is twice repeated. One of the Bhikkhus thrice requests Buddha to allow them to bear the responsibility for their own dissensions whilst he himself enjoys the repose of enlightenment.

[7] Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7].

[8] See § 6 [3] above; also § 11 [iii. 1] below.

[9] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

[10] These lines appear in the *Dhammapada* as verse 5. See Ap. F 1 *b* § 4.

[11] Int. § 189 (*robber bands*).

If one should find a true friend,[1] a comrade, firm in good,
With him one may go forth surmounting every ill with joy in thoughtfulness.

Should one not find a true friend, a comrade, firm in good,
One should go forth alone, even as a monarch[2] leaving his conquered realm, like a lone elephant[3] in solitude.

Better to go alone; there is no friendship with the foolish.
One should go forth alone and do no evil, carefree, like a lone elephant in solitude.'

And the Blessed One having uttered these verses standing then went on to the village of Bālaka the salt-maker (*yena Bālaka-loṇakāra-gāma.*)[4] [155] At that time the venerable Bhagu[5] was staying in the village. . . .[6] Then the Blessed One rose and went on to Pācīnavaṃsa Park (*yena Pācīnavaṃsa-dāya*).[7] Now at that time the venerable Anuruddha,[8] the venerable Nandiya,[9] and the venerable Kimbila[19] were staying in Pācīnavaṃsa Park. . . .[11] [156] And to them the Blessed One said: 'Do you then, Anuruddha [and friends], live in concord (*samaggā*),[12] in unity, without disputes here?' . . .[13]

§ 11. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka X, i–iv.*

[x. i. 1] At that time the Enlightened and Blessed One (*Buddho Bhagavā*)[14] was staying at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden.[15] Now at that time a certain mendicant brother had committed an offence

[1] *Sahāya*; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [8]; and Ap. F 1 *b* (*friendship*) n. These and the following lines appear in the *Dhammapada* as verses 328–30.

[2] This verse seems to have suggested the story of King Dīghīti in Ch. 15 *a* § 2.

[3] See [156] n below. Cp. the *Khaggavisāna-Sutta* of the *Sutta-Nipāta*, where the simile of the lonely rhinoceros is used (SN, 35–75).

[4] Int. § 150. See § 11 [iv. 1] below. See also Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n.

[5] He was a Sakyan and a kinsman of Anuruddha and Kimbila (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; *Brethren*, p. 176). The name was also Brāhman (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]), whether originally so or not.

[6] Buddha instructs Bhagu.

[7] Int. § 150; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1]; see § 11 [iv. 1] below. For *dāya* see Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171] n.

[8] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[9] Ch. 12 *e* § 10.

[10] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[11] The park-keeper intervenes. The passage omitted is identical with that in *Majjh.* 31 (Ch. 12 *e* § 10) except that the scene is transferred from the Vajjian country to a region farther westward.

[12] Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [2]. The passage then proceeds as in Ap. F 1 *b* § 1 [3].

[13] The subject of the subsequent conversation with the three disciples is different from that in *Majjh.* 31 though akin as it is to the same theme, namely the supreme comfort in the highest experience of contemplation (cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n). In *Majjh.* 31 the disciples describe the four Jhānas (Ap. I *a*) and the succeeding stages of attainment (Ch. 3 § 4 [66]). In the present Sutta they speak of perceiving the aura (*obhāsa*) and vision (*dassana*) of forms. The latter Sutta seems to indicate a later stage of psychical theory. In the MV account (see § 11 [iii. 3] n below) the conversation is similar but shorter. The text does not extend Buddha's journey to Pārileyyaka (see § 11 [iv. 6] below) as does the MV account. The gradual compilation of the story of the dissensions at Kosambi and Buddha's lonely exile is interesting (IN 6, *Canon*). The lonely elephant introduced as a simile in the verses above (see [154]) is not mentioned as a fact till § 11 [iv. 6] n below.

[14] Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].

[15] Int. § 144.

(*āpattiṃ*).[1] . . . He considered that offence no offence; other mendicant brothers considered it an offence. . . . And those mendicant brothers obtaining a unanimous vote (*sāmaggiṃ*)[2] expelled[3] (*ukkhipimsu*) that mendicant brother for not seeing[4] his offence. [2] And that mendicant brother was very learned,[5] acquainted with the Traditions,[6] preserving the Law, preserving the Discipline, preserving the Digests,[7] wise, accomplished, intelligent, self-restrained (*lajjī*),[8] conscientious,[9] and desirous of training (*sikkhā-kāmo*).[10] And that mendicant brother went to those mendicant brothers who were his intimates and associates[11] and said 'This is no offence, friends. . . .' He also sent a messenger to the mendicant brothers who were his intimates and associates in the country (*jānapadānaṃ*),[12] saying 'This is no offence, friends. . . .' And that mendicant brother gained in the country also intimates and associates to his party (*pakkhe*).[13] [3] . . .[14] [4] And a certain mendicant brother went to where the Blessed One was . . . and said: 'Here, revered sir, a certain mendicant brother committed an offence . . . he considered that offence no offence; other mendicant brothers considered it an offence. . . . And that mendicant brother went to those Bhikkhus who were his intimates and associates and said: 'This is no offence, friends. . . .' And that mendicant brother has gained in the country intimates and associates to his party.' . . .[15]

[ii.1] Now at that time mendicant brothers in the refectory[16] (*bhattagge*) and within the dwelling-quarters were quarrelsome, contentious, and given to strife,[17] and used towards each other provoking action and speech and came to blows. People were vexed, disturbed, and angry. . . . Some mendicant brothers heard those vexed, disturbed, and angry people . . . and those mendicant brothers reported the matter[18] to the Blessed One. . . .[19]

[ii. 2] And at that time in the midst of the assembly mendicant brothers were quarrelsome, contentious, and given to strife,[20] and were

[1] Or, transgression; Ap. 3 *b* § 1; see § 13 [1] below.
[2] Ch. 23 *a* [9]; cp. Ap. H 3 *b* (*Powers*).
[3] Ap. H 2 *b* (*expulsion*). See § 12 [v. 11] below.
[4] Ap. H 2 *b* § 5 (*admitting*).
[5] Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [83]. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180] (*suta*).
[6] Ap. A 1 *b* (12).
[7] Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [6].
[8] Cp. Ch. 20 § 4 (2), *meek-minded*.
[9] *Kukkuccaka*; literally, having (the sense or fear of) ill-doing. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 9 (iv).
[10] Ch. 21 § 8 [26]. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [1] (*sikkhapadāni*).
[11] *Sambhattā*; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]. Cp. § 13 [1] (*non-association*) below.
[12] Cp. Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; also Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].
[13] Ch. 8 *a* [1].
[14] Omitting altercations.
[15] In [5]–[8] Buddha visits both sides and counsels moderation (cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17], *middle road*). In [9]–[10] the two parties hold Uposatha (Ap. H 1) separately; Buddha counsels reunion.
[16] Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [1] n; cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 11 [10] n.
[17] The same epithets appear in § 10 [152] above.
[18] Cp. Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [6], where the pattern of the story is identical; also Ch. 8 *b* § 1, where the same formula is conventionally used in introducing an ecclesiastical regulation.
[19] Buddha counsels moderation in each individual.
[20] See § 10 [152] above.

continually assailing each other with sharp taunts. They could not pacify the dispute.[1] . . .[2] Then the Blessed One went to where those mendicant brothers were and on arriving said to those mendicants: 'Enough, Bhikkhus; let there be no quarrel; let there be no contention, let there be no dispute, let there be no strife.' . . .[3] Then the Blessed One exhorted the mendicant brothers. [3] . . .[4] [20] . . .[5] Then the Blessed One, thinking 'Stubborn are these foolish men; they are not open (*sukarā*) to instruction',[6] rose from his seat and departed.

[iii. 1] Then the Blessed One . . . folded his bedding[7] and assumed outer-robe and bowl . . . [iv. 1] and then went on to the village of Bālaka the saltmaker.[8] Then the Blessed One went on to Pācīnavaṃsa Park.[9] [2] Now at that time the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya, and the venerable Kimbila were staying in Pācīnavaṃsa Park. . . . [3] And to them the Blessed One said: 'Do you then, Anuruddha [and friends], live in concord, in unity, without disputes here?' . . .[10]

[iv. 6] And the Blessed One having enlightened . . . and gladdened[11] the venerable Anuruddha . . . Nandiya and . . . Kimbila by a discourse on the Law rose from his seat and set forth on the way[12] (*cārikaṃ*) towards Pārileyyaka. And the Blessed One journeying by stages went on to Pārileyyaka[13] and there at Pārileyyaka the Blessed One stayed in the Rakkhita[14] Grove at the foot of a Sāl-tree. . . .[15]

§ 12. *Vinaya-Piṭaka*, *Mahā-vagga*, *Khandhaka X*, *v*.

[x. v. 1] And the Blessed One having stayed at Pārileyyaka[16] as long as he required set forth on the way[17] towards Sāvatthi.[18]. . .[19] [11] And

[1] Or, appease the strife. See § 5 [1] above.

[2] A Bhikkhu reports to Buddha and the passage proceeds exactly as in the *Majjhima* account. See § 10 [153] above.

[3] The admonition is twice repulsed.

[4] The story of Dīghīti and Dīghāvu follows. See Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [3]–[20].

[5] Buddha's admonition against strife is repulsed for the third time.

[6] This reflection has been added here to the details found in the *Majjhima* account.

[7] The narrative is identical with that in *Majjh.* 128 (see § 10 [153] above).

[8] The narrative continues as in *Majjh.* 128 (see § 10 [154] above).

[9] The narrative continues to follow the *Majjhima* account (see § 10 [155] above); and Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [1] n.

[10] The dialogue here is identical with that in *Majjh.* 128 (see § 10 [156] n above) except that it includes only the part regarding concord among the friends and omits the subsequent questions and answers on the higher attainments of adepts, which latter theme is dismissed with the single remark that the friends after every five days spend a whole night in religious discourse.

[11] Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4].

[12] Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (i) [vii. 1].

[13] Int. § 150. See above, §§ 6 [5], 10 [156] n.

[14] Literally, guarded, protected, or sheltered.

[15] Omitting reflections attributed to Buddha on the comfort of being at a distance from the quarrelsome and disputatious Bhikkhus of Kosambi. Omitting also the marvellous (Int. § 94, ii) story of the noble elephant (see § 10 [156] n above) who seeking seclusion joined Buddha and served and fed him. The story concludes and probably originated in a verse or *udāna* (Ch. 2 § 2) attributed to Buddha.

[16] Int. § 150.

[17] Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (i) [vii. 1].

[18] Int. § 138.

[19] The lay disciples at Kosambi agree to ostracize the contentious monks until they appease the Blessed One. In [2] the embarrassed monks resolve to go to Sāvatthi. In [3]–[10] Buddha gives directions for their impartial reception.

that mendicant brother who had been expelled[1] reviewed both the Law and the Discipline[2] and thought 'This is an offence,[3] this is not no-offence.' . . . [12] And those mendicant brothers who favoured the expelled Bhikkhu, taking him went to where the Blessed One was. . . . [The Blessed One said] 'This is an offence . . . but since that mendicant brother, having offended and having been expelled, sees[4] [his offence] therefore, Bhikkhus, restore (*osāretha*)[5] that mendicant brother.' [13] And those mendicant brothers who favoured the expelled Bhikkhu . . .[6] went to those who had expelled him . . . and said 'Let us establish concord in the community.' And those Bhikkhus who had expelled him went to the Blessed One. . . . [14] [The Blessed One said] 'Since that mendicant brother . . . has been restored let the Saṃgha . . . establish concord in the community.' . . .[7]

§ 13. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, Khandhaka I, xxv.*

[1] The Enlightened and Blessed One (*Buddho Bhagavā*)[8] was staying . . . in the Ghosita Garden.[9] And at that time the venerable Channa[10] had committed an offence[11] and was not willing to admit[12] (*passituṃ*) the offence. Those mendicant brothers who were devout[13] (*app-icchā*) were vexed, disturbed, and angry,[14] and those mendicant brothers reported the matter[15] to the Blessed One. Then in this connexion[16] and on this occasion the Blessed One caused the mendicant-assembly (*bhikkhu-saṃghaṃ*) to meet and spoke in censure saying 'This [tends] not to the conversion of the unbelieving nor to the increase of the believing, but both to the unbelief of the unconverted and to the alienation of some believers[17] (*pasannānaṃ*)' . . . and directed the mendicant brothers saying 'Therefore, mendicant brothers, let the assembly (*saṃgho*) pass against the Bhikkhu Channa for not

[1] See § 11 [i. 1] above.

[2] Or, Rules. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2] and [6].

[3] Ap. H 3 *b* § 1.

[4] Ap. H 2 *b* § 5 (*admitting*).

[5] Cp. Ap. H 2 *b* (*Expulsion*).

[6] They re-admit him. It may be observed that they had not previously excluded him. The story halts at times.

[7] Buddha prescribes a resolution (*ñatti*; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4]) re-establishing concord in the Saṃgha.

[8] Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].

[9] Int. § 144.

[10] Ch. 22 *b* § 24 n; see below § 15 [12], [15]. In CV, IV. xiv. 1 Channa is said to have joined in the disputes of the Bhikkhus and Bhikkhunīs (Ch. 12 *b*); 'intruding upon the Bhikkhunīs he took their side and disputed with the Bhikkhus'. The passage quoted appears to be altogether irrelevant to the rest of the chapter.

[11] See § 11 [i. 1] above.

[12] Or, would not see; Ap. H 2 *b* § 5 (*admitting*). In CV, I. xxxi, where Channa again offends, the word used is *paṭikātuṃ* (to repair), the text being otherwise identical.

[13] Literally, having few desires. The transcending of personal desires was an essential part of the Buddhist ideal; cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6, *vi-rāga*), and Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3] (*covetousness*).

[14] Ch. 7 *c* § 1 [5]. This stock phrase does not always accord with its context.

[15] Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [6].

[16] Ch. 8 *a* [4].

[17] See Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [6]; Ap. H 3 *b* 2 [2] n. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 6 [5] (*pasāda*).

admitting his offence an act of suspension[1] [involving] non-association (*a-saṃbhogaṃ*)[2] with the community (*saṃghena*).[3] [2] . . .[4] and announce[5] to house after house that the Bhikkhu Channa for not admitting his offence has been subjected to an act of suspension [involving] non-association with the community.'

(iii) *Rāja Udena*

§ 14. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 35), Sutta 127 (Bhāradvāja). (PTS, iv, p. 110.)*

[1] At one time the venerable Piṇḍola-Bhāradvāja[6] was staying at Kosambi in the Ghosita Garden.[7] [2] And the Rāja[8] Udena[9] went to where the venerable Piṇḍola-Bhāradvāja was and . . . seated himself at one side. [3] . . .[10] [9] 'It is wonderful . . . it is strange,[11] O (*bho*) Bhāradvāja', said [the Rāja], 'how well [the word] is spoken by the Blessed One. . . . [11] How excellent, O Bhāradvāja, how excellent. . . .[12] Let the respected (*bhavaṃ*)[13] Bhāradvāja receive me as a lay-disciple (*upāsakaṃ*) taking refuge[14] from this day forth whilst life lasts.'[15]

§ 15. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, XI. i. 5–15.*

[5] . . . The elder mendicant brothers came to Rājagaha[16] to chant together the Doctrine and the Discipline. . . .[17] [12] Then the venerable Ānanda[18] said this to the elder mendicant brothers: 'The Blessed One, revered sirs (*bhante*),[19] at the time of his death spoke to me thus, "Therefore,[20] Ānanda, let the Saṃgha after my passing away cause the

[1] *Ukkhepaniya-kamma*, a formal resolution of suspension or expulsion; Ap. H 2 *b* (*expulsion*). For *kamma* see Ap. H 1 § 4 n.

[2] Literally, not eating. Cp. § 11 [i. 2] (*associates*) above.

[3] *Saṃgha* seems to be used here in the widest sense to include the laity; Ch. 8 A, n.

[4] Buddha prescribes the manner of passing such an act.

[5] Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [2] n.

[6] Ch. 10 *c* (8). His conversion is recorded in *Saṃ. Nik.* (*Kindred Sayings*, i, pp. 199–201). Bhāradvāja was the name of a large Brāhman clan of which many members became Buddhist converts (*K.S.* i, pp. 201–16). The clan was found both in Magadha and in Kosala; on two occasions in *Saṃ. Nik.* (*K.S.* i, pp. 207, 209). Brāhmans of this name are described as offering fire-sacrifices (Int. § 186). See Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2].

[7] Int. § 144.

[8] His position is not defined. Cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 6 [*b*]; Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [ii. 1]. He is called Mahārāja in § 15 [14] below.

[9] See § 13 [12] below; also Ch. 10 *c* (*disciples*). Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [157]. For details and refs. concerning this Rāja see RDBI, p. 7; for further commentarial legends see ThB, pp. 115–16.

[10] The Rāja asks what is the cause and basis of the pure life of the youthful brethren. Piṇḍola's answers convince the Rāja. The discourse does not mention rebirth or a future world (IN 2 *a*).

[11] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

[12] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 7 with change of names.

[13] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].

[14] Ap. H 1 *c*.

[15] Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [34].

[16] Ch. 23 *b* § 5 [3].

[17] See Ch. 23 *b* §§ 6–9. The occasion is the first Great Council.

[18] See § 2 above; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[19] Here *bhante* is plural; Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9].

[20] The cause is left unstated.

sacred penalty[1] (*brahma-daṇḍaṃ*) to be laid upon the Bhikkhu Channa.[2] . . . Let Channa say what he may wish to the mendicant brothers; the Bhikkhu Channa should not be answered[3] (*vattabbo*) by the mendicant brothers, he should not be admonished, he should not be taught."' 'Therefore do thou indeed, friend Ānanda', said they, 'lay the sacred penalty upon the Bhikkhu Channa.' . . . 'Even so, revered sirs', said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the elder mendicant brothers, and together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers . . .[4] [having embarked] on a ship (*nāvāya*) going up-stream[5] he disembarked at Kosambi[6] and sat down at the foot of a certain tree near the pleasure-park[7] (*uyyānassa*) of the Rāja Udena.[8] [13] Now at that time the Rāja Udena was diverting himself in the park together with his household[9] (*orodhena*). . . . Then the household of the Rāja Udena went to where the venerable Ānanda was. . . .[10] [14] Then the Rāja Udena went to where the venerable Ānanda was. . . . Seated at one side he spoke to the venerable Ānanda thus: 'Has our[11] household been here, O (*bho*) Ānanda?' 'Thy household came here, Mahārāja[12] . . . and gave me five hundred robes.'[13] 'Then what wilt thou do, respected (*bhavaṃ*)[14] Ānanda, with so much [cloth] as outer-robe (*cīvaraṃ*)?'[15] 'Those mendicant brothers, Mahārāja, whose robes are worn out, with them I will make a division. . . . The worn-out robes we shall make into upper-covering[16] [for couches] . . . the old upper-coverings we shall make into bolster-covers[17] . . . the old bolster-covers we shall make into floor-covering[18] . . . the old floor-covering we shall make into foot-towels[19] . . . the old foot-towels we shall make into cleaning-cloths[20] . . . the old cleaning-cloths we shall beat and pound up with mud and smear [on the flooring] as plaster.'[21] Then

[1] Ap. H 3 *b*. For *brahma* as a prefix cp. Ap. F 2 *c* (*Brāhman*) n. The unusual informality of the proceedings leaves this long incidental narrative of Ānanda and Channa open to question.

[2] Ch. 22 *b* § 24 n; see § 13 [1] above.

[3] Literally, be turned; perhaps, be recognized.

[4] Omitting the conventional number 500; Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [1].

[5] Int. § 121.

[6] Int. 144.

[7] Ch. 1 § 9 [58].

[8] See § 14 [2] above.

[9] 'The ladies of his palace', SBE, xx, p. 382. Int. § 190 (*wives*); cp. Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1] (*itth-āgāra*). The Rāja addresses his 'household' by the plural pronoun *tumhe* (you).

[10] The ladies obtain the Rāja's permission to visit their religious director (*ācariya*, Ch. 8 *g*) Ānanda.

[11] The plural pronoun *amhākaṃ* is used. Cp. Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89].

[12] Cp. § 14 [2] above; Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [85].

[13] *Uttar-āsanga* means upper-robe; Ch. 8 *j* § 3.

[14] Ch. 23 *a* [7].

[15] Ch. 8 *j* (*Apparel*).

[16] *Uttara-ttharaṇa*; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [6]; and Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9). Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [501] (*pallet*).

[17] *Bhisi-cchaviyo*; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3].

[18] *Bhumma-ttharaṇa*; Int. § 190 (*furniture*).

[19] *Pada-puñchaniyo*; literally, foot-wipers. 'Towels for the washing of the feet', SBE, xx, p. 383. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171].

[20] *Rajo-haraṇa*, literally, stain-remover; apparently to apply the mud-plaster ext mentioned.

[21] *Pari-bhaṇḍa*; literally, binding together. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17] n, and Int. § 190 (*architecture*).

the Rāja Udena . . . gave the venerable Ānanda another five hundred garments.[1]

[15] Then the venerable Ānanda went to the Ghosita Garden[2] and having arrived sat down on the seat arranged.[3] And the venerable Channa[4] came to where the venerable Ānanda was . . . and to him seated at one side the venerable Ānanda spoke thus: 'Friend Channa, the sacred penalty has been laid upon thee by the Saṃgha . . . thou mayst say what thou wishest to the mendicant brothers; the mendicant brothers must not answer thee, must not admonish thee, must not teach thee.' 'Shall I not be, revered Ānanda, [as one] slain so long as the mendicant brothers do not even answer me, do not admonish me, do not teach me!' There upon Channa fell swooning. Then the venerable Channa . . . dwelling alone secluded . . . ere long realized for himself in the present life and abode in the supreme fulfilment of the holy life (*brahmacariya-pariyosānam*)[5] . . . and he perceived fully:[6] '[Separate] existence (*jāti*) is ended . . . there is no [individual state] beyond this state (*nāparaṃ itthattāya*).'[7] . . .[8]

1 *Dussa*; literally, (lengths of) woven (cloth); Ch. 22 *c* § 2 [13] (*wraps*).
2 Int. § 144.
3 The seat prepared for the chief person present; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [157].
4 See § 13 [1] above.
5 See Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 11 (*yoga-khema*).
6 *Abbh-aññāsi*; Ch. 22 *b* § 20. The phrases which follow are a customary part of the profession of 'perception' or *aññā* (cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] n, *dhamma-cakkhu*, and Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]).
7 Ch. 4 § 17 [249]. 'He became conscious that . . . after the present life there would be no beyond', SBE, xx, p. 385.
8 Ānanda removes the penalty. [6] concludes this chapter of the CV with the abrupt remark that 'the Khandhāka (division) on the Five Hundred [Elders attending the first General Council; Ch. 23 *b* § 4] is ended', thus returning from Kosambi to Rājagaha whence the narrative has strayed perhaps through an interpolation.

CHAPTER 16

WESTERN CLANS OF THE MIDDLE-LAND;[1] LOCALITIES AND DISTRICTS UNIDENTIFIED

a. Kurus[2]

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta* 75 (*Māgandiya-S.*).

[PTS, i, p. 501.] Thus have I heard. At one time the Blessed One was staying among the Kurus [at] the Kurus's township[3] called Kammāssadhamma,[4] in the fire-hall (*agy-āgāre*)[5] of the Brāhman[6] Bhāradvāja-gotta,[7] on a grass pallet.[8] And the Blessed One . . .[9] having gone to a certain grove[10] (*vana-sandaṃ*) sat for [his noon] day-rest[11] at the foot of a certain tree. [502] And Māgandiya[12] the Paribbājaka[13] roaming[14] and wandering on foot came to the fire-hall of the Brāhman Bhāradvāja-gotta and . . . saw the grass-pallet prepared (*paññataṃ*)[15] there . . . and said: 'For whom is this grass-pallet prepared? . . . It is like the couch of a devotee, I think.' 'There is [here], O (*bho*) Māgandiya, the devotee Gotama the Sakyan [who has] gone forth from the Sakyan clan (*Sakya-kulā*).[16] Now concerning the respected (*bhavantaṃ*) Gotama the good report has gone forth: "So it is indeed; he is the Blessed One, saint supremely enlightened . . .[17] the teacher of men's spirits[18] (*deva-manussāṇaṃ*), the Buddha,[19] the

[1] Ch. 1 § 2. Of the clans included in Chs. 16 and 17 only the Avantis are mentioned in *Vin. Piṭ.* and they only once (Ch. 17 *d* § 2). For the position of the several clans see RDBI, p. 27; ThB, p. 13; *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 192 n.

[2] Int. § 158 (9). The Kuru-Pañcālā are included in the summary list of 10 clans mentioned in *Dīgha* 18 (Ch. 12 *e* § 6) and in the longer list of 16 clans in *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 252, 256, 260). The comprehensive treatise called *Mahāsatipaṭṭhāna-S.* (*Dīgha* 22) and its shorter version called *Satipaṭṭhāna-S.* (*Majjh.* 10) are located at the Kuru township of Kammāssadhamma (Ch. 9 *a*, n). The 'northern Kurus' are mentioned along with the 'eastern Videhas' at *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 59.

[3] *Nigama*; Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[4] Int. § 152; Ap. B *c* § 4 [1]. The name is neuter. A learned and enlightened monastery seems to have been established here not long after Buddha's death.

[5] Cp. *aggi-sālā*, Ch. 10 *a* § 11.

[6] Int. § 185.

[7] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2]. For *gotta* cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6).

[8] *Tiṇa-santharaka*; cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]; also Ch. 12 *d* § 1 (*mat*).

[9] As in Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] with change of place-name.

[10] Cp. Ch. 11 *a* § 1; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1]. Cp. also *vana*; Ch. 11 *c* § 2 [17] (*Veḷu-vana*); Ch. 12 *c* § 3 (*Mahā-vana*).

[11] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].

[12] He became a believer (Ch. 10 *c*). It is improbable that he was the Māgandiya of *Saṃ. Nik.* iii, p. 12, and *Sutta-Nipāta*, 835–47, and of the imaginative commentaries (Int. § 14) on the latter and on Udāna, IV, 10 (see ThB, pp. 115–16).

[13] Int. § 126.

[14] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1].

[15] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[16] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].

[17] As in Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2] and Ch. 11 *f* 1 [11], but without the involved reference to Māra, Brahmā, and other powers which appears to be a later touch; IN 6 (*Canon*).

[18] This rendering is perhaps too free, but if Gotama used the expression *deva-manussā* it is not improbable that the phrase represented for him the relationship between the universal and the spirit cribbed, cabined, and confined for a time in the passing individual self; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1], and Ch. 4 § 18 [3].

[19] Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [2].

Blessed One (*buddho bhagavā ti*)". For that respected Gotáma this couch is prepared.' 'An ill sight indeed we see, O Bhāradvāja, seeing the couch of this revered (*bhoto*) revolutionary[1] Gotama', said he. . . .[2] 'If indeed, O Bhāradvāja,' he said, 'we were to see this reverend Gotama face to face, face to face even would we say to him: "The devotee Gotama is a revolutionary." And wherefore? He pries so [critically] into our lore (*sutte*).[3] . . .'[4]

§ 2. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 106 (Āṇañja-sappāya-S.).*[5]

[PTS, ii, p. 261.] . . . The Blessed One was staying among the Kurus [at] the Kurus's township called Kammāssadhamma.[6] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[7] The Blessed One spoke thus: 'Transitory[8] are the sense-pleasures,[9] empty, deceiving, delusive (*mogha-dhammā*);[10] made of illusion[11] (*māyā-kataṃ*) is this thing, the talk of fools.' . . .[12] [p. 265] 'So, Ānanda,[13] the paths[14] approaching to unperturbedness[15] (*āṇañja-sappāyā*) have been shown by me; the paths approaching to the realm of nothingness[16] have been

[1] The word *bhūnaha* is obscure. It may mean 'overthrowing nature' or 'opposing human-nature'. 'Repressionist', SBB, v, p. 354.

[2] The Brāhman says that many wise Kshatriyas, Brāhmans, householders, and devotees, believe in Gotama's method. Int. § 185 (*castes*).

[3] Cp. Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note* (*Sutta*); and Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 (i), *Vedic*; also Int. § 178 (*teachers*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Brāhman*). 'Because our Scriptures say so', SBB, v, p. 354; 'Because it is on these lines that you criticize our tenets', SBB, v, p. 355.

[4] Buddha hears the conversation through his 'divine ear' (Int. § 94, iii; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [2]; Ap. I *b* § 3 [7]; Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [4] n) and on returning addresses Māgandiya upon the control of the senses and sensuous thoughts (Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2], *eye*). In an incongruous passage mention is made of Gotama's luxurious youth and his three mansions (Ch. 1 § 8), and earthly pleasures are compared unfavourably with those of heaven (*sagga*; Ap. C *a* § 2, 126) and of the company of the Thirty-three (Int. § 70) and of the divine nymphs (*accharā*; Int. § 93, vi) in the Grove of Gladness—ideas more suited to a later priesthood than to Buddha's selfless detachment (cp. Ap. C *b* § 9, *heavenly life*). Buddha concludes by saying that through the true Doctrine 'by oneself one will know and see . . . that with the cessation of grasping there is cessation of *bhava* (separate life), with the cessation of *bhava* there is cessation of *jāti* (the individual's life regarded as a unit), with the cessation of *jāti* cease [individualistic fears of] decay and death, grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair'. Here the 12 steps of the causative process are intelligibly simplified and reduced to four (Ap. B *c*, *Note*; cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [4] n. Māgandiya is convinced and enters the Order.

[5] Discourse on the approach to unperturbedness.

[6] Also spelt Kammāsadhamma; Int. § 152.

[7] As in Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [2]; see § 5 [1] below.

[8] Ap. E, *Note* (*aniccā*).

[9] *Kāmā*; Ap. D *a* § 1.

[10] *Mogha* is a form of *moha* (Ap. D *a* § 10, ii).

[11] Ap. D *b*.

[12] Sense-pleasures are declared to be under the sway of Māra (Int. § 69) the spirit of deception. Ānanda shares in the dialogue.

[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]. Ānanda is addressed as representing the brethren; he fills here an intellectual role (cp. Ap. B *c* § 4; Ap. E *c* ii § 2 [298] n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [3]).

[14] *Paṭipadā*; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].

[15] *Āṇañja* is the same as *ānejja* which is used in the *Sāmaññaphala-S.* (*Dīgha-Nik.* i, p. 76) in describing the fourth *Jhāna* (Ap. 1 *a* § 1 [174]), as also in the Fives of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, pp. 93, 100) and further in the Fives of *Aṅg. Nik.* (ii, p. 184) in describing a stage higher than *upekhā*, the fourth of the Brahma-beatitudes (Ap. F 2 *b*) there made to follow the four Jhānas. *Āṇañja-samādhi* (transcendent unperturbedness) is used in *Sutta-Vibhaṅga* (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, p. 109). Cp. *samādhi* (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]); *upekhā* (Ch. 9 *a* § 13 [8] n); *yoga-khema* (Ch. 1 § 11 [163]).

[16] *Ākiñcaññ-āyatana*: Ch. 3 § 5 [164]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

shown; the path approaching to the realm of neither perception nor non-perception[1] has been shown; the crossing of the flood[2] (*oghassa*) from point to point has been shown; noble[3] release[4] has been shown. . . . [266] Here, Ānanda, are trees, here are solitudes.[5] Meditate (*jhāyath'*),[6] Ānanda, be not slothful; be not hereafter full of regret.' . . .

§ 3. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Nidāna-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 12*), *Sutta 60* (*Nidāna*). (*PTS, ii, p. 92.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . [at] Kammāsadamma.[7] [2] Then the venerable Ānanda[8] . . . [3] addressed the Blessed One thus: 'It is surprising, it is strange, revered sir! How profound, revered sir, is the causative-process[9] and its illumination how profound; yet to me it seems altogether clear.' 'Not so, Ānanda; not so, Ānanda. The causative-process indeed is profound and its illumination is profound. Through not understanding this law . . . mankind (*pajā*)[10] cannot get . . . beyond wandering (*saṃsāraṃ*).[11] [5] In one who sees enjoyment in notions (*dhammesu*)[12] of grasping and abides therein craving increases.[13] Because of craving [there is] grasping;[14] because of grasping [there is] individual-existence; because of individual-existence [there is] earthly-existence (*jāti*); because of earthly existence arise decay-and-death, grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair. Thus there is origination[15] of this whole aggregation of sorrow.' . . .[16]

§ 4. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Nidāna-saṃyutta* (*Sam. 12*), *Sutta 66* (*Sammasa*). (*PTS, ii, p. 107.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . [at] Kammāsadamma.[17] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[18]

[1] *Nevasaññā-nāsaññ-āyatana*: Ch. 3 § 5 [165]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175].
[2] Ap. C *b* § 11 (370).
[3] Ap. C *b* § 5; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7].
[4] *Vimokha*; Ch. 22 *b* § 27; and Ch. 21 § 11 [33]. The Discourse is summarized in these phrases.
[5] *Suññ-āgārāni*, empty spots; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [7]. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] (*void*).
[6] Cp. *jhāna* (Ap. I *a*). See Ap. E *c* ii § 2 [302].
[7] Or, Kammāssadhamma; Int. § 152.
[8] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[9] *Paṭicca-samuppāda*; either the origination of sorrow or the universal origin of individuality, or both (Ap. B *c*).
[10] The word is collective; Ap. D *a* § 8 (342). Cp. Ap. B *a* § 2 [8] n.
[11] Ap. B. 'Constant faring on', *Kindred Sayings*, ii, p. 64; 'the Constant Round (of transmigration)', SBB, iii, p. 51—Up to this point the Sutta corresponds with a few verbal exceptions exactly with *Dīgha* 15 (Ap. B *c* § 4). The *Dīgha* version then proceeds to expand the subject elaborately in the manner of the Suttantas (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*).
[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].
[13] *Taṇhā pavaḍḍhati*; craving multiplies or reproduces itself. Cp. § 4 [7] below; Ap. D *a* § 4 (335); also Int. § 26; Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*recurring*).
[14] *Upadāna*; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. The 7 previous links in the complete chain of causation are ignored here; cp. § 4 [11] n below.
[15] Ch. 5 *b* § 6. The process of cessation follows.
[16] [5]–[10] appear also in Sutta 55 of the present Saṃyutta. They include a lengthy simile of a great tree, used also in Suttas 56, 58, and 59.
[17] Int. § 152.
[18] As in Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [2].

[3] The Blessed One spoke thus: 'Scrutinize now with an inward scrutiny (*sam-masaṃ*),[1] mendicant brothers. . . .[2] [9] In this regard (*idha*),[3] mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu scrutinizing scrutinizes with an inward scrutiny: this various and manifold sorrow (*dukkhaṃ*),[4] this decay-and-death,[5] which arises in the world . . . he knows that this sorrow is based upon [accumulations or] supports[6] (*upadhi-nidānaṃ*), has its origin from supports, has its birth from supports, is produced from supports; when there is [accumulation or] support there is [sorrow in] decay-and-death, when there is no [accumulation or] support decay-and-death is not. . . . [10] And further . . . he knows that support is based upon craving,[7] has its origin in craving, has its birth[8] from craving, is produced from craving; when there is craving there is support, when there is no craving support is not. . . . [11] And further . . . he knows that whatsoever in the world is lovely and pleasant here this craving, should it arise, arises; should it abide it abides here. . . . Sight[9] (*cakkhuṃ*) in the world is lovely and pleasant; here this craving, should it arise, arises; should it abide it abides here. [12] Hearing . . . [13] smell . . . [14] taste . . . [15] body (*kayo*) . . . [16] mind[10] (*mano*) . . . here this craving, should it arise, arises; should it abide it abides here.

[17] Those who in the past for ages (*addhānaṃ*),[11] whether devotees or Brāhmans,[12] viewing what is lovely and pleasant in the world, have seen it as permanent[13] (*niccato*), have seen it as happiness, have seen it as reality (*atthato*),[14] have seen it as health, have seen it as peace (*khemato*),[15] they made craving to increase[16] [18] and they making craving to increase, made support to increase; making support to increase they made sorrow to increase; and making sorrow to increase

[1] Literally, touch with inward touch. Ap. C *b* § 11 (374).
[2] Ānanda (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]) on behalf of the monks asks the Blessed One to explain.
[3] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].
[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 5. Sorrow is here made synonymous with individual existence.
[5] This compound word is equivalent to perishable individuality; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. It evidently involves birth (*jāti*) but certainly not rebirth (cp. Ch. 1 § 11 [163] n); see [18] below.
[6] Ap F 1 *c* [162] (*upadhayo*). These are personal possessions and the concomitant desires. They had not yet been transmuted into that metaphysical residue which germinated repeatedly in rebirths and which was an item of the Jain belief and was repudiated by Gotama (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93], *outflow*) but was too subtle to be resisted by his successors.
[7] Egoistic desire; Ap. D *a* (*taṇhā*).
[8] *Jāti*; cp. Ch. 1 § 11 [163].
[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2] (*eye*). This stage, including the physical senses and the mind, corresponds with *saḷāyatana* (Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]) in the Causative Process. The previous four stages which are practically two equivalent pairs of metaphysical expressions are ignored. We see the Causative Process growing here and in § 3 [5] (*grasping*) above; cp. IN 6 (*Canon*). The whole process is evidently a verbal expansion of the 2nd Truth (Ch. 5 *b* § 6 [20], *origin*).
[10] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].
[11] Cp. Ap. B *a* § 3 [3] (*addhunā*).
[12] Two rival schools differing in thought and practice and perhaps in race are indicated. Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
[13] Contrast *a-nicca*, Ch. 4 § 18 [1].
[14] Or, as an end, or, as profit. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] (*fundamental*).
[15] 'As safety', *Kindred Sayings*, ii, p. 77.
[16] Cp. § 3 [5] above; Int. § 26.

they had no release[1] from earthly-existence, from decay, from death,[2] from griefs, from lamentations, from sorrows, from dejection, from despair; they had no release, I say, from sorrow.' . . .[3]

§ 5. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta* (*the Tens*), *Sutta* 20. (*PTS*, *v*, *p.* 29.)

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying . . . [at] Kammāsadhamma.[4] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[5] [2] 'There are, mendicant brothers, these ten noble states[6] (*ariya-vāsā*) which the Noble[7] have kept and keep and will keep. What ten? [3] (i) Here (*idha*)[8] a Bhikkhu has abandoned five points;[9] (ii) he is possessed of six[10] points; (iii) he is watchful[11] of one thing; (iv) he has fourfold support;[12] (v) he has rejected sectarian 'truths';[13] (vi) he has renounced absolutely;[14] (vii) he is unagitated[15] in will;[16] (viii) he is

1 *Na pari-muccimsu*, they are not liberated. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 2 (*mutta*).

2 See [9] above.

3 In [19] the same is said of the future. A simile of a beautiful cup containing poison follows. The Sutta takes it for granted that individuality means suffering. It aims at the removal of individualistic desires or craving. The theme though obscured seems to be that craving separates the individual from the universal; if craving is removed the universality of the soul is revealed (Ap. C *b*). Nothing is said about any process of re-birth (Int. § 19; cp. Ap. B *a*, *Karma*) or its cessation.

4 Or Kammāssadhammā; Int. § 152.

5 See § 2 [1] above.

6 Or, qualities of the faithful. The whole passage occurs with a few verbal differences in *Dīgha* 33 (Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n) and *Dīgha* 34, and the introductory portion appears also as *Sutta* 19 of the Tens but without mention of place. The priority can scarcely be settled but the shortest form is probably the earliest; IN 6 (*Canon*). Cp. *aḷiya-vasāni* in Ap. G 1 *c* § 1.

7 Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7].

8 As to this; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].

9 The word is *aṅga* (Ap. G 1 *b* § 5, *parts*). The five are *kāma-cchanda*, *vyāpāda*, *thīnamiddha*, *uddhacca-kukkacca* and *vi-cikiccha*; Ch. 9 *a* § 5 (*obstacles*).

10 These are mastery over the five senses and the mind; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2] (*eye*).

11 This is defined later as *sat-ārakkha*, watchful of *sati* (self-knowledge; cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 1, *satimā*) that is mindful of the transience of individuality.

12 It is explained that he deliberately pursues, he deliberately abides in, he deliberately avoids and deliberately rejects. Cp. the explanation of *right activity* in *Dīgha* 22, see Ch. 9 *a* § 13 [21] (6), *development*.

13 The word *sacca* here means no more than 'theory'. These hypotheses are the 'questions' of the philosophical sectaries; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii). The word *pacceka* here translated as sectarian (as in SBB, iv, p. 247) means solitary or independent.

14 It is explained later that he has abandoned the quests called *kām-esana* and *bhav-esana* and has moderated that called *brahmacariy-esana*. These aims are termed 'wordly desires', 'rebirth', and 'religious life' in SBB, iv, p. 248, and 'longing for things sensual', 'longing for becoming', and 'longing for the brahma-life' in *Gradual Sayings*, v, p. 22. The last of these three is translated as 'the quest of . . . (problems connected with) the religious life' in SBB, iv, p. 209. They may be the three forms of *taṇhā* censured in the second Truth (Ap. D *a* § 1). The 'noble Quest' is expounded in *Majjh.* 26 (Ap. F 1 *c*) and is the quest for *brahmacariya* of which the fulfilment is Nibbāna (Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]); thus the *brahmacariya* of the present text must mean something other than Nibbāna in this life and may mean the future rewards thereof.

15 *An-āvila*; cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (162).

16 *Saṅkappa*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. It is explained later that he has abandoned any wish for *kāma*, *vyāpāda*, *vihimsā* (cp. Ap. D *a* § 10, *Fires*). In Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (2) the opposites (*nekkhamma*, *a-vyāpāda*, *a-himsā*) are enumerated; Ap. F 2 *a* (126) n.

tranquillized[1] in body and soul;[2] (ix) his mind[3] is happily liberated;[4] (x) he is happily liberated[5] by insight[6] (*su-vimutta-pañño*). . . .'[7]

§ 6. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 82* (*Raṭṭhapāla-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 54.] Thus was it heard by me. At one time the Blessed One journeying among the Kurus with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers came to [a place which was] called Thullakoṭṭhita (*Thullakoṭṭhitaṃ*),[8] a township (*nigamo*)[9] of the Kurus. And the Brāhmans[10] and householders[11] of Thullakoṭṭhita heard [the news]: 'The devotee Gotama . . . [55] has reached Thullakoṭṭhita. . . .'[12] Then the Brāhmans and householders of Thullakoṭṭhita went to where the Blessed One was. . . . Now at that time a clansman[13] (*kulaputto*) called Raṭṭhapāla,[14] the son of a member of a leading family[15] there at Thullakoṭṭhita, was seated at that meeting.[16] . . . [56] And Raṭṭhapāla the clansman not long after the departure of the Brāhmans and householders of Thullakoṭṭhita went to the Blessed One . . . and said: '. . . Revered sir, let me receive from the Blessed One ordination as one who has gone forth[17] [from the world], let me receive admission.'[18] . . . [19]

[1] *Passaddha*, at rest; Ch. 9 *a* § 8 (*calm*). Cp. F 2 *a* (162). The tranquillity is stated to be that reached in the fourth *Jhāna* (Ap. I *a* § 1 [174], *serenity*).

[2] The term *kāya-saṃkhāra* seems to be comprehensive and to comprise the whole individuality (Ap. E *a*, *saṃkhārā*). 'Body-complex', *Gradual Sayings*, v, p. 21.

[3] *Citta*; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6].

[4] *Su-vimutta*; Ap. D *a* § 6. The release is from *rāga*, *dosa*, and *moha*; Ap. D *a* § 10.

[5] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[6] i.e. he understands the transience of the individual; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7] (*insight*). It is explained that he is conscious that for him *rāga*, *dosa*, and *moha*, have been uprooted like a palm-tree stump, not to spring up in future; Ap. E *a* § 4 (5).

[7] The rest of the Discourse explains each of the ten points. This list of ten essential (IN 5 *b*) Āriyan characteristics makes no reference to rebirth (Int. § 19; IN 2). The Kammāssadhamma discourses as they give no support to the doctrine of rebirth are similarly unfavourable to animistic beliefs in Spirits (Int. § 93) or in marvels (Int. § 94). They may be used as a touchstone of early if not of the earliest doctrines accepted by those who were not laymen; cp. Int. § 48 (*teachers*).

[8] Int. § 152.

[9] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.

[10] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 5, 7, 9, 13 [2], 14 [1].

[11] Ch. 7 *a* 11 [3].

[12] As in Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [11].

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]. 'A young man', SBB, vi, p. 29.

[14] Ch. 10 *c* (23).

[15] *Agga-kulika*; belonging to a high family. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [ix. 1]; Ap. F 2 *a* (134).

[16] *Parisā*; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2. Perhaps, 'in that company'.

[17] Ch. 5 *c* § 8 [32].

[18] *Upasampadā*; Ch. 6 *a* § 10; Ap. H 2.

[19] The story of Raṭṭhapāla follows in imaginative prose with moral verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*), the latter as in *Theragāta* ccli and the former as in the commentarial introduction to the *Theragāta* verses (*Brethren*, pp. 302–3). Raṭṭhapāla's parents at last consent to his becoming a monk, but later try to tempt him back to worldly pleasures and to household life, which is described in picturesque detail (Int. § 190, *family*). He retires to the deer-park (*mig-ācira*; cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 9, and Ch. 1 § 9 n) of the local Rāja—the *Theragāta* prose improves the narrative by stating that he flew (Int. § 94, iv) to the park. There he informs the Rāja that with a wise self-interest he has abandoned worldly pleasures in order to avoid the pains of rebirth (Ap. B *a*, *Karma*). If reliance can be placed upon this Sutta, the Rāja was sole ruler of the Kurus; cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 2 (*Rāja*).

b. PAÑCĀLANS

§ 1. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 18 (Janavasabha-S.).*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Nādika.[1] . . . At that time the Blessed One explained regarding the followers in the folklands round about, who had died and passed on in rebirths—among the Kāsis and Kosalas, among the Vajjis and Mallas, among the Cetis and Vaṇsas, among the Kurus and Pañcālans[2] (*Kuru-Pañcālesu*), among the Macchas and Sūrasenas. . . .[3]

§ 2. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Bhikkhu-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 21), Sutta 7 (Visākha). (PTS, ii, p. 280.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Vesāli . . . in the Kūtāgāra Hall.[4] [2] Now at that time the venerable Visākha[5] the Pañcālan[6] (*pañcāla-putto*) enlightened . . . and gladdened[7] the mendicant brothers by discourse on the Law in the attendance-hall[8] (*upaṭṭhāna-sālāyaṃ*). . . . [3] And the Blessed One in the evening having risen from quiet[9] [contemplation] (*paṭisallānā*), went to the attendance-hall. . . . [4] Having sat down the Blessed One addressed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Who now, Bhikkhus, enlightened . . . the mendicant brothers by discourse on the Law in the attendance-hall with trained speech, clear, resonant, comprehensible, thorough, and disinterested?'[10] [5] 'The venerable Visākha the Pañcālan, revered sir . . .' they replied.

[1] Int. § 147. See Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1].

[2] Int. § 158 (10); Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; see § 2 n, below. Two branches of the Pañcālas are mentioned in earlier Indian literature (RDBI, pp. 27, 203) as occupying lands to the NE. and SE. of the Kurus, whose capital was Indraprastha in the neighbourhood of what is now Delhi. The northern branch extended from the Ganges to the Himālayas; the southern branch from the Ganges to the Jamna. The capital of the latter was Kanauj (Ch. 15 *a* § 12, ii, n). See ThB, pp. 13–14; *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 192 n.

[3] This ancient list (Int. § 158; Ch. 17 *a* [4] n) seems to be of Kosalan origin and to comprise the clans coming within the Kosalan sphere of influence. Ānanda, who like Buddha was a Sakyan, is made somewhat strangely to plead for the inclusion of the trans-Gangetic clans of Magadha and Aṅga.

[4] Ch. 12 *c* § 3.

[5] *Brethren*, p. 152. The Thera is mentioned in the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* (ii, p. 51) where the present text appears also word for word except that the scene is at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana. There is also the layman Visākha of *Majjh.* 44. See Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*) n.

[6] Apart from the bare lists of clans (see § 1 above), in which the Pañcālans were always coupled with the Kurus, this is the only mention of the Pañcālans in the first four Nikāyas and the *Vin. Piṭ.* No discourse by Buddha to them has been recorded or editorially compiled. Buddha probably never reached the neighbourhood of the upper Doāb. In the introduction to Psalm clxv Visākha is called 'the son of the daughter of the king of the Pañcālas', (*Brethren*, p. 152); cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 2 (*Rāja*)—For *putta* cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1] (*kula-putta*); and Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2].

[7] Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4].

[8] Ch. 20 § 2 [6]. 'Meeting-hall', *Kindred Sayings*, ii, p. 190; 'assembly-hall', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 59.

[9] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2]. See Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [2] where miraculous agency is introduced.

[10] *A-nissita*; detached (from selfish motives). Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (4); and Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [6] (*not attached*). 'Unworldly', *Kindred Sayings*, ii, p. 190; 'unbiased', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 59. For a similar list of qualities in a preacher see Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [3].

[6] Then the Blessed One addressed the venerable Visākha saying 'It is well (*sādhu*), it is well, Visākha. . . .'[1]

c. CETIS

§ 1. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya*, *Mahā-vagga*, *Sacca-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 56), *Sutta 30* (*Gavampati*). (*PTS*, *v*, *p*. 436.)

[1] At one time many elder mendicant brothers were staying among the Cetis[2] (*Cetesu*) at Sahañcanika.[3] [2] . . . Many elder mendicant brothers after their meal[4] having returned from their begging round[5] were seated assembled together in the circular-hall (*maṇḍala-māle*)[6] and among them this informal conversation[7] arose: 'He now, friends, who sees sorrow [as it is],[8] sees also the origin of sorrow, sees also the cessation of sorrow, sees also the path[9] leading to the cessation of sorrow.' . . .[10]

§ 2. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya*, *Chakka-nipāta* (*the Sixes*), *Sutta* 46. (*PTS*, *iii*, *p*. 355.)

[1] . . . At one time the venerable Mahā-Cunda[11] stayed among the Cetis[12] (*Cetīsu*) at Sahajāti;[13] and there the venerable Mahā-Cunda instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[14]

[1] Omitting repetition and verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*).

[2] Int. § 154; Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [5]. Both in the shorter and longer stock lists of clans (Int. § 158 [7]; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]) the Cetis are always associated with the Vaṃsas and it may be concluded that the territories of the two clans were adjacent. In § 3 below it is stated that Pācīnavaṃsadāya was in the land of the Cetis and it is elsewhere made clear (Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [iv. 1]) that this place lay between Kosambi and Sāvatthi; it may be assumed therefore that the land of the Cetis was to the north of Kosambi, probably in the Doāb between the Ganges and the Jamna.

[3] Int. § 154. *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 369, adopts Sahajātā out of the numerous variants. See below § 2. Sahajāti is mentioned in the *Culla-vagga* of *Vin. Piṭ.* (ii, pp. 300–1).

[4] Ch. 11 *c* § 7.

[5] These are all stock phrases. Ch. 15 *a* § 9.

[6] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11].

[7] *Antarā kathā*, talk between whiles; Ch. 15 *b* § 4 [2]; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [2].

[8] Ap. C *b* § 11 (203).

[9] *Paṭipadā*; Ch. 5 *b* § 8; and Ap. G 1 *a* (i).

[10] The venerable Gavampati (Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1]; see *Dīgha-Nik.* ii, pp. 356–7. *Thera-Gāthā*, xxxviii) reports what he has heard from the lips of the Blessed One.

[11] Ch. 11 *c* § 6 [263]. He addresses the Cetis also in the Tens of *Aṅg. Nik.* (v, pp. 41, 157). See also *Majjh. Nik.* (i, p. 40); *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, p. 81). He is said to have been a younger brother of Sāriputta (*Brethren*, pp. 118–19). In MV, x. v. 6, CV, I. xviii. 1 (Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1] n), and in the *Sutta-vibhaṅga* (*Vin. Piṭ.* iv, p. 66), as also in *Majjh. Nik.* (iii, p. 78) and *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 299), he is named in a recurring list of 10 or 11 foremost disciples (Ch. 10 *c*; Ch. 17 *d* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [78–9]), namely Sāriputta, Mahā-Moggallāna, Mahā-Kaccāna, Mahā-Koṭṭhita, Mahā-Kappina, Mahā-Cunda, Anuruddha, Revata, Upāli, Ānanda, and Rāhula—the list sometimes varying by the inclusion of Mahā-Kassapa or the exclusion of Upāli and Rāhula (Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [1]).

[12] Int. § 154.

[13] Or, Sayaṃjāti. See § 1 above.

[14] Mahā-Cunda speaks of the dissension between those monks who value the intellectual understanding and following of the Law (*dhamma-yogā*) and those who rely on ecstatic meditation (*jhāyī bhikkhū*). The fomer seek for the fundamental (*attha*; Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]), the latter for the Immortal (*amata*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 6); it is implied that the two are the same. If Buddha himself had commended an elaborated Jhāna (Ap. I *a*, *jhāna*) this controversy could scarcely have arisen.

§ 3. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Aṭṭhaka-nipāta (the Eights) Sutta 30. (PTS, iv, p. 228.)*

[1] . . .[1] The venerable Anuruddha[2] stayed among the Cetis[3] in Pācīnavaṃsa Park (*Pācīnavaṃsa-dāye*).[4] Then as the venerable Anuruddha was alone and quiet[5] a reflection arose in his mind thus: '(i) This Law[6] is for one who has few wishes not for one with many wishes[7] (*mah-icchassa*), (ii) . . . for the contented,[8] not for the discontented, (iii) . . . for the secluded, not for one who delights in throngs,[9] (iv) . . . for one who is vigorous in undertaking,[10] not for the slothful,[11] (v) . . . for the attentive-minded,[12] not for one oblivious of self-knowledge,[13] (vi) . . . for the settled,[14] not for the unsettled, (vii) . . . for one possessed of insight,[15] not for one who ill understands (*du-ppaññassa*).' [2] And then the Blessed One . . .[16] appeared in front of the venerable Anuruddha . . . and to him seated at one side spoke thus: [3] 'It is well, it is well, Anuruddha; well hast thou revolved[17] seven reflections of a Great Man.[18] . . . Then (*tena hi*)[19] do thou, Anuruddha, revolve also this eighth reflection[20] of a Great Man: "(viii) This Law is for one who delights and takes pleasure in precision,[21] not for one who delights and takes pleasure in entanglements."[22] [4] . . .'[23]

d. Localities and districts in indeterminate areas

§ 1. *Madhurattha-vilāsinī,*[24] *Introduction (PTS, Buddhavaṃsa, Preface, pp. viii–ix).*

. . .[25] [He spent] the sixth rainy season at the Maṅkula-hill (*Maṅkula-pabbate*).[26] . . .

[1] Gotama is residing among the Bhaggans on the Sumsumāra Peak (Ch. 13 *b* § 2) in the Deer-park.
[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].
[3] Int. § 154.
[4] Int. § 150; Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155]. See § 1 [1] n above.
[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [1].
[6] Part I (title) n.
[7] Or, the covetous; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3].
[8] *San-tuṭṭha*; Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6]; Ch. 8 *k* [6].
[9] *Saṅgaṇik-ārāma*; cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 5 (*gregariousness*).
[10] Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [3]; Ch. 20 § 4 (5).
[11] *Kusīta*; cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (21).
[12] Ch. 20 § 4 (6).
[13] Or, of attention; the word is *sati*. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* (*sati-paṭṭhāna*).
[14] *Samāhita*; cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (152).
[15] Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [12]; Ch. 20 § 4 (7).
[16] Gotama appears miraculously (Int. § 94, iii; Ch. 13 *b* § 6 n) before Anuruddha among the Cetis.
[17] Literally, reflected.
[18] *Mahā-purisa*; Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133].
[19] So then, therefore; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [5]. Cp. Ch. 21 § 14 [50] n.
[20] *Vitakka*; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13] (*thought*). The eight reflections constitute a code of ideals; Ap. H 4 (*Ideals of Conduct*). Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [10] n.
[21] *Ni-ppapañca*; what is not diffuse, or the absence of entanglement. 'For the precise and for one who delights in exactness', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 155. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 2 [2] (*questioning*).
[22] Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 5 (1), *fetter*.
[23] The four Jhānas (Ap. I *a*) are mentioned. These are contrasted with the pleasures of household life which are picturesquely described (Int. § 190, *family*).
[24] Ch. 10 *d*.
[25] As in Ch. 10 *b* § 1.
[26] Int. § 157. The name does not occur in *Vin. Piṭ.* or in the first four Nikāyas.

the twelfth at Verañjā;[1]
the thirteenth at the Cāliya-hill (*Cāliya-pabbate*)[2] . . .
the sixteenth at Ālavi[3] after he had tamed Ālavaka[4] . .
the eighteenth at the Cāliya-hill as before.[5] . . .

§ 2. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Navaka-nipāta* (*the Nines*), *Sutta 3*. (*PTS, iv, p. 354*.)

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Cālikā on the Cālikā hill.[6] Now at that time the venerable Meghiya[7] was the Blessed One's attendant (*upaṭṭhāko*). . . .[8] [2] And the venerable Meghiya . . . went begging for food in Jantugāma[9] and after his meal[10] having returned from his begging round went to the bank of the river (*nadiya*) Kimikālā. . . . [7] Then the venerable Meghiya drew near to where the Blessed One was and . . . sat down at one side. . . .[11] [The Blessed One spoke thus:] 'For the liberation[12] of the mind of the immature, Meghiya, five conditions (*dhammā*)[13] for maturity avail. What five? [8] As to this,[14] Meghiya, a mendicant brother has good associates.[15] . . . [9] Further he is dutiful [*sīlavā*];[16] he abides restrained by the restraints[17] of the Pātimokkha[18] [rules]. Perfecting himself in conduct and behaviour, seeing the danger in small errors, he takes up and disciplines himself in the precepts (*sikkhāpadesu*).[19] [10] Further he takes pleasure in and receives willingly and easily such discourse

[1] Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii).

[2] Int. § 157; see below (*eighteenth*); also *Brethren*, p. 67. Cālika or Cāliya Hill is mentioned in *Aṅg. Nik.* iv, p. 354 (see § 2 below), as being near the river Kimikālā. It may have been part of the Himālayan range or perhaps of the mountainous region southward of the Gangetic plain.

[3] Int. § 157; see § 4 [3] below. 'Āḷavi is stated to have been thirty yojanas (*c.* 260 miles) from Sāvatthī and twelve from Benares', Spence Hardy, *Manual of Buddhism*, 262; Legge's *Fa Hien*, chap. xxxiv; *Yuan Chwang* (Watters), ii. 61', *Sisters*, p. 43.

[4] A *yakkha* (Int. § 93, vii, n) who is said to have dwelt here; Ch. 10 *d* § 1. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1] n; and Int. § 188.

[5] See above (*thirteenth*).

[6] See § 1 above.

[7] Ch. 10 *d* (19th *vassa*) n; and Ch. 10 *c* (*disciples*). See *Brethren*, lxvi, and p. 350 where a list of Buddha's attendants is given.

[8] Ap. A 2 *b* (68).

[9] The village and river are not mentioned elsewhere in *Vin. Piṭ.* or the first four Nikāyas.

[10] Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7].

[11] Meghiya relates that his meditations were interrupted by evil thoughts.

[12] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[13] Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]. These five and four subsequent conditions appear also as 'helpful to enlightenment' in the first Sutta of the Nines (*Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 236), where it is stated that they must be enumerated to those who inquire as to the faith (IN 5 *b*, *Essentials*), and where the scene is the Jetavana at Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c*) and the hearers are monks.

[14] *Idha*; Ap. E c i § 8 [19].

[15] Cp. Ch. 20 § 7 (1), *amity*; Ch. 21 § 6 [22] (*intimates*); and Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [154] (*friend*).

[16] Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]; Ch. 20 § 7 (4); and Ap. H 4 *a* (*Sīlas*).

[17] Ap. H 4 *b* § 2 [2]. These seem to be the ten *sikkhapadāni* (Ch. 8 *d* § 5) rather than the whole of the *Pātimokkha* rules (Ap. H 1). The first four rules called the *Pārājikāni* (Ch. 8 *b* § 6) may be intended.

[18] Ch. 8 *b*.

[19] Ch. 8 *e* § 3.

(*kathā*) as is elevating and suited to release[1] the mind.[2] . . .[3] [11] Further he abides strenuous in what he has undertaken[4] for the abandoning of evil thoughts,[5] for the originating of good thoughts; steadfast, persistent, not shrinking from the yoke of righteous[6] thoughts. . . . [12] Further he has insight,[7] is endowed with insight into origination and disappearance,[8] [with an insight which is] Aryan[9] (*ariyāya*), penetrating,[10] leading to the complete destruction of sorrow.[11] . . . [13] . . .[12] And by that Bhikkhu, Meghiya, standing fast in these five qualities (*dhammesu*), four further conditions must be cultivated[13]—[perception of] the unclean[14] must be cultivated for the abandonment[15] of desire;[16] loving-kindness[17] must be cultivated for the abandonment of ill-will;[18] introspection[19] with inhaling and exhaling[20] must be cultivated for the control of discursive thought;[21] the perception of transcience[22] must be cultivated for the destruction of the conceit[23] "I am".[24] For him, Meghiya, who perceives transience there is established the perception of no [separate] self;[25] he who perceives no [separate] self attains to the destruction of the conceit "I am", to Nibbāna[26] in this world.'[27]

§ 3. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Satipaṭṭhāna-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 47*), *Sutta 19* (*Sedaka*). (*PTS, v, p. 168.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed among the Sumbhans (*Sumbhesu*),[28] [at] the Sumbhans's township[29] called Sedaka (*Sedakaṃ*).[30] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers. ' . . .[31]

[1] Perhaps reveal. 'A help to opening the heart', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, pp. 232, 237.
[2] *Ceto*; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29] (*ceto-vimutti*).
[3] A classification of subjects of discourse (cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4]) follows. These resemble but supplement the Reflections in Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3].
[4] Ch. 20 § 4 (5).
[5] Or, evil states of mind; *a-kusalā dhammā*; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]. 'Unrighteous conditions', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 232.
[6] Good, i.e. self-denying; *kusala*. Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*).
[7] Ch. 16 *c* § 3 (vii).
[8] *Attha-gāminī* is the adj. of *attha-gama* (Ch. 9 *a* § 6 n).
[9] Noble; Ch. 5 *b* § 5.
[10] *Nibbedhikā*; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7].
[11] Ap. E *b*.
[12] Omitting repetitions slightly varied.
[13] Developed, or exercised; Ap. I *a* (*exercises*).
[14] *A-subhā*; Ch. 20 § 6 (3).
[15] Ch. 20 § 6 (5).
[16] *Rāga*; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).
[17] *Mettā*; Ap. F 1 *b*.
[18] *Vyāpāda*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [3].
[19] *Sati*, attention; Ch. 9 *a* (*Mahā-sati-paṭṭhāna*).
[20] Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [2]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79] n.
[21] *Vitakka*; cp. Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3] (*reflection*). 'To cut off distraction', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, pp. 233, 237.
[22] Ch. 20 § 6 (1).
[23] *Māna*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [4].
[24] Ap. D *b* § 1.
[25] *Anatta-saññā*; Ch. 20 § 6 (2); and Ch. 4 § 18 [3].
[26] Ch. 5 *a* § 2 [2]; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ap. C *b*.
[27] Ap. C *b* § 4.
[28] Int. § 153.
[29] Ch. 11 *e* § 4.
[30] Alternatively Sekadakaṃ (or Pesakārakaṃ), Setakaṃ, Desakaṃ. *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 74, prefers Desaka. This place is the scene of two other Suttas in *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, v, pp. 89, 169).
[31] Omitting an illustration from the practice of pole-climbing acrobats (Int. § 190, *sports*), who must pay attention to their own and each other's movements. The pole is termed *caṇḍāla-vaṃsa*; the connexion with the low-caste Caṇḍāla tribe (Int. § 185, *Sūdrā*) is disputed.

[6] How, mendicant brothers, does one guarding himself guard another (*paraṃ*)?[1] By practice,[2] by exercise,[3] by constant [example].[4] . . . [7] And how, mendicant brothers, does one guarding another guard himself? By [exercise of][5] patience,[6] harmlessness,[7] loving-kindness,[8] pity.[9] . . .[10] [8] "I will guard myself"; thus attention[11] (*sati-paṭṭhānaṃ*) should be practised. "I will guard another"; thus attention should be practised. Guarding oneself one guards another; guarding another one guards oneself.'[12]

§ 4. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya*, *Nidāna-vagga*, *Lābha-sakkāra* (*Saṃ.* 7), *Sutta* 22 (*Putta*). (*PTS*, *ii*, *p.* 235.)

[1] . . .[13] [3] 'A faithful lay-woman,[14] mendicant brothers, directing her only son, beloved and kind,[15] would thus exhort him: "Be thou, my son (*tāta*),[16] such an one as Citta[17] the householder and Hatthaka[18] of Āḷavi[19] (*Āḷavako*)." [4] These twain', said [the Blessed One], 'are the standard for measurement of my disciples who are laymen, that is Citta the householder and Hatthaka of Āḷavi.' . . .[20]

§ 5. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya*, *Saḷāyatana-vagga*, *Citta-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 41), *Sutta* 1 (*Saññojana*). (*PTS*, *iv*, *p.* 281.)

[1] At one time many elder mendicant brothers were staying at Macchikāsaṇḍa[21] in the Wild-plum Grove[22] (*Ambāṭaka-vane*). [2]

[1] His neighbour. Ap. F 1 *b* § 7 (*kindness*).

[2] *Āsevana*; self-training. The verbs *āsevati* and *bhāveti* are used indifferently, see *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 10. Ap. E *c* ii.

[3] *Bhāvanā*; Ch. 9 *a* § 8; Ap. I *a* (*Meditation*).

[4] *Bahulī-kamma*; literally, repeated action; cp. § 7 [2] below. This and the two preceding terms constitute a current formula; they recur in *Majjh.* 44 (PTS, i, p. 301) and are translated in SBB (v, p. 215) as 'the practice and cultivation and increase' of certain states of consciousness. On the force of example see Ap. B *b* (*kamma*) and Ap. D *a* § 4 (335) *spreading*.

[5] It is implied that the exercise of these virtues is its own great reward; Int. § 113.

[6] *Khanti*; Ap. F 2 *a* (142).

[7] *A-vihiṃsā*; non-hostility. Int. § 49; cp. Ch. 4 § 14 [iii. 4].

[8] *Mettatā*; Ap. F 2 *b* [6].

[9] *Anudayatā*; Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2].

[10] Omitting repetition.

[11] *Sati-paṭṭhāna*; Ap. C *a* § 3 [22] (*meditations*).

[12] Int. § 3 (*altruism*). The alternative title of this Sutta is *Ek-antaka*, which may possibly mean Ending Separation.

[13] Buddha at Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c*) addresses the monks on the dangers of *lābha-sakkāra-siloka*, 'gain, honour and reputation' (Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524]).

[14] *Upāsikā*; Ch. 8 *l*.

[15] *Manāpa*; Ch. 21 § 12 [48].

[16] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].

[17] See § 5 [4] below.

[18] Ch. 10 *c* (64).

[19] See § 1 above.

[20] If the youth is to become a monk his standard must be Sāriputta and Moggallāna; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*.

[21] Int. § 157; Ch. 10 *c* (63); Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [1]. This village is also the scene of the next 8 Suttas. Its situation is not defined in the first four Nikāyas, but in *Brethren* (p. 107) it is stated to have been near Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c*). In *Culla-vagga*, I. xviii. 1, it is stated that Sāriputta and Moggallāna with a party of Elders (Ch. 16 *c* § 2 n) journeying among the Kāsis (*Kāsīsu*; Ch. 15 *a*) arrived at Macchikasaṇḍa and were entertained by Citta there.

[22] SBE, xvii, p. 362. Here, as usual but not necessarily always where two locatives are employed the larger term precedes the smaller; Ch. 11 *c* § 6 [263]; cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 9 [171], and Ch. 15 *a* § 8 [248]; also Ch. 11 *e* § 4, where a locative is followed by an elliptical nominative.

Now at that time many elders . . . were seated assembled together in the circular-hall (*maṇḍala-māle*)[1] and among them this informal[2] conversation arose: ' "A fetter",[3] friends (*āvuso*), and "things conducive thereto (*saññojaniyā dhammā ti*)",[4] are these [two] things different in meaning[5] [as they are] different literally,[6] or [though they are] one in meaning is there a difference merely literally?' [3] . . .[7] [4] Now at that time Citta[8] the householder[9] had come to Migapathaka[10] on certain business. [5] . . . [6] And Citta the householder went to where the elder mendicant brothers were. . . . [7] Seated at one side Citta . . . spoke thus: 'It is reported, revered sirs (*bhante*), that among the elders . . . assembled together in the circular hall this informal conversation has arisen: "A fetter" and "things conducive thereto", are these [two] things different in meaning [as] they are different literally, or [though they are] one in meaning is there a difference merely literally? . . . [8] "A fetter", revered sirs, and "things conducive thereto", these [two] things are different both in meaning and in letter. . . .[11] [10] The eye[12] is not a fetter to material forms,[13] nor are material forms a fetter to the eye; but that excited desire (*chanda-rāgo*)[14] which arises there in consequence (*paṭicca*)[15] of both, that then is the fetter. . . . The mind (*mano*)[16] is not a fetter to objects[17] [of thought], nor are objects [material or immaterial] a fetter to the mind; but that excited desire which arises there in consequence of both, that then is the fetter.' [11] . . .[18]

[1] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11].

[2] *Antarā-kathā*; Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2].

[3] *Saññojana*; a bond impeding the mind. Ap. D *a* § 8.

[4] Or, conditions; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]; cp. [10] below. 'Things that tend to fetter', *Kindred Sayings*, iv, p. 190.

[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [4].

[6] *Nāna-vyañjanā*; cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [3] (*letters*).

[7] Omitting different views.

[8] See § 4 [3] above; Ch. 10 *c* (63); Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [2]; *Culla-vagga*, I. xviii. The ten Suttas forming this Saṃyutta all illustrate the merits of this famous householder. In the 8th Sutta he encounters the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta (Int. § 179). In the 9th he asserts his ability to enter at will the four Trances (Ap. I *a*) and states that 'it would not be wonderful if the Blessed One should say "There is no fetter binding Citta to bring him back to this world" ' (Ap. D *c* § 3 [15], *an-āgāmin*). Thus the possible spiritual equality of pious laymen to the monks is asserted (Ap. C *b*, *Note*). On Citta's friendly attendance in the *bhikkhu*-assembly compare Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1] (*king*) and Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [13].

[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7].

[10] 'Deer-path'; a neighbouring village. '*Comy.* says it was his tributary village, behind the Ambātaka (wild mango) Grove', *Kindred Sayings*, iv, p. 190 n.

[11] The senses and the objects of sense are compared with a pair of oxen, black and white, and desires are likened to the yoke without which their tendency to harm is ineffective.

[12] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2].

[13] *Rūpā*; the objects of sight. Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

[14] Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n.

[15] Ch. 9 *a* § 7 (*proceeding*).

[16] Ch. 9 *a* § 11.

[17] Dhammā: concepts; phenomena. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]; cp. [2] above.

[18] The Elders accept this view as agreeing with 'the word of the Buddha'; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [3] (*vacana*), and Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1] n.

§ 6. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI. xxxvii–xxxviii.*

[xxxvii. 1] The Blessed One . . .[1] set forth on his way (*cārikaṃ*) towards Ātumā[2] together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers. . . .[3] [Now] at that time a certain Bhikkhu who had retired[4] [from wordly life] in old age was dwelling at Ātumā and he had formerly been a barber.[5] [2] . . . And that Bhikkhu who had retired in old age spoke thus to the young men [his two sons]: 'The Blessed One, sons (*tāta*),[6] is coming to Ātumā. . . . Go ye, sons; taking your apparatus and a tub (*nāliy-āvāpakena*)[7] proceed from house to house and collect salt and oil[8] and rice[9] and eatables (*khādaniyaṃ*);[10] and we will make a beverage of rice-milk (*yāgu-pānaṃ*)[11] for the Blessed One when he has arrived.' [3] . . . [4] And the Blessed One journeying by stages[12] reached Ātumā, and there at Ātumā the Blessed One stayed at the Straw-house (*bhus-āgāre*).[13] Then that Bhikkhu . . . when the night had elapsed caused much rice-milk to be prepared and presented it to the Blessed One. . . .[14] [5] The blessed Buddha (*buddho bhagavā*)[15] rebuked[16] him. . . .

§ 7. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Ānapāna-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 54), Sutta 10 (Kimbila). (PTS, v, p. 322.)*

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Kimbila[17] (*Kimbilāyaṃ*) in the Bamboo-Grove (*Veḷu-vane*).[18] [2] There the Blessed One instructed the venerable Kimbila[19] saying: 'How exercised[20] (*bhāvito*), Kimbila,

[1] He had been staying at Kusinārā; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1].

[2] Int. § 157; also MPS, iv, 30, where Buddha stayed at the 'Straw-house' as here. It is not stated whether the place was within the Sakyan boundary or in Kosala.

[3] Omitting the conventional number 1,250; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1].

[4] *Pabbajita*; Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (10).

[5] *Nahāpita*; literally, bath-man. Cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[6] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]. The sons in their reply use the same term.

[7] Perhaps a cauldron, or pail. Cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 10.

[8] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (4).

[9] *Taṇḍula*; husked rice, from which *yāgu* (rice-gruel or rice-milk) is prepared. See Int. § 189 (*land*).

[10] Ch. 6 *a* § 12; and Int. § 190 (*food*).

[11] Cp. Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8].

[12] Ch. 3 § 5 [166].

[13] 'Threshing-floor', SBE, xvii, p. 141. In Dhp. 252 *bhusa* means chaff, or possibly straw. In modern India the word means the chopped-up stalks of certain grain-plants; the chopped stalks are used as cattle-fodder. See *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 220, where *bhus-āgāra* is rendered 'thatched shelter', the context supporting this translation; cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2] (*hut*); Ch. 14 *c* § 15 (*salaḷ-āgāra*).

[14] Buddha questions the Bhikkhu and elicits the facts, which he knows already by intuition (Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [502] n).

[15] Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].

[16] Ch. 8 *g* § 1 [5]. Buddha's rebuke which follows does not define the fault or faults committed. One fault seems to be the use of anything but an alms-bowl (Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]) for collecting food; another may be the employment of lay substitutes.

[17] Or, Kimbilā. Int. § 157. In *Saṃ*. xxxv of *Saṃ. Nik.* (iv, p. 181) Kimbilā is said to be 'on the bank of the river Ganges' (Int. §§ 121 n, 143 n). The place is mentioned also in *Aṇg. Nik.* (iii, pp. 247, 338; iv, p. 84), and is always associated with the *thera* Kimbilā.

[18] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 2 [17].

[19] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[20] Or, cultivated. Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [2]; Ap. I a (*Exercises*).

how practised (*bahulī-kato*)[1] is self-transcendence[2] through meditation[3] [on the nature of the self] through inhaling and exhaling[4] (*ānapāna-sati-samādhi*) greatly fruitful greatly advantageous?'[5] . . .[6] [4] On this being said the venerable Ānanda[7] spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Of that self-transcendence through meditation . . . which the Blessed One would exercise this is the time[8] [to hear], Blessed One; this is the time, O Welfarer (*Sugata*).[9] Having hearkened to the Blessed One the mendicant brothers will bear in mind [his words].' [5] 'Then (*tenah'*),[10] Ānanda, hearken well, give attention; I will speak. . . . [7] As to this (*idha*),[11] Ānanda, a mendicant brother having gone to a forest or to the foot of a tree or to a solitude[12] seats himself with crossed legs and holding the body erect he fixes his thought (*satiṃ*)[13] intently and self-scrutinizing (*sato*)[14] he exhales, and self-scrutinizing he inhales. [8] Exhaling a long breath . . . inhaling a long breath . . . [9] he trains himself thinking: "I will exhale . . . I will inhale understanding[15] all the body. . . . I will exhale . . . I will inhale tranquillizing the body-compound (*kāya-saṃkhāraṃ*)."[16] [10] He trains himself thinking: "I will exhale . . . I will inhale . . . understanding[17] joy[18] and . . . bliss[19] . . . [11] understanding the mind-compound[20] . . . tranquillizing the mind-compound . . . [thus] understanding the mind . . . [12] gladdening the mind . . . composing the mind . . . liberating[21] the mind . . . [13] contemplating impermanence (*anicc-ānupassī*)[22] . . . contemplating the fading away[23] [of desire] . . .

[1] Or, repeated. Ch. 14 *c* §§ 14 [3], 18 [2]; cp. § 3 [6] (*constant*) above.
[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].
[3] Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-knowledge*).
[4] Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425]. See Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [2]; except for the setting the two texts are the same up to the tranquillizing of the 'body-compound'. The context suggests that the object of this 'breathing' is to induce tranquillity (*upekkha*; Ap. F 2 *b* [6]; cp. Ch. 1 § 11, *yoga-kkhema*) through conscious assimilation of the universal and everlasting ether (Ch. 21 § 11 [33], 4; Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [8], *space*; cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 8, *flame*). All the ten Suttas of this Saṃyutta deal with 'breathing'. In the 8th Sutta alone the exercise leads to the elaborately graded Trances (Ch. 9 *a* § 13 [21–8]) and to the further intricacies of the Attainments (Ch. 3 § 4 [66]).
[5] Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2].
[6] Kimbilā is unable to answer the twice repeated question.
[7] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[8] *Kāla*; Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7]. Cp. Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101]; Ch. 20 § 2 [6].
[9] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].
[10] Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3].
[11] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [18]. 'In this method', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 323.
[12] *Suññ-āgāra*; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [266].
[13] Ap. F 2 *b* [6].
[14] Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. See Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425] n.
[15] *Paṭisaṃvedin*; comprehending; see [10] below; cp. Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*experiences*). 'Feeling it go through', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 275.
[16] Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 2 [8] (*rūpa*).
[17] *Paṭisaṃvedin*, completely perceiving or sensing; cp. [9] above. 'Feeling the thrill of . . . feeling the sense of . . . aware of', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 287.
[18] *Pīti*; Ch. 9 *a* § 8.
[19] *Sukha*; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*pīti-sukha*).
[20] *Citta-saṃkhāra*; Ap. E *a* ii § 2 [8] (*saṃkhāra*).
[21] *Vimocayaṃ*, pres. part; Ap. D *a* § 6.
[22] Ap. E *a* i.
[23] *Vi-rāga*; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii) n.

contemplating the cessation[1] [of craving] . . . contemplating renunciation."[2] . . . [15] As to body (*kāye*),[3] contemplating the body. [17] as to sensations (*vedanāsu*)[4] . . . [19] as to mind (*citte*)[5] . . . [21] as to phenomena (*dhammesu*),[6] contemplating these . . . he lives strenuous, comprehending, mindful (*satimā*),[7] having put away in this world covetousness[8] and dejection[9] (*abhijjhā-domanassaṃ*).' [22] . . .

§ 8. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 28. (PTS, v, p. 54.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One stayed at Kajangalā[10] (*Kajaṅgalāyaṃ*), in the Veḷuvana.[11] And many laymen (*upāsakā*)[12] of the place came to where the mendicant sister called Kajangalā[13] was . . . and said: [2] 'This was said, reverend mother (*ayye*),[14] by the Blessed One in the Great Questions (*mahā-pañhesu*).[15] "The question, the answer, the explanation regarding the One . . . regarding the two . . . regarding the ten." How is the meaning (*attho*)[16] in full to be perceived, reverend mother, of this which was spoken in brief by the Blessed One?' [3] . . .[17] [4] ' "The question, the answer, the explanation regarding the One" —this was thus said by the Blessed One. Because (*paṭicca*)[18] of what was this said? A mendicant brother, friends (*āvuso*), rightly indifferent[19] . . . as to one thing makes an end of sorrow in this world.[20] As to what one[21] thing? All beings[22] existing by food. . . . [5] "The question[23]

[1] *Nirodha*; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4].
[2] *Patinissagga*; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).
[3] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 21 § 3 [12].
[4] Ap. E *a* ii § 2.
[5] Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6].
[6] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; and Ch. 4 § 18 [3].
[7] Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (7).
[8] Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2].
[9] Perturbation of mind (arising from covetousness). Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*despair*).
[10] Int. § 157.
[11] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 2 [17]. In *Majjh.* 152 (Ap. E *c* ii § 2 n) mention is made of another grove here, the Mukhelu-vana.
[12] Ch. 8 *l*.
[13] This learned Bhikkhunī is not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or *Vin. Piṭ.* Other notable Buddhist women lecturers (*Sisters*, Introduction, p. xxxvi) are Khemā (Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [6]) the nun and her former husband and Bhaddā Kundalakesā (*Sisters*, pp. 63–8). See also Int. § 190 (*women*); Ch. 12 *b* (*Nuns*).
[14] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [2]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 1 [1].
[15] In the *udāna* of this *Vagga* Suttas 27 and 28 are both entitled '*mahāpañha*'; the reference here appears to be to Sutta 27. The Catechism in *Dīgha* 33 is conducted by Sāriputta (Ch. 13 *a* § 3 n) with Buddha's approval; in *Dīgha* 34 Sāriputta also puts questions and supplies the answers. Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4 (*dhammā*).
[16] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].
[17] The nun states that though she has not heard the matter expounded by the Blessed One or the great masters she will attempt to explain how it appears to her. Her explanations correspond mostly but not completely with those attributed to Buddha in Sutta 27.
[18] Or, in what connexion? Ch. 9 *a* § 7 (*proceeding*).
[19] *Nibbindamāna*; better 'detached'. Ch. 5 *c* § 4.
[20] Ap. C *b* § 4.
[21] All individual life. Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; so also Sutta 27 of this series. *Dīgha* 33 explains this as 'all things *āhāra-ṭṭhitikā* (subsisting by food, or by supports; see below [6] n), *saṃkhāra-ṭṭhitikā* (subsisting by composition, or by individuality; Ap. E *a* ii § 2)'. *Dīgha* 34 presents nine other 'unities'. Sāriputta puts this question to Bhaddā before her conversion (*Sisters*, p. 66, where Vedāntic passages are cited).
[22] Ch. 5 *a* § 6.
[23] Literally, the two questions.

. . . regarding the two"—this was thus said by the Blessed One. . . . A mendicant brother rightly indifferent . . . as to two things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what two? Name and form (*nāme ca rūpe ca*).[1] ". . . Regarding the three" . . . . A mendicant brother rightly indifferent . . . as to three things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what three? The three feelings (*vedanāsu*).[2] [6] " . . . Regarding the four". . . . A mendicant brother rightly trained in mind (*su-bhāvita-citto*)[3] . . . as to four things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what four? The four earnest meditations.[4] [7] " . . . Regarding the five". . . . A mendicant brother rightly trained in mind . . . as to five things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what five? The five spiritual organs.[5] " . . . Regarding the six". . . . A mendicant brother rightly trained in mind . . . as to six things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what six? The six elements of deliverance.[6] " . . . Regarding the seven". . . . A mendicant brother rightly trained in mind . . . as to seven things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what seven? The seven parts of wisdom.[7] ". . . Regarding the eight". . . . A mendicant brother rightly trained in mind . . . as to eight things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what eight? The Āryan Eightfold Path.[8] [8] ". . . Regarding the nine." . . . A mendicant brother rightly indifferent . . . as to nine things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what nine? The nine abodes of beings (*satt-āvāsesu*).[9] [9]

[1] Individuality; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. '*Nāma*, by which in this connexion the "four incorporeal khandhas" (aggregates) are always meant', SBB, iv, p. 205 n. *Rūpa*, the corporeal aggregate, is the first of the five Khandhas (Ap. E *a* ii).

[2] Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28].

[3] Ap. I *a* (*Exercises*).

[4] *Satipaṭṭhānā*. See Ap. G 1 *b* § 4, where other fours are enumerated. In Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 the four are defined as the Four Noble Truths. In Sutta 27 the four are explained as four nourishments (*āhārā*; see above, [4] *one*), elsewhere defined as relating to body, touch (senses), volition, and consciousness (*Dīgha* 33 and 34).

[5] *Indriyāni*; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4. In Sutta 27 the five things to be regarded indifferently are defined as the five grasping-aggregates (*panc'upādāna-kkhandhā*) as in Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.

[6] *Nissaraniyā dhātū*. In *Dīgha* 33 and 34 these are defined as loving-kindness, pity, sympathy with joy, serenity (Ap. F 2 *b* [6]), unqualified liberation of mind, and the destruction of the conceit 'I am' (Ap. D *b* § 1). In Sutta 27 the six are called 'the six spheres in the self', as in Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.

[7] Ap. G 1 *b* § 4. In Sutta 27 the seven are defined as 'states (spheres) of consciousness, which in *Dīgha* 33 and 34 are explained as seven realms where conscious beings exist (Int. § 70 n; cp. [8] n, *nine*, below). The detailed description of these states suggests that these passages in *Dīgha* 33 and 34 and Sutta 27 of the present series are later in date than Sutta 28—on the principle that simpler forms tend to give way to rather than to succeed more complex and imaginative expositions (IN 6, *Canon*) and that ground apparently gained however delusively is rarely if ever abandoned in the Canon (Int. § 57).

[8] Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9. In Sutta 27 the eight (indifferent) things are defined as 'the eight worldly matters (*loka-dhammā*);' these are explained in *Dīgha* 33 and 34 as gain and loss, repute and disrepute, blame and praise, pleasure and pain (cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7]; and Int. § 111, *indifferent*).

[9] Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 (*nine*). Sutta 27 gives the same answer. As defined under the Nines in *Dīgha* 33 and 34 these are abodes both of conscious and unconscious beings (cp. [7] n, *seven*, above; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9, *unity*), ending with the sphere of

"... Regarding the ten" ... A mendicant brother rightly trained in mind ... as to ten things makes an end of sorrow in this world. As to what ten? The ten good paths of action.'[1] ...[2]

neither perception nor yet non-perception (Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]. One is tempted to interpret these nine 'abodes' here less fancifully as the nine stages of meditation ('trance').

[1] *Kusalā kamma-pathā*. These appear in a negative form in Sutta 27. They are defined in *Dīgha* 33 and 34 in terms corresponding with the ten sīlas (Ap. H 4 *a*). Compare the ten qualities of a saint in Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.

[2] Buddha subsequently confirms Kajaṇgalā's explanations.

CHAPTER 17

BEYOND THE JAMNA: A SUPPLEMENTARY CHAPTER

REGIONS TO THE WEST, SOUTH-WEST AND NORTH-WEST OF THE RIVER JAMNA

a. The last six Clans

Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Aṭṭhaka-nipāta (the Eights), Sutta 42. (PTS, iv, p. 251.)

[1] 'Observance-day (*Uposatha*)[1] perfected[2] [by the] eightfold [rules], mendicant brothers,[3] when kept is very fruitful,[4] very advantageous, very glorious, very stirring. . . .[5] [3] How far is it very fruitful . . . very stirring? [4] It is as if one should hold the supreme lordship and government of the sixteen great countries (*soḷasannam mahā-janapadānaṃ*)[6] rich in the seven treasures,[7] namely of the Aṅgas,[8] Magadhas[9] . . .[10] Macchas,[11] Sūrasenas,[12] Assakas,[13] Avantis,[14] Gandhāras,[15] Kambojas[16]—this [rulership] is not worth a sixteenth

[1] Ch. 8 *a*. Buddha is speaking.

[2] *Samannāgata*; Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17] n.

[3] The scene is not stated, but Buddha probably was addressing the monks at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana (Ch. 14 *c*) where the preceding Sutta was delivered. The first half of this Sutta practically repeats the text of Sutta 41.

[4] Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [16].

[5] The eight abstinences follow here, namely, from (1) taking life, (2) taking what is not given, (3) unholy living, (4) false speaking, (5) intoxicating liquors, (6) taking more than one meal a day, (7) shows and fairs with dancing and music, and garlands, scents and cosmetics, (8) high or large beds. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (26); cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (*sikkhā-padāni*); and Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 (*Cūla-sīla*).

[6] Int. § 158 (*clans*); cp. Ch. 1 § 2 n.

[7] Or, jewels; Ap. A 2 *a* (4).

[8] Int. § 158 (1). The Aṅgas and Magadhas are always associated in the longer stock list of clans; they do not appear in the shorter list (Ch. 16 *b* § 1). Their lands lay on the right bank of the Ganges and occupied the south-eastern portion of the Middle-land, extending as far as what is now known as Bengal. The territories of the last six clans lay on the right bank of the river Jamna, the great tributary of the Ganges, or extended to regions far west of the two rivers.

[9] Ch. 11; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4].

[10] The names of the eight clans of the true Middle-land north of the Ganges follow; as in Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17].

[11] Int. § 155. They are always coupled with the Sūrasenas in the stock list of clans and with them constitute the last pair in the shorter list. The Macchas are not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.*, and it would appear that Buddha did not visit their country. See RDBI, p. 27; ThB, p. 13.

[12] Int. § 158 (12).

[13] Int. § 158 (13). See *c* below; RDBI, pp. 27–8; ThB, p. 14. The Assakas are the first of the clans mentioned whose territories lie outside the great plain of the Ganges and its many tributaries; cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n.

[14] See *d* § 1 [15] below.

[15] See *e* below. The Gandhāras are mentioned by the Emperor Asoka (Ap. G 1 *c*) in Rock Edict V (V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 3rd ed., p. 168) together with the Yonas or Yavanas (Ionians; Woolner, *Asoka*, Glossary, p. 126) and Kambojas.

[16] Int. § 158 (16); see RDBI, p. 28. These with the three preceding clans form the last two pairs in the longer stock list of clans and with them are excluded from the shorter list. Excepting this list and a brief passage at *Majjh. Nik.*, ii, p. 149, they are not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.*, and undoubtedly

part of the Observance-day perfected [by the] eightfold [rules]. And why? Poor is human rule in comparison with divine happiness (*dibba-sukham*).[1] . . .'[2]

b. Sūrasenas;[3] the City of Madhurā

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta (the Fours), Sutta 53.* (*PTS, ii, p. 57.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was travelling on the main road[4] between Madhurā[5] and Verañjī[6] (*Verañjiṃ*), and many householders and housewives (*gahapatāniyo*)[7] were also travelling on the main road. . . . Then the Blessed One resting on the journey sat down at the foot of a certain tree on a seat prepared[8] [for him]. And the householders and housewives saw the Blessed One seated at the foot of the tree and . . . having saluted him sat down at one side. . . .[9]

§ 2. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 84* (*Madhura-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 83.] . . . The venerable Mahā-Kaccāna[10] stayed at

they lay beyond the range of Buddha's wide journeyings. Their territory may have touched the Gandhāran frontier and not improbably was adjacent to the coast of what is now Sind. The Kambojas are mentioned in the Asokan Rock Edicts V and XIII (Smith, *Asoka*, pp. 168, 186; Woolner, *Glossary*, pp. 79, 126) with the Yonas (Ionians) and Gandhāras.

[1] The pleasures of a future existence did not concern Buddha (Ap. C *b* § 9, *life*; cp. Ap. E *b* § 2 [8], *bliss*; Ap. F 1 *c*, *Note*) but they were closely scrutinized by his successors as the context shows. Cp. *sagga* in n. below.

[2] The Discourse proceeds to state that a devout man or woman (Int. § 190, *women*) may attain after death the fellowship (*sahavyatā*, Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14]) of the Four Great Kings, the Thirty-three, the Yāma devas, the Tusita devas, the gods delighting in creation or lastly the gods who delight in the work of others (Int. § 70, *sphere*; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [9] n). These and other particulars are an expansion of the word *sagga* (heaven; Int. § 33) in the verses which follow them (In 6, *Canon*). Cp. *dibba-sukha* above.

[3] Int. § 158 (12); see RDBI, p. 27. The Sūrasenas are not mentioned by name in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* except in the longer and shorter stock lists of clans. In both lists the Sūrasenas are coupled with the Macchas, and it would appear that the territories of these clans lay to the west of the river Jamna, and to the south of the wide realm of their neighbours the Gandhāras, and to the north of the great kingdom of Avanti.

[4] *Addhāna-magga*; perhaps, half-way. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16]; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1].

[5] Int. § 155; Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii) n; see § 2 below. The clan of which this was the capital is not mentioned. The proof of Buddha's visit to Madhura is by no means complete. In the Fives of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 256), however, he is said to have remarked that the town suffered from five disadvantages, 'roughness, dust, savage dogs, Yakkhas in animal forms (Ch. 3 § 1, n), and scarcity of alms', and this may be taken as relevant evidence. The town grew to greatness at a much later period.

[6] Elsewhere Verañjā; Int. § 157.

[7] Int. § 190 (*women*); and Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7].

[8] *Paññatta*; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 2 [1], 11 [7]; Ch. 21 § 7 [24].

[9] Buddha speaks to the citizens on marriage. A bad man (*chava* or corpse) may be wedded to a bad wife, or to a good woman, or a good man (*deva*) may be wedded to a bad woman, or to a good wife (*devī*). *Deva* and *devī* are common honorifics for king and lady, but their use here for a man or woman of noble nature may perhaps be taken to indicate a belief in the divine basis of life not always obscured by individuality (cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1], *deva-manussā*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 2 n).

[10] Ch. 10 *c* (10); Ap. A 1 *b* (5); also *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 67.

Madhurā[1] (*Madhurāyaṃ*) in the Gundā-vana.[2] And Rāja[3] Madhura (*rājā Madhuro*) the son of an Avanti princess (*Avanti-putto*)[4] heard [the news]: 'The devotee Kaccāna, sir (*bho*), is staying at Madhurā in the Gundā-vana. Now concerning the respected (*bhavantaṃ*) Kaccāna the good report has gone forth: "He is wise, accomplished, intelligent, very learned (*bahu-ssuto*),[5] a brilliant preacher,[6] speaking readily on the good,[7] a venerable man (*vuddho*), a saint. It is good to look upon such saints." '[8] Then Rāja Madhura . . .[9] went to where the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna was and . . . [p. 84] seated at one side spoke thus: 'The Brāhmans,[10] O (*bho*) Kaccāna, say thus: "The Brāhmans are the highest caste[11] (*seṭṭho vaṇṇo*); [every] other caste is lower. The Brāhmans are the fair (*sukko*)[12] caste; [every] other caste is dark (*kaṇho*). The Brāhmans are pure (*sujjhanti*); not so the non-Brāhmans. The Brāhmans are the sons of Brahmā,[13] his own, born from his mouth,[14] Brahmā-born (*Brahma-jā*), Brahmā-created, Brahmā-heirs."[15] On this matter, respected Kaccāna, what sayest thou?' 'It is an [empty] clamour such as is [heard] in the [noisy] world, Mahārāja.[16] . . . If a Kshatriya is rich in treasure and grain, in silver and gold,[17] will [another] Kshatriya . . . a Brāhman . . . a Vaisya . . . a Sūdra (*suddo*) serve him, rising early, lying down late, doing any work, obliging,[18] pleasant spoken[19] . . .[20] [p. 89] Should a Kshatriya . . . Brāhman . . . Vaisya . . . Sūdra shave off his hair and beard and assume the yellow

[1] See § 1 above; also *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 67, where the scene is the same and the subject similar.

[2] Cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 1 n.

[3] Ch. 8 *j* § 2 [ii. 1]. He is addressed as Mahārāja below, see [84].

[4] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1] (*Vedehi-putta*). It would appear that the Rāja's predecessor had by marriage allied himself with the ruling house of the powerful neighbouring kingdom of Avanti; Int. § 158 [14]. 'Avanti-putta, King of Madhurā', SBB, vi, p. 43.

[5] Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2].

[6] *Citta-kathin*; Ch. 10 *c* (30).

[7] *Kalyāna-paṭibhāna*; cp. Ch. 10 *c* (25). All these six epithets are used of Khemā (Ch. 10 *c*, 49) in *Saṃ. Nik.* iv, p. 375.

[8] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].

[9] The Rāja drives out to see Mahā-Kaccāna; conventional phrases are used as in Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [13] and Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119].

[10] Ch. 1 § 2. Seemingly at that time the claims of the Brāhmans of north-western India were loftier than those of their caste-fellows further east; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [26].

[11] See Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [3]. Class, order, or grade; literally, colour. The order of mention is always the same in the four Nikāyas: Int. § 185; Ap. H 4 *d*.

[12] Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [3] (*white*); Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2] (*black*).

[13] Int. § 69. Cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2].

[14] These phrases with the substitution of Bhagavat for Brahmā are used of Buddha's true disciples (e.g. *Majjh. Nik.* iii, p. 29; *Saṃ. Nik.* ii, p. 221). For 'Sons (*puttā*)' cp. Ch. 2 § 1 n.

[15] With the substitution of *dhamma* (Law) for *brahma* (cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14] n) these last three phrases also are used of Buddha's true disciples.

[16] Cp. [83] above; Ch. 7 *b* § 1 [85].

[17] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10).

[18] *Manāpa-cārin*; cp. Ap. F 1 *b* § 7.

[19] These five epithets appear also in Ch. 11 *f* 2 [3].

[20] Kaccāna then asks whether the case would be similar if a Brāhman, Vaisya, or Sūdra became wealthy, and the Rāja assents. They agree that ill-doers irrespective of caste will be punished in hell (*niraya*; Ap. B *a* § 7) or other place of suffering; and that a well-doer of any caste will pass to bliss in heaven (*sagga-loka*); Ap. C *a* § 2 [126]). The Rāja further agrees that he would punish malefactors irrespective of their caste.

robes[1] and go forth from the household to the houseless life, abstaining from taking life,[2] from stealing, from falsehood, eating only once[3] a day . . . observing the good law—what wouldst thou do?' 'We[4] should salute him, O Kaccāna, and rise[5] and invite him to a seat and would honour him with robes. . . .' 'This being so, Mahārāja, are not these four castes exactly equal (*sama-samā*); or how does it seem to thee in this matter?' 'Assuredly, O Kaccāna, this being so these four castes are exactly equal; I see no difference between them in this matter [of status]. [90] . . .[6]

c. Assakas

Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 19 (Mahā-Govinda-S.).

[36] . . .[7]

'Dantapura[8] of the Kaliṅgas and of the Assakas[9] [the city] Potana;[10]
Mahissatī of the Avantis[11] and of the Sovīras Roruka;
Mithilā too of the Videhas; Campā among the Aṅgas founded;
And Bārānasi of the Kāsis.[12] These were Govinda-founded.' So 'tis said.

d. Avantis

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Citta-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 41), Sutta 3 (Isidatto ii). (PTS, v, pp. 285–8.)*

[1] At one time many elder mendicant brothers were staying at Macchikasaṇḍa[13] in the Wild-plum Grove. [2] And Citta[14] the householder went to where the elder mendicant brothers were . . . and having exchanged greetings with them sat down at one side. [3] . . .[15]

1 Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].
2 Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (1).
3 Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10]; and Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] (*scraps*).
4 Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14].
5 Ch. 18 *c* §§ 1 [101], 2 [8]; also Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [171]; and Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*).
6 The Rāja asks to be admitted as a lay disciple of the Blessed One, and on hearing of the latter's death begs to be made Kaccāna's disciple. With the death of the teacher changes in his unwritten doctrine were inevitable (IN 6, *Canon*).
7 The following verses are included in the imaginative fable of Mahā-Govinda (Ch. 15 *a* § 1), the Great Steward, a predecessor of Gotama. They appear to be in the style of the Purānic chronicle verses (Int. § 159 n) and therefore to be later in date than the Canonical lists of 10 or 16 clans. Their geographical scope is wider on the south-east, south, and south-west, but the details of the Middle-land are obscured partly by artistic make-believe and partly perhaps owing to unrecorded turmoils.
8 Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36].
9 See *a* [4] above.
10 On the river Godhāvari which flows across India from west to east, entering the Bay of Bengal southward of the ancient land of the Kaliṅgas.
11 See *d* § 1 [15] below.
12 Benāres; Int. § 119. The prose context implies that one of the three Gangetic towns mentioned in this last couplet was the traditionary central capital of the Indian continent.
13 Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [1].
14 Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [4].
15 Citta asks what is the basis of the divergent notions about the eternity of the world, the infinity of the world, the identity of soul and body, and the existence of the Tathāgata after death (Ap. G 1 *a*, ii), and also of the 62 erroneous theories stated in the Brahmajāla (Ap. E *c* i § 2).

[10] Now the venerable Isidatta[1] was the junior of all in that assembly of mendicant brothers. [11] And the venerable Isidatta spoke thus to the venerable Elder [the Senior]: 'May I reply to the question of Citta the householder, revered (*bhante*)[2] Elder?' 'Do thou reply, friend Isidatta', he said. . . .[3] [14] 'The instructed disciple of the noble (*ariya-sāvako*)[4] . . . regards not body . . . sensation . . . perception . . . individual character (*saṅkhāre*)[5] . . . consciousness as the self (*attato*). Thus, householder, there is [for him] no false idea of individuality (*sakkāya-diṭṭhi*).[6] [15] [Citta the householder approving said] 'Whence, revered sir, has the reverend[7] Isidatta come?' 'I come from Avanti[8] (*Avantiyā*), householder.' 'There is in Avanti, revered sir, a clansman (*kulaputto*)[9] named Isidatta, who is a friend of ours though we have not met[10] and who has retired[11] (from worldly life). Has the venerable [elder] met him?' . . .

§ 2. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, V, xiii.*

[1] . . . The venerable Mahā-Kaccāna[12] was staying among the Avantis (*Avantīsu*)[13] at Kuraraghara[14] on a precipitous hill (*Papāte pabbate*).[15] At that time the lay-disciple Soṇa Kuṭikaṇṇa[16] was the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna's attendant. . . . [3] And in the evening the venerable Soṇa having risen from quiet [contemplation][17] went to where the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna was and . . . seated at one side . . . spoke thus: [4] '. . . The Blessed One has been described to me as such and such-like, but has not been seen by me face to face. I would go, revered sir, to see that Blessed One, the Saint[18] all-enlightened,

[1] No. cxx, *Theragātā* (*Brethren*, p. 107); also *Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 283. See Ch. 10 *c*, n.
[2] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9].
[3] Isidatta states that these erroneous notions are based upon the false idea of individuality (*sakkāya-diṭṭhi*). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [18].
[4] Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].
[5] Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [4]. 'The activities', *Kindred Sayings*, iv, p. 195. 'Will' is perhaps the nearest rendering; Ap. E *a*, *Note*.
[6] Egoism; the notion of a real personal entity or self. Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [3]; cp. Ch. 4 § 18 [3].
[7] See *a* [4] above; Int. §§ 156, 158 [14]. See below, §§ 2–4. The form of the word shows that here Avanti signifies the country (Int. § 123 n) and not the people. The wide realm called Avanti stretched from the western coast of India (see *c* above) eastward to the neighbourhood of the Magadhan kingdom in the Gangetic plain (Ch. 23 *a* [7] n. See also *Brethren*, pp. 107, 149, 202, where commentarial information, necessarily rather late, is forthcoming.
[8] Ayya; Ch. 7 *b* § 8 [5].
[9] Int. § 159 n.
[10] Literally, not seen (*a-diṭṭha*). It appears that they were acquainted by correspondence. On the use of writing in early Buddhist days see RDBI, pp. 116–20, and *Brethren*, pp. 90–1, 107; see also Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [1] (*writing*).
[11] *Pabbajita*; Ch. 1 § 9 [59].
[12] Ch. 10 *c* (10). Ch. 16 *a* (*Middle-land*) n. See below, §§ 3, 4. Kaccāna is always included in the recurring list of 10 or 11 foremost disciples (Ch. 16 *c* § 2 n). He is mentioned from time to time in the Canon as interpreting in full to the monks Buddha's concise sayings (*Majjh. Nik.*, i, p. 110, iii, pp. 194, 223; *Aṅg. Nik.* v, pp. 255, 259). See also *Saṃ. Nik.* iii, p. 13; *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, pp. 314, 321.
[13] See § 1 [15] above; also *Saṃ. Nik.* iii, pp. 9, 12, iv, pp. 115, 116.
[14] Int. § 156; Ch. 10 *c* (80).
[15] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* §§ 6, 27; and § 4 [1] below.
[16] Ch. 10 *c* (19).
[17] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].
[18] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.

if my instructor[1] allows me.' 'It is well, it is well, Soṇa; go thou to see the Blessed One. . . . [5] Then do thou, Soṇa, speaking for me, salute[2] the feet of the Blessed One with the forehead . . . and say thus: "Avanti[3] and the Southern-wilderness[4] (*Avanti-dakkhin-āpatho*) have few mendicant brothers. In my case having gathered together at the end of three years with pain and difficulty an assembly of Bhikkhus ten in number from here and there I obtained admission-ordination (*upasampadaṃ*). Would then indeed the Blessed One allow admission-ordination by a chapter[5] (*gaṇena*) less in number in Avanti and the Southern-wilderness? [6] In Avanti and the Southern-wilderness, revered sir, the soil is dark, rough, with [mere] cattle-tracks.[6] Would then the Blessed One allow boots with more than one fold?[7] . . . The men are devoted to bathing and cleanse themselves frequently with water.[8] . . . Coverlets[9] are [made of] skins, sheepskin, goatskin, deer-skin, just as in the Middle-lands[10] (*majjhimesu janapadesu*) [various vegetable] fibres[11] are used. Would then indeed the Blessed One allow [these usages]?' . . .[12]

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Saḷāyatana-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 35), Sutta 132 (Lohicca). (PTS, iv, pp. 116–21.)*

[1] At one time the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna[13] was staying among the Avantis[14] at Makkarakaṭa[15] in a forest hut.[16] [2] And many pupils (*ante-vāsikā*)[17] of the Brāhman[18] Lohicca,[19] youths,[20] who were gathering fire-wood, came to where the forest hut of the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna was. When they reached it . . . they made all sorts of noises [crying]: 'So these shaveling[21] devotees, [even] menials, black[22] folk, offspring of the foot of [Brahmā[23] who is] the kinsman [of us Brāhmans] are respected,[24] esteemed, revered, honoured among these labouring

[1] *Upajjhaya*; Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6].
[2] Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3].
[3] Int. § 123 n. The passage suggests that Avanti had not yet spread to the western sea-coast.
[4] Int. § 132; Ch. 1 § 2 (*south*).
[5] Ch. 8 *d* § 3.
[6] The last two epithets are found also in *Aṅg. Nik.* (i, p. 136). SBE, xvii, p. 34, has 'Trampled by the feet of cattle' but this seems hardly applicable to so wide a region.
[7] MV, v. i. 30 (SBE, xvii, p. 14 n). Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [29].
[8] Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].
[9] *Attharaṇāni*; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14].
[10] Ch. 8 *e* § 5 (*central*).
[11] Four plants are enumerated. Int. § 189 (*manufactures*).
[12] Soṇa proceeds to Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c*) where he meets Buddha in the Jetavana. Buddha makes special concessions to Bhikkhus living in outlying regions and distinction is made, possibly commentarially (Int. § 21), between these outlying parts or 'border countries' and the Middle-land as in Ch. 1 § 2. The scope of these backward outlying regions is suggestive.
[13] See § 2 [1] above.
[14] See § 1 [15] above.
[15] Int. § 156.
[16] Ch. 11 *c* § 29.
[17] Literally, in-dwellers. The term was also used by Buddhists; Ch. 8 *g* § 4 (*assistant*).
[18] Int. § 185.
[19] Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 3, where another Brāhman of the same name is converted.
[20] *Mānavā*; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].
[21] *Muṇḍakā*; Ch. 13 *c* § 28 [6]. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].
[22] *Kiṇhā* or *kaṇhā*. Cp. Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84] (*fair*).
[23] Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [3]. Cp. Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84].
[24] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].

folk [in the village].' [3] Then the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna came forth from the lodge[1] (*vihārā*) and . . . said 'Do not make a noise, young men; I will tell you the Law'. . . .[2]

§ 4. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dassaka-nipāta,* (*the Tens*) *Sutta 26.* (*PTS, v, p. 46.*)

[1] At one time the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna[3] was staying among the Avantis[4] at Kuraraghara[5] on a wild hill (*pavatte pabbate*).[6] And the lay-woman Kālī[7] of Kuraraghara came to where the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna was and . . . seated at one side spoke thus: [2] 'This was said, revered sir, by the Blessed One in the Young Women's Questions[8] (*Kumāri-pañhesu*):

"To the attainment of the real (*atthassa*),[9] to peace of heart—
Now have I conquered the host of dear and pleasant semblance—
To bliss I have awaked, musing alone.
Therefore I form no tie (*sakkhiṃ*) with men;
No tie with anyone is wrought for me."[10]

How now, revered sir, can the full meaning of this brief saying of the Blessed One be shown?' [3] 'Some religious teachers,[11] sister (*bhagini*),[12] excelling in attainment[13] through [concentration on] earth-unity[14] . . . water-unity . . . fire-unity . . . air-unity . . . on unity that is blue[15] . . . yellow[16] . . . red . . . white . . . space[17]-unity . . . mind[18]-unity, reach the goal.[19] The Blessed One, sister, has known fully [every stage of] such unity as far as excellence in attainment through it [can reach]. Knowing it fully the Blessed One saw the beginning (*ādiṃ*),[20] saw the

[1] Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13].

[2] Kaccāna in verse (Ap. A 2 *a, Note*) expounds to the youths and later to Lohicca the nature and practice of the Brāhmans of old (Cp. Ap. F 2.*c*). Lohicca is convinced and requests Kaccāna to visit and instruct his family.

[3] See § 2 [1] above.

[4] See § 1 [15] above.

[5] Int. § 156.

[6] Cp. § 2 [1] above. *Pavatta* means natural, uncultivated.

[7] Ch. 10 *c* § 80.

[8] See *Saṃ. Nik., Māra-saṃyutta,* iii. 5 (*Dhītaro,* the Daughters), where the verses are the same and the young women are the three daughters of Māra (Ap. G 2 *b* § 2).

[9] Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]. See below [3] n (*ādi*).

[10] Ap. A 2 *a, Note* (*verses*).

[11] Ap. A 2 *d* [21].

[12] Int. § 190 (*address*).

[13] *Sam-āpatti*; Ch. 3 § 4 [66].

[14] *Pathavī-kasiṇa.* See Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, p. 125; ThB, p. 183. *Kasiṇa* is a device for inducing self-hypnosis by artificial means. 'This word . . . means entire or total and hence something which engrosses the attention' (Eliot, *H. and B.*, vol. i, p. 314). The context implies that these modes of self-hypnosis or trance (Ap. I *a*) existed before Buddhism, but it is possible that they were elaborated later, superseding the meditation and quiet-breathing exercises (Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [2]) of the *Satipaṭṭhāna-Suttanta.*

[15] The four colours appear also in the eight Stages of Mastery (MPS, iii, 29–32).

[16] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [3] n.

[17] *Ākāsa*; cp. Ch. 21 § 11 (4).

[18] *Viññāna*; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

[19] *Attha*; Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]. 'Have wrought their weal thereby', *Gradual Sayings,* v, p. 32.

[20] The context suggests that *ādi* here has the same signification as *attha* (see [2] above) that is the eternal reality underlying and uniting all things (Ap. G 2 *a, Unity*). *Sutta-Nipāta* (358), however, suggests that the beginning of 'grasping' (*upadāna*; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]) or individuality is signified.

misery[1] [of sense pleasures], saw the escape,[2] saw the clear vision of the Way and No-way.[3] Because of his seeing the beginning . . . the misery . . . the escape . . . the clear vision of the Way and No-way, his attainment of the real, his peace of heart, was found. . . .'

e. GANDHĀRAS;[4] THE CITY OF TAKKASILĀ

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VIII, i, 5–13.

[5] . . . Now at that time at Takkasilā[5] (*Takkasilāyaṃ*) there dwelt a far-renowned physician.[6] [6] And Jīvaka Komārabhacca[7] . . .[8] set out [from Rājagaha] for Takkasilā. Travelling by stages he arrived at Takkasilā where that physician was and having arrived he spoke to the physician thus: 'I wish, director (*ācariya*),[9] to learn the art[10] of medicine.' 'Then indeed, good (*bhaṇe*)[11] Jīvaka, study', said he. . . . After the lapse of seven years . . . [7] Jīvaka Komārabhacca went to the physician and having approached him spoke thus: '. . . I have been learning for seven years and the end of this art is not visible to me. When will the end of it be visible?' 'Well then, good Jīvaka, taking a

[1] *Ādīnava*; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].

[2] *Nissaraṇa*; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [203]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]. Cp. *vimutti* (Ap. D *a* § 6).

[3] *Magg-āmagga*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. These phrases may be taken as a brief statement of the essentials (IN 5*b*) of the creed of Buddha. The context implies an uncreated origin and goal.

[4] Int. § 158 (15); Ch. 11 *d* § 5 [1] n. See RDBI, pp. 28, 203; ThB, pp. 14, 15, 159, 163. In *Dīgha* 11 (Ap. I *b* § 4) reference is made to the famous 'Gandhāran science (*Gandhārī nāma vijjā*)' in association with miracles, which Gotama declares that he 'dislikes, is ashamed of, and disapproves'. Except this and the longer stock list of clans (see *a* above) there is no mention of the Gandhārans in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ*. The Gandhārans and Kambojans are mentioned as border tribes in the Emperor Asoka's Edicts (Ap. G 1 *c*), but evidently were beyond the range of Gotama's widest journeyings. On the long Graeco-Buddhist period in Gandhāra after Alexander's invasion see René Groussét, *In the Footsteps of the Buddha* (English tr. 1932), pp. 105–19.

[5] Int. § 190 (*education*). Takkasilā is mentioned again in *Sutta-vibhaṅga* (*Vin. Piṭ*. iv, p. 5), but does not appear in the first four Nikāyas. The present passage though it has the authority of the *Mahā-vagga* of *Vin. Piṭ*. is clearly part of a commentarial addition (Int. § 21). The narrative preceding the passage is gossiping, prurient, and credulous and can scarcely be accepted as serious. Takkasilā and what is now the north-west frontier of India was evidently far beyond the range of Gotama's travels. A statement that Pasenadi before his accession to the Kosalan kingdom was educated at Takkasilā is only commentarial (RDBI, p. 28; cp. *Saṃ. Nik., Saṃ*. iii, the *Kosala* or *Pasenadi Saṃyutta*; Int. § 137 n). Takkasilā is mentioned repeatedly in *Brethren* (pp. 136, 149, 201, 319) as an educational centre, but only in the commentarial prose. This once famous centre, the Taxila of Greek writers on India, has now been identified with a site about 20 miles north-west of Rawalpindi excavated by Sir J. Marshall (ThB, p. 164). It thus lay within the region generally called Gandhāra.

[6] Int. § 190 (*medicine*).

[7] Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [1].

[8] Omitting 'without letting prince Abhaya know.' This was the Magadhan prince Abhaya (Int. § 168) who is said to have adopted and brought up the young Jīvaka, though this tradition is probably only a commentarial expansion of Jīvaka's second name.

[9] Ch. 8 *g*.

[10] *Sippa*; Ch. 1 § 8.

[11] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

hoe[1] roam for a league[2] on all sides[3] of Takkasilā and whatever [plant] thou shalt see that is not medicinal bring it.' . . . And Jīvaka Komārabhacca came back to the physician . . . and said: 'I have roamed, director, for a league on all sides of Takkasilā and have not seen any [plant] that is not medicinal.' 'Thou art trained, good Jīvaka', said he; 'this much will suffice thee for a living.' . . .[4] [13] And Jīvaka Komārabhacca travelling by stages arrived at Rājagaha where Prince Abhaya was . . . and took up residence in the inner palace (*ante-pure*)[5] of Prince Abhaya.

[1] *Khanitti*; Int. § 189 (*land*).
[2] *Yojana*; Ch. 2 § 7.
[3] *Samantā*; Ch. 21 § 6 [22].
[4] The teacher receives no payment; he presents a small sum to the pupil. On the way back to Rājagaha Jīvaka exercises his art successfully at Sāketa (Int. § 149 *b*).
[5] Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4].

PART III

SĀVATTHI AND THE LAST JOURNEY

CONTINUOUS RESIDENCE IN SĀVATTHI; THE LAST STAGE; RĀJAGAHA REVISITED AND THE SCHISM OF DEVADATTA; THE LAST JOURNEY, AND PARINIBBĀNA

CHAPTER 18

GOTAMA'S CONTINUOUS MINISTRY IN SĀVATTHI[1]

a. Permanent residence in Sāvatthi; death of Anāthapiṇḍika

§ 1. *Madhurattha-vilāsinī*[2] (*Commentary on the Buddha-vaṃsa*) *Introduction* (*PTS, Buddhavaṃsa, Preface, p. ix*).

. . . It is said that the Blessed One was for the first twenty years after the Enlightenment without a fixed residence; wheresoever he wished to go, there he went and stayed. Thereafter he stayed near Sāvatthi,[3] both at the Jetavana[4] Vihāra and at the Eastern Garden (*Pubb-ārāme*),[5] [living] upon regular contributions.[6]

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 143* (*Anāthapiṇḍiko-vāda-S.*)

[PTS, iii, p. 258.] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana[7] Anāthapiṇḍika's garden. Now at that time Anāthapiṇḍika[8] the householder . . . instructed a certain man, saying: 'Go, good (*ambho*)[9] man, to the Blessed One and . . . speaking for me salute[10] the feet of the Blessed One with the forehead, saying: "Anāthapiṇḍika the householder, revered sir, being ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted lays his head at the feet of the Blessed One"; also go to the venerable Sāriputta and . . . say: "It would indeed be good, revered sir, if the venerable Sāriputta would go to the dwelling of Anāthapiṇḍika the householder out of compassion." ' . . . Then the venerable Sāriputta[11] . . . with the venerable Ānanda[12] as attendant-recluse (*pacchā-samaṇ-ena*)[13] went to the dwelling of Anāthapiṇḍika. . . . [259] Having sat down the venerable Sāriputta spoke: '. . .[14] [p. 261] Thou must train[15]

[1] Ch. 14 *c* § 2 n.

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 1.

[3] Ch. 10 *d* § 1. 'In the Tibetan the whole forty-five years have been fixed, seventeen of them at Jetavana, eight at Rājagaha, and the rest at various places (Schiefner, *Tib. Leb.* § 11)', ThB, p. 97 n. According to commentarial tradition Ānanda was now first appointed as permanent attendant on the Buddha: Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ap. A 2 *b* (68); see *Dīgha* 14 (SBB, iii, p. 7); ThB, pp. 122–3; A. Coomaraswamy, *Buddha*, p. 67. That Gotama toured periodically from this centre in spite of advancing age is probable; cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [476] (*north gate*).

[4] Ch. 10 *a*.

[5] Ch. 18 *b*.

[6] Reading, *dhuva-paribhoga*.

[7] Ch. 14 *c* § 2.

[8] Ch. 10 *c* (62). See Ch. 14 *c* § 16 [1] where Buddha visits the great householder.

[9] Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [3].

[10] Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3].

[11] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].

[12] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[13] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].

[14] Sāriputta adjures the sick man not to grasp at the six senses (Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2] n) or the notions or feelings or sensations connected therewith, or at the elements (*dhātu*; cp. Ap. E *b* § 3 [2] n, and Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i [23]) including ether and mind (Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6] n, and Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [423]), or at the five Aggregates (Ap. E *a*, ii), or at the realms of infinite space, of infinite consciousness, of nothingness, of neither perception nor non-perception (Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]). The counsel is to transcend individuality and not to grasp at personal reward; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [18] (*sakkāya*); and Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.

[15] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1].

thyself, householder, saying, "I will not grasp at this world (*idha-lokaṃ*),[1] nor shall my mind become dependent on this world. . . . I will not grasp at a world beyond (*para-lokaṃ*),[2] nor shall my mind become dependent on a world beyond." . . . And thou must train thyself, householder, saying, "Anything seen, heard, perceived (*mutaṃ*),[3] thought (*viññātaṃ*), sought, investigated by the mind—that I will not grasp at nor shall my mind become dependent on that." Thus indeed, householder, must thou train thyself.' . . . Then the venerable Sāriputta and the venerable Ānanda . . . having risen departed. And Anāthapiṇḍika the householder not long after . . . [p. 262] died. . . .[4] And Anāthapiṇḍika as a spirit (*deva-putto*)[5] when the night was far advanced came to the Blessed One in surpassing beauty illuminating[6] the whole Jeta Grove . . . and standing at one side addressed him in verses:[7]

'This friendly Jeta Grove,[8] haunt of the company of seers!
Abode of the Law's Lord, source of my happiness!
Labour and learning, law and duty, life's high way—
By this are mortals cleansed and not by birth or wealth.
Therefore he who is wise discerning his own goal (*attham attano*)[9]
Will ponder deep the Law; he thus and there is cleansed.
Like unto Sāriputta in insight, duty, calm—
What monk has passed beyond (*pāra-gato*)[10] may there be as the highest.' . . .

b. The Eastern Monastery1;[11] Visākhā's[12] Great Gift

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Sutta-Vibhaṅga, Pācittiya lxxxiv, 2.* (*Vin. Piṭ.*, *iv, pp. 161–2.*)

[p. 161.] In Sāvatthi at that time there was a holiday (*ussavo*).[13] People decked out and adorned[14] flocked to the Park (*uyyānaṃ*).[15] Visākhā Migāra's mother[16] too thought that she would go decked out

[1] Cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (89).
[2] Here grasping at a future world is condemned. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 7, and Int. § 12.
[3] 'Thought', SBB, vi, p. 304. Cp. *Sutta-Nipāta* (1122).
[4] Omitting *Tusitaṃ kāyam uppajji* (entered the Tusita body); Int. § 93 (vi). The attainment of this heaven was contrary to the counsel just given.
[5] Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]; Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [5] n; Ap. D *b* § 6 [1].
[6] Int. § 94 (ii).
[7] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.
[8] Int. § 138.
[9] Ap. C *b* § 10 [2].
[10] Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (414).
[11] Int. § 140; Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]; Ch. 11 *a* § 3 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [1]; Ap. D *c* § 4 [4] n; Ap. G 1 *b* § 1. See also *Majjh*. 37 and 109; *Saṃ. Nik*. viii (7), xxii (10), xlviii (46–8); *Aṅg. Nik*., Fours, 190, Eights, 43, 47, 49. On the date of the gift see § 2 [478] n below.
[12] Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [1].
[13] Cp. Ch. 1 § 3.
[14] *Alaṃ-kata*; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [3].
[15] Anāthapiṇḍika's garden (see *ajjh-ārāme* [162] below) or perhaps an open space adjacent to it; Ch. 7 *a* § 10.
[16] Int. § 140 n; Ch. 10 *c* (72); Ch. 14 *c* § 9 n. The Commentaries (Int. § 14) say that Migāra was the father of Puṇṇavaḍḍhana who was Visākhā's husband, and that

and adorned to the Park. [p. 162.] Having left the village she thought: 'What shall I do when I have come to the Park? What now if I should attend upon the Blessed One?' Having removed her adornments (*ābharanaṃ*)[1] and made them into a bundle with an upper-robe (*uttar-āsaṅgena*)[2] she gave it to her slave-girl.[3] . . . Then Visākhā Migāra's mother went to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near and saluted the Blessed One she sat down at one side. Whilst Visākhā Migāra's mother sat at one side the Blessed One . . . gladdened[4] her with discourse on the Law. . . . Then rising from her seat, having saluted the Blessed One, and so moving as to keep her right side towards him[5] she departed. And her slave-girl came away forgetting the bundle. The mendicant brothers saw it and reported the matter to the Blessed One. 'Then, mendicant brothers', said he, 'pick it up and take care of it. . . . I sanction,[6] mendicant brothers, the custody of jewellery (*ratanaṃ*)[7] and such-like found and picked up in this garden (*ajjh-ārāme*).[8] The person to whom it belongs will fetch it.'

§ 2. *Dhammapada*[9] *Commentary, i, 247–50.*[10]

[p. 474.] . . . When Visākhā had attended to the sick and to the young priests, she issued forth from the monastery. But before she had gone far, she stopped and said [to her maid], 'Dear girl, bring me the parure;[11] I will put it on.' Instantly the slave-girl remembered she had forgotten it and had left it behind. . . . And the slave-girl went and fetched it. [p. 475.] Visākhā did not put it on, but sent for some goldsmiths and had it appraised. 'It is worth ninety millions',[12] said they; 'and the workmanship is worth a hundred thousand.' . . . Visākhā paid the price herself;[13] and, putting ninety millions and a hundred thousand into a cart, she took the amount to the monastery. 'Reverend sir,' said she, when she had made her obeisance to the Teacher, '. . . I have now brought the money with me. Reverend sir, which one of the four reliances[14] shall I give?' 'Visākhā, a dwel-

Visākhā induced Migāra to learn from Buddha and so was Migāra's spiritual mother. They round up the account by stating that she was the granddaughter of the rich and miraculously gifted Meṇḍaka (Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [1]). See Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [1].

[1] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]. Cp. *ratanaṃ* below; see § 2 [474] below.
[2] Ch. 8 *j* § 3 [2]. [3] Ch. 4 § 1 [69]. [4] Ch. 6 *a* § 12.
[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 9. [6] Ch. 8 *a* [4]. [7] Cp. *ābharaṇaṃ* above.
[8] Cp. *uyyānaṃ* [161] above. [9] Ap. B *a* § 7.
[10] Int. § 14. The text is taken from Warren's *Buddhism in Translations* (1922), pp. 474–7. It is extracted from the Commentary on *Dhammapada*, verse 53, which is itself taken from the *Visākhāyā Vatthu*. Visākhā's story is given at great length, but it is more detailed than convincing. A shorter but similar history of Visākhā (Int. § 140) appears in Buddhaghosha's Commentary on the *Dīgha-Nikāya* (*Dīgha* 27). 'This is an example of one of the latest of the legends in the Commentaries. The whole of it is probably later than any of the references to Visākhā in the Vinayā', ThB, p. 106.
[11] See § 1 [162] above.
[12] Ch. 10 *a* § 2 (*pieces*); and Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163] n.
[13] The parure was returned freely, but Visākhā preferred to ransom it.
[14] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] (*bases*).

ling-place at the east gate for the congregation of the priests would be fitting.' . . . And Visākhā, with a joyous mind, bought a site for ninety millions, and with another ninety millions she began constructing a monastery.

. . . Now it was the custom of the Teacher, if he took alms at the house of Visākhā, to issue forth from the city by the south gate and [p. 476] lodge at Jetavana monastery.[1] If he took alms at the house of Anāthapiṇḍika, he would issue forth by the east gate,[2] and lodge in Eastern Park; but if the Blessed One was perceived at sunrise making his way to the north gate,[3] then people knew that he was setting out on his travels. So when Visākhā heard . . . that he had gone in the direction of the north gate, she hastened to him, and making an obeisance, said, 'Reverend sir . . . at this vast expense I am having a monastery built for you. . . . Command some priest to stay behind who will know how the work should be done.' . . . 'Moggallāna,'[4] said the Teacher, 'take five hundred priests in your train and turn back.' And he did so. . . .[5] And in no long time they had erected a two-storey building on high foundations and approached by steps. The building contained a thousand apartments—five hundred apartments being in the lower storey, and the same number in the upper.

After travelling about for nine months, the Teacher came again to Sāvatthi; and in these nine months Visākhā had put up her building, and was now at work on the peak, which was [p. 477] intended to hold the water-pots, and was finished in solid, beaten, red gold. . . . For four months did Visākhā give alms in her monastery to the Buddha and to the congregation which followed him . . . [p. 478.] Thus ninety millions went for the site of the monastery, ninety for the construction of the monastery, and ninety for the festival[6] at the opening of the monastery, making two hundred and seventy millions[7] in all. . . .[8]

§ 3. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 27* (*Aggañña-S.*)[9]

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Garden (*Pubbārāme*)[10] in the storied house (*pāsāde*)[11] of Migāra's mother

[1] Ch. 14 *c* § 1 [9].
[2] Int. § 140.
[3] Int. § 149 (*a*); cp. Ch. 18 *a* § 1 (*Sāvatthi*) n.
[4] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
[5] Omitting Moggallāna's magical works (Int. § 94, iv) in expediting the building. Moggallāna's magical powers are described in Sutta 14 of *Saṃ.* li of *Saṃ. Nik.*; Ap. I *b* (*magic*).
[6] Ch. 10 *a* § 4.
[7] Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [9].
[8] Visākhā with her children and grandchildren circumambulated the completed building singing verses. As she was a little maid of seven years when converted by Buddha (*Dhp. Comy.* 230) the Teacher must have been in advanced age when the monastery was presented. See Ch. 18 *b*, n.
[9] Discourse on the Primeval; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] (*Beginning*); cp. Ap. B *a* § 2 (*Anamatagga-saṃyutta*), on devolution.
[10] Ch. 7 *a* § 10 n (*ārāma*). On the locatives here see Ch. 11 *c* § 6 [263] n.
[11] Ch. 2 § 2.

(*Migāra-mātu*).[1] Now at that time Vāsettha[2] and Bhāradvāja[3] desiring the mendicant state were on probation[4] (*parivasanti*) among the mendicant brothers. And the Blessed One having risen in the evening from his quiet [contemplation][5] descended from the storied house and was walking to and fro[6] in the open air in the shade of the house. [2] And Vāsettha saw the Blessed One walking to and fro . . . and bade Bhāradvāja, saying: 'The Blessed One himself, friend Bhāradvāja . . . is walking to and fro in the shade of the house. Let us go, friend Bhāradvāja, let us draw near to where the Blessed One is. Perhaps we may get [the opportunity] of hearing a discourse on the Law in the Blessed One's presence.' . . . Then Vāsettha and Bhāradvāja drew near to where the Blessed One was and . . . having saluted walked behind him as the Blessed One walked to and fro. [3] And the Blessed One addressed Vāsettha, saying: 'You, Vāsettha, are Brāhmans by birth, Brāhmans by family, gone forth[7] from the household of a Brāhman family to the houseless life (*an-agāriyaṃ*). What, Vāsettha, do not the Brāhmans abuse you, do they not denounce you?' 'Indeed, revered sir, the Brāhmans do abuse us and denounce us with congenial denunciation, full and unsparing. . . . They say thus: "The Brāhmans[8] are the highest caste;[9] [every] other caste is lower. The Brāhmans are the fair caste; [every] other caste is dark. The Brāhmans are pure; not so the non-Brāhmans. The Brāhmans are the sons of Brahmā, his own, born from his mouth, Brahmā-born, Brahmā-created, Brahmā-heirs. You here have abandoned the highest caste and have gone over to a lower caste, to shaveling (*muṇḍake*)[10] devotees, menials, black folk (*kaṇhe*), offspring of the foot of [Brahmā[11] who is] the kinsman [of the Brāhmans]. . . .[12] [7] The four castes, Vāsettha, being full of both [good and evil], existing with both dark and fair qualities,[13] those blamed by the wise and those extolled by the wise,[14] what the Brāhmans thus say [to you] . . . this the wise do not acknowledge".' . . .[15]

1 Int. § 140 n.
2 Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13].
3 Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i).
4 Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [28]; Ap. H 2 *a* (*parivāsa*).
5 Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].
6 *Caṅkamati*; Ch. 3 § 7.
7 Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172].
8 Int. § 185.
9 See Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84].
10 Ch. 13 *c* § 28 [6].
11 Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [2].
12 Buddha replies that Brāhmans are born in the natural manner and that there are good and bad in all castes. All castes are admitted to the Order [7]; Ap. H 4 *d*.
13 *Dhammā*; Ch. 12 *c* § 6; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7].
14 *Viññū*; cp. Ap. H 1 § 6 [8] (*noble*).
15 See Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8]. The Sutta then states a theory of the common origin of all living beings. On the dissolution and reintegration of this world (cp. Int. § 107, *kalpa*) firstly bright spirits assemble in an inchoate universe. As the surroundings sustaining them become more material the differences between spirits become marked, till finally individualistic desires and claims arise and the common origin is forgotten. This theory of creation appears more briefly in *Dīgha* 24 [15] together with other theories of the genesis of things (Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n).

§ 4. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 118 (Ānāpāna-sati-S.).*[1]

[PTS, iii, p. 78.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Garden in the storied house of Migāra's mother[2] together with many very well-known elder (*therehi*)[3] disciples, the venerable Sāriputta, Mahā[4]-Moggallāna, Mahā-Kassapa, Mahā-Kaccāyana, Mahā-Koṭṭhita, Mahā-Kappina, Mahā-Cunda, [79] Anuruddha, Revata, Ānanda, and others.[5] . . . Now at that time the elder mendicant brothers exhorted and admonished the junior (*nave*)[6] mendicant brothers. Some elder mendicant brothers exhorted and admonished ten mendicant brothers, and some . . . twenty, and some . . . thirty, and some . . . forty. And those junior mendicant brothers . . . became aware of gradually higher excellence (*visesaṃ*).[7] Then at that time the Blessed One the [following] day being Observance-day,[8] the fifteenth[9] [day of the month], at the time of Requesting [criticism][10] was seated in the open air in the middle of the full-moon night.[11] And the Blessed One having surveyed the silent assemblage instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'I have developed in this Path;[12] with heart developed (*āraddha-citto*)[13] in this Path am I, mendicant brothers. Therefore,[14] mendicant brothers, more and more develop energy[15] for the attainment[16] (*pattiyā*) of the Unattained (*apatassa*), for reaching the Unreached,[17] for the realization of the Unrealized.[18] . . .[19]

§ 5. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 26 (Ariya-pariyesana-S.).*[20]

[PTS, i, p. 160.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi . . . in Anāthapiṇḍika's Garden.[21] And the Blessed One in the forenoon[22] . . . entered Sāvatthi for alms.

[1] Discourse on attention to inhaling and exhaling. Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [2].
[2] Int. § 140 n.
[3] Ch. 8 *g* § 2.
[4] The prefix *Mahā* in this list means 'the older (or senior)'; Ch. 10 *c* (3).
[5] Ch. 16 *c* § 2 n; and Ch. 10 *c*, n.
[6] Ch. 8 *g* § 2. These appear to have been fully ordained and not novices awaiting the second and final ordination.
[7] 'Grew to higher specific attainments', SBB, vi, p. 199.
[8] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1].
[9] Ap. H 1 § 1.
[10] Ch. 8 *c*.
[11] Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n.
[12] *Paṭipadā*; Ch. 5 *b* § 8.
[13] Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [28]; cp. Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] (*achieving*).
[14] *Tasmā ti ha.* Ch. 21 § 14 n.
[15] *Viriyaṃ arabhatha*; cp. Ch. 20 § 4 (5). Ap. F 2 *a* (132) *viriya*. Compare *Appamādena sampādetha* (earnestly labour) in Ch. 22 *b* § 25.
[16] Cp. Ch. 3 § 4 [66] (*sam-āpattiyo*); Ap. I *a* (*Trance*).
[17] *An-adhigata*; unapproached, ungained.
[18] *A-sacchikata*; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]. These three appellations are variants of the negative epithets *amata* (Ap. G 2 *a* § 6), *akata* (Ap. G 2 *a* § 7) and such names for the illimitable.
[19] Buddha leaves Sāvatthi, returning at the time of the Lotus-moon in the fourth month (*Komudiṃ cātumāsiniṃ*); Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]. On his return he addresses the company further on the four stages (Ap. D *c*) culminating in saintship and more especially on exercises of inhaling and exhaling (Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]) to promote meditation.
[20] Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. F 1 *c*. See also Ch. 5 *c* § 6.
[21] Ch. 14 *b* § 3.
[22] Ch. 8 *k* [1].

And many mendicant brothers drew near to where the venerable Ānanda[1] was . . . and spoke thus: 'It is long, friend Ānanda, since we have heard a discourse on the Law from the mouth of the Blessed One; it would be well, friend Ānanda, if we should receive from the mouth of the Blessed One a discourse on the Law for our instruction.' 'Then, venerable sirs, you should go to where the hall (*assamo*)[2] of Rammaka[3] the Brāhman is; then you might receive from the mouth of the Blessed One a discourse[4] on the Law for instruction.' . . .

And the Blessed One having gone begging for food in Sāvatthi after his meal having returned from his begging-round[5] directed the venerable Ānanda, saying: 'Come, Ānanda, we will go to the Eastern Garden[6] to the storied house of Migāra's mother for the [noon] day-rest.'[7] . . . [161] Then the Blessed One went to the storied house of Migāra's mother. And the Blessed One having risen in the evening from his quiet [contemplation][8] directed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Come, Ānanda, we will go to where the Eastern-enclosure (*Pubba-koṭṭhako*)[9] is to bathe our limbs.' . . . In the Eastern-enclosure he bathed his limbs, and having come up [out of the water] stood in one robe drying his limbs. Then the venerable Ānanda spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The hall (*assamo*) here of Rammaka the Brāhman, revered sir, is not far off. Delightful,[10] revered sir, is the hall of Rammaka the Brāhman; fair is the hall. . . .' The Blessed One silently assented. And the Blessed One went to where the hall . . . was. Now at that time many mendicant brothers were seated in the hall . . . for religious discussion. And the Blessed One stood outside the door of the enclosure[11] (*bahi-dvāra-koṭṭhake*) waiting for the conclusion[12] of the discussion . . . then coughed and tapped the bolt;[13] and the mendicant brothers opened the door to the Blessed One. . . .[14]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Indriya-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xlviii*), *Sutta 41* (*Jarā*). (*PTS, v, p. 216.*)

[1] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Garden. . . . [2] And the Blessed One in the evening . . . was sitting in the warmth of the declining sun warming his back. [3] And the

[1] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; see § 6 below.

[2] Sanskrit, *āshrama*; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [2]. This 'lodging' seems to have been an institution rather than a hermitage; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 9.

[3] Int. § 140.

[4] See Ch. 11 *e* § 2.

[5] Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7].

[6] Int. § 140.

[7] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].

[8] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

[9] Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [1]; cp. *koṭṭhaka* below. This may have been a forecourt with pools or 'tanks' like those in the gardens of the Tāj at Āgra and in the ancient ruined monasteries of Ceylon. This incident recurs in the Sixes of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 345), where, however, a different context suggests that the bathing-place was not monastic but public.

[10] Ch. 11 *c* § 25.

[11] Perhaps courtyard or forecourt, gateway or entrance; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [2]; cp. *Pubba-koṭṭhaka* above, and Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [10]. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11] (*hall*).

[12] Ch. 15 *a* § 9.

[13] Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119].

[14] The Sutta concludes with the famous narrative of Gotama's Search and Enlightenment recorded in terms often identical in *Majjh.* 36 (Ch. 12 *c* § 3) which is located at Vesāli and in *Majjh.* 85 and 100 (Ch. 2 § 5 n). Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 6.

venerable Ānanda[1] came to where the Blessed One was . . . and whilst chafing the Blessed One's limbs with his hand spoke thus: 'It is surprising, it is strange,[2] revered sir; the Blessed One's complexion is no longer pure and clear, and all the Blessed One's limbs are relaxed[3] and wrinkled, and the body is inclined forward, and there is seen a change in the faculties of sight, of hearing, of smell, of taste, of touch.' [4] 'This indeed is so, Ānanda. In youth one is by nature subject to decay, in health by nature subject to disease, in life (*jīvite*)[4] by nature subject to death.[5] . . .[6] [5] Thus spoke the Welfarer (*Sugato*),[7] and further the Teacher said:[8]

Alas for thee, O sad decay,[9]
Decay that makest colours dim!
How pleasing to the eye the form
Decay will tread it down.
Though life should last a hundred years
Yet must it ever end in death;
He letteth no one pass him by.
Death tramples all things down.

c. King Pasenadi and his successor Vidudabha; Campaigns of Pasenadi and the Magadhan King Ajātasattu

§ 1. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 86* (*Aṅgulimāla-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 97.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi . . . in Anāthapiṇḍika's Garden.[10] Now at that time in the dominion (*vijite*)[11] of King Pasenadi[12] the Kosalan (*Pasenadissa Kosalassa*) there was a robber named Aṅgulimāla.[13] . . . [p. 98] He wore a necklace (*mālam*) of the fingers of the various people whom he had slain. . . . The Blessed One set out on the course of a journey (*addhāna-maggaṃ*)[14] to where the robber Aṅgulimāla was. . . .[15] The robber saw the Blessed One from afar as he approached. . . . [p. 99] then taking sword and shield and adjusting his bow and quiver[16] he pursued the Blessed One from behind. . . .[17] [p. 100] And the Blessed One with

[1] Ap. A 2 *b* (68).
[2] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].
[3] Cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25] (*cart*).
[4] Cp. Dhp. 148. Compare *jāti*: Ch. 1 § 9 and § 11.
[5] Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14] (*dissolvable*), § 25 (*perishable*).
[6] Omitting repetition.
[7] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].
[8] The hedonism of the tone of these verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) must be attributed to a worldly poet unreached by non-desire.
[9] 'Shame on thee, miserable age', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 192. Cp. Ch. 1 § 9 (*existence*).
[10] Ch. 14 *b* § 3.
[11] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5].
[12] Ch. 14 *a* § 1; see § 7 [7] below.
[13] Finger-necklace; Ch. 10 *d*, n; Ch. 12 *a* § 3; Ch. 14 *a* § 3 [101].
[14] Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16].
[15] Omitting the warnings of the country people.
[16] Int. § 175.
[17] Omitting Aṅgulimāla's conversion through a miracle (Int. § 94, iii) by which the robber though running cannot draw nearer to the saint who is walking.

the venerable (*ayasmatā*)[1] Aṅgulimāla as attendant[2] journeying by stages came to Sāvatthi. . . .[3]

Early in the day (*divā-divassa*)[4] King Pasenadi the Kosalan with five hundred horse having left Sāvatthi went to the Garden.[5] . . . [101] When King Pasenadi . . . was seated at one side the Blessed One spoke thus: 'What now hast thou in hand, Mahārāja?' . . . 'There is in my dominion, revered sir, a robber named Aṅgulimāla. . . . By him villages, townships, and country regions (*jana-padā*)[6] are annihilated. . . . Shall I not subdue[7] him?' 'If now, Mahārāja, thou shouldst see Aṅgulimāla with hair and beard cut off,[8] clad in yellow robes, having gone forth from the household to the homeless life, abstaining[9] from the destruction of life, abstaining from taking what is not given, abstaining from false speaking, taking one meal a day,[10] living holily,[11] dutiful,[12] righteous in character (*kalyāṇa-dhammaṃ*),[13] how wouldst thou treat him?' 'I would salute him, reverend sir, and rise[14] and invite him to a seat and would invite him to accept robes, alms-food, lodging, medicine[15] for sickness and requisites;[16] and I would provide the protection, defence and guard due to him.' . . .[17]

§ 2. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Suttanta 27* (*Aggañña-S.*).

[8] 'In the following manner, Vāseṭṭha,[18] it can be perceived how this Law (*dhammo*) is among mankind here the best (*settho*) both in this life and beyond.[19] King Pasenadi the Kosalan knows, Vāseṭṭha, that the devotee Gotama has gone forth from the neighbouring[20] Sakyan clan.[21] Now the Sakyas, Vāseṭṭha, are subjects[22] of King Pasenadi the Kosalan (*Pasenadi-Kosalassa*).[23] The Sakyas render

1 So called apparently as a direct convert of the Buddha; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]. His hymn is No. cclv in the *Thera-gāthā*. See Ch. 10 *c*, n.

2 Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].

3 Omitting the popular demand that the king should subdue the robber.

4 Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [2].

5 Ārāma; Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [1].

6 Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]; and Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17].

7 'I shall never suppress him', SBB, vi, p. 53; but this rendering makes the king unnaturally pusillanimous.

8 Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].

9 Ap. H 4 *a* (*Abstinences*).

10 Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10].

11 Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11]; also Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (3).

12 Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [9].

13 Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6]; and Ap. H 4 (*Ideals*) with reference to the present list of monkish virtues.

14 Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89]; see § 2 [8] below.

15 *Bhesajja*; Ch. 8 *j* § 9 [2].

16 Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; and Ch. 2 § 7 [65]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (*Bases*).

17 The king perceives Aṅgulimāla among the Bhikkhus and is highly alarmed but subsequently is reassured. The Sutta ends with verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) which are included in Hymn cclv of the *Theragāthā*.

18 Buddha addresses the young Brāhmans Vāseṭṭha and Bhāradvāja; the Sutta is continued from Ch. 18 *b* § 3.

19 *Diṭṭhe c'eva dhamme abhisamparāyañ ca*; Ch. 13 *d* § 8 [1] n; cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 7. No instances from the next world are given.

20 Reading *anantarā*.

21 Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].

22 *Anu-yuttā*. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1] n; and Int. § 169 (iii).

23 Ch. 14 *a* § 4 [2]; see below, §§ 3 [2], 5 [3], 6 [2], 7 [1]. The two words are hyphened, only the last being inflected.

[respect] to Pasenadi the Kosalan (*Pasenadimhi Kosale*),[1] inclination[2] [of the head], salutation, rising[3] in his presence with joined palms,[4] doing obeisance.[5] And in the same way, Vāseṭṭha, whatsoever [respect] the Sakyas render to King Pasenadi the Kosalan, inclination [of the head], salutation, rising in his presence with joined palms, doing obeisance, that [respect] King Pasenadi the Kosalan renders to the Follower (*Tathāgate*)[6] . . . doing obeisance. . . .'

§ 3. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 3), Sutta 11 (Jaṭila). (PTS, i, p. 77.)*

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Garden[7] in the storied house of Migāra's mother. [2] And at that time the Blessed One in the evening having risen from quiet [contemplation][8] sat outside the door of the enclosure[9] (*bahi-dvāra-koṭṭhake*). And King Pasenadi the Kosalan[10] came to where the Blessed One was . . . and sat down at one side. [3] Then at that time seven Jaṭilas[11] and seven Nigaṇṭhas[12] and seven unclad ascetics (*acelā*)[13] and seven single-garment ascetics[14] (*eka-sātakā*) and seven Wanderers (*paribbājakā*)[15] with long nails and hair like thornbushes, carrying poles with requisites,[16] passed by near the Blessed One. [4] Then King Pasenadi the Kosalan rising from his seat having arranged his upper robe[17] over one shoulder bent his right knee to the ground and holding out joined palms[18] (*añjaliṃ*) towards . . . the ascetics, he thrice called out his name, saying: 'King Pasenadi the Kosalan am I, revered sirs; King Pasenadi the Kosalan am I.' [5] When . . . the ascetics had passed by then the king . . . went to where the Blessed One was. . . . [6] Seated at one side King Pasenadi the Kosalan spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Are these men, revered sir, some of those who are saints (*arahanto*)[19] in this world or are proceeding on the road to saintship?' . . .[20]

[1] Ch. 14 *a* § 1 [1]; see § 4 [110] below. The two words are separate, both of them being inflected.

[2] *Nipacc-ākāra*; the act of bowing or prostration. Cp. CV, VII. iii. 7.

[3] Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89]; see § 1 [101] above.

[4] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].

[5] *Sāmīci-kamma*; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i).

[6] Or Right-farer. This may indicate the leader or possibly any ordained follower of the faith. Ap. A 2 *c*.

[7] Ch. 18 *b*.

[8] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

[9] Or entrance; Ch. 18 *b* § 5. 'In the loggia outside the Eastern door', *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 104. The door appears to have been the door of the *pāsāda*, which possibly abutted on the highway.

[10] See § 2 [8] above.

[11] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1].

[12] Int. § 184; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92].

[13] Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15].

[14] Int. § 187; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*asceticism*).

[15] Int. § 126.

[16] *Khāri-vidha*. Cp. Ch. 2 § 7 [65] (*parikkhāra*); also Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [1] (*rolls*). Compare *khāri-vividhaṃ ādāya*, *Dīgha-Nik*. i, p. 101.

[17] Ch. 8 *j* § 3.

[18] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].

[19] Ap. D *c*.

[20] Buddha replies that it is difficult to judge anyone's qualities without long observation. The king assents, instancing his own spies and informers (*carā o arakā*); cp. Int. § 175 (*police*), and Int. § 172 (*ministers*).

§ 4. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 87* (*Piya-jātika-S.*).

. . .[1] [PTS, ii, p. 110.] Queen Mallikā (*Mallikā devī*)[2] went to where King Pasenadi[3] the Kosalan was and having arrived spoke . . . thus: 'What thinkest thou, Mahārāja;[4] is Vajīrī the princess (*kumārī*)[5] dear to thee?' ''Tis so, Mallikā, Vajīrī the princess is dear to me.' 'Then what thinkest thou, Mahārāja; upon any ill or vicissitude to thy dear (*te*) princess Vajīrī, would grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair arise?' 'Should any ill or vicissitude, Mallikā, happen to my dear (*me*) princess Vajīrī it would be a disaster in my life also.' . . . 'Is the lady Vāsabhā[6] dear to thee?' ''Tis so, Mallikā; the lady Vāsabhā is dear to me.' ' . . . Should any ill or vicissitude happen to thy dear lady Vāsabhā would grief . . . arise?' 'Should any ill . . . happen to my dear lady Vāsabhā it would be a disaster in my life also. . . .' 'Is Vidūdabha[7] the General (*senāpati*)[8] dear to thee?' [p. 111] ''Tis so, Mallikā. . . .' 'Then what thinkest thou, Mahārāja; should any ill . . . happen to Vidūdabha the General would grief . . . arise?' 'Should any ill . . . happen to my dear (*me*) Vidūdabha the General it would be a disaster in my life also. . . .' 'Am I dear to thee?' ''Tis so, Mallikā, thou art dear to me.' 'Then what thinkest thou, Mahārāja; should any ill . . . happen to me would grief . . . arise.' 'Should any ill . . . happen to thee, my dear Mallikā, it would be a disaster in my life also. . . .' 'Are the Kāsis and Kosalas (*Kāsi-Kosalā*)[9] dear to thee?' ''Tis so, Mallikā.' ' . . . Should any ill . . . happen to thy Kāsis and Kosalas would grief . . . arise?' 'Should any ill . . . happen to my Kāsis and Kosalas it would be a disaster in my life also. . . .' 'Thus then, Mahārāja, was it fittingly said by the comprehending far-seeing Saint, the Supremely Enlightened:[10] "Dear ones [like all things belonging to individuality] bring grief,[11] lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair, things not dear".' . .

§ 5. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 3*), *Sutta 13* (*Doṇapāka*). (*PTS, i, p. 81.*)

[1] He was staying at Sāvatthi.[12] Now at that time King Pasenadi the Kosalan ate a very heavy meal (*doṇa-pākaṃ*)[13] [2] and . . . replete after the meal went to where the Blessed One was. . . . [3] And the Blessed One regarding King Pasenadi the Kosalan (*Pasenadi-*

[1] The scene is Sāvatthi. A saying of the Buddha that loved ones bring pain has been reported in the king's palace.
[2] Ch. 14 c § 10 [1]. [3] See § 2 [8] above. [4] Ch. 3 § 2. Cp. Ch. 1 § 5 [52] (*deva*).
[5] Or, the young maiden. Cp. Ch. 7 b § 4 [92] n (*kumāra*).
[6] Literally, Vāsabhā the Kshatriya (lady). 'Your queen Vāsabhā', SBB, vi, p. 58. Other ladies of Pasenadi's family are mentioned in Ch. 14 f § 12 [126].
[7] Int. § 169 (iii); Ch. 14 f § 12 [127] n. This prince appears in the Nikāyas occasionally and only as the attentive and loved son of King Pasenadi. The accounts of his subsequent career of crime and violence are commentarial.
[8] Cp. Ch. 4 § 1 [68]. Literally, army-lord; cp. Ch. 7 a § 11 [2] (*Seniya*).
[9] Ch. 15 a § 3 [11]; and Int. § 162. [10] Ch. 23 a [9].
[11] *Soka*; cp. Ch. 5 b § 5; Ap. E b; and Ap. B c § 2 [2] (*despair*). [12] Ch. 18 e § 1.
[13] Cp. [7] below (*nāḷikā*); also Ch. 13 c § 10 [24] (*thāli-pāka*).

Kosalaṃ)[1] replete after his meal at that time uttered this verse (*gāthaṃ*):[2]

The mortal who is thoroughly wise,
Keeps measure in the food he eats,
O'er him sense pleasures lose their power,
For him life passing gently fleets.

[4] At that time the young (*mānavo*)[3] Sudassana[4] was standing behind the king. . . . [5] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan instructed the young Sudassana, saying: 'Come thou, my good (*tāta*)[5] Sudassana, having learnt this verse in the presence of the Blessed One recite it to me when my meals are brought and I will grant thee a hundred kahāpanas[6] daily as permanent alms (*nicca-bhikkhaṃ*).'[7] . . . [7] The king by degrees fixed a *nāḷika*[8] of boiled rice[9] as his maximum.

§ 6. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 3*), *Sutta 8* (*Mallikā*). (*PTS, i, p. 75.*)

[1] Sāvatthi.[10] [2] Now at that time King Pasenadi the Kosalan[11] had gone to the roof of the royal palace[12] with Queen[13] Mallikā.[14] [3] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan spoke to Queen Mallikā, saying: 'Now is there, Mallikā, anyone dearer to thee than self (*attanā*)?' [4] 'There is, Mahārāja, none dearer to me than the Self (*Attanā*).[15] Then is there, Mahārāja, anyone dearer to thee than self?' [5] 'There is too, Mallikā, none dearer to me than the Self.' [6] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan having descended from the palace went to the Blessed One. . . .[16] [8] And the Blessed One regarding this matter[17] at that time uttered this verse:[18]

Traverse all regions with the thoughtful mind
Naught will it reach more dear than is the Self (*Attanā*);
Even so dear the common[19] self (*puthu attā*) of others.
Who seeks the Self[20] [the All], will injure (*hiṃse*)[21] none.

[1] See § 2 [8] above.
[2] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.
[3] *Mānava* usually means a young Brāhman (Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91]). Such here would probably be a graduate of one of the numerous Brāhman academies (Ch. 14 *d* § 6 [2]) and would be learned in ritual literature and Brāhmanic law, accomplishments useful in a secretary. His presence in the royal household would not be inconsistent with the king's acceptance of Buddha's teaching (cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [127] n).
[4] Sudassana is said commentarially to have been the son of the king's sister, but the text makes it probable that he was a young Brāhman secretary.
[5] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].
[6] Int. § 189 (*money*).
[7] Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163].
[8] A measure said to be a quarter of a *doṇa*; see [1] above.
[9] *Odana*; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11].
[10] Ch. 18 *e* § 1.
[11] See § 2 [8] above.
[12] *Pāsāda-vara*; Ch. 3 § 1.
[13] *Devī*; Ch. 1 § 3.
[14] Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [1].
[15] The One, the Vedāntic universal Self. Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; and Int. § 39 (*Whole*). The dialogue was probably constructed as a setting to the concluding verses (see [8] below), where the solution of its subtleties may be sought.
[16] The king repeats the conversation.
[17] Ch. 8 *b* § 1.
[18] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.
[19] *Puthu* means ordinary, common, separate. Cp. Ap. E *c* ii (*temporary self*).
[20] *Atta-kāma*; Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [2]; and Int. § 35 (i), *Param-ātman*. See [4] above. The meaning of these lines can scarcely be that all men love themselves and this self-love is a bond between them.
[21] Int. § 49.

§ 7. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Kosala-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 3), Suttas 14, 15 (Saṅgāme dve vuttāni).*[1] *(PTS, i, p. 82.)*

He was staying at Sāvatthi.[2] [1] The Māgadhan King Ajātasattu,[3] son of the Videhan princess (*vedehi-putto*),[4] having collected a fourfold[5] army marched against King Pasenadi the Kosalan (*Pasenadi-Kosalaṃ*)[6] in Kāsi[7] (*yena Kāsī*). [2] . . . [3] And King Pasenadi the Kosalan having collected a fourfold army marched against the Māgadhan King Ajātasattu . . . in Kāsi. [4] . . . And in that conflict (*saṅgāme*) the Māgadhan king . . . defeated King Pasenadi the Kosalan, and the defeated king . . . retreated towards his own capital (*rāja-dhāniṃ*)[8] Sāvatthi. [5] And many mendicant brothers in the forenoon . . . entered Sāvatthi for alms. . . . After their meal . . . those mendicant brothers spoke to the Blessed One thus: [6] ' . . .[9] King Pasenadi the Kosalan has been defeated and has retreated towards his own capital Sāvatthi.' [7] 'The Māgadhan king, mendicant brothers, Ajātasattu[10] son of the Videhan princess', he said, 'is a friend, companion, and intimate of evil;[11] and King Pasenadi[12] the Kosalan is a friend, companion, and intimate of good.[13] To-day King Pasenadi the Kosalan will lie down at night in sorrow, having been defeated.

Conquest makes enmity.[14] In sorrow bide the conquered.
The tranquil[15] bide in bliss[16] sans conquest, sans defeat.'

[8] . . .[17] [11] Again the Māgadhan king . . . and King Pasenadi the Kosalan met in conflict. And in the conflict King Pasenadi the Kosalan defeated the Māgadhan king . . . and took him prisoner alive. [12] And this thought came to King Pasenadi the Kosalan: 'What though this Māgadhan king . . . injures me who have not injured him yet he is my sister's son (*bhāgineyyo*).[18] What if now I should take away his whole array[19] of elephants . . . cavalry . . .

[1] 'Two sayings on conflict.' These pieces like the rest of the contents of the *Kosala-saṃyutta* are concise verses ascribed to Buddha with a commentarial setting rather than Suttas or outlines of discourses. Int. § 21 (*commentaries*).

[2] Ch. 18 *e* § 1. If the narrative is accurate then Buddha, who visited Rājagaha about the time of Ajātasattu's usurpation of power (cp. Ch. 19 *c* § 1 [392] n) must have returned to Sāvatthi for a period before starting from Rājagaha on his last journey.

[3] Int. § 166.

[4] Int. § 168.

[5] See [12] below; Int. § 175.

[6] See § 2 [8] above.

[7] Ch. 15 *a*. The territory of the Kāsis seems to be indicated. The city of Benāres became known as Kāsī and is still so called.

[8] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3].

[9] Omitting repetitions.

[10] Int. § 166.

[11] *Papa*; Ch. 20 § 3 (6). This unqualified condemnation may perhaps be attributed to later Kosalan feeling rather than to Buddha; cp. Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [100] (*reparation*).

[12] Int. § 169 (i); see § 1 [97] above.

[13] *Kalyāṇa*; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6].

[14] *Vera*; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5). These lines appear in Dhp. (201).

[15] *Upasanta* means 'calm, without desire or grasping'. The meaning is illustrated in *Sutta-Nipāta*, 848, 919; and in Dhp. 378.

[16] *Sukha*; Ap. E *b*, *Note* (*joy*).

[17] Omitting repetitions.

[18] Evidently a commentarial inexactitude. Pasenadi's sister (Int. § 168) married King Bimbisāra, but Ajātasattu was Bimbisāra's son by another wife. See RDBI, pp. 3, 4.

[19] See [1] above; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] (*retinue*).

chariots . . . and infantry, and release him alive?' [13] . . . and he released him alive. [14] . . . [16] The Blessed One regarding this matter at that time uttered these verses:

A man despoils another as far as profits him;
When others him despoil, he spoil'd despoils in turn.
'It stops here' thinks the fool, until his deed has ripened;
When his ill-deed shall ripen, he will encounter sorrow.[1]
A slayer finds a slayer; the victor victor finds;
Ill-speaking meets ill-speech; the angry anger find.
As act to act[2] succeeds the spoiled despoils in turn.

d. Great Discourses in Sāvatthi

§ 1. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 62 (Mahā-Rāhul-ovāda-S.).*[3]

[PTS, i, p. 420.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana,[4] Anāthapiṇḍika's garden. And the Blessed One in the forenoon[5] . . . proceeded towards[6] Sāvatthi for alms; and the venerable Rāhula [p. 421] . . . accompanied the Blessed One walking behind. And the Blessed One turning aside[7] instructed the venerable Rāhula, saying: 'Whatever is material-form (*rūpaṃ*),[8] Rāhula . . .[9] must be regarded with right insight as it really is, thus: "This is not mine[10] [permanently], I am not this, this is not the [permanent] Self (*attā*)[11] of me." . . . Material-form [must be so regarded], Rāhula, and also sensation and perception and individual character (*saṅkhārā*)[12] and intellect.' . . .[13] The venerable Rāhula in the evening having risen from quiet[14] [meditation] went to where the Blessed One was. . . . [To him seated at one side the Blessed One said:] 'Whatsoever is personal[15] (*ajjh-attaṃ*), Rāhula, individual (*paccattaṃ*),[16] hard, dense, tangible . . .[17] this is called, Rāhula, the personal earth-element (*pathavī-dhātu*). Now that which is the personal (*ajjh-attikā*) earth-element and that which is the external (*bāhirā*) earth-element—these

[1] These two lines appear with a slight change in Dhp. (69).
[2] Pāli *kamma-vivaṭṭena* (by the evolution of action). Cp. Ap. B (*results of action*); also Ap. D *a* § 4 (335), *spreading*.
[3] Advice to Rāhula; Ch. 11 *d* § 9 [414]. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* (*Singāl-ovāda*).
[4] Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1].
[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
[6] *Pāvisi* usually means 'entered', but the present rendering makes the scene more likely.
[7] 'Without looking round', SBB, v, p. 300.
[8] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [38].
[9] As in Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [44].
[10] Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45].
[11] Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]; also Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [4]. 'This is no self of mine', SBB, v, p. 301. This last phrase may be rendered: 'this is not a permanent individual, I, myself, a being resembling the Selfsame'; cp. Ap. E *c* i. The life, the breath, in things is not individual but universal; cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5) [487].
[12] Or, will; Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40]. 'The constituents', SBB, v, p. 300.
[13] Rāhula without entering the city turns aside to meditate.
[14] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].
[15] Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 7 (*inner*).
[16] Ap. E *c* ii § 3; cp. Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*).
[17] As in Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [5], but the parts of the body here enumerated are only 19.

constitute the earth-element.[1] It must be regarded with right insight as it really is, thus: "This is not mine [permanently], I am not this, this is not the [permanent] Self of me." [p. 422.] Having regarded this as it really is one becomes indifferent[2] to the earth-element, one frees the mind from desire[3] of the earth-element. And what, Rāhula, is the water-element? The water-element may be personal or external. . . . The fire-element may be personal or external. . . . The air-element may be personal or external. . . . [p. 423.] The ether-element[4] (*ākāsadhātu*) may be personal or external. . . . Having regarded this [and the other elements] with right insight as it really is one becomes indifferent to the ether-element, one frees the mind from desire of the ether-element [as of the other elements].

. . .[5] [p. 424.] Cultivate, Rāhula, the development[6] of loving-kindness;[7] as thou cultivatest the development of loving-kindness any malevolence[8] (*byāpādo*) will be abandoned. Cultivate the development of pity; as thou cultivatest the development of pity any spite (*vihesā*) will be abandoned. . . . As thou cultivatest the development of sympathetic-joy any discontent (*arati*) will be abandoned. . . . As thou cultivatest the development of serenity any resentment (*patigho*)[9] will be abandoned. Cultivate the development of [meditation on] the unclean (*asubhaṃ*);[10] as thou cultivatest the development of [meditation on] the unclean any desire (*rāgo*)[11] will be abandoned. . . . [p. 425.] As thou cultivatest the development of the perception of transience[12] any conceit "I am" (*asmi-māno*)[13] will be abandoned. Cultivate the development of mindfulness[14] in inhaling and exhaling;[15] mindfulness in inhaling and exhaling, when exercised, when frequently practised, is greatly fruitful, greatly advantageous.[16] . . .[17] One trains oneself thinking I exhale, I inhale, contemplating impermanence.[18] . . . contemplating the fading away [of desire] . . .

[1] Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23].

[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4].

[3] *Vi-rājeti*; cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 4 (*vi-rāgā*).

[4] Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6] n; also Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*space*). 'Space-element', SBB, v, p. 302. The cavities in the body are apparently meant. The text specifies the hollows in the ears, nostrils, mouth, and so forth, without clear differentiation from the preceding element. A later paragraph (p. 424) states that '*ākāsa* bides nowhere (*ākāso na katthaci patiṭṭhito*)'.

[5] Omitting an exhortation to emulate the tranquil indifference (cp. Ap. F 2 *a*, 144, *resentment*) of the earth, water, and other elements.

[6] *Bhāvanaṃ bhāvehi*; Ap. I *a* (*Exercises*).

[7] *Mettā*; this and the three following virtues constitute the self-transcendent *Brahma-vihārā* (Ap. F 2 *b*).

[8] Ap. D *a* § 8 ii. This is the first in a list of six vices (Ap. F 2, n). They end as they begin in self-importance.

[9] Impatience or ill-will. Ap. F 2 *a* (144).

[10] Ch. 20 § 6 (3); cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [5].

[11] Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[12] *Anicca-saññā*; Ap. E *a* (i).

[13] Ch. 4 § 14 [4].

[14] *Sati*, self-scrutiny or mindfulness regarding the relation of the individual-self to the universe: Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*self-knowledge*); Ch. 9 *a* (*attention*).

[15] *Ān-āpāna-sati*; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2].

[16] Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]. The advantages here are spiritual.

[17] As in Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [7–12] with change of person.

[18] *A-nicca*, transience; Ap. E, *Note*.

contemplating the cessation [of craving] . . . contemplating renunciation.[1] Thus exercised, thus frequently practised, mindfulness in inhaling and exhaling is greatly fruitful, greatly advantageous. . . .' [p. 426.] Thus spoke the Blessed One; the venerable Rāhula rejoicing welcomed the word[2] of the Blessed One.

§ 2. *Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 99* (*Subha-S.*).

[PTS, ii, p. 196.] . . . The Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana,[3] Anāthapiṇḍika's garden. Now at that time the young[4] [Brāhman] Subha,[5] son of the Tudi[6] [Brāhman], was visiting Sāvatthi on some business and was staying in the dwelling of a certain householder.[7] . . .[8] [p. 197.] And Subha . . . hearkening to the householder went to where the Blessed One was. . . . Seated at one side the young [Brāhman] . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The Brāhmans,[9] O (*bho*) Gotama, say thus: "A householder (*gahaṭṭho*)[10] is [in the straight way of] achieving (*ārādhako*) [true] method, law and good[11] (*kusalaṃ*); one who withdraws[12] [from household life] does not achieve [true] method, law and good." Regarding this what does the respected Gotama say?' 'On this point, young sir (*mānava*),[13] my opinion is conditional, on this point I have not a rigid opinion.[14] . . . Both the householder and one who withdraws [from household life] acting rightly, because and on account of right action, achieves [true] method, law and good.' . . .[15]

[p. 199.] 'The Brāhmans, O Gotama, enjoin five conditions (*dhamme*)[16] for the forming of merit,[17] for the achieving[18] of [the highest] good (*kusalassa ārādhanāya*).[19] . . . Truth[20] is the first condition that the Brāhmans enjoin. . . . Austerity[21] is the second condition. . . .

[1] Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [13].
[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].
[3] Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1].
[4] *Mānava*; Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].
[5] Another account of Subha's conversion is given in *Majjh.* 134. He is also the interlocutor in *Dīgha* 10 (Ch. 14 *d* § 8).
[6] *Todeyya*; Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [1].
[7] *Gahapati*. The caste is not definitely indicated; cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 5 [290].
[8] Subha inquires what *samaṇa* or *brāhmaṇa* he might attend; cp. Ch. 14 *e* § 1 [4].
[9] Int. § 190.
[10] In a sentence following shortly the word *gihī* is used; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2].
[11] Cp. Ch. 2 § 5 [163]. See [199] [207, *infinite*], below.
[12] *Pabbajita*; Ch. 1 § 9 [59] (*retired*).
[13] Int. § 190 (*address*).
[14] *N'āham ekaṃsa-vādo*, I am not (a teacher) with a one-sided (one-pointed) theory; see Ap. C *b*, *Note* (*layman*). In a subsequent passage (see [204] below) Buddha is represented as pointing out the spiritual disadvantages of a lay life.
[15] A discussion on a busy life is omitted.
[16] See [204] n below. Cp. Ch. 20 § 2 [6]; and Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]. See Ap. F 2 (*Virtues*).
[17] *Puñña*; Ap. B *a* § 6 [9].
[18] Cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79] (*developed*).
[19] See [197] above. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [163]; and Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4] *Brahma-sahavyatā*. Concerning ancient Indian mystical aims compare Dr. W. R. Inge's remarks on Greek mysteries in an essay included in a collection called *The Legacy of Greece* (1921), pp. 48–51.
[20] *Sacca*; truthfulness. Ap. F 2 *a* (147).
[21] *Tapas*; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10] (*self-rule*).

Chaste-living[1] is the third condition. . . . Learning[2] is the fourth condition. . . . Renunciation[3] is the fifth condition that the Brāhmans enjoin for the forming of merit, for the achieving of [the highest] good. . . . Regarding this what does the respected Gotama say?' 'What then, young sir, is there among the Brāhmans even one who says thus: "I fully know and realize and declare the [ultimate] effect[4] of these five conditions?"' 'There is not, O Gotama.' 'What then, is there among the Brāhmans any teacher or teacher of a teacher[5] up to the seventh generation of teachers who say thus: "I know fully and realize by myself (*sayaṃ*)[6] and declare the [ultimate] effect of these five conditions?"' 'There is not, O Gotama.' [p. 200.] '. . .[7] It is as if[8] a line of blind men were arranged one after another the foremost does not see and the midmost does not see and the last does not see. . . .' On this being said the young [Brāhman] Subha . . . disturbed . . . spoke thus: 'The Brāhman Pokkharasāti[9] the Opamaññan, O Gotama, [lord] of Subhaga-vana,[10] says thus: "So now these few [unorthodox] religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*)[11] profess [capacity] above [ordinary] human-nature (*uttari-manussa-dhammā*)[12] as a mark of fully Aryan[13] knowledge and vision;[14] this claim of theirs [p. 201] proves indeed ridiculous. . . . How indeed should anyone born a mortal . . . realize what is above human-nature? . . ."' 'What then, young sir, does the Brāhman Pokkharasāti . . . comprehend and fully know the inmost mind (*cetasā ceto*)[15] of all [unorthodox] religious teachers? . . .[16] [p. 203.] There are five obstacles (*nīvaranā*)[17] . . . the obstacle of sensuous-desire, the obstacle of ill-will, the obstacle of slothful torpor, the obstacle of ill-conceit, the obstacle of

[1] *Brahma-cariya*; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (3).
[2] *Ajjhena*; repetition (of mantras). This becomes *sajjhaya* on p. 205 below. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24] (*texts*); also Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133] (*Vedas*).
[3] *Cāga*, self-denial or generosity; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]. 'Munificence', SBB, vi, p. 114.
[4] *Vipāka*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23]. The five virtues are not depreciated by Gotama, but he apparently implies that the Brāhmans do not relate them to any convincing spiritual climax. He apparently did not attribute to the orthodox Brāhmans of Kosala participation in the monistic theories of the Upanishads Int. §§ 81, 178, *Vedānta*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*, *Māyā*). He himself shared consciously or unconsciously these monistic views. The later *Mahāyāna* (Ap. D *b*) developments in Buddhism arose hence.
[5] *Ācariya-pācariya*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14].
[6] Ap. E *c* ii § 1.
[7] Gotama challenges the ancient Rishis; as in Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13] with consequential changes.
[8] Ch. 6 *a* § 7.
[9] Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9] n. In the *Soṇadaṇḍa-S.* (*Dīgha* 4, PTS, i, p. 116) it is said that Pokkharasāti with his family and friends took refuge in the Samaṇa Gotama. His second name does not appeari n any other passage in the four Nikāyas.
[10] Subhaga-grove, in or near Ukkaṭṭha; Ch. 14 *d* § 3. See SBE, xi, p. 168.
[11] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [ii. 37]. The term here evidently includes Buddhists.
[12] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].
[13] *Alam-ariya*; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 5.
[14] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 4 § 16 (*knowledge*).
[15] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].
[16] Subha acknowledges the impossibility. Buddha says that what one Brāhman does not know is not necessarily non-existent. The best-known Brāhmans of Kosala (Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 i [2], *Todeyya*) are then included.
[17] Ap. D *a* § 9 (iv).

doubt. . . . By these five obstacles the Brāhman Pokkharasāti . . . is encompassed. Can he indeed know or see or realize what is above human-nature, the mark of fully Aryan knowledge and vision? . . . There are five sense-pleasure strands (*kāma-guṇa*).[1] What five? Material-forms perceptible by the eye . . . sounds . . . odours . . . tastes . . . substances perceptible by touch. . . . By these sense-pleasure-strands the Brāhman Pokkharasāti . . . is entangled, not seeing the dangers,[2] not perceiving the escape.[3] Can he indeed know or see or realize what is above human-nature. . . . [p. 204.] Here a mendicant brother detached from sense-pleasures, detached from evil thoughts (*dhammehi*)[4] attains and dwells in the first contemplation (*paṭhama-jjhānaṃ*);[5] this indeed is a joy (*pīti*)[6] apart from sense-pleasures, apart from evil thoughts. Then further a mendicant brother by the subsidence of reasoning and investigation attains and dwells in the second contemplation; this indeed is a joy apart from sense-pleasures, apart from evil thoughts. . . .'[7]

[p. 206.] 'This has been heard by me, O Gotama: "The devotee Gotama knows the path to union with the Brahmās."[8] . . . [p. 207.] This has been heard by me, O Gotama: "The devotee Gotama shows the path to union with the Brahmās." It would be well should the respected Gotama show to me the path to union with the Brahmās.' 'Then, young sir, listen well, pay attention, I will speak. . . . Here a mendicant brother with a mind full of loving-kindness[9] abides suffusing one world-quarter, then a second, then a third, then a fourth. Thus he stays whilst he suffuses the whole world above, below, across, on all sides, in all completeness with a mind full of loving-kindness, wide, extended, infinite[10] (*a-ppamānena*), without enmity, without ill-will. With the liberation of the mind through loving-kindness thus developed, he will not stay, he will not stop at what is finite[11] (*yaṃ pamāna-kataṃ*). . . . And again a mendicant brother abides with a mind full of pity . . . with a mind full of sympathetic joy . . . with a mind full of serenity . . . wide, extended, [p. 208] infinite,

[1] Ap. D *a* § 9 (i).

[2] *Ādīnava*; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*misery*).

[3] *Nissarana*; Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3]. Cp. *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, p. 240; *Majjh-Nik.* i, p. 87.

[4] Ap. B *b* § 3 [6] (*evil conditions*).

[5] Only two of the four Jhānas are mentioned here; Ap. I *a*.

[6] Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

[7] A further discussion of the Brāhmans' five points (see [199] above) follows. Incidentally the distribution of food to the Brāhmans at sacrifices (Int. § 185, *ritual*) is mentioned. It is declared that a household life is a detriment to spiritual progress (see [198] n above).

[8] Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [37]. The word *sahavyatā* may mean companionship or union according to the context. The mention of these deities in the plural is an acknowledgement of their limitation and finiteness. In the *Tevijja-Sutta* (Int. § 35, i) Gotama speaks of union with Brahman, the fundamental infinite divinity (Int. § 37), and the present passage must be reconciled therewith and with the use of the word *appamāna*, unlimited, infinite (see [207] below).

[9] *Mettā*; Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. This is the first of the four beautiful *Brahma-vihārā* (Int. § 32).

[10] Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] n.

[11] Cp. [197, *kusala*], [206, *union with the Brahmās*], above; also Ap. G 2 *a* § 7 (*akaṭa*).

without enmity, without illwill. With the liberation[1] of the mind through serenity thus developed he will not stay, he will not stop at what is finite.' . . .[2]

e. Sāvatthi: General Survey; Unclassified References

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Devatā-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 1), iii Satti-vagga. (PTS, i, p. 13.)*

Sāvatthi series (*Sāvatthi-nidānaṃ*).[3] Standing at one side the spirit (*devatā*)[4] in the presence of the Blessed One uttered this verse (*gāthaṃ*):[5]

(1) *By the Sword*

'As one touched by the sword
With fire about his head,[6]
Lust and desire[7] dispelling,
So should the thoughtful mendicant go forth.'

'As one touched by the sword
With fire about his head,
The dream of self[8] dispelling,
So should the thoughtful mendicant go forth' [the Blessed One rejoined].

. . . . . .

(3) *The Mesh*[9]

'Enmeshed within, enmeshed without,
The human race in mesh is meshed.
O Gotama, I ask thee this—
Who shall uncoil this mesh?'

'He who is wise, on duty (*sīle*)[10] fixed
Ruling his heart and mind,
The zealous mendicant well-trained—
He shall "this mesh uncoil".

[1] *Ceto-vimutti*; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].

[2] Subha is converted and becomes a lay follower. Rebirth is not mentioned (IN 2 *a*), beyond a bare allusion to reaching the Brahma-world.

[3] Ch. 14 *b* § 7; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) n. The third chapter (*vagga*) of the first *saṃyutta* of the *Saṃ. Nik.* is headed *Sāvatthi-nidānaṃ* (Sāvatthi series or connexion). The chapter consists apparently of a residue of partially classified pieces facing the redactor, possibly Buddhaghosha himself (Int. § 21) at the end of his labours. This residue may well have been in manuscript and scruple may have prevented him from adding a definite scene, or possibly lack of suggestive detail in the piece itself. There is similarly a collection headed *Rājagaha-nidānaṃ* (Ch. 11 *c*, n). Similar headings are *Sāvatthiyam* (Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [1]) and merely *Sāvatthi* (Ch. 14 *a* § 4).

[4] Int. § 35. The individual deity is not specified either here or in the preceding *vagga*.

[5] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

[6] i.e. as one in haste, escaping from sword and fire. Buddhaghosha's explanation is more elaborate; see *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 19.

[7] *Kāma-rāga*; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[8] *Sakkāya-diṭṭhi*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii). Cp. (3) below (*The Mesh*).

[9] Selfhood; cp. (1) above (*the dream of self*).

[10] Ap. H 4 *a*.

They whose desires, whose enmities,
Whose ignorance[1] have fall'n away,
The saintly ones from taints[2] set free,
For them no snare is coil'd.
Where name and form[3] have ceased to be,
Where naught [of self] remains,
Repugnance[4] nor the joy of form[5]—
There is the mesh uncoil'd.'

. . . .

§ 2. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga, Devaputta-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 2), iii Nānātiṭṭhiya-vagga. (PTS, i, pp. 63–6.)*

[1] Sāvatthi series (*Sāvatthi-nidānaṃ*).[6] [2] And the venerable Ānanda[7] came to where the Blessed One was. . . . To him seated at one side the Blessed One spoke thus: 'Does Sāriputta[8] indeed please thee also, Ānanda?' [3] 'How indeed, revered sir, should the venerable Sāriputta not be pleasing to one who is not foolish, corrupted, erring, confused in mind? The venerable Sāriputta is wise (*paṇḍito*),[9] revered sir; the venerable Sāriputta has great insight[10] . . . wide insight . . . blissful insight . . . swift insight . . . acute insight . . . discriminating insight. The venerable Sāriputta, revered sir, has few desires . . . is contented . . . detached . . . not gregarious . . . vigorous in undertaking[11] (*āraddha-viriyo*) . . . a teacher[12] (*vattā*) . . . forbearing in speech . . . exhorting . . . censuring evil. . . .'[13] [4] 'Even so, Ānanda, even so. . . .'[14] [5–13] . . .[15]

f. The Disciples in Sāvatthi

§ 1. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 22), Sutta 83*[16] *(Ānanda). (PTS, iii, p. 105.)*

[1] . . . The venerable Ānanda[17] stayed at Sāvatthi in Anāthapiṇḍika's garden.[18] [2] And there the venerable Ānanda instructed the

[1] Ap. D *b*. Here *avijjā* (ignorance) is used as the equivalent of *moha* (delusion), the third of the Three Fires; Ap. D *a* § 10, ii (251).
[2] Ap. D *a* § 7.
[3] *Nāmañca rūpañca*; separate selfhood, sense of distinctive being. Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].
[4] *Paṭigha*; Ap. F 2 *a* (144).
[5] *Rūpa-saññā*; cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *rūpa-rāga*).
[6] Ch. 14 *b* § 7.
[7] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[8] Ch. 10 *c* (2).
[9] Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [53]. See also Ap. H (*Ideals of conduct*). The first seven epithets appear also in Buddha's own eulogy of Sāriputta in *Majjh.* 111.
[10] Ch. 10 *c* (2).
[11] Ch. 16 *c* § 3 (iv); and Ch. 10 *c* (18).
[12] For a similar list of qualities in a preacher see Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [4].
[13] Omitting repetition.
[14] Buddha repeats Ānanda's phrases.
[15] The *devaputta* Susima together with a great company of similar spirits appears before Buddha and repeats Ānanda's eulogy of Sāriputta, and Buddha again confirms these praises. The whole celestial company delighted glows with [the four] colours (Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [3] n). Verses on the same theme follow (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). The word *devaputta* frequently signifies a spirit lately released from human life (Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [262]; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [2] n; also Int. §§ 35, 93 [vi]).
[16] Cp. Ch. 5 *c* (*Second Sermon*).
[17] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[18] Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [1].

mendicant brothers . . . thus: [3] 'The venerable Puṇṇa[1] the son of Mantānī,[2] friends, was indeed very helpful to us being then juniors[3] (*navakānaṃ*). He used to exhort us with this exhortation:[4] ". . . [4] How is the notion 'I am (*asmī-ti*)'[5] derived . . .?" "Derived from[6] material-form . . . from feeling . . . from perception . . . from individual-will (*saṅkhāre*)[7] . . . from intellect . . . is the notion 'I am'." [5] . . .[8] [6] "Then what thinkest thou, friend Ānanda: Is material-form permanent (*niccaṃ*) or impermanent?"[9] "Impermanent, friend (*āvuso*)." [7–10] "And feeling . . . perception . . . individual-will . . . intellect, are they permanent or impermanent?" "Impermanent, friend." [11] "Therefore (*tasmātiha*)[10] that which is impermanent, is that suffering[11] or happy?" "Suffering, friend." "That then which is impermanent, suffering, and by nature changeable (*viparināma-dhammaṃ*) is it proper to regard it thus 'This is mine, I am this, this is my permanent self'"?[12] "No indeed, friend." . . .[13] [12] "Regarding them thus, friend Ānanda, an instructed disciple of the noble[14] becomes indifferent[15] to material-form . . . feeling . . . perception . . . individual-will . . . intellect. Becoming indifferent he becomes free from desire; through non-desire he is liberated. When he is liberated there arises in him the knowledge 'I am liberated'. He knows 'Separate existence is ended; the holy-life is lived; what ought to be done has been done; there is nothing beyond this state (*nāparaṃ itthattāyā-ti*).'"[16] [13] The venerable Puṇṇa was most helpful to us. . . .'

§ 2. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 66. (PTS, i, p. 193.)*

[1] . . . The venerable Nandaka[17] stayed at Sāvatthi in the Eastern Garden[18] in the storied house of Migāra's mother. And Sālha Migāra's[19] grandson and Rohana Pekhuniya's grandson came to where the venerable Nandaka was. . . . To Sālha Migāra's grandson seated by his side the venerable Nandaka spoke thus: [2] . . .[20] [8] 'Then what

[1] Ch. 10 *c* (9). [2] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1] n. [3] Ch. 8 *g* § 2.
[4] *Ovāda*; cp. Ch. 9 *b* (*Singāl-ovāda*). [5] Ap. D *b* § 2 [6].
[6] *Upādāya*; derived, derivatory, secondary. [7] Ap. E *a* ii § 2.
[8] Omitting the simile of a ace seen in a mirror (*ādāsa*) or in a bowl of clear water; Int. § 190 (*toilet*). [9] Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42].
[10] Ch. 21 § 14 n. [11] Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42].
[12] Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]. It is assumed as in contemporary Upanishads (Int. § 178, *Vedāntist*) that the universal Self is the origin and end of all individual things and permeates and encompasses all individuals. Being without origination it is without cessation (Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]), whereas all individuals comprised within it are transient and cease to be. They have no permanent principle save the divine universal Spirit which suffuses all individual things without distinction and cannot be separated.
[13] As in Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [44–5]. See Sutta 79 of *Saṃyutta* xxii where the full text here abbreviated is to be found amongst other matter.
[14] Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7]. [15] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4]. [16] Ch. 5 *c* § 5 [46].
[17] Ch. 10 *c* (42). [18] Ch. 18 *b*. [19] Ch. 18 *b* § 1 [161].
[20] On the unprofitableness of the three great Faults, elsewhere called the Three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10).

think ye, Sālha [and you Rohana][1]—is non-greed (*a-lobho*) [attainable]?' 'Even so, revered sir.' 'Non-covetousness,[2] thus I state the meaning (*attham*), Sālha. . . . [9] Then what think ye—is non-enmity (*adoso*) [attainable]?' 'Even so, revered sir.' 'Non-malice,[3] thus I state the meaning, Sālha. . . . [10] Then what think ye—is non-delusion (*a-moha*)[4] [attainable]?' 'Even so, revered sir.' 'Knowledge,[5] thus I state the meaning, Sālha. . . .[6] [13] Then the disciple of the noble,[7] Sālha, thus divested of covetousness, divested of malice, non-infatuated, understanding, self-scrutinizing,[8] abides suffusing with a mind full of loving-kindness . . . full of pity . . . full of sympathetic joy, full of serenity[9] one world-quarter, then a second, then a third, then the fourth. . . .[10]

He thus knows: "There is this [existence], it is low (*hīnam*); there is a chosen[11] [existence], it is the escape[12] (*nissaranam*), beyond this percipient[13] [existence]. When he thus knows, thus sees, his mind is liberated from the taint[14] of sensuous pleasure . . . from the taint of individuality . . . from the taint of ignorance. In him liberated there arises the knowledge of his liberation. He knows: 'Separate-existence is ended; the holy-life is lived; what must be done is done; there is nothing [individual] beyond this [existence].'[15] . . . Thus in this very life[16] being without hunger,[17] [with desire] extinguished (*nibbuto*),[18] cooled,[19] he abides experiencing bliss[20] by being himself [one with] Brahman[21] (*Brahma-bhūtena attanā*).

[1] The plural form Sālhā includes idiomatically the rest of the audience.
[2] *An-abhijjhā*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2].
[3] *A-vyāpāda*; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *ill-will*).
[4] See the Three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10).
[5] *Vijjā*; knowledge of the self and its transient nature; Ap. D *a* §10 (ii, *delusion*).
[6] On the unprofitableness of evil and the profitableness of good actions (*kusalā dhammā*; Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]), as in Sutta 65 [4–13], where the words are attributed to Buddha.
[7] Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7].
[8] *Pati-ssata*; cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1] (*satimat*).
[9] These are the four beautiful *Brahma-vihārā* or divine moods of infinite love, infinite pity, infinite sympathy, infinite serenity; Ap. F 2 *b*, and Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [207] (*infinite*).
[10] As in the closing sentence of Ap. F 2 *b* [6] (*world*).
[11] The Pāli word is *panītam*; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4] n.
[12] Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3]. Cp. *Nibbāna* (Ap. C *b*); also *Jhāna* (Ap. I *a*). Contrast *Three Refuges* (Ap. H 1 *c*).
[13] *Sañña-gata*; cp. Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] (*non-perception*).
[14] Ap. D *a* § 7 (*āsavā*).
[15] Ch. 4 § 17. 'There is no more of this state for me', *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 178.
[16] *Ditth'eva dhamme*; Ap. C *b* § 4.
[17] *Ni-cchāta*; Ap. E *b* § 2 [8]. Cp. Ap. D *a* (*thirst*).
[18] Ch. 2 § 2 (*at peace*).
[19] Tranquillized; Ap. C *b* § 2 [8] (*sīti-bhūta*).
[20] *Sukha*; Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].
[21] Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [37]; also Ch. 1 § 11 (*union*). 'Of himself . . . by becoming Brahma', *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 178.

CHAPTER 19

LAST VISIT TO RĀJAGAHA: THE SCHISM OF DEVADATTA; AJĀTASATTU KING OF MAGADHA

a. THE DEATHS OF SĀRIPUTTA AND MOGGALLĀNA[1]

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka*, *Saṃyutta-Nikāya*, *Mahā-vagga*, *Satipaṭṭhāna-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ*. *47*), *Sutta 13* (*Cunda*). (*PTS*, v, *p*. *161*.)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jeta-vana,[2] in Anāthapiṇḍika's garden. [2] Then at that time the venerable Sāriputta[3] was staying among the Magadhas[4] (*Magadhesu*) at Nālagāmaka[5] ill, suffering, and greatly exhausted,[6] and Cunda[7] the novice (*samaṇuddeso*)[8] was the venerable Sāriputta's attendant (*upaṭṭhāko*).[9] [3] And the venerable Sāriputta died (*parinibbāyi*)[10] of that illness. [4] Then Cunda the novice taking the venerable Sāriputta's bowl and outer-robe[11] went to the Jetavana at Sāvatthi (*Sāvatthi-Jetavanaṃ*) to Anāthapiṇḍika's garden, to where the venerable Ānanda[12] was. Having arrived and saluted (*abhivādetvā*) the venerable

[1] On the doubtful subject of the dates of the deaths of Sāriputta and Moggallāna see ThB, pp. 140–2. The following extracts show that their deaths preceded that of Buddha. The compiler of the MPS has included a speech by Sāriputta (Ch. 20 § 10 [16]) at Nālandā during the first stage of Buddha's last journey and this has led the Commentator into difficulties which perhaps were unnecessary. He interrupts Buddha's journey northwards towards Vesāli so as to enable the aged teacher hurriedly to revisit Sāvatthi where he receives the news of Sāriputta's death and Rājagaha where as the Commentator states he had a shrine made for the relics of Moggallāna at the entrance to the Veḷuvana, before resuming his northward journey. It seems to require less ingenuity to suppose that Buddha received the news of the deaths of his two great disciples whilst he was still at Sāvatthi and that his motive in leaving that city for the south was the troubled state of the community in Rājagaha after the deaths of the two leaders. He could proceed either by the eastern route through Vesāli or by the western land-route to Kosambī and thence by the river-route to Pātaligāma. He seems to have preferred the latter, possibly on account of the recurring dissensions at Kosambī (Ch. 19 *b* § 1). This reconstruction of events conflicts with Culla-vagga, VII. ii. 2–4 (Ch. 19 *b* § 3), VII. iii. 2–3 (Ch. 19 *b* § 4 n) and VII. iv. 1–6 (Ch. 19 *b* §§ 9–10), where the two great disciples are actively engaged in opposing the schismatic Devadatta both before and after Buddha's arrival in Rājagaha. The CV account of Devadatta's heresy, however, seems to be more concerned with making an impressive case against the schismatic than with historical accuracy or possibility.

[2] Int. § 138.

[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 16. The *Jātaka* Commentary (95, Fausböll) relates that Buddha was at Sāvatthi when he learnt of the death of Sāriputta and that of Moggallāna a fortnight later and makes him thereupon foretell his own approaching death at Kusinārā (SBB, iii, p. 193). The length of the intervening period is not made clear.

[4] Int. § 158 (2).

[5] Int. § 145.

[6] Ch. 11 *c* § 6.

[7] Ap. G 1 *a* § 1 [32]. Cunda, who apparently was called the novice even after his novitiate had ended, had also brought the news of Nātaputta's death (Ch. 13 *c* § 25). This event preceded the death of Sāriputta, as is shown by Dīgha 33 (SBB, iv, p. 203), in which Sāriputta addressed the monks on the subject.

[8] See Ch. 8 *i* (*Juniors*). Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 6 (*sāmaṇera*) and § 2 (*navakā*).

[9] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1].

[10] Ap. C *b*, *Note*.

[11] *Patta-cīvaram ādāya*; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10].

[12] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

Ānanda he seated himself at one side and . . . spoke thus to the venerable Ānanda: 'The venerable Sāriputta, revered sir, has died. This is his outer-robe with his bowl.'[1] [5] 'This now, friend Cunda,' he said, 'is news to be told to the Blessed One personally. . Come, friend Cunda, we will go to where the Blessed One is. When we have arrived we will announce this matter to the Blessed One.' . . . [6] Then the venerable Ānanda and Cunda the novice went to where the Blessed One was. . . . Seated at one side the venerable Ānanda spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'Cunda the novice here, revered sir, says thus: "The venerable Sāriputta, revered sir, has died; this is his outer-robe with his bowl." Indeed, revered sir, my body was near swooning and the quarters [of the heavens] became dim to me and objects[2] (*dhammā*) became darkened to me when I heard "The venerable Sāriputta has died".' . . .

[7] 'What thinkest thou, Ānanda,' he said, 'did Sāriputta in dying take away the aggregate[3] of duty[4] or did he take away the aggregate of self-transcendence or did he take away the aggregate of insight, or did he take away the aggregate of liberation[5] or did he take away the aggregate of clear-knowledge[6] [which leads] to liberation?' 'Not so do I think, revered sir. . . . But indeed to me, revered sir, the venerable Sāriputta was an exhorter who had crossed[7] [the stream], an instructor, enlightening, informing, stirring and gladdening,[8] unwearied in showing the Law, the helper of his companions in holy-living;[9] and we remember the venerable Sāriputta's strength [drawn] from the Law (*dhamm-ojaṃ*),[10] enjoyment in the Law, help in the Law.' [8] 'Now indeed, Ānanda,' he said, 'has it not been announced by me ere this[11] that there is in all, even the beloved and kind, the principle of change, of separation, of transience?[12] And, Ānanda, in this case [is anything else] possible? . . .[13] Such a thing is not to be found. [9] Just as if (*seyaythāpi*),[14] Ānanda, of a great tree standing firm the mightiest[15] limb should dissolve (*palujjeyya*),[16] even so, Ānanda, of the great mendicant-community standing firm [the greatest disciple] Sāriputta has died. And how, Ānanda, in this case [is anything else] possible?[17] That what is born, produced, compounded, dissolvable

[1] Some texts add his relics, and the Commentary explains that these were in his (muslin) water-strainer. SBB, iii, p. 141.

[2] Or, thoughts; as in Ch. 21 § 7 [24]. 'The teachings', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 142.

[3] Or, constituent (of the Law); *khandha*. Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [6]. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii.

[4] *Sīla*; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3.

[5] Ch. 21 § 17 [2]; Ap. D *a* § 6.

[6] *Ñāna-dassana*; Ch. 4 § 16.

[7] *Otiṇṇa*; 'one who was well grounded', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 142.

[8] Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4].

[9] Ch. 20 § 2 (7). Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 8.

[10] Or, religious strength (literally sap). 'Essence of the Norm', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 142.

[11] Ch. 13 *a* § 4.

[12] Cp. Ch. 4 § 18 [1] (*aniccā*).

[13] As in Ch. 21 § 12 [48]; and in [9] below.

[14] Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[15] Literally, a mightier; i.e. one of the mightier (limbs).

[16] Ch. 21 § 12 [48].

[17] See [8] above.

by nature, that this indeed should not be dissolved—such a thing is not to be found.' [10–11]. . . .[1]

§ 2. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Satipaṭṭhāna-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.*47), *Sutta 14* (*Cela or Ukkacelā*). (*PTS, v, p. 163.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying among the Vajjians[2] (*Vajjīsu*) at Ukkacelā[3] (*Ukkacelāyaṃ*) on the bank of the river Gangā[4] together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers not long after Sāriputta[5] and Moggallāna[6] had died. [2] And at that time the Blessed One surrounded by the assemblage of mendicant brothers was seated in the open air. Then the Blessed One surveying the silent assemblage exhorted the mendicant brothers saying: [3] 'Verily, mendicant brothers, this session (*parisā*)[7] seems as though empty; Sāriputta and Moggallāna being dead, the session is empty for me, mendicant brothers. [But] there is no yearning[8] in that region (*disāyaṃ*)[9] in which Sāriputta and Moggallāna abide.' [4]. . . .[10]

b. Devadatta and Prince Ajātasattu. Ajātasattu's Accession to the Throne. Devadatta's Schism;[11] his Death

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, VII, ii–iv.

§ 1. [VII. ii. 1.] When the Blessed One had stayed at Anupiyā[12] as long as he wished he proceeded towards Kosambi.[13] Then journeying

[1] As in Ch. 21 § 8; see § 2 [4] below. In this whole discourse on the death of the chief disciple there is no mention of heaven (Ap. C *a* § 2) or of any future birth (Int. § 11; IN 2; Ap. B *a*, *karma*).

[2] Int. § 158 (5).

[3] Ch. 12 *e* § 11. The occasion may have been a brief visit during the river voyage from Kosambi (Ch. 19 *b* §§ 1, 3 [5]) to the Magadhan country prior to the last journey, but another conjecture is that the incident took place during an interruption of that journey.

[4] Int. § 121.

[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 16.

[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 18. The *Jātaka* Commentary (95, Fausböll) states that Moggallāna died a fortnight after Sāriputta and is precise as to the phase of the moon (SBB, iii, p. 193). 'An account of the death of Sāriputta will be found in the Mālālankāra-vatthu (Bigandet, "Legend", &c., 3rd ed., ii, 1–25) and of the murder of Moggallāna by the Niganṭhas (Int. § 184) in the Dhammapada commentary (Fausböll, p. 298 seq.) of which Spence Hardy's account ("Manual of Buddhism", p. 338) is nearly a translation; and Bigandet's account (loc. cit., pp. 25–7) is an abridgement', SBB, iii, p. 193 n.

[7] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].

[8] *An-ap-ekkha* (non-desire) is the equivalent of *up-ekkha* (serenity; Ap. F 2 *b* [6]); Cp. Ch. 14 *a* § 5 [3] n. 'It is indifferent as to that quarter in which Sāriputta and Moggallāna are dwelling', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 144.

[9] i.e. Nibbāna after death. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (4), where the word 'region' is rejected as inapplicable.

[10] Omitting a statement that all the Blessed Ones past and future (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Buddhas*) have each such a 'pair of disciples' (Ch. 7 *a* § 23; and Int. § 95). Omitting also [5] praise of their qualities. The rest of the Sutta [6–9] repeats verbatim the close of the previous Sutta (see § 1 [9–11]).

[11] IN 7. Ch. 15 *b* (ii) n.

[12] Int. § 148 (i). It may perhaps be assumed that Gotama journeyed from Sāvatthi to Anupiyā proceeding on his route through the Kosalan country SW. to Kosambi.

[13] Int. § 143; Ch. 19 *a*, n and § 2 [1] n. Possibly Gotama desired to visit this place on account of the dissensions with which its name has been associated (Ch. 15 *b*, ii). According to commentarial authority (KM, p. 38) this journey took place some 8 or 9 years before Gotama's death, but if his long residence in Sāvatthi was continuous as is commentarially stated (Ch. 10 *d* § 1, *Sāvatthi*), this visit to

gradually he came to Kosambi, and there at Kosambi the Blessed One stayed in the Ghosit-ārāma.[1]

§ 2. [1. cd.] And then whilst Devadatta[2] was alone and quiet[3] a reflection arose in his mind thus: '. . .[4] Now this Prince[5] Ajātasattu[6] is indeed both young (*taruṇe*) and [likely to be] fortunate (*bhaddako*)[7] hereafter. What now if I should please Prince Ajātasattu? From his favour much gain[8] and honour would accrue to me.' And then Devadatta having folded his bedding (*senāsanaṃ*)[9] and assumed his bowl and outer-robe proceeded towards Rājagaha; and by stages[10] reached Rājagaha.[11] . . .[12]

§ 3. [2–4.] . . .[13] [5] Then when the Blessed One had stayed at Kosambi as long as he wished he proceeded towards Rājagaha.[14] Then journeying gradually he came to Rājagaha, and there at Rājagaha the Blessed One stayed in the Veḷuvana in Kalandakanivāpa.[15] And many mendicant brothers came to where the Blessed One was and having drawn near and saluted (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One they sat down at one side and . . . spoke thus: 'Prince Ajātasattu, revered sir, goes morning and evening with five hundred chariots[16] to attend on Devadatta and food-offerings in five hundred rice-dishes[17] are presented [by him daily].' 'Envy not, Bhikkhus,' he said, 'Devadatta's gain and honour and reputation. As long as Prince Ajātasattu goes morning

Kosambi and Rājagaha must have shortly preceded his last journey; cp. § 4 [1] n below. It is to be noted that Sutta 63 of the Sixes of *Aṅg. Nik.* states that Gotama journeyed among the Kosalans after finally condemning Devadatta (Ch. 14 *f* § 2 [1] n).

[1] Ch. 15 *b*.(i) § 1 [1].

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[3] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

[4] Omitting repetition.

[5] Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n.

[6] Int. § 168. The name Ajātasattu-kumāra appears to be personal not official since it was held before the prince's accession to the throne.

[7] Good or auspicious; cp. Ch. 6 *b* 2 [xiv] n; Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [2]. 'And has a lucky future before him', SBE, xx, p. 185.

[8] *Lābha*, profit. See § 11 [7] below; Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524]. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (4).

[9] Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9); Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1] (*mat*). Or, having set in order (lit. made smooth) his lodgings; cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2].

[10] Or, gradually; *anupubbena*.

[11] Int. § 125. See § 3 [5] below.

[12] Devadatta appears miraculously (Int. § 94, v; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4], *iddhi*) as a child with a girdle of snakes in the presence of Prince Ajātasattu, and gains the prince's favour.

[13] Omitting a statement that a spirit (*deva-putta*; Int. § 93, vi; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]; Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [5] n) as large as two or three village-fields appeared to Moggallāna and informed him of Devadatta's schemes and thus apprised Buddha of them. This is inconsistent with the view that Sāriputta and Moggallāna died before Buddha's arrival at Kosambi (Ch. 19 *a*, n), but the CV narrative here can scarcely count as evidence. The narrative is found also in *Aṅg. Nik.* (iii, p. 122).

[14] See § 2 above. He doubtless travelled by the river route (Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [1] n).

[15] Int. § 126. It is open to discussion whether the former or the latter of these names has the greater content or they are in apposition and the content is identical. It is possible that Kalandakanivāpa is the name of a building or group of huts within the Vihāra grounds and that the English translation, Squirrels' Feeding-ground, suggests something more than was originally meant. The tendency in such series of place-names seems usually to be from the particular to the more particular; Ch. 11 *c* § 6. But equivalence in some instances seems clearly established by apposition; Ch. 6 *a* § 3 n; cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 1.

[16] *Rathā*; Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149], and Int. § 190 (*vehicles*). For the conventional number cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2].

[17] Or, rice-bowls (*thāli-pākā*); Ch. 13 *c* § 10[24].

and evening with five hundred chariots to attend on Devadatta . . .[1] Devadatta's decline[2] in good qualities (*kusalesu dhammesu*)[3] is to be expected and not prosperity.[4] . . .[5]

> Their fruit destroys the plantain, the bamboo and the reed;
> Honour destroys the wicked man, even as conception slays the mule.'[6]

§ 4. [VII. iii. 1.] Then at that time the Blessed One surrounded by a great session (*parisāya*)[7] including the king[8] (*sa-rājikāya*) was seated explaining the Law. And Devadatta having risen from his seat and adjusted his upper wrap[9] over one shoulder extended his joined palms[10] towards the Blessed One and spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The Blessed One, revered sir, is now worn-out, old, of great age, he has gone his [appointed] journey[11] and completed his life. Now let the Blessed One, revered sir, abide at leisure devoted to a state[12] of bliss[13] in this world;[14] let him give up to me the community of mendicants; I will lead[15] the mendicant-community.' 'Enough, Devadatta,' he said, 'set not thy heart on leading the mendicant-community. . . .[16] I would not, Devadatta, give up the mendicant-community even to Sāriputta and Moggallāna; how then [should I yield it] to thee. . . .[17]' Then Devadatta . . .[18] agitated and displeased,[19] saluting (*abhivādetvā*)[20] the Blessed One and so moving as to keep his right side towards him departed. This then was Devadatta's first attempt upon the Blessed One. [2–3]. . . .[21]

1 Omitting repetition.
2 Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1].
3 Cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]; and Ch. 12 *c* § 6 (*things*).
4 *Vuddhi*, increase; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]; Ch. 20 § 2 [6] (1). Cp. Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [100].
5 Omitting illustrations.
6 These verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*), with or without the preceding prose, appear also in *Saṃ. Nik.* i, p. 154, ii, p. 241, and *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 73. In *Saṃ. Nik.* i the verses are attributed to Brahmā Sahampati (Int. § 93, ii, n). Cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [5].
7 Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].
8 Bimbisāra; Int. § 168. For royal attendance at meetings of the Saṃgha see Ap. G 1 *c* § 2 (*joined*). For royal authority over the Saṃgha see Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [iv] (*Censors*). The great householder Citta attended discussions in the *bhikkhu-saṃgha* on friendly terms (Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [4]). See also Ch. 3 § 1 n.
9 Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8].
10 Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [13].
11 These phrases appear also in Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. The terms imply that Buddha was approaching his 80th year and consequently that Ajātasattu's accession very shortly preceded Buddha's death; cp. § 1 n above.
12 *Vihāra*, rest or abiding; cp. Ap. F 2 *b*.
13 *Sukha*. 'Happiness (reached even in this world)', SBE, xx, p. 238.
14 *Diṭṭha-dhamma*; Ap. C *b* § 6 [4].
15 Ch. 21 § 7 [25].
16 Omitting the double repetition of the demand and refusal.
17 Omitting '*chavassa khelāpakassa*', an obscure term of abuse meaning apparently 'a mere (lifeless) lick-spittle' and suggesting the opprobrious rancour of minor sectaries; IN 6 (*Canon*).
18 Omitting his mortified thoughts.
19 A stock phrase; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [393]; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29] (*rejoicing*).
20 The phrase applies to departure as well as to arrival; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].
21 Buddha causes the Saṃgha to pass a Proclamation-act (*pakāsaniya-kamma*; Ap. H 2 *b*, *Expulsion*) against Devadatta to the effect that the Saṃgha is no longer concerned with what Devadatta does or says (cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [2]). This is tantamount to expulsion and seems inconsistent with Devadatta's later action in requesting Buddha to put 'five points' before the Saṃgha for consideration (see § 7 [14] n

§ 5. [4] . . .[1] Then Prince Ajātasattu . . . having fastened a dagger (*potthanikaṃ*)[2] upon his thigh early in the day[3] hurriedly entered the inner-palace (*antepuraṃ*),[4] [his manner being] fearful, flurried, excited, and nervous. And the chief-ministers (*mahā-mattā*)[5] attending in the inner-palace saw Prince Ajātasattu hurriedly entering the inner-palace . . . and on seeing him seized him. Searching him and seeing the dagger fastened upon his thigh they said to him: 'What dost thou, prince (*kumāra*),[6] wish to do?' 'I wished', he said, 'to slay my father.' . . .[7] [5] Then those ministers taking Prince Ajātasattu went to where the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra[8] was and having arrived . . . reported this matter. . . .[9] Then the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra spoke to Prince Ajātasattu thus: 'Why, prince, dost thou wish to slay me?' 'I am desirous, lord (*deva*),[10] of ruling,' he said. Saying 'If then thou, prince, art desirous of ruling, this rulership is thine,' he resigned the rulership to Prince Ajātasattu.

§ 6. [6–13] . . .[11]

§ 7. [14] Then Devadatta went to Kokālika, Kaṭamoraka-Tissaka,

below). Buddha further requests that the Proclamation shall be made in Rājagaha by Sāriputta (cp. Ch. 19 *a*, n), who at first hesitates owing to Devadatta's previous high repute. Devadatta is here (alone) called the son of Godhī (*Godhiputta*; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; KM, p. 15). In [3] Sāriputta is appointed by the Saṃgha and carries out the order.

1 Devadatta proposes a joint conspiracy between the prince and himself against King Bimbisāra and the Buddha.

2 Or, knife; cp. MV, VI. xxiii. 3. See Int. § 175 (*arms*).

3 *Divā divassa*; Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]. The meaning is made clear by *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 189 (Ch. 11 *e* § 3).

4 Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3]; Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149]; Ch. 17 *e* [13]. Cp. Ch. 2 § 4.

5 Int. § 172; Ch. 23 *a* [8].

6 Int. § 190 (*address*).

7 Omitting the unlikely and inadequate excuse that Devadatta had incited him, and the varied counsels of the ministers.

8 Int. § 168.

9 The king excludes from future office those ministers who had advised that the prince and Devadatta and all the Bhikkhus following the Buddha should be slain; he degrades those who had advised that the prince and Devadatta should be slain; and he advances to high positions those ministers who had advised that he should be informed and his command obeyed.

10 Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8].

11 In this and succeeding sections of the CV Ajātasattu is still called prince (*kumāra*); apparently because though he has assumed the royal power he has not yet seized the throne; cp. Ch. 19 *c* § 1 (*rājakumāra*). According to the CV [6–8] Devadatta and Prince Ajātasattu conspire to slay 'the Samaṇa Gotama' (Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 20 § 11 [32]); Devadatta employs men to waylay Gotama but they are overcome by the goodness of the Blessed One and become lay disciples. In [9] Devadatta resolves after this failure himself to slay the Blessed One; he climbs the mountain called the Vultures' Peak and hurls a rock down whilst the Blessed One is walking in meditation in the shade below, but miraculously (Int. § 94, ii) 'two mountain peaks came together and stopped that rock, and only a splinter falling from it made the foot of the Blessed One to bleed' (SBE, xx, p. 245). In [10] Buddha assures the Bhikkhus of his safety and says that the Tathāgatas (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Buddhas*) 'die (in the course of nature) not by violence' (cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14]). In [11–12] Devadatta causes the man-slaying elephant Nālāgiri to be released in a street which the Blessed One has entered, but the elephant is subdued by his loving-kindness (Int. § 94, iii). In [13] Devadatta loses reputation and favour and his followers become unpopular among the laity through their importunity; Buddha rules that not more than three monks shall receive hospitality together (Ap. H 5 [92] n). Some of these incidents are impossible and others may be equally unreal.

Khandadevī's son and Samuddadatta[1] and . . . said: 'Come, friends, we will make a split in the community[2] of the devotee Gotama,[3] a breaking of his wheel[4] (*cakka-bhedaṃ*).' On this being said Kokālika said to Devadatta: 'The devotee Gotama indeed, friend, is great in power[5] and eminence. . . .' 'Come, friends,' said he, 'we will go to the devotee Gotama and ask for five (fundamental) things (*vatthūni*), saying: "The Blessed One, revered sir, in different methods[6] (*aneka-pariyāyena*) speaks in praise of the uncovetousness (*app-icchassa*) and contentment (*santuṭṭhassa*) of the meditative, earnest, believing, humble, and strenuous.[7] These five (fundamental) things, revered sir, in different methods conduce to uncovetousness and contentment . . . and strenuousness—(i) it would be well, revered sir, that mendicant brothers should be throughout life[8] forest-dwellers,[9] and that if anyone stays within a village-boundary it should be accounted to him as a sin (*vajjaṃ*);[10] (ii) that they should be throughout life alms-beggars[11] (for food), and that if anyone accepts an invitation[12] it should be accounted to him as a sin; (iii) that they should be throughout life wearers of rags taken from the dust-heap,[13] and that if anyone accepts a robe [received] from a layman[14] it should be accounted to him as a sin; (iv) that they should be throughout life dwellers at the foot of trees,[15] and that if anyone resorts to a shelter it should be accounted to him as a sin; (v) that they should throughout life not eat fish or meat (*maccha-maṃsaṃ*),[16] and that if anyone eats fish or meat it should be accounted to him as a sin." These the devotee Gotama will not sanction. We on our side through these five (fundamental) things will persuade the people.' 'It is possible, friend,' they said. '. . . Men have faith in what is austere.'[17] [15] Then Devadatta with his group

[1] Tibetan tradition presents these as five Sakyans—Kokālika, Kaṭamoraga, Tiṣya, Khaṇḍadravya, and Sāgaradatta; see KM, p. 39. The whole passage appears also in *Saṃghadisesa* Rule X, i. 1–3 (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, pp. 171–2). The names of these four stock evil-doers recur in *Saṃghadisesa* Rule XI, and *Pācittiya* Rules XXIX and LXXXI. Kokālika and Kaṭamoraka-Tissaka also appear in *Saṃ. Nik.* (*Kindred Sayings*, i, pp. 186–91), where both are censured by deities to whom the title of 'solitary' Brahmā (*pacceka-brahmā*; Int. § 93, ii) is given; and in *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, v, pp. 113–16) the censure of Kokālika is repeated. Two other specially troublesome monks are Paṇḍuka and Lohitaka, whose ill-doings are recorded in *Culla-vagga*, I. i, vi and viii. See Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Dissentients*).

[2] *Saṃgha*. The apparent inconsistencies in the *nissaya* formulas (Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4]) of the Ordination ceremony seem to show traces of the controversy fostered by Devadatta and resulting in his schism. See § 4 [2] n above.

[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].

[4] Or, a schism in his circle. Ch. 5 *b* § 1 [82].

[5] *Mah-iddhika*; Ap. I *b* § 4 [5].

[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[7] Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3], where all these seven terms recur. The first two though concrete have been translated as abstract for distinction and emphasis.

[8] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] (1).

[9] *Araññakā*; Ch. 8 *k* [8].

[10] Cp. Ap. H 3 *b* (*Penalties*).

[11] *Piṇḍa-pātika*; Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [2].

[12] *Ni-mantana*; Ch. 8 *k* [7].

[13] *Paṃsu-kūlikā*; Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [35].

[14] *Gahapati-cīvara*; Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [34].

[15] Ch. 8 *k* [8]. Thus a forest hut was to be forbidden. Cp. Ch. 4 § 4 [70].

[16] Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [14] (2); and Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (7). 'Abstain from fish', SBE, xx, p. 252.

[17] *Lūkha*, rough; cp. Ch. 3 § 7.

went to where the Blessed One was . . . and spoke to the Blessed One. . . .[1] 'Enough, Devadatta,' he replied; 'let him who wishes be a forest-dweller, and let him who wishes live in the village-boundary. Let him who wishes be an alms-beggar,[2] and let him who wishes accept an invitation [to a meal]. Let him who wishes wear rags taken from the dust-heap and let him who wishes accept a robe from a layman. For eight months[3] indeed, Devadatta, lodging[4] at the foot of trees is sanctioned by me; also fish or meat (*maccha-maṃsaṃ*)[5] pure in three points—when [its special preparation is] not seen, not heard of, and not suspected.' Then Devadatta with his group saying, 'The Blessed One[6] does not sanction these five (fundamental) things', delighted and exultant, rose and . . . departed. Then Devadatta with his group entered Rājagaha and persuaded the people through the five fundamental things saying: '. . . The Blessed One does not sanction these five things; we on our side have adopted and abide by these five (fundamental) things.'

§ 8. [16] . . .[7] [17] And the venerable Ānanda[8] in the forenoon . . . entered Rājagaha for alms. And Devadatta saw the venerable Ānanda in Rājagaha going round for alms and . . . spoke to him thus: 'From this day forth, friend Ānanda, apart from the Blessed One, apart from the mendicant-community I shall keep Observance-day (*uposathaṃ*),[9] I shall conduct the Assembly-proceedings (*saṃgha-kammaṃ*).'[10] . . .[11]

§ 9. [VII. iv. 1.] Then Devadatta on the day of Uposatha (*tadah' uposathe*)[12] rising from his seat[13] held a tally-vote (*salākaṃ gahesi*)[14] saying: '. . .[15] The Blessed One does not sanction[16] these [five things]; we on our side have adopted and abide by these five (fundamental) things. To whatsoever venerable [brother] these five things seem good let him take a voting-tally (*salākaṃ gaṇhatu*).' Now at that moment [there were present] five hundred[17] Vesālian mendicant brothers, Vajjians by descent (*Vajji-puttakā*),[18] who were juniors[19] and

[1] Omitting the agreed phrases in which he demands the five fundamental things.
[2] Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [2]. [3] i.e. excluding the rainy season. Ch. 8 *k* [8].
[4] *Senāsana*; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2]. [5] Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [14] (2).
[6] Either the title Bhagavat had become conventionalized and was so used by opponents or the chronicler here fell into the expression easiest and most natural to him. Ch. 4 § 9.
[7] Omitting the comments of the people. Devadatta when questioned by the Blessed One acknowledges that his purpose is to cause division in the Saṃgha and is warned that such conduct leads to punishment in *niraya* (Ap. B *a* § 7) for an aeon (*kappa*), whilst peace-making in the Saṃgha leads to happiness for an aeon in heaven (*sagga*; Ap. C *a* § 2 (126)). [8] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]. [9] Ap. H 1.
[10] 'Carry out the formal proceedings of the Order', SBE, xx, p. 255. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [iii. 1]; Ap. H 1 § 4 (*kamma-vācā*).
[11] Buddha receives the news with a short *uddāna* or poetic cry (Ch. 2 § 2).
[12] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]. The phrase may include the eve of *Uposatha*.
[13] The narrative does not specify the scene. An irregular meeting may be supposed.
[14] Ch. 10 *c* (24); and Ap. H 3 *b* (*Powers*). The correct method of taking a ballot by vote, tally or ticket, is prescribed in CV, IV. ix, x, xiv [26]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [5] (*silent*). [15] Omitting repetition.
[16] Or, prescribe. The verb is *anujānāti*; cp. Ch. 8 *a* [4].
[17] Int. § 121. [18] Ch. 12. [19] *Navakā*; Ch. 8 *g* § 2.

ignorant of the business. These, thinking 'This is [according to] the Law, this is [according to] the Discipline, this is the Teacher's doctrine',[1] took [each] a voting-tally. Then Devadatta having split up the community departed with five hundred mendicant brothers for Gayā-Head.[2] . . .[3]

§10. [3] . . .[4] And then those five hundred mendicant brothers set forth [returning] to the Veḷuvana.[5] . . .[6] And thereupon hot blood gushed forth from the mouth[7] of Devadatta. [4]. . . .[8]

§ 11. [5] Then the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: '. . . .[9] [7]. . . .[10] It is good, Bhikkhus, that a mendicant brother should quite overcome and remain above gain[11] as it arises, loss as it arises, fame[12] as it arises, disrepute as it arises, respect[13] as it arises, neglect as it arises; that he should quite overcome and remain above ill-will[14] as it arises [in himself], partisanship[15] as it arises [in himself]. And for what advantage? . . . [This advantage that] whilst indeed for him who does not entirely overcome and remain above gain as it arises the taints (*āsavā*)[16] with their fret and fever arise; [on the other hand] for him who quite overcomes and remains above gain as it arises the taints with their fret and fever do not exist.' . . .[17]

1 Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2].
2 Int. § 145; Ch. 11 *b*.
3 In [2] Sāriputta and Moggallāna report the matter to Buddha, who sends them to Gayā-Head to persuade the monks to return (cp. Ch. 19 *a*, n). Sāriputta and Moggallāna are welcomed by Devadatta as converts. If they were present they must have died shortly afterwards in Magadha during Buddha's temporary absence at Sāvatthi.
4 Sāriputta and Moggallāna by preaching whilst Devadatta is asleep induce the five hundred monks to return. Here the comic muse has overpersuaded the not very judicial chronicler.
5 The text has 'Sāriputta and Moggallāna with those five hundred mendicant brothers set forth'. The Blessed One was dwelling in the Veḷuvana.
6 Kokālika awakens and informs Devadatta, who is painfully affected.
7 This is a customary phrase implying death either on the spot or after a short interval. It is used of the deaths of Sañjaya (Ch. 7 *a* § 22 [2] n) and of Nātaputta (Ch. 11 *d* § 6 n; SBB, v, p. 278).
8 Buddha allows the return of repentant schismatics to the community without re-ordination.
9 In [5–6] Devadatta's fate and the eight qualifications of an envoy (as in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.*, *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 134) are mentioned.
10 Devadatta's surrender to eight evil conditions is censured. This whole passage is found also in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, iv, pp. 109–10), where the scene is the Vultures' Peak 'not long after Devadatta had gone'.
11 *Lābha*; see § 2 above. With the eightfold renunciation here enjoined compare *nekkhamma* (Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]); also Int. § 111 (*indifferent*), and Ap. H 4 (*Conduct*); cp. also Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7] n.
12 *Yasa*; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11], and Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3] (*respected*).
13 *Sakkāra*; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3], and Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3] (*respected*).
14 *Pāp-icchatā*; malice. Ch. 20 § 3 (5); cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [3], *ill will*, and § 10 (ii), *hate*. 'Any evil longing', SBE, xx, p. 263; 'evil intentions', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 110.
15 *Pāpa-mittatā*; wrong friendship. 'Evil friendship', SBE and *Gradual Sayings*. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1] (*liking*).
16 Ap. D *a* § 7. These are the cravings of blind egotism.
17 The rest of the eight points are repeated. Devadatta's faults and fate are indicated; as a result of his ambition he is condemned to *niraya* (Ap. B *a* § 7) for an aeon (Ch. 19 *c* § 1). [8] moralizes in verse (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) on his fall. The remainder of CV, VII deals with cases of disunion and schism; Ap. H 3, *Note* (CV, 7).

c. Prince Abhaya's Conversion. King Ajātasattu's Repentance

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 58 (Abhaya-rāja-kumāra-S.).*

[PTS, i, p. 392.] . . . The Blessed One stayed in the Veḷuvana in Kalandakanivāpa.[1] And Abhaya the prince (*rājakumāro*)[2] went to where the Nigaṇṭha[3] Nataputta[4] was. . . . And to him seated at one side the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta spoke thus: 'Go thou, prince, to where the devotee Gotama[5] is . . . and say thus: "Should now, revered sir, the Follower (*Tathāgato*)[6] utter speech unpleasant and unkind (*a-manāpā*)[7] to others?" . . . If then the devotee Gotama when thus questioned declares to thee thus: [p. 393.] "The Follower, prince, should not utter speech unpleasant and unkind to others", then thou shouldst say to him thus: "Then wherefore, revered sir, was Devadatta declared by thee as lost,[8] destined to hell,[9] to stay there for an aeon,[10] beyond redemption[11]—by which speech of thine Devadatta was agitated and displeased?"[12] . . .' 'Be it so, revered sir (*bhante*)',[13] said Abhaya the prince in assent to the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta and rising from his seat he saluted the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta so moving as to keep his right side towards him.[14] . . .[15] Seated at one side Abhaya the prince spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Should now, revered sir, the Follower utter speech unpleasant and unkind to others?' . . . [395] 'When indeed,' he replied, 'the Follower knows speech to be genuine, true and profitable,[16] although unpleasant and [seemingly] unkind to

[1] Int. § 126.

[2] Int. § 168. The relationship of Abhaya to Ajātasattu is not clear (Ch. 19 *b* § 6 [6] n). For *rāja-kumāra* cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].

[3] Int. § 184 (*Jainism*).

[4] Int. § 179. According to this Sutta Nātaputta was alive after the schism if not after the death of Devadatta. According to one account (Ch. 11 *d* § 6 n) Nātaputta's death took place near Nālandā in the Magadhan country, and according to another (Ch. 13 *c* § 25 [243]) the news of his death reached Buddha at Sāmagāma in the Sakyan country and this in turn implies that the news was previous to Buddha's last journey, which must therefore have been preceded by a long tour from Rājagaha northward to the Sakyan country and back. It is possible that the different accounts of these events are not reconcilable, but it seems to emerge that a considerable period of months or years may have elapsed between Devadatta's schism and Buddha's last journey; cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 7 n.

[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].

[6] Ap. A 2 *c*. 'The truth-finder', SBB, v, p. 284.

[7] Ap. F 1 *b* § 7.

[8] *Apāyika*. The states of *ap-āya* (loss) and *nir-aya* (degradation) seem to be only nominally distinguishable.

[9] *Nerayika*; Ap. B *a* § 7.

[10] *Kappaṭṭho*; Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7] n; and Int. § 107.

[11] *A-tekiccha*, not to be medicined; Ch. 14 *f* § 2 [1] n. The composer of the Sutta appears to have felt the need for justifying the use of terms, attributed to Gotama here and elsewhere (CV, VII. iii. 16, iv. 7), so harsh and so directly contrary to the Buddha's *anatta* doctrine (Ap. E *c* i). The Sutta does not afford a secure basis of facts.

[12] Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1].

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 10 [15].

[14] Ch. 6 *a* § 9 [14].

[15] The prince invites Buddha to a meal at his house and after serving the meal with his own hands seats himself beside Buddha and propounds his question.

[16] *Attha-saṃhita*, connected with advantage; cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]. *Attha* might mean 'reality'; but the context shows that the meaning here is 'advantage', whether to the person blamed or to others.

others, then the Follower knows the right time for declaring such speech. . . .' [396] On this being said Abhaya the prince spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'How excellent, revered sir, how excellent. . . .'[1]

§ 2. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 2* (*Sāmaññaphala-S.*).[2]

[1] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha in the mango-grove of Jīvaka Komāra-bhacca[3] with a great company of Bhikkhus. . . . At that time the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu the son of the Videhan consort,[4] on Uposatha-day,[5] the fifteenth of the fourth month at the time of the Lotus-moon in the middle of the full-moon night, went to the roof of the palace and sat there surrounded by the courtiers. . . .[6] [9] Then the king . . . mounted his riding-elephant and was conducted out of Rājagaha by uplifted torches, and with much royal state set out for Jīvaka Komārabhacca's mango-grove. . . . [11] Then the king . . . having ridden as far as the ground [was permissible][7] for the elephant dismounted and on foot approached the door of the circular hall[8] [reserved for the assembly]. . . .[9] [12] Then the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu . . . went to where the Blessed One was and having arrived stood at one side . . . [13] and having saluted (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One he extended his joined palms[10] towards the mendicant assembly[11] and seated himself at one side. . . .[12] [99] On [hearing] what was said the Māgadhan king . . . spoke thus to the Blessed One: '. . .[13] I here, revered sir, come for refuge to the Blessed One, and to the Law, and to the community of mendicant brothers; let the Blessed One receive me as a lay disciple[14] taking refuge from this day forth whilst life lasts. Transgression[15] has overcome me, revered sir, so that

[1] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 7. The prince becomes a lay follower; Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*) n.

[2] Ch. 11 *c* § 23. This Suttanta (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*) plainly has supplemented the original Discourse with much extraneous matter of an exegetical character. It now comprises not only the three forms of the *Sīla* treatise (Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*), composed at different periods, and an account of the doctrines of the six Titthiya teachers (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*), but further a description of the four Jhānas (Ap. I *a*) and of the manifold kinds of mystical power or *iddhi* (Ap. I *b* § 3), as well as a summary of the advantages of being a recluse.

[3] Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [34].

[4] Int. § 168 (*Ajātasattu*); Ch. 11 *c* § 11 [1] n.

[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]. The phrase may include the eve of Uposatha.

[6] As in Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1–8].

[7] 'As far as the path was passable for elephants', SBB, ii, p. 68. Cp. Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [13].

[8] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11]. Here Buddha was seated against the middle prop (*thambha*; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [3]) with his face to the east, surrounded by the brethren. The hall must have been small unless the roof was merely awning (Ap. H 1 *b* § 4, *calico*).

[9] Omitting details.

[10] Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1].

[11] See Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11] n. For royal attendance at meetings of the Saṃgha see Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (*joined*); cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [4].

[12] The king requests permission to ask a question and after mentioning numerous crafts and occupations (Int. § 189, *trade*) as bringing profit he asks what similar advantage in this world accrues to a *samaṇa*. He recounts his unsatisfactory visits to other Teachers (as in Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i). Buddha explains the advantages of a life of devotion.

[13] The king utters the formula 'How excellent, how excellent'; as in Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[14] Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*). See also Int. § 170 (*teaching*).

[15] *Accaya*; cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 4. 'Sin', SBB, ii, p. 94.

I have been utterly foolish, utterly erring, utterly evil.[1] I [who sit] here have for the sake of sovereignty cut off from life a righteous (*dhammikaṃ*) father, a righteous king (*dhamma-rājānam*).[2] May the Blessed One, revered sir, accept [this confession of][3] my transgression as a transgression for [my] restraint (*saṃvarāya*)[4] in future.' [100] 'Yea, king (*mahā-rāja*),[5] transgression has overcome thee so that thou hast been utterly foolish, utterly erring, utterly evil. . . . But in as far as thou, king, hast seen thy transgression as transgression and makest reparation[6] according to the Law, we accept that of thee. This indeed is the process[7] (*vuddhi*) under the discipline of the noble[8] (*ariyassa vinaye*)—he who sees his transgression as a transgression and makes reparation according to the Law attains restraint in future.' [101] On this being said the Māgadhan king . . . spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'And lo[9] now, revered sir, we are going; we have many duties, much that should be done.' 'Now, king, for what thou thinkest seasonable (*kālaṃ*).'[10] Then the Māgadhan king . . . so moving as to keep his right side towards the Blessed One departed. [102] Then the Blessed One not long after the departure of the king . . . instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'Smitten[11] is this king, mendicant brothers; stricken is this king. If this king had not cut off from life a righteous father, a righteous king, then he in this very seat would have acquired the stainless clear vision of the Law (*dhamma-cakkhuṃ*).'[12] Thus spoke the Blessed One; the mendicant brothers rejoicing[13] welcomed the word of the Blessed One.

d. Ajātasattu and his Neighbours:[14] the Vajjians[15]

Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16 (Mahā-parinibbāna-S.). Part I, 1–5.

§ 1. [Pt. I, 1.] . . . The Blessed One stayed at Rājagaha on the Gijjakūta Hill.[16] At that time the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu,[17] the son[18]

[1] *A-kusala*; not good. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].

[2] This appears to be more than verbal tribute to the justice of Bimbisāra's reign; Int. § 168. For *dhamma* (Right) see Part I (title) n.

[3] Or, pardon; Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5]; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [4] n. 'Accept it of me, Lord, that do so acknowledge it as a sin', SBB, ii, p. 94.

[4] Ap. H 4 *c* (*Penances*).

[5] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 3 § 2 [66]; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [4].

[6] 'You confess it', SBB, ii, p. 94. *Paṭi-karoti* means rather repair than confess. Cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [7] (evil).

[7] Or, Such is the progress [made in morality]. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 5 (1); Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].

[8] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].

[9] *Handa*, come; Ch. 23 *b* §§ 3, 6. Cp. *iṅgha*, Ch. 22 *a* § 5 [21].

[10] Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 19 *d* § 4; Ch. 20 § 2 [6]; also Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*). Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [4].

[11] *Khata*; literally, upturned. Cp. *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 89 (see *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 80, note). 'Deeply affected', SBB, ii, p. 95.

[12] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6].

[13] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29]. These conventional phrases close the Suttanta.

[14] For his attitude towards the Avanti kingdom on the west see Ch. 23 *a* [7] n; for his relations with the Kosala kingdom on the north-west see Int. § 170.

[15] Ch. 12; Ch. 12 *a* § 2 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 7 (*Licchavis*); Ch. 20 § 11 [26].

[16] Int. § 128.

[17] Int. § 166.

[18] Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133].

of the Videhan[1] consort [of King Bimbisāra], was desirous of overcoming the Vajjians. . . .[2] [2] And the Māgadhan king . . . instructed Vassakāra[3] the Brāhman, the chief-minister (*Magadha-mahāmattaṃ*), saying: 'Go, Brāhman, to where the Blessed One is and on arrival speaking for me salute[4] the feet of the Blessed One with the forehead . . .[5] saying "Revered sir, the Māgadhan king . . . salutes the feet of the Blessed One with the forehead[6] and enquires after his health,[7] freedom from sickness, well-being, strength, and comfort." And say thus: "The Māgadhan king, revered sir . . . is desirous of overcoming the Vajjians. . . ."[8] So far as the Blessed One may answer thee gather well [his words] and report to me. So-goers (*Tathā-gatā*) indeed speak nothing that is not so[9] (*vi-tathaṃ*).'

§ 2. [3] . . .[10] Vassakāra the Brāhman, the chief-minister, having caused many sumptuous chariots[11] to be made ready mounted one and went out from Rājagaha and started for the Gijjhakūṭa Hill.[12] Having ridden on a chariot as far as the ground [was permissible][13] for a chariot he dismounted and on foot approached to where the Blessed One was. . . .[14] Seated at one side Vassakāra . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The Māgadhan king, O Gotama (*bho Gotama*)[15] . . . salutes the feet of the respected Gotama (*bhoto Gotamassa*)[16] with his forehead. . . .[17] The Māgadhan king, O Gotama . . . is desirous of overcoming the Vajjians. . . .'[18]

§ 3. [4] Now at that time the venerable Ānanda[19] was standing behind the Blessed One fanning him. Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Doubtless thou hast heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians are much given to meetings, favouring meetings.'[20] 'I have heard so, revered sir. . . .' 'As long, Ānanda, as the Vajjians are much-given to meetings, favouring meetings, so long is the prosperity of the Vajjians to be expected, and no decline. . . .[21] As long as the Vajjians shall meet together in concord and rise in concord, and the Vajjians shall transact business together in concord. . . . As long as the Vajjians shall not appoint what is against that which has been appointed previously, shall not break up what has been appointed previously, according as they shall continue to conform to the old appointed Vajjian laws. . . . As long as the Vajjians shall respect . . .

[1] Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133].
[2] Ch. 20 § 1. As in Ch. 12 *d* § 6. The whole passage appears also in *Aṅg. Nik.* (the Sevens, Sutta 20).
[3] Int. §§ 170, 172; Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1].
[4] Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3]. See Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].
[5] Omitting phrases repeated immediately afterwards.
[6] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3] n.
[7] Ch. 14 *f* § 12 [126]; also Ch. 12 *c* § 3 (*phrases*); and Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*).
[8] As in Ch. 12 *d* § 6.
[9] Or, is untrue. Cp. Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note* (*Leaders*).
[10] See Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1].
[11] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx. 1].
[12] Int. § 128.
[13] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [13].
[14] As in Ch. 20 § 11 [29] (*phrases*).
[15] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).
[16] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]. *Bhoto* is the gen. of *bhavaṃ*; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [158].
[17] Omitting repetitions.
[18] As in Ch. 12 *d* § 6.
[19] Ch. 20 § 2 [6].
[20] Ap. H 3 *a* § 1. See Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2].
[21] Omitting repetitions.

the ancestors[1] of the Vajjians and shall think of them reverently. . . . As long as the Vajjians shall not carry off forcibly and keep any clans-women[2] or maidens of the clans. . . . As long as the Vajjians shall respect . . . whatsoever Vajjian shrines[3] they possess, both within and without, and shall not allow diminution in the customary dues[4] given and presented of old. . . . As long as rightful care, defence, and protection shall be well-provided for the saints[5] of the Vajjians, [and they say] "Saints who have not yet arrived may come to the realm and saints who have arrived may live in the realm at ease", so long is the prosperity of the Vajjians to be expected and no decline.' [5] Then the Blessed One instructed Vassakāra . . . saying: 'At one time, Brāhman, I stayed at Vesāli at the Sārandada[6] shrine. There I taught the Vajjians these seven conditions[7] securing welfare. As long, Brāhman, as these seven conditions securing welfare shall endure among the Vajjians . . . so long is the prosperity of the Vajjians to be expected and no decline.'

§ 4. [5, *cd.*] On this being said Vassakāra . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'If then, O Gotama, the Vajjians are possessed of any [such] condition securing welfare their prosperity is to be expected and no decline—what then is to be said if they possess all seven conditions? So, O Gotama, the Vajjians are not to be dealt with by the Māgadhan king . . . that is [by way] of battle, apart from persuasion, apart from the division of opponents.'[8] . . .[9] Then Vassakāra having welcomed and gladly received the word of the Blessed One rose from his seat and departed.

[1] Int. § 134 (*leaders*).
[2] Int. § 190 (*women*).
[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [1].
[4] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5].
[5] Buddhist Elders or Arahats; Ap. D *c*.
[6] Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [1].
[7] Int. § 134; Ch. 20 § 2 [6].
[8] Or, splitting into opposite parties.
[9] Omitting an exchange of farewell phrases; as in Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101].

CHAPTER 20

THE LAST TOUR: THROUGH THE MAGADHA[1] COUNTRY

Sutta Pitaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16 (Mahā-parinibbāna-suttanta);[2] *the Narrative of the Great Decease. Part I, 1–34.*

§ 1. [i. 1:] Thus was it heard by me. At one time the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha on the Gijjhakūṭa Hill.[3] At that time the Magadhan king Ajātasattu[4] . . . was desirous of overcoming the Vajjians. . . .[5]

§ 2. [6] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda[6] saying: 'Go thou, Ānanda; as many mendicant brothers as are staying near (*upanissāya*) Rājagaha, cause them all to meet in the attendance-hall[7] (*upaṭṭhāna-sālāyaṃ*).' . . . Then standing at one side the venerable Ānanda spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The assembly of mendicant brothers, revered sir, has met; now for what, revered sir, the Blessed One thinks seasonable (*kālaṃ*).'[8] And the Blessed One having risen from his seat went to the attendance-hall and when he arrived sat in the place prepared[9] and being seated the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'I will set forth for you, mendicant brothers, seven conditions[10] (*dhamme*) securing stability.[11] Then

[1] Int. § 145.

[2] Int. § 16; Ch. 21; Ch. 22. A Suttanta (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*) varies little from a Sutta but is perhaps more complex, containing more than one episode and being of the nature of a compilation. The MPS seems to be drawn from many sources (IN 6, *Canon*). Part I, §§ 1–5 correspond verbally with *Aṅg. Nik.* vii, Sutta 20; §§ 6–10 are the same as *Aṅg. Nik.* vii. 21–5; § 11 is the same as *Aṅg. Nik.* vi 11. It appears to have been originally a direct narrative of the Teacher's last journey and decease, but many of his visits served as occasions for the insertion of texts borrowed from other books of the Nikāyas. These are pointed out where they occur. The passages in the *Vin. Piṭ.* which correspond verbally with the MPS seem to have borrowed, not always appositely, from the MPS or from the latter's sources (Ch. 11 *d* § 15 n). See Rhys Davids's analysis of the MPS in SBB, iii, pp. 71–2.

[3] Int. § 128.

[4] Int. § 168.

[5] As in Ch. 12 *d* §§ 5, 6. See Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [1–5].

[6] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4]. See below §§ 9 [13], 10 [15], and throughout the MPS.

[7] Or, common hall, the large hall of the Vihāra; Ch. 10 *a* § 11; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [163]; Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 21 § 13 [49]. 'Service Hall', SBE, xi, p. 5; SBB, iii, p. 81.

[8] The phrase is also used as a formula for granting permission to leave (MPS, i. 25; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101]). It has much the force of 'at your pleasure'. Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*); Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210]; Ch. 21 §§ 10 [6], 13 [49]; Ch. 22 *c* § 1. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [4].

[9] Or, president's seat. Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[10] Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [1]; Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [5]; also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]. See below §§ 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7; it seems clear that these five following sets of seven or six 'conditions' were announced by Buddha on different occasions, as is implied in the sevens of *Aṅg. Nik.* (vii, Suttas 21–7) and evident from *Aṅg. Nik.* vi. 11, and that they have been assembled here by a compiler who has massed the ideals and virtues of monkish life (Ap. H 4, *ideals* and Ap. F 2, *virtues*). In none of these is a clear place given to the rebirth theory (IN 2; Ap. B *a*, *Karma*).

[11] *A-parihāna*, non-decline.

hearken well, give attention, I will speak.' 'Even so, revered sir', said the mendicant brothers assenting to the Blessed One. The Blessed One spoke thus: '(1) As long, mendicants, as the mendicant brothers frequently hold meetings,[1] favouring meetings, so long, mendicants, is the prosperity (*vuddhi*)[2] of the mendicant brothers to be expected and no decline[3] (*parihāni*); (2) as long as the mendicant brothers shall meet together in concord[4] and rise in concord and shall transact the business of the assembly in concord . . . (3) as long as the mendicant brothers shall not appoint what is against that which has been appointed previously, shall not break up what has been appointed previously,[5] according as they shall continue to conform to the appointed precepts[6] (*sikkhā-padesu*) . . . (4) as long as the mendicant brothers shall respect . . .[7] the elder (*therā*) brethren experienced, long ordained, the fathers of the assembly, leaders of the assembly, and shall bear in mind what is commanded (*sotabbaṃ*) by them . . . (5) as long as the mendicant brothers shall not come under the sway of craving, which when it arises (*uppannāya*) recurs[8] . . . (6) as long as the mendicant brothers shall be eager for forest[9] lodgings . . . (7) as long as the mendicant brothers shall severally (*paccattam yeva*)[10] fix their thought (*satiṃ*)[11] attentively, [and say] "Earnest companions in the holy life[12] who have not yet arrived may come and earnest companions in the holy life having come shall dwell [with us] at ease (*phasuṃ*);[13] . . [14] as long as these seven conditions abide among the mendicant brothers and the mendicant brothers conform thereto, so long, mendicants, is the prosperity of the mendicant brothers to be expected, and no decline." '

§ 3. [7] 'I will set forth, mendicant brothers, seven further conditions[15] securing stability. . . .[16] (1) As long, mendicants, as the mendicant brothers shall not be lovers of action,[17] busybodies, bound up in love of business . . . (2) . . . not be lovers of talk;[18] (3) . . . not be

[1] Ch. 8 *a* [4]; also Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (1); Ap. H 3, *Note* (*assemblies*).
[2] Literally, growth or expansion. Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5].
[3] Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1].
[4] Ch. 8 *e* § 5.
[5] 'Abrogate nothing that has been already established', SBE, xi, p. 6; SBE, iii, p. 82.
[6] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1]; Ap. H 4 *b*.
[7] Equivalents, as in Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i), omitted.
[8] Or, spreads (like a weed); Ap. D *a* § 4 (335). The phrase is *taṇhā ponobhavikā*; Int. § 24. 'That craving which, springing up within them, would give rise to renewed existence', SBE, xi, p. 6; SBB, iii, p. 82.
[9] Ch. 8 *k* [8] (*āraññakā*); cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [1].
[10] Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8].
[11] Ap. F 2 *b* [6].
[12] *Sa-brahmacārī*; see § 7 (1), (4), (5), (6), below; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7]; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2].
[13] Ch. 12 *d* § 5 (7); Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]; Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. Cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [3].
[14] Omitting repetitions.
[15] See § 2 [6] above. These conditions appear also word for word in *Aṅg. Nik.* vii. 22.
[16] Repetitions omitted.
[17] In this and the next two phrases the word used is *kamma* (cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [6], *deed*; Ap. F 1, *Ethics of Action*; Ap. F 2 *d*, *right act*). 'Business', SBE, xi, p. 7; SBB, iii, p. 82. 'Action', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 13.
[18] *Bhassa*; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*vācā*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 (*talk*).

lovers of sleep;[1] (4) not be lovers of throngs[2] . . . (5) as long as the mendicant brothers shall not be evil-wishers,[3] shall not come under the sway of evil wishes; (6) . . . not be friendly with evil, companions in evil, intimates in evil[4] . . . (7) as long as the mendicant brothers shall not on account of a lower special attainment[5] halt on the way;[6] so long, mendicants, is the prosperity of the mendicant brothers to be expected. . . .'

§ 4. [8] 'I will set forth, mendicant brothers, seven further conditions[7] securing stability. . . . (1) As long as the mendicant brothers shall be faithful,[8] (2) shall be meek-minded,[9] (3) shall be conscience-fearing,[10] (4) shall be deeply learned [in the Law];[11] (5) shall be vigorous in what is undertaken,[12] (6) shall be attentive-minded,[13] (7) shall be possessed of insight;[14] so long, mendicants, is the prosperity of the mendicant brothers to be expected. . . .'

§ 5. [9] 'I will set forth seven further conditions[15] securing stability. . . . (1) As long as the mendicant brothers shall exercise[16] (*bhāvessanti*) reflection,[17] [which is] a part of wisdom;[18] (2) shall exercise learning in the Law,[19] a part of wisdom; (3) shall exercise energy,[20] a part of wisdom; (4) shall exercise joy,[21] a part of wisdom; (5) shall exercise

[1] 'Sloth', SBE, xi. [2] Ch. 8 *g* § 5 (*gregariousness*). 'Society', SBE, xi.

[3] Or, malicious. Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7]. Cp. Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 (*malevolence*), § 4 (*malicious speech*); also Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii), *hate*, and Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5) *enmity*. 'Shall not have sinful desires', SBE, xi, p. 7; 'wrong desires', SBB, iii, p. 83.

[4] Ap. D (*Evil*). Cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [7].

[5] Or, because of climbing some lower isolated height; i.e. through self-complacency.

[6] Cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (21). 'Come to a stop on their way (to Nirvāna in Arahatship)', SBB, iii, p. 83. See also MPS, ii. 26 (Ch. 21 § 8 n).

[7] See § 2 [6] above. These conditions appear also practically word for word in *Aṅg. Nik.* vii, 23.

[8] *Saddhā*; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180], and Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [3].

[9] *Hiri-manā*; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]. 'Conscientious', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 14. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [2] (*lajjin*).

[10] *Ottāpi*; Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [91] n (*conscience*). 'Afraid of sin', SBE, xi, p. 8; 'afraid of wrong-doing', SBB, iii, p. 83; 'afraid of blame', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 14.

[11] *Bahu-ssutā*; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]; and Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n.

[12] *Āraddha-viriya*. Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (iii); Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [11]; and Ap. F 2 *a* (137); see § 5 (3) below. Cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79], and Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [28].

[13] *Upaṭṭhita-satī*, or as in *Aṅg. Nik.* vii, 23, *sati-manto*; i.e. with intent thought fixed upon the relation of the self to the universe. Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (v); also Ch. 9 *a* (*sati-paṭṭhāna*); Ap. F 2 *b* [6]; Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-knowledge*). See § 5 (1) below.

[14] *Paññā-vanto*; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (vii); Ap. E *a* i (277); and Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; see § 8 below. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*sammā-diṭṭhi*).

[15] See § 2 [6] above. These conditions appear also in *Aṅg. Nik.* vii. 24. They are also called the Seven Parts of Wisdom (Ch. 9 *a* § 8).

[16] Literally, grow or cultivate; see § 6 (1) below; Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]. Cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 2; and Ap. I *a* (*Meditation*).

[17] *Sati*; reflection leading to knowledge of the relation of the self to the universe. See § 4 (6) above.

[18] *Sam-bojjh-aṅga*; Ch. 21 § 15 (6); Ap. G 1 *b* § 4. See § 10 [17] below.

[19] Ch. 9 *a* § 8. 'Search after truth', SBE, xi, p. 9; 'the part (in awakening) that is Dhamma-testing', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 14. [20] See § 4 (5) above.

[21] *Pīti*; Ch. 9 *a* § 8. Cp. Ap. F 2 *b* [6] (*muditā*). This injunction shows that Buddha's doctrine was not pessimistic; he taught that egoistic life was sorrowful but the transcendence of the self was joy (Ap. E *b*, *Note*).

calm,[1] a part of wisdom; (6) shall exercise self-transcendence,[2] a part of wisdom; (7) shall exercise serenity,[3] a part of wisdom; so long is the prosperity of the mendicant brothers to be expected. . . .'

§ 6. [10] 'I will set forth seven further conditions[4] securing stability. . . . (1) As long as the mendicant brothers shall cultivate[5] the perception[6] of the transient,[7] (2) . . . the perception of permanent-individuality,[8] (3) . . . the perception of the unclean,[9] (4) . . . the perception of misery,[10] (5) . . . the perception of abandoning,[11] (6) . . . the perception of freedom from desire,[12] (7) . . . the perception of cessation;[13] so long is the prosperity of the mendicant brothers to be expected. . . .'

§ 7. [11] 'I will set forth six conditions[14] securing stability. . . . (1) As long as the mendicant brothers shall maintain amity[15] (*mettaṃ*) in deeds[16] among the companions in the holy life[17] both openly and in private (*raho*)[18] . . . (2) as long as they shall maintain amity in speech among the companions in the holy life . . . (3) as long as they shall maintain amity in thought among the companions in the holy life, so long is the prosperity of the mendicant brothers to be expected. (4) As long as whatever they shall receive rightfully, in accordance with the Law, including even the contents of an alms-bowl[19]—in all things so received they shall be sharers, enjoying them in common[20] with the duteous (*sīlavantehi*)[21] companions in the holy life[22] . . . (5) as

[1] *Passaddhi*; Ch. 9 *a* § 8. This may differ from (7) below in degree only. 'Calming down', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 14.

[2] *Samādhi*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1]; see § 8 below. Cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. 'Earnest contemplation', SBE, xi, p. 9; 'concentration', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 14; 'rapture', SBB, iii, p. 336 (Int. § 53). It is plain that this should be a general practice of the monks, not an exceptional feat of psychic experts.

[3] *Upekhā*; Ap. F 2 *a* (162); Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. Cp. (5) above.

[4] See § 2 [6] above. These conditions appear also in *Aṅg. Nik.* vii. 25. They are also called the Seven Perceptions in the *Saṅgīti-S.* of *Dīgha-Nik.* (PTS, iii, p. 253).

[5] Or, exercise. See § 5 (1) above; Ap. I *a* (*Exercises*).

[6] *Saññā*; Ap. E *a* ii § 2. 'Thought', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 14.

[7] *Anicca*; Ch. 4 § 18 [1]; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]; Ap. E *a* i; and Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]. 'The realization of the idea of the impermanency of all phenomena, bodily or mental'.

[8] *An-atta*; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ap. E *c* i, 'Non-individuality', SBE, xi; 'the absence (. . . of any abiding principle) of any soul', SBB, iii; 'soullessness', SBB, iv, p. 235. The whole list clearly denies belief in rebirth (Ap. B *a*, *Karma*).

[9] *A-subha*; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [5]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5 (*taca-pañcakaṃ*); also Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (7), *defilement*.

[10] *Ādīnava*; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. 'The danger of sin', SBE, xi.

[11] *Pahāṇa*; Ch. 9 *a* § 5; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; cp. § 10 [17] below. 'Elimination', SBB, iv, p. 235.

[12] *Vi-rāga*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6), and Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).

[13] *Nirodha*; Ch. 5 *b* § 7; and Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]. 'Nirvana', SBE, xi, SBB, iii; 'ending', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 14.

[14] See § 2 [6] above. These conditions appear also in *Aṅg. Nik.* vi. 11 (*Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 208), as 'six ways of courtesy or goodwill' (*dhamma sārāṇīya*); cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 3 n, and Int. § 53.

[15] Or, loving-kindness; Ap. F 1 *b*. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [8] (*associates*).

[16] Ap. B *b*, *Note*.

[17] See § 2 (7) above.

[18] Or, alone (Ch. 13 *e* § 1 [2]).

[19] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[20] *Sādhārana-bhogī*. There was no private property in the Vihāra (Ch. 8 *g*).

[21] Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [9]. 'Upright', SBE, xi, SBB, iii, p. 85; 'virtuous', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 208. See (5) below (*sīlāni*).

[22] See § 2 (7) above.

long as those duties (*sīlāni*)[1] which [when] unbroken, unflawed, unspotted, unblemished, are emancipating (*bhujissāni*),[2] lauded by the wise, [when] uncorrupted[3] [are] conducive to self-transcendence[4]—in such duties they shall dwell united by duty with the companions in the holy life[5] both openly and in private . . . (6) as long as that outlook,[6] noble (*ariyā*)[7] and onward-speeding, which speeds on to the complete destruction[8] of the sorrow of one who practises it—as long as in such an outlook the mendicant brothers shall dwell united by outlook with the companions in the holy life[9] both openly and in private, so long is the prosperity of the mendicant brothers to be expected and no decline. . . .'

8. [12] And the Blessed One staying there at Rājagaha on the Gijjhakūṭa Hill[10] delivered that full religious discourse[11] to the mendicant brothers, thus: 'Such is duty, such is self-transcendence, such is insight. When suffused by duty[12] [to others] self-transcendence[13] is greatly fruitful, greatly commendable; when suffused by self-transcendence insight[14] [into the transience of the individual] is greatly fruitful, greatly commendable. The [whole] mind suffused by insight [thus pervaded by self-transcendence and by duty to others] is completely liberated from the taints,[15] that is to say from the taint of sensuous pleasure, from the taint of individuality, from the taint of wrong outlook,[16] from the taint of ignorance.'

§ 9. [13] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Rājagaha as long as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda[17] saying, 'Let us go,

[1] This paragraph occurs in *Saṃ*. lv. 1 (Ap. H 1 § 6 [8]). See (4) above (*duteous*) and § 8 below; also Ap. H 4 *a*.
[2] Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [1]; also Ap. D *a* § 6.
[3] *A-parāmaṭṭhāni*; cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 ii (*parāmāsa*). 'Incorruptible', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 208. SBE, xi, and SBB, iii, on commentarial authority, translate as 'untarnished (by the desire of future life, or by the belief in the efficacy of outward acts)'; cp. Ap. C *b* § 9 n.
[4] *Samādhi*. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].
[5] See § 2 (7) above.
[6] *Diṭṭhi*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].
[7] Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7]; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].
[8] Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3].
[9] See § 2 (7) above.
[10] Int. § 128.
[11] Int. §§ 53, 102; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3; Ap. I, *Note*; and Ch. 11 *c* § 10 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 12; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [2]. See below §§ 9 [14], 10 [18]; Ch. 21 §§ 1 [4], 2 [10], 5, 18, 20. The three points are fully developed in *Dīgha* 10 (Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [6] n; SBB, ii, pp. 268, 269, 270). They summarize a long passage in *Dīgha* 4 (PTS, i, p. 124; SBB, ii, p. 156) and partly in *Dīgha* 2 (PTS, i, pp. 69, 73–7; SBB, ii, pp. 79, 84–6) where the terms are *sila*, *paññā*, and *jhāna*, and where the discourse seems to be overladen by interpolations; see also *Aṅg. Nik.* i, pp. 240, 241 (*Gradual Sayings*, i, pp. 219, 221 n). The terms *sīla*, *ñāna*, *vimutti* (*Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 451) survey the same comprehensive field. The sermon interpreted means 'Do your duty to others in deed and word and thought, forget your selves, perceive the transience of all things and their deathless unity'; cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*amata*), Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*right effort*), and Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*Everything*). On the scope of the discourse see Ch. 21 § 17 [2] n (*truths*). Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*graduated discourse*); Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (1); and Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180] (*good conduct*).
[12] See § 7 (5) above.
[13] Or, thought transcending self. See § 5 (6) above.
[14] See § 4 (7) above.
[15] *Āsavā*; Ap. D *a* § 7.
[16] Cp. Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [29]; and Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1) *views*. The *āsavā* are here four though elsewhere they are three; false outlook may be but is not always ignorance.
[17] See § 2 above.

Ānanda; we will move on to Ambalaṭṭhikā.'[1] 'Be it so (*evaṃ*), revered sir,' said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One. Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Ambalaṭṭhikā. [14] And there at Ambalaṭṭhikā the Blessed One stayed in the king's pleasure-house[2] (*rāj-āgārake*). And there also the Blessed One staying at Ambalaṭṭhikā in the king's pleasure-house delivered that same full religious discourse[3] to the mendicant brothers: 'Such is duty, such is self-transcendence, such is insight. . . .'

§ 10. [15] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Ambalaṭṭhikā as long as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda[4] saying, 'Let us go, Ānanda; we will move on to Nālandā.'[5] . . . And there at Nālandā the Blessed One stayed in the Pāvāraka mango-grove.[6] [16] And the venerable Sāriputta[7] came to the Blessed One . . . and sitting beside him spoke thus: 'Thus have I faith in the Blessed One, revered sir—there neither has been, nor will there be, nor does there exist now, another religious teacher having more of the higher knowledge[8] than the Blessed One, that is, [more] of Enlightenment (*sambodhiyaṃ*).' . . .[9] [17] 'Such indeed, revered sir, is the inference from the Law drawn by me. Those who in past time were saints[10] all-enlightened[11]—all these Blessed Ones (*Bhagavanto*), having abandoned[12] the five obstacles,[13] having seen into (*paññāya*) the defilements[14] of the mind (*cetaso*) that cause loss of power[15] with minds well trained in the four earnest meditations,[16] being exercised (*bhavetvā*) to the utmost in the seven parts of wisdom,[17] were enlightened in unsurpassed enlightenment (*sammā-sambodhiṃ*). [So will be] also those who in the future shall be saints all-enlightened. . . . [So] also the Blessed One, the present saint all-enlightened, having abandoned the five obstacles . . . is enlightened in unsurpassed enlightenment.' [18] And there also the Blessed One staying at Nālandā in the Pāvārika mango-grove delivered that same full religious discourse[18] to the mendicant brothers; 'Such is duty, such is self-transcendence, such is insight. . . .'

§ 11. [19] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Nālandā as long

[1] Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [2]. [2] Ch. 1 § 9. [3] See § 8 above.
[4] See § 2 above. [5] Int. § 145. [6] Ch. 11 *d* § 5.
[7] See Ch. 11 *d* § 5 n, on Sāriputta's outburst and other Suttas where it is to be found. The compiler of the MPS (IN 6, Canon) has included this incident, but it is doubtful whether the great disciple was still living (Ch. 19 *a*, n). The incident may have taken place many years previously.
[8] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).
[9] Gotama asks whether Sāriputta knows the minds of all past and future Buddhas and of himself. The disciple admits that he does not, but says that he has learnt from the Teacher the main characteristics of enlightenment distinguishing all Buddhas (cp. Ch. 4 § 18, *principle*). [10] *Arahants*; Ap. D *c*.
[11] *Sammā-sambuddhā*; Ch. 5 *b* § 10. On the belief in previous Buddhas see Ap. A 2 *c*. [12] *Pahāya*; cp. § 6 (5) above.
[13] *Nīvaraṇā*. Ap. D *a* § 9 (iv).
[14] *Upakkilesā*; cp. Ch. 1 § 11 [163]; Ch. 2 § 2.
[15] *Du-bbalī*; cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4 (*balāni*). [16] Ch. 13 *a* § 6.
[17] See § 5 (1) above. [18] See § 8 above.

as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Let us go, Ānanda; we will move on to Pātaligāma.'[1] . . . Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Pātaligāma. [20] . . .[2] [26] And at that time Sunīdha and Vassakāra,[3] chief ministers[4] of Magadha[5] (*Magadha-mahāmattā*), were laying out a [walled] city (*nagaraṃ*)[6] at Pātaligāma as a defence against the Vajjians.[7] . . .[8] [29] And Sunīdha and Vassakāra, chief ministers of Magadha, went to the Blessed One and having drawn near exchanged courtesies with the Blessed One and having gone through the current phrases[9] of courtesy stood[10] at one side and . . . spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'May the respected (*bhavaṃ*)[11] Gotama[12] consent to take a meal[13] with us together with the mendicant community to-day?' The Blessed One consented by his silence. . . .[14] [32] And at that time the chief ministers . . . following the Blessed One said 'The gate[15] by which the devotee Gotama shall go out to-day shall be named "*Gotama Gate*";[16] the steps[17] from which he shall cross the river Ganges[18] shall be the "*Gotama Steps*" '. . . . [33] And the Blessed One proceeded to the river Ganges. At that time the Ganges was full,[19] level with its banks, brimful. . . .[20]

[1] Int. § 145.

[2] As in Ch. 11 *d* § 15. Gotama meets the laymen of Pātaligāma and addresses them on the gains of the well-doer in this life and the next. This worldly and individualistic discourse may be safely attributed to later brethren who did not understand the Teacher's doctrine.

[3] Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1].

[4] Int. § 172; Ch. 23 *a* [8].

[5] Int. § 123.

[6] Int. §§ 128, 136, 175; Ch. 14 *d* § 2; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4), § 4 [4]. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]. See below, [32] gate.

[7] Int. § 133; Ch. 19 *d*.

[8] Omitting an account of the earth-spirits (*devatā*; Int. § 35, ii) who haunted the site (Int. § 71); also a prophecy (Int. § 95) attributed to Gotama that the city would be called Pātaliputta and would be subject to dangers from fire, flood, and dissensions.

[9] Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]. See Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [158] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1] n; Ch. 19 *d* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 23 *a* [8] n.

[10] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1].

[11] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]; and Int. § 190 (*address*).

[12] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].

[13] Ap. H 5 [92], and Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [15].

[14] As in Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7] with necessary changes. Further, omitting verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) which follow after the meal and represent Buddha as recommending gifts to the 'Gods (*devatā*)' as bringing gain. On the unlikeliness of these verses see SBE, xi, p. 20 n, where it is suggested that the *devatā* may be 'good men', i.e. Arahats (cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 2; also Ap. B *a* § 6 [9], *gifts*).

[15] The city-gate; see [26] above; Ch. 2 § 6 [63] n.

[16] Ch. 1 § 6 n; Ch. 19 *b* § 6 [6] n.

[17] *Tittha*; Ch. 14 *c* § 17 [11]. Cp. Ch. 11 *a* § 1. Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [v] n; also Ch. 9 *c* (*Titthiyā*); and Ch. 15 *a* § 12 (ii), *ford*.

[18] Int. § 121.

[19] This would imply that the journey took place during the rainy season, July to September. The regular Rains had not yet begun (Ch. 21 § 6 [22]).

[20] Omitting the miraculous (Int. § 94, iii) crossing of the river by Buddha and the company of Bhikkhus while the people struggled across, and verses moralizing the occasion (Int. § 79).

CHAPTER 21

THE LAST TOUR: THROUGH THE VAJJIAN[1] COUNTRY; VESĀLI

Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16 (*Mahā-parinibbāna-suttanta*);[2] *the Narrative of the Great Decease. Parts ii–iv, 12.*

§ 1. [Pt. ii. 1.] Then [having crossed the river Ganges from Pāṭaligāma] the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Let us go, Ānanda; we will move on to Koṭigāma.'[3] . . . Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Koṭigāma. And there at Koṭigāma the Blessed One stayed [2] . . . and instructed the mendicant brothers. . . .[4] [4] And there also the Blessed One staying at Koṭigāma delivered that same full religious discourse[5] to the mendicant brothers: 'Such is duty, such is self-transcendence, such is insight. . . .'

§ 2. [5] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Koṭigāma as long as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Let us go . . . to Nādikā.'[6] . . . Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Nādikā. And there at Nādikā[7] (*Nādike*) the Blessed One stayed in the Brick-house[8] (*Ginjakāvasathe*). [6–9] . . .[9] [10] And there also the Blessed One staying at

[1] Int. § 158. [2] Ch. 20. [3] Ch. 12 *e* § 4 [1].

[4] A short discourse follows, on the Four Noble Truths, as in MV, VI. xxix (Ch. 12 *c* § 11) and in Saṃyutta lvi of *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, v, p. 431), including verses which suggest a comparatively late date of composition. Cp. § 17 [2] (*dhammā*) below.

[5] Ch. 20 § 8. [6] Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *e* § 5. Nādikā may be pl.

[7] In the singular. [8] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6].

[9] See Ap. B *a* § 6. Omitting the long passages in which Gotama is stated to have explained the several destinies of certain persons recently deceased at Nādikā as respectively (i) Arahatship (saintship or emancipation in this world, and hence final release), (ii) the state of never returning to this world, (iii) the state of once returning, and (iv) that of being no longer liable to rebirth in a state lower than human; and in which the Teacher further is made to declare that, in order to avoid the tedium of answering questions regarding the fate of each disciple on decease, he will teach Ānanda the 'Mirror of the Law', by which each disciple may predict of himself that Hell is destroyed for him, and rebirth as an animal, or as a ghost, or in any place of woe or fallen state of suffering, and that he is assured of complete enlightenment. This system of sanctions is based upon individualistic desires strongly reprobated in the Sermon on the Four Noble Truths. The *Nidāna-kathā* of the *Jātaka* (Ch. 5 *b* § 2) following the Pāli scriptures represents the first five disciples as having attained (i) the fruits of entering the stream, and (ii) the fruits of Arahatship or saintship. These two ideas present a natural sequence, and contain the germ from which apparently the above dogmatic fourfold classification subsequently developed. Between entering the stream (i.e. of conversion) and becoming no longer liable to rebirth in a fallen state of suffering there is a wide space to be filled up by the imagination. It is noticeable that the highest stage, that of Arahatship in this world, cannot follow on the next highest, namely the state of never returning to this world. This confusion seems attributable to the process of expansion to which the original teaching was subjected.

Nādikā in the Brick-house delivered that same full religious discourse[1] to the mendicant brothers: 'Such is duty. . . .'

§ 3. [11] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Nādikā as long as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Let us go . . . to Vesāli.'[2] . . . Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Vesāli. And there at Vesāli the Blessed One stayed in the Ambapāli-grove.[3] [12] And there the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Let a Bhikkhu, mendicant brothers, live self-scrutinizing, comprehending; this is our injunction to you. And in what way is a Bhikkhu self-scrutinizing (*sato*)?[4] In this respect (*idha*) a Bhikkhu lives as regards the body,[5] contemplating the body . . . as regards the sensations, contemplating the sensations . . . as regards the mind, contemplating the mind . . . as regards phenomena, contemplating phenomena; strenuous,[6] comprehending, mindful, having put away in this world covetousness[7] and perturbation. Thus, mendicant brothers, is a Bhikkhu self-scrutinizing. [13] And in what way is a Bhikkhu comprehending (*sampajāno*)?[8] In this respect a Bhikkhu acts with comprehension in going out, in returning . . .[9] in walking, in standing, in sitting, in sleeping, in waking, in speaking, in being silent. Thus, mendicant brothers, is a Bhikkhu comprehending. Let a Bhikkhu live self-scrutinizing, comprehending; this is our injunction to you.'

§ 4. [14–18] And Ambapāli the courtesan heard that the Blessed One having arrived at Vesāli[10] was staying at Vesāli in her mango-grove (*amba-vane*).[11] . . .[12] [19] And when the night had elapsed Ambapāli the courtesan in her own garden[13] (*sake ārāme*) caused choice food . . . to be prepared and . . . informed the Blessed One that it was time. Then the Blessed One in the morning came to where the

[1] Ch. 20 § 8.

[2] Int. § 133.

[3] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx. 1] n. Cp. § 14 [19] below (*ārāma*).

[4] Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. 'Mindful', SBE, xi, p. 28; SBB, iii, p. 101.

[5] The passage is drawn from the *Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-S.* (Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]), or from the *Satipaṭṭhāna-S.* (*Majjh. Nik.* 10). Body and sensations, mind and phenomena, form two comprehensive pairs. See § 8 [26] below; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [15].

[6] *Ātāpin*; Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3] (*fervent*); Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10].

[7] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]. 'The grief which arises from bodily craving', SBE, xi; 'the hankering and the dejection common in the world', SBB, iii.

[8] Comprehending the transience of all individuals; see § 7 [23] below; cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 3 (*paññā*). 'Thoughtful', SBE; 'self-possessed', SBB. The passage is drawn from the *Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-S.* (Ch. 9 *a* [4]).

[9] Omitting details of daily life.

[10] In the MV version (Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx. 1]) the place is Koṭigāma and later (Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx. 6]) Ambapāli is said to have sent a message from her mango-grove at Vesāli to Buddha at Ñātika. The more detailed account is probably the later.

[11] Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx. 1] n. Cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [14].

[12] Omitting accounts of visits by Ambapāli and by the Licchavi nobles, and descriptions of their gorgeous chariots (as in Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1–5]; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 9 [2]), all plainly intended to interest and flatter Licchavis of a later day (IN 6, Canon), whose predecessors Buddha is here said to compare with the *tāva-tiṃsa* Gods (Int. § 93, vi).

[13] Or, the garden of her name. Ch. 7 *a* § 10 (*ārāma*).

food-distribution[1] (*parivesanā*) of Ambapāli the courtesan was. . . .[2] And when the Blessed One having eaten had withdrawn his hand from the bowl[3] Ambapāli the courtesan taking a low seat (*nīcaṃ āsanaṃ*)[4] sat down at one side . . . and said: 'I give,[5] revered sir, this Ambapāli-grove (*Ambapāli-vanaṃ*) to the mendicant community headed by the Buddha.' The Blessed One accepted the garden.[6] And the Blessed One having enlightened . . . Ambapāli with a discourse on the Law, rose from his seat and departed.[7]

§ 5. [20] And there also the Blessed One staying at Vesāli in the Ambapāli-grove delivered that same full religious discourse[8] to the mendicant brothers: 'Such is duty. . . .'

§ 6. [21] Then the Blessed One having stayed in the Ambapāli-grove as long as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Let us go . . . to Beluva-gāmaka.'[9] . . . Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Beluva-gāmaka. And there at Beluva-gāmaka the Blessed One stayed. [22] And there[10] the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Come, mendicant brothers, do you on every side[11] of Vesāli keep the rainy season[12] [grouping yourselves] according as you are friends and intimates faring together.[13] I for my part will enter upon the rainy season [retreat] here at Beluva-gāmaka.' 'Be it so, revered sir', said the mendicant brothers in assent to the Blessed One and in every part of Vesāli they entered upon the rainy season [grouping themselves] according as they were friends and intimates faring together. Then the Blessed One there at Beluva-gāmaka entered upon the rainy season [retreat].

§ 7. [23] And a severe illness attacked the Blessed One when he had entered upon the rainy season [retreat]; the painful sensations became like unto death. The Blessed One, self-scrutinizing[14] and comprehending,[15] endured them patiently. Then this thought came to the Blessed One: 'It does not befit me that I should die (*parinibbāyeyyaṃ*)[16] without having instructed my attendants (*upaṭṭhāke*),[17] without having

[1] Int. § 133; No invitation was necessary for such a meal. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [4].
[2] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1], and Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7] with necessary changes.
[3] 'Had quite finished his meal, and had cleansed the bowl and his hands', SBB, iii, p. 105. Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]. See Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6].
[4] Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482].
[5] Int. § 133. Nothing is said here of a formal dedication (Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [18]; Ch. 10 *a* § 3 [93]).
[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 15; see § 3 [11] above (*Grove*).
[7] The MV account states that he went to the Mahāvana (Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]). The present account implies that he left the meal but stayed in the garden.
[8] Ch. 20 § 8.
[9] Int. § 133; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [21].
[10] This passage up to the end of Pt. II (MPS) occurs also in and perhaps is borrowed from the *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, v, pp. 152–4), but may have been part of the original structure of the MPS.
[11] Samantā; Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [8]; Ch. 17 *e* [7].
[12] Ch. 8 *c*. Cp. Ch. 20 § 11 [33] n.
[13] Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [22]. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [8] (*associates*).
[14] *Sata*; i.e. perceiving the transience of the individual self. Ch. 22 *a* §§ 3 [20], 8 [40]; and Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]; cp. Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-knowledge*).
[15] *Sampajāna*; see § 3 [13] above; Ch. 22 *b* § 27.
[16] Ap. C *b*, *Note*.
[17] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [1] (*ministering*).

advised[1] the mendicant community (*bhikkhu-saṃghaṃ*).[2] What now if I having turned aside this illness by strength[3] (of resolve) should continue to keep the will to live?'[4] And the Blessed One turned aside that illness by strength (of resolve) and continued to keep the will to live. And the illness of the Blessed One abated. [24] Then the Blessed One having recovered from the weakness, not long after he had recovered from it, came out from the dwelling (*vihārā*) and sat down on a seat appointed[5] in the shade[6] of the [verandah of the] house (*vihāra-pacchāyāyaṃ*). Then the venerable Ānanda drew near to where the Blessed One was and . . . seated at one side spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The health[7] of the Blessed One, revered sir, has been observed by me. Indeed, revered sir, my body was near swooning and the quarters [of the heavens] became dim to me and objects[8] (*dhammā*) became darkened to me, owing to the weakness of the Blessed One. Yet indeed, revered sir, there was some measure of relief for me in thinking "The Blessed One will not die until he has made some pronouncement concerning the mendicant community." ' [25] 'What then, Ānanda,' he said, 'does the mendicant community expect of me? The Law has been shown by me, Ānanda, without my making [distinction between] that which is outer [doctrine] and that which is inner [doctrine].[9] Here[10] in respect of the laws[11] (*dhammesu*), Ānanda, the Follower[12] has not the closed hand[13] of an instructor (*ācariya-muṭṭhi*). (Whosoever now, Ānanda, may think thus, either "I will lead[14] the mendicant community" or "The mendicant community is looking to me", let him now make some pronouncement concerning the mendicant community. But the Follower, Ānanda, does not think thus, either "I will lead the mendicant community"

[1] 'Taking leave of', SBE, xi, p. 35.
[2] Or, Order (Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; Ch. 8 A). *Saṃgha* seems here to have its widest meaning, neither a formal meeting or assembly, nor a company or assemblage.
[3] *Viriya*; Int. § 105 n; Ap. F 2 *a* (137).
[4] *Jīvita-saṃkhāraṃ adhiṭṭhāya*; 'Keep my hold on life', SBE, iii, p. 106; 'remain holding fast to my sum of life', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 131. For *saṃkhāra* as 'will' see Ap. E *a*, *Note*. Cp. § 10 n below (*āyu-saṃkhārā*), power (*iddhi*) to remain alive.
[5] Or, arranged. See § 9 [2] below; Ch. 17 *b* § 1; and Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
[6] Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [4]; and Int. § 190 (*architecture*).
[7] The *Saṃ. Nik.* version here slightly differs.
[8] Or, thoughts; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]. 'The doctrines', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 131. These phrases were used by Ānanda on the occasion of Sāriputta's death (Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [6]).
[9] 'Exoteric and esoteric doctrine', SBE, xi, p. 36; SBB, iii, p. 107. Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*self-evident*). Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3] (*spirit of the Law*).
[10] *Tatthā*, in this regard. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].
[11] Or, Truths. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; see §§ 14 [50], 15 below; and Part I (title) n.
[12] *Tathāgata*; right-farer, successor, follower, or leader (Ap. A 2 *c*). See below §§ 16, 17 [1]; Ch. 22 *a* §§ 2 [18] n, 8 [37] n, 9 [42]; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 2 [2] n, [3], 4 [7], [8] n, 6 [10], 7 [14], 8 [15], 9 [17], 10 [19], 13 [23], 25. It may be doubted whether Gotama ever gave himself this or any other title except the clan-name Sakya-putta (Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]). Elsewhere in the speech he calls himself simply and naturally 'I (*ahaṃ*)'. The annalist has respectfully improved on this.
[13] Int. § 114; Ap. G 1 *a* § 6 [2]. ' "Teacher's " fist', *Kindred Sayings*, v, p. 132.
[14] Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1]; and Ch. 7 *a* § 22 [2] (*company*).

or "The mendicant community is looking to me." Why, Ānanda, should the Follower make any pronouncement concerning the mendicant community?)[1] I indeed, Ānanda, am now worn-out, old, of great age, I have gone my journey,[2] completed my life; my life has lasted eighty years.[3] As when a worn-out cart[4] is made to go by patching up (*vegha-missakena*),[5] even so by patching up methinks, Ānanda, the body of the Follower is made to go. At such time as the Follower by withdrawing attention from all outward-things,[6] by the cessation (*nirodhā*) of each sensation, attains and dwells in a self-transcendent state of mind (*ceto-samādhiṃ*)[7] free from [thoughts of] outward-things, then [only] is the body of the Follower at ease.[8]

§ 8. [26]—Therefore[9] in this regard, Ānanda, abide self-reliant[10] (*atta dīpā*), taking refuge[11] in yourselves, not taking refuge in others; reliant on the Law, taking refuge in the Law,[12] not taking refuge in another. And how, Ānanda, does a mendicant brother abide self-reliant, taking refuge in himself, not taking refuge in others; reliant on the Law, taking refuge in the Law not taking refuge in another? In this respect, Ānanda, a mendicant brother abides as regards the body,[13] contemplating the body . . . as regards the sensations, contemplating the sensations . . . as regards the mind, contemplating the mind . . . as regards phenomena, contemplating phenomena, strenuous, comprehending, mindful, having put away in this world covetousness and perturbation. Thus indeed, Ānanda, a mendicant abides self-reliant . . . not taking refuge in another. Those, Ānanda, who either now or after my passing away shall abide self-reliant . . . not taking refuge in another, these shall become my Bhikkhus,

[1] This passage, seemingly so inconsistent with Buddha's habitual mild imperiousness and with his own preceding thoughts, may have been interpolated (IN 6, *Canon*) by a party favouring local independence or congregationalism (Ch. 8 *f*). In MPS, vi. 1 (Ch. 22 *b* § 21) Buddha declares that after his departure the Dhamma and Vinaya must take his place.

[2] *Addha-gatā*; cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16] n. Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [120] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 16 [27]. See Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1].

[3] Ch. 2 § 5 n; Ch. 7 *b* § 1; Ch. 10 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 22 *b* § 16.

[4] *Sakaṭa*; Int. § 190 (*vehicles*). Cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [3].

[5] The exact meaning is not clear. 'With much additional care', SBE, xi, p. 37; 'with the help of thongs', SBB, iii, p. 107.

[6] *Nimittā*; phenomena. Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [3]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 9 (*omens*); also § 11 [33] below (*external*); and Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] (*void*).

[7] Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]; cp. Ch. 20 § 5 (6); Ch. 8 *f* § 2 [1].

[8] Ch. 20 § 2 (7).

[9] Cp. § 14 [50] below. The following injunction appears again in *Saṃ*. xlvii of *Saṃ. Nik.* (Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [10]); and again in *Dīgha* 26 (PTS, iii, p. 58), where Buddha addresses the brethren at Mātulā (Ch. 11 *d* § 13). It appears also in *Saṃ*. xxii of *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, iii, p. 42), where the assembled Bhikkhus are addressed at Sāvatthi. But there the origin of perturbation is stated to be the non-perception of the transience of the Khandhā (Ap. E *a* ii). See Ap. E *c* ii § 4.

[10] Int. § 40; Ap. E *c* ii § 4. The self can be transcended only by the self.

[11] Cp. § 16 below; and Ap. H 2 *a* § 1. For the necessity of exertion and diligence see Ap. C *b* § 11 (21).

[12] Ch. 11 *d* § 13 (*dhamma*); cp. Ch. 23 *a* [9]. The Dhamma teaches how, by exertion, to overcome the desirous self (IN 5 *b*).

[13] The following passage is taken from the *Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-S.* (Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]). See § 3 [12] above.

Ānanda, above darkness[1]—those who are desirous to learn[2] (*sikkhā-kāmā*).'

§ 9. [Pt. iii. 1.] Then the Blessed One in the forenoon[3] having dressed and assumed his outer-robe and alms-bowl entered Vesāli for alms. Having gone begging for food in Vesāli, and after his meal[4] having returned from his begging-round, he instructed the venerable Ānanda, saying: 'Take a mat, Ānanda; I will go to the Cāpāla[5] shrine[6] for the [noon] day-rest.' 'Be it so, revered sir,' replied the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One, and taking up a mat he followed closely after the Blessed One. [2] And the Blessed One went to the Cāpāla shrine and having arrived sat down on the seat arranged[7] and the venerable Ānanda, having saluted[8] the Blessed One, sat down at one side. Then to the venerable Ānanda seated at his side the Blessed One said: 'Delightful, Ānanda, is Vesāli. . . .'[9]

§ 10. [3–5] . . .[10] [6] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Go thou, Ānanda; now for what thou thinkest seasonable.'[11] 'So be it, revered sir,' said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One, and having risen from his seat he saluted the Blessed One so moving as to keep his right side[12] towards him and sat down not far off[13] at the foot of a certain tree.

§ 11. [7–11] . . .[14] [12] Then the venerable Ānanda went to where the Blessed One was and when he arrived saluted the Blessed One and sat down at one side. . . .[15] [33] 'There are, Ānanda,' [said the

[1] Above doubt, indifference or ignorance. For the metaphor cp. Ch. 20 § 3 (7).

[2] i.e. diligent in self-training; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [2]. A better rendering may be 'those, that is, who love the discipline'; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1].

[3] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [106]. See below § 17 [1].

[4] See Ch. 12 *d* § 1.

[5] See Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [1].

[6] *Cetiya*; Int. § 134.

[7] See § 7 [24] above.

[8] Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5].

[9] As in Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2]; see § 12 n [41–7] below.

[10] Omitting a passage on fourfold *iddhi* (Ap. I *b* § 6; see § 12 n [40] below) giving power to remain alive (*āyu-saṃkhārā*; see § 7 [23] above) till the end of the cycle or *kappa* (Int. § 49; see § 12 [38] below). This and the preceding passage are found also in *Saṃ*. li of *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, pp. 102–4) and in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 308–10).

[11] Ch. 20 § 2 [6].

[12] Ch. 6 *a* § 9.

[13] *Avidure*; cp. Ch. 1 § 1 (i) n.

[14] Māra (Int. §§ 69, 93, iv; see § 12 [34] n below) renews his attempts to persuade Gotama to pass away before his time; Gotama states that he will die at the end of three months, and thereupon the earth quakes. This long passage is found also in *Saṃ*. li of *Saṃ. Nik.* (v, pp. 260–3) and in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 310–12). It may perhaps have formed part of the ancient Sinhalese Commentary (Int. § 21) and so found place in Buddhaghosha's recension of the Canon (IN 6).

[15] Ānanda inquires regarding the causes of the recent earthquake and in [13]–[20] Buddha explains that earthquakes are due to eight causes (Int. § 189; Ch. 22 *b* § 27 n), the first cause being a natural disturbance of the wind and water on which the earth rests; the second being the power of some spiritual teacher or god (*devatā*, IN 8 *a*), and the remaining six being the conception, birth, enlightenment, first preaching, renunciation of the will to live, and final extinction of a (or the) Tathāgata (Ap. A 2 *c*; and Ch. 22 *a* § 8 n). These last six evidently are not catastrophic. The passage appears also in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 312–13). In [21]–[23] eight kinds of assemblies (*parisā*, Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21]) are mentioned and Buddha's supernatural appearances and disappearances thereat (Int. § 94, iii). The passage appears also in *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, p. 30) and partly in *Dīgha* 33 (iii, p. 260). In [24]–[32]

Blessed One] 'these eight deliverances[1] (*vimokhā*).[2] What eight? (1) As one having form one sees forms (*rūpāni*); this is the first stage of deliverance. (2) Conscious of no form personally[3] (*ajjhattaṃ*) one sees forms external;[4] this is the second [stage of] deliverance. (3) Thinking of "the [fundamental] brightness"[5] [underlying all forms] one becomes given up to it;[6] this is the third stage of deliverance. (4) By passing entirely beyond perceptions of form, by the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, by not thinking of perceptions of diversity, one saying "Space is infinite!" attains and dwells in the realm of space-infinity;[7] this is the fourth stage of deliverance. (5) Having passed entirely beyond the realm of space-infinity, one saying "Consciousness is infinite" attains and dwells in the realm of consciousness-infinity; this is the fifth stage of deliverance. (6) Having passed entirely beyond the realm of consciousness-infinity, one saying "There is not any [individual] thing" attains and dwells in the realm of nothingness; this is the sixth stage of deliverance. (7) Having passed entirely beyond the realm of nothingness one attains and dwells in the realm of neither [individual] perception nor [total] non-perception; this is the seventh stage of deliverance. (8) Having passed entirely beyond the realm of neither perception nor non-perception one attains and dwells in the cessation of perception and sensation; this is the eighth stage of deliverance. These then, Ānanda, are the eight deliverances.'

the eight States of Mastery over visible objects (*abhibh'-āyatanāni*, see [33] n below) are enumerated. This passage is found also in *Dīgha* 33 (iii, pp. 260–1), *Majjh.* 77 (ii, pp. 13–14), *Aṅg. Nik.* (i, p. 40, iv, pp. 305–6), and partly in *Saṃ. Nik.* (iv, pp. 76–7).

[1] Or, stages of deliverance. This passage occurs also in *Dīgha* 15 (SBB, iii, pp. 68–70) and *Dīgha* 33 (SBB, iv, pp. 242–3) and in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, iv, pp. 203–4), and also in fuller form in the Units of *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, i, pp. 36–8), where the States of Mastery (see [12] n above) lead up to and explain the first stages of the Deliverances. It may be remarked that the first three Deliverances cover the same ground as the four Jhānas, and the last five are identical with the five Attainments (Ch. 3 § 4 [66]) which usually follow the Jhānas; Ap. I *a* (*Trance*) n.

[2] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265].

[3] Within oneself; internally. Compare the second Jhāna (Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]); cp. also Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6].

[4] *Bahiddhā*, externally. Cp. § 7 [25] above (*outward-things*).

[5] See *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, pp. 35 and 262. *Subhan ti*; the fair, the beautiful, the good. It seems reasonable to interpret this as equivalent to the *amata* (Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*). This interpretation at least gives truth and beauty to the passage. 'It is well', SBB, iii, p. 119; 'it is beautiful', SBB, iv, p. 242; 'how fair!', *Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 37; 'it is fair', *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 203. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 26 (*fourth trance*); also Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n (*formless*).

[6] *Adhi-mutta*; see *Vin. Piṭ.* i, p. 183 (SBE, xvii, p. 10, where Buddhaghosha's explanation of the word is given). Not 'released'.

[7] See Ch. 22 *b* § 2 *b* [8]. Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]; and Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2] n; cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3] (*space-unity*); Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] (*void*). Of the last five stages of Deliverance four are identical with the Attainments (*samāpattiyo*) taught by Gotama's teachers and rejected by him (Ch. 3 § 5 [164], *nothingness*) and the last is mere metaphysical negation. It is apparent that his later followers re-adopted (IN 6, *Canon*) these subtleties from an earlier Hindu system of *yoga* (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*, *yoga* and *Sāṅkhya*).

§ 12. [34–37] . . .[1] [38] On this being said the venerable Ānanda spoke thus to the Blessed One: 'May the Blessed One, revered sir, live on for the [rest of the] cycle (*kappaṃ*);[2] may the Well-farer (*Sugato*)[3] stay on during the cycle, for the help of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the sake of, for the help of, for the happiness of, spirits and men (*devamanussānam*).'[4] . . .[5] [48] 'Now indeed, Ānanda,' he said, 'has it not been announced by me ere this[6] that there is in all, even the beloved and kind (*manāpehi*),[7] the principle of change, of separation, of transience (*aññathā-bhāvo*)?[8] Then how in this case, Ānanda, is it possible that what is born, produced, compounded (*saṅkhataṃ*),[9] dissolvable by nature (*paloka-dhammaṃ*)[10]—that this indeed should not be dissolved? This state (*ṭhānaṃ*)[11] is not to be found. . . .[12] Let us go, Ānanda; we will move on to the Mahāvana,[13] to the Kūṭāgāra Hall.' 'Be it so, revered sir,' said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One.

§ 13. [49] Then the Blessed One with the venerable Ānanda went on to the Mahāvana, to the Kūṭāgāra Hall; and having arrived he instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Go thou, Ānanda; as many mendicant brothers as are staying near Vesāli, cause them all to meet in the attendance-hall.'[14] . . . Then standing at one side the venerable Ānanda spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'The assembly of mendicant

[1] Buddha recounts how Māra (see § 11 [7] n above; also Int. § 69; and Ch. 4 § 6 n) attempted at Uruvelā on the bank of the river Nerañjarā under the goatherds' Nigrodha-tree to persuade him to pass away prematurely, and how he has just renewed the attempt, and he states that he has now assured Māra that he will pass away after three months.

[2] See § 10 [3] n above. Commentators have endeavoured to explain *kappa* as meaning the natural span of man's life or about one hundred years (*Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 206 n). As Buddha has just stated that he is eighty years old and worn out, a request that he should live for his natural life's span is superfluous; moreover, an extra period of twenty years would be a ridiculous issue of the travail of fourfold supernatural power (see n. on [40] below).

[3] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].

[4] The phrasing is the same as in Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1].

[5] Buddha refuses the request, saying that the time for making it is past. In [39] Ānanda repeats and Buddha refuses the request up to the third time. In [40] Ānanda pleads that Buddha should exercise his power of fourfold *iddhi* (see above § 10 [3] n, and § 12 [38]) for the purpose. In [41]–[47] Buddha recounts the occasions at Rājagaha (Ch. 11 *c* § 25; and Int. § 134) and Vesāli (see § 9 [2] n above, and Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2]) when Ānanda missed the opportunity of asking him to live on to the end of the *kappa*, and he declares that the fault has been Ānanda's (Ch. 12 *d* § 1 [2] n). These passages are mostly repetition and add little or nothing except the stock list of spots at Rājagaha.

[6] *Paṭigacc'eva* or *paṭikacc'eva* (in anticipation). See Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [8]; Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14]. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [2] (*earlier*).

[7] Or, gracious. Ch. 16 *d* § 4 [3]; and Ch. 10 *c* (66); Ap. F 1 *b* § 7.

[8] Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 4; and Ch. 4 § 18 [1] (*aniccā*).

[9] Ap. E *a* ii § 2 [8].

[10] Ap. E *a* i *Anicca*. Cp. Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [9] (*dissolve*).

[11] Ap. E *b* § 3 (1), where *n'etaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati* recurs.

[12] Omitting a statement, here attributed to Buddha, that as he has foretold (Int. § 95) that he will die after three months the decision cannot be changed; see § 16 below.

[13] Int. § 133.

[14] Ch. 10 *a* § 11; Ch. 20 § 2 [6]. This was evidently the common hall of the *Kūṭāgāra-sālā* (Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237]).

brothers, revered sir, has met; now for what, revered sir, the Blessed One thinks seasonable.'[1]

§ 14. [50] And the Blessed One went to the attendance-hall and when he arrived sat in the place prepared[2] and being seated the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'Therefore[3] in this regard, mendicant brothers, those laws (*dhammā*)[4] which I have fully learnt[5] and shown to you—these you should grasp well and they must be kept, cultivated, and fostered[6] by you so that[7] holy living (*brahma-cariyaṃ*)[8] may be long-enduring[9] and long-standing; and let this be for the help of the many, for the well-being of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the sake of, for the help of, for the well-being of spirits and men.'[10]

§ 15. [50 *cd.*] And which, mendicant brothers, are those laws[11] that I have fully learnt and shown? . . .[12] [These] namely, (1) the four earnest meditations,[13] (2) the four right efforts,[14] (3) the four roads to mental-power,[15] (4) the five spiritual organs,[16] (5) the five moral forces,[17] (6) the seven parts of wisdom,[18] (7) the Noble Eightfold Path.[19] These laws then, mendicant brothers, I have learnt and shown. . . .'[20]

[1] Ch. 20 § 2 [6] (*kālaṃ*).
[2] Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [4]; the chief or presidential seat.
[3] The abruptness of this opening shows that the passage is an excerpt. Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [11]; cp. § 8 [26] above; Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3], and Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3]; also Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3] (*then*).
[4] Or, truths; see § 7 [25] above; Ch. 13 *a* § 6. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 21.
[5] *Abhiññāya* may be a gerund (Ap. E *c* ii § 1) attached to the personal pronoun or it may be gen. sing. of *Abhiññā* meaning 'highest knowledge' (Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [6]).
[6] *Bahulī-kātabbā*, often to be done. SBB (iii, p. 127) translates 'spread abroad'. The last three verbs are almost synonymous; cp. *Aṅg. Nik.* i, p. 10.
[7] The words from here to the end of the sentence are found also in *Dīgha* 33 (SBB, iv, p. 204).
[8] Ch. 5 *c* § 5.
[9] *Addhaniya*, appertaining to a long space or period; cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16] n.
[10] Ch. 6 *b* § 1. This sentence is a mosaic pieced together with some difficulty. It is repeated at length twice in the discourse (see § 15 below). The concluding phrases are found also in *Dīgha* 29 (PTS, iii, p. 127) and are attributed to Vipassin Buddha in *Dīgha* 14 (PTS, ii, p. 45).
[11] *Dhammā*; see § 7 [25] above. The list comprises the principal Buddhist virtues; Ap. F 2 (*virtues*).
[12] Omitting repetition, as in § 14 above. See Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.
[13] These are upon body and sensations, mind and phenomena. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1] (*body*); Ap. G 1 *b* §§ 4, 5. See *Dīgha* 33 (PTS, iii, p. 221).
[14] Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; also Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14], and Ch. 3 § 6 n. These efforts are 'in order that unrisen wrong and wicked ideas [*dhammā*] may not arise . . . that wrong and wicked ideas if arisen may be put away . . . that unrisen good ideas may arise . . . that good ideas if arisen may persist', *Dīgha* 33 (SBB, iv, p. 215); cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] (*thoughts*) and Ap. B *b* § 3 [6] (*conditions*).
[15] Ap. G 1 *b* § 4. These are four forms of concentration—*chanda* (purpose), *viriya* (will), *citta* (mind), *vīmaṃsā* (thought); see *Dīgha* 18 (PTS, ii, p. 213), *Dīgha* 33 (PTS, iii, p. 221).
[16] *Saddhā*, *viriya*, *sati*, *samādhi* and *paññā*; see *Dīgha* 33 (PTS, iii, p. 239). Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.
[17] These are the same as the preceding group; see *Saṃ. Nik.* v, p. 219. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 8. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4. In *Dīgha* 33 (PTS, iii, p. 253) *hiri* (Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]) and *ottappa* (Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n) are added making seven; at *Aṅg. Nik.* v, p. 123 (Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [3]) these last two replace *sati* and *samādhi*.
[18] Ch. 20 § 5 [1].
[19] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ch. 13 *a* § 6.
[20] Omitting repetition; as above.

§ 16. And the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Come now, mendicant brothers, let me instruct you. Perishable[1] by nature is individuality (*vaya-dhammā saṃkhārā*);[2] labour[3] diligently[4] (*appamādena sampādetha*). Not long hence the death[5] of the Follower (*Tathāgatassa*)[6] will take place; at the end of three months[7] from now the Follower will die.' Thus said the Blessed One; and the Well-farer (*Sugato*)[8] having said this the Teacher (*Satthā*)[9] said further this [in verse]:[10]

'My age is more than ripe; life [left] to me is little.
Quitting you I shall go finding in myself[11] a refuge.[12]
Be ye diligent, mindful,[13] dutiful,[14] O mendicant brothers;
Fix your own mind in firm resolve.[15]
Who in this discipline shall diligently abide,
Quitting the revolution of [individual] life (*jāti-saṃsāraṃ*),[16] shall make an end of sorrow.'[17]

§ 17. [Pt. iv. 1.] Then the Blessed One in the forenoon[18] having dressed and assumed his outer-robe and alms-bowl entered Vesāli for alms. . . . After his meal having returned from his begging-round, he took leave of Vesāli[19] [turning round and] gazing as an elephant [at the city],[20] and instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'This will be the Follower's[21] last sight of Vesāli, Ānanda. Let us go . . . to Bhaṇḍagāma.'[22] . . . Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Bhaṇḍagāma; and there at Bhaṇḍagāma the Blessed One stayed. [2] And there the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Through not under-

[1] Ch. 22 *b* § 25. Cp. Ch. 4 § 18 [3]; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [5] (*nāparaṃ itthattāya*); Ap. E *a* i (*anicca*), Ap. G 1 *a* § 5 (*decay*) see Int. § 11 (*rebirth*). For the termination *dhamma* meaning 'by nature' see Ap. F 1 *c* (*jāti-dhamma*) n.

[2] Ap. E *a*. 'All component things must grow old', SBB, iii, p. 128.

[3] Strive to transcend selfhood; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1), *egoism*. Cp. Ap. E *c* ii (*self-training*); Ap. F 1 *c* (*Quest*).

[4] Int. § 38; also Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10]; Ap. C *b* § 11 (21).

[5] *Parinibbāna*; Ap. C *b*, *Note*; and Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42].

[6] See § 7 [25] above. [7] See § 12 [48] n above.

[8] Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]. [9] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8]. [10] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

[11] *Me . . . attano*; i.e. in my diligent endeavour to transcend selfhood; cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 13 (*self-reliant*). Whereas Buddha appears to have said 'Strive to transcend selfhood here', the verse-writer seems to imply 'Hope to escape selfhood hereafter', a more individualistic aim; cp. Ap. D *c* § 3 [15] n.

[12] *Saraṇa*; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]. Buddha here states that he takes refuge in himself; in § 8 [26] above he bids his followers to take refuge in themselves and to take refuge in the law, the two phrases apparently being equivalent since the law teaches the transcendence of the self by exertion. These may be formulas earlier than the ecclesiastical formula of the Three Refuges (Ap. H 1 § 6).

[13] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1].

[14] *Su-sīlā*. Duties were those of deed, of word, and of thought, and concerned others as well as the self; Ap. H 4 *a* (*Sīlas*).

[15] *Sankappa*, purpose, will; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*will*). Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10] (*resolute*).

[16] Ch. 4 § 17 (*jāti*); and Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*). The phrase may show the comparatively late date of the verses. [17] Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2].

[18] See § 9 [1] above. [19] Int. § 133. [20] Ch. 2 § 6 n.

[21] *Tathāgata*; see § 7 [25] above. [22] Int. § 147.

standing, through not penetrating four truths (*dhammānaṃ*),[1] mendicant brothers, thus this [our] long course (*addhānaṃ*)[2] of straying has been run,[3] mine and yours. What four? Through not understanding, through not penetrating noble duty (*ariyassa sīlassa*)[4] . . . noble self-transcendence (*samādhissa*)[5] . . . noble insight (*paññāya*)[6] . . . noble liberation (*vimuttiyā*).[7] . . . So, mendicant brothers, when noble duty is understood and penetrated, when noble self-transcendence is understood and penetrated, when noble insight is understood and penetrated, when noble liberation is understood and penetrated, the craving for individual-existence[8] is broken up; the conduit[9] of individual-existence is destroyed; there is not now individual-re-existence.'[10] [3] Thus said the Blessed One; and the Well-farer having said this the Teacher[11] said further this [in verse]:[12]

'Duty, self-transcendence, and insight, and liberation unsurpassed;
These things were understood by Gotama, the far-renowned.
So having fully learnt the Law he, the Enlightened, proclaimed it to the almsmen (*bhikkhunaṃ*):
Having made an end of sorrow the Teacher, the Clear-seeing, is at peace.'

§ 18. [4] And there also the Blessed One staying at Bhaṇḍagāma[13] delivered that same full religious discourse[14] to the mendicant brothers: 'Such is duty, such is self-transcendence, such is insight. . . .

19. [5] Then the Blessed One having stayed at Bhaṇḍagāma as long as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Let us go,

[1] These are not outwardly the four Noble Truths (see § 1 [2] n above), but analysis will show that the content is the same or almost so (see Ch. 20 § 8, *discourse*, and § 18 below). The discourse appears also in the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* (Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [2]).

[2] Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16] n.

[3] '*Sandhāvitaṃ saṃsaritaṃ*.' See Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1]; Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*). 'We have thus gone on faring, thus gone on running this long time, both you and I', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 1. Whilst these four truths are genuinely Buddhist the notion that belief in them saves the individual from rebirth is a gratuitous development of Buddha's doctrine of the transience of all individuals. (Ap. E *a* i).

[4] Ap. G 1 *b* § 3; Ap. H 4 *a*.

[5] Ap. F 2 *d*. 'Noble earnestness in meditation', SBE, iii, p. 131; 'the Ariyan concentration', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 1.

[6] Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ap. F 2 *a* (132).

[7] Ap. D *a* § 6; also Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7], where the list is further extended.

[8] Ap. D *a* § 1 (*bhava-taṇhā*).

[9] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2]. If *netti* could be rendered as 'container' or 'boundary' of the ego it would express Gotama's teaching; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73].

[10] Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [2]; and Ch. 4 § 16. This if rendered as 'there is not now further selfhood', would accord with Gotama's teaching; Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] (*inferior*) n. 'There is now no more again of becoming', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 2.

[11] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].

[12] The verses scattered through many of the Suttas seem to be parts of old ballads, which it would be interesting to piece together again (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*).

[13] Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [1].

[14] Ch. 20 § 8. The three points of this discourse are the first three of the four Truths set forth in § 17 [2] above. They epitomize the First Sermon, *paññā* covering the first three Truths, and *sīla* and *samādhi* the Eightfold Path; Ap. G 1 *a* (i), *Truths*.

Ānanda; we will move on to Hatthigāma[1] . . . then to Ambagāma[2] . . . then to Jambugāma[3] . . . then to Bhoganagara.'[4] [6] 'Be it so, revered sir,' said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One. . . . [7] At Bhoganagara the Blessed One stayed at the Ānanda shrine (*Ānande cetiye*).[5] And there the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'These four great indications (*mah-āpadese*),[6] mendicant brothers, will I set forth; listen then, attend well, and I will speak.' 'Be it so, revered sir,' said the mendicant brothers in assent to the Blessed One. [8] 'Here, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu may say: "This, friends, was heard by me from the mouth of the Blessed One, taken from his mouth. This is the Law, this [accords with] the discipline, this is the doctrine of the Teacher." The word of this Bhikkhu must be neither [unduly] welcomed nor scorned. Without [undue] welcome and without scorn those words [syllable] by syllable having been thoroughly examined must be collated with [the Teacher's] discourse (*Sutte*)[7] and compared with the discipline (*Vinaye*). . . .[8] If these [words] when collated with the discourse and compared with the discipline conform with the discourse and harmonize with the discipline, the deduction must be reached—truly this is rightly accepted by that Bhikkhu as an utterance of the Blessed One.[9] Take this, mendicant brothers, as the first great indication. [9] Then here a Bhikkhu may say thus: "In a certain abode a community dwells with elders and a head. It was heard by me from the mouths of that community, taken from their mouths: 'This is the Law, this [accords with] the discipline, this is the doctrine of the Teacher.' ". . . Take this as the second great indication. [10] Then here a Bhikkhu may say thus: "In a certain abode many elder Bhikkhus dwell, very learned, acquainted with the Traditions, preserving the Law, preserving the Discipline, preserving the Digests.[10] It was heard by me from the mouths of those elders, taken from their mouths: 'This is the Law, this [accords with] the discipline, this is the doctrine of the Teacher'. " . . . Take this as the third great indication. [11] Then here a Bhikkhu may say thus: "In a certain abode an elder Bhikkhu dwells, very learned, acquainted with the Traditions, preserving the Law, preserving the Discipline, preserving the Digests. It was heard by me from the mouth of that elder, taken from his mouth: 'This is the Law, this [accords with] the discipline, this is the doctrine of the Teacher'. " . . . These words must be collated with

[1] Ch. 12 *e* § 2.
[2] Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 n.
[3] Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 n.
[4] Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *e* § 3; Ch. 22 *a* § 1 [13].
[5] Int. § 134. *Ang. Nik.*, ii, p. 167, reads *Ānanda-cetiye*.
[6] Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [1]; and IN 6 (*Canon*). The discourse appears also in the Fours of *Ang. Nik.* (ii, p. 167). 'Great authorities', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 174.
[7] Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*.
[8] Omitting negative cases.
[9] See Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2].
[10] Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [6]. 'The Summaries', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 176. The late date is evident; IN 6 (*Canon*).

[the Teacher's] discourse and compared with the discipline. . . . Take this as the fourth great indication. Take these, mendicant brothers, as the four great indications.'

§ 20. [12] And there also the Blessed One staying at Bhoganagara at the Ānanda shrine[1] delivered that same full religious discourse[2] to the mendicant brothers: 'Such is duty, such is self-transcendence, such is insight. . . .'

[1] The shrine doubtless was near or within the township; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 6 [263] n.
[2] Ch. 20 § 8.

CHAPTER 22

THE LAST TOUR: IN THE MALLAN[1] COUNTRY

Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16 (*Mahā-parinibbāna-suttanta*);[2] *the Narrative of the Great Decease. Parts iv, 13–vi.*

a. THE LAST DAYS

§ 1. [Pt. iv. 13.] The Blessed One having stayed at Bhoganagara[3] as long as he wished instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Let us go . . . to Pāvā'.[4] . . . Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went on to Pāvā. And there at Pāvā the Blessed One stayed in the mango-grove (*ambavane*) of Cunda[5] the metal-worker.[6] [14] And Cunda the metal-worker heard that the Blessed One having arrived at Pāvā was staying at Pāvā in his mango-grove.[7] Then Cunda went to where the Blessed One was and having drawn near he exchanged greetings[8] with the Blessed One and seated himself at one side, and when he was so seated the Blessed One enlightened, informed, stirred, and gladdened him by discourse on the Law[9] (*dhammiyā kathāya*). [15] . . . Then Cunda spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'May the Blessed One, revered sir, consent to take with me a meal[10] to-morrow together with the mendicant-community.'[11] The Blessed One accepted by his silence. . . .[12]

§ 2. [18] Then the Blessed One in the forenoon[13] having dressed and assumed his outer-robe and alms-bowl went to the dwelling of Cunda the metal-worker. . . .[14] [19] And Cunda the metal-worker seated himself at one side, and the Blessed One having enlightened, informed, stirred, and gladdened him by discourse on the Law[15] rose from his seat and departed.

§ 3. [20] And after the Blessed One had eaten the meal[16] of Cunda the metal-worker a severe illness attacked him, a flux of blood;[17] the

[1] Int. § 158.
[2] Ch. 20.
[3] Ch. 21 § 19 [5]. The context suggests that this township may have been within the Mallan border (Int. § 148).
[4] Int. § 148 (i).
[5] Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1]; see § 9 [42] below.
[6] Int. § 189 (*manufactures*).
[7] Cp. Ch. 21 § 4 [14]; and Int. § 133.
[8] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].
[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 12; see below §§ 2 [19], 7 [36].
[10] Ch. 10 *a* § 7; Ch. 20 § 11 [29].
[11] *Bhikkhu-saṃgha*; perhaps the large assemblage or gathering of Bhikkhus rather than the settled community (Ch. 8 A).
[12] As in Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7] with necessary changes; but here mention of the fatal dish of *sūkara-maddava* is added (see § 4 below).
[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
[14] Omitting a speech which Buddha commences by saying that though he will eat the *sūkara-maddava* prepared (see § 4 below) his followers must not touch it, and that except a Tathāgata (Ch. 21 § 7 [25]) no one in the universe of spirits and men with Māra and Brahmā (Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28] n) could digest it. He then orders that the residue shall be buried in a pit. The object of the narrator apparently is to show that Buddha did not act in human ignorance.
[15] See § 1 [14] above.
[16] The word *bhatta* does not seem to imply any reference to the fatal *sūkara-maddava* (see § 4 below).
[17] Dysentery. Int. § 190 (*sickness*).

most painful sensations became like unto death. The Blessed One self-scrutinizing[1] and comprehending endured them patiently. Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Let us go . . . to Kusinārā.'[2] 'Be it so, revered sir,' said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One.

§ 4. 'When he had eaten Cunda's meal, the metal-smith's,' so have I heard,
'Firmly he bore the sickness and the pains like unto death.
After the meal the pains of sickness fell
Upon the Teacher from the "boars' delight" (*sūkara-maddavena*).[3]
Relieved from pain, the Blessed One declared
"Now will I go to Kusinārā town". '[4]

§ 5. [21] Then the Blessed One pausing on the journey came to the foot of a certain tree. When he had come there he instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Pray (*iṅgha*),[5] Ānanda, arrange my outer-wrap (*saṃghātiṃ*)[6] fourfold;[7] I am tired, Ānanda, and will sit down.'. . . [22] The Blessed One sat down on the seat arranged,[8] and the Blessed One when seated instructed the venerable Ānanda saying, 'Pray (*iṅgha*), Ānanda, fetch me water; I am thirsty, Ānanda, and would drink.' . . .[9] Bringing water in the alms-bowl he came back to where the Blessed One was . . . and the Blessed One drank.

§ 6. [26] Now at that time Pukkhusa[10] the Mallan (*Malla-putto*),[11] a disciple[12] of Āḷāra Kāḷāma,[13] was proceeding along the road[14] from

[1] Ch. 21 § 7 [23]. [2] Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [1].
[3] See above §§ 1 [15] n, 2 [18] n, 3 [20] n. Rhys Davids (SBB, iii, p. 137) gives reasons for considering this to be a bulbous root and translates the word as 'truffles'; the *Pāli Dict.* prefers 'soft boar's flesh'. The word is a compound and must therefore represent a single though complex idea. It can scarcely be the equivalent of a noun and an adjective, e.g. tender swine-flesh.
[4] To the original text of the MPS (PTS, *Dīgha-Nik.* ii, p. 128) there is a Pāli footnote to the effect that these verses (A 2 *a*, *Note*) are not found in the Sinhalese Book (*Sīhaḷa-potthake*; Int. § 21, *Ceylon*). From this it may be inferred that the verses—or at least the last lines including mention of the *sūkara-maddava*—were introduced later from a northern source. Buddhaghosha has a note (SBB, iii, p. 139) to the effect that the verses were made by the reciters at the time of the Council [*Saṅgīti*] by which possibly may be meant a Council (Ch. 22 *c*) which met at a date considerably removed from the founder's death. Ap. IN 6 (*Canon*).
[5] Literally, hasten. See §§ 7 [35], 8 [39] below; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 1 [1], 6 [10] and Int. § 190 (*address*). Cp. *handa*, Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101]. [6] Ch. 8 *j* § 3.
[7] Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354]. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*place*). [8] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
[9] Omitting a miracle (Int. § 94, iii) by which the stream Kakutthā (see § 8 [39] below), over which 500 carts (Int. § 189, *caravans*) had just passed, becomes at once clear and drinkable.
[10] The last convert but one (Ch. 10 *c*; Ch. 22 *b* § 20). He seems to have been the owner of the 500 carts or part of the caravan; see § 7 [35] below.
[11] Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2] (*Licchavi-putta*); and Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21].
[12] *Sāvaka*; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18). The term applies to schools other than Buddhist.
[13] Int. § 178. Pukkusa was like Gotama a clansman and so a Kshatriya (Int. § 185) or a householder (Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [3]). Admitting clansmen as disciples Āḷāra Kāḷāma can scarcely have been an orthodox Brāhman, though the *yoga* taught by him may have been monistic and Vedāntic (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*). But see Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24] (*texts*). [14] Ch. 5 *a* § 4.

Kusinārā to Pāvā;[1] and Pukkusa the Mallan saw the Blessed One sitting at the foot of the tree and having seen him he drew near to the Blessed One. . . . Seated at one side he spoke thus to the Blessed One: ' 'Tis wonderful (*acchariyaṃ*), revered sir, 'tis strange,[2] revered sir, how those who have gone forth[3] [from the world] dwell in calm abstraction[4] (*vihārena*). . . .[5] [34] I here come, revered sir, for refuge to the Blessed One and to the Law and to the mendicant community; let the Blessed One receive me as a lay-disciple taking refuge from this day forth whilst life lasts.'[6]

§ 7. [35] Then Pukkusa the Mallan instructed a certain man [among his servants][7] saying: 'Prithee (*iṅgha*),[8] I say (*bhaṇe*),[9] fetch me a gold-coloured pair[10] [of outer-wraps][11] measured[12] ready to be worn.' And saying, 'Be it so, revered sir (*bhante*),'[13] in assent . . . the man fetched the pair [of wraps]. Then Pukkusa the Mallan presented the gold-coloured pair [of wraps] to the Blessed One saying: 'This gold-coloured pair [of wraps] measured ready to be worn, let the Blessed One, revered sir, accept them conferring a favour[14] (*anukampaṃ*) on me.' 'In one of them, Pukkusa,' he said, 'wrap me and Ānanda in the other.' And saying: 'Be it so, revered sir', in assent to the Blessed One Pukkusa the Mallan wrapped the Blessed One in the one and Ānanda in the other. [36] . . . Then Pukkusa the Mallan having been enlightened, informed, stirred, and gladdened by the Blessed One by discourse on the Law[15] rose from his seat, saluted the Blessed One, and so moving as to keep his right side[16] towards him departed.

§ 8. [37–8] . . .[17] [39] Then the Blessed One together with a great

[1] Ch. 13 *a* § 4. The road from Pāvā to Kusinārā evidently was short, running in a N. or NW. direction, and was intersected by the Kakutthā (see § 8 [39] below), a stream flowing W. or SW. into the curving river Hiranyavatī (Ch. 22 *b* § 1 [v. 1], [v. 1]), which also had to be crossed in order to reach Kusinārā.

[2] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

[3] Ch. 1 § 9.

[4] Rest or abiding. Cp. Ap. F 2 *b*; also Ap. I *a* (*Jhāna*).

[5] Omitting Pukkusa's description of Āḷāra Kāḷāma's power of abstraction; also Buddha's account of his own still greater capacity for concentration. The competitive language plainly is that of a zealous later follower (IN 6, *Canon*). Pukkusa acknowledges Buddha's greater powers. This is followed by the long formula commencing with '*Abhikkantaṃ, bhante, abhikkantaṃ*' customary in the canonical accounts of conversions (Ch. 6 *a* § 7).

[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [11]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6) [489].

[7] See § 6 [26] n above.

[8] See § 5 [21] above.

[9] Ch. 3 § 1.

[10] *Yuga*; Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [34]; and Ch. 22 *c* § 2 [13]; also Int. § 189 (*manufactures*). Cp. Ch. 13 *d* § 8 (*muslins*).

[11] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8] (*upper-wrap*); and Ch. 8 *j* § 3 [2] (*saṃghāti*). 'The third piece [or outer-wrap] . . . went twice round the legs, and then the rest of it was thrown over the left shoulder, and passed under the right arm across the body', SBB, iii, p. 145 n.

[12] Literally, as to measure.

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 10.

[14] Or, taking compassion; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1]; cp. Ap. F 1 *b* § 7; and Int. § 113 n.

[15] See § 1 [13] above.

[16] Ch. 6 *a* § 10.

[17] Omitting an account of how Ānanda placed both the robes upon Buddha and how the excessive brightness (Int. § 94, iii) of Buddha's body dimmed their golden colour; also verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) in which Buddha states that the body of a Tathāgata (Ch. 21 §§ 7 [25] n, 11 [12] n) assumes this radiance on two occasions, namely on the eve of his enlightenment (Ch. 4 § 2 n; cp. § 9 [42] below) and on the eve of his death. At the close Buddha foretells (Int. § 95) his death that night; Ch. 22 *b* § 10 [19].

assemblage of mendicant brothers went on towards the river Kakutthā[1] and having arrived . . . he immersed himself, bathed and drank, and having crossed over he went on to where there was a mango-grove (*Ambavanaṃ*).[2] Having arrived he instructed the venerable Cundaka[3] saying: 'Pray (*iṅgha*),[4] Cundaka, arrange my outer-wrap fourfold;[5] I am tired, Cundaka, and will lie down.' And saying: 'Be it so, revered sir', in assent to the Blessed One the venerable Cundaka arranged the outer-wrap fourfold. [40] Then the Blessed One lay down on his right side in the lion-posture[6] placing foot on foot, self-scrutinizing[7] and comprehending, giving attention and heed to [the time of] rising.[8] The venerable Cundaka then sat there in front of the Blessed One. [41] . . .[9]

§ 9. [42] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Now it may be, Ānanda, that someone may excite regret in Cunda[10] the metal-worker saying: "'Tis a detriment to thee, friend Cunda, 'tis a misfortune for thee, that the Leader[11] died after having eaten with thee his last alms-meal (*piṇḍa-pātaṃ*)."[12] The regret of Cunda the metal-worker must be removed thus, [by] saying: "'Tis a gain (*lābhā*) to thee, friend Cunda, 'tis good fortune[13] for thee, that the Leader died after having eaten with thee his last alms-meal. From the mouth[14] of the Blessed One, friend Cunda, was it heard by me, from his mouth this was received: These two alms-meals are equally fruitful, equal in effect (*samasama-vipākā*),[15] very much more fruitful[16] and more advantageous[17] (*mah-ānisaṃsatarā*) than other alms-meals. Which two? The alms-meal which a Tathāgata eats before attaining unsurpassed enlightenment,[18] and the alms-meal which a Tathāgata eats before he dies (*parinibbāyati*)[19] in that extinction[20] which leaves no substance remaining.[21] These two alms-meals are equally fruitful,

[1] See §§ 5 [22] n, 6 [26] n above. This stream probably flowed into the Rāptī (Hiraññavati) or into the Gandak near the junction of these two; Int. § 148 (i) n.

[2] The PTS text treats this as a place-name.

[3] The personal attendant for the time being. Ch. 10 *d* § 1, *20th year*, n; also Ch. 10 *c* (*disciples*).

[4] See § 5 [21] above.

[5] Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354].

[6] Ap. H 5 [93].

[7] Contemplating the relation of the self to the universe. Ch. 21 § 7 [23]; Ch. 22 *b* § 1.

[8] Or, pondering for a while.

[9] Omitting verses to the same effect (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). The incident appears to have been detached from another narrative (IN 6, *Canon*).

[10] See § 1 above.

[11] *Tathāgata*; Ch. 21 § 7 [25].

[12] Literally, scraps or scrap-meal; Ch. 11 *c* § 7 [7] (*begging-round*). Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1).

[13] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 19.

[14] Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [2].

[15] Literally, equal in ripening. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (1) [23], [32].

[16] Not necessarily in better prospects either in the next world or in a succession of future births. Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [16].

[17] Or, blessed; Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2].

[18] Cp. § 8 [37] n above; Ch. 4 § 1 n; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8].

[19] Or, is extinguished. Ch. 21 § 16.

[20] *Nibbāna-dhātu*, state of extinction. Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8]. Cp. Ap. C *b*.

[21] *An-upādi-sesa*; perhaps 'leaving no substance [for rebirth] remaining', but this rendering commits the passage to a doctrine which was introduced only at a comparatively late date; Ap. B *a*, *Note* (*self*). Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*remains*). 'In which nothing whatever remains behind', SBB, iii, p. 148.

equal in effect, very much more fruitful and more advantageous than other alms-meals. . . ."[1] Thus must the regret of Cunda the metal-worker be removed.' [43] Then indeed the Blessed One having viewed this matter (*attham*)[2] at that time breathed forth this cry (*udānam*):[3]

'In the giver[4] merit (*puññam*)[5] grows; in him who has control[6] of self no enmity (*veram*)[7] heaps up.
The good man casts off evil (*pāpakam*),[8] and when desire, hate, and delusion[9] are destroyed he is at peace (*nibbuto*).'[10]

b. The Great Decease; the Watches of the Night

(i)

§ 1. [Pt. v. 1.] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Let us go, Ānanda; we will move onward to the farther side of the river Hiraññavatī,[11] to the Kusinārā[12] Bend (*Kusinārā-Upavattanam*)[13] of the Mallans, the Sāl-tree Grove (*sāla-vanam*).'[14] 'Be it so, revered sir', said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One. Then the Blessed One together with a great assemblage of mendicant brothers went onward to the farther side of the river Hiraññavatī to the Kusinārā Bend of the Mallans, the Sāl-tree Grove. When he had come there he instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Pray (*iṅgha*),[15] Ānanda, arrange[16] for me the platform (*mañcakam*)[17] with its head to the north between the twin Sāl-trees; I am tired,

[1] Omitting a passage which states that Cunda has accumulated *kamma* (Ap. B *a*, and Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; cp. *puñña* [43] below) conducing to long life, happiness, heaven (*sagga*; Ap. C *a* § 2, verse 126; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8] n), and dominion, and other rewards which appeal to individualistic motives and suggest doubts as to the early date of the whole passage (IN 6, *Canon*). Cunda is styled here Venerable (*āyasmā*; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]), thus receiving a rank to which a later age may have promoted him.

[2] Ch. 8 *b* § 1.

[3] Ch. 2 § 2 (*udāna*); Ch. 4 § 10. The Udāna series seems only slightly connected with this occasion.

[4] Ap. F 1 *a*.

[5] Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]. Cp. [42] n (*kamma*) above.

[6] Verb *samyamati*; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (6). Cp. *Dhp*. 380; also Ap. D *a* § 4 (103); and Ap. F 2 *a* (126).

[7] Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5).

[8] Ap. D (*Evil*). The context shows that the bases of evil are greed and self-centredness.

[9] These are the three fires; Ap. D *a* § 10.

[10] Ch. 2 § 2.

[11] Ch. 13 *a* § 8 [1] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n.

[12] Int. §§ 136, 148 (i).

[13] Ch. 13 *a* § 8 [1]; see below, §§ 11 [21], 13 [24]. 'The Sāla Grove of the Mallas, the Upavattana of Kuṣinārā', SBB, iii, p. 149. Cp. Ch. 1 § 2 (*Mahā-sāla*). As Gotama was born among Sāl-trees in the open (Ch. 1 § 5 [52]) so he died surrounded by these noble trees; Int. § 136 (*Mahā-vana*).

[14] In apposition to Upavattanam. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 9 (*deer-park*); Ch. 11 *c* § 6 (*Kalandaka-nivāpa*).

[15] Ch. 22 *a* § 5 [21].

[16] Or, prepare. The verb is *paññapeti*; from it is derived the p.p. *paññatta* so frequently used in describing the seat arranged, prepared, or appointed for Gotama or indicated to him; Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[17] Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [2]. A *mañcaka* was ordinarily a small low wooden platform or perhaps a charpoy, but the Commentary (Int. § 15) explains that here it was a permanent platform used for ceremonial purposes (SBB, iii, p. 149 n). The 'twin Sāl-trees' apparently formed an avenue and the platform may have been at the western extremity, thus allowing the occupant to face east along a natural hall.

Ānanda, and will lie down.' And saying: 'Be it so, revered sir', in assent to the Blessed One the venerable Ānanda prepared the platform with its head to the north between the twin Sāl-trees. Then the Blessed One lay down on his right side in the lion-posture[1] placing foot on foot, self-scrutinizing[2] and comprehending.

§ 2. [2] . . .[3] [3] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: '. . .[4] It is not, Ānanda, in such wise[5] that the Follower[6] is respected[7] or regarded or kept in mind or honoured, or exalted. But that mendicant brother or mendicant sister or layman (*upāsako*)[8] or lay-woman who has attained the Law and the spirit of the Law[9] (*dhamm-ānudhamma paṭipanno*)[10] and dwells therein, having attained the right course (*samīci-paṭipanno*),[11] walking according to the spirit[12] of the Law (*anudhamma-cārī*)—that [disciple] respects, regards, keeps in mind, honours the Follower with the highest honour (*pūjāya*).[13] Therefore in this regard,[14] Ānanda, thus should ye train[15] yourselves: "Having attained the Law and the spirit of the Law we will dwell therein, having attained the right course, walking according to the spirit of the Law." '

§ 3. [4–6] Now at that time the venerable Upavāna[16] was standing in front of the Blessed One fanning[17] him. And the Blessed One did not need[18] the venerable Upavāna and said: 'Withdraw, mendicant brother; stand not before me.' . . .[19]

§ 4. [7] [The venerable Ānanda said] 'Formerly, revered sir, mendicant brothers having spent the rainy season[20] in the districts (*disāsu*)[21]

[1] Ap. H 5 [93]. [2] Ch. 22 *a* § 8.

[3] Omitting an account of marvels (Int. § 94, ii) in honour of the Tathāgata (Ch. 21 § 7 [25])—the flowering of the Sāl-trees which scatter their blossoms on the dying Sage, showers of heavenly *mandārava* flowers (Int. § 94, i; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 n) and of powdered sandal-wood (Ch. 13 *d* § 8), to the accompaniment of heavenly music (Ap. D *c* § 4, *Gandhabba*). See [3] below. [4] As in [2] above.

[5] i.e. by external display. The narrator connects the phrase with the preceding marvels and perhaps has become conscious that accounts of miracles (Int. § 94) though intended to increase the glory of the scene cannot add to the dignity of the great Teacher. [6] Ch. 21 § 7 [25].

[7] Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2]. [8] Ch. 8 *l*; see § 16, *degree*, n.

[9] Meaning of the Law, harmony with the Law, or the corollaries of the Law. '(All the greater and) the lesser duties', SBB, iii, p. 150. Compare 'outer' and 'inner' doctrine (Ch. 21 § 7 [25]).

[10] Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (20). *Anu-dhamma*; cp. *dhamma* (Ap. G 1 *b*), and *abhi-dhamma* (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*). [11] Ap. H 1 § 6 [7]. From *sammā*; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[12] 'Precepts', SBB, iii.

[13] See below §§ 6 [10], 9 [17]. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 ii (*rites*).

[14] Ch. 21 § 14; and Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3]. [15] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1].

[16] Ch. 13 *c* § 24 n; and Ch. 10 *c* (*Disciples*). Also *Dīgha-Nik.* iii, p. 141; *Saṃ. Nik.* i, pp. 174–5, ii, pp. 41–2, iv, pp. 41–3, v, p. 76; *Aṅg. Nik.* ii, p. 163, iii, p. 195; *Brethren*, p. 140. [17] Int. § 190.

[18] 'Was not pleased with', SBB, iii, p. 151.

[19] Omitting Ānanda's inquiry why Buddha is displeased with Upavāna after so many years of service; also Buddha's reply that the gods of 'the ten world-systems' (Int. §§ 70, 93, vi) in great numbers desire to see him and are crowding every spot even as small as the tip of a hair (*Gradual Sayings*, i, p. 60), and that Upavāna stood in their way. The text of [6] is repeated in § 28 [11] below.

[20] Ch. 8 *c*.

[21] Or, different regions. Cp. Ch. 10 § 3 (*quarters*).

came to see the Tathāgata;[1] we took those thoughtful[2] mendicant brothers to see him, we took them to attend upon him. But, revered sir, on the passing away of the Blessed One we shall not be able to take thoughtful mendicant brothers to see him, we shall not be able to take them to attend upon him.' [8] 'These four places,[3] Ānanda, for the clansman[4] who has faith (*saddhassa*)[5] are worthy to be seen, worthy to be revered.[6] Which four? The place where it is said, "Here the Tathāgata was born."[7] . . . The place where it is said, "Here the Tathāgata was enlightened with supreme and full enlightenment."[8] . . . The place where it is said, "Here the supreme wheel of the Law (*dhamma-cakkaṃ*)[9] was started[10] by the Tathāgata." . . . The place where it is said, "Here the Tathāgata died in that extinction[11] which leaves no substance remaining." . . . These four places, Ānanda, for the clansman who has faith are worthy to be seen, worthy to be revered. Mendicant brothers and sisters, lay-men[12] and women,[13] who have faith will come saying, "Here the Tathāgata was born", and "Here the Tathāgata was enlightened . . ." and "Here the Law was started . . ." and "Here the Tathāgata . . . died".' . . .[14]

§ 5. [9] [The venerable Ānanda said] 'In what way, revered sir, should we deal with womankind[15] (*mātu-gāme*)?' 'Not seeing them, Ānanda.' 'When seeing them happens, Blessed One (*Bhagavā*),[16] in what way must we deal with them?' 'No conversation, Ānanda.' 'But when there is conversation, revered sir, in what way must we deal with them?' 'When it happens, Ānanda, you must be careful.'

§ 6. [10] [The venerable Ānanda then said] 'In what way, revered sir, should we deal with the body of the Tathāgata?'[17] 'Busy not yourselves, Ānanda, about the honouring[18] of the body of the Tathāgata. Apply yourselves, I pray (*iṅgha*),[19] Ānanda, to the true good

[1] Ch. 21 § 7 [25].

[2] *Mano-bhāvanīya* means developed (or exercised) in mind; cp. Ch. 12 § 9 [2].

[3] This whole passage regarding Buddhist pilgrimages is found also in *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, ii, p. 120).

[4] *Kula-putta*; Int. § 159 n.

[5] Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180].

[6] 'To be looked upon . . . with feelings of emotion', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 124.

[7] This phrase is used twice in the short Rummindeī Pillar-edict (Ch. 13 *c* § 16) of the Emperor Asoka, but the title in the first instance is *Buddha* and in the second it is *Bhagavat*, not Tathāgata. The title Tathāgata (Ch. 21 § 7 [25]; Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*) is not found in the Asokan inscriptions.

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [28]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42].

[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 1. Cp. *cakka-vattin* (see § 6 [11] n below).

[10] Or, turned. 'Started' if the wheel be that of the Conqueror's chariot; 'turned' if it be the circle of the Teacher's thought.

[11] Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42].

[12] Ch. 8 *l*.

[13] See § 8 [15] below; Int. § 190 (*women*).

[14] Omitting a statement attributed to Buddha that the faithful who die on such pilgrimage (*cetiya-cārikaṃ*, shrine-visit; Ap. H 1 § 5; cp. Int. § 134) will proceed to happiness and heaven (*sagga*; Int. § 92; Ap. C *a* § 2, verse 126; Ap. H 1 § 5 (*shrine*); cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] n).

[15] Ch. 13 *c* § 12 [1]; and Int. § 190 (*women*).

[16] The word is rarely used in the vocative. Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9].

[17] Ch. 21 § 7 [25].

[18] Pūjā; see § 2 above.

[19] Ch. 22 *a* § 5 [21].

(*sad-atthe*);[1] attach yourselves to the true good; abide diligent,[2] strenuous,[3] resolute[4] for the true good. There are, Ānanda, wise Kshatriyas[5] and wise Brāhmans and wise householders[6] who have clear faith in the Tathāgata; they will do honour to the body of the Tathāgata.' [11–12] . . .[7]

§ 7. [13] Then the venerable Ānanda[8] having entered the lodge (*vihāraṃ*)[9] stood holding the door-bolt[10] and wept saying: 'And I indeed am a learner (*sekho*)[11] who has [much] to do;[12] and death is about to come upon my Teacher[13] who has been compassionate[14] to me.' Then the Blessed One commanded (*āmantesi*)[15] the mendicant brothers saying: 'Where now, mendicant brothers, is Ānanda?' 'The venerable Ānanda here, revered sir, has entered the lodge and stands holding the door-bolt weeping. . . .'[16] And the Blessed One commanded a certain mendicant brother saying, 'Go thou, Bhikkhu; speaking for me command Ānanda saying, "The Teacher, friend (*āvuso*)[17] Ānanda, commands thee".' And saying, 'Be it so, revered sir', in assent to the Blessed One, the mendicant brother went to where the venerable Ānanda was and having drawn near spoke to the venerable Ānanda thus: 'The Teacher, friend Ānanda, commands thee.' And saying, 'Be it so, friend', in assent to the mendicant brother

[1] Or, to the real aim; Ap. C *b* § 10 [1] (*the real*), and Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]. '(Be zealous) in your own behalf', and '(devote yourselves) to your own good', SBB, iii, p. 154; and similarly explained by Buddhaghosha (see *Pāli Dict.*, s.v.). The true good or quest is liberation (Ap. D *a* § 6; cp. *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 4) or self-extinction (Ap. F 1 *c* [162], *nibbāna*) in this life, not self-advancement in a system of rebirths or out of it (Ap. D *c*, *Stages*). A distinction, however fine, is made in *Dhammapada* 166 between *attad-attha* (own good) and *sad-attha* (true good). Cp. Ap. G 1 *b*.

[2] *Appamattā*; Ch. 21 § 16.

[3] *Ātāpino*; Ch. 21 § 3 [12]. Cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [5] (*labour*).

[4] *Pahit-attā*; literally, with mind fixed. See § 20 below. Cp. Ch. 21 § 16 (*resolve*), and Ap. F 2 *a* (152).

[5] *Khattiya-paṇḍitā*; Int. § 185.

[6] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21]; see § 9 [17] below.

[7] Omitting a long passage which, though in direct opposition (IN 6, *Canon*) to what immediately precedes, is attributed to Buddha and which states in [11] that the body of the Tathāgata should receive the same burial as the body of an overlord or emperor (*raññо cakka-vattissa*; see § 8 [16] below; Ch. 1 § 2 [49]; Ch. 14 *c* § 3; and Int. § 162; cp. § 4 [8] n above) adding that a Tathāgata should be honoured with a tumulus (*thūpa*; Int. §§ 22, 190, *burial*); cp. Int. § 13 (*cetiya*) at the cross-roads. This speech is repeated in MPS, vi. 17 (Ch. 22 *c* § 5), where it is attributed more appropriately to Ānanda; the speech proceeds in [12] to state that four kinds of persons are worthy of tumuli, namely a Tathāgata, a solitary Buddha (Ch. 1 § 2 [49]), a Tathāgata's disciple, and an emperor, since the hearts of the faithful are tranquillized on perceiving their memorials. This passage is found also in the Fours of *Ang. Nik.* (ii, p. 245).

[8] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].

[9] There has been no previous mention of a monastery, and unless this passage has been removed from its original context the *vihāra* here must be a temporary lodge. Ch. 15 *a* §§ 8 [248], 13 [158]; Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [3]. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] (*lodge*).

[10] *Kapisīsa*; explained as a wooden bolt (*aggala*) at the top of a door-post by Buddhaghosha (SBE, xi, p. 95 n). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 30 [119].

[11] Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3]; and Ch. 23 *b* § 4.

[12] i.e. to learn. 'One who has yet to work out his own perfection', SBB, iii, p. 158. Ānanda's modest consciousness that he was not rid of selfhood has endeared him to many, as well as his unstinted service.

[13] *Satthar*; Ch. 5 *b* § 2.

[14] *Anukampaka*; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14].

[15] Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1].

[16] Omitting repetition.

[17] Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 8 *g* § 3 [2] (*address*).

the venerable Ānanda went to where the Blessed One was and having drawn near he saluted the Blessed One and sat down at one side. [14] Then to the venerable Ānanda seated at one side the Blessed One spoke thus: 'Enough, Ānanda; mourn not, lament not. Has it not been announced by me ere this[1] that there is in all, even the beloved and kindly, the principle of change, of separation, of transience?[2] And how in this case, Ānanda, is it possible that what is born, produced, compounded, dissolvable[3] by nature—that this indeed should not be dissolved? This state is not to be found. For a long time, Ānanda, has the Follower[4] been attended[5] by thee with loving-kindness (*mettena*)[6] in deed[7] (*kaya-kammena*) . . . with loving-kindness in word . . .[8] with loving-kindness in thought, steadfast, happy, undivided, unmeasured. Thou hast well merited,[9] Ānanda; undertake the effort (*padhānaṃ*);[10] soon shalt thou be without taint.'[11]

§ 8. [15] Then the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying . . .[12] 'Ānanda, Bhikkhus, is wise and knows that "This is the time (*kālo*) suitable for mendicant brothers to come to see the Tathāgata;[13] this is the time suitable for mendicant sisters; this is the time suitable for laymen;[14] this is the time suitable for lay-women;[15] this is the time suitable for a ruler[16] (*rañño*), for the ruler's chief-ministers,[17] for sectaries (*titthiyānaṃ*),[18] for the sectaries' disciples." '[19] [16] . . .[20]

§ 9. [17] On this being said the venerable Ānanda spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Let not, revered sir, the Blessed One die in this mud-walled[21] little city,[22] an uncultured[23] little city, a remote[24] little city. There are verily, revered sir, other [and] great cities,[25] namely

[1] See Ch. 13 *a* § 4; Ch. 21 § 12 [48]. The formula s abbreviated in §§ 27 [10], 28 [11] below.
[2] Cp. Ch. 4 § 18 [1] (*aniccā*).
[3] Ap. E *a* i (*Anicca*); cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 6 [10] n; also Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6] (*break up*); and Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [4] (*subject to death*).
[4] Ch. 21 § 7 [25].
[5] *Pacc-upaṭṭhita*; cp. Ap. A 2 *b* (68).
[6] Ch. 9 *b* § 9 [33].
[7] Ap. B *b*, *Note*.
[8] Omitting repetition.
[9] Literally, hast done what merits well. Cp. Ap. B *a* § 6 [9].
[10] Ch. 21 § 15 (2).
[11] *An-āsava*; Ap. C *a* § 1 (94); and Ap. D *a* § 7.
[12] Omitting a statement that all previous Buddhas (Ap. A 2 *c*) have had such devoted attendants as Ānanda.
[13] Ch. 21 § 7 [25].
[14] Ch. 8 *l*.
[15] See § 4 [8] above.
[16] Or, Rāja; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*].
[17] *Rāja-mahāmattā*; Int. § 172.
[18] Int. § 179 (*Six*); Ch. 9 *c*; cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [524] n.
[19] *Titthiya-sāvakā*; cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7].
[20] Omitting an enumeration of four wonderful qualities attributed to Ānanda by Buddha, namely those of pleasing assemblages of the four classes of the faithful; cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 5 [1]. The speech adds that an emperor (*rājā-cakkavattī*; see § 6 [10] n above) has four similar qualities. The last remark may date the passage (IN 6, *Canon*). The whole passage appears also in Suttas 129–30 of the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, ii, pp. 132–3).
[21] *Kuḍḍa*; 'wattle-and-daub', SBB, iii, p. 161. The word means 'crushed', and thence a plastered wall; Ch. 10 *a* § 2 [92], and Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]. Cp. Int. § 175. This passage is found also at the opening of *Dīgha* 17 (SBB, iii, p. 199).
[22] *Nagaraka*; cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4); also § 11 [20] below.
[23] *Uj-jaṅgala*; quite wild.
[24] *Sākha*; branch, outlying part.
[25] The omission of Vesāli from this list seems remarkable and may indicate that Vesāli had ceased to be a great city by the time when this passage was composed. Int. § 167; cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 6 (*Ajātasattu*).

Campā,[1] Rājagaha,[2] Sāvatthi,[3] Sāketa,[4] Kosambi,[5] Bārānasi;[6] there let the Blessed One die. In them there are many Kshatriyas[7] with great halls, Brāhmans with great halls,[8] householders[9] with great halls, who have clear faith in the Tathāgata.[10] These will do honour[11] to the body of the Tathāgata.' 'Speak not so, Ānanda; speak not so, Ānanda, saying "a mud-walled little city, an uncultured little city, a remote little city".' [18] . . .[12]

§ 10. [19] 'Go thou, Ānanda,' he said, 'enter Kusinārā[13] and announce to the Kusināran Mallans:[14] "This day, Vāseṭṭhas,[15] in the last watch[16] (*yāme*) of the night, the death[17] of the Tathāgata[18] will come. . . ." '[19] 'Be it so, revered sir', said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One, and having dressed, with bowl and formal garb,[20] in company with another (*atta-dutiyo*)[21] he entered Kusinārā.[22]

§ 11. [20] Now at that time the Kusināran Mallans were met together in the council-hall (*santh-āgāre*)[23] on some business.[24] And the venerable Ānanda went to where the council-hall of the Kusināran Mallans was and having arrived announced to them: 'This day, Vāseṭṭhas, in the last watch of the night the death of the Tathāgata will befall. Hear,[25] O Vāseṭṭhas, hear, O Vāseṭṭhas. Be not hereafter full of regret saying: "Verily in our village-neighbourhood (*gāma-khette*)[26] the death of the Tathāgata befell and we did not gain [per-

[1] Int. § 146. [2] Int. § 125. [3] Int. § 138.
[4] Int. § 149 *b*. [5] Int. § 143. [6] Int. § 151.
[7] Int. § 185.
[8] Or, with many followers; *mahā-sālā*. Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 5 [3], 6 [2]. Cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 5 [160] (*hall*). [9] See § 6 [10] above.
[10] Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. [11] *Pūjā*; see § 2 above.
[12] Omitting a statement that the city was once the capital of a monarch of the four points (*cakkavatī cātur-anto*; Ch. 1 § 2) called Mahā-Sudassana, owner of the seven treasures (Ap. A 2 *a*, 4), and it then resembled Āḷakamandā, the royal city of the gods (IN 8 *a*). The passage has the appearance of being a monkish invention to enhance the splendour of the great Teacher's death (IN 6, *Canon*). It occurs also in the *Mahā-Sudassana-S.* (*Dīgha-Nik.* ii, pp. 169–70).
[13] The incident of Ānanda's visit to Kusinārā and of the presentation of the Mallans to the dying Teacher is episodical. [14] Int. § 148 (i).
[15] Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4]; Ch. 22 *c* § 1 [12]. This is also a Brāhman name (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]). It has been suggested that Kshatriya clans derived their names from Brāhman teachers. It seems more probable that Brāhmans occasionally drew their names from the ruling families whose ceremonial rites they directed.
[16] Ch. 4 § 4 [75].
[17] *Pari-nibbāna*; 'the final passing away', SBB, iii, p. 163. See Ch. 22 *a* § 8 [37] n.
[18] Ch. 21 § 7 [25].
[19] Omitting phrases which are attributed more appropriately to Ānanda in [20] below.
[20] Wearing a lower garment and an upper garment as for indoors and taking for outdoor use an outer-robe and beggar's bowl; Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].
[21] Literally, himself the second. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2] (*associate*); Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9] (*attendant*). [22] See Ap. H 3 *a* § 3; also Ch. 22 *c* § 1 n.
[23] Int. § 171; Ap. H 3 *a* § 3. The Mallans of Pāvā also had their council-hall; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [2].
[24] The same phrase is used for ordinary commercial business; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [1]; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [1].
[25] *Abhi-kkhamatha*; literally, Be kind. Cp. Latin *favete* (*linguis*). This speech is attributed also to Buddha in [19] above.
[26] Ch. 22 *c* § 10; Ch. 23 *a* [9] n. Cp. § 9 [17] above.

mission] for the last time to see the Tathāgata".' [21] Having heard this [speech] of the venerable Ānanda the Mallans and their sons[1] and their daughters-in-law and their wives[2] were grieved, dejected, with hearts given over to sorrow. Many wailed disordering their hair, wailed stretching out their arms, fell prone, rocked themselves backwards and forwards[3] saying: 'Very soon will the Wellfarer (*Sugato*)[4] die; very soon will the light (*cakkhuṃ*)[5] in the world disappear.'[6] And then the Mallans and their sons and their daughters-in-law and their wives, grieved, dejected, with hearts given over to sorrow, went to the Bend (*Upavattanaṃ*)[7] of the Mallans, the Sāl-tree Grove, where the venerable Ānanda was.

§ 12. [22] . . .[8] Then the venerable Ānanda having caused the Kusināran Mallans to stand in groups family by family[9] presented[10] (*bandapesi*) them saying: 'Such and such a Mallan, revered sir, with his children, with his wife,[11] with his retainers[12] (*sa-pariso*), with his friends,[13] salutes[14] (*vandati*) the feet[15] of the Blessed One with his fore-head.' And the venerable Ānanda in this manner within the first watch[16] presented the Kusināran Mallans to the Blessed One.

(iii)

§ 13. [23] Now at that time a Wanderer (*paribbājako*)[17] named Subhadda[18] was dwelling at Kusinārā. And Subhadda the Wanderer heard [people] say, 'This very day in the last watch of the night the death of the devotee (*samaṇassa*) Gotama[19] will befall.' Then this [thought] came to Subhadda the Wanderer: 'Now indeed I have heard Wanderers, old men of great age, instructors of teachers,[20]

[1] *Malla-puttā*; the termination sometimes as here implies youth, sometimes simply race or descent (cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26]) or sect (Ch. 3 § 5 [165] n).

[2] *Malla-pajāpatiyo*; Int. § 190 (*women*). The last position implies no disrespect; cp. Ch. 2 § 5 (*mother*), and § 12 [22] below.

[3] These vehement expressions are stock phrases; they are applied to mourning spirits (MPS, v. 6) and to Bhikkhus (MPS, vi. 19) among others. See § 27 [10] below; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 n.

[4] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].

[5] Or, Seer; literally, eye. 'Light of the world', SBB, iii, p. 152, p. 163. Cp. *cakkhumant* (MPS, vi. 28; see § 28 below); and *dibba-cakkhu* (Ap. B *c* § 1).

[6] Be covered or closed; literally, be drawn within. Cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 6 n.

[7] See § 1 [1] above; Ch. 22 *c* § 2 [13].

[8] Omitting Ānanda's reflection that if he presented them singly the time taken would be too long, and phrases repeated immediately below.

[9] *Kula*; Ap. F 2 *a* (134). Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1].

[10] Literally, caused them to offer their salutations. Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (i).

[11] *Sa-bhariya*; cp. § 11 [21] above.

[12] With associates; or, with an assemblage (of supporters). Cp. Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21].

[13] Or, kinsmen; Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5].

[14] Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3].

[15] Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [17].

[16] Ch. 4 § 4 [75].

[17] Ch. 11 *c* § 9.

[18] Int. § 54. His story appears in *Apadāna* 49 (PTS, p. 100). Tradition holds that this was not the Subhadda mentioned in MPS, vi. 20 (Ch. 22 *c* § 6 n) and Cullavagga, XI. i. 1. Another Subhadda died at Nādika (Ap. B *a* § 6 [6]—The episode of the last convert brings the Teacher's active life to a close, with one more watch of the night left.

[19] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].

[20] *Ācariya-pācariyā*, teachers over teachers; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14]. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* (*director*).

saying this: "At times though rarely there arise in the world Tathāgatas,[1] saints supremely enlightened." Now this day in the last watch of the night the death of the devotee Gotama will befall. A state of doubt indeed has arisen in me; I have to this extent faith in the devotee Gotama—the devotee Gotama may be able to show me the truth[2] so far that I may cast off this state of doubt.' [24] Then Subhadda the Wanderer went to the Bend[3] of the Mallans, the Sāl-tree Grove, where the venerable Ānanda was, and having arrived he spoke to the venerable Ānanda thus: '. . .[4] Would indeed, O (*bho*)[5] Ānanda, that I might receive [permission] to see the devotee Gotama.' On this being said the venerable Ānanda spoke to Subhadda the Wanderer thus: 'Enough, friend[6] Subhadda, do not disturb the Tathāgata, the Blessed One is tired.' . . .[7]

§ 14. [25] Now the Blessed One heard this conversation of the venerable Ānanda with Subhadda the Wanderer; and the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Enough, Ānanda, do not hinder Subhadda; let Subhadda receive [permission] to see the Tathāgata. Whatever Subhadda will ask me he will ask being desirous of knowledge not desirous of troubling me; and whatever I being asked shall expound (*vyākarissāmi*) to him, he will quickly comprehend it.' Then the venerable Ānanda spoke to Subhadda the Wanderer thus: 'Come, friend Subhadda; the Blessed One gives thee permission.'

§ 15. [26] And Subhadda the Wanderer went to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near he exchanged courtesies (*sammodi*) with the Blessed One and having gone through the current phrases[8] of courtesy seated himself at one side, and when he was so seated Subhadda the Wanderer spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Those religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*),[9] O (*bho*)[10] Gotama, [heads] of Orders (*saṃghino*),[11] [heads] of companies[12] (*gaṇino*), instructors[13] of companies, well-known, renowned, founders of sects,[14] well thought of by the multitude, namely Pūrana Kassapa,[15] Makkhali Gosāla, Ajita Kesakambalin, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya[16] Belaṭṭhiputta, the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta[17]—have all these in accordance with their own

[1] Ch. 21 § 7 [25]; Ap. A 2 *c*; cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [2] (*Buddha*).

[2] *Dhamma* is used in a general sense; Part I (title) n; Ch. 5 *a* § 10; see § 15 [26] below. Cp. Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.

[3] See § 1 [1] above.

[4] Omitting repetition of his reflections as in [23] above.

[5] Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].

[6] Ch. 3 § 5 [163].

[7] Subhadda twice repeats and Ānanda twice refuses the request.

[8] Ch. 12 *c* § 3 [237].

[9] Ap. A 2 *d* [21]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [29]. It is to be noticed that the teachers mentioned below were not Brāhmans by caste. Int. § 185 n. The term here includes philosophic sectaries but not orthodox ritualistic Brāhmans.

[10] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).

[11] Ch. 8 A (*saṃgha*).

[12] Ch. 3 § 5 [165].

[13] *Gaṇ-ācariyā*; Ch. 8 *g* (*ācariya*).

[14] *Tittha-karā*; Int. § 179 (*Six*); Ch. 9 *c* (*Titthiyas*). All these epithets appear also in the *Kosala-saṃyutta, Sutta 1* (Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]), together with the six names, though the latter are there placed in a different order.

[15] Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17].

[16] Int. § 182.

[17] Int. § 184.

claim had full knowledge [of the truth] or have none had full knowledge; have some had full knowledge while some have not had full knowledge?' 'Enough, Subhadda. Let this wait—whether all these have in accordance with their own claim had full knowledge or none of them have had full knowledge, or some have had full knowledge while some have not had full knowledge. I will show thee the truth[1] (*dhammaṃ*), Subhadda. Then hearken well, give attention; I will speak.' 'Be it so, revered sir', said Subhadda the Wanderer in assent to the Blessed One.

§ 16. The Blessed One spoke thus: [27] 'In whatever system[2] and discipline[3] (*dhamma-vinaye*), Subhadda, the noble Eightfold Path[4] is not found, therein also the devotee [at peace][5] is not found. (Therein also the devotee second [in degree][6] is not found, therein also the devotee third [in degree] is not found, therein also the devotee fourth [in degree][7] is not found.) And in whatever system and discipline, Subhadda, the noble Eightfold Path is found, therein also the devotee [at peace] is found. (Therein also the devotee second [in degree] is found; therein also the devotee third [in degree] is found, therein also the devotee fourth [in degree] is found.) Now in this system and discipline, Subhadda, the noble Eightfold Path is found. Here indeed, Subhadda, is the devotee [at peace]. (Here is the devotee second [in degree], here is the devotee third [in degree], here is the devotee fourth [in degree].) Devoid of devotees [at peace] are those other teachings; but here [in my doctrine], Subhadda, may the mendicant brothers live rightly (*sammā*),[8] so that the world (*loko*) be not devoid of saints[9] (*arahantehi*).

[1] See § 13 [23] above; § 16 [27] below, where the Eightfold Path is made the essential part of the Law (Ap. G 1 *b*), which thus is centred in right conduct of thought, word, and deed, leading to self-transcendence.

[2] Or, law (*dhamma*). Cp. § 15 [26] (*truth*) above.

[3] Ch. 3 § 5 [163]; Ap. A 1 *b* (6).

[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. Here the Dhamma is by implication most briefly defined as the Path; IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

[5] *Samaṇa*; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2] n. *Samaṇa* is used here not in the sense of 'ascetic' but in the sense of 'tranquil' attributable to its second possible derivative source. It may be compared with *nibbuta* as used in Ch. 2 § 2. Further compare 'stream-attaining' (Ap. D *c* § 3 [6]).

[6] Int. § 110. The awkward absence of the numeral 'first' both from the prose text here and from the last of the verses below suggests that the monkish redactor added the second, third, and fourth degrees, though out of respect for the original text (IN 6, *Canon*) he refrained from improving the word *samaṇo*. The doubtful clauses are here enclosed in brackets. Their omission gives the speech verisimilitude. The dying teacher may well have declared that every true religion must inculcate right conduct in thought, word, and deed, culminating in transcendence of selfhood; and he might truly add that at that time no system but his own taught this. The ill-fitting additions seem to have been introduced in favour of the rebirth doctrine which without them would find no place here (Int. § 30).

[7] These four degrees may be explained as the four stages ending in Arahatship (Ap. D *c* § 4 [*d*]), but it is more accordant with Gotama's teaching to take them as meaning the four classes of the faithful so frequently mentioned, namely monks, nuns, laymen, and lay-women (see above § 2 [3]). Cp. Ap. H 1 § 6 (*four pairs*).

[8] Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*.

[9] Ap. D *c*.

Nine and twenty years of age was I, Subhadda,
When I went forth[1] seeking what Right[2] might be.
Fifty years and more[3] have passed
Since I went forth, Subhadda,
Keeping the bounds of Method (*ñāyassa*),[4] of the Law (*dhammassa*);
Beyond this [last] there is no devotee [at peace] (*samaṇo n'atthi*). . . .'[5]

§ 17. [28] On this being said Subhadda the Wanderer spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'How excellent, revered sir, how excellent, revered sir! . . .[6] Let me receive from the Blessed One ordination as one who has gone forth (*pabbajjaṃ*),[7] let me receive admission (*upasampadaṃ*).'[8]

§ 18. [28 *cd.*] 'Whosoever, Subhadda, has formerly belonged to one of the different philosophical schools[9] and desires the renunciation-ordination (*pabbajjaṃ*) and admission (*upasampadaṃ*) under this doctrine and discipline undergoes a probation [period][10] of four months. At the end of four months Bhikkhus of established character[11] confer the renunciation-ordination, confer admission[12] to the mendicant state. But here distinction[13] of persons is recognized by me.' [29] 'If, revered sir, those who formerly belonged to one of the different philosophical schools . . .[14] undergo a probation of four months . . . I will undergo a probation of four years. . . .' Thereupon the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Then, Ānanda, confer on Subhadda the renunciation-ordination.'[15] 'Be it so, revered sir', said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the Blessed One.

[1] Ch. 2 § 5 n.

[2] *Kiṃ-kusala*, 'what Good [might be]'; Ch. 2 § 5 [163]. This is self-transcendence (*nibbāna*, Ch. 5 § 4 [17]) attained through or in *samādhi* (Ch. 5 § 4 [18]).

[3] 'Fifty years and one year more', SBB, iii, p. 167. Cp. Ch. 10 *d* § 1 (20th year); Ch. 13 *c* § 30 n; Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. According to the Ceylon tradition Gotama was born 'on a Friday, in the year 623 before the European era' and died at the close of his 80th year (Subhadra Bhikshu, *A Buddhist Catechism*, 1890, pp. 12, 27). Cp. Ch. 1 § 6 (*fifth day*).

[4] Ap. G 1 *d* § 4 [2]. As indicated in the preceding prose setting the 'method' is the Eightfold Path.

[5] Omitting the repetition of the prose phrases regarding Samaṇas of the second, third, and fourth degrees, here strangely incongruous with the verses; also of the prose sentence which immediately precedes the verses and paraphrases the concluding lines.

[6] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[7] Or, the ordination of renunciation [of the world]. Ch. 5 *c* § 8.

[8] Ch. 8 *d*.

[9] Or, another sect. Ap. H 2 *a* § 3.

[10] *Pari-vasati*; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1]; Ap. H 2 *a* (*Parivāsa*).

[11] *Āraddha-cittā*; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]. Cp. Ch. 20 § 4 (5).

[12] This implies that both ceremonies were performed, the admission ceremony being a double one as now in Ceylon (Ap. H 2 *c* § 1). See § 19 below.

[13] Similar distinction is allowed in favour of Jaṭilas and Sākiyans (Ap. H 2 *a* § 4).

[14] Omitting repetition. The whole passage is found also in *Saṃyutta* xii of *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, ii, p. 21) with change of name and place, the scene being Rājagaha and the convert Kassapa the naked ascetic (*acela*, Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [15] n).

[15] Here only the renunciation-ordination is mentioned, but the admission-ordination may be implied. Ch. 7 *b* §§ 3, 7 [2]. Cp. § 19 below.

§ 19. [30] Then Subhadda the Wanderer spoke to the venerable Ānanda:[1] 'It is your gain, friend Ānanda, it is good fortune to you, friend Ānanda, who here have been consecrated with the consecration[2] of abiding[3] face to face with the Teacher.' And Subhadda the Wanderer in the presence of the Blessed One received the renunciation-ordination, received admission.[4]

§ 20. [30 *cd.*] And thereupon shortly after being admitted the venerable Subhadda, dwelling alone, secluded, diligent,[5] strenuous, resolute,[6] ere long learnt fully for himself (*sayaṃ*), realized in the present life and having attained abode in, the supreme fulfilment of the holy life[7] for the sake of which the clansmen[8] rightly go forth from the household to the houseless life; he perceived[9] fully—'Separate-existence (*jāti*)[10] is ended; the holy-life has been lived, what ought to be done has been done; there is no [individual state] beyond this state (*n'āparaṃ itthattāya*).'[11]

Thus was the venerable Subhadda yet another saint.
He was the Blessed One's last own-disciple.[12]

(iv)

§ 21. [Pt. vi. 1.] Then the Blessed One instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'It may be now Ānanda that ye may think thus: "The Word (*pāvacanaṃ*)[13] is that of a [dead and] past Teacher; we have no Teacher."[14] Not so now Ānanda, should ye regard this. The doctrine[15] and the discipline[16] shown and made known by me to you will be your Teacher on my passing away.'

§ 22. [2] 'After my passing away, Ānanda, the Bhikkhus should not address[17] one another as now they address each other by saying "friend (*āvuso*)".[18] An elder mendicant should address a younger mendicant brother by name or by family (*gottena*)[19] or as "friend". A younger mendicant brother should address an elder mendicant brother either as "revered sir (*bhante*)"[20] or as "venerable (*āyasmā*[21] *ti*)".'

[1] Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42].
[2] *Abhi-seka*; literally, sprinkling. Ch. 7 *b* § 3 (*anointing*); Cp. Ap. D *c* § 3 [6] n. 'Sprinkled with the sprinkling of discipleship', SBB, iii, p. 169.
[3] *Ante-vāsa*, pupilship; literally, dwelling with. Ch. 8 *g* § 4 (*assistant*).
[4] See § 18 [28], [29], above.
[5] *Appamatta*; Ap. C *b* § 11 (21).
[6] *Pahitatta*; see § 6 [10] above.
[7] Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; see § 25 n below.
[8] Int. § 158.
[9] *Abbhaññāsi*; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [15]. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*Aññāta*).
[10] Ch. 5 *c* § 5.
[11] Ch. 4 § 17.
[12] Literally, 'last seen-disciple (*sakkhi-sāvako*)' Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18); Ch. 10 *c*; also Int. § 30; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n.
[13] Int.§ 54. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [3] (*utterance*); also Ap. A 1 *b* (10), *sāsana*.
[14] Ap. E *b* § 2 [8].
[15] *Dhamma*. See § 24 [5] (*Law*) below; and Ch. 23 *a* [9] (*Law*). Cp. Ch. 21 § 14 (*dhamma*); also Ch. 21 § 7 [25] n.
[16] Ap. A 1 *b* (6).
[17] Verb *samud-acarati* (to be current, to occur; hence to meet, to greet). Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 3 (*current phrases*).
[18] Ch. 3 § 5 [163]. See Ch. 8 *g* § 3.
[19] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).
[20] Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [9].
[21] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [7].

§ 23. [3] 'After my passing away, Ānanda, let the Saṃgha,[1] if so desiring, rid itself of lesser and subsidiary precepts[2] (*sikkhapadāni*).'

§ 24. . . .[3] [5] Then the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'It may be now, Bhikkhus, that some mendicant brother may have a doubt or perplexity[4] regarding the Buddha or the Law[5] or the Community or the Path or [Middle] Road.[6] Inquire, Bhikkhus; be not hereafter full of regret saying: "The Teacher was present with us and we could not question the Blessed One when face to face." ' On this being said the mendicant brothers were silent. . . .[7] Then the Blessed One instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'It may be now, Bhikkhus, that you do not inquire because of respect for the teacher; then let friend speak to friend.'[8] On this being said the mendicant brothers were silent. [6] Then the venerable Ānanda spoke to the Blessed One thus: ''Tis wonderful, revered sir, 'tis strange;[9] thus do I believe, revered sir—in the assembly of mendicant brothers not even one mendicant brother has any doubt or perplexity regarding the Buddha or the Law or the Community or the Path or Road.' . . .[10]

[1] This does not necessarily imply a single centralized body. Cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 1 (*Church*).

[2] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1]; Ch. 8 *e* §§ 3, 5 n; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [21] (*chief rule*); Ch. 23 *b* § 9. Or, disciplinary rules; cp. Ch. 8 *e* (*Vinaya*). It is not probable that Buddha wished to abolish rules instituted by himself. He may have wished to prevent the growth of unnecessary observances accumulated by local communities, and this would accord with his constant opposition to insignificant formalism (Ap. G 1 *a*, *practices*).

[3] Omitting [4] which attributes to Buddha an order that the *brahma-daṇḍa* penalty (Ap. H 3 *b*) should be laid upon the mendicant brother Channa, whom the Bhikkhus should not address, advise, or admonish, Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12]. The abruptness of this order is not a reason against its validity, for the Teacher's long reverie may well be supposed to have been interrupted by brief sentences as his thoughts for the time became definite. But the Commentary states that Channa was punished for obstinately supporting the mendicant sisters against the mendicant brothers (SBB, iii, p. 172). This long dispute ended in the suppression of the Bhikkhunī-Saṃgha in Ceylon, and as the Bhikkhus seem not to have been above loading the scriptures to their own advantage elsewhere (Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [6] n) it is not impossible that they used the solemn narration of the Teacher's death to insert a text which might serve as a point in argument. The obstinacy of Channa is mentioned in *Culla-vagga*, I. xxv (Ch. 15 *b* § 13), IV. xiv, and his repentance in *Culla-vagga*, XI. i. 12, 15. The last passage includes the text here omitted. He figures also as a stock offender in the *Sutta-Vibhaṅga* (*Vin. Piṭ.* iii, pp. 155, 177, iv, pp. 36, 47, 113, 141). The scene in all these cases is Kosambi (Int. § 143). See also *Thera-gāthā*, lxix (*Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 70). He is not the Channa of Ch. 11 *c* § 6; nor apparently the *thera* of Ch. 15 *a* § 16 (*Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 111). The name is common.

[4] The text of [5] and [6] appears also in the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* (Ch. 13 *a* § 8).

[5] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4] (*Enlightened*); cp. § 21 (*doctrine*) above.

[6] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]. The Middle Road and the Path are the same.

[7] Omitting double repetition of the question and silence.

[8] Ch. 13 *a* § 8.

[9] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

[10] Omitting a passage in which Buddha is represented as replying that whereas Ānanda merely believes this he himself has certain knowledge that none has any doubt and that all the 500 present (Int. § 121), even the most backward, having entered the stream will be no longer liable to birth in a state of punishment (Ap. B *a* § 6 [8]) and will assuredly attain complete enlightenment. The object of the passage is apparently to enhance the authority of the *Canon* as recently revised by a General Council (IN 6).

§ 25. [7] And then the Blessed One enjoined[1] the mendicant brothers saying: 'Come now, mendicant brothers, I enjoin you—Perishable[2] by nature is individuality;[3] earnestly[4] labour.'[5] This was the last saying[6] (*vācā*) of the Tathāgata.[7]

§ 26. [8] Then the Blessed One attained the first trance (*paṭhama-jjhānaṃ*).[8] (Emerging from the first trance he attained the second trance; emerging from the second trance he attained the third trance; emerging from the third trance he attained the fourth trance;[9] emerging from the fourth trance he attained the realm of space-infinity;[10] emerging from the attainment[11] of the realm of space-infinity he attained the realm of consciousness-infinity;[12] emerging from the attainment of the realm of consciousness-infinity he attained the realm of nothingness;[13] emerging from the attainment of the realm of nothingness he attained the realm of neither [individual] perception[14] nor [total] non-perception; emerging from the attainment of the realm of neither perception nor non-perception he attained to the cessation of perception and sensation.[15] Then the venerable Ānanda spoke thus to the venerable Anuruddha:[16] 'The Blessed One, revered (*bhante*)[17] Anuruddha, is dead.' 'The Blessed One, friend (*āvuso*) Ānanda, is not dead; he has attained to the cessation of perception and sensation.' [9] Then the Blessed One . . .[18] reached the first

[1] *Āmantesi*; exhorted, instructed, or commanded. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1].

[2] Ch. 21 § 16; cp. Ch. 14 § 16 (*puna-bbhava*); and Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [4] (*death*). The MPS account of Buddha's death, from his last words down to the verses of Anuruddha and Ānanda, is the same as that given in the *Sagātha-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (i. 157–9) with some interesting exceptions. The *Saṃ. Nik.* account does not mention the fifth stage of 'attainment' (Int. § 82 n) and says nothing of the earthquake or storm, and it does not include the immoderate lamentations of Bhikkhus and Devatās; IN 6 (*Canon*).

[3] *Saṃkhārā*; Ap. E *a*. 'Decay is inherent in all component things', SBB, iii, p. 173. Ch. 7 *a* § 19 n; see also Int. § 97.

[4] Strenuously, diligently. Ap. C *b* § 11 (21); Ap. E *c* ii § 2 [302]. Zealously (Ch. 13 *e* § 2).

[5] Or, by diligent effort succeed, namely in doing what should be done (*karaṇīya*, Ch. 5 *c* §§ 5, 6; also Ap. F), i.e. in living the holy life (*brahmacariya*, see § 20 above; Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *a* § 10), which attains to the extinction of selfhood (Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [1], *egoism*), here on earth transcending the transient Ego. Compare Ch. 7 *b* § 2 [90] (*su-caritaṃ*); also Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79] (*energy*); and Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*sammā-vāyāmo*); and Ap. H 5 [93].

[6] Int. § 38; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [29]; Ap. E *c* ii § 5.

[7] Leader or Successor; Ch. 21 § 7 [25].

[8] Or, entered into the first contemplation. Ap. I, *Note* (*trances and attainments*); Ap. I *a* (*Jhāna*).

[9] i.e. complete transcendence of the Ego and union with the Infinite; cp. Ch. 21 § 11 [33] (3).

[10] Or, the infinite ether (*ākāsa*). Ch. 21 § 11 [33] (4); also Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23]; and Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2] n.

[11] *Samāpatti*; Ch. 3 § 4 [66]; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5].

[12] Or, mind. Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*viññāna*). Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 n.

[13] Ch. 3 § 5 [164].

[14] Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]; Ch. 3 § 5 [165].

[15] Ap. I *a* § 2 (*vedanā*). This highest stage of 'attainment' does not appear in the *Saṃ. Nik.* account (i, p. 158).

[16] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]. This conversation is not in the *Saṃ. Nik.* narrative.

[17] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [2].

[18] Omitting the reverse process back to the first trance or starting-point. The passage here placed in brackets seems to have been added in order to enforce the importance of the cloudy pre-Buddhist 'attainments' (*samāpattiyo*; Ch. 3 § 4 [66])

trance.) Emerging from the first trance he attained the second trance; emerging from the second trance he attained the third trance; emerging from the third trance he attained the fourth trance. Emerging from the fourth trance the Blessed One immediately died.

§ 27. [10] . . .[1] When the Blessed One died, immediately after his death, the venerable Anuruddha[2] uttered these verses:[3]

> 'There was no [troubled] breath in Him (*tādino*)[4] the steadfast-minded;
> Unshaken, calm (*santiṃ*) attained then when he ended life,
> The Sage (*muni*)[5] with mind (*cittena*) courageous pain (*vedanaṃ*) endured.
> Even as the extinction (*nibbānaṃ*)[6] of a flame[7] [such] was his mind's (*cetaso*)[8] release.'[9]

When the Blessed One died, immediately after his death, the venerable Ānanda uttered this verse:

> 'What terror was there then, what awe,
> When he who was in all ways best endued, the All-enlightened, died!'

When the Blessed One died many Bhikkhus there who had not overcome desire[10] wailed stretching out their arms, fell prone, rocked themselves backwards and forwards saying: 'Too soon has the Blessed One died. . . .'[11] But those Bhikkhus who had overcome desire, self-scrutinizing (*satā*), comprehending,[12] endured saying: 'Transient is individuality (*aniccā saṃkhārā*);[13] and how in this case is it possible[14] [otherwise]?'

as a form of *yoga* (Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*, *Sāṅkhya*; and Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4], *Brahma-sahavyatā*). The narrative here is necessarily unauthoritative (IN 6, *Canon*).

[1] Omitting an earthquake and storm (Ch. 21 § 11 [12] n) not mentioned in the *Saṃ. Nik.* narrative (i, p. 158); also verses attributed to Brahmā Sahampati (Int. § 93 ii) on the transience of what is complex; also lines uttered by Sakka the king of the gods (*Devānaṃ Indo*; Int. § 93 i) on the impermanence of the *saṃkhārā* (Ap. E *a*, *Note*).

[2] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[3] Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*. These verses are found also in the *Sagātha-vagga* of *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, p. 159); Ānanda's lines following immediately below appear in the *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, p. 158) before Anuruddha's.

[4] *Tādin* (such an one; that one) is an epithet of the Buddha and the saints; cp. *Dhp.* 94, 95, 96, and 196. See Part I (title) n.

[5] Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (1). *Saṃ. Nik.* varies slightly.

[6] Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. C *b*.

[7] *Pajjota*; cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (4).

[8] *Ceto* means here individual life rather than mind; cp. Ch. 4 § 17 (*citta*); Ch. 5 *b* § 9; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]. 'Heart,' SBB, iii, p. 176; *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 198. 'Individuality' might be a better rendering.

[9] *Vimokha*; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]; cp. Ap. D *a* § 6 (*vimutti*).

[10] *Rāga*; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii. 251).

[11] As in § 11 [21] above regarding the Mallas; and in § 28 [11] below regarding the spirits. This passage is not in the *Saṃ. Nik.* narrative.

[12] Ch. 21 § 7 [23].

[13] Ap. E *a*.

[14] This phrase is abbreviated from the formula used in § 7 [14] above (*ere this*) and elsewhere.

§ 28. [11] And then the venerable Anuruddha instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Enough, friends; mourn not, lament not. Has it not been announced by the Blessed One ere this[1] that there is in all . . . the principle of transience.[2] And how in this case, friends, is it possible that what is born, produced, compounded, dissolvable[3] by nature—that this indeed should not be dissolved? This state is not to be found. The spirits,[4] friends, are vexed.[5] ("But of what kind of spirits, revered sir, is the venerable Anuruddhā thinking?" There are, friend Ānanda,[6] spirits in the sky (*ākāse*)[7] with earthly perceptions;[8] they wail disordering their hair . . . saying: "Too soon has the Blessed One died.[9] . . . Too soon has the light[10] in the world disappeared." There are, friend Ānanda, spirits on earth[11] (*pathaviyā*) with earthly perceptions; they wail . . . saying: "Too soon has the light in the world disappeared".) Now those spirits who have overcome desire, self-scrutinizing, comprehending, endure saying: "Transient is individuality; and how in this case is it possible[12] [otherwise]?" '

c. THE OBSEQUIES

§ 1. [Pt. vi. 12.] And the venerable Anuruddha[13] and the venerable Ānanda passed the remainder of that night in discourse on the Law. Then the venerable Anuruddha instructed the venerable Ānanda saying: 'Go thou, friend Ānanda, enter Kusinārā and announce to the Kusināran Mallans, "The Blessed One is dead, Vāseṭṭhas,[14] now ['tis time] for what ye think seasonable." '[15] 'Be it so, revered sir', said the venerable Ānanda in assent to the venerable Anuruddha. . . .[16]

§ 2. [13] Then the Kusināran Mallans summoned their retainers (*purise*)[17] saying: 'For this [occasion], sirs (*bhane*),[18] collect in Kusinārā scents and garlands[19] and all the musicians.'[20] And the Kusināran

[1] Ch. 13 *a* § 4 (*already*); Ch. 23 *b* § 1.
[2] Cp. Ch. 4 § 18 [1] (*anicca*).
[3] *Paloka-dhamma*; Ap. E, *Note* (*anicca*).
[4] *Devatā*; IN 8 *a*; Int. § 74.
[5] Or, distressed; 'will reproach us', SBB, iii, p. 178. The explanation must be left to phantasy.
[6] Ānanda is now addressed instead of the Bhikkhus. The passage here put in brackets is an awkward addition. IN 6 (*Canon*).
[7] Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23].
[8] *Pathavi-saññim* means earth-perceiving or earth-conscious. 'Of worldly mind', SBB, iii, p. 178.
[9] See § 27 [10] above.
[10] See § 11 [21] above.
[11] Int. §§ 35 ii, 70.
[12] For the formula see § 7 [14] above (*ere this*).
[13] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].
[14] Ch. 22 *b* § 10.
[15] Ch. 20 § 2 [6]. 'Do, then, whatever seemeth to you fit', SBB, iii, p. 179.
[16] As in Ch. 22 *b* §§ 10 [19]–11 [21] with necessary changes. The Mallans are represented as debating in their council hall (Ap. H 3 *a* § 3) 'on that very business' when Ānanda arrives.
[17] These seem to have been badge-men, uniformed guards and messengers enforcing the authority and orders of the Council. Int. § 175 (*police*); see § 5 [18] below.
[18] Ch. 3 § 1.
[19] *Gandha-māla*; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (8); and Int. § 190 (*toilet*).
[20] *Tāḷā* are instruments of percussion and these doubtless preponderated. Int. § 190 (*music*).

Mallans with scents and garlands and all the musicians and five hundred pairs of [upper] wraps,[1] went to the Bend (*Upavattanaṃ*)[2] of the Mallans, the Sāl-tree Grove, where the body of the Blessed One was. When they had arrived they . . . honoured[3] the body of the Blessed One with dances,[4] songs, music[5] (*vāditehi*), and garlands and scents; making awnings of the cloth, preparing circular enclosures[6] (*maṇḍala-mālāni*); and so they passed that day. And then the Kusināran Mallans thought thus: 'It is the wrong time to-day to burn[7] the body of the Blessed One; now to-morrow we will burn the body of the Blessed One. And then . . .[8] [so] also they passed the second day . . . and the third . . . and the fourth . . . and the fifth . . . and the sixth day.

§ 3. [14] Then during the seventh day the Kusināran Mallans thought thus: 'Let us . . . honouring the body of the Blessed One with dances,[9] songs, music and garlands and scents, carry it southwards to the south of the city, outside [the walls] to the outside of the city, and let us burn the body of the Blessed One at the south [side] of the city (*nagarassa*).'[10] And at that time eight leaders[11] of the Mallans, having bathed their heads,[12] clothed themselves in unsoiled garments[13] and then thinking 'We will lift the body of the Blessed One' were not able to lift it. . . .[14]

§ 4. [16] And then . . . with divine (*dibbehi*)[15] and human (*mānusakehi*) dances,[16] songs and music . . . they carried the body of the

[1] *Dussa-yuga*, pair of garments; cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35] (*pair*), and Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14] n. The garments consisted of long strips of cloth which were wound round the body.

[2] Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21].

[3] The conventional fourfold phrase is used as in Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].

[4] See § 4 below; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (7). These religious dances, addressed to the spirits of the earth and of the lower heavens, were animistic and pagan and doubtless belonged to a cult earlier than Hinduism. They may be compared with the dances which still figure so largely in modern Tibetan Buddhist ritual. Cp. Ch. 11 *a* § 3 (*pagan*).

[5] Instrumental music; Ch. 6 *a* § 2 (*musicians*).

[6] As shrines; or for religious meetings, as in Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [11]. 'In the Mahāvihāra (Tiss' ārāma) at Anurādhapura there were 32 mālakas; Dpvs xiv, 78; Mhvs 15, 192. The sacred Bodhi-tree, e.g. was surrounded by a mālaka'; *Pāli Dict.* s.v. *mālaka*, cited from Geiger, Mahāvaṃsa, trsl. 99. 'Decoration wreaths', SBB, iii, p. 180.

[7] Int. § 190 (*cremation*).

[8] Omitting repetitions.

[9] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (7).

[10] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4).

[11] *Pāmokkhā*; cp. Ch. 8 *b* (*Pāti-mokkha*) n.

[12] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [5].

[13] Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [5].

[14] Omitting details of this miraculous incident (Int. § 94, i). Anuruddha explains [15] that the spirits (*devatā*; IN 8 *a*) desire that the body should be carried to the north gate and through the city to the east gate and thence to Makuta-bandhana, a Mallan shrine (see § 4 below). On the Mallans complying the difficulty is removed and [16] a miraculous fall of heavenly Mandārava flowers (Int. § 79; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 n) ensues. The significance of this incident appears to be that the Buddha was to be treated not as a foreigner as was first proposed but as a citizen of Kusinārā.

[15] The context here implies that the Gods took part; the original text may have intended only that the Gods were represented. Compare the 'heavenly (sacred) spectacles (*divyāni rupāni*)' of the Emperor Asoka, Rock Edict, iv, and the description of a Buddhist procession at Pātaliputra by the Chinese traveller Fa-hien (*Travels*, ch. xxvii, tr. Legge, cited by V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 3rd ed., p. 167).

[16] See § 2 above; the epithets 'divine and human' are here added. Cp. § 190 (*feasts*).

Blessed One by the north [road] to the north of the city, and having entered the city by the north gate (*dvārena*)[1] they carried it by the middle [road] to the middle of the city and went out by the east gate, and at the east side of the city [went on to where there was] the Mallans's shrine (*cetiyaṃ*)[2] called Makuta-bandhana and there they laid down the body of the Blessed One.

§ 5. [17] . . .[3] [18] Then the Kusināran Mallans summoned their retainers[4] saying: 'For this [occasion], sirs (*bhane*),[5] collect the beaten cotton[6] (*kapāsaṃ*) of the Mallans.' And then the Kusināran Mallans wrapped the body of the Blessed One in unsoiled garments[7] (*vatthena*), and having wrapped it in unsoiled garments they wrapped it in beaten cotton; having wrapped it in beaten cotton they wrapped it in unsoiled garments. In this way they wrapped the body of the Blessed One in five hundred double [layers] and having laid the body of the Blessed One in an iron oil-trough[8] they covered it over[9] with a similar iron-trough; and having made a pyre of all kinds of scented [woods] they placed the body of the Blessed One in the pyre.[10]

§ 6. [19–20] . . .[11] [21] And at that time four leaders of the Mallans having bathed their heads[12] and clad themselves in unsoiled garments thinking, 'We will kindle the pyre of the Blessed One', were not able to kindle it. . . .[13]

§ 7. [22] And then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa[14] arrived at Kusināra, at Makuta-bandhana the Mallans' shrine,[15] where the pyre of the Blessed One was. Having arrived he adjusted his robe over

[1] Int. § 175.
[2] Int. § 134; see § 7 below.
[3] The Mallans consult Ānanda as to the form of burial suitable. He replies in words attributed to Buddha in MPS, v, 11 (Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [11] n) with necessary changes. His words are preçiselv followed in the narrative of [18].
[4] See § 2 above.
[5] Ch. 3 § 1.
[6] 'Carded cotton-wool', SBB, iii, p. 183. Cp. Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3].
[7] Clothing. 'A new cloth', SBB.
[8] *Tela-doṇī*; Int. § 189 (*manufactures*). See § 10 n below; and Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (4).
[9] The two vessels were boat-shaped. The one would serve as a lid to the other. There was doubtless a hole in each to allow the oil to be drawn. The two vessels must have been placed within the pyre, and the pair would keep the ashes intact.
[10] Int. § 190 (*cremation*).
[11] Mahā-Kassapa who is absent near Pāvā with 500 of the brethren hears the news of the Buddha's death; as in Ch. 13 *a* § 4. He immediately sets forth for Makuta-bandhana; see § 7 below. Curiously interposed in [20] is the incident of Subhadda the recruit (Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23] n), who had been received into the Order in his old age and who now bids the brethren rejoice on being freed from the great Samaṇa's restraint and on being able to do what they please (see also Ch. 23 *b* § 2).
[12] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [5].
[13] Omitting details regarding this miraculous incident (Int. § 94, i). Anuruddha explains that the spirits (IN 8 *a*) desire that the ceremony should wait till the arrival of Mahā-Kassapa to salute the feet of the Blessed One—Mahā-Kassapa became Buddha's immediate successor. He was absent at the time of the Buddha's death and the present miracle may have been introduced in the interest of his party (IN 6, *Canon*). He was a Brāhman and some of the depreciation to which Ānanda is frequently subjected in the Nikāyas may be due to a rivalry between the Sakyans of Gotama's immediate family and the Brāhman converts who supported the venerable and learned Kassapa (Ch. 11 *d* § 7 n; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 25 n, and Ch. 23 *b* § 9 n; also Ap. H 2 § 4 n).
[14] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 10 *c* (4).
[15] See §§ 4, 6 n above.

one shoulder (*ekaṃsaṃ*),[1] extended joined palms (*añjaliṃ*)[2] and so moving as to keep the pyre on his right[3] [walked round it] thrice and having uncovered it at the foot saluted[4] the feet of the Blessed One with his forehead. Also the five hundred Bhikkhus [who had come with him from Pāvā] having adjusted their robes over one shoulder, extended joined palms and so moving as to keep the pyre on their right [walked round it] thrice and saluted the feet of the Blessed One with their foreheads. And as the venerable Mahā-Kassapa and those five hundred Bhikkhus saluted [the feet] the pyre of the Blessed One caught fire. . . .[5]

§ 8. [23] . . .[6] And when the body of the Blessed One had been consumed . . .[7] the Kusināran Mallans, having made [for the relics] a fence of swords[8] and put round [them] a wall of bows in the council-hall (*santhāgāre*),[9] for seven days . . . honoured the relics (*sarīrāni*)[10] of the Blessed One with dances, songs, music, and garlands and scents.

§ 9. [24] (1) And the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu[11] the son of the Videhan [consort of Bimbisāra] heard [it said] 'The Blessed One they say (*kira*) has died at Kusinārā', and thereupon . . . sent a messenger to the Kusināran Mallans saying: 'The Blessed One was a Kshatriya (*khattiyo*)[12] and I also am a Kshatriya. I also am worthy (*arahāmi*)[13] of a part of the relics[14] (*sarīrānaṃ*) of the Blessed One, and I will make a stūpa (*thūpaṃ*)[15] and a festival (*mahaṃ*)[16] [in honour] of the relics of the Blessed One.' (2) And the Licchavis[17] (*Licchavī*) of Vesāli heard . . . and sent a messenger. . . .[18] (3) And the Sakyas[19] (*Sakyā*) of Kapilavatthu heard . . . and sent a messenger saying: 'The Blessed One was the foremost[20] of our kin; we also are worthy of a part of the relics of the Blessed One. . . . (4) And the Bulis[21] (*Bulayo*) of Allakappa heard . . . and sent a messenger. . . . (5) And the Koliyas[22] (*Koliyā*) of Rāma-

[1] Cīvara is a general term for robe; the usual word is more precise, *uttarāsaṅga*, upper-wrap; Ch. 8 § 1.
[2] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3].
[3] Ch. 2 § 2.
[4] Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3].
[5] Omitting 'spontaneously (*sayam eva*)', which adds another miracle (Int. § 94, i).
[6] Omitting details regarding the incineration after which only the bones (*sarīrāni*) of the Blessed One remained.
[7] Omitting the miracle (Int. § 94, i) through which the pyre was extinguished by a stream of water from mid-air (*antalikkhā*; cp. Ch. 1 § 5 [52] n)—apparently from a water-spout (*udaka-sālato*)—supplemented by pails of scented water poured on the embers by the Mallans.
[8] 'Lattice work of spears', SBB, iii, p. 187.
[9] Int. § 137; Ap. H 3 *a* § 3.
[10] The context shows that the plural form of *sarīra* (body) means the bones; otherwise translated as relics (see § 9 below).
[11] Int. § 166.
[12] Int. §§ 164, 185.
[13] Cp. *arahat* (Ch. 5 *b* § 10).
[14] See § 8 n above.
[15] Tumulus; mound. Int. §§ 22 and 190 (*architecture*).
[16] Int. § 190 (*feasts*).
[17] Ch. 12 *a*.
[18] As Kshatriyas they claim a share on the same terms as Ajātasattu and the other non-Brāhman claimants.
[19] Int. § 164.
[20] The word is *seṭṭha* (best); cp. Seṭṭhi (Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [2]).
[21] These are not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* They evidently occupied a small territory near the Mallas. Ch. 2 § 6 (*states*).
[22] Ch. 13 *d*.

gāma[1] heard . . . and sent a messenger. . . . (6) And the Brāhman of Vethadīpa[2] heard . . . and sent a messenger . . . saying: 'The Blessed One was a Kshatriya; I am a Brāhman; I also am worthy of a part of the relics of the Blessed One, and I will make a stūpa and a festival [in honour] of the relics of the Blessed One.' (7) The Mallas of Pāvā[3] heard . . . and sent a messenger saying: 'The Blessed One was a Kshatriya and we also are Kshatriyas. We also are worthy of a part of the relics of the Blessed One. . . .'

§ 10. [25] On this being said the Kusināran Mallas spoke to those assembled parties (*te saṃghe gaṇe*)[4] thus: 'The Blessed One died in our village-neighbourhood[5] (*gāma-kkhette*); we will not give a part of the relics of the Blessed One.' On this being said Doṇa the Brāhman[6] spoke to those assembled parties thus:

> 'Hear, sirs,[7] a word of mine.
> Our Blessed One [ever] forbearance[8] taught.
> It is not right that strife should rise
> Over the sharing of the relics of the best of men.[9]
> Let us all, sirs, united in accord (*samaggā*)[10]
> Agreeing share [his relics in] eight parts.'

'Therefore, O Brāhman,' they replied, 'do thou divide what relics of the Blessed One there are in fair division[11] making eight equal parts.' 'Be it so, sirs (*bho*)', said Doṇa the Brāhman in assent to those assembled parties (*tesaṃ saṃghānaṃ gaṇānaṃ*), and having divided the remains of the Blessed One in fair division making eight equal parts he spoke to those assembled parties thus: 'Give me, sirs, this vessel (*kumbhaṃ*),[12] and I will make a stūpa and a festival [in honour] of the vessel.' And they gave the vessel to Doṇa the Brāhman.

[1] Int. § 166 (5); Ch. 13 *d* § 2 [52] (*Devadaha*) n.

[2] The name is not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.* The place seems to have been a Brāhman village (Int. § 166; Ch. 1 § 2 n) in the neighbourhood. It does not appear that the Brāhmanic (Vedic and ritualistic) cult of the time was so highly organized as to oppose the rise of Buddhism generally (Ap. G 2 *c*).

[3] Ch. 13 *a* § 1.

[4] 'To the assembled crowds', SBB, iii, p. 189. Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [164] (*company*); Ap. H 3 *b* § 1 (*chapter*); and Ap. H 3 *a* § 3 (*assembly-hall*).

[5] Suburb or environs. Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [20].

[6] Int. § 166 (9). The context shows that Doṇa was a convert to Buddhism. His conversion is recorded in the Fives of *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 168), in a Sutta interesting for its account of Brāhman ideas regarding descent, marriage, and morals (Int. § 185) and of unlawful occupations (Int. § 189, *trade*). A Brāhman of this name is mentioned in a dubious Sutta also included in *Aṅg. Nik.* (*Gradual Sayings*, ii, pp. 43–5; Ch. 14 *d* § 1).

[7] *Bhonto*, plural of *bho*; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2].

[8] *Khanti*; Ap. F 2 *a* (142); cp. Int. § 104.

[9] *Uttama-puggalo*. Part I, title (*Buddha*) n.

[10] Ch. 8 *e* § 5.

[11] Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [35].

[12] By some considered to have been the Buddha's begging-bowl (*Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 163 n). A *kumbha* is ordinarily a clay vessel (Ch. 11 *c* § 19 [237]). The word here may not refer to the iron trough (see § 5 above) in which the body was incinerated but to a smaller jar in which the charred bones were collected. Cp Ch. 16 *d* § 6 [2] (*tub*).

§ 11. [26] And the Moriyas[1] (*Moriyā*) of Pipphalivana[2] heard [it said] 'The Blessed One they say has died at Kusinārā' . . . and sent a messenger saying: 'The Blessed One was a Kshatriya and we also are Kshatriyas. We also are worthy of a part of the relics of the Blessed One. . . .' [On being told] 'There is no part of the relics of the Blessed One [left], the relics of the Blessed One have been divided; take hence the embers', they took the embers thence.

§ 12. [27] . . .[3] So there were eight relic-stūpas,[4] a ninth stūpa for the vessel, and a tenth stūpa for the embers. Thus was it formerly. [28] . . .[5]

[1] Int. § 166 (10). The Moriyā are not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ*. Their claim may have been added here in the interests of the Mauriyan dynasty established later by Chandragupta and rendered illustrious by the Emperor Asoka.

[2] Pepper-tree Grove. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 28 (*Pipphalī-guhā*); and Ch. 10 *c* (4) n (*Pippali-māṇava*).

[3] The division is made as agreed.

[4] On the division and redivision of the relics see ThB, pp. 155, 158–9.

[5] Omitting verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) which Buddhaghosha in his Commentary (Int. § 21; SBB, iii, p. 190) states to be a late addition (IN 6, *Canon*) and which mention still more relics, apparently introduced in the interests of Ceylon (cp. Ch. 4 § 8 n). A share here is termed *doṇa*.

CHAPTER 23

EPILOGUE: THE CALLING OF THE FIRST GREAT COUNCIL[1]

a. Ānanda[2] and the Law and Discipline

Sutta-Piṭaka, Majjhima-Nikāya, Sutta 108 (*Gopaka-Moggallāna-S.*).

[PTS, iii, p. 7.] Thus have I heard. At one time Ānanda was staying at Rājagaha in the Veḷuvana at Kalandakanivāpa[3] not long after the death of the Blessed One. At that time the Māgadhan king Ajātasattu[4] the son of the Videhan [consort of King Bimbisāra] was having Rājagaha[5] strengthened,[6] being distrustful of King Pajjota.[7] And the venerable Ānanda before noon[8] wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe and alms-bowl entered Rājagaha for alms. Then the venerable Ānanda thought: 'It is still very early to go round for alms in Rājagaha. What if now I should go to [see] the work[9] of Gopaka-Moggallāna[10] the Brāhman[11] where ... the Brāhman [will be]. ... Gopaka-Moggallāna the Brāhman spoke to the venerable Ānanda thus: 'Let the respected (*bhavaṃ*)[12] Ānanda come; welcome to the respected (*bhoto*) Ānanda; it is long since the venerable Ānanda has passed this way (*pariyāyaṃ*)[13] that is so as to come here. . . .' Then the venerable Ānanda sat down on the seat pointed out and Gopaka-Moggallāna the Brāhman taking a low[14] (*nīcaṃ*) seat sat down at one side. . . . [p. 8.] Then Vassakāra[15] the Brāhman, chief-minister of Magadha (*Magadha-mahāmatto*)[16] who was visiting the works[17] (*kammante*) at Rājagaha, came to where the work of Gopaka-Moggallāna the Brāhman was [to be inspected], where the venerable Ānanda was, and . . .[18] sat down at one side. . . . [p. 9.] 'Is there indeed now, O (*bho*) Ānanda,' he said, 'an individual mendicant-brother (*eka-bhikkhu*) appointed by the respected Gotama (*bhotā Gotamena*)[19] saying: "This man on my passing away shall be your [place of] refuge

[1] In 6 (*Councils*). [2] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]. [3] Int. § 126.
[4] Int. § 170. [5] Int. § 128 n. [6] Or, fortified. Int. § 175.
[7] His western neighbour, ruling in the Avanti country (Int. § 162; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15]). For other foreign relationships see Ch. 19 *d* (*neighbours*).
[8] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 9.
[9] *Kammanta*, i.e. work on the fortifications; see [8] below. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 6.
[10] He is not mentioned elsewhere in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.*
[11] Brāhmans then as now did not confine themselves to priestly or even to intellectual occupations. Int. § 190; Ch. 11 *c* § 21 (*Brāhman*); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2].
[12] Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [14]; also Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; Ch. 15 *a* § 13 [158] (*bhoto*).
[13] Made this detour; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [5]. 'Has taken the opportunity', SBB, iv, p. 7; cp. SBB, ii, p. 245 n on this frequent phrase.
[14] Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482]. [15] Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1].
[16] Int. § 172. There were several chief ministers. Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [1]; Ch. 19 *b* § 5 [4]; Ch. 20 § 11 [20]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2. [18] See [7] above.
[17] He exchanges greetings with Ānanda; see Ch. 20 § 11 [29].
[19] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].

(*paṭi-saraṇaṃ*),"[1] to whom you now may run?' 'There is not indeed, Brāhman,' he said, 'an individual mendicant brother appointed by the Blessed One, the comprehending (*jānatā*) far-seeing (*passatā*) Saint (*arahatā*), the Supremely Enlightened. . . .'[2] 'Is there indeed then, Ānanda, an individual mendicant brother agreed upon by the Community (*saṃghena*), appointed by the great number[3] of elder mendicant brothers saying "This man on the passing away of the Blessed One shall be our [place of] refuge", to whom you now may run?' 'There is not indeed, Brāhman, an individual mendicant brother [so] agreed upon by the Community. . . .' 'Then without such refuge [and leader], O (*bho*) Ānanda, how do you remain in agreement (*sāmaggiyā*)?'[4] 'We are not indeed, Brāhman, without refuge; we have a refuge, Brāhman, we have the Law[5] as a refuge.' . . .[6]

b. MAHĀ-KASSAPA[7] AND THE FIRST COUNCIL

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, XI.

§ 1. [XI. i. 1.] The venerable Mahā-Kassapa directed the mendicant brothers saying: 'Once,[8] friends, I was in the course of a journey from Pāvā to Kusinārā with a great assemblage, five hundred mendicant brothers. . . .[9] At that time a certain naked-ascetic . . . had reached half-way from Kusinārā to Pāvā. . . . Seeing the naked-ascetic I said to him "Dost thou, friend, know our Teacher?" "Yes, friend, I know him," he said, "to-day the devotee Gotama has been dead seven days". . . .[10] Then I, friends, spoke to the mendicant brothers thus: "Enough, friends; mourn not, lament not, Has it not been announced already[11] by the Blessed One. . . . That which is born, produced, compounded, dissolvable by nature—that this indeed should not be dissolved, such a thing is not found."

[1] 'Alternative refuge', SBB, vi, p. 160; 'Zuflucht', OB, p. 389 n. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 7.
[2] Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [111]. Cp. the phrases in Ch. 5 *b* § 10.
[3] Pāli *sambahulehi*, i.e. by the greater number, by a majority; Ap. H 3 *b* (*Powers*).
[4] Or, unanimity; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 1]. Cp. Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9].
[5] *Dhamma*; Ch. 22 *b* § 21 (*doctrine*); cp. Ch. 21 § 8; and Ch. 23 *b* § 3 (*Doctrine*). The Law inculcates the attainment of Nibbāna of selflessness in this life (Ap. C *b*) by self-transcendence (*samādhi*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]) through the practice of holy living (*brahma-cariya*; Ch. 5 *a* § 10) and the exercise of the four holy or divinely harmonious qualities (*brahma-vihārā*; Ap. F 2 *b*); see IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).
[6] Ānanda explains that each parish ('as many of us as live in the neighbourhood of a village—*ekaṃ gāmakkhettaṃ upanissāya*'; cp. Ch. 8 *f*; and Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [20]) governs itself in accordance with the Dhamma. The Sutta also deals with the ten qualities which inspire confidence (as in *Aṅg. Nik.* v, pp. 198–201) and with *iddhi* (Ap. I *b* § 3).
[7] Ap. A 1 *b* (3).
[8] The phrase *ekaṃ samayaṃ* (at one time) seems to imply a period somewhat remote and that Mahā-Kassapa is narrating events which are not recent. The time of the speech may perhaps be somewhat earlier than the first rainy season after the Buddha's death (see § 5 [3] below). The scene is not stated, but may be assumed to be a preliminary session preceding the first General Council and to be in the neighbourhood of the Sattapaṇṇa Cave (Ap. A 1 *b*, 14) overlooking Rājagaha, the speech being Mahā-Kassapa's introductory address.
[9] See Ch. 13 *a* § 4.
[10] Omitting the unrestrained lamentations of some of the brethren; and the self-restraint of others.
[11] Ch. 22 *b* § 28 [11] (*ere this*).

§ 2. [1 *cd*.] Then at that time, friends (*āvuso*) [a mendicant brother] Subhadda[1] by name, who had gone forth [from the world] in his old age, was sitting in that meeting (*parisāyaṃ*)[2] and . . . spoke to the mendicant brothers thus: "Enough, friends; mourn not, lament not, we are happily liberated from the great devotee (*mahā-samaṇena*)[3] and we have been oppressed by [him saying] This befits you, this befits you not; but now we will do what we wish, and we will not do what we do not wish."

§ 3. [1 *cd*.] Come[4] therefore, friends, let us [warned by Subhadda's example] chant together both the Doctrine[5] and the Discipline[6] before un-law (*a-dhammo*) flourishes and the Law is thrust aside, un-discipline flourishes and the Discipline is thrust aside; before those who teach un-law become powerful and those who teach the Law become weak, those who teach un-discipline become powerful and those who teach the Discipline become weak.'

§ 4. [2] [The Bhikkhus who were present on that occasion thus replied]: 'For this [purpose] indeed, revered sir, let the elder (*thero*)[7] choose mendicant brothers.' Then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa chose five hundred[8] saints[9] less one; and the mendicant brothers spoke thus to the venerable Mahā-Kassapa: 'The venerable Ānanda[10] here, revered sir, although [he is still] a learner (*sekho*)[11] is incapable of going astray (*a-gatiṃ*) through liking,[12] through enmity, through misapprehension or through fear, and much (*bahu*) of the Doctrine and the Discipline has been mastered by him in the presence of the Blessed One; therefore indeed, revered sir, let the elder choose also the venerable Ānanda.' And then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa chose the venerable Ānanda also.

§ 5. [3] Then the elder[13] mendicant brothers thought thus: 'Where now should we chant together the Doctrine and the Discipline?' And then the elder mendicant brothers thought thus: 'Rājagaha (*Rājagahaṃ*)[14] indeed is a good place for alms[15] with plentiful lodgings.[16] What now if we whilst spending the rainy season (*vassaṃ*)[17] at Rājagaha should chant together the Doctrine and the Discipline and no other mendicant brothers were to enter upon[18] the rainy season [retreat] at Rājagaha. [4] Then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa put the

[1] Ch. 22 *c* § 6 [20] n.

[2] Ap. H 3 *a* § 2 [21] (*session*). The arrival of Kassapa and his companions at Kusinārā before this moment is not stated, but perhaps may be assumed.

[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 8.

[4] *Handa*; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101].

[5] *Dhamma*; i.e. the *Sutta-Piṭaka*; see § 8 below. Cp. Ch. 23 *a* [9]; and Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4].

[6] *Vinaya*; Ch. 8 *e*; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2]; Ap. A 1 *b* (3).

[7] Ap. A 1 *b* (2).

[8] Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [15] n. Cp. Int. § 121.

[9] Pāli *arahant*; Ap. D *c*.

[10] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ap. A 1 *b* (8).

[11] Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [13]. 'Although he have not yet attained [to Nirvāna]', SBE, xx, p. 372.

[12] *Chanda*, Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1]; cp. *rāga* (Ap. D *a* § 10, ii).

[13] Ap. A 1 *b* (2).

[14] Int. § 125; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [5].

[15] Literally, 'a great pasturage (*mahā-gocaraṃ*)'; Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n.

[16] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [2].

[17] Ch. 8 *c*. See § 1 n above.

[18] Ch. 8 *c* § 1 [3]. 'Were to go up to Rājagaha for', SBE, xx, p. 372.

proposal[1] (*ñāpesi*) to the assembly saying: 'Let the assembly, friends, hear me. If it please the assembly let the assembly agree that these five hundred mendicant brothers whilst spending the rainy season at Rājagaha should chant together both the Doctrine and the Discipline and that the rainy season should not be spent at Rājagaha by other mendicant brothers.[2] This is the proposal (*ñatti*).[3] Let the assembly, friends, hear me. The assembly agrees that these five hundred mendicant brothers whilst spending the rainy season at Rājagaha should chant together the Doctrine and the Discipline and that the rainy season should not be spent at Rājagaha by other mendicant brothers. To whatsoever venerable [brother] seems good the appointment (*sammuti*) of these five hundred mendicant brothers to chant together the Doctrine and the Discipline whilst spending the rainy season at Rājagaha [together with the resolution] that the rainy season should not be spent at Rājagaha by other mendicant brothers, let him remain silent;[4] to whomsoever it does not seem good, let him speak. It is agreed by the assembly that these five hundred mendicant brothers whilst spending the rainy season at Rājagaha should chant together the Doctrine and the Discipline, and that the rainy season should not be spent at Rājagaha by other mendicant brothers. It seems good to the assembly; therefore it remains silent. Thus I take it.'[5]

§ 6. [5] And the elder mendicant brothers [so chosen] came to Rājagaha to chant together both the Doctrine and the Discipline. And the elder mendicant brothers thought thus: 'The Blessed One indeed, friends, praised the repairing[6] of what is broken and impaired. Come,[7] friends, let us during the first month repair what is broken and impaired; during the middle month[8] let us meet and chant together both the Doctrine and the Discipline.' Then during the first month they repaired what was broken and impaired.[9]

§ 7. [6] ...[10] [7] And then [in the second month when the assembly had met] the venerable Mahā-Kassapa put a proposal to the assembly saying: 'Let the assembly, friends, hear me; if it please the assembly I will question Upāli[11] regarding the Discipline.'[12] The venerable Upāli put a proposal to the assembly saying: 'Let the assembly, revered sirs, hear me; if it please the assembly, I when questioned by the venerable Mahā-Kassapa regarding the Discipline will reply.'

[1] Ch. 8 *e* § 3.

[2] All Bhikkhus staying within the parish boundaries (Ch. 8 *f*) would be required to attend.

[3] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4].

[4] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [5].

[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 5.

[6] *Aṅg. Nik.* iii, p. 263; *Culla-vagga*, VI. v. 2. Cp. *CV*, VI.xvii. 1, on contracts for building and repairs. See Int. § 190 (*architecture*).

[7] *Handa*; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [101].

[8] Ch. 8 *c* § 3 [2]. See Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [5].

[9] Doubtless in the Veḷuvana Vihāra and possibly in other monkish lodgings; Ch. 11 *c* § 24 [4] n.

[10] Ānanda attains arahatship at last (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [3]) on the night before the meeting as he is retiring to rest 'just before his head touched the pillow (*bimbohanaṃ*'; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [3]).

[11] Ap. A 1 *b* (3).

[12] *Vinaya*; Ch. 8 *e*.

Then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa spoke to the venerable Upāli thus: 'Where, friend Upāli, was the first Expulsion-rule[1] (*pārājikaṃ*) ordained?' ... 'Where was the second[2] Expulsion-rule ordained?' ... 'Where was the third[3] Expulsion-rule ordained?' ... 'Where was the fourth[4] Expulsion-rule ordained?' ... In this manner he questioned him regarding both the Disciplines (*ubhato-vinaye*)[5] and as questioned the venerable Upāli replied.

§ 8. Then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa put a proposal to the assembly saying: 'Let the assembly, friends, hear me; if it please the assembly I will question Ānanda[6] regarding the Doctrine.'[7] The venerable Ānanda put a proposal to the assembly saying: 'Let the assembly, revered sirs, hear me; if it please the assembly, I when questioned by the venerable Mahā-Kassapa regarding the Doctrine will reply.' Then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa spoke to the venerable Ānanda thus: (i) 'Where, friend Ānanda, was the Brahmajāla[8] (*Brahmajālaṃ*) spoken?' 'Between Rājagaha and Nālandā, revered sir, at the king's pleasure-house in Ambalaṭṭhikā.'[9] 'Concerning whom?' 'Suppiya[10] the Wanderer and Brahmadatta the [Brāhman] youth.'[11] And [so] the venerable Mahā-Kassapa questioned the venerable Ānanda both regarding the introduction (*nidānaṃ*)[12] of the Brahmajāla and regarding the person[13] [or persons concerned]. (ii) 'Then where, friend Ānanda, was the Sāmaññaphala[14] spoken?' 'At Rājagaha, revered sir, in Jīvaka's mango-grove.'[15] 'With whom?' 'With Ajātasattu[16] the son of the Videhan [consort].' And [so] the venerable Mahā-Kassapa questioned the venerable Ānanda both regarding the introduction of the Sāmaññaphala and regarding the person. In this manner he questioned him regarding the five Collections (*pañca nikāye*)[17] and as he questioned the venerable Ānanda replied.

[1] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*]. [2] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*].
[3] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*c*]. [4] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].
[5] Or, twofold Vinaya. 'That is, relating on the one hand to Bhikkhus, and on the other to Bhikkhunīs (not Sutta Vibhaṅga and Khandhakas)', SBE, xx, p. 376. This view, however, leaves the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga* unaccounted for (Ap. H 1, *Note*).—See Ch. 8 *e* § 3 classifying the *Pātimokkha* rules. These would come more conveniently here along with the *Vinaya* than as placed in the *Culla-vagga* text after the *Dhamma* (Discourses). [6] Ap. A 1 *b* (8).
[7] *Dhamma*, here the *Sutta-Piṭaka*, Ap. A 1 *a* (*Suttanta*). See § 3 above.
[8] The first Discourse in the *Dīgha-Nikāya*. Ch. 8 *j* § 11; Ap. E *c* i § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii). [9] Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [2].
[10] Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [1]. [11] *Mānava*; Ch. 13 *b* § 2.
[12] Or, connexion; Ch. 7 *a* § 15. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 5; and Ch. 1 § 1 n. 'Occasion', SBE, xx, p. 377. [13] *Puggala* sing.; personnel. Ap. E *b* § 2 [5].
[14] The second Discourse in *Dīgha-Nikāya*. Ch. 11 *c* § 23.
[15] Int. § 130. [16] Int. § 168.
[17] Int. § 14 (*Sutta-Piṭaka*); Ap. H 2, *Note*. The number of books then comprised in the fifth *Nikāya* is not defined, but it may be taken that it included only a small part of the present voluminous collection of poetical, imaginative, and generally supplementary pieces expressing the spirit rather than the letter of what may be called the later Law. That the assembly should have repeated together the five *Nikāyas* in their present bulky and elaborate form is obviously impossible, but it is possible that they recited the outlines or headings of a large number of Suttas with

§ 9. [9] . . .[1] Then the venerable Mahā-Kassapa put a proposal to the assembly saying: 'Let the assembly, friends, hear me. . . . If it please the assembly that which was not ordained [by the Blessed One] let the assembly not ordain, and that which was ordained let it not revoke; let it remain devoted to the precepts (*sikkhāpadesu*)[2] as they were ordained. This is the proposal . . . That which was not ordained [by the Blessed One] the assembly does not ordain, and that which was ordained it does not revoke; it remains devoted to the precepts as they were ordained. . . .'[3]

their settings and occasions and that we still have these outlines inbedded in a mass of later commentarial or elucidatory matter. The word *Sutta* means a thread, and *Sutta-Piṭaka* means literally a basket or collection of threads or outlines. In the Suttantas (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*) of the *Dīgha-Nikāya* we have the Discourses finally elaborated by later generations of the devout. As regards the first four *Nikāyas* or Collections it is possible that the assembly arranged many of the chief discourses according to length and grouped some others according to kindred themes or according to the graduated numerical system popular for memorizing purposes among Buddhists. It is also more than likely that the chief rules of the Vinaya had already been formulated and committed to memory as a code of behaviour for the brethren. The Third Basket or *Abhidhamma-Piṭaka* (Int. § 14) consisting of exegetical treatises had not yet been composed.

[1] See Ch. 8 *e* § 3.

[2] Ch. 22 *b* § 23.

[3] The *Culla-vagga* account makes the meeting proceed to charge Ānanda with negligence in omitting to request the Buddha to specify which were the greater and the lesser Rules (MPS, vi. 3) and in failing to persuade him to live on to the end of the Cycle (Ch. 11-*c* § 25 [43] n), as well as with errors of commission (Ch. 22 *c* 6 n). These charges come in so strangely that the passage may be put down as an interpolation (IN 6, *Canon*) reflecting the quarrel (Ch. 11 *d* § 7 n) between the scholastic, formalizing, and philosophizing party under the austere and ascetic Brāhman Mahā-Kassapa and the more practically ethical, secularizing and conservative party under the Kshatriya leader, the kindly, faithful, and nobly simple Ānanda. These dissensions reverberated more loudly at the time of the second General Council a hundred years later at Vesāli.

APPENDIXES

CONTAINING SUPPLEMENTARY TEXTS TAKEN FROM THE PĀLI

APPENDIX A

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter 1*)

THE CANON; PREVIOUS BIRTHS; PREVIOUS BUDDHAS

§ 1. The Pāli[1] Canon[2] and the Great Councils

a. The Three Piṭakas[3] *or Baskets* (*the Pāli Canonical Books*)[4]

[*Note.* The following passage, on the 'Disappearance of (Buddhist) Learning', is taken from the uncanonical *Anāgata-vaṃsa* (Chronicle of Future Events). This book contains a narrative of a prophecy, attributed to Gotama Buddha, on the gradual decline of the religion founded by him. The passage gives a fairly complete list of the Books of the Three Piṭakas or Sacred Canon, and of their expected gradual disappearance. The Books which are considered the latest and least authoritative, apparently, are expected to perish first. On this basis it appears that the *Abhi-dhamma Piṭaka*,[5] or 'Metaphysical' section of the Canon, is reputed the most recent; the *Suttanta-* (or *Sutta-*)[6] *Piṭaka*, or Discourses, the next; and the *Vinaya Piṭaka*,[7] or Disciplinary section (which in its present form includes the valuable narratives of the *Mahā-vagga*), the most ancient portion of the Canon. Of the *Suttanta-* (or *Sutta-*) *Piṭaka*, similarly on this supposition, the oldest portions are reputed to be the *Jātaka*[8] or Birth-Stories (of Gotama's previous existences) in the *Khuddaka Nikāya*[9] (Collection of Short Pieces), and the *Dīgha Nikāya* (Collection of Long Pieces, including the famous and beautiful *Mahā-parinibbāna Suttanta*, or Discourse of the Great Decease). The nucleus of the Jātaka consists of moral tales in verses with an ancient prose setting.[10] Prose additions of an exegetical nature have been made to these at later dates, but the tales themselves undoubtedly, at least in many cases, are ancient, and some of them are illustrated in the carvings of the Mauryan stūpas at Bharhut and Sānchi erected about the close of the third century B.C.[11] These moral tales, however, at least in their

[1] Literally 'line'; thence 'sacred text'.

[2] *Tipiṭaka*, or Three Baskets. Int. §§ 1, 14, 21; IN 6; Ch. 1 § 10; Ch. 11 *c* (*Rājagaha*).

[3] Ap. H 1 § 5.

[4] Much useful information regarding the contents of the Pāli Canon is to be found in a convenient form in the Appendix to E. J. Thomas's, *Life of Buddha*, 1927.

[5] See text below; Int. § 14; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [6] n; Ch. 16 *b*. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3] (*anudhamma*).

[6] *Sutta* means literally 'thread' and thence connected or ordered discourse, and is common to Buddhist and Brāhmanic literature (Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502]). In the word *suttanta* the termination *-anta* (end) seems generally to have very little force and any difference of meaning between the term *suttanta* and the shorter word *sutta* has often practically disappeared (Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3]). A *suttanta* may be a fully expanded and exegetically expounded *sutta*. The discourses of the *Dīgha Nikāya* Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 2; Ch. 20 (*Suttanta*); Ch. 21 § 19 [8]; Ch. 23 *b* § 8 n.

[7] Int. § 13; Ch. 8 *a* [4] n.

[8] Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 (*Sasa Jātaka*). Cp. Ap. B. The *Cariyā Piṭaka* (now the 15th book of the *Khuddaka Nikāya*) gives an all-verse rendering of the ethical pick of the *Jātaka* stories including the *Sasa-Jātaka* or Hare birth-story as illustrating the virtues called the Ten Perfections. (Ap. F 2 *a*).

[9] Ap. C *b* (*Dhammapada*).

[10] Cp. RDBI, pp. 206–8.

[11] Int. § 52; RDBI, p. 198.

Buddhist dress, cannot be older than the nucleus of the Suttas (Discourses) in the Nikāyas, though they represent a more primitive and popular form of moral teaching. The Introduction[1] to the Jātaka (including a Life of Gotama Buddha) is non-canonical, but is based upon the Canonical Books, having been compiled probably in the fifth century A.D., in Ceylon. Being of comparatively late date, it has added many marvels to the simpler narratives of the Canon; but its marvels are far exceeded by still later Burmese, Tibetan, and Chinese narratives evidently based upon it or derived from the same source.[2] This would appear to justify the reverse process of simplification—the removal of exaggeration and of metaphysical intricacies —here attempted.]

An-āgata-Vaṃsa (Chronicle of Future Events), Journal of the PTS (1886), 33 ff.[3] *The Disappearance of* [*Buddhist*] *Learning.*[4]

As long as the text (*pāli*)[5] of the word of the Buddha in the Three Baskets (*Te-piṭake Buddha-vacane*) with the commentary (*s'aṭṭhakathā*) remains, so long indeed the disappearance of [Buddhist] learning (*pariyatti antaradhānaṃ*) will not happen. As time elapses there will be rājas of no family (*a-kulino*) and without religion (*a-dhammikā*); the courtiers and officials will be without religion; and then the inhabitants of the kingdom will be without religion. On account of their want of religion the sky (*devo*)[6] will not rain duly, so that the crops will not develop duly. Upon the failure of these the requisite-givers will not be able to give the requisites (*paccaye*)[7] to the mendicant-brothers' community (*bhikkhu-saṃghassa*); and the mendicant brothers not receiving the requisites will not hold classes of pupils (*antevāsikanam*).[8] As time elapses learning will fall away. As it perishes, first the Great Treatise (*Mahā-pakarāṇaṃ*)[9] will perish. When this perishes the Yamaka, the Kathāvatthu,[10] the Puggalapaññatti, the Dhātukathā, the Vibhaṇga, and the Dhammasangiṇi[11] also [will perish]. The Abhidhamma Piṭaka[12] having perished the Suttanta Piṭaka[13] will fall away. When the Suttanta perishes, first the Aṇguttara Nikāya[14] will perish; when the Aṇguttara Nikāya perishes, the Saṃyutta Nikāya,[15] the Majjhima

[1] Int. § 1.
[2] RDB, pp. 11–15; cp. ThB, pp. xxi–xxiv.
[3] Cited in H. C. Warren's, *Buddhism in Translations* (1922), pp. 481–6. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [6].
[4] The original Pāli of the following passage on the 'Disappearance of Learning' is given (ed. J. Minayeff) in the *Journal of the PTS* of 1886, p. 35; and is cited in D. Andersen's admirable Pāli Reader (Copenhagen, 1910), p. 102. This passage immediately follows the extract given in Ap. G 1 *b* § 6 (*Anāgata-Vaṃsa*).
[5] Literally, 'line'. Int. § 21.
[6] Int. § 35; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 28 [3].
[7] Ap. H 1 (iii).
[8] Ch. 8, i.
[9] i.e. the *Paṭṭhāna*, the seventh and last part of the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*.
[10] Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.
[11] The first part of the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*.
[12] 'Metaphysical' (or Exposition) Basket, or Collection of treatises on the higher Law. See *Note* above; Ch. 4 § 5 n. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 9.
[13] 'Discourse' Basket, or Collection of Sermons. Ap. H 2, *Note* (*Nikāyas*); and Ch. 23 *b* § 8 (*Doctrine*).
[14] Collection of pieces arranged according to the numbers of the headings: the Units, the Twos, the Threes, &c. Ch. 10 *c* (*Units*).
[15] Collection of pieces classified according to subject.

Nikāya,[1] the Dīgha Nikāya,[2] (and) the Khudda Nikāya[3] will fall away. Along with the Vinaya Piṭaka[4] they will still preserve the Jātaka (*Jātakaṃ*). But the well-conducted will still preserve the Vinaya Piṭaka; as time elapses they not being able to preserve the Jātaka also, first the Vessantara Jātaka[5] will fall away; when the Vessantara Jātaka perishes . . .[6] the Apaṇṇaka Jātaka[7] will fall away. The Jātaka having perished, they will still preserve the Vinaya Piṭaka.[8] As time elapses the Vinaya Piṭaka will fall away. As long as a four-lined verse (*catu-ppādikā gāthā*) shall be forthcoming among men so long the disappearance of learning will not happen. When a pious rāja has had a purse of a thousand [pieces] placed in a golden casket on the back of an elephant, and to the sound of the drum twice and thrice shall proclaim in the city 'Whosoever knows a verse spoken by the Enlightened Ones (*Buddhehi*),[9] let him take this sum of a thousand pieces (*sahassa-kahāpanaṃ*)[10] together with the elephant,' and, not having found a single four-lined verse known, shall take back the purse of a thousand [pieces] into his palace, then the disappearance of learning indeed will happen.

b. The Great Councils[11]

[*Note*. According to the tradition the Books of the Pāli Canon were collected orally at the first Great Council held at Rājagaha immediately after the death of the Buddha; and were revised and enlarged at the second Great Council held at Vesāli a hundred years later, and further revised at later Councils. It seems likely that collections of the Vinaya or rules of the Order, and of the Suttas or discourses[12] of the Buddha, had been made already at Rājagaha and at Sāvatthi, and also at other large Buddhist centres, before the death of the Buddha; and it is probable that such collections of rules and discourses were collated and revised orally at the first Council. The details of the traditionary accounts of these transactions may not be exact,[13] but the general outline of facts recorded has every appearance of verisimilitude. According to the tradition the Books of the Pāli Canon were taken orally to Ceylon[14] by Prince Mahinda,[15] the son or younger brother of the Emperor Asoka, about the middle of the third

[1] Collection of medium-lengthed pieces.
[2] Collection of long pieces.
[3] Collection of short pieces. *Khudda*, or *Khuddaka* means 'small'. The *Khuddaka*, or fifth Nikāya, as we now have it, comprises fifteen parts, including the *Khuddaka-pātha* (Ap. G 2 *a* § 9), *Dhammapada* (Ap. B *a* § 7), *Udāna* (Ch. 4 § 10 [i. 3]; Ch. 10 *c*, n), *Iti-vuttaka* (Ap. F 1 *b* § 5), *Sutta-Nipāta* (Ch. 4 § 3 n; Ch. 8 *h* § 2; Ch. 8 *l*; Ap. F 1 *b* § 6; Ap. F 2 *c* §§ 2, 3; Ap. G 2 *a* § 8), *Jātaka*, *Buddha-vaṃsa* (Ap. A 2 *a*; Ap. C *b*, *Note*), the *Thera-gāthā* and *Therī-gāthā* (Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 9), and the *Apadāna* (Ch. 1 § 8 n). Of all these parts added to the Nikāya at various dates the *Anāgata-Vaṃsa* mentions only the *Jātaka* by which is doubtless meant the verse-prose nucleus of the Jātaka as we now have it. Ap. H 4, *Note*.
[4] 'Rule' Basket, or Collection of Regulations of the Saṃgha. Ch. 8 *e*.
[5] The last tale in the *Jātaka* book. Ch. 10 *d* § 3; Ap. A 2 *a*, n.
[6] Omitting the titles of the sacred *Jātaka* tales.
[7] The first tale in the *Jātaka* book, 'The Unshakeable'.
[8] The *Vinaya Piṭaka*, comprising the *Pātimokkha* (Ap. H 2), *Mahā-vagga*, and *Culla-vagga* (see *Note* above), professedly contains nothing that was not laid down by the Teacher himself (see CV, XI. i. 9) but plainly contains rules formulated at widely different periods (cp. OB, p. 381–2; Ch. 4 § 9).
[9] Ap. A 2 *d*.
[10] Int. § 189 (*money*); Ch. 13 *a* § 7 [1] n. A 'shower' of such coins is mentioned in *Dhammapada*, verse 186.
[11] IN 6; Int. §§ 3, 9, 12.
[12] Ap. H 5.
[13] Cp. KM, pp. 101, 103, 110.
[14] Int. § 1.
[15] Int. § 21.

century B.C., and were there reduced to writing in the first century B.C., in the reign of King Abhaya Vattagāmini. The Sinhalese Commentaries upon the Canonical Books were translated, or re-translated, into Pāli by the famous Buddhaghosha, who arrived in Ceylon from northern India early in the fifth century A.D. That he brought with him a knowledge of the Pāli or Hinayana canonical books,[1] and perhaps written copies of the same, from Magadha, the country of their origin, seems unquestionable.]

Dīpa-vaṃsa (*Island Chronicle*)[2] *IV*, *v*, *1–23*.[3]

(1) The community of mendicant-brothers, seven hundred thousand in number, was assembled, saintly (*arahā*),[4] freed from taint (*khīn-āsavā*),[5] all having reached the summit of virtue.

(2) They all having considered, having selected the best, formed a committee (*saṃgha-sammataṃ*) of Five Hundred Elders (*therānaṃ*).[6]

(3) The famous Kassapa,[7] chief of those practising the Dhutanga-precepts,[8] Ānanda, [chief] of those[9] deeply learned[10] in the teaching of the Victorious One,[11] (*Jina-sāsane*), the learned Upāli[12] [of those versed] in the Rules (*vinaye*).[13]

(4) Anuruddha[14] [of those versed] in divine-vision (*dibba-cakkhumhi*),[15] Vaṇgīsa the dialectic (*paṭi-bhānavā*).[16]

(5) Kaccāna[17] [chief] in analysis (*vibhajjanamhi*),[18] Koṭṭhita[19] in the science of exegesis (*paṭi-sambhidā*),[20] and many other great Elders (*mahā-therā*) were there, the first depositories [of the Doctrine].

(6) The Collection of Doctrine and Rules (*dhamma-vinaya-saṃgaho*)[21] [made] by these and the other dutiful, virtuous Elders, the Five Hundred Elders, is called the Collection made by the Elders, or the Elders' Doctrine (*thera-vādo*).[22]

[1] Otherwise known as the *Thera-vāda* or Doctrine according to the Elders.

[2] The *Dīpa-vaṃsa* or Chronicle of the Island of Ceylon was composed, or rather collected and compiled from ancient sources, in the fourth century A.D. (RDBI, p. 277). Int. § 21; Ch. 8 *e* § 4.

[3] The *Dīpa-vaṃsa* narrative commences with events following immediately on the death of the Buddha (Ch. 22, MPS, 62). For the First Council compare CV, XI, and for the Second Council CV, XII (SBE, XX).

[4] KM, p. 60. Ap. C *b*, *Note*; Ap. D *c*.

[5] Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]. Cp. Ap. C *a* § 1 (94); Ap. C *b* § 2. See KM, p. 53.

[6] The title Elder (*thera*) is given to the immediate disciples of the Buddha and to the leaders of the early Buddhist Church. See *sloka* 6 below; Ch. 5 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 5 *c* § 8 n; Ch. 8 *e* § 3; Ch. 23 *b* §§ 4, 5; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note* (*Sāriputta*). Cp. Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [14]; Ch. 8 *g* § 2; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [4]; Ch. 15 *a* § 9.

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 2; Ch. 10 *c* (4); Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [13]; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 23 *b*.

[8] Rules of ascetic purity. Ch. 10 *c* (4); Ap. H 4 *c*. See KM, pp. 75, 76.

[9] See (8) below.

[10] Ch. 10 *c* (32); cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 7 n.

[11] i.e. the words of the Buddha. Int. § 187 n, and Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2].

[12] Ch. 8 *e* § 2; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 23 *b* § 7 [7]; Ap. H 1, *Note* (*cap. v*) n.

[13] Int. § 56; Ch. 8 *e*; Ch. 10 *c* (41); Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2]; Ch. 23 *b* § 3.

[14] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].

[15] KM, p. 20; SBE, xi, pp. 209, 216. Ap. I *b* § 3 (*divine eye*).

[16] Ch. 10 *c* [3] (25). See KM, p. 60.

[17] Ch. 10 *c* (10); Ch. 17 *b* § 2; Ap. B *c* § 5 [3].

[18] See A. B. Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 152.

[19] Ch. 10 *c* (31); Ch. 15 *a* § 9; Ap. D *c* § 3 [6] n.

[20] Ch. 10 *c* (31). See KM, p. 60.

[21] Ch. 6 *a* § 13; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 16, 21. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2], where the distinction between Doctrine and Rules is emphasized.

[22] Int. § 1. See *sloka* 2 above.

(7) Having questioned Upāli regarding the Rules and Ānanda regarding the Dhamma,[1] the mendicant brothers made the Dhamma Collection and the Vinaya (*dhamma-saṇgahaṃ vinayaṃ cāpi*).

(8) The much-sought teachers Mahā-Kassapa the Elder (*thero*) and Anuruddha, the mindful Upāli and the deeply learned Ānanda.[2]

(9) And other well-known disciples (*sāvakā*) praised by the teacher[3] (*Satthu-vannitā*), masters of the science of exegesis (*patta-paṭisambhidā*),[4] firm, possessing the six higher forms of knowledge (*chal-abhiññā*),[5] great in power (*mah'-iddhikā*),[6] masters of meditation and ecstasy (*samādhi-jhānaṃ*),[7] perfect in the true-doctrine[8]—

(10) All the Five Hundred Elders, having acquired the nine-fold (*navaṇgaṃ*)[9] teaching of the Victorious One (*Jina-sāsanaṃ*)[10] from the Buddha[11] himself, preserved it.

(11) Having heard in the presence of the Blessed One (*Bhagavato*) and having received in his presence both the Doctrine (*dhammaṃ*) and the Rules (*vinayaṃ*) complete as shown by the Buddha.

(12) The Elders, preserving the Doctrine, preserving the Rules, all of them acquainted with the Traditions (*āgat'-āgamā*),[12] reliable, sure, like to the Teacher, ever reverend.

(13) [Having received it from the Chief—for the Tathāgatas[13] (so-goers, leaders) are chiefs of the Doctrine—][14] the first or chief depositories made the great (or chief) Collection (*saṃgahaṃ*); the whole is called the Elders' Doctrine (*thera-vādo*) or original (first) Doctrine (*agga-vādo*).

(14) At the delightful Sattapaṇṇi-cave (*Sattapaṇṇi-guhe*)[15] the Five Hundred leading Elders sat and arranged the ninefold (*navaṇganaṃ*)[16] teaching of the Teacher (*Satthu-sāsanaṃ*).[17]

(15) [The Sutta, Geyya, Veyyākaraṇa, Gāthā, Udāna, Itivuttaka, Jātaka, Abbhuta and Vedalla are the ninefold teaching of the Teacher.][18]

[1] CV, xi. 8 specifies the five Nikāyas and names the first two Suttas of the first Nikāya.

[2] See (3) above; Int. § 30; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 10 *c* (32); Ch. 23 *b* §§ 4, 8; Ap. A 2 *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [3]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [4].

[3] Ap. E *b* § 2.

[4] See KM, p. 60.

[5] KM, p. 60; A. B. Keith, *B.Ph.*, pp. 130, 132. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6, *abhiññā*).

[6] KM, p. 60; SBE, xi, p. 40 n; Ap. I *b*.

[7] KM, p. 56; Ap. F 2, iv (*samādhi*); Ap. I *a* (*jhāna*).

[8] Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [2].

[9] KM, p. 7. See *slokas* 14 and 15 below. The whole of *sloka* 10, which greatly impedes the narrative, is possibly an interpolation.

[10] Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2]. Cp. Ap. I *b* § 4 [8]; also Ch. 22 *b* § 21 (*Word*).

[11] Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1] n.

[12] Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [6], [8]; Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2]. The Āgamas (Traditions) are the first four Nikāyas of the *Sutta Piṭaka* (KM, p. 1 n).

[13] ThB, p. 1 n; Ap. A 2 *b* (*Buddhavaṃsa*, ii. 62); Ap. A 2 *c*.

[14] The words in square brackets are apparently interpolated.

[15] Int. § 129; Ch. 23 *b* 1 n.

[16] KM, p. 7. See *sloka* 10 above.

[17] Ch. 5 *b* § 2.

[18] The words in square brackets are apparently an explanatory interpolation. They are not supported by the CV. From the context it would appear that the first Aṇga contained the first four Nikāyas of the *Sutta Piṭaka*, whilst the remaining eight Aṇgas contained portions of what is now the *Abhidhamma Piṭaka*, as well as parts of what is now the fifth Nikāya of the *Sutta Piṭaka*. The fifth Nikāya, which differs markedly from the first four Nikāyas, was formerly included in the third Piṭaka (RDB, p. 18). The growth of the last Piṭaka may be compared with that of the Fourth Veda (Int. § 176).

(16) The Elders arranged this indestructible true-doctrine (*saddhammaṃ*),[1] namely, the Divisions[2] and the Fifties[3] (*vagga-paññāsakaṃ*), the Classification[4] (*saṃyuttaṃ*) and the Enumeration[5] (*nipātakaṃ*), and [thus] made the so-called Basket of Tradition (*āgama-piṭakaṃ*),[6] revered as the Sutta [or Outlines of Discourses].

. . . .[7]

(21) Thus [was] complete in every part the Collection of Dhamma and Vinaya (*dhamma-vinaya-saṃgahaṃ*), well arranged and protected by the omniscience of the Teacher (*Satthu sabbaññutāya*).

(22) With Mahā-Kassapa as their head the Elders, Five Hundred [in number], knowing the doubt of the people, made the Dhamma Collection (*dhamma-saṃgahaṃ*).

A 2. Early Legends[8]

a. The 'Record of the Far Past'[9] in the Buddha-vaṃsa[10] and the Jātaka Commentary:[11] Reflections of the Bodhisatta Sumedha.

[*Note.* The following reflections of Sumedha,[12] the Bodhisatta,[13] who subsequently became Gotama Buddha,[14] are quoted in the Introduction to the Jātaka, and come originally from the *Buddha-vaṃsa*. They may well be attributed to Gotama, the occasion being similar.[15] The twenty-four previous Buddhas of this poetic chronicle are possibly a later elaboration of the fact that Gotama Buddha thought that his doctrine was no new revelation, but simple truth and reason, which others in previous generations might equally have taught,[16] and which future Teachers might have to rediscover. The poetic narratives recounting the life of Gotama Buddha, or the lives of the Buddhas preceding him and his own previous existences during their times, appear to be necessarily later in date than the prose accounts of the events of the life of the Teacher, which are to be found embedded in the early prose canonical books. Immediately after Gotama's death the disciples held a great Council to establish the Vinaya and Sutta Piṭakas. They must have had an accurate recollection of the living human Teacher, and embodied this in the form of the Piṭakas adopted by them. Great changes no doubt have been made in the Piṭakas since, but these have probably been rather by way of addition than of alteration of the second texts. The continuous poetic narratives, such as the *Sutta-Nipāta*

[1] Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [2].
[2] i.e. the Divisions (*vaggā*) of the *Dīgha Nikāya*.
[3] i.e. the groups of fifty discourses in the *Majjhima Nikāya*.
[4] i.e. the *Saṃyutta Nikāya*.
[5] i.e. the *Aṅguttara Nikāya*.
[6] KM, p. 1 n.
[7] Omitting repetitions; a miraculous earthquake; and mention of the gods or spirits, Māra and Brahmā.
[8] Int. § 89.
[9] Ch. 10 *d* § 3.
[10] The *Buddha-vaṃsa* is the Chronicle of the twenty-five Buddhas in verse. Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 10 *d*; Ap. A 1 *a*, note on *Khudda-Nikāya*; Ap. A 2 *b*; Ap. A 2 *c*; Ap. F 2 *a*.
[11] Ch. 1 § 1.
[12] Int. § 31.
[13] A Bodhisatta is a Sage destined to become a Buddha in a later birth, or at a later stage of his existence. Ch. 1 (i) n, and § 11 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 4 (5); Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ap. B *a*; Ap. B *c* § 1; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]. Cp. IN 9 *a*; Int. § 102; Ch. 1 § 6 (*Mahā-satta*); Ch. 4 § 2 (*Mahā-purisa*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 (*satta*).
[14] For his subsequent existence as the Bodhisatta Vesantara see Ch. 4 § 4 n; Ap. A 1 *a* (*V. Jātaka*).
[15] Ch. 1 § 1 n.
[16] Ap. G 1.

poems and the *Buddha-vaṃsa*, and again the still older ballads or verses[1] on isolated events were composed for popular hearing, doubtless by persons far removed from the original inner circle of disciples who shaped the original books still probably preserved within the voluminous matter of the present Canon.]

Buddha-vaṃsa, II (*Dipaṇkarassa Bhagavato Vaṃsa*), 1–27.[2]

(1) A hundred thousand cycles (*kappe*)[3] and four immensities (*asaṇkhiye*) ago, [there was] a fair and delightful city[4] called Amara,

(2) Abounding in food and drink, full of the ten noises,[5] the noise of elephants, the noise of horses, and of drums, conch-shells and chariots,

(3) And the cry of [sellers of] food and drink; a town possessing every requisite, pursuing every trade.

(4) Possessing the seven jewels,[6] thronged with people of diverse races, prosperous [as] a city of the gods; the home of virtuous actions.

(5) In [this] city of Amaravati [I[7] being then] a Brāhman named Sumedha, possessing many millions, the owner of vast wealth,

(6) Studious, learned in mantras,[8] versed in the three Vedas,[9] perfect in the signs (*lakkhaṇe*)[10] and in the tradition and in right observance,

[1] Ch. 2 § 2 (*udāna*); Ch. 4 § 9 n (*udāna*); Ch. 5 *a* §§ 6 (*gāthā*) and 6 n; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [2]; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 8, 16; Ch. 7 *c* n; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [4] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 3 n, 6 [4]; Ch. 10 *c* (25); Ch. 11 *c* § 27 [2]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [9], [12] n; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 7 n; Ch. 13 *e* §§ 1 n, 2 [2]; Ch. 14 *a* § 5 [3]; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 3 [5], 8 n; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 3 [2] n, 5 [189], 8 [2], 9 n, 13 [6], 16 n; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 3 n, 15 [4]; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36]; Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [153]; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56] n; Ch. 16 *b* § 2 [6] n; Ch. 17 *d* §§ 3 [3] n, 4 [2]; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [262]; Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [5]; Ch. 18 *c* §§ 1 [101] n, 5 [3], 6 [8]; Ch. 18 *e* §§ 1, 2 [5] n; Ch. 19 *b* §§ 3 [5], 11 [7]; Ch. 20 § 11 [29] n; Ch. 21 §§ 16, 17 [3]; Ch. 22 *a* §§ 4 n, 8 [37] n, [41] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 27; Ch. 22 *c* § 12 n; Ap. B *a* § 1; Ap. D *a* § 3; Ap. D *b* § 6 [3] n; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [53]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6]; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* and § 8. 'The number of verses in the Nikāyas is approximately as follows: Dīgha (two volumes only) 150, Majjhima (the whole) 27, Saṃyutta (the whole) 950, Aṇguttara (the whole) 525', *Preface to Dīgha-Nikāya*, PTS, vol. ii, p. vii—to which number must be added some 146 in *Dīgha*, vol. iii. We have here a more or less continuous account of Gotama's life and doctrine rendered into verse (*udāna* and *gāthā*). It is to be remarked that CV, v. xxxiii. 1, records how two Brāhman Bhikkhus observing that 'the word of the Buddha' is being taught in varying dialects offer to render it into verse (*chandaso*), but are forbidden to do so (SBE, xx, p. 150 n; *Vin. Piṭ.*, Oldenberg's Int., p. xlviii. See IN 6, *Canon*, n).

[2] These *slokas* or couplets are the same as verses 12–37 quoted in the Introduction to the Jātaka. Dīpaṇkara was the first of the 24 named Buddhas (Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*) who preceded Gotama. It was during his life that the Bodhisatta Sumedha began the effort which culminated in his ultimate rebirth as Gotama Buddha.

[3] Int. § 107.

[4] Int. § 190 (*streets*).

[5] Only six of the ten city-noises are here mentioned. The full list is given in the Mahā-sudassana-sutta, i. 3, including tabors, lutes, singing, cymbals, and gongs, but omitting the conch-shell (see H. C. Warren, *Buddhism in Translations*, 1922, pp. 5, 101; SBE, xi, p. 249); and in the *Mahā-parinibbāna Suttanta*, v. 18 (SBE, iii, p. 162).

[6] Or, treasures. Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 3 n; Ch. 17 *a* [4]; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [18] n. These were 'The wheel of empire (Ch. 2 § 4 n), the elephant, the horse, the gem, the empress, the treasurer and the crown-prince [or adviser]', MPS, v. 18, Warren, *Bm. in Tr.*, p. 101; also *Dīgha Nik.* iii, p. 59; *Mahā-Sudassana Suttanta*, i. 11, 21, 26, 31, 36, 41, 46 (SBE, xi, 251 ff.). Cp. also Ch. 7 *a* [10]; Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [91].

[7] The speaker is Gotama Buddha to whom the whole narrative of the *Buddha-vaṃsa* is attributed.

[8] i.e. incantations (Int. § 188).

[9] Int. § 176.

[10] Ch. 1 § 6 (*signs*).

(7) Sitting in seclusion I[1] then thought thus:[2] 'Full of sorrow indeed is repeated existence (*puna-bhavo*)[3] and the dissolution of the body.

(8) I am by nature subject to [earthly] existence[4] (*jāti-dhammo*), [that is,] subject to old age (*jarā-dhammo*) and to disease; therefore I will seek a safe Nirvāna (*nibbutiṃ*),[5] without old age (*a-jaraṃ*) and without death (*a-maraṃ*).[6]

(9) What if I should reject this foul body, this mass of corruption, and should go on without regret and without regard.

(10) There is, there must be, a way (*maggo*), it cannot but be that there is one; I will seek this way, that I may be released from [individual] existence (*bhavato*).[7]

(11) Just as where sorrow is found, there also joy is found, so where [individual] existence (*bhave*)[8] is found, its opposite (*vi-bhavo*)[9] must be looked for.

(12) Just as where heat is found, there, as opposite, cold is found, so where the triple fire[10] is found, Nirvāna (*nibbānaṃ*)[11] must be looked for.

(13) And just as where evil (*pāpe*) is found, there also good (*kalyānaṃ*)[12] is found, so also where [earthly] existence (*jāti*)[13] is found, one must look there also for its contrary (*a-jātiṃ*).

(14) Just as when a man having stepped into mire sees a brimming lake, if he does not seek the lake, that is not the fault of the lake;

(15) So where the lake of deathlessness[14] (*amatan-tale*) is found, that washes away passion, if he does not seek the lake, the fault is not in the lake of deathlessness.

(16) Just as when a man is encircled by foes and a path of escape is found, if he does not flee, that is not the fault of the pathway;

(17) So when a man is encircled by passion[15] and a path to bliss (*sive*) is found, if he does not seek that way, the fault is not in the pathway to bliss.

(18) And just as when a man is diseased and a healer is found, if he does not ask him to heal the disease, the fault is not in the healer;

(19) So if one sorrowful and oppressed by the disease of passion does not seek the spiritual-teacher (*ācariyaṃ*),[16] that is not a fault in the instructor (*vinayake*).

[1] Sumedha.

[2] The ideas here expressed must have been shared by innumerable Hindu ascetics during the course of long ages, and doubtless are practically those which actuated Gotama at the period when he resolved to renounce the world.

[3] Int. § 24.

[4] Ch. 1 § 11; see *sloka* 13 below; Ap. F 1 *c* [161].

[5] Cp. *sloka* 12 below; Ap. C *a*.

[6] See *sloka* 15 below.

[7] See *sloka* 11 below; Ch. 5 § 6; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[8] Cp. *sloka* 10 above.

[9] Ch. 5 § 6; Ap. D *a* § 1.

[10] i.e. lust, hatred, and infatuation (*rāga, dosa, moha*; Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 4 § 17 n; Ap. D *a* § 10). It would appear that Infatuation means delusion as to the permanence of the skandhas or *khandhā*, i.e. individuality (Ap. E *a*).

[11] Cp. *sloka* 8 above; Ap. C *a*; Ap. C *b* § 7.

[12] Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6]. Cp. *kusalaṃ* in *sloka* 27 below.

[13] See *sloka* 8 above; Ch. 1 § 11.

[14] i.e. selflessness, the realization of the union of the mortal individual self with the Whole or All. See *sloka* 8 above; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [11]; Ap. C *a* § 1 (95); Ap. C *b* § 2. Cp. Ap. F 2, iv (*sammā-samādhi*); Ap. G 2 *a*.

[15] The Pāli word here used for passion is *kilesa*; Ch. 2 § 2.

[16] Ch. 8 *g*.

(20) And just as a man might loathe and cast off a corpse fastened to his neck, and go forward glad, free, master of himself;

(21) Even so rejecting this foul body, this mass of corruption, let me go on without regret and without regard.

(22) Just as men and women leave excrement upon a refuse heap, and depart without regret and without regard;

(23) Even so will I reject this body, this mass of corruption, as one might leave filth in a foul place, and go forward.

(24) Just as the owners reject an old ship broken and leaky, and depart without regret and without regard;

(25) Even so will I reject this body, oozing from nine apertures, and go on my way, as those owning the derelict ship.

(26) Just as a man who carries wares, walking in the company of robbers, seeing the danger of losing his property, evades them and departs;

(27) Even so, this body [being] like a great robber, I will elude it, because of the danger of losing that which is good,[1] and go on my way.'

b. Gotama's Life foretold in summary in the Buddha-vaṃsa[2]

[*Note.* The 26th part of the *Buddha-vaṃsa* contains a summary of the Life of Gotama Buddha, the Sakya-muni,[3] in 25 *slokas* or couplets. This includes mention of Kapilavatthu[4] as the capital of the Sakyas, and names the Rāja Suddhodana[5] and Māyā Devī[6] as the future Buddha's parents, Bhaddakaccā as his wife,[7] and Rāhula[8] as his son, and also mentions among his followers his two chief disciples, whom it calls Kolita and Upatissa, these latter being alternative names of Moggallāna and Sāriputta[9] respectively, and the two chief among his women disciples Khemā[10] and Uppalavaṇṇā. After the names of the two chief disciples mention is made of Ānanda,[11] the 'ministrant' (*upaṭṭhāka*) or personal attendant of the Buddha; and after the names of the two chief women disciples there is mention of Nanda-mātā, that is Mahā-Pajāpatī,[12] who was the mother of Nanda,[13] and the foster-mother of the future Buddha, and mention is also made of the chief lay followers[14] (*upāsakā*). A still briefer summary of the Life of Gotama appears in *slokas* 60–69 of the second part of the *Buddha-*

[1] The Pāli word here used for good is *kusalaṃ*; cp. *kalyānaṃ* in *sloka* 13 above.

[2] Ap. A 2 *a*; Ap. A 2 *c*; Ch. 10 (*Buddha-vaṃsa Commentary*).

[3] Ch. 1 § 6 n.

[4] Int. § 135; see *sloka* 62 below.

[5] See *sloka* 66 below.

[6] Ch. 1 § 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (534).

[7] Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 10 *c* [5] (58). She is called Yasodharā in the commentary on the *Thera-gāthā* (*Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 183). Neither name occurs in *Vin. Piṭ.* or the first four Nikāyas, but the Bhaddakaccā is mentioned again in *Buddha-vaṃsa* (xxvi. 15), and a Bhaddakaccanā once in *Aṅg. Nik.* (Ch. 10 *c*, 58).

[8] Ch. 2 § 1. The thera Rāhula is called the 'own son of Gotama (*Gotamassa Bhagavato atra-jo*)' in the *Apadāna* (Ch. 1 § 8 n), but is not said there to be the child of Bhaddakaccā or Yasodharā. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 9 n.

[9] SBE, xiii, p. 149; KM, p. 25; ThB, p. 95. See *sloka* 67 below; Ch. 16 *d* § 4 [4] n; Ap. G 1 *c* (Bhābrā Rock Edict). Sāriputta and Moggallāna died shortly before the death of the Buddha, and therefore are not mentioned in the list of chief Theras, who had received their teaching direct from the Buddha, and who met together in the First Council (Ap. A 1 *b*, *Dīpavaṃsa*, IV. v. 2).

[10] KM, pp. 31–2; ThB, p. 189; see *sloka* 68 below.

[11] ThB, p. 110; see *sloka* 68 below. Int. § 30; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ap. A 1 *b* (8).

[12] KM, p. 31; ThB, p. 26; Ch. 12 *d* (CV, x. i). Also Ch. 7 *b* § 3 (*Nanda*).

[13] Ch. 7 *b* § 3.

[14] Ch. 8 *l*. The names are Citta (Ch. 10 *c*, 63) and Hatthālavaka (Ch. 10 *c*, 64).

vaṃsa in the form of a prophecy by the first[1] of the Buddhas, Dīpaṇkara, regarding the ultimate and far-distant Buddhahood of the Bodhisatta Sumedha, who was destined to be re-born as Gotama, the historical Buddha. Dīpaṇkara was the Buddha of the period when Sumedha the ascetic made his resolution to become a future Buddha, and before whom Sumedha lay to enable him to cross over a miry place. In this shorter summary also mention is made of his two chief disciples and of the two chief women followers as above. The briefer summary is given here.]

Buddha-vaṃsa, ii. 60–9.[2]

(60) Dīpaṇkara, knowing [all] worlds, receiver of votive offerings, standing where I laid my head, uttered this speech:

(61) 'Behold this austere ascetic, matted-haired (*jaṭilaṃ*)![3] Countless cycles hence he will become a Buddha in this world (*loke*).

(62) Then going forth from pleasant Kapilavatthu (*Kapilavihaya*)[4] [to be] the Leader (*Tathāgato*),[5] making the struggle of profound meditation (*padhānaṃ*),[6] having gone through hard austerities,

(63) And having seated himself at the foot of the Ajapāla-tree,[7] and there having received the milk-rice, the Tathāgata[8] will approach the Nerañjarā[9] [river].

(64) Having partaken of the milk-rice on the bank of the Nerañjarā the Victor (*jino*)[10] shall come by a triumphal path to the foot of the tree of Enlightenment (*bodhi-mūlamhi*).[11]

(65) Then with reverence he will walk round the seat of wisdom, and peerless, glorious, seated at the foot of the pīpal-tree[12] he will attain Enlightenment (*bhujjhissati*).

(66) His mother will be Māyā by name, his father by name Suddhodana;[13] he will be Gotama.[14]

(67) Passionless (*an-āsava*),[15] freed from taint (*vīta-malā*), tranquil-minded (*santa-cittā*), composed (*samāhitā*), the chief disciples (*sāvakā*)[16] will be Kolita[17] and Upattissa.[18]

(68) The ministrant[19] Ānanda[20] by name will serve the Victorious One

[1] Or, rather the first that has been named by tradition.
[2] These *slokas* are the same as verses 70–9 quoted in the Pāli Introduction to the *Jātaka*.
[3] Int. § 186.
[4] See *Note* above.
[5] See *sloka* 63 below. Ap. A 1 *b* (*Dīpavaṃsa*, IV. v. 13). *Tathā-gata* means literally 'So-goer' and may signify either 'one who shows the way' or 'one who follows his predecessors (i.e. a successor)'.
[6] KM, pp. 60–1.
[7] Ch. 4 § 6.
[8] See *sloka* 62 above.
[9] Ch. 3 (M, xxvi, Trenckner, PTS, i, p. 167).
[10] See *sloka* 68 below; Int. 187 n.
[11] See *sloka* 69 below; Ch. 4 § 4; Ch. 10 *d* § 3; Ap. F 2 *a* (118).
[12] The *Ficus religiosa*; Pāli, Assattha; see *sloka* 69 below.
[13] See *Note* above; Ch. 1 § 4; Ch. 10 *b* § 2.
[14] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].
[15] Ap. A 1 *b* (*Dīpavaṃsa*, IV. v. 1).
[16] KM, p. 61; Ch. 7 *a* § 16; Cp. Ch. 8 *l* (*upāsaka*); and *sāvika* in *sloka* 68 below.
[17] Better known as Moggallāna. Ch. 7 *a* § 23.
[18] Better known as Sāriputta. Ch. 7 *a* § 23. See *Note* above.
[19] *Upaṭṭhāka*, attendant. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [4]; Ch. 10 *c* (36), (63) n and (64) n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [1]; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14] (*attended*). See also Ch. 8 *i* (*Juniors*) and § 2 [1]. A list of previous personal attendants is given in the commentary on Ānanda's verses included in the *Theragāthā* anthology (Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Psalms of the Brethren*, p. 350).
[20] See *Note* above; Ch. 8 *b* § 4; Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 29; Ch. 18 *a* § 1 n; Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [3]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

(*jinaṃ*);[1] Khemā[2] and Uppalavaṇṇā[3] will be the chief women disciples (*sāvikā*),[4]

(69) Passionless, freed from taint, tranquil-minded, composed. The wisdom-tree (*bodhi*)[5] of this Blessed One (*Bhagavato*) will be called Assattha.'[6]

c. The Previous Buddhas[7] *and the Coming Buddha, Metteyya: the Tathāgatas.*[8]

[*Note.* The Chinese traveller, Fa Hian, in his account of his travels[9] in India in the fifth century A.D. states that the followers of Gotama's heretical cousin Devadatta, still established near Srāvasti (*Sāvatthi*) in that century, rejected Gotama and reverenced the three previous Buddhas, and especially Kāṣyapa (*Kassapa*) Buddha, who was declared to be the latest of the line. These three Buddhas were Krakucchanda or Kakucchanda, Kanakamuni or (*Koṇāgamana*), and Kāṣyapa or Kassapa.[10] These three alone were born in the present 'blessed age (*bhadda-kappa*)'.[11] The second of these three Kanakamuni (*Konākamana*) is mentioned in the Emperor Asoka's[12] inscription upon the Niglīva Pillar,[13] which states that the Emperor enlarged the stūpa of Konākamana and, after visiting the spot in person, erected a stone pillar in his honour. The cult of this Buddha therefore was firmly established by the time of Asoka. In the *Mahāparinibbāna Suttanta* or Book of the Great Decease, in the form in which it has come down to us, mention is repeatedly[14] made of the previous and future Buddhas, but in each case the mention is merely general, without any particular names, and it is possible that the text refers rather to

[1] See *sloka* 64 above.

[2] See *Note* above; Ch. 10 *c* (49); Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [6].

[3] Ch. 10 *c* (50).

[4] Cp. *sāvakā* in *sloka* 67 above.

[5] See *sloka* 64 above.

[6] See *sloka* 65 above.

[7] Int. §§ 35 (ii), 62, 187; Ch. 1 § 2; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; Ch. 7 *b* §§ 1 n, 2 n; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2] n; Ch. 10 *a* § 4 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [2]. Ch. 20 § 10 [17]; Ch. 22 *b* § 8 [15] n. Ap. A 2 *a* and *b*; Ap. B *c* § 1 (2); Ap. G 1 *b* § 2; Ap. H 1 § 5; Ap. H 5 [93] n. Cp. Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [4] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 6 [10] n; and Part I (title). In the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* a subdivision of the 12th group (*Nidāna Saṃyutta*) is called the *Buddha-vagga* and treats of the succession of the Buddhas.

[8] Int. §§ 62, 74 n; Ch. 4 § 18; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 5 *b* §§ 1, 4 n; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 8, 9, 19; Ch. 7 *b* §§ 1, 8 n; Ch. 7 *c* § 2; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7]; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [3] n; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 3 [13], 8, 11 [3]; Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8]; Ch. 19 *c* § 1; Ch. 21 §§ 7 [25], 11 [12] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [8]; Ap. B *c* § 5 [7]; Ap. E, *Note*; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1); Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [7]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [32]; Ap. H 4 *a* §§ 1 n, 4 [8]. Cp. Ap. E *a*, *Note* (*leaders*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5); Ap. H 1 § 6 (*Sugata*). A parallel may be seen in the 23 Tirthankaras (ford-makers, guides), the successive leaders of the Jains preceding Mahāvira (Int. § 179); cp. Ch. 9 *c* (*Titthiyas*); Eliot, *H. and B.* i, pp. 110, 343. Bishop Bigander presenting the Burmese tradition states that the title *tathā-gata* 'means, he who has come like all his predecessors', *The Life or Legend of Gaudama, the Buddha of the Burmese*, preface to the 2nd ed. (1866); see *Note* below (*Leaders*).

[9] Beal's translation, pp. 82, 83; Int. § 62.

[10] KM, p. 64. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 26 [5].

[11] *Buddhavaṃsa*, xxvii. 18, below; Int. § 107; Ch. 7 *a* § 20.

[12] Ap. G 1 *c*.

[13] Near Rummindeī or Lumbini (V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed. p. 200).

[14] e.g. Ch. 20 § 10 [16] n.

Leaders[1] or Sages than to Buddhas. In the *Mahā-padāna Suttanta*[2] specific mention is made of the six Buddhas immediately preceding Gotama Buddha, namely Vipassin, Sikhin, Vessabhū, Kakusandha, Konāgamana and Kassapa. In addition to these six and Gotama Buddha an eighth name is elsewhere mentioned, namely that of the coming Buddha, Metteyya.[3] It is stated in this *Sutta*, as also in the *Buddhavaṃsa*, that of the last six buddhas one appeared in the 91st world-age (counting backwards from the present), two in the 31st, and three in the present 'blessed-age', which is also that of both Gotama Buddha and the coming Buddha Metteyya.[4] In the poetical narrative of the *Buddhavaṃsa* names are given to the twenty-four immediate predecessors[5] of the historical Buddha, commencing with Dīpankara. In the last sloka but one of this poem, at the close of the summary list of the twenty-four preceding Buddhas, mention is briefly made of Metteyya, the Buddha to come. The name Metteyya signifies Loving-kindness or Charity. That Gotama should have expressed the hope and belief that the spirit of charity would ultimately rule among men is inherently probable. That he should have believed that the doctrine of altruism, taught by him, was no new doctrine, but discoverable in part or in whole, in different ages, by great spirits among men, is equally probable. That from these beginnings his monkish followers should have elaborated long lists of Buddhas, their names, stature, and longevity, the names of their chief disciples and so forth, is as probable; and that such lists and descriptions should show no particular differences except in names is what could be expected of a process of this nature. Revealed dogmatic religions always necessarily figure as new departures, as peculiar and original. The theory of a succession of Buddhas, rediscovering independently the same doctrine age after age, is evidence that the doctrine, equally attributed to all of them, was purely rational.][6]

Buddhavaṃsa, xxvii. 16–20.

(16) Ninety-one cycles (*kappe*) ago was the Lord (*nāyako*) called Vipassin,[7] and that merciful Buddha delivered beings from sin.

[1] The word used is *Tathāgata* (literally, so-goers), i.e. those who show the way; or perhaps, those who follow others. It is probable that the term in some passages means the faithful or disciples of the Noble Path in general (Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32]). If the word is derived not from *tatha* (thus, so) but from *tatha* = *sacca* (true), it would mean 'truth-attainer'. In *Dīgha* 29 (SBB, iv, p. 127) a Tathāgata is said to be a right speaker (*Tathā-gada* according to Buddhaghosha; cp. Ch. 19 *d* § 1 [2]). The word is evidently intended to be understood in divers ways. Sutta 23 of the Fours of *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, ii, p. 23) states four reasons for which the title is given. With all of these the general term Leader or Right-farer seems to fit; see *Gradual Sayings*, ii, p. 27 n. 'Buddhaghosa gives eight explanations', *Pāli Dict.* (s.v.). For further references see headline above. The title Tathāgata probably is not early; it is not found in the Asokan inscriptions; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8] n.

[2] *Dīgha* 14; Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [3] n.

[3] Ch. 11 *d* § 13 [1] n. Metteyya (of which the Sanskrit form is Maitreya) means Charity or Loving-kindness. The name occurs only in one of the Suttas in the first four Nikāyas, namely in the *Cakkavattisihanāda-sutta* of the *Dīgha Nik.* (ThB, pp. 219, 259). Maitreya became later the dominant figure in Mahāyānist Buddhism (Int. §§ 3, 87; Ap. F 1 *b*, *Note*) and is the spiritual ancestor of the greater part of the hierarchy of the Mahāyānist Bodhisattas in China and Japan, the 'Spirit of Wisdom' (Mañjusrī) being the original of the remainder. (Cp. J. B. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism*, 1928, chs. xi, xv, and xxiv.)

[4] OB, p. 375 n.

[5] Ap. A 2 *a* (*Dīpankara*). For the many thousands of unnamed predecessors see Ch. 4 § 3 n. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[6] Int. § 6.

[7] Ap. B *c* § 3.

(17) Thirty-one cycles ago there were two Lords, Sikhin and Vessabhū, unequalled, unrivalled.

(18) In this blessed cycle (*bhaddake kappe*) there have been three Lords,[1] Kakusandha, Konāgamana, and the Lord Kassapa.[2]

(19) I now am and Metteyya will be the Supreme Buddha (*saṃ-buddho*). These five are the Buddhas [of this age] steadfast, having compassion upon the world.

(20) Many myriads of other Kings of the Law have explained the path (*maggaṃ*)—blissful (*nibbutā*) they with their followers.

d. Background of Indian Popular Beliefs: Gods,[3] Spirits,[4] and animistic practices[5]

[*Note*. As is pointed out by Professor T. W. Rhys Davids in his *Buddhist India* (p. 219) two versified Suttantas[6] included in the *Dīgha Nikāya*, namely, the *Mahā-samaya Suttanta*[7] and the *Ātānātiya Suttanta*,[8] are especially valuable for the light which they throw upon the popular beliefs of the times. 'In the first of these two poems,' he writes, 'some unknown early Buddhist poet describes how all the gods of the people come to pay reverence, at Kapilavastu, to the new teacher, and to his order of mendicant recluses. . . . The poet of the *Mahā-samaya* (the Great Concourse) enumerates first the spirits of the Earth and of the Great Mountains. Then the Four Great Kings, the guardians of the four quarters, East and South and West and North. One of these four, Vessavaṇa Kuvera, is the god who in the second poem is the spokesman for all the rest. . . . Then come the Nāgas, the Siren-serpents. . . . Then come a goodly crowd of Titans, and sixty kinds of gods, of whom only about half a dozen are Vedic . . . lastly, the great gods who dwell in the highest heavens (that is, are the outcome of the highest speculation), like Brahmā himself, and Paramatta,[9] and Sanam Kumāra.' In the *Ātānātiya Suttanta* certain spirits are said to have come to the Buddha and to have informed him of a spell capable of protecting the new religion against unfriendly spirits which are then enumerated. Both these poetical compositions are put into the mouth of the Buddha, who is represented as reciting them to his followers.

In the ancient treatise called the *Sīla* (Virtuous Conduct),[10] which is appended to each of the thirteen (or according to another arrangement twelve) Suttas forming the first section (*Sīla-kkhanda Vagga*) of the *Dīgha Nikāya*, there is included a long passage enumerating at length superstitious practices, which are denounced as unworthy of Buddhists. The whole treatise throws much light on the general life of the people of the period.[11] The passage below is taken from the *Sīla*, in the middle of the first part of the Brahmajāla Sutta, and similarly is interpolated between

[1] See *Note* above; Ch. 11 *c* § 26 [5]. Cp. Ap. H 1 § 5.

[2] According to the Commentary the *Buddhavaṃsa* should end here (*Buddhavaṃsa*, PTS, p. 67).

[3] Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

[4] IN 8 *a*; Ap. B *a* § 1 n; Ap. G 2 *b*.

[5] Int. § 158 (16) n, 185 (*ritual*); Ch. 1 § 7 (*Festival*); Ch. 9 *c* (*Magic*); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2] n; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note* (*animism*); Ap. I *b* (*Magic*); cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] n (*Yakka*).

[6] Int. § 74.

[7] *Dīgha* 20; Ch. 13 *c* § 17.

[8] *Dīgha* 32; Ch. 13 *c* § 17 [1] n.

[9] Int. § 35 (i); cp. Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Attan*).

[10] Or, duty. Ch. 8 *j* § 11; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 14 n; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 n; Ap. H 4, *Note* (*Sīla*); also Ap. F 1, *Note*; Ap. F 2, *Note*.

[11] IN 14.

the first and last portions of the *Tevijja Sutta*,[1] greatly interrupting, at least in its present form,[2] the flow of the discourse.]

Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 1 (Brahmajāla-s.),[3] *i. 21 (Mahā-sīla); repeated in Suttas 2–12, and in Sutta 13 (Tevijja-s., 43).* [4]*(PTS, i. p. 67; p. 250).*

[21] ... Some religious practitioners (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇa*),[5] living on food given by pious people, are in the habit of making their living by base arts[6] and false practices, such as—[prophecies from marks[7] on] parts of the body, omens (*nimittaṃ*),[8] [interpreting] portents, dreams, signs,[9] [divination by] holes in materials gnawed by mice, sacrifices to Agni (*aggihomaṃ*)[10] ...[11] sacrifices of animals; [practising] charms for the body (*aṅga-vijjā*), for sites, for the fields, for luck, for ghosts, for the soil (*bhūri-vijjā*),[12] for snakes, for poison, for scorpions, for mice; the science of augury (*sakuṇa-vijjā*), the science of ravens;[13] [professing] knowledge of the length of life, exorcism against wounds, and the animal-circle (*miga-cakkaṃ*).[14] He,[15] however, declines to make a living by such base arts and false practices. . . .[16]

[1] Ch. 14 *d* § 6; Ap. F 2 *b*, *Note.*

[2] It is possible that of the three parts of the *Sīla* the last two are successive additions. Ap. E *c* i § 2; Ap. H 2 *b*.

[3] Ch. 8 *j* § 11; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii); Ap. H 4 *a* § 4.

[4] Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [39] n.

[5] Ch. 9 *b* §§ 3, 9; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 13 *d* § 4; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6]; Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3]; Ch. 22 *b* § 15; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [ii. 37]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [29]; Ap. H 4, *Note.* The word *samaṇa* means one who is not a layman or by birth a Brāhman (Ch. 2 § 7; Ch. 5 *b* § 9; Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 8 *g*, and 8 *l*; Ch. 11 *a* § 2; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [53]; Ap. I *b* § 4 [5]; cp. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i); and is applicable both to Buddhists and to Hindus (Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]). The word *brāhmaṇa* in Pāli signifies 'a holy man', not necessarily a member of the Brāhman caste (Ap. F 2 *c*). The compound word, when in the singular, apparently signifies one person, not two individuals (cp. SBE, xi, p. 105 n; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]) but the two terms are sometimes contrasted (Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ch. 11 *d* § 5; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [2]; Ch. 14 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 3 [13], 8 [248] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [17]; Ap. E *a* ii § 3; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2). On the opposition of Brāhmans and Samaṇas see Ch. 13 *c* § 28 [6].

[6] Int. § 77; Ap. I *b* 1 [2].

[7] Int. § 188; Ch. 1 [6].

[8] Ch. 1 § 9.

[9] Int. § 188 (*dreams*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (2).

[10] Int. § 186. For the personification cp. Ap. G 2 *b* § 2.

[11] Omitting details of offerings of grain and oil, &c.

[12] '(Spells) to secure good harvests', SBE, xi, p. 196.

[13] '(Divination) by the croaking of ravens', SBE, xi.

[14] 'Pretended knowledge of the language of beasts', SBE, xi. Perhaps astrology. 'Auguries drawn from the celestial phenomena', RDBI, p. 216.

[15] i.e. Gotama; or the pious householder who has become a true recluse (*Tevijja Sutta*, i. 47–9, SBE, xi). There are slight differences in the different Suttas in which the *Sīla* is repeated.

[16] Six further paragraphs follow giving additional details.

APPENDIX B

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter 2*)

RESULTS OF ACTION:[1] SAṂSĀRA[2] (CONTINUITY), THE REVOLUTION OF EXISTENCES, OR REBIRTH

a. Hindu and later Buddhist views: personal Karma[3]

[*Note.* The following later Buddhist ideas on Saṃsāra,[4] or the Round of Existences, are indistinguishable from the Hindu views, earlier and later, on this subject. They may probably without incorrectness be attributed to the youthful Gotama at the commencement of his search for Peace. They are, however, strongly individualistic, being closely interwoven with the idea of personal salvation, and are therefore thoroughly inconsistent with the Dhamma, based upon the Noble Truth[5] that personal desire is the origin of all sorrow, and upon the theory of the transience, if not the non-existence, of the self.[6] The potency of this wonderful ethical idea is well known; it has for ages influenced the world for good by its piercing personal appeal, its wonderfully organized scheme of rewards and punishments, 'sanctions' which are calculated to appeal to the self-interest of every intelligent and long-sighted individual who accepts the theory. But to one who found in self,[7] or individualism of every kind, the basis of all sorrow, no doctrine that induced by rewards or restrained by punish-

[1] Int. §§ 4, 19, 22 n. Ch. 4 § 16 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 10 n; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 n; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14] n; Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. C *b*, *Note*, n; Ap. E *b* § 3 (1) n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [32] (*world beyond*); also Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [16] (*act*). Cp. Ap. D *c* § 3 [6] (*phala*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 [23] (*vipāka*); and Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [3] n. Contrast Ap. E *c* i § 9 (7th verse); and Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n. For favourable results see *mah-ānisaṃsa* (Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]); also *puñña* (Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]).

[2] Int. §§ 34, 62; Ch. 11 *c* § 26 [5] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1]; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [4]; Ch. 21 §§ 16, 17 [2]; Ap. B *a* § 1; Ap. B *c* §§ 1 (2), 4 [1]; Ap. C *a* § 1 [95]; Ap. E *c* i § 9 n; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 [414]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 7 n; Ap. G 2 *c* §§ 2 (ii) [i. 30] n, 3 (i) [20]. Cp. IN 13; Ap. C (*Nirvāna or Nibbāna*); Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*); also Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] (*pubbe-nivāso*). *Saṃsāra* is the subject of the 15th *Saṃyutta* (called *Anamatagga* or Unending; Ap. B *a* §§ 2, 3) of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya*.

[3] Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] n (*kamma*); Ap. I *b* § 3 (*rebirth*) and (*action*), and Ap. D *a* § 8 (i. 342); also Int. §§ 11, 92; IN 1–5; Ch. 1 § 11 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 6 n; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 n; Ch. 5 *c* §§ 5 n, 7 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] n; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 7 n, 29 n; Ch. 13 *d* §§ 3 [7] n, 4 [214] n, 5 [387] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56] n; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [11] n; Ch. 20 § 2 (*conditions*) n, § 6 [2] n; Ap. D *c*, *Note*; Ap. E *b* § 3 (2) n; Ap. E *c* i, *Note*, and § 8 n; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 n; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*, and § 4 [2] n; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 12 (*upadhi*); Ch. 10 *c* [4] (40, *former existence*); Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note* (*Bodhisatta*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 (*future*); and Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [18] n. Contrast ethical action, Ap. F 2 *c* § 2 (21).

[4] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

[5] Ch. 5 *b* §§ 4–9 (*First Sermon or Dhamma-cakka-ppavatana Sutta*).

[6] Ch. 5 *c* §§ 1–5 (*Second Sermon or An-atta-lakkhana-Suttanta*); Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*); Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] (*remaining*). 'It seems from the Katthā Vatthu [an early book of the *Abhidhamma-Piṭaka* treating of sects] that, in 250 B.C., in the North and also in the South the old theory of the soul-theory had crept back by side issues into the doctrine from which it had been categorically and explicitly excluded by Gotama and his earlier followers', T. W. Rhys Davids's (Lectures on) *Buddhism, its History and Literature*, 2nd ed., 1926, p. 198. The idea that the five fluctuating Khandhas (Ap. E *a*), which constitute the whole individuality, can transmigrate together without any durable Ego, attributes to them a permanent selfhood without the name of Ego. It conflicts with Buddha's last words, *Vayadhammā saṃkhārā*. Int. § 38.

[7] Ap. D.

ments would bring satisfaction, for its very sanctions would appeal to that sense which should not exist or which should atrophy by disuse or which should be overcome by effort; and such a one would be appalled by the prospect of long ages of ceaseless watchful striving to grasp at last the best and ultimate reward.][1]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Saṃyutta Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga,*[2] *Devatā-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. i*), *vi. 6.* (*PTS, i, p. 37.*)[3]

What causes man to be born (*jāneti*)? What in him strays (*vidhāvati*)?
What undergoes re-birth (*saṃsāraṃ*)?[4] From what cannot release be found (*na parimuccati*)?
Desire[5] (*taṇhā*) causes man to be born. His mind (*cittaṃ*)[6] strays.
A sentient being (*satto*) undergoes re-birth. No release is found from sorrow.

§ 2. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Anamatagga-saṃyutta*[7] (*Saṃ. xv*), *Sutta 5* (*Pabbata*). (*PTS, ii, pp. 181–2.*)[8]

[6] It is, mendicant-brother, as though there were a mountain consisting of a great rock, a league (*yojanaṃ*) long, a league wide and a league high, without any break or crack, quite solid, and after every hundred years someone were to come and wipe it once with a muslin (*kāsikena*)[9] cloth. That mountain of rock would wear away and come to an end in that manner more quickly than a world-cycle[10] (*kappo*). [7] Such, mendicant-brother, is the length of a world-cycle; and not one such cycle, but hundreds, thousands, hundreds of thousands of cycles have passed away (*saṃsitaṃ*). [8] And why [do I say] this?[11] This revolution of existence (*saṃsāro*) is without limit (*anamatagg'*) and there is no known beginning of beings (*sattānaṃ*) who pass on and are re-born[12] (*saṃsarataṃ*), obstructed by ignorance[13] and fettered[14] by desire (*tanhā-saṃyojanānaṃ*). [9] So long

[1] Ap. C *b* § 9. The belief in Bodhisattas (Sages destined to become Buddhas in a future life) is thoroughly consistent with Hindu ideas of Saṃsāra and Karma. It is not consistent with the *an-attā* theory of the transience of the individual. Its appearance in Buddhism probably marks one of the stages of the gradual return of later Buddhism to the doctrines of Hinduism, into which it was ultimately re-absorbed.

[2] Discourses or tales fitted to ancient Buddhist verses. IN 6 (*Canon*); Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. D *a* § 3; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3.

[3] The verses here given were apparently composed for popular instruction and are doubtless ancient. They are without prose setting, but are part of a series attributed to a *devatā* or spirit (Ap. A 2 *d*). See § 4 below.

[4] Ap. B (*saṃsāra*) n; see §§ 2 [8], 3 [2] below; Ap. B *c* § 1 (2).

[5] Ap. D *a* § 1.

[6] Or, spirit. Ap. E *c* i § 4.

[7] Group of discourses on the Unending. 'Kindred Sayings on the Incalculable Beginning', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Book of Kindred Sayings*, ii, p. 118. See § 3 below, and Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*). Cp. Ap. B *c*; also Ch. 18 *b* § 3 (*Aggañña-S.*).

[8] The scene of the Sutta is the Jetavana monastery at Sāvatthi (Int. § 138).

[9] Ch. 13 *d* § 8; Ap. F 1 *b* § 7 n. See Int. § 189 (*manufactures*). Kāsipura or Benāres (Int. § 151) was the capital of the Kāsis and famous for its delicate products.

[10] Int. § 107.

[11] This and the next two sentences appear in each of the twenty Suttas composing the *Anamatagga-saṃyutta*. IN 6 (*Canon*); see § 3 [12] n below.

[12] Literally, recur. This may be applied collectively; see Ap. B *b* (*Impersonal Kamma*) and Ap. G 2 *a* (*Collective Kamma*). See § 1 above, § 3 [2] below; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1]; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [4] (*pajā*).

[13] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[14] Ap. D *a* § 8.

have sorrow (*dukkhaṃ*), pain and calamity been experienced, and the graveyard[1] (*kaṭasi*) has been filled. [10] And so, mendicant-brother, there is sufficient [reason] to feel revulsion (*nibbindituṃ*)[2] and aversion (*virajjituṃ*) from all individuality (*sabba-saṇkhāresu*)[3] and to liberate oneself from it.

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Anamatagga-saṃyutta*[4] (*Saṃ. xv*), *Sutta 3* (*Assu*). (*PTS, ii, pp. 179–80.*)[5]

[2] This revolution of existence, mendicant-brothers, is without limit and there is no known beginning of beings who pass on and are re-born;[6] obstructed by ignorance and fettered by desire. [3] What think ye, mendicant-brothers; which is more—the water which is in the four great Seas (*catūsu mahā-samuddesu*),[7] or the tears which have been shed by you in this long time (*āddhunā*)[8] passing and being born again (*saṃsaratam*), groaning and weeping because of union with the unpleasing and separation from the pleasing?[9] . . . [7–12] While you long were experiencing the deaths of mother, son, daughter, the loss of relatives and goods[10] and of health, while thus you were long experiencing disasters, groaning and weeping because of union with the unpleasing and separation from the pleasing, the tears which have been shed by you [were more], and not the water which is in the four great Seas. . . .[11]

§ 4. *Aṇguttara Nikāya, Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 33* (*Nidānaṃ*). (*PTS, i, p. 134.*)[12]

[1] There are three conditions,[13] mendicant-brothers, of the origination (*samudayāya*) of actions (*kammānam*).[14] And what are the three? Desire[15] (*lobho*) is a condition of the origination of actions, hatred (*doso*) is a condition . . .[16] delusion (*moho*) is a condition. . . .

When a man's action is performed through desire . . . hatred . . . delusion, arises from desire . . . hatred . . . delusion, is caused[17] by desire . . . hatred . . . delusion, has its origin in desire . . . hatred . . . delusion, wherever his individuality[18] (*atta-bhāvo*) exists, there that action ripens (*vi-paccati*), and

[1] Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [7–10] n. The words from here to the end of the Sutta have appeared in Suttas 1–4 preceding.
[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 4.
[3] Ap. E *a*.
[4] See § 2 above; Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*).
[5] The scene is the Jetavana monastery. Int. § 138.
[6] See § 2 [8] above; cp. § 1 above. Conceivably the meaning here might be 'Collective life (underlying all generations of individuals)', not 'individual lives'. This would express a truth consonant with Gotama's doctrine of 'No-Soul' (Ap. E *c* i), with which the doctrine of individual re-birth (transmigration) is in marked discord (Ap. G 2 *a*, *Karma*). Otherwise it would appear that the Discourse in its present form belongs to a period when the creed originally taught by Gotama had been subjected to Hindu influences, involving discrepancies, piously regarded as inexplicable mysteries (Ap. B *b*, *Kamma*).
[7] Ap. G 1 *b* § 1.
[8] This may be read collectively and not individually. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [17] (*addhānaṃ*).
[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 5.
[10] Pāli *bhoga*. Int. § 111.
[11] As in § 2 [8–10] above.
[12] The scene is not stated. The omission is possibly a sign of late date. Cp. Ch. 1 § 10.
[13] Or, connexions. Ap. D *a* § 10 (*Three Fires*). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 15 (*nidāna*); Ch. 12 *d* § 4.
[14] i.e. actions in a future life. Cp. Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Nigaṇṭha*); see § 5 below.
[15] Covetousness or craving.
[16] Omitting repetitions.
[17] Or, conditioned. The Pāli suffix here is *-nidānaṃ*.
[18] Ap. E *c* i.

wherever it ripens, there he experiences the result[1] of that action, whether it arises (*uppajje*)[2] in the present world[3] or in another life.[4]

It is like seed, mendicant-brothers, which is uninjured, undecayed, unharmed by hot winds, and which is fresh, and properly set and planted in fertile and well-prepared ground. If the sky (*devo*) gives due rain the seed will grow, develop, and increase. In the same way, mendicant-brothers, when a man's action is performed through (desire . . . hatred . . .) delusion . . . has its origin in (desire . . . hatred . . .) delusion . . . wherever it ripens, there he experiences the result of that action, whether it arises in the present world or in another life. These, mendicant-brothers, are the three conditions of the origination of actions.

[2] There are three [opposite] conditions, mendicant-brothers, of the origination[5] of actions. And what are the three? No-desire (*a-lobho*) . . . no-hatred (*a-doso*) . . . no-delusion (*a-moho*). . . . When a man's action is performed without desire . . . hatred . . . delusion . . . then since (desire . . . hatred . . .) delusion has departed that action[6] is terminated[7] (*pahīnaṃ*), cut-off-at-root (*ucchinna-mūlaṃ*), like an up-torn palm-tree, deprived of separate existence (*ana-bhāva-kataṃ*),[8] not able to arise[9] in the future (*āyatiṃ an-uppāda-dhammaṃ*).

It is like seed. . . . If a man burn it with fire and reduce it to ashes, and scatter it in the wind, or cast it into a rapid stream, then, mendicant-brothers, that seed will be terminated,[10] cut-off-at-root, like an up-torn palm-tree, deprived of separate existence, not able to arise in the future. In the same way, mendicant-brothers, when a man's action is performed without (desire . . . hatred . . .) delusion . . . then since (desire . . . hatred . . .) delusion has departed that action is terminated . . . not able to arise in the future. These, mendicant-brothers, are the three [opposite] conditions of the origination of actions.

[1] *Vipāka*, ripening. Ap. E *c* i § 9. Cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 4 (*fruit*); and Int. § 26 (*repercussions*).
[2] Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1] (*re-births*); Ap. D *b* § 6 [3].
[3] Ap. C *b* § 4.
[4] The appeal of this passage is frankly individualistic. If the verb in the last clause were in the passive, the 'experience' might be that of other individuals in other generations, who suffer the results of the first agent's ill-doing. This would be in accordance with Collective Karma (Ap. G 2 *a*), as distinguished from Personal Karma.
[5] One would have expected here the negative.
[6] The word here means, not 'actions', but 'the consequences of action'.
[7] Or, destroyed. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5). Cp. Ap. D *c* § 3 [18].
[8] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *bhava*).
[9] From the non-individualistic, i.e. social, point of view, good actions are as fruitful as bad. Compare Buddha's undoubted teaching of the Noble Eightfold Way, which in the *Mahā-parinibbāna Sutta* (Ch. 22 *a*) he declares to be the essential part of the true doctrine and discipline (Ap. G 1 *b*). In the passage here, logically, it is the egotism that is uprooted, not the actions; and it is the necessity of the uprooting of egotism, not that of actions, that Buddha points out in the First Sermon. If, however, 'action', in this passage were taken to mean 'individualistic (i.e. grasping, desire egoistic) action', we should have a rendering quite in accord with the teaching of the First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 7). Individualistic or selfish action (with its consequent sorrow) is uprooted by the elimination of desire, hatred, and delusion, the characteristics of individualism (Ch. 2 § 2). It is not difficult to see how such teaching might be transmuted to suit the popular belief in re-birth, and how these changes might result in the utterly unbased and illogical statement that 'actions performed without desire, hatred, and delusion, become non-existent and not liable to spring up again in the future'. They are fortunately for ever creative.
[10] Or, destroyed.

Born of desire and born of hate and born of delusion—O wise [Bhikkhu],
Whatever act has been done from this [cause], whether small or great,
Must be experienced [again] even here [in this world]; no other ground exists.
Therefore desire and hate and delusion the wise Bhikkhu,
When knowledge arises, should leave and all ill-doing.[1]

§ 5. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 74*.

[1] . . .[2] 'The Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta,[3] revered sir (*bhante*), who knows and sees everything, claims complete knowledge and insight. . . .[4] He expounds the annihilation of past actions (*kammānaṃ*) through austerities (*tapasā*), and the prevention (*setu-ghātaṃ*) of future (*navānaṃ*) actions[5] through inactivity (*a-karaṇā*).[6] When action[7] ceases, pain will cease; when pain ceases, sensation[8] will cease; when sensation ceases, all that is painful (*sabbaṃ dukkhaṃ*) will end. Thus by the destruction of the material[9] (*san-diṭṭhikāya*) there is transcendence (*sam-atikkamo*) to purity.'

§ 6. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 16* (*Mahā-parinibbāna-S.*), *ii*, *6–10*.[10] (*The four Stages to Arahatship or Saintship.*)

[6] . . .[11] 'The mendicant-brother Sālha has died at Nādika,[12] revered sir, (*bhante*). What is his course and future state[13] (*abhi-samparāyo*)? The mendicant-sister Nanda[14] has died. . . .[15] What is her state? [Similarly] Sudatta . . . Sujātā . . . Kakudha . . . Kālinga . . . Nikata . . . Katissabha . . . Tuṭṭha . . . Santuṭṭha . . . Bhadda . . . Subhadda.[16] . . . What is [their] state?' [7] 'The mendicant-brother Sālha, Ānanda,[17] through the destruction of the taints (*āsavānaṃ*)[18] has by himself,[19] and in this world (*diṭṭhe 'va dhamme*)[20] learnt, realized, and attained taintless liberation[21] of mind (*ceto-*

[1] The appeal here is egoistic. The verses are composed for popular consumption, and though early do not necessarily represent the doctrine of the instructed disciples of the Teacher. Cp. § 1 above.

[2] The scene is the Kūṭāgāra Hall at Vesāli (Int. § 133). The speaker is Abhaya, a Licchavi of Vesāli. 'There are apparently two persons of this name. The other Abhaya [Int. § 168], a son of King Srēnika [Bimbisara], was a patron of the Jainas, and is frequently mentioned in their legends and in the canonical books', SBE, xlv, p. xv, H. Jacobi's note.

[3] Int. § 184; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [29].

[4] Omitting: 'saying "walking or standing, sleeping or waking, I always possess complete knowledge and insight" '.

[5] Or, rather, activity. For the Jains this was an energy arising from subtle matter pervading and disturbing the soul. Gotama's unfavourable comment on this doctrine is given in the *Cula-dukkha-kkhandha-S.* (Ch. 9 *c* § 1), where he states that it is unproven (Ap. G 1 *a*, iii) and does not inculcate active virtue. Cp. § 4 [1].

[6] Ap. B *b* § 3 [2] n.

[7] Or, activity.

[8] Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

[9] Literally, visible.

[10] See Ch. 21 § 2 [6–10]. For the Four Stages see also Ap. D *c*; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 1 n. The narrative appears also in *Saṃ. Nik.*, *Mahā-vagga* (PTS, v, pp. 356–60) with some variation. A closely similar and perhaps earlier form of the same passage appears in *Dīgha* 18 (Ch. 12 *e* § 6).

[11] Ānanda is addressing the Buddha.

[12] Int. § 147; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [6]; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1]; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]. In the *Saṃ. Nik.* version the place is called Nātika.

[13] Ch. 13 *d* §§ 5, 8 [1] n.

[14] Ch. 10 *c* (53). See also Ch. 12 *b* (*Nuns*).

[15] Omitting repetitions.

[16] Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23] n. See Ch. 10 *c*, n.

[17] Ap. A 2 *b* (68).

[18] Or, defilements. Ap. D *a* § 7.

[19] Ap. G 1 *a* (iv, *Rationalism*).

[20] Ap. C *b* § 4.

[21] Ap. D *a* §§ 6 and 9 (iii) n (Ten Fetters, *saṃ-yojanāni*). For a description of the Ten Fetters and of the sub-groups of five and three which form their lowest classes, with references, see KM, pp. 52–3. See also RDB, pp. 109–10; SBE, xi, p. 222.

vimuttiṃ) and liberation of insight (*pañña-vimuttiṃ*). The mendicant-sister Nandā, Ānanda, through the complete destruction of the Five Bonds (*samyojanānam*)[1] appertaining to the lower world (*oram-bhāgiyānaṃ*), has arisen [to another world][2] where she will pass away completely (*tattha-parinibbāyinī*), and is never to return[3] from that world (*tasmā lokā*). The layman[4] Sudatta, Ānanda, through the complete destruction of three bonds, and through reducing desire, hatred, and delusion,[5] has become a once-returner (*sakad-agami*),[6] who when he returns to this world will end his sorrow. The lay-woman Sujāta, Ānanda, through the complete destruction of three bonds,[7] has become a stream-attainer (*Sota-pannā*),[8] not liable to [be born again in] a state of punishment (*a-vinipāta-dhammā*)[9] and certain to attain to complete enlightenment. The layman Kakudha, Ānanda, through the complete destruction of the Five Bonds appertaining to the lower world has arisen [to another world], where he will pass away completely, and is never to return from that world. [So also with] . . .[10] more than fifty laymen deceased at Nādika. . . . More than ninety laymen deceased at Nādika . . . have become once-returners. . . . More than five hundred laymen deceased at Nādika . . . have become stream-attainers. . . . [8] The death of mortals, Ānanda, is not strange, and that as each one dies you should come to the Leader (*Tathāgataṃ*)[11] inquiring on this matter is troublesome[12] to him. Therefore now I will show you the course of the Law (*dhamma-pariyāyaṃ*), called the Law-Mirror (*Dhamm-ādāsaṃ*),[13] by which a true-disciple (*ariya-sāvako*)[14] possessing it if he wishes may by himself know about himself: "I shall not be [re-born] in Hell,[15] nor [born again] as an animal, nor as a ghost,[16] nor in any state of punishment,[17] and am certain to attain complete enlightenment." [9] And what, Ānanda, is this Law-Mirror . . .? The true disciple [is safe because he] possesses perfect faith[18] in the Enlightened One (*Buddhe*) . . .[19] and he possesses

[1] Ap. D *a* §§ 8, 9 (Bonds, *bandhanāni*). These are the first five or lower kinds of Fetters. It is plain that we descend here from great ethical speculation to the region of scholastic quiddities. It is evident that in the Four Stages there are two systems amalgamated, one containing the First and Fourth Stages, and the other the Second and Third (cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 16; Ch. 7 *b* § 5 n; Ap. H 5 [92]). In the amalgamation the Fourth Stage has become a plain anti-climax as well as a non-sequitur. Later a further class (within the First Stage), namely that of the Seven-times-returning, was discovered (KM, p. 52 n).

[2] Int. § 70 n; Ch. 2 § 3; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

[3] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]. Cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 (9) n; Ap. C *a* § 3; Ap. D *c* § 3 [15] (*an-āgāmin*).

[4] Ch. 8 *l*; Ap. C *b*, *Note*.

[5] Ap. D *a* § 10 (*Three Fires*).

[6] Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3].

[7] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n.

[8] The stream (*sota*) is that of conversion. To cross it is to become converted and to enter a course of life leading ultimately to the eradication of sorrow. (Cp. Int. § 12 (*hida and palata*).) It does not imply death or new existence. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ap. C *a* § 2 (178); Ap. D *c* § 3. Cp. Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (283).

[9] See [8] below; also § 7 (*niraya*) below; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [2] n.

[10] Omitting names given above. The passage mentioning some 50, 90, and 500 unnamed deceased followers appears also in and seems to be borrowed from the marvellous narrative of *Dīgha* 18 (Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1] n).

[11] Ap. A 2 *c*.

[12] Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14) n.

[13] The Mirror is intended to reflect the truth that those who enter the Buddhist fold escape the Hindu terror of Hell and punitive re-births. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 14 n; Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [2]; Ap. I *a*, *Note* (*emancipation*).

[14] Ap. E *c* § 5 [8].

[15] Pāli *niraya*. Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13] n. See § 7 below.

[16] The Pāli prefix is *petti-* from *peta*, a ghost. Int. § 93 (vi); cp. Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2].

[17] See [7] above; Ch. 22 *b* § 24 [6] n; Ap. H 1 § 6 n.

[18] Ap. H 2 *b* (*Three Refuges*).

[19] Omitting terms of praise evidently of monkish origin. See Ap. H 1 § 6.

perfect faith in the Law (*Dhamme*) . . .[1] and he possesses perfect faith in the Community (*Saṃghe*),[2] believing that the Community of the disciples of the Blessed One . . . is deserving of offerings, of hospitality, of gifts,[3] and of salutation, and is the supreme field of merit[4] for the world. . . . [10] This, Ānanda, is the Law-Mirror. . . .'[5]

§ 7. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Dhammapada,*[6] *verses 306–9* (*on Hell, nirāya*).[7]

(306)[8] The liar goes to hell (*nirāyam*), and he (the hypocrite) who having done thus says 'I do it not'.
Hereafter (*pecca*) both these evil-doers are together in another-place (*parattha*).—[9]

(307) Many yellow-robed (*kāsāva-kaṇṭhā*)[10] are evil-doers, unrestrained;
Being evil by evil deeds they go to Hell.—

(308) Better [for him] to eat a burning blazing iron ball
Than that the unvirtuous (*du-ssīlo*) unrestrained man should eat the alms[11] of the land.—

(309) The man who thoughtlessly covets another's wife reaches four destinations:[12]
Vice, a restless bed, thirdly disrepute, and fourthly Hell.

b. Earlier Buddhist Views: Impersonal Kamma.[13] (*Texts supplementary to Chapter 5*)

[*Note.* After preaching at Benāres to the first five disciples the First Sermon[14] on individualistic desire as the origin of sorrow and on the Noble

1 Omitting eulogistic phrases. As in Ap. E *c* ii § 3.

2 Ap. H.

3 This eulogy and appeal inevitably suggest the monkish preacher. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (29) n; Ch. 10 *a* § 3 n; Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 20 § 11 [29] n. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3] (*cajoles*); Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (4).

4 Pāli *puñña*. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [6]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12] (*field*); Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]; Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 5; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17]; Ap. H 1 §§ 5, 6 [7]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5; Ap. H 5 [91]; also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]. Cp. Ap. B (*Results of Action*).

5 Omitting repetitions.

6 The *Dhammapada* (Collection of Law-verses; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 15 n) is the second book of the fifth (or *Khuddaka*) *Nikāya*. It is a classified anthology of moral couplets or *slokas*, gathered from different sources, and consequently of various dates. Ap. A 1 *a* (*Khuddaka Nikāya*); and Ch. 18 *b* § 2.

7 From the *Niraya-vagga* (Hell-section). See § 6 [7], [8] above; Ch. 11 *c* § 29 n; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [4] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 8 [16] n, § 11 [7] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 1; Ap. C *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*. Compare *duggati* (Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n).

8 Contrast the monkish vehemence of these threats with the gentleness of the sermon on the *Brahma-vihārā* in the *Tevijja-sutta*. Ap. F 1 *b* (*Mettā*).

9 Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14) *pāragū*.

10 i.e. monks. Ch. 8 *j*.

11 Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3] (*raṭṭha-piṇḍa*).

12 *Thānāni*, states or conditions. Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1].

13 Int. §§ 4, 8, 25, 28, 55 n, 117, 184; Ch. 3 § 5 [163] n; Ch. 5 § 7 n; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [7] n; Ap. B *a* §§ 2, 3; Ap. E *c* i, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a* (*Collective Karma*); Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Six teachers*, n); and Ap. F 1 *a*. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [6] (*example*); Ap. E *c* 1 § 9; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17], [26]. 'The great difficulty of imagining a particular karma passing from individual to individual, without the persistence even of a subtle body, is avoided by the conception of human beings, or indeed of the whole universe, as constituting one life or self. Thus it is from our ancestors that we receive our karma and not merely from "our own" past experiences; and whatsoever karma we create will be inherited by humanity for ever', A. Coomaraswamy on *Mahayāna* in *Buddha and the Gospel of Buddhism*, 1928 (1916), p. 232.

14 Ch. 5 *b* § 1.

Eightfold Path of selfless activity, the Buddha, according to tradition, proceeded to preach to them the Second Sermon, called the *An-atta-lakkhaṇa*[1] *Sutta*, on the absence of any sign of a permanent self[2] in the individual. Whether or not we have the latter sermon in the original form in which it was preached, it seems clear that the object of the Buddha at this juncture was to impress upon his hearers the main lesson of his first discourse, namely sorrow's origin in personal desire, and this he now did by dwelling on the comparative insignificance of the individual, in whom on analysis no sign of any durability, and therefore no sign of a permanent soul, could be traced. Anything like self-importance in the individual therefore was entirely misplaced, and if this were removed the entrance to the Noble Eightfold Path, leading away from sorrow, would be cleared. This teaching is further emphasized in the discourse on the Three Characteristics[3] of the individual in the *Aṅguttara Nikāya*, in which discourse the *an-atta* doctrine is set forth. Of the following extracts the first two, taken from the *Milinda-pañha*, which though post-canonical is orthodox,[4] definitely declare that the soul does not transmigrate at death, though its influence passes on;[5] the third and fourth, including the well-known discourse which converted Sīha, the General of the Licchavis, show that Gotama's view of the Karma doctrine differed markedly from that of his contemporary, the leader of the Jains, but that he held to the doctrine of Karma in a modified form; the fifth extract, from the *Mahā-vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, demonstrates that the Karma doctrine, that is the belief in the continuous moral consequences[6] of actions (of deeds, of words, of thoughts)[7] however greatly modified it may have become in his teaching, which was radically new because radically altruistic, was placed by him in the forefront of his dhamma. The Karma of his predecessors was individualistic, calculated to bring the travelling Soul at last to personal salvation; the Kamma of the Buddha was altruistic, calculated to raise suffering humanity together through the exercise of the divine qualities, the Brahmavihārā,[8] to higher levels. It is interesting to note that at a much

[1] Ch. 5 *b* § 2.

[2] Cp. the *Mahā-taṇhā-saṃkhaya Sutta* (*Majjh. Nik.*, Sutta 38) on Sāti's heresy of the transmigration of Consciousness (*viññāna*). See OB, p. 259 n; Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1912), 75 ff.

[3] Ap. E.

[4] Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy* (1923), p. 81; Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 141.

[5] A doctrine indistinguishable outwardly from the ordinary theory of re-birth prevails elsewhere in the book, e.g. Questions of Milinda, vol. ii, pp. 195–201.

[6] Int. 8 (*responsibility*), and § 38 (*strenuously*). See also Ap. D *a* § 4 (335); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (122). Cp. 'It has been the great service which Comtism has rendered to humanity, that it has taught people to realize the solidarity of the human race. The Buddhist doctrine of Karma is an attempt made five hundred years before the birth of Christ to formulate a similar but wider idea. Men are merely the present and temporary links in a long chain of cause and effect. . . . There is a real identity between a man in his present life and in the future. But the identity is not in a conscious soul which shall fly out away from his body after he is dead. The real identity is that of cause and effect. . . . The good Buddhist cannot seek for any salvation which he is himself to enjoy in any future world. The result of his good actions . . . will survive when he is dead, and advance the happiness of some other being, or some other beings, who will have no conscious identity with himself.' (T. W. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism, its History and Literature*, new ed., 1926, Putnams, pp. 127–31.)

[7] Int. § 25. See § 3 (6) below; Ch. 9 *b* § 9; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ch. 20 § 7 (1); Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14]; Ap. C *a* § 1 (96); Ap. C *b* § 9; Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (1); Ap. F 1 *b* § 1; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. H 1 § 4.

[8] Int. § 35 (i).

later date the Brāhmans classed Buddhists with Cārvākas, who were materialists and denied re-birth and moral responsibility (see Eliot, *H. and B.* ii., pp. 220–2).]

§ 1. *Milinda-pañha*,[1] *ed. Trenckner* (*1880*), *pp. 46–8.*

[p. 46] The Rāja said 'Revered Nāgasena, what (*ko*) is re-formed (*paṭi-san-dahati*)?'[2] The Elder (*thero*) replied 'Mahārāja, separate-being (*nāma-rūpaṃ*)[3] is re-formed.' 'Is this same separate-being re-formed?' 'This same separate-being, Mahārāja, is not re-formed; but with this separate-being [one] does action (*kammaṃ*)[4] whether good (*sobhanaṃ*)[5] or evil (*papakaṃ*),[6] and by that action another separate-being is formed hereafter.'[7] 'If, revered sir (*bhante*),[8] this same separate-being is not re-formed, surely one[9] (*so*) will be released (*mutto*) from one's evil actions?'[10] The Elder replied 'If [someone][11] were not formed hereafter (lit. re-formed), [one] would be released from one's evil actions.' 'Give an example.'

'It is as if,[12] Mahārāja, some man were to carry off another's mangoes, and the mango-owner having seized him were to show him to the rāja,[13] saying "My mangoes, lord (*deva*),[14] were carried off by this man"; and the

[1] Int. § 36; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3) n; see § 2 below. The Inquiry of [King] Milinda, or Menander. Menander, a Bactrian king of Greek extraction, lived in the 2nd century B.C., and the *Milinda-pañha* is considered to have been composed about the beginning of the Christian era (Cp. KM, pp. 9, 118; SBE, xxxv–xxxvi; V. A. Smith, *Oxf. Hist. of India*, 1920, p. 118). Though not included in the Canon it has almost the authority of the canonical books, and it presents the most convenient illustrations of early orthodox ideas regarding Karma in connexion with the doctrine of the transience of individuality.

[2] Literally, 'put together again'. 'Reborn', SBE, xxxv, p. 71. See below (*hereafter*) and § 2. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] (*outflow*); Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1] n; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2, *upa-pajjati*); Ap. E *c* i § 5 [12] (*abhi-nibbatati*).

[3] Literally, 'name and (separate) form'. Int. § 29; Ap. B *c* §§ 2 (2), 4 [22]. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 3; Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [3].

[4] The word *kammaṃ* is here collective and means 'a course of actions'. Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [56].

[5] Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*); cp. § 3 [6] below.

[6] Ap. D (*Evil*).

[7] See above (*patisandahati*). This statement might not appear arbitrary and unproven to a convinced transmigrationist seeking for a reconciliation between the doctrine of *karma* and the *an-atta* theory; but it is difficult to credit that the highly analytical mind of Gotama would not have perceived the lacuna in the reasoning and sought to bridge it, if it presented itself to him in this form. It plainly is not another 'name-and-form' (individuality), but another 'action', just as mango rises from mango, rice from rice, sugar-cane from sugar-cane, and fire from fire, in the following illustrations in the text. The bridge across the gap is not a *karma* connecting one individual with another, but a collective *karma* uniting the successive generations of men, which issue from, and are moulded by the deeds and thoughts of, their predecessors. The statement in the text would be logical enough if the word *patisandahati* could be translated as 'transformed (or influenced)'. Ap. B *c* § 4 [21] n; Ap. E *c* i, *Note;* and Int. § 11 (*re-birth*). Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 14 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 29 n.

[8] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.

[9] 'The new being', SBE, xxxv, p. 72.

[10] i.e. from their results and responsibility (Int. §§ 25, 26; cp. Ap. E *c* i § 9, *fruit* and Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [32]). This is the logical individualistic view, and is irrefutable, except from the collective or altruistic standpoint, unless indeed adequate punishment is exacted in this life.

[11] i.e. another separate-being, *nāma-rūpa*, as in Nāgasena's immediately preceding speech. The one individuality is said to cause the other to arise. Thus Nāgasena's argument is altruistic; but is dependent upon an unproved connexion.

[12] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6].

[13] Or, ruler. Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*b*].

[14] Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [8].

other were to say thus: "I did not, lord, carry off this man's mangoes; the mangoes which were planted by this man were other than the mangoes which were carried off by me; I am not guilty (*daṇḍa-patto*)." How now, Mahārāja, would that man be guilty?' 'Yes, revered sir, he would be guilty.' 'For what reason?' 'Although, revered sir, he might say thus not having disconnected the first mango from the last, that man would be guilty.' 'Even thus, Mahārāja, with this separate-being (*iminā nāmarūpena*) one does action, whether good or evil, and by that action another separate-being (*aññaṃ-nāmarūpaṃ*) is formed hereafter (lit. re-formed); therefore one is not released from one's evil actions.'

'Give a further example.' . . .[1] [p. 47] 'It is as if, Mahārāja, some man in winter-time having lit a fire and warmed himself were to go away without extinguishing it; then the fire were to burn another man's field; and the field-owner having seized the man were to show him to the rāja, saying "My field, lord, was burned by this man"; and the other were to say thus: "I did not, lord, burn this man's field; the fire which was not extinguished by me was other than the fire by which this man's field was burned; I am not guilty." How now, Mahārāja, would that man be guilty?' . . .[2]

[p. 48] 'It is as if, Mahārāja, some man having bought from the hand of a cow-keeper a pot of milk were to leave it in his keeping and were to go away, saying "To-morrow I will come and take it; then on the next day curds were to form; then he having returned were to say "Give me the pot of milk", and the other were to show him the curds; and the former were to say "I am not buying from your hand curds; give me the pot of milk"; and the latter were to say thus; "While thou wast unaware the milk has become curds"; and they disputing were to come before thee. Of which, Mahārāja, would'st thou support the cause?' 'The cow-keeper's, revered sir.' 'For what reason?' 'Although he spoke thus, yet the one was produced (*nibbattaṃ*)[3] from the other.' 'Even thus, Mahārāja, although the separate-being (*nāmarūpaṃ*) ending in death (*māruṇ-antikaṃ*)[4] is other than[5] the separate-being [appearing] in the re-formation (*paṭi-sandhismiṃ*), yet the one was produced from the other; therefore one is not released from one's evil actions.' 'Thou art skilful, revered Nāgasena.'

§ 2. *Milinda-pañha*,[6] *ed. Trenckner (1880), p. 71.*

[p. 71] The Rāja said 'Revered Nāgasena, if there is no passing on[7] (*na ca sankamati*) is there re-formation[8] (*patisandahati ca*)?' 'Yes, Mahārāja, though there is no passing on there is re-formation.' 'But, revered Nāgasena, when there is no passing on how is there re-formation? Give an example.'

[1] Omitting similar illustrations from rice and sugar-cane.
[2] Omitting repetitions. Omitting also illustrations from fire spreading to a whole village, and from a young girl developing into a grown woman.
[3] Ap. E *c* i § 5 [11].
[4] Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *paraṃ maraṇa*); also Ch. 4 § 16 (*ayam-antima*); and Int. § 7.
[5] Literally, the first *nāmarūpa* is said to be 'one thing (*aññaṃ*)', and the second *nāmarūpa* 'another thing (*aññaṃ*)'.
[6] Int. § 36; see § 1 above.
[7] Or, transmigrating.
[8] Or, re-birth. See § 1 [46] above. Ap. E *a*, *Note* (*flame*); Ap. E *c* i, *Note;* Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Cp. Int. § 4.

'If, Mahārāja, a man were to kindle a light (*padīpaṃ*) from another light now would that light have passed on from the other?' 'No indeed, revered sir.' 'Even thus, Mahārāja, though there is no passing on there is re-formation.'

'Give a further example.' 'Dost thou remember learning, Mahārāja, in childhood some verse or other from a teacher of verses (*sīlok-ācariyassa*)?[2] 'Yes, revered sir.' 'Did then, Mahārāja, that verse pass on from the teacher to thee?'[3] 'No indeed, revered sir.' 'Even thus, Mahārāja, though there is no passing on there is re-formation.' 'Thou art skilful, revered Nāgasena.'

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga VI, xxi, 1–10.*[4] (*The Conversion of Sīha*[5] *the General*).

[1] At that time many eminent Licchavis[6] [at Vesāli][7] having assembled sat together in the council-hall (*santh-āgāre*),[8] and were praising in many ways the Enlightened One (*Buddhassa*), his Law (*Dhammassa*), and his community (*saṃghassa*). On that occasion, Sīha, the chief-general (*sena-pati*),[9] a follower[10] of the Nigaṇṭha,[11] was seated in their assembly; and Sīha the General thought: 'This Blessed One (*Bhagavā*) doubtless must be the Saint and All-enlightened One (*arahaṃ*[12] *Sammā-sambuddho*)[13] since so many eminent Licchavis assembled and sitting together here in the council-hall praise in so many ways him, his Law and his community. What if I should go and see him, the Saint and All-enlightened One.'

[2] Then Sīha the General went to where the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta[14] was, and having drawn near said to the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta 'Revered sir (*bhante*),[15] I am desirous of going to see the devotee (*samaṇaṃ*)[16] Gotama.'[17] 'Why, Sīha, shouldst thou, who art a believer in Karma (*kiriya-vādo*) go and see the devotee Gotama, who is not a believer in Karma (*a-kiriya-*

[1] Int. § 25; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3] n.

[2] Int. § 190 (*education*).

[3] From these illustrations it would appear that Gotama must have taught that what passed on was influence (Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [viii], § 6) and nothing more, and that thus the influence of a man continued endlessly from generation to generation. This is nothing else than the doctrine of 'collective' as distinguished from 'personal' Karma, which doctrine may thus be attributed to him. Whence did Nāgasena's version, which was not new or original, but orthodox, arise, if not from some distinction between Gotama's theory of Karma and the usual theory of personal Karma, which must necessarily be that of personal and non-personal (i.e. collective) Karma. To an idealist (māyā-ist or illusionist) another and more mysterious distinction (Ap. B *c*) might be possible, but Gotama was plainly no illusionist. To him the visible was real and its duties insistent, and unremittent exertion was the breath of his nostrils. Illusionary changes, taking place within a brooding bodiless mind, without accompanying real movement, transmigrating or otherwise, would for him have come within the limit of metaphysical subjects, with which he constantly refused to deal (Ap. G 1 *a*).

[4] Also in *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Atthaka-nipāta* (*the Eights*), *Sutta 12* (Ch. 12 *a* § 4).

[5] i.e. the lion. Int. §§ 30, 41; IN 4; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13].

[6] Int. § 161.

[7] Ch. 12.

[8] Int. §§ 133, 171.

[9] Int. § 175.

[10] Pāli *sāvaka*.

[11] i.e. Freed (literally, 'without bond'), a designation assumed by the Jains. Int. § 179.

[12] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.

[13] Int. § 187.

[14] Nātaputta, son of Jnāta or Nāta; the patronymic of Vardhamāna or Vaddhamāna, the founder of Jainism. Int. § 179.

[15] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.

[16] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 8 (*g*) and (*l*).

[17] Ch. 1 § 6 [55].

vādaṃ)?[1] The devotee Gotama has no belief in Karma; he teaches a law of non-karma (*a-kiriyāya dhammaṃ*) and in this doctrine he instructs his disciples.' Then the wish[2] which had arisen in Sīha the General to go and see the Blessed One subsided.

[3] . . .[3]

[4] And Sīha the General went out from Vesāli to see the Blessed One. . . .[4] Having drawn near he exchanged greetings with (*abhivādetvā*) the Blessed One and seated himself at one side.[5] Seated at one side Sīha the General addressed the Blessed One thus: 'I have heard, revered sir, that the Samaṇa (devotee) Gotama has no belief in Karma; that he teaches a law of non-karma, and in this doctrine he instructs his disciples. Now, revered sir, do those who say thus . . . speak rightly of the Blessed One? Do they not misrepresent the Blessed One and set forth a pretended doctrine instead of the Dhamma?[6] . . .'

[5] 'In a way, Sīha, one speaking rightly might say of me "The Samaṇa Gotama has no belief in Karma;[7] he teaches a law of non-karma[8] and in this doctrine he instructs his disciples." Again, in a way, one speaking rightly might say of me "The Samaṇa Gotama has belief in Karma; that he teaches a law of Karma. . . ."

And again, Sīha, in a way one speaking rightly might say of me "The

[1] See §§ 4 [12], 5 below; Int. § 41; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [3]; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 18 [108] n (*kiṃ-vādin*). The words *kiriya-vāda* and *a-kiriya-vāda* are usually translated as 'believing in the result of actions (according to their moral merit)' and 'denying the doctrine of Karma' (see [5] below; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]). Gotama certainly never taught the doctrine of passivity (cp. the Noble Eightfold Path, 4th section, *sammā-kammanta*; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*); this rather was taught by the Jains themselves. The Jains taught the doctrine of the power (for evil) of action, and therefore the need of abstention from action (Ap. B *a* § 5). They were kiriyavādins, i.e. believers in the doctrine of Karma. In teaching the transience of the self, Gotama seemed to the Jains to teach the non-consequence of actions. Being individualists they did not distinguish between consequences to the individual agent and consequences to all (Int. § 4). This and the succeeding phrases are further expounded in the Eights of *Aṅg. Nik.* (iv, pp. 174–5).

[2] Pāli *abhi-saṃkhāra*. Ap. E *a*, *Note*.

[3] Omitting the second and third occasions on which Sīha asked for Nātaputta's consent, and his final decision to visit Gotama without the consent of the Nigaṇṭhas.

[4] Omitting details.

[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 7 *b* § 8 [4]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 6 [2], 12 [1]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [6]. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] (*saluting*); Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [1] (*stood*). The exact repetition of such stock phrases of meeting and parting is evidence that the surviving indirect reports of the Suttas (very many of which begin '*Evam me sutaṃ*, thus I have heard') have been edited to a general uniformity (Int. § 3; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 n; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3] n; Ap. E *c* ii § 2 n; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [2]).

[6] Omitting Sīha's excuses for the question.

[7] See [2] above and [6] below; Int. §§ 8, 25. '"The doctrine of non-action", and "the doctrine of action", taken in the ordinary sense of the words, are the doctrines that the actions of sentient beings receive not, or receive, their reward according to the law of moral retribution. In this discourse, however, a peculiar meaning is attached to these two terms; see § 6.' (SBE, xvii, p. 110 n). The point seems to be lost later in the discourse, [6], by the reporter; unless his object was merely to stress Gotama's preference for a middle position in all disputes. Gotama taught that the individual was transient and therefore could not be subject to Karma in a new life; but that Karma went on remorselessly (the result of deeds, words, and thoughts never ceased), and this was borne by all later generations of men (Int. § 43). That is Gotama taught the doctrine of Collective Karma, not of Individual Karma. In this sense he both taught and did not teach the doctrine of Karma; he was thus a *kiriyavādin* and an *a-kiriyavādin*, as he himself said. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 5 (*majjhena*) below.

[8] 'He teaches the doctrine of non-action', SBE.

Samaṇa Gotama is a believer in annihilation (*uccheda-vāda*)[1] . . . teaches a doctrine of contempt[2] (*jegucchitāya dhammaṃ*) . . . teaches a doctrine of dissolution[3] (*vinayāya dhammaṃ*) . . . teaches a doctrine of burning away (*tapassitāya*[4] *dhammaṃ*) . . . is undecided (*a-pagabbho*)[5] . . . is confident (*assattho*)."[6]

[6] And in what way, Sīha, might one speaking rightly say of me "The Samaṇa Gotama has no belief in action (*Karma*). . . ."? I teach[7] the not doing (*a-kiriyam*) of unrighteous action[8] by deed,[9] by word,[10] or by thought;[11] I teach the not making of the many evil conditions (*dhammānaṃ*)[12] opposed to good (*a-kusalānaṃ*).[13] . . . I teach the doing of righteous actions by deed, by word, and by thought; I teach the making of many good conditions. . . .

[7] And in what way might one say. . . . "The Samaṇa Gotama has belief in annihilation.[14] . . ."? I announce the annihilation of lust, of hatred, and of delusion;[15] I announce the annihilation of the many evil conditions opposed to good. And in what way might one say. . . . "The Samaṇa Gotama teaches contempt[16]. . . ."? I teach contempt for unrighteous action, whether by deed, by word, or by thought; I teach contempt for approach to the many evil conditions opposed to good. . . .

[8] And in what way might one say . . . "The Samaṇa Gotama teaches dissolution.[17] . . ."? I teach the law of dissolution (*vinayāya dhammaṃ*) of lust, of hatred, and of delusion;[18] I teach the dissolution of the many evil

[1] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9]. 'Ucchedavāda ("the doctrine of annihilation") is the doctrine that death is the annihilation of existence. . . . But in this discourse the word is taken in a peculiar sense; comp. § 7.' SBE, xvii, p. 111 n. This point (annihilation of the individual soul) follows the previous one most appositely. Believing in annihilation of the individual, Gotama could not believe in the doctrine of individual Karma; but believing in the everlasting effects of deeds, words, and thoughts, he could not teach a doctrine of moral irresponsibility. See [6] below.

[2] See [7] below. 'Proclaims contemptibleness', SBE.

[3] ' "Right conduct". But in this discourse it is also taken in the sense of "putting away" (scil, evil); see § 8.'—SBE.

[4] ' "Self-mortification", literally, "burning", in which sense the word is taken in [8]'—SBE. This does not mean asceticism here. The Jains were peculiarly ascetic, and did not charge Gotama with asceticism. He claimed a higher austerity; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 [11]; and Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10] (*strenuous*). Cp. Ch. 3 § 7.

[5] Literally, not-bold. 'Apagabbha (apragalbha) and apagabbhatā ordinarily mean "irresolute" and "irresolution". But here the words are taken in quite another sense, with a pun that cannot be rendered in English; see § 9', SBE. The reference seems really to be to the apparent indecision of a doctrine which teaches both Karma and non-Karma, as above.

[6] See [9] below.

[7] See [5] above.

[8] See *Note* above; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [3]; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Pāli *du-ccarita*. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [II. 1] (*caraṇa*).

[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*action*); and Ap. F 1 (*Action*). Cp. Ch. 11 *c* 29; also Ch. 20 § 3 (1).

[10] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*speech*).

[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*will*).

[12] Or, the not forming of evil principles. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (6); Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [11]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [204]; Ch. 21 § 15 (2) n; also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [9]; Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [3] (*principles*); Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [7], 5 [2]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]; Ch. 19 *b* § 3 [5] (*qualities*). At *Majjh. Nik.*, i, pp. 46, 55, *dhamma* (belief) is used as equivalent to (*sammā-*) *diṭṭhi*, (right) view.

[13] Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [3] (*evil*); Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [11] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99]; cp. § 1 above; Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*).

[14] See [5] above.

[15] Ap. D *a* § 10 (*Three Fires*). Plainly he also taught the *an-atta* doctrine, the annihilation of individuality at death, but not that of moral responsibility.

[16] See [5] above.

[17] See [5] above.

[18] Ap. D *a* § 10.

conditions opposed to good. . . . And in what way might one say . . . "The Samaṇa Gotama enjoins burning away.[1] . . ."? I teach that all evil conditions opposed to good, all unrighteous actions by deed, by word, and by thought, are to be burnt away (*tapanīy*). . . .[2]

[9] And in what way might one say . . . "The Samaṇa Gotama is unfixed (*a-pagabbho*)[3] . . .[4] and is confident."[5] I am confident with the utmost confidence (*assāsena*), and teach a doctrine of confidence,[6] and instruct my disciples in it. . . .'

[10] When the Blessed One had thus spoken, Sīha the General said: 'Excellent, revered sir! . . .[7] Let the Blessed One receive me as a lay-disciple (*upāsakaṃ*)[8] taking refuge from to-day till I die.' . . .[9]

§ 4. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, VI, xxxiv., 12–13* (*the Conversion of Meṇḍaka*).

. . .[10] [12] Meṇḍaka[11] the householder, having caused many sumptuous chariots[12] (*yānāni*) to be made ready, mounted one and went out from Bhaddiya[13] . . .[14] to see the Blessed One (*bhagavantaṃ*) [at the Jātiyāvana].[15] And many heretics (*titthiyā*)[16] observed Meṇḍaka the householder from afar as he approached; and after observing him said to him 'Whither goest thou, householder (*gaha-pati*)?' 'I go to see the Blessed One, the devotee Gotama, sirs (*bhante*).' 'Why, householder, shouldst thou who art a believer in Karma (*kiriya-vādo*) go and see the devotee Gotama, who is not a believer in Karma (*a-kiriya-vādaṃ*)?[17] The devotee Gotama has no belief in Karma; he teaches a law of non-karma (*a-kiriyāya dhammaṃ*)[18] and in this doctrine he instructs his disciples.'

[1] See [5] above. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].

[2] Omitting an expansion of the same idea of *tapas* (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ch. 13 *d* § 4 [214]).

[3] In the sense of detached from the process of rebirth. See [5] above; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]. The charge is agnosticism (Ap. G 1 *a* ii); the reply is a pun stating the saint's detachment from a process of re-births.

[4] Omitting a punning explanation to the effect that an *a-pagabbha* is one who has freed himself from the necessity of being re-born, i.e. returning to a mother's womb (*gabbha*), and that in this sense the term may be used of the Tathāgata. Ap. B *a* § 6 (7).

[5] See [5] above; Ap. G 1 *a* (i).

[6] Literally, "quiet breathing".

[7] As in the narratives of the conversion of Yasa (Ch. 6 *a* § 7), Vaccha-gotta (Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [6]) and many others.

[8] Ch. 8 *l*.

[9] Omitting Gotama's repeated injunctions to Sīha to reflect, and finally, after his admission, to continue his gifts to the Nigaṇṭhas—an instance of the Teacher's tolerance. Cp. Int. § 42; Ch. 5 *a* § 7 [169]; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 (Pillar Edict VII, vi). The narrative is continued in Ch. 8 *j* § 8; see also Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7].

[10] Omitting instances of Meṇḍaka's magic powers (Ap. I *b*), attributable to exegetic fancy.

[11] Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [1]. He is included in the list (*Aṅg. Nik.*, iii, p. 451) of laymen who attained perfection (*niṭṭhā*); Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1] n.

[12] Int. § 190; Ch. 12 *a* § 9 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [xxx. 1]. Cp. Int. § 21.

[13] Int. § 146.

[14] Omitting repetition.

[15] The Jātiyā Grove on the outskirts of the city.

[16] 'Heretics' from the Hindu or Brāhmanical point of view, which the Buddhists evidently shared in this respect. Int. § 179.

[17] See § 3 [2] above.

[18] SBE, xvii (p. 125) translates as 'teaches Dhamma without the doctrine of action'. The charge made against Gotama seems clearly to be the intelligible one that his teaching was opposed to the doctrine of Karma. The charge is not further explained here; and to state without explanation that Gotama was an inactionist (passivist) would have been to bring forward a charge both unintelligible and baseless. His Eightfold Path was plainly activist.

[13] Then Meṇḍaka the householder thought 'This Blessed One doubtless must be the Saint and All-enlightened One, since these heretics are thus jealous.' . . .[1]

§ 5. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I, xxxviii, 11.*[2]

. . .[3] Fire-worshippers [and] Jaṭilas[4] (*jaṭilakā*), mendicant brothers, these must receive ordination (*upasampādetabba*),[5] and no probationary residence (*parivāso*) is to be required of them. For what reason? They hold the doctrine that actions have consequences (*kamma-vādino &c.*), they are believers in Karma (*kiriya-vādino*).[6] . . .[7]

c. The Buddhist Chain or Wheel of Causation or Paṭicca-samuppāda (Dependent Origination, Causative Process).[8] *(Texts supplementary, to Chapter 4)*

[*Note.* The following passages are placed in an Appendix and not in the main text of Gotama's Life because in their present form they are markedly metaphysical, illusionist,[9] and transmigrationist, and it would appear are for the most part late additions to the tradition. Gotama himself decisively set aside metaphysical speculation and limited himself as much as possible to ethical and practical teaching.[10] It is perhaps possible to find at the basis

[1] Omitting his approach to where Gotama was, and the latter's 'graduated' discourse, which proceeds as in the narrative of the conversion of Yasa and his parents. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].

[2] Ap. H 2 *a* (*Probation*).

[3] Omitting instructions regarding probationers formerly belonging to other (*añña-titthiya*) schools. 'A Titthiya school', SBE, xiii, p. 191. Int. § 179.

[4] Int. § 186; Ch. 7 *a* § 2. 'Jaṭilas' were fire-worshipping ascetics. 'Fire-worshippers' is apparently the more comprehensive term.

[5] Ch. 8 *b*.

[6] Since the Jaṭilas were not the only believers in the doctrine of Karma (Int. § 177), it may be concluded that they held a form of that doctrine specially acceptable to the Buddha. As they were sun-worshippers it was perhaps more realistic than the Karma doctrine of the idealistic Vedāntist schools. In any case it is evident that in spite of his *an-atta* doctrine, some form of the Karma doctrine commended itself to the Buddha. See § 3 [2] above; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. H 2 *a* § 4.

[7] Omitting similar instructions regarding Sākiya probationers formerly belonging to other schools.

[8] 'The Twelve Nidānas, afterwards called the wheel of causation, are repeated in no less than ninety-six Suttas', A. Coomaraswāmy, *Buddha*, p. 96. On this difficult subject see Mrs. Rhys Davids's article 'Paṭiccasamuppāda' in the *Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics*. On the representation of the twelve parts of the wheel of causation in the Ajanta cave (cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 1, *Dhamma-cakka*) frescoes and in Tibetan and modern Japanese Buddhist pictures see T. W. Rhys Davids's (Lectures on) *Buddhism its History and Literature* (2nd ed. 1926, pp. 119–20, 153–60). Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [7] n; also IN 6 (*Canon*) n; IN 8 *c*; Int. §§ 7 n, 8 (*unity*), 67, 86; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 2, 6 n; Ch. 5 *b* § 10 n; Ch. 9 (*Meditation* and *Trances*); Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [3]; Ap. B *a* § 2; Ap. D *b*; Ap. E *c* i §§ 3 [29], 5 [8]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 7 n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 5; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [i. 29], [ii. 30]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] n. For *paṭicca* cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 7; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]; Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (4). With *samuppāda* compare *samudaya* (Ch. 4 § 10 [2]; Ch. 9 *a* [3]); *hetu* (Ch. 7 *a* § 19) and *paccaya* (Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]).

[9] Int. § 88; and Int. § 22 (*metaphysical*). Compare the idealistic process of origination implicit in the *Prāshna-Upanishad*: 'All things fly to the Self. . . . This is the Self who sees, touches, hears, smells, tastes, thinks, discriminates, acts. The personal self and the ultimate imperishable, impersonal Self, are one', *Ten Principal Upanishads*, tr. Shree Purohit Swāmi and W. B. Yeats, 1937, p. 45.

[10] Ap. G 1 *a*.

of *Paṭicca-samuppāda* an ethical and psychological analysis of Egoism, rather than a metaphysical account of the five skandhas (Pāli *khandhā*; aggregations constituting individuality),[1] their origin without a First Cause, and how they are perpetuated[2] by the action of Karma. According to the Four Noble Truths, which are the foundation of Gotama's teaching,[3] there is but one source of sorrow in the transient life of man, namely Desire (Egoism).[4] This is the Law; but those who do not know the Law are blinded by their ignorance. Thus it follows that there must be two sources of sorrow, namely Desire (Egoism) and Ignorance.[5] And the roots of Desire are on the one hand the senses, and on the other hand the mind which is deceived.[6] Such ethical doctrines Gotama must have taught. We have all the terms recurring in a mystical dress here in the dogma of *Paṭicca-samuppāda*. It seems more than probable that the mysticism is due to others and not to Gotama.

The 'Causative Process' is apparently an attempt to expand Gotama's statement that the Individual is composite and transient[7] (and therefore only of secondary importance), and by the use of progressively vaguer terms to lead back to an illusionist origin of individual life. Thus earthly-existence (*jāti*, 'birth') is due to individual-existence (*bhava*, 'being'); the latter can be traced back to separate-being (*nāma-rūpa*, 'name and form'); that again to composite-unity (*saṃkhāra*, 'composites', 'individuality'); and that finally to misapprehension (*a-vijjā*, 'not-knowing', 'ignorance').[8] Nothing of course is explained by this derivation, except what Gotama had already emphasized, from a realistic standpoint, namely that the individual is derivative and his self-importance delusive as well as disastrous to himself and his surroundings.[9] The original of this formula has apparently been confused by Māyā-ist and Kamma-ist additions. From the resultant confusion three ideas stand out fairly clearly. These are: (1) The individualism which tortures mankind is based upon ignorance; (2) This individualism spreads and repeats itself; (3) With the eradication of individualism sorrow also is eradicated. In his first two sermons[10] Gotama showed the transitory nature of the Self, with the ethical object of proving the pettiness and futility of individualistic desires, and their foundation in ignorance and misconception. This ethical object appears to have been obscured by later metaphysical followers.

A not dissimilar attempt to derive the individual from a first origin (*buddhi*, intellect) through will or individuality (*ahaṃ-kāra*), the five subtle elements, the five organs of sense and the mind (*manas*), and other stages down to the subtle individual body (*linga-sarīra*), which transmigrates on

[1] Ap. E *a*.
[2] Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 7 [15] where the dependence indicated is in no sense metaphysical.
[3] Ap. G 1 *b*.
[4] Ap. D.
[5] Ap. D *b*.
[6] Ap. D *a* (*Three Fires*).
[7] Ap. E *c*. The stages or links of the Causative Process are termed Nidānas (§ 2 [2] n. below; Ch. 12 *d* § 4). In the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* (collection of classified Suttas) the 12th *Saṃyutta* is called the *Nidāna-Saṃyutta*, i.e. the group of discourses dealing with the links of the Causative Process. It may be observed that the great bulk of the 81 discourses in this group comes from Sāvatthi (cp. Ch. 11 *c*, *Rājagaha*).
[8] Or, illusion (*moha*) regarding separate individuality.
[9] Ap. G 2 *a*.
[10] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 and Ch. 5 *c*. If the first seven points of the Causative Process be taken as co-ordinate and the remaining five as dependent, a theory will be found which is consonant with the Second and First Sermons respectively.

separation from the gross body at death, figures in Sāṇkhya[1] philosophy, in the form in which it has reached us, and it is possible that the Buddha's successors borrowed to some extent in this as in other matters from early Sāṇkhya views (cp. Eliot, *H. and B.*, ii, pp. 299–300).

It is not difficult to imagine Gotama teaching his followers that out of ignorance and our individuality, out of the separateness of our minds and bodily senses, arises the individual's habit of grasping, desiring, and craving, and from such craving come the pain and sorrow which accompany the individual from birth to death with all the ungraciousness of decay; and conversely, that with the eradication of egoistic desire begin the fading away of sorrow and the disappearance of the ignorant individualism of the unguided mind and senses. When the parallel links of the statement were re-arranged so as to form a lengthened chain the metaphysical confusion of *paṭicca-samuppāda* arose. A shorter and apparently rational form of the process of causation appears in the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* (Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [4] n), and the steps are reduced to four in *Majjh.* 75 (Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n).]

(i)

§ 1. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction* (*Nidāna-kathā*), *JN*,[2] *p. 75.*

(1) Before the sun had set the Great One (*mahā-puriso*) thus put to flight the army of Māra.[3] And then . . .[4] he rendered clear in the first watch of the night[5] the knowledge of previous-existences (*pubbe-nivāsa-ñāṇaṃ*),[6] and in the middle watch the divine-vision (*dibba-cakkhuṃ*),[7] and in the last watch of the night he obtained the knowledge of the causative-process (*paṭicca-samuppāde-ñāṇaṃ*).[8] When he had thoroughly mastered this way and that way, backwards and forwards,[9] the formula of the twelve steps of

[1] Ap. G 2 *c*.

[2] See Ch. 4 § 4; and Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (12th *vassa*).

[3] The Evil One or Tempter. Ap. G 2 *b* § 1 [4].

[4] Omitting the miraculous homage of the Bo-tree. Int. § 94 (ii).

[5] Cp. Ch. 4 §§ 10 (*process*), 17 n; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]; and Ap. E *a*, *Note*.

[6] Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482] n; Ap. I *b* § 3; and Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note* (*Bodhisatta*). See (2) below; Ap. C *a* § 2 (423). Contrast Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [1. 30] n.

[7] Ch. 15 *a* § 6 [172] n; Ap. I *b* § 3 (*divine eye*). Cp. Ch. 5 *a* §§ 6 n, 9 n; Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21]; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. H 5 [95]; also Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*); and Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5] n.

[8] The causative-process, according to the Karma-ist view, is the process by which the individual soul is originally created; and the reverse of this process gives the stages of its extinction at the completion of its migrations. Transmigration is quite inconsistent with Buddha's doctrine of the impermanence of the individual soul. It is more than possible, however, that Gotama at this juncture, dwelling upon the nature of the universe, its oneness, its divineness, its endlessness, and pondering on the ceaseless self-assertion and insistency of the individual human soul, so sharply contrasted with its relative insignificance, may have striven to reconcile the two, and have found the reconciliation in the activity of altruism, which, denying to the self its permanence and self-importance, yet attributes to its deeds, words, and thoughts, an endless series of consequences to be borne by all succeeding generations, for good or ill; and finding all evil in the conflict of selfishness against unselfishness, may have meditated on the growth and decay of the egoistic spirit of man. The *paṭicca-samuppāda* is equivalent to the third *vijjā* (Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]), i.e. to the knowledge of emancipation, together with reasoning supporting the same. In this view it signifies that the knowledge of emancipation from sorrow depends on the sense of having overcome separateness and craving, the senses and the body, individuality, and ignorance.

[9] See § 2 [2] below (*process*).

causation (*dvā-dasa-padikaṃ paccay-ākāraṃ*)[1] the ten thousand worlds[2] quaked[3] twelve times up to their ocean boundary (*udaka-pariyantaṃ*). . . .[4]

(2) When thus he had pierced through to omniscience (*sabba-ññuta-ñāṇaṃ*)[5] . . .[6] he breathed forth this cry (*udānaṃ*)[7] never omitted[8] by any he Buddhas:[9]

'Through the round (*saṃsāraṃ*)[10] of many earthly-existences I ran not finding [escape],
Seeking the builder of the house [of individuality]! Sorrowful earthly-existence (*jāti*)[11] again and again![12]

O builder[13] of the house,[14] thou art discovered! Thou shalt not build the house again!
All thy rafters (*phāsuka*) are broken, the roof (*gaha-kūṭaṃ*)[15] is demolished:

[My] mind (*cittaṃ*) has escaped from composite-individuality (*vi-saṃkhāra-gataṃ*);[16] it has attained the destruction of cravings (*taṇhānaṃ*).'[17]

§ 2. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga I, i, 1–7.*[18]

[1] At that time the Buddha, the Blessed One (*bhagavā*), was staying at Uruvelā[19] on the bank of the Nerañjarā at the foot of the tree of Enlightenment (*bodhi-rukkha-mūle*)[20] having just become All-enlightened. Then the Blessed One sat [cross-legged] continuously for seven days at the foot of the tree of Enlightenment feeling the bliss of liberation (*vi-mutti*).[21]

[1] Ap. E *c* i § 9 (*dependence*); cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [11]. [2] Int. § 70.
[3] Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [43] n.
[4] Omitting the rejoicing of the ten thousand world-system (*dasa-sahassi-loka-dhātu*), and miracles of trees, blossoms, and flowers, &c. (Int. § 94, i). That the devout narrators of these events should have been led to describe the harmonious rejoicing of the universe at the initiation of the gospel of love and good will among men and all things living (Ap. F 1 *b*) was natural. The words of Buddha's own lips, as he described to them his experience of that time, may indeed have seemed to justify them, though he filled the universe with his own feelings and they peopled it with rejoicing spirits.
[5] Ethical enlightenment has here become universal knowledge. See (1) above; Ap. I *b* (*Occultism*). Cp. Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [3].
[6] Omitting further mention of prodigies.
[7] Ch. 2 § 2. These verses, which are here attributed to the Buddha, are included in the *Dhammapada* collection of verses (153, 154), see Ap. D *b* 5, where they are said to come from the *thera* Ānanda's *Udāna-gāthā* (*Ānandattherassa udānagāthā vatthu*). Almost identical verses are attributed to the Elder Sivaka in the *Thera-gāthā* collection of sacred songs (clii). They may be contrasted with the verses attributed to the Buddha in the *Mahā-vagga* account of his meditation on the Causative Process during the 1st Watch of the night (§ 2 below). The ancient ballad verses, which are interspersed in the canonical accounts of Gotama's life, are composed in a popular manner, probably by persons outside the inner circle of the Elders, and attribute to the Buddha the beliefs of popular Hinduism.
[8] Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6. [9] Ap. A 2 *c*.
[10] Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*); Ap. B *a* § 1; and Int. § 92.
[11] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2). [12] Ap. D *a* § 8 (342).
[13] i.e. Desire (*taṇhā*). Int. § 24 (*pono-bbhavikā*).
[14] Pāli *gaha*. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii). [15] Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [4].
[16] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40]; Ap. E *a*, *Note*; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 (*jāti*); also Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-transcendence*).
[17] Or, cravings. Ap. D *a*. [18] Ch. 4 §§ 9–12.
[19] Int. § 145. [20] Ap. A 2 *b* (64).
[21] Ap. D *a* (*Fetters*).

[2] Then the Blessed One during the first watch of the night[1] thought over the causative-process,[2] forward and reversed:

'Because of ignorance[3] (*avijjā-paccayā*)[4] [there is] composite-unity[5] (*saṃkhārā*);
because of composite-unity[6] consciousness[7] (*viññāṇaṃ*);
because of consciousness separate-being[8] (*nāma-rūpaṃ*);
because of separate-being the six-seats [of the senses][9] (*saḷ-āyatanaṃ*);
because of the six-seats [of the senses] contact[10] (*phasso*);
because of contact sensation[11] (*vedanā*);
because of sensation craving[12] (*taṇhā*);
because of craving grasping[13] (*upadānaṃ*);
because of grasping individual-existence[14] (*bhavo*);
because of individual-existence earthly-existence[15] (*jāti*);

[1] Cp. Ap. B *c* § 1 [1].
[2] Int. § 67. The process consists of twelve Nidānas or links. See *Note, Nidānas*, and § 1 (1) above; cp. Ch. 1 § 1 n, *Nidāna*; Ch. 7 *a* § 15 (*nidāna*). Contrast § 4 below where the steps are reduced to nine. The *Mahā-vagga* version with twelve steps has also *Nikāya* authority, e.g. § 5 below.
[3] Or, misapprehension. Ap. B *a* § 2 [8]; Ap. E *a* (*Saṃ. Nik.*, *Khandha-vagga, Sutta 5*); cp. Ap. D *b*, *Note*; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6]; and Int. § 96 (*Illusion*).
[4] The suffix means 'in dependence on', or 'by reason of'; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 11 [1. 5]; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]; Ap. E *c* i § 9, 6th verse; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [11]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [20].
[5] Or, individuality. Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [4] n; Ap. C *b* § 1; Ap. E *a*. Cp. Ch. 4 § 10 (*dhamma*). See *jāti* below.
[6] The *Saṃkhārā* and the next five steps are practically equivalent, with slight elaborations, to the Skandha-formula (Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ch. 5 *c* § 1; Ap. E *a Skandhas* n), which is a psychological analysis intended to show the composite nature and therefore the transience of individuality. The tenth, eleventh, and the first part of the twelfth steps, namely individual existence (depending on ignorance or illusion), earthly-existence and decay-and-death, belong to another and metaphysical series, intended to show the illusionary nature of individual life. The remaining steps, namely ignorance or misapprehension, desire, grasping, and all the sorrows (the latter part of the twelfth step), constitute an ethical series exactly corresponding to Gotama's teaching in the first sermons leading up to the Noble Eightfold Path of conduct (Ap. F 2, iv).
[7] Or, intellect. Ap. B *c* § 3; Ap. E *a*; Ap. E *b* § 2; Ap. E *c* i §§ 4, 7 [3]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].
[8] Literally, name-and-form. See §§ 3, 4, below; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [5]; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (3); Ap. B *b* § 1; Ap. D *a* § 8, i (221); Ap. G 2 *a* §§ 1, 8. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 2 (*rūpa*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*form*). See also *bhava* and *jāti* below; Ap. D *a* § 8, ii (*sakkaya*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1) n (*ahiṃkāra*).
[9] i.e. the five physical senses and the mind; see SBE, xiii, p. 77 n. Ch. 9 *a* §§ 7, 10; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 2 [4] n, 7 [4] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 18 n; Ap. G 2 *a* §§ 3, 9; also Ch. 7 *a* § 5 (*eye*); Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [8] (*mind*); Ap. C *b* 11 (370); Ap. D *b* § 2 [7]; Ap. E *a* ii § 3. Cp. § 4[2] below; Ch. 7 *a* § 18 (*indriyāni*); Ap. E *c* ii § 2. For *āyatana* see Ap. 1 *a* § 1 [174]. The four preceding steps are at times ignored; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [11] n.
[10] Or, touching. Ap. D *b* § 2.
[11] Ap. E *a*; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* (*Fire-Sermon*).
[12] Literally, thirst. Ap. D *a*.
[13] Ap. D *a*; also Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3] n. The preceding steps are at times omitted; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [5].
[14] Literally, becoming. Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*bhava-taṇhā*); Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [5]; Ap. A 2 *a* (10); Ap. B *a* § 4 [2]; see § 4 [5] below; Ap. C *b* § 2; Ap. D *a* §§ 1, 5 [6]; Ap. F 2 *a* (130); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3). Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5, *bhāva*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 (*satta*); also Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*). See *nāma-rūpa* above.
[15] Literally, birth. See below § 4 [4]; Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 5 *b* § 5 (*jāti*); Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ch. 9 *a* § 10; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8]; Ap. C *a* § 2 (423); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5); Ap. I *b* § 3. See *saṃkhārā* and *nāma-rūpa* above.

because of earthly-existence[1] arise decay[2]-and-death (*jarā-maranaṃ*),[3] grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair.[4]

Thus there is origination[5] (*samudayo*) of this whole aggregation of sorrow (*dukkha-kkhandhassa*).[6]

Even so—

With the absolute[7] cessation (*nirodhā*) of ignorance[8] [there is] cessation of composite-unity;
with the cessation of composite-unity cessation of consciousness;
with the cessation of consciousness cessation of separate-being;
with the cessation of separate-being cessation of the six-seats [of the senses];
with the cessation of the six seats [of the senses] cessation of contact;
with the cessation of contact cessation of sensation;
with the cessation of sensation cessation of craving;
with the cessation of craving cessation of grasping;
with the cessation of grasping cessation of individual-existence;
with the cessation of individual-existence cessation of earthly-existence;
with the cessation of earthly-existence cease decay-and-death, grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair.

Thus there is cessation (*nirodho*)[9] ot this whole aggregation of sorrow.'

[3] . . .[10]

[4] Then again the Blessed One during the middle watch of the night thought over the causative process, forward and reversed. . . .[11]

[5] . . .[12]

[6] Then again the Blessed One during the last watch of the night thought over the causative process. . . .[13]

[7] . . .[14]

[1] The word *jāti* and all the remaining terms of the series, except those elaborating the word *dukkha* (sorrow), occur in the First Noble Truth of the First Sermon, together with the words *khandhā* (equivalent to steps 2–7) and *upadāna* (step 9). The words *taṇhā* (step 7) and *bhava* (step 10) appear also in the First Sermon (Second Truth). Thus all the terms of the series from the eighth downwards appear directly in the First Sermon.

[2] Or, old age.

[3] Decay (with disease) and death may be classified as material ill, and all the sorrows as immaterial ill. Ch. 1 § 1, *maranāni*; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [9].

[4] i.e. all forms of sorrow (*dukkha*). See § 4 [3] n below; Ch. 5 (First Sermon); Ch. 7 *a* (Fire Sermon); Ch. 9 *a* §§ 1 [1], 10; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [5]; Ap. E *b*; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] (*despair*); Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [21] (*dejection*); Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [111] n (*soka*).

[5] Or, development. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*origin*); Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ap. C *b* § 11 (374).

[6] Or, mass of sorrow.

[7] Literally, without residue or tinge.

[8] i.e. misapprehension regarding individuality.

[9] Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ch. 5 *c* §§ 7, 8; Ch. 7 *a* § 19; Ap. C *b* § 6; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] (*dukkha-kkhayo*); Ap. D *a* § 4 (354); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5).

[10] Omitting here the first verse of the cry (*udāna*) attributed to the Buddha. See Ch. 4 § 10 [i. 3].

[11] Omitting repetition.

[12] Omitting here the second verse of the cry (*udāna*). See Ch. 4 § 11 [i. 5].

[13] Omitting repetition.

[14] Omitting here the third verse of the cry. See Ch. 4 § 12 [i. 7].

(ii)

§ 3. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 14 (Mahā-padāna Sutta)*,[1] *ii, 18–19. (PTS, ii. p. 32.)*

[18] '. . .[2] "What must there be so that there may be separate-being[3] (*nāma-rūpaṃ*)? Whence comes separate-being? . . . When there is consciousness[4] (*viññāne*) there is separate-being; from consciousness there is separate-being. . . . What must there be so that there may be consciousness? Whence comes consciousness? . . . When there is separate-being there is consciousness; from separate-being there is consciousness." [19] Then, mendicant brothers, Vipassin the future Buddha[5] thought thus: "Going back, consciousness goes no further (*n'āparaṃ*)[6] than separate-being." '[7]

§ 4. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 15 (Mahā-nidāna Suttanta)*,[8] *1–22.*

[1] Thus have I heard. At one time the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*) was staying among the Kurus [at] the Kurus' town (*nigamo*) called Kammāssadhamma.[9] Then the venerable (*āyasmā*) Ānanda[10] drew near to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near and exchanged greetings with the Blessed One he seated himself at one side . . .[11] and addressed the Blessed One thus: 'It is surprising, revered sir, it is strange,[12] revered sir! How profound, revered sir, is the causative-process and its illumination how profound; yet to me it seems altogether clear.'

'Say not so, Ānanda. . . . The causative process indeed is profound and its illumination is profound. Through not understanding this law, through

[1] Ap. G 1 *b* § 2.

[2] The narrative is attributed to Gotama, speaking at Sāvatthi in the hall of the Kareri-lodge (*Kareri-kuṭikāyaṃ*) in the Jetavana garden (Ch. 14 *c* § 2).

[3] Or, separate-material-being; literally, name-and-form, or that which has material-form and identity. See §§ 2 (2) above, 4 [2] below. '*Nāma-rūpa*, literally, name and form, but actually meaning for Buddhists, mind and body', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1912), p. 72.

[4] Knowing-faculty, intellect, reason, or mind. See § 2 (2) above; Ch. 5 *c* §§ 1, 7 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [4] n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 1.

[5] Ap. A 2 *c* (16). Vipassin is included in the unhistorical series of Gotama's predecessors, and therefore the passage in its present form is traceable to Gotama's followers rather than to himself, but it may contain nonetheless ideas which he entertained.

[6] 'Die Reihe geht nicht weiter', OB, p. 260. Cp. Ch. 4 § 17.

[7] This may perhaps mean that in the last analysis we come to matter and mind, which are mutually dependent and cannot be separated in reality; and beyond these it is impossible to proceed. This would be a realistic view of the causative-process and opposed to the idealistic attempts to get back through more abstract terms to thought as the absolute origin. Cp. Ap. E *a*, *Note*, Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*, also Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n, and Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228] (*underlying*).

[8] Ap. E *c* i § 3. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 15 (*nidāna*). This is perhaps the earliest canonical authority for the account given in the commentarial introduction to the *Mahāvagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka* (see § 2 [2] n above).

[9] Int. § 152; Ch. 16 *a* § 1. The choice of scene for this dialogue with Ānanda seems curious. The text is largely commentarial.

[10] Ap. A 2 *b* (68). Ānanda here fills an intellectual role (Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [3]).

[11] Omitting repetitions.

[12] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 9; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [9]; Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [3]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6; Ch. 22 *b* § 24 [6]; Ap. I *b* § 4 [5].

not penetrating it, mankind . . .[1] cannot get beyond misery (*apāyaṃ*), suffering (*duggatiṃ*),[2] punishment (*vinipātaṃ*)[3] and wandering (*saṃsāraṃ*).[4]

[2] If it be asked, Ānanda, "Do decay-and-death depend on anything?" the answer should be . . . "Decay-and-death depend on earthly-existence (*jāti-paccayā*) . . . earthly-existence depends on individual-existence . . . individual-existence depends on grasping . . . grasping depends on craving . . . craving depends on sensation . . . sensation depends on contact[5] . . . contact depends on separate-being[6] . . . separate-being depends on consciousness." If it be asked, Ānanda, "Does consciousness depend on anything?" the answer should be . . . "Consciousness depends on separate-being."[7] Thus, Ānanda, on separate-being depends consciousness, on consciousness depends separate-being.[8] [3] . . . Thus there is origination of this whole aggregation[9] of sorrows.'

[4] '. . . This statement, Ānanda, that on earthly-existence depend decay-and-death, is to be understood thus. If there were absolutely and completely no earthly [or other separate] existence (*jāti*)[10] for anyone anywhere,[11] namely, for Spirits in the spirit-state (*devattāya*),[12] for lesser spirits in the lesser-spirit-state (*gandhabbattāya*),[13] for demons in the demon-state (*yakkhattāya*),[14] for ghosts in the ghost-state (*bhutattāya*),[15] for men in the human-state . . .[16] on the complete non-being and cessation of earthly [or other separate] existence would there be decay-and death?' 'No indeed, revered sir.'

[5] '. . . If there were absolutely and completely no individual-existence (*bhavo*)[17] for anyone anywhere, namely existence[18] in the world of sense-pleasure (*kāma-bhavo*), existence in the world of form (*rūpa-bhavo*), existence in the world of formlessness (*a-rūpa-bhavo*) . . . on the cessation of individual-existence would there be any earthly [or other separate] existence?' 'No indeed, revered sir.'

[6] '. . . If there were no grasping[19] . . . namely sensuality (*kāṃ-ūpādānaṃ*), heresy (*diṭṭh-ūpādānaṃ*),[20] superstitious ritual (*sīlabbat-ūpādānaṃ*),[21] [in

[1] Omitting similes. [2] Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n. [3] Ap. C *a* § 2 (*hell*).

[4] Ap. B, and Ap. B *a*, *Note.* So far the Discourse corresponds practically word for word with the *Nidāna-Sutta* in *Saṃ. Nik.* (Ch. 16 *a* § 3). From this point it expands the theme exegetically in the manner of the Suttantas; IN 6 (*Canon*).

[5] The 'six seats of the senses' are not included in this list. See 2 (2) above.

[6] Or, separate material being; literally, name-and-form.

[7] See § 3 above.

[8] Omitting the reverse dependence down to decay-and-death, to which material ills, causing pain, are added the immaterial ills, grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair (or all the sorrows). See § 2 [2] above.

[9] Or, mass. Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3].

[10] Or, life. The word *jāti* (literally, 'birth'), here has the widest possible extension and applies to all forms of existence from the world of the highest gods down to that of creeping things. See § 2 [2] above.

[11] It is scarcely probable that these subdivisions of the unseen world interested the realistic, practical, and ethical mind of Gotama. Ap. G 1 *a*.

[12] Int. § 70. [13] Ch. 14 *d* § 1 n; Ap. D *c* § 4; and Int. § 93 (vii) n.

[14] Int. § 93 (vii); Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]. [15] Int. § 93 (vi).

[16] Omitting quadrupeds, birds, and creeping things; and repetitions.

[17] See § 2 [2] above. Individual-existence is extended here even into the sphere of formlessness. [18] Ch. 2 § 3. [19] Ap. D *a* § 5.

[20] The heresy of individuality; see Ap. D *a* § 8 ii (*sakkaya-diṭṭhi*). KM, p. 52; RDB, p. 95; Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 103.

[21] Or, observance of superstitious rites, see Ap. D *a* § 8, ii (*sīlabbata-parāmāsa*) 'Mere rule and ritual', SBB, iii, p. 53. KM, p. 52; RDB, p. 95; Keith, *B.Ph.*, p. 103.

fine] assertion of a permanent-self[1] . . . on the cessation of grasping would there be any individual-existence?' . . .[2]

[20] 'The statement that on separate (material) being[3] depends contact is to be understood thus. . . .[4] If there were not the attributes, marks, signs, and indications by which there is perception of identity (*nāma-rūpassa*), would there be any contact?' 'No indeed, revered sir.'

[21] '. . . If consciousness[5] were not to descend into the mother's womb, would separate (material) being[6] be constituted in the womb? . . . And if consciousness after descending into the womb were to leave again, would separate (material) being have birth in this life (*itthattāya*)?[7] And if consciousness were to be withdrawn from a boy or girl in infancy, would separate (material) being attain to growth, increase, and fulfilment?' 'No indeed, revered sir.'

[22] '. . . If separate (material) being were not acquired would there then be origination and rise of earthly-existence, decay, death, and sorrow? . . . Thus, Ānanda, what is born and decays and dies and passes (*cavetha*)[8] and whatever arises (*uppajjetha*)[9] . . . is separate (material) being[10] together with consciousness. . . .'[11]

§ 5. *Saṃyutta-Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Nidāna-saṃyutta (Saṃ. i), Sutta 15. (PTS, ii, p. 17.)*

[1] He was staying at Sāvatthi[12] . . .[13] [3] Seated at one side the venerable (*āyasmā*)[14] Kaccāyana-gotta[15] addressed the Blessed One thus: ' "Right outlook (*sammā-diṭṭhi*),[16] right outlook!" So, revered sir, is it said. Now how far,[17] revered sir, is there right outlook?' [4] 'This world (*loko*) in general, Kaccāyana, is dependent on (*nissito*) two [opposite theories] "being

[1] Or, belief in soul or self (*atta-vada*); see Ap. E *c* i. RDB, p. 52; Keith, *B.Ph.*, p. 103. The second and fourth of these upādānas are plainly inconsistent with the rebirth doctrine, with which they are here associated. What Gotama really taught was that from grasping proceeds the individualistic spirit, which thus spreads continually from generation to generation. He taught that if individualism (due to ignorance) and craving were eliminated the personal sense of transience (Ch. 1 § 10) and sorrow would disappear and the holy-life would be led (Ch. 4 § 17); and that individuality was resolvable into fluctuating and transient compounds (Ap. E *a*).

[2] Omitting analyses of craving (desire), sensation, and contact.

[3] See § 2 [2] above (*nāma-rūpa*).

[4] Omitting a passage, which, although it deals with each of the two branches of 'name-and-form' separately, and states that each is composed of elements, does not appear to add anything appreciable to the analysis.

[5] Or, knowing-faculty. Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

[6] This theory resembles the Hindu view of transmigration, which assumes the perpetuation of the Ego; and is not attributable either to Buddha, who preached that there was no permanent-self, and therefore nothing to pass on save influence; or to those of his followers who endeavoured to reconcile by a mystery the doctrine of No-Ego with that of *Saṃsāra* by supposing the aggregate influence of one agent to migrate to a new agent in due succession as a flame to a new lamp. Ap. B *b* 1 (re-formed).

[7] Ch. 4 § 17.

[8] 'To leave one existence', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 208.

[9] 'To spring up in another (existence)', Warren. 'Or, re-appear', SBB, iii, p. 61.

[10] Ap. B *b* § 1 (*nāma-rūpa*).

[11] Omitting an emphatic re-assertion of the doctrine of rebirth from what is evidently a realist point of view.

[12] Ch. 14.

[13] Omitting the usual introduction.

[14] Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [7].

[15] See Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [7] n; Ap. A 1 *b* (5). For the termination *gotta* see Ap. E *b* § 2.

[16] Right view or survey. Ap. F 2 (iv).

[17] *Kittāvatā*; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [3].

(*atthitaṃ*)" and "not-being (*natthitaṃ*)". [5] Indeed, Kaccāyana, to one considering the origination of the world (*loka-samudayaṃ*)[1] according to fact with complete knowledge, there is no not-being[2] in the world (*yā loke natthitā sā na hoti*). [6] And, Kaccāyana, to one considering the cessation[3] of the world (*loka nirodhaṃ*), according to fact with complete knowledge, there is no being[4] in the world. This world in general is a bundle (*nibandho*) of approaching, grasping, and inclination,[5] but one [who has right outlook] does not enter upon, does not grasp at, does not insist on, this approaching and grasping of the mind (*cetaso*), this insistence and inclination and attachment [of an egoism which says] "Myself (*atta me ti*)".[6] He does not doubt or question that what arises[7] is sorrowful[8] (*dukkhaṃ*),[9] and what ceases is sorrowful. This knowledge is not from others, it is his own.[10] So far indeed, Kaccāyana, is there right outlook.

[7] "Everything has being[11] (*sabbaṃ atthi*)", this indeed, Kaccāyana, is one extreme; "nothing has being", this is the other extreme.[12] Avoiding both these extremes, the Right-farer (*Tathāgata*)[13] shows the Law (*dhammaṃ*) in the middle (*majjhena*):[14] [8] Because of ignorance [there is] individuality[15] (*saṃkhārā*). . . .[16] Even so with the absolute cessation of ignorance [there is] cessation of individuality. . . .[17] Thus there is cessation of this whole aggregation of sorrow.'

§ 6. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta* (*the Tens*), *Sutta 76*.[18]

[1] 'If three things (*dhammā*) were not in the world, mendicant brothers, then the Leader (*Tathāgato*),[19] the Saint and Supreme Buddha, would not

[1] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]; and Ap. D *b* § 6 [3]. For *loka* see Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
[2] i.e. there is reality; the world is real. Ap. G 1 *a* (iii); cp. Ap. D *b* (*Māyā*).
[3] Ch. 7 *a* § 19.
[4] i.e. no rest, no non-becoming.
[5] Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*).
[6] Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*).
[7] i.e. individuality.
[8] Or, painful. The pain arises from the struggle of the individual transient Self against others and the Whole.
[9] Ap. E *b*.
[10] Cp. Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 5 *a* § 10. Ap. C *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* (iv). Contrast Ch. 5 *a* § 2 (*beyond questioning*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3).
[11] Or, exists.
[12] What follows in the text appears at first sight to have no logical connexion with what precedes, and may have been added commentarially. What has been stated above is that life (this world) has a real, but at the same time a merely transient, existence; and that which comes into existence, and which is dissolved, is the individuality or egoism with which suffering is involved (as shown in the First and Second Noble Truths of the First Sermon, Ch. 5 *b* § 4). What logically follows is the Third Noble Truth, namely that with the uprooting of egoistic desire or individualism the sorrow of this life vanishes; and this carries us further, since life is real though transient, to the Fourth Noble Truth, the Noble Eightfold Path of active well-doing. The metaphysical question of how individuality arises interested later generations more than Gotama, who here expressly says that the knowledge of the necessary facts is intuitive and depends on no one but oneself.
[13] Ap. A 2 *c*; see § 6 below. That this title, so constantly attributed to the Buddha in the Canon, was actually claimed by Gotama is scarcely established (cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14] n). It is to be taken in connexion with the epithet *Su-gata* (Well-farer), probably meaning 'Good-Leader', often used of the Buddha (Ch. 10 *a* § 8; Ap. C *a* § 2, 126); also with the *majjhimā patipadā* (the middle way), the *ariya atthaṅgika magga* (the noble eightfold path), along which he led (Ap. F 2 *d*).
[14] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*Middle Way*). The Middle Doctrine here apparently acknowledges the reality of things and their transience. For Gotama's middle position compare Ap. B *b* § 3 (5).
[15] Or, composite-unity.
[16] As in § 2 [2] above.
[17] As in § 2 [2] above.
[18] The scene is not mentioned, but the Sutta is placed among Discourses delivered at Sāvatthi.
[19] See § 5 [7] above.

appear in this world; the Law and rules (*dhamma-vinayo*) which he makes known would not shine in this world. What are these three? [2] Individual-existence,[1] decay,[2] and death (*jāti ca, jarā ca, maranañ ca*).'[3] . . .[4]

[1] Or, birth as an individual. Ch. 1 § 11.

[2] Or, old age.

[3] i.e. the transience and suffering of the world. We have here perhaps the nucleus of the later elaborations of the Causative Process.

[4] The Sutta proceeds, forwards and backwards, through ten steps, each consisting of three vices, the second step being lust, hatred, and delusion, and the tenth being shamelessness, insensibility, and sloth.

APPENDIX C

(Texts supplementary to Chapter 3)

NIRVĀNA OR NIBBĀNA[1]

a. Hindu and later Buddhist Nirvāna:[2] *extinction, or heaven, after this life; Heaven and Hell*

[*Note.* The following passages describe Nirvāna as it appeared to the later Buddhists. Their view is almost indistinguishable from that of earlier and later orthodox Hindus, and may probably be attributed correctly to Gotama before the formation of his own distinctive doctrine. They are all characterized by the personal note, the joy in the triumph of reward, prospective or present, the desire to escape from personal loss or suffering. The note of impersonality,[3] of revulsion from egoism (*ahaṃkāra*), of altruism,[4] is absent. Buddhism perished in India because it failed to retain its original characteristics and relapsed into the popular, ritualistic, and individualistic beliefs from which it had arisen.[5] Among its losses was the ideal of heaven on earth, the peace of Nibbāna attained by the saint during this life.]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, Verses on the Saints'*[6] *Reward.*[7]

(90) For one who has gone his journey (*gat-addhino*), who is untroubled, entirely liberated (*vippa-mutassa*),
For one who has thrown off[8] all shackles,[9] fever no longer exists.

(94) Him whose mental faculties (*indriyāni*)[10] have attained tranquillity,[11]
Like a horse well-trained by the charioteer;
Who has thrown off pride and is without taints (*an-āsavassa*)[12]—
Such an one even the gods (*devā*)[13] envy.

(95) Like the earth he is not opposed [to any];
Like the threshold, such is the well-doer (*subbato*)—
Like a lake[14] of which the waters have become clear;
For such there are no wanderings (*saṃsāra*[15]).

[1] Int. §§ 112, 181 n; Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*); Ap. H 1 § 5. For references to the voluminous literature on the Buddhist Nirvāna and a discussion see ThB, pp. 187–191.

[2] IN 13; Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. A 2 *a* (8), (12); Ap. I *a*.

[3] Ap. E *c*.

[4] Ap. F 1 *b*.

[5] Int. § 57.

[6] Ap. D *c*.

[7] From the *Arahanta-vagga* (Saints-section).

[8] The word *pahīna* is used; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5) n. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [7] (*put away*).

[9] The Pāli word used is *gantha*. Ap. D *a* §§ 8, 9.

[10] Ch. 3 § 5 n. Cp. Ap. E *a* (*viññāna*); Ap. I *a* and *b*.

[11] The Pāli word used is *samatha*.

[12] Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14]; and Ap. A 1 *b* (1).

[13] IN 8 *a*.

[14] The lake and the lotus figure frequently and beautifully in Buddhist writings, as indeed in Indian literature generally. Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n; Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [168]; Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (16) n; Ap. A 2 *a* (15); Ap. D *a* § 4 (336). Cp. Ap. E *a*, *Note*.

[15] Ap. B.

(96) Restful (*santaṃ*) is the mind, restful the speech and action[1]
Of such a one as has become liberated (*vi-mutassa*)[2] and set at rest by perfect knowledge.[3]

§ 2. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, Verses on Heaven*[4] *and Hell.*[5]

(126) Some enter (*upapajjanti*)[6] [to be re-born on earth]; evil-doers go to hell (*nirayaṃ*);
Well-doers (*su-gatino*)[7] to heaven (*saggaṃ*);[8] the untainted (*an-āsavā*)[9] are extinguished (*pari-nibbanti*).[10]

(178) Better than sole-sovreignty of earth, than going to heaven (*saggassa*),
Than lordship over all the worlds,[11] is the reward of reaching the stream (*sota-patti-phalaṃ*).[12]

(423) Who knows his former habitation (*pubbe-nivāsaṃ*),[13] and perceives heaven and hell (*sagg'-āpāyaṃ*),
And has attained the end of earthly existences (*jāti-kkhayaṃ*),[14] the sage (*muni*), perfect in knowledge,[15]
All-perfect, consummate—him I call holy (*brāhmanaṃ*).[16]

§ 3. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 22* (*Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-S.*[17]).

'. . . [22] Whosoever, mendicant brothers, shall develop these four meditations[18] (*sati-paṭṭhāne*) during seven years, one of two results[19]

[1] This threefold division of 'mind, word, and deed' is constantly recurring in Buddhist ethics. It shows that thoughts and words are kingdoms equal with that of deeds, in the plane of conduct. To one who accepts the doctrine of Karma in any form, a thought or a word has its effects as inevitably as an action. Ap. B *b*, *Note.*

[2] Ap. D *a*.

[3] The Pāli word used is *sammad-aññā*. Ap. D *b*.

[4] Cp. Int. §§ 12, 35 ii (*Arahatship*), 101; Ch. 5 *b* § 6 n; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 7 *b* § 2; Ch. 11 *c* § 29 n; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [11] n; Ap. C *b*, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i § 2 n; Ap. F 1 *a* 1; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6]; see also below (126) n. Compare also *sugati* (Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n); *samparaya* (Ch. 13 *d* § 8 n). The tendencies which lead to *sagga* and *niraya* are set forth by tens in the closing Suttas of the *Dasaka Nipāta* of *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, v, pp. 103–9.). Buddha himself denounced all craving for the continuance of individual existence (Ch. 13 *c* § 18).

[5] Ap. B *a* § 7; Ap. B *c* § 4 [1] (*vinipāta*).

[6] Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [1] (*re-births*).

[7] i.e. the Arahats (Ap. D *c*). Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7]; Ap. C *b* § 11 (285); Ap. I *b* § 3. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 5 n.

[8] IN 2 *a*; Int. §§ 19, 33; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n; Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 8 [16] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8] n; Ap. C *b* §§ 9, 11 (174); Ap. G 1 *c* § 7. Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [2] n; Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii); Ap. D *c*, *Note*, n. For further references see n. to heading above (*heaven*).

[9] Ap. D *a*.

[10] Ch. 22 *a*.

[11] The Pāli word is *loka*. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

[12] i.e. of conversion. Ap. B *a* § 6 (7).

[13] Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1].

[14] Literally, birth-destruction. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[15] The Pāli word is *abhiññā*. Ap. I *b*. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 1 (1).

[16] Ap. F 2 *c* § 1.

[17] The Great Discourse on the Meditations or Fixing the Attention (Ch. 9 *a* § 14). This Discourse commences 'Thus have I heard. On a certain occasion the Blessed One was dwelling among the Kurus at the Kurus' town named Kammāssadhamma (Int. § 152). And there the Blessed One addressed the mendicant brothers'. The passage here given constitutes the close of the Discourse, and appears to present the characteristics not of the great Teacher, but of later monkish scholastics.

[18] The general subject of these meditations is impermanency. Ch. 9 *a*; Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [8]; and Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-knowledge*).

[19] Or, rewards (Ap. D *c* § 4 [*a*]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4). The offer of rewards constitutes an appeal to the desires of individuality, out of which arise all sorrows, according to the teaching of Gotama on the Four Noble Truths (Ch. 5 *b*). This passage therefore must be suspected of being of later date than Gotama's own teaching. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2].

(*phalānaṃ*) may be expected by him—either complete knowledge[1] (*aññā*) in this life[2] (*diṭṭhe va dhamme*), or, even if [at death] a residue [of grasping] remains (*upādi-sese*),[3] never returning (*an-āgāmitā*).[4] But setting aside seven years, mendicant brothers, whosoever shall thus develop these four meditations during six years . . .[5] five years . . . four years . . . three years . . . two years . . . one year . . . seven months . . . six months . . . five months . . . four months . . . three months . . . two months . . . one month . . . half a month . . . seven days, one of [these] two results may be expected by him—either complete knowledge in this life, or, even if [at death] a residue of grasping remains, never returning.

It was because of this (*etam paṭicca*) that I said [at first]: 'Mendicant brothers, there is only one way[6] (*maggo*) for the purification of living beings, for the overcoming of grief and lamentation, for the subsidence of sorrow and dejection, for the attainment of right method (*ñayassa*),[7] for the realization of Peace (*nibbānassa*), and that is the four meditations. . . .

§ 4. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 16* (*Mahā-parinibbāna Suttanta*[8]), *vi, 8.*

. . .[9] Having risen from the first trance (*paṭhama-jjhānā*)[10] he attained the second trance (*dutiya-jjhānaṃ*), having risen from the second trance he attained the third trance (*tatiya-jjhānaṃ*), having risen from the third trance he attained the fourth trance (*catuttha-jjhānaṃ*), having risen from the fourth trance immediately the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*) passed away completely (*pari-nibbāyi*).[11] . . .[12]

b. (*Texts supplementary to Chapter 5*)

The Nibbāna of Buddha: Selflessness or Extinction of Individualism in this Life.[13]

[*Note.* It may be gathered from the following extracts that the Nibbāna of the Buddha's own teaching was a state of selflessness attained during

[1] Or, gnosis; Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2]. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 5 (*paññā*); Ap. D *b* § 2 (*vijjā*); Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*).
[2] Int. § 40; Ap. C *b* § 4.
[3] Cp. Ap. C *b* § 1 (*upadhi*). 'If at death the groups still remain', Warren, *Bm.-in-Tr.* (1922), p. 375.
[4] Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]. The ideal of heaven and the ideal of a present Nibbāna which renders heaven a superfluity and impediment are plainly not reconcilable. The alternative offers a more popular substitute for the strictly altruistic theory which Gotama taught (Ap. C *b* § 10). It is to be observed that there is here no mention of lower stages (Ap. D *c*).
[5] Omitting repetitions.
[6] Ap. F 2 *d*; also Ap. D *b* (*ignorance*).
[7] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].
[8] The Great Discourse (or Narrative) of the Decease. Ch. 22.
[9] Omitting a passage describing how the dying Buddha proceeded through eight stages, and then reversed the process before commencing it again, to attain final extinction after the fourth stage.
[10] Ap. I *a*.
[11] Ap. C *b*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73]; Ap. G 1 *a*. Thus all mental effort and metaphysical modes of existence culminate in complete personal extinction; Gotama taught the present extinction of passion (Ap. D *c*, *Arahat*).
[12] Omitting the earthquake and storm occurring 'when the Blessed One was completely extinguished with total extinction (*pari-nibbute Bhagavati saha pari-nibbāna*)'.
[13] Int. §§ 5, 39 n, 48, 55, 60, 101, 105, 117; Ch. 4 §§ 5 (liberation, *vimutti*), 9 n, 16, 18 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 5 *b* § 4; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 4 [5] n, 10 n; Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] n; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 6 [4] n, 11 [3]; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 23 *a* [9] n; Ap. D *c*, *Note*; Ap. E *b*, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [19] n; Ap. F i *c* [162]; Ap. F 2, ii (*upekkhā*); Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6), § 4 [2]; Ap. G 1 *c*,

this life. It was altruistic in its nature and implied active social well-doing,[1] very different from self-centred isolation on earth or the enjoyment of bliss hereafter. The use of the words *pari-nibbāna* and *pari-nibbāyati*[2] for 'death' and 'die' in the *Mahā-parinibbāna-suttanta* shows that the word *nibbāna*, without the prefix *pari-* (indicating completion) denotes a state attainable before death. Later the words *nibbāna* and *pari-nibbāna* apparently were frequently used as synonyms[3] indicating a state after death, higher than the Brahmā-world[4] at the summit of the Rūpa-loka, and perhaps beyond and above the Arūpa-loka.[5] They sometimes, however, indicated apparently successive transcendental states, of which *pari-nibbāna*, or complete extinction, was the higher.

Among the Buddha's followers the word *nibbāna* was also sometimes synonymous with *sagga*, used both of a future state[6] after death and of a state of peace during this life.[7] While some passages in the *Dhammapada*, which is a handbook of sacred verses,[8] classified according to subjects, and collected from many sources in the Canon, mention Nibbāna as a state of bliss attained in this life, the language of others is ambiguous[9] and may refer to Nibbāna as a state of bliss attainable hereafter. This ambiguity of language may indicate how the one idea was developing into the other. Similarly there are four references in the *Dhammapada* to *Sagga* (heaven).[10] The word also appears in several of the inscriptions of the Emperor Asoka.[11] If the *Dhammapada* was in existence in the time of Asoka, as is probable,[12] it would appear that within two and a half centuries after the death of Gotama his followers had adopted the future individual reward[13] and punishment, without discarding Gotama's own teaching of the immediate bliss of self-forgetfulness in the extinction of individual desires.[14]

The numerous accounts of conversions in the canonical books, as well as in the *Nidāna-kathā* of the *Jātaka*, show clearly that the converts[15] of the Buddha became Arahats,[16] that is attained to Nibbāna during their life on earth. The Buddhist tradition[17] considers that the Saṃgha,[18] or community of mendicant brothers, at first consisted exclusively of Arahats, and large bodies of men attained to this state at the same time.[19] The

Note; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14, *veil*); Ap. I, *Note* (*Here*); Ap. I *a* §§ 4 (*serenity*), 5 [2]. For further references see below §§ 4, 6 (*this world*), 11 (89, *loke*). Cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] (extinction). *Nibbāna* means 'extinction' (Ch. 22 *b* § 27) as of a flame; the flame may be individual life or may be selfhood; cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [18] n, and Ch. 14 *c* § 14 [3] n. This self-extinction is an 'escape' (*nissaraṇa*) as to a refuge (Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]).

[1] Ap. F.

[2] Int. § 13; Ch. 11 *c* § 20 [18] n; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1] (*parinibbuta*); Ch. 21 §§ 7 [23], 16.

[3] Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), i, p. 223; cp. KM, p. 50. Compare § 11 (89) below, where *parinibbutā* is used of 'those who reach Nibbāna in this world'.

[4] Int. § 70.

[5] Ch. 2 § 3.

[6] Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [1] n; Ap. C *a* § 2. The root meaning of this word is 'brightness', there being an etymological connexion with the word *suriya* (Sanskrit *surya*, the sun). Cp. 2 (*Immortal*) below.

[7] See § 6 [4] below.

[8] Forming a portion of the fifth or last part, known as the *Khuddaka Nikāya*, of the second *Piṭaka*. Ap. A 1 *a*.

[9] See § 11 below (369), (370).

[10] Int. § 33. There are also seven specific references to *niraya*, besides allusions to hell under other synonyms; and three specific references to *saṃsāra* (Ap. B).

[11] Ap. G 1 *c*.

[12] RDBI, pp. 174–6, 188.

[13] Cp. Ap. D *a*.

[14] Ap. G 1 *b*.

[15] Ch. 5 (MV, 1, vi, 47); Ch. 6 (MV, 1, vii, 15), (MV, 1, x); Ch. 7 *a* (MV, 1, xxii, 5); Ch. 22 (MPS, v, 69).

[16] Ap. D *c*.

[17] Ap. A 1 *b* (1).

[18] Ap. H.

[19] Ch. 7 *a* (JN, p. 82; MV, 1, xxi, 4), (MV, 1, xxiv, 5).

Saṃgha was not a society of self-centred ascetics seeking personal salvation; it was an association naturally formed by a great organizing mind for the perpetuation and propagation of his doctrine and to set a clear example of holy living to the Hindu people to whose service he deliberately devoted his own self-forgetful and laborious life. That his followers would ultimately lose sight of this self-forgetfulness and return to the older path, more natural to simple minds, he seems to have foreseen.[1] It had no exclusive claims to righteousness. Oldenberg points out that Yasa attained salvation as a layman,[2] but thereupon became a mendicant brother. It may be pointed out further that in the *Mahā-vagga* narrative Yasa's father, the merchant prince, similarly attained salvation; but remained a layman. The *Mahā-vagga* describes the conversion of King Bimbisāra in practically the same terms.[3] The case of Gotama's father, Suddhodana,[4] is similar. The idea that salvation was the monopoly of the mendicant brothers was evidently a later notion, cultivated for priestly reasons, natural enough to a clerical order, but foreign to the mind of Gotama. Gotama did not call men to be mendicants in order that they might secure the prize of Nibbāna or any heavenly reward, but in order that they might serve the world,[5] by teaching the truth regarding individualistic desire and its destruction, which when rightly explained all men might learn at once and, like Yasa's father, without further reliance on others (*a-para-ppaccaya*).][6]

§ 1. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I, v, 2.*[7]

[2] 'Hardest for them[8] to see[9] would be the pacification of all individuality (*sabba-saṃkhāra-samatho*),[10] the abandonment[11] of all the bases[12] (*sabb-upadhi-patinissaggo*), the destruction of craving (*tanha-kkhayo*),[13] the absence of desire (*vi-rago*),[14] cessation (*nirodho*),[15] Peace (*nibbānaṃ*).'[16]

§ 2. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I, vi, 8–9.*[17]

[8] I am become above all,[18] knowing all (*sabba-vidū*), amidst all things
(*dhammesu*) I am unstained[19] (*an-upalitto*),

[1] Ch. 12 *d* (CV, xi, 6).

[2] OB, p. 369 n; and Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]. Cp. § 8 below; Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (1) n; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11]; Ch. 8 *l*; Ch. 13 *c* § 21.[19]; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [3] n; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note;* also Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [197] (*opinion*). A list of 18 head laymen each of whom has attained perfection (*niṭṭhaṃ gato*) and seen the deathless (*amata-ddaso*) is given in the Sixes of *Ang. Nik.* (iii, p. 451); Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1] n. Cp. Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3] n. Women also attained saintship (Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3]).

[3] MV, I, xxii, 9.

[4] Ch. 7 *b* § 2 [90]; Ch. 10 *b* § 2.

[5] Ch. 5 (MV, I, v, 7); Ch. 6 (MV, I, xi, 1).

[6] Ap. B *c* § 5.

[7] Ch. 5 *a* § 2.

[8] i.e. the Magadhan people.

[9] That this should be said of the usual doctrine of a Nirvāna hereafter seems improbable.

[10] Ap. B *c* § 2; Ap. E *a*.

[11] Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 4 (*indifferent*).

[12] i.e. of selfishness. 'The getting rid of all the substrata (of existence)', SBE, xiii, p. 85. According to the Karma view the *upadhī* are principles of growth, i.e. substrata of individual existence and consist of various forms of desire (Ap. C *a* § 3; Ap. D a § 1). Ch. 7 *a* §§ 8, 12.

[13] Ap. E a ii § 4 (1).

[14] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).

[15] Ch. 5 *b* § 7; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] (*tranquillity*).

[16] Ch. 3 § 5; cp. Ch. 14 *d* § 3 n.

[17] Ch. 5 *a* § 4. These verses with their prose setting appear both in the *Mahā-vagga* and in *Majjh.* 26 (Ch. 5 *a* § 9). The passage appears to be an extract from a ballad narrative with a prose commentarial expansion. The verses, attributed to Gotama, are clearly the work of a poetic follower considerably later than the great teacher. They are famous for the stanza describing the outset of the Buddha's mission. Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note.*

[18] Cp. Int. § 187 n; Ap. D *a* § 4 (103).

[19] Cp. Ch. 4 § 13.

Giving up all (*sabbañ-jaho*), liberated[1] by the cessation of craving.
Having by myself gained knowledge, to whom should I pay regard?
I have no teacher; none is like me;
In the world of men and spirits[2] none is my compeer.
I am a saint (*arahā*)[3] in this world, a teacher unsurpassed;
The sole supreme Buddha. Having attained tranquillity[4] (*sīti-bhūto*) I am at peace (*nibbuto*).[5]
To start the wheel[6] of the Law (*dhamma-cakkaṃ*) I go to [Benāres] the city of the Kāsis;[7]
And in the darkened world I will be the drum of the immortal[8] (*amata-dudrabhin*).

[9] . . .[9]

Like me are the Conquerors who have reached the destruction of the taints[10] (*āsavā-kkhayaṃ*);
Conquered by me are sinful thoughts (*pāpakā dhammā*),[11] therefore am I a Jina, Upaka.[12]
. . .[13]

§ 3. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, IX, i, 4.*[14]

'As the great sea, mendicant brothers, has a single savour, the savour of salt, so also, mendicant brothers, this Law and discipline (*dhamma-vinayo*) have a single savour, the savour of liberation.'[15]

§ 4. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 6 (Mahāli-sutta).*[16]

[13] When a mendicant brother by the destruction of the taints (*āsavā-naṃ*) knows fully and realizes by himself (*sayaṃ*) here in this world (*diṭṭhe*

[1] Ap. D *a*; see § 3 below.
[2] Int. § 35.
[3] Ap. D *c*.
[4] Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [3]. Literally, coolness. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 10.
[5] Ch. 2 § 2.
[6] Ch. 5 *b* § 1 (*Dhamma-cakka-ppavattana-S.*); Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ch. 13 *c* § 4 (6).
[7] Int. § 151; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 1 [36], 6 [170].
[8] i.e. the immortal (or divine) peace. See § 11 (21) below; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 6 n, 10; Ap. A 2 *a* (15); Ap. G 2 *a* § 6. See *Note* (*sagga*) above; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [31] n.
[9] Omitting the remark of the sceptical Ājīvaka (Int. § 183), Upaka, 'Then thou professest, friend, to be a saint (*arah*'), a supreme Conqueror (*ananta-jina*).'
[10] Defilements or sins. 'Sensuality, individuality, delusion, and ignorance (Kāma, Bhava (Ap. B *c* § 2], Diṭṭhi, and Avijjā)', SBE, xiii, p. 91 n. Ap. A 1 *b* (1); see below §§ 10, 11 (89); Ap. D *a* § 7.
[11] Ap. D *a* (*Evil*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. For *dhammā* see Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]. 'All states of sinfulness', SBE, xiii, p. 91.
[12] The prose setting, which is singular, was perhaps added to explain this name. It is conceivable that the author of the ballad adds here his own name, just as in numerous Homeric hymns the bard, imagining himself to be in the divine presence, cannot refrain from adverting to himself, though not indeed by name, in the concluding couplet.
[13] Omitting Upaka's sceptical reply and departure.
[14] Ch. 8 *b* § 4; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ap. D *c* § 4; Ap. G 1 *b* § 1; Ap. H 4 *d*. The discourse appears also in *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, iv, 200 ff, 206 ff).
[15] Pāli *vimutti*; i.e. that freedom from desire and the passions which is Nibbāna. See § 2 above; Ap. D *a* § 6.
[16] Ch. 12 *c* § 4; Ap. D *c* § 1. The scene is laid at Vesāli in the Kūṭāgāra hall.

va dhamme)[1] and enters upon liberation[2] of mind (*ceto-vimuttiṃ*), liberation of intellect[3] (*paññā-vimuttim*), the state of untaintedness (*an-āsavaṃ*),[4] and dwells therein—that, Mahāli, is a higher[5] and more excellent thing, for the sake of realizing which the mendicant brothers with me lead the holy life (*brahmacariyaṃ*).'[6]

§ 5. *Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 140* (*Dhātu-vibhaṅga-S.*[7]). (*PTS, iii, p. 245.*)

'. . . This is the supreme noble (*ariya*)[8] insight (*paññā*),[9] namely knowledge (*ñāṇaṃ*)[10] with the destruction of all sorrow. This liberation[11] of him [who knows] is established, based upon the truth (*sacce*). . . . This is the supreme noble truth,[12] opposed by nature to deception[13] (*a-mosa-dhammaṃ*), Release (*nibbānaṃ*).'

§ 6. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. i*), *Sutta 115.* (*PTS, iii, p. 163.*)

. . .[14] [4] 'If a mendicant brother teaches the law of aversion (*nibbidāya*)[15] from material-form,[16] of its fading (*vi-rāgāya*), of its cessation (*nirodhāya*),[17] well may he be called a brother who declares the Law. If a mendicant brother has attained to aversion from material-form, to its fading, to its cessation, well may he be called a brother who has attained the Law. If a mendicant brother by aversion from material-form, by its fading, by its cessation, without attachment (*an-upādā*),[18] is liberated (*vi-mutto*), well may he be called a brother who in this world (*diṭṭha-dhamme*)[19] has reached Peace (*nibbāna-ppatto*).

[5–7] If a mendicant brother . . .[20] by aversion from feeling[21] . . . is liberated, well may he be called a brother who in this world has reached Peace.

[8] If a mendicant brother . . . by aversion from perception.[22] . . . If a

[1] Int. § 33; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ch. 12 *e* § 2 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411]; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [13], 8 [4]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]; Ap. B *a* §§ 4 [1], 6 [7]; Ap. C *a* § 3; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5); Ap. I *b* § 3. Cp. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 14 [4] (*etarahi*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *loka*); Ap. G 1 *c* § 7 (*beyond*). See also § 6 below, and Ap. C *b* (heading). Literally, even in the visible order (cp. Part I, title, n, *dhamma*).

[2] Ap. D *a* § 6; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note.*

[3] Understanding or insight; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ap. F 2 *a* (132).

[4] i.e. Arahatship (Ap. D *c*). Ap. D *a* § 7.

[5] i.e. than the power of seeing divine shapes (*dibbāni rūpāni*) and hearing divine sounds (*dibbāni saddāni*). Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5] n.

[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 5; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] n.

[7] Division of elements; Ch. 11 *c* § 19. The scene is laid at Rājagaha, at the home of Bhaggava the potter (Int. § 130).

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265].

[9] Ch. 20 § 4 [8] (7). Cp. Ap. C *a* § 3 (*aññā*); Ap. I *a*.

[10] 'Knowledge how to destroy all dukkha', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 181.

[11] Ch. 4 § 17; Ap. D *a* § 6.

[12] Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ap. G 1 *b*.

[13] Or, falsehood; cp. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii, *moha*). 'Even that which is genuine', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 181.

[14] The scene is Sāvatthi. Ch. 18 *a*.

[15] Ap. D *a* § 6; cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7.

[16] Ap. E *a* (*rūpa*).

[17] Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].

[18] Ch. 5 *b* § 5 (*pañc' upādāna-kkhandhā*); see § 11 (89) below; Ap. D *a*.

[19] Or, in the phenomenal world. Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1]; also Ap. C *b* (heading); and Ch. 14 *b* § 8 [2]; Ap. D *c* § 3; see also § 4 above. 'In this very life', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 139. Cp. § 11 (89) below (*loke*); Ap. E *b* § 2 (*loke*); Ap. E c ii § 6 [20]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5), § 4 [4] (*lokaṃhā*; also Ap. H 1 § 6 [6]).

[20] Omitting repetitions.

[21] Ap. E *a* (*vedanā*).

[22] Ap. E *a* (*saññā*).

mendicant brother . . . by aversion from composite-individuality.[1] . . . If a mendicant brother . . . by aversion from consciousness[2] . . . is liberated, well may he be called a brother who in this world has reached Peace.'

§ 7. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Salāyatana-vagga, Jambukhādaka-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xxxviii*), *Suttas 1 and 2*. (*PTS, iv, pp. 251–2.*)

1 [3] . . .[3] ' "Nibbāna, Nibbāna", so one says, friend Sāriputta. But what is Nibbāna, friend (*āvuso*)? The destruction of lust, the destruction of hatred, the destruction of delusion;[4] that, friend, is called Nibbāna.' . . .[5]

2 [3] ' "Saintship (*arahattaṃ*),[6] saintship", so one says, friend Sāriputta. But what is saintship, friend? The destruction of lust, the destruction of hatred, the destruction of delusion; that, friend, is called saintship.' . . .[7]

§ 8. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Saṃyutta 11* (*Sota-patti-saṃyutta*), *Sutta 54*. (*PTS, v, p. 410.*)

[19] . . . 'I say to thee, Mahānāma,[8] that between a lay-disciple (*upāsakassa*),[9] whose mind[10] has been thus liberated,[11] and a mendicant brother, whose mind has been liberated from taint (*āsavā*),[12] there exists no difference as regards their liberation.'

§ 9. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 18*.

'If wandering-teachers[13] (*paribbājakā*) belonging to other schools (*aññatitthiya*)[14] should ask you, mendicant brothers, "Friends, does the devotee (*samaṇo*) Gotama lead a holy life in order to attain the Spirit-world[15] (*devalok-ūpapattiyā*)?"—if that question were put to you, would not you be distressed and ashamed and vexed?' 'Yes, revered sir.' 'So then, mendicant brothers, you are distressed and ashamed and vexed at [the desire for] heavenly life (*dibbena āyunā*),[16] heavenly beauty, heavenly happiness, heavenly splendour; you are distressed and ashamed and vexed at [the desire for] heavenly power ('*ādhipateyyena*).[17] Mendicant brothers, you should be

[1] Or, personality. Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*). Mrs. Rhys Davids translates this as 'the activities', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 139.

[2] Ap. E *a* (*viññāna*). The five *khandhā* together make up the transient Self.

[3] A wandering ascetic, Jambukhādaka (Ap. G 2 *c*) addresses Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [xxiii. 1]) at Nālā or Nālaka (Int. § 145).

[4] Ap. A 2 *a* (12); Ap. D *a* § 10 (*three fires*). See Ch. 12 *e* § 11 [3].

[5] The eightfold Path is stated to be the way to Nibbāna (Ap. F 2 *d*).

[6] Ap. D *c*.

[7] The eightfold Path is stated to be the way to Saintship (Ap. F 2 *d*).

[8] Buddha is addressing Mahānāma the Sakkan (Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [3]) at Kapilavatthu, in the Nigrodha Garden (Int. § 136). The extract closes the Sutta.

[9] See *Note* above; Ch. 8 *l*.

[10] Pāli *citta*. 'Seele', OB, p. 369.

[11] Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [19]; Ap. D *a* § 6. 'Thus' means 'from desire of this world and of the Spirit-worlds up to the world of Brahmā' (Int. § 70). The layman must be able to say that he is freed from these by the cessation of selfhood (*sakkāya*). Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).

[12] Ap. D *a* § 7.

[13] Int. § 179. The Buddha is speaking. The scene is not stated.

[14] Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

[15] 'To be re-born in the world of gods', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 424. This passage if it does not definitely reject the Hindu doctrine of personal Karma, decisively rejects it as a moral ideal. Int. § 8; Ap. B *a*, *Note* (*reward*); and Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (4).

[16] Int. § 70; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (29).

[17] Int. §§ 19, 34, 35; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5] n; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3); also Ap. C *a* § 2 (126) *sagga*. Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 6 (*existence*); Ch. 14 *b* § 8 [2] (*beyond*); Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii); also Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n (*detachment*); Ch. 17 *a* [4] (*sukha*). For the rejection of the idea of reward cp. Int. § 113; also Ch. 20 § 7 (5).

still more distressed and ashamed and vexed at [positive wrong-doing,] ill-doing by the body . . . ill-doing by word . . . ill-doing by the mind.'[1]

§ 10. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Chakka-nipāta (the Sixes), Sutta 49.*

[1] . . .[2] 'Revered sir (*bhante*), to one who is a saint (*arahaṃ*),[3] who is freed from taints (*khīn-āsavo*),[4] who lives the [holy] life (*vusita-vā*),[5] who has done that which ought to be done, having cast off the burden, having gained the real (*anuppatta-sad-attho*),[6] having destroyed the fetters[7] of individual-existence, being freed by the highest knowledge—to him the thought does not come "Such an one is superior to me, or is equal to me, or is inferior to[8] me".' . . . [2] Then the Blessed One . . . said 'Thus do clansmen (*kula-putta*)[9] manifest their knowledge (*aññaṃ*);[10] the fundamental (*attho*)[11] is spoken of, and the individual-self (*attā*)[12] is not referred to.

§ 11. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada Verses.*

(21) Diligence (*appamādo*)[13] is the immortal path (*amata-padaṃ*),[14]
indolence (*pamādo*) the path of death (*maccuno*).
The diligent (*appamattā*) do not die (*na mīyanti*); those who are indolent are like the dead.

(23) Contemplative, constant, always firmly strenuous,
Steadfast, they touch nibbāna, union and safety (*yoga-kkhemaṃ*)[15] unsurpassed.

[1] Ap. I *b* (*Magic*) and Ap. B *b*, *Note*.

[2] The scene is the Jetavana. Two advanced disciples living at Sāvatthi in the Andha-vana address the Teacher. Ch. 14 *c* § 12.

[3] Ap. D *c*.

[4] See § 2 above.

[5] Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [11]. For this and the next phrase see Ch. 4 § 17.

[6] Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10]. Cp. [2] below; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228] (*substance*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 8. 'Won his own salvation', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 216.

[7] Ap. D *a* § 8.

[8] i.e. they think of others as one with themselves. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1]; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* and § 4 [8] n; Ap. I, *Note* (*self-seeking*). Cp. Ch. 4 § 17 (*jāti*); Ch. 5 *c* § 6; Ch. 21 § 17 [2] n; Ap. C *a* § 3 n; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [7]; Ap. F 1 *b* §§ 3 [4], 6; also Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [5]; Ap. H 1 § 6 [9] n; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5 n. The thought recurs in the *Māgandiya-sutta* of the *Sutta Nipāta*.

[9] 'Men of true breed', Mrs. Rhys Davids. Int. § 159.

[10] Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [2]. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29] n (*dhamma-cakkhu*); Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [15] n (*abbhi-aññāsi*).

[11] Etymologically, that from which (or to which) one proceeds (Ap. G 2 *a*). 'The goal', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 255. Mrs. Rhys Davids translates this passage as 'they tell of their gain (*attha*) but they do not bring in the ego (*attā*)', *Buddhism* (1912, p. 216); cp. Ap. D *b* § 6 [3] n. See [1] above. Ch. 15 *a* § 8 (*highest goal*); Ch. 16 *c* § 2 n; Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [2], [3] n; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [262]; Ap. E *c* i § 2 n. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45] (*not this*) n; Ch. 15 *a* § 6 [172] n; also Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [4]; Ch. 9 *b* § 7; Ch. 10 *c* [1] (10); Ch. 14 *b* § 8 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3]; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [17]; Ch. 19 *c* § 1 [395]; Ap. G 1 *a* §§ 3 (6), 4 [4]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9]. Cp. also Ch. 8 *b* § 1; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [5]; and Ap. G 1 *b* (*Dhamma*). In the Tens of *Aṅg. Nik.* (v, pp. 224, 255) *attha* (*basis*) is almost identified with *dhamma* (law); cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 5 [189] (*dhamma*) n.

[12] For the impersonal view compare Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [7] (*others*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3), *divine*. It is in emphasizing the necessity of a practical, purposeful, and active selflessness that the Buddha insists upon his doctrine of the impermanence of the Self. Int. § 10; Ap. D; Ap. E *c* ii; also Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n (*selfhood*); Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [7]; and Ap. E *c* i. Cp. Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*); also Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3] (*bhava*).

[13] Int. § 38; Ch. 14 *b* § 8 [5]; Ch. 21 § 16; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 20, 25; Ap. E *c* ii §§ 5, 6 (19). Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6]; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (iv); Ch. 21 § 8 [26] n; also Ch. 20 § 3 (7).

[14] Cp. § 2 above; verses (285), (374) below; Ch. 7 *a* § 20.

[15] Int. § 178; Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. I *a*.

(89) Those whose minds (*cittaṃ*) are fully trained in the [several] parts of complete enlightenment,[1]
Who are glad in the abandonment of grasping, without attachment (*an-upādāya*),[2]
Freed from the taints (*khīn-āsavā*),[3] glorious, they in this world (*loke*)[4] are completely at Peace (*pari-nibbutā*).[5]

(174) This world (*ayaṃ loko*) is blinded; few in it perceive.
Like a bird released from a net, here and there one (*appo*) goes to heaven (*saggāya*).[6]

(202) There is no fire[7] like lust,[8] there is no ill (*kali*)[9] like hatred,
There is no sorrow like individuality,[10] there is no happiness like tranquillity.[11]

(203) Desire (*jighacchā*)[12] is the utmost disease, composite-individuality (*saṃkhārā*)[13] is the utmost sorrow;
Knowing this as it is[14] (*yathā-bhūtaṃ*) indeed is Nirvāna (*nibbānaṃ*), the utmost bliss (*sukhaṃ*).[15]

(285) Cut off love (*sineham*) of the self (*attano*),[16] as an autumn lotus with the hand;
Follow indeed the path to rest (*santi-maggaṃ*),[17] Nirvāna (*nibbānaṃ*), shown by the Welfarer (*Su-gatena*).[18]

(369) Bail out, mendicant brother, this ship;[19] bailed out by thee it will go lightly.
Having cut off both lust and hatred, then thou wilt attain to Peace (*nibbānaṃ*).

[1] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4]; Ap. I *a* (*Higher Knowledge*).
[2] See § 6 above.
[3] Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]. Cp. § 2 above.
[4] Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 9 *a* [1]; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]; Ap. E *b* § 2; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4]. Cp. Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [261] (*idha-loka*); and § 6 (*diṭṭha-dhamme*) above. See Ap. C *b* (*headline*).
[5] See *Note* above; Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 3 n, 6 [4]; Ap. E *b* § 2 [8]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (1). Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 2 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411]; Ap. E *b* § 3 (2); and Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [149] n.
[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. C *a* § 2 (126); Ap. G 1 *c* § 7. Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *paraṃ maranā*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [1].
[7] Ap. D *a*. In this sloka *rāga* and *dosa* are followed not by *moha* (delusion), but by *khandhā*, and it may hence be deduced that *moha* is delusion regarding individuality.
[8] The Pāli word used is *rāga*.
[9] Literally, 'unlucky throw at dice'. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).
[10] The Pāli word used is *khandhā* (aggregations). Ap. E *a*.
[11] Or, rest. The Pāli word used is *santi*. Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4].
[12] Literally, hunger. Compare *taṇhā* (thirst), Ap. D *a*.
[13] Ap. E *a*.
[14] Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2].
[15] Cp. verse (374) below; Ch. 4 § 14; Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ap. D *c* § 3; Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (2); Ap. F 2 *b* (*muditā*). It is only the selfish state that Buddhism finds sorrowful. Ap. D *a*, *Note*; Ap. E *b*, *Note*.
[16] Int. § 10; Ap. D *a* § 4 (285); Ap. E *c*.
[17] Verse (21) above; Ch. 2 § 5; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [5]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (368). Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 8 (*passaddhi*) and (*upekhā*); Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] (*santi*).
[18] Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (16); Ap. C *a* § 2 (126); Ap. E *b* § 2.
[19] See verse (370) below.

(370) Five [things] let him cut off, five let him leave, and five let him be above!
The mendicant who surmounts the five obstacles (*pañca sāng'-ātigo*)[1] is called one who has crossed the flood (*ogha-tiṇṇo*).[2]

(372) There is no meditation (*jhānaṃ*)[3] of the unwise, there is no wisdom (*paññā*)[4] of the unmeditative;
He in whom are both meditation and wisdom, is indeed in the presence of Nibbāna (*nibbāna-santike*).

(374) Whensoever he comprehends (*sam-masati*),[5] the origin and destruction[6] of the aggregates (*khandhanam*),[7]
He obtains the joy[8] and happiness of those who know the immortal (*amatam*).[9]

[1] Ch. 4 § 4 n; Ap. B *c* § 2 (*salāyatana*); Ap. D *a* §§ 8, 9; Ap. D *c* § 2; Ap. E *a*.

[2] Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]. Cp. verse (369) above; also Int. § 12; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii); Ap. D *c* (*sota-panna*); Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.

[3] Ap. I *a*.

[4] Ch. 20 §§ 4 [8] (7), 8 [12].

[5] Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [3].

[6] i.e. their transience. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[7] Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 19 n.

[8] The Pāli word used is *pīti*. Cp. verse (203) above.

[9] Cp. verse (21) above. It would appear that 'the immortal (*amataṃ*)' is Nirvāna and that Nirvāna is the state of those who recognize in the transience of the individual the divine permanence or immortality of the One. Int. § 35 (1); Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172]; Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 6. Cp. Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 4 § 16 (*death*); Ch. 5 *c* 3 n; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 16, 18; Ap. E *a*, *Note*; Ap. E *a* ii § 1; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (383).

APPENDIX D

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter* 4)

EGOISM[1] THE ORIGIN OF SORROW[2] AND EVIL[3]

a. *Taṇhā* (*thirst, desire, or craving*)[4] *and Upādāna* (*grasping*);[5] *the Hīnayāna*[6] *realist view of Selfishness; the Fetters*[7] *or Fires*[8]

[*Note.* The essential tenet[9] of the Buddha's doctrine is that individualistic desire, or selfhood, is the origin of sorrow. Every part of his supposed teaching should be tested by it. That which is discordant with it must either have passed into his doctrine through failure on his part to notice the inconsistency, or must have been added by later followers. As there are ample reasons to believe that he possessed a powerfully analytic and constructive mind,[10] the latter hypothesis appears to be far more likely. In his First Sermon (*Dhamma-cakka-ppavattana Sutta*),[11] the very basis of his teaching, he states the case against egoism most emphatically, in the first three Noble Truths (the nature, the cause, and the removal of sorrow). In the first Noble Truth he sets forth the nature of sorrow and summarizes it in the words—'briefly, the five-fold grasping-aggregate is sorrowful (*panc' upādāna-kkhandhā*[12] *pi dukkhā*)'—and this 'aggregate' is none other than individuality or egoism. This is something more subtle than mere selfishness, more insidious, and more difficult for characters above the ordinary to detect and throw off. In the second Noble Truth, or the Truth of the origin of sorrow, he lays down that thirst (*taṇhā*), or individualistic desire,[13] is the cause. And the third Noble Truth, that of the cessation of

[1] Int. §§ 3, 12, 55, 62; Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [5]; Ap. C *b* § 10; Ap. E *a*, *Note*; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1) n *ahimkāra*; Ap. E *b* § 2 (*burden*); Ap. E *c* i, *Note*, and § 2 [19] n; Ap. F i *b* § 3 [6] n; Ap. F 2 *a* (*nekkhamma*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4] (*lokamhā*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *b*, *Note*; Ap. H 1, iii (*priestly sin, boasting*). Cp. Ch. 8 *l* and Ch. 9 *a* § 9; Ap. F.

[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ap. E *b*; Ap. I, *Note*.

[3] Ch. 9 *b* §§ 2 [3], 4, 9; Ch. 20 § 3 (6); Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]; Ap. B *b* § 1 (*pāpaka*); Ap. C *b* § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17]; Ap. G 2 *b* (*Māra*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*a-kusala*). See Ch. 4 § 17 (*āsavā*); also Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (122, *virtue*); Ap. G 1 *c* (*Good*).

[4] See below §§ 1, 4 (335), 5, 10 (ii); Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [10]; Ap. B *c* §§ 1 (2), 2 (2); Ap. *E b*, *Note*, and § 2; Ap. F 1 *b*, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] (*hunger*); also Ap. F 1 *c*.

[5] See § 5 below. Ch. 5 *b* § 5 (*panc' upādāna-kkhandhā*); Ch. 5 *c* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* § 8 [11]; Ch. 9 *a* [2], [18]; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411]; Ap. B *c* § 5 [6]; Ap. C *b* § 6; Ap. D *c* § 4 n; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1); Ap. E *b* §§ 2 n, 3 (1); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 [20]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (394). Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 2 (*attachments*); Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1] (*covetousness*); Ch. 14 *a* § 5 [3] (*apekkhā*); Ap. I *b* § 4 [8] (*avoid*).

[6] Int. § 21; Ap. E *c* ii, *Note*.

[7] See D *a* §§ 8, 9 ii, below.

[8] See § 10 below.

[9] Ap. G 1 *b*.

[10] See especially Ch. 8 on the organization of the Saṃgha, and Ap. G.

[11] See § 1 below.

[12] Literally, 'the five grasping aggregations'. This phrase, like the synonymous plural word *saṃkhārā* ('composite unity', Ap. E *a*), seems to be most accurately rendered by a singular term indicating plurality collectively. It is translated as 'the five aggregates which spring from attachment (the conditions of individuality and their cause)' by Rhys Davids (SBE, xi, p. 148). Cp. '*sabbe saṃkhārā dukkhā*', Ap. E *b*.

[13] 'One might express the central thought of this First Noble Truth in the language of the nineteenth century by saying that pain results from existence as an

sorrow, finds relief for the sufferer only in the utter abandonment of all thirst. On the other hand well-being or good consists in denial of the self and in active well-doing. In the sermon which he preached to his first lay convert, Yasa, at Benāres almost immediately after the great discourse which converted his first five disciples, the opening section is expressly called a discourse dealing with the virtue of charity (*dāna-kathā*).[1] Thus loving-kindness to all men is placed in the very forefront of Buddha's teaching. The tradition of this was not lost to his later followers. The most characteristic of the attitudes of Gotama, figured in devout Buddhist statuary, is the Earth-touching attitude,[2] in which he stretches forth his hand to the Earth to call upon it as witness of his deeds of generosity in his Vessantara existence. The Jātaka stories[3] themselves are a long series of narratives of which the characteristic note is the self-forgetful generosity of the future Buddha (see the Story of the Wise Hare, No. 316).[4] Of the Ten Perfections which are the conditions of the attainment of Buddhahood laid down in the *Buddha-vaṃsa*[5] the very first is charity. The selflessness preached by Gotama, however, is not in any sense a passive virtue; it is intensely active,[6] as is shown by Gotama's own long and tireless life of labour for others. It is, in another aspect, *Mettā*, Love;[7] and is consistent with Right Aspiration (*sammā-saṃkappā*)[8] and endeavour or effort (*sammā-vāyāma*). In the conviction that egoism lay at the root of misery a sufficient, and probably the sole sufficient, reason can be found for Gotama's sudden and disconcerting abandonment of asceticism.[9] In the intense desire of the ascetic he found once more, however transmuted and freed from earthly purposes, the assertion of the Ego. Thus in forgetfulness of self and in thought of others lies Gotama's solution of the ills of the world.

The famous verses, 'O builder of the house',[10] attributed to the Buddha at the moment of his Enlightenment, point to desire as the builder not only of misery but of the Ego itself, and thus enter into the region of metaphysics, where the Buddha definitely refused to tread.[11] Distinction must be drawn between the metaphysical transcending of the Ego and the ethical escape from selfishness. The former is self-regarding and passive, the latter is altruistic and active.

Buddhism abounds in synonyms for personal desire, and in metaphors and similes illustrating the dangers and misery of this passion and the happiness of escaping from it—the fires, the fetters, the bonds, the obstacles, and the peace and bliss[12] of liberation therefrom.]

individual. It is the struggle to maintain one's individuality which produces pain—a most pregnant and far-reaching suggestion', SBE, xi, p. 148 n.

[1] This is part of the 'graduated discourse', which constantly recurs. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. F 1 *a*.

[2] Ch. 4 § 4 n. Cp. of the later Dhyāni (ethereal) Buddhas 'The Jinas (victorious ones) are Vairocana, Ratnasambhava, Amitabha, Amoghasiddhi and Akṣobhya, whose colours [cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 n] respectively are white, yellow, red, green, and blue and who exhibit the Bodhyagrī (Dharmacakra or Teaching), Varada (Gift-bestowing), Dhyāna (Meditative), Abhaya (Assurance) and Bhūsparsa (Earth-touching) attitudes of hands respectively', B. Bhattacharyya, *Indian Buddhist Iconography*, 1924, p. 2.

[3] Int. § 1.

[4] Ap. F 1 *a* § 2.

[5] Ap. F 2 *a* (117).

[6] Ap. E *c* ii; Ap. F 1.

[7] Ap. F 1 *b*.

[8] Ap. F 2 (iv); cp. Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1912), p. 222.

[9] Ch. 3 § 7 n.

[10] Ap. D *b* § 5 (154).

[11] Ap. G 1 *a* (ii).

[12] Ap. C *b* § 11 (203); see § 4 (285), (354) below.

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Saṃyutta Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Saṃyutta 12 (Sacca-saṃyutta), Sutta 11. (The Second Noble Truth.)*[1]

[PTS, v, p. 421.] 'This again, mendicant brothers, is *the Noble Truth of* the Origin of Sorrow; it is this recurring (*pono-bbhavikā*)[2] craving (*taṇha*, thirst)[3] attended by enjoyment and desire, seeking enjoyment on all sides, namely sense-craving (*kāma-taṇhā*);[4] the craving for individual existence (*bhava-taṇhā*),[5] the craving for the opposite of individual-existence (*vi-bbhava-taṇhā*).'[6]

§ 2. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Saṃyutta 1 (Khandha-saṃyutta), Sutta 63.*

[PTS, iii, p. 73.] [3] . . .[7] 'Well would it be for me, revered sir (*bhante*), should the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*) briefly set forth the Law (*dhammaṃ*),[8] so that I having heard the Law of the Blessed One might dwell alone, apart, diligent, strenuous, intent.'

[4] 'One indeed who grasps (*upadiyamāno*),[9] mendicant brother,' he replied, is the bondman of the Tempter (*Mārassa*);[10] one who does not grasp is liberated (*mutto*)[11] from the Evil One (*pāpimato*).'

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga,*[12] *Saṃyutta 4 (Māra-saṃyutta), Sutta 19 (Kassaka). (PTS, iii, p. 114.)*

[12] 'That of which they say "this is mine", and those things[13] which
they call "me"—
If there thy mind (*mano*)[14] is, O devotee (*samaṇa*), thou shalt not
of me be free.'

[1] As in Ch. 5 *b* §§ 6 and 10. See *Note* above; also Ch. 9 *a* § 11 (*Mahā-sati-paṭṭhāna Sutta*, where the statement is expanded).

[2] Or, eternal; literally, 'again becoming'. The accepted meaning of the word is 'causing the renewal of existence' (Ap. B *a* § 1), or 'leading to re-birth'. This meaning makes *pono-bbhavikā* the only illogical word in the statement of the four Truths. It seems possible that the word and the threefold expansion of the word *taṇhā* are monkish explanatory additions. Int. § 24. Cp. § 4 (335) below; Ap. C *b* § 2 (*bases*).

[3] See Ap. D *a* (*taṇhā*).

[4] Or, craving for sensuous pleasure; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3). For *kāma* see §§ 8 (ii), 9 (i) below; Int. § 33 n; Ch. 3 § 2; Ch. 4 § 14 [4]; Ch. 5 *b* § 4; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 2, 4 [5], 8 [11]; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [xi. 1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92]; Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [2] (*self-gratification*); Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [261]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (383); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. *rāga* § 10 (ii) below.

[5] Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2]; Ch. 21 § 17 [2]; also Ch. 2 § 3; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2). Cp. § 7 below; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73].

[6] *Bhava taṇhā* and *vi-bbhava-taṇhā* are translated in SBE, xi, p. 148, as 'the craving for a future life' and 'the craving for success (in this present life)'; in SBE, xiii, p. 95 as 'thirst for existence' and 'thirst for prosperity'; and as 'the craving for existence' and 'the craving for non-existence' in ThB, p. 87. The prefix *vi-* is sometimes intensive and sometimes negative. It appears here to be the latter. Ap. A 2 *a* (11); Ap. E *b* § 2 [6]; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9]. Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 6 n (*abhava*). For a variant of the third form of *taṇhā* see Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vi) n.

[7] The scene is the Jetavana (Ch. 18 *a*). An unnamed disciple addresses the Buddha.

[8] Ap. G 1 *b*.

[9] See § 5 below.

[10] Ap. G 1 *b*.

[11] See § 6 below; cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [18] (*release*).

[12] The first of the following verses is attributed to Māra (Ap. G 2 *b*), disguised as a ploughman (*kassaka*); the second verse is Buddha's reply. Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. B *a* § 1.

[13] i.e. the body, sensations, and the other constituents of the temporary Ego. See Ap. E *a* ii; Ap. E *c* i

[14] Ap. E *c* i § 4.

[13] 'That is not mine[1] of which they speak; they are not I (*aham*) of which they tell—
Thus know thou, Evil One (*pāpima*); my path (*maggam*) thou dost not even see.'

§ 4. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada Verses.*

(103) One may conquer a million men in battle,
But he who conquers himself (*attānam*) alone verily is the utmost battle-winner.[2]

(285)[3] Cut off love of the self (*attano*), as an autumn lotus (*kumudam*)[4] with the hand;
Follow indeed the path to rest (*santi-maggam*),[5] Nirvāna, shown by the Welfarer.

(335) He whom this wretched craving (*tanhā*),[6] wide-spreading[7] in the world (*loke*), overcomes,
His griefs (*sokā*) increase like the abounding bīraṇa-weed.[8]

(336) And he who overcomes this wretched craving, hard to be conquered in the world,
Sorrows (*sokā*) fall away from him, as water-drops from a blue lotus (*pokkharā*).[9]

(354) The gift of the Law (*dhamma-dānam*)[10] vanquishes every other gift;
The flavour of the Law vanquishes every other flavour;
Delight in the Law (*dhamma-rati*)[11] vanquishes every other delight;
The destruction of craving (*tanhā-kkhayo*)[12] vanquishes all sorrow.

§ 5. *Grasping, clinging, or attachment* (*upādāna*).[13] *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 15* (*Mahā-nidāna-suttanta*) *6–7*.[14]

[6] '. . . If there were no grasping[15] . . . namely, that of sensuality, that of heresy, that of superstitious ritual, [in fine] that of the assertion of a permanent self (*attavād-ūpādānam*), on the cessation of grasping would there be any individual existence (*bhavo*)?'[16] 'No indeed, revered sir.' 'Accordingly, Ānanda, grasping is the cause, condition (*nidānam*), origin and dependence of individual-existence. [7] . . . On the cessation of craving[17] (*tanhāya*) would there be any grasping?' 'No indeed, revered sir.' 'Accordingly, Ānanda, craving is the cause . . . of grasping. . . .'

[1] Ch. 5 *c* § 2. Cp. Ap. D *b* § 1.
[2] Ap. C *b* § 2; Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (103). Cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43] (*control*).
[3] As in Ap. C *b* § 11.
[4] Cp. (336) below.
[5] See *Note* above.
[6] See Ap. D *a* (*tanhā*).
[7] Cp. § 1 (*pono-bbhavikā*) above; Int. § 26; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [5] (*increases*); Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [6] (*example*); Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [16] (*act*); Ch. 20 § 2 (5) n; Ap. B *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 6; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*.
[8] The *bīraṇa* is a grass which infests rice-fields. Int. § 189.
[9] Cp. (285) above; Ap. C *a* § 1 (95).
[10] Ap. F 1 *a*.
[11] See *Note* above.
[12] Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5).
[13] See Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*) and § 2 above; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32].
[14] As in Ap. B *c* § 4 [6].
[15] The following analysis of *upādāna* is attributed to Gotama, but may be an explanatory addition.
[16] This is the metaphysical substitute for the sorrows of individual life. Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].
[17] Or, desire. See Ap. D *a* (*tanhā*).

§ 6. *Liberation (mutti, vi-mutti).*[1] *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Saṃyutta 12 (Sacca-saṃyutta), Sutta 11. (The Third Noble Truth.)*[2]

[PTS, v, p. 421.] 'This again, mendicant brothers, is *the Noble Truth*[3] *of* the Cessation of Sorrow; it is the cessation of this very craving, so that no remnant or trace of it remains—its abandonment, its rejection, liberation (*mutti*) from it, detachment (*an-ālayo*)[4] from it.

§ 7. *Influxes, taints, passions (āsavā).*[5] *Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 36 (Mahā-Saccaka Sutta).*[6]

[PTS, i, p. 249.] '. . . Then I turned my mind to the knowledge of the destruction of the taints[7] (*āsavānam*). I knew verily. . . . "These are the taints. . . . This is the origin of the taints. . . . This is the cessation of the taints. . . . This is the path leading to the cessation of the taints." '

When thus I perceived and understood, my mind was liberated from the taint of sensuous pleasure (*kām-āsavā*), the taint of individuality (*bhav-āsavā*),[8] and . . . the taint of ignorance (*avijj-āsavā*); and when I was liberated there arose in me the knowledge of my liberation. . . .'

§ 8. *Fetters (ten) or links (samyojanāni).*[9]

(i) *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada Verses.*

(221) Let him give up anger;[10] let him abandon pride (*mānaṃ*).[11]
Let him overcome every fetter (*saññojanaṃ sabbaṃ*)[12]

[1] See § 2 above; Int. §§ 34, 35, iii, 112; Ch. 4 §§ 5, 16, 17; Ch. 5 *b* § 9; Ch. 5 *c* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 6 *a* § 8 [11]; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 6, 24; Ch. 9 *a* § 4 [12]; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 21 [19], 29 [5]; Ch. 13 *d* § 9; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 4 [8], 7 [9], 18 [4] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (ix), (x); Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [7]; Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7]; Ch. 21 § 17 [2]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; Ap. C *b* §§ 3, 4, 5, 8; Ap. D *b*, *Note*; Ap. D *c* § 1; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1); Ap. E *b* § 3 (1); Ap. E *c* ii § 5 n; Ap. F 1 *b* § 5; Ap. F 2 *a* (130); Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; Ap. I *b* §§ 3, 5 [18]; also Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [12]; and *vi-mokkha*, Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5], and Ch. 22 *b* § 27. Cp. *nissaraṇa*, Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3]; *vi-suddhi*, Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]; *Nibbāna*, Ch. 1 § 11; *sad-attha*, Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10]; also Ch. 8 *b* (*Pāti-mokkha*) n; Ch. 9 *a* § 2 [2] (*independent*); Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [4] (*mind*); Ch. 20 § 7 (5, *emancipating*).

[2] As in Ch. 5 *b* §§ 7 and 10. See Ch. 9 § 12 where the statement is expanded.

[3] The words in italics confuse the grammatical structure of the sentence, in the Pāli as in the English, and may be later additions. Ch. 5 *b* § 8.

[4] Ch. 3 § 5 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4] (*mind*) n; Ap. C *b* § 6 (*aversion*). Cp. Int. § 105; Ap. F 2, ii (*upekkhā*).

[5] Ch. 4 § 17 [249]; Ch. 5 *c* § 10; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 8 [11], 14; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 9 [482] n, 12 [20]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [19]; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6] (*khīn-āsavā*); Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [7]; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 6 [8] n; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (3); Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]; Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7]; Ch. 20 § 8; Ch. 22 *b* § 7 [14] (*an-āsavā*); Ap. B *a* § 6 (7); Ap. C *b* §§ 2, 4, 8; Ap. D *c*, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8]; Ap. G 1 *b* §§ 3, 5; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*, n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [33] n. Cp. Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [xi, 1] n; Ap. F 1 *c* [161, *saṃkilesa*]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (7); also Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [1] (*reeking*).

[6] As in Ch. 4 § 17.

[7] Passions or impurities.

[8] Cp. § 1 above; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]; and Ch. 4 § 16 (*puna-bbhava*).

[9] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7] n; Ap. D *a* (*Fetters*); also Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [2]; Ap. C *b* § 10; Ap. D *c*, *Note*; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6]; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 5 (1); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. In *Majjh.* 2 the Fetters are three in number (Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [9]). Contrast Ch. 4 § 5; Ap. F 2 (*Virtues*). Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] (*snares*); Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411] (*bondage*); Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] (*dependence*); Ap. C *a* § 1 (90); Ap. C *b* 11 (370); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 [20]; and § 9 below.

[10] Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (4).

[11] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).

[12] See § 9 (ii) below. In the *Dhammapada* all references to the Saṃyojanas are general. On analysis all the Fetters prove to be changing forms of selfishness or of

Attaching him to separate existence (*nāma-rūpasmiṃ*);[1]
Sorrows do not befall him who has nothing (*a-kiñcanaṃ*).

(342) A race (*pajā*)[2] pursued by craving,
They move as a hare enmeshed.
Bound in fetters and bonds,[3]
They enter into sorrow again and again[4] for ages (*cirāya*).

(ii) *Aṇguttara Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta, Sutta 13* (*Saṃyojanāni*).[5]

[1] 'Mendicant brothers, these are the ten fetters (*saṃyojanāni*). What ten? [2] Five lower (*oram-bhāgiyāni*) fetters; five higher (*uddham-bhāgiyāni*) fetters. What are the five lower fetters? [3] False view of individuality (*sak-kāya-diṭṭhi*);[6] doubtfulness (*vi-cikicchā*);[7] misuse of duties and rites (*sīla-bbata-parāmāso*)[8] [in striving for reward]; sensual desire (*kāma-cchando*);[9] ill-will (*vy-āpādo*).[10] These are the five lower fetters. What are the five higher fetters? [4] Desire for form (*rūpa-rāgo*) [i.e. for existence therein]; desire for the formless (*a-rūpa-rāgo*)[11] [i.e. for existence therein]; conceit (*māno*)[12] [or pride of self]; up-liftedness (*ud-dhaccaṃ*);[13] want of knowledge (*a-vijjā*).[14] These are the five higher fetters. These indeed, mendicant brothers, are the ten fetters.'

Ignorance which is the source from which selfishness springs. The same may be said of all the various classifications of Bonds and Obstacles, as well as of the three Fires.

[1] Literally, name-and-form. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[2] Singular, collective; Ch. 16 *a* § 3 [4].

[3] The word used for 'bond' is *saṅga*. See § 9 (ii) below.

[4] Ap. B *c* § 1 (2) and Ap. B *a*.

[5] Also in *Saṃ. Nik.*, *Mahā-vagga*, *Magga-saṃ*, Suttas 179–80, where the discourses form part of the Sāvatthi series (Ch. 18 *e* § 1).

[6] 'Delusion of self', SBE, xi, p. 222; 'heresy of individuality', KM, p. 52; 'belief in a permanent self', ThB, p. 177; 'theory of soul, heresy of individuality, speculation as to the eternity or otherwise of one's own individuality', *Pāli. Dict.* Literally, 'notion of separately existing aggregates or bodies'. The term *sakkāya* (selfhood) is explained in *Majjh.* 44 (PTS, I, p. 299). Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [18]; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [9]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [14]; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (1); Ap. C *b* § 8 n. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 4 [6]; also Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*nāma-rūpa*); Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*); Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*).

[7] Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 4 [9], 19 [4]; and Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [2]. Cp. Ap. F 2 *c* §§ 1 (414), 3 (11); Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [23] n. Contrast Ch. 14 *c* § 18 [4] (*faith*).

[8] Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [9]; and Ap. B *c* § 4 [6]; also Ch. 20 § 7 (5) n; Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8]. See further Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* (*practices*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 1; Ap. H 1 § 6 [8]. The rites doubtless were Brahmanical rites maintained in Buddhist times as still in modern Siam (see H. G. Q. Wales, *Siamese State Ceremonies*, 1931). 'Wrong handling of habit-and-ritual', *Gradual Sayings*, v, p. 13. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3] (*pūja*); Ap. H 4 *a* (*Sīlas*); and Ap. G 1 *c* § 4 (*ceremonies*).

[9] Ch. 8 *g* § 8; Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (12); Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]; Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]. For *kāma* see § 1 above; Ch. 3 § 2.

[10] Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (2); Ch. 11 *c* § 15 n; Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [9]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 14 [iii. 4]; Ap. F 2 *b* (*a-vyāpajjha*); also Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7]; Ap. F 1 *b*; Ap. F 2 *a* (144, *patigha*). This fetter is termed *patigha* elsewhere (*Dīgha Nik.*, iii, p. 252).

[11] See § 10 (ii, *rāga*) below; and Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3); also Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (3), *joy of form*. Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 6 n (*abhava*); Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n (*āruppa*); Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note* (*egoism*); also Ch. 2 § 3 (*tayo bhavā*); Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*vibhava-taṇhā*).

[12] Self-importance. Ch. 4 § 14; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ap. E *c* i § 7 [3].

[13] See § 9 (iv) below; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [16]; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [1]. Cp. Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 [7].

[14] Ap. D *b* (*Ignorance*).

§ 9. *Five*[1] *bonds* (*bandhanāni*);[2] *five impediments; five ties; five obstacles, &c.*

(i) *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 13* (*Tevijja-S.*).[3]

[27] '. . . There are five sense-pleasure-strands (*kāma-guṇā*)[4] and these are named . . . chain (*andū-ti*) and bond (*bandhanaṃ-ti*). What are the five[5] things? Material-forms (*rūpā*)[6] perceptible by the eye . . . sounds . . . odours . . . tastes . . . substances perceptible by touch. . . . These five sense-pleasure-strands are named . . . chain and bond.'

(ii) *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, Verse 397.*

(397) He who having broken every fetter (*sabba-saṃyojanaṃ*),[7] is without fear,[8]
Who, having escaped the impediments (*saṅg'-ātigam*),[9] is released—him I call holy (*brāhmaṇaṃ*).[10]

(iii) *Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 16* (*Ceto-khila Sutta*)[11] *20–24.*

[PTS, i, p. 193.] . . .[12] [20] 'And who has broken through the five bondages[13] (*vinibandhā*) of the mind (*cetaso*)? . . . When a mendicant brother is rid of desire for sensuous-pleasure (*kāme*) . . .[14] his mind inclines to ardour (*ātappāya*). . . .[15] [21] And further, mendicant br thers, when a mendicant brother is rid of desire for the body (*kāye*) . . . [22] desire for material-form (*rūpe*)[16] . . . his mind inclines to ardour. . . . [23] When a mendicant brother is not . . .[17] bound to the ease of sleep, of rest, and of sloth . . . [24] when a mendicant brother has not adopted the holy-life (*brahmacariyaṃ*) hoping to attain to some spirit-community[18] (*deva-nikāyaṃ*) . . . his mind inclines to ardour. . . . Such have broken through the five bondages of the mind.'

[1] Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; Ap. C *b* § 11 (370); Ap. D *b* § 2; Ap. D *c* § 3; Ap. E *a* ii § 3; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 10 n; Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ap. F 1 *c* [162]. For the chief points of the faith set forth numerically in brief see *Dīgha* 33 and at greater length see *Aṅguttara Nikāya*.

[2] The Buddhists delight in picturesque synonyms, which they apply at choice, and in fluctuating subdivisions intended to fit into numerical series rather than into a strict scientific system. Cp. § 8 (*Fetters*) above; Ch. 14 *a* § 5 [3]γ (*bond*).

[3] Ap. F 2 *b*, *Note*; see (iv) below.

[4] Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]; Ch. 14 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [203]; and Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] n. See § 1 above.

[5] Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 7 (*spheres*).

[6] Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 (*sense organs*); and Int. § 34.

[7] See § 8 i (221) above. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 7.

[8] Cp. Ch. 1 § 10 [2] n; and Ap. F 2 *a* (137), *courage*.

[9] Ap. D *a* (*Fetters*). See § 8 i (342) above; Ap. D *c* § 2.

[10] Ap. F 2 *c* § 1.

[11] Discourse on Mental Obduracy (and the bondages or ties of the mind). The numbering is that of SBE, xi, pp. 229–32. The scene is the Jetavana (Ch. 18 *a* §§ 1 and 2).

[12] Omitting mention of the five Obduracies (*ceto-khilā*), namely doubts regarding the Teacher, the Law, the Community, the Training (*Sikkhā*), and anger with fellow-disciples.

[13] Ties or entanglements. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1]; also Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13] (*bond*).

[14] Omitting synonyms and repetitions.

[15] Omitting synonyms and repetitions.

[16] Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

[17] Omitting mention of overeating.

[18] Or, heavenly sphere (Int. § 34; cp. Ap. C *a* § 2 [126]; Ap. C *b* § 9). This fifth *vinibandha* corresponds with the sixth and seventh of the Fetters (Ap. B *a* § 6), namely *rūpa-rāga* and *a-rūpa-rāga* (desire for a future life in either the world of form or the world of formlessness; see SBE, xi, p. 222), and may be regarded as a development of *sakkāya-diṭṭhi* (false view of selfhood), the first of the Fetters. Ap. D *b*, *Note* (*micchādiṭṭhi*).

(iv) *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 13 (Tevijja-s.).*[1]

[30] 'In the same way, Vāseṭṭha,[2] there are five obstacles (*nīvaraṇā*) . . . and these are named barriers[3] (*ā-varaṇā*), and are named obstacles (*nī-varaṇā*)[4] . . . hindrances (*onahā*) and . . . snares (*pariy-onahā*).[5] What are the five? The obstacle of sensuous desire, the obstacle of ill-will, the obstacle of slothful torpor, the obstacle of ill-conceit (*uddhacca-kukkucca-nīvaraṇaṃ*)[6] and the obstacle of doubt (*vicikiccha-nīvaraṇaṃ*).[7] . . .'

§ 10. *Three Fires.*[8]

(i) *Khuddaka Nikāya, Buddhavaṃsa, ii, 12.*[9]

Just as where heat is found, there, as opposite, cold is found, so where the triple-fire (*tividh-aggi*) is found, Nirvana must be looked for.

(ii) *Dhammapada, Verse 251.*

(251) There is no fire like desire,[10] there is no prison[11] like hate,[12]
There is no snare like delusion[13]—there is no torrent[14] like craving.[15]

[1] See (i) above; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [78] n.
[2] A young Brāhman who with his caste-fellow Bhāradvaja inquired of the Buddha regarding union with Brahmā.
[3] 'Veils', SBE, xi, p. 182.
[4] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6]; Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]; Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3] n; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [203]; Ch. 20 § 10 [17].
[5] 'Entanglements', SBE, xi, p. 182.
[6] See § 8 (ii) above. Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1). For *kukkucca* cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 2].
[7] Or, scepticism. Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [23].
[8] Ch. 2 § 2; Ch. 4 § 17 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ch. 9 *a* §§ 4 n, 11 n; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 11 *c* § 15 n; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20] n; Ch. 13 *c* 14 [91] n; Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [4] n (*lobha*); Ch. 14 *e* § 6; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 4 [2] n, 14 [4] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (ix) n; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [2], [10]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]; Ap. B *a* §§ 4, 6 (7); Ap. B *b* § 3 [7], [8]; Ap. C *b* § 7; Ap. D *a* (*Fires*); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (20); Ap. F 2 *b*, n; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. I *a* § 2. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vii) n; Ap. C *b* § 2 (*sīli*); also IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).
[9] As in Ap. A 2 *a*, 12.
[10] Hungering or lust; Pāli, *rāga*, literally, dye. Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424]; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (1); Ch. 22 *b* § 27; Ap. D *b* § 1; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3). Contrast *vi-rāga* Ch. 5 *c* § 4; Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9]; Ch. 16 *a* § 7 [13]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (i); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. § 1 (*kāma-taṇhā*) and § 8 (ii, *a-rūpa-rāga*) above; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [91] (*greed*); Ch. 23 *b* § 4 (*liking*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 (*covetousness*); also Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (*āma-gandha*) n, and Int. § 19.
[11] The Pāli word is *gaho*, literally, 'house', Ap. B *c* § 1 (2). Cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (*Dhp.* 202) where hatred is compared with an unlucky throw at dice.
[12] Pāli, *dosa*. Ch. 5 *a* § 6; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [9]. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7] (*ill-will*); Ch. 20 § 3 (5); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (222, *anger*); Ap. G 2 *b* § 2 (*Dislike*). Compare also *mettā* (love, charity; Ap. F 1 *b*; Ap. F 2 *b*) the first of the four Brahmavihāras. These are all based upon the sense of unity, with which hatred conflicts.
[13] Pāli, *moha*; contrasted with *vijjā*, knowledge (Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [10]). Ch. 8 *g* § 8 n; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ch. 14 *b* § 4[4]; Ap. D *b*, *Note* and § 6 [3] n; Ap. F 2 *c* §§ 1 (414), 3 (11) n; Ap. I *b* § 3; also Ch. 4 § 18 [3] n. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [3] (*notions*); Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (3), *avijjā* (*ignorance*); Ap. D *b* (*ignorance*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1, *maññita*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*, and § 4 [8]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14, *veil*); also Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17] (*mogha*); Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [261] (*mogha*); and Ap. C *b* § 5 (*mosa*).
[14] The Pāli word is *nadi*, literally 'river'. Cp. *ogha* 'flood', Ap. C *b* § 11 (370).
[15] See Ap. D *a* (*taṇhā*).

b. The Mahāyāna[1] *Illusionist view of the Ego;*[2] *the Brāhmanic doctrine of Māyā (Illusion);*[3] *Ignorance (avijjā)*[4] *the Origin*[5] *of Evil*

[*Note.* The Mahāyāna sect of Buddhism did not arise till about the commencement of the 1st century, A.D.,[6] but the tendencies which gave rise to it were in existence long prior to that date, and themselves arose out of the Māyā (illusion) doctrine of the Vedānta[7] school of Hindu philosophy, to which apparently Gotama's teachers belonged. Distinction must be drawn between the realist Hīnayāna tenet of 'delusion' (*moha*,[8] delusion regarding the position of the individual) and the idealist 'illusion' of the *māyā* theory which subsequently developed into the Mahāyānist doctrine; between the false opinion, or *micchādiṭṭhi*,[9] of selfishness and that metaphysical *avijjā*,[10] or ignorance, from which ultimately arises separate existence; and between ethical liberation (*mutti*)[11] from the passions of individualism and metaphysical escape from individuality itself together with rebirth. These realistic and idealistic views of the phenomena of the world constantly fade into each other. The idealistic view came to prevail in the Buddhist schools of northern India, and still more so in the countries of middle and northern Asia to which Buddhist missionaries from India proceeded overland. The process, however, by which the idealist or illusionist theory came to prevail over the natural and unsophisticated realism of the Hīnayāna was gradual, and marked a return to a Hindu philosophic theory from which the Founder had departed.[12] Some four centuries after the period of the founders of Mahāyānism the famous Buddhist commentator Buddhaghosha,[13] who is the greatest exponent of the Hīnayāna doctrine, expressed himself in terms which often can hardly be distinguished from the language of Mahāyānism. The somewhat mystical, though not altogether unrealistic, idea of a fundamental divine unity and of the fleeting nature of individual life leads to expressions which can easily be interpreted as implying the unreality of the individual and a strict monism admitting mind alone.

The teaching of the new sect, self-styled the Mahā-yāna or Greater Vehicle, was a revolt against the particularism, or effort after personal salvation, into which the older Buddhist schools, collectively called by the Mahāyānist doctors the Hīna-yāna or Lower[14] Vehicle, had relapsed, and

[1] Int. § 21; Ch. 9 *a* § 11 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [3] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [1] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] n.

[2] Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 7 [3].

[3] IN 6 (*Canon*) n; IN 8 *c*; Int. § 96; Ap. E *c* i, *Note*; Ap. E *c* ii § 2 n; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* (*views*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Vedānta*). Cp. Ap. B *c* § 5 [5] (*not being*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 n (*diṭṭhi*); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14, *veil*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*nothingness*); also Ch. 14 *e* § 8 [2] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 (*māyā*); Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 (7, *māyā*). Contrast *paññā* (insight) Ch. 20 § 4 [8] (7). See ThB, pp. 199–201, 203; Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), i, pp. xliii, lxxvii.

[4] Ch. 4 § 17 [249]; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20]; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (3); Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii); Ap. E *a* ii § 3; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Ignorance is the delusion of selfhood (Ap. E *c* i). Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 13 [6] n (*tamo*); Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii, *moha*); further Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*yoga*, knowledge); also Ap. C *a* § 3 (*one way*), and Ap. E *c* ii: Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*). Contrast *paññā* (insight) Ch. 20 § 4 [8] (7).

[5] Ap. B *c*.

[6] Keith, *Buddh. Phil.* (1923), p. 216; Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), i, p. xxxii, and ii, p. 40.

[7] Int. §§ 66, 178.

[8] Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[9] Briefly *diṭṭhi*. KM, p. 52 n; Ap. D *a* §§ 8 (ii), 9 (iii) n. Cp. Ch. 5 § 4 [18] (*sammā-diṭṭhi*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 n.

[10] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[11] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[12] Ch. 3 § 5.

[13] Int. § 20.

[14] Literally, abandoned, low, inferior.

in this respect the new movement was an instinctive return to Gotama's fundamental principle, absolute altruism. In retaining a hold upon realism, however, Hīnayāna remained truer to the original teaching of the Buddha.]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, i, iii, 4.*[1]

'Blissful is the solitude of the happy one who has learnt the truth and comprehends;
Blissful is harmlessness in the world, self-restraint towards living things;
Blissful is non-desire[2] in the world, the transcending of sense-pleasures.
The abandonment of the conceit "I am" (*asmi-mānassa*)[3]—this indeed is the highest bliss.'

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xxii*), *Sutta 47* (*Samanupassanā*). (*PTS, iii, p. 46.*)

'. . . .[4] [6] Relying on what he has felt,[5] arising from ignorance and contact,[6] the uninstructed ordinary-man thinks—"I am (*asmī-ti*);[7] this I exists (*ayam aham asmī-ti*); I shall be (*bhavissan-ti*), I shall not be; I shall be with material-form (*rūpī*), or shall be without material-form; I shall have perceptions, or shall not have perceptions, or shall neither have nor not have[8] perceptions". [7] Now, mendicant brothers, the well-instructed disciple of the noble (*ariya-sāvakassa*)[9] has the same five[10] sense-organs (*pañc-indriyāni*), but he casts off ignorance (*avijjā*) and acquires wisdom[11] (*vijjā*). Because of the absence of ignorance . . . he does not think—"I am; this I exists. . . ." '[12]

§ 3. *Buddhaghosha's Visuddhi-magga* (*Path of Purity*), *ch. xvi* (*Indriya-sacca-nidesa*).[13] (*PTS, p. 513.*)

'Misery only doth exist, none miserable.
No doer[14] is there; naught save the deed is found.
Nirvana [*nibbuti*] is, but not the man [*puma*, individual] who seeks it.
The Path exists, but not the traveller on it.'

[1] As in Ch. 4 § 14.

[2] Pāli *vi-rāgatā*. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[3] Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [13], 8 [7] n. Cp. § 2 below; Ap. D *a* § 3 [13] Ap. E *c* i § 3 [31]. It is to be observed that the Saint is not freed from a separate existence, and so provided with an escape from rebirth, but from the delusion that he has a separate existence.

[4] As in Ap. E *a* ii § 3. The scene is Sāvatthi; Ch. 18 *a*.

[5] Or, sensations. Pāli *vedayita*.

[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *phassa*).

[7] The heresy of 'belief in self or soul' is called *sakkāya-diṭṭhi* or *attavāda* (see RDB, p. 95). Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [4]. See § 1 above; Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]; and Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).

[8] Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).

[9] Ch. 8 *l*.

[10] Ch. 10 *c* (43), faculties; Ap. D *a* § 9. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *salāyatana*).

[11] Ap. C *a* § 3 (*aññā*).

[12] Omitting repetitions.

[13] From H. C. Warren, *Buddhism in Translations*, Harvard Oriental series (1922), p. 146. The verses given in this section and section 4 and in Ap. E *c* i § 9 are quoted by Buddhaghosha. The *Visuddhi-magga* (cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]) is a general treatise on Buddhism by the greatest of Buddhist commentators; the present chapter deals with the Faculties. Int. § 20; Eliot, *Hinduism and Buddhism* (1921), iii, p. 30; KM, p. 9.

[14] Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 29; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17], [23], [26]. Thus Gotama's realistic divergence from Vedāntic idealism is retraced by his successors and his doctrine of the temporary self merges again into theoretical illusionism (Ch. 4 § 18 [3]; Ap. E *c* ii).

§ 4. *Buddhaghosha's Visuddhi-magga, ch. xxi* (*Paṭipadā-ñānadassana-visuddhi-nidesa*). (*PTS, p. 656.*)

'Behold[1] how empty [*suññato*] is the world,
Mogharāja![2] In thoughtfulness (*sato*)
Let one remove belief in self
And pass beyond the realm of death.
The king of death[3] [*maccu-rājā*] can never find
The man who thus the world beholds.'

§ 5. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Dhammapada, Verses, 153, 154.*[4]

(153) 'Through the round of many earthly-existences I ran, not finding [the cause];
Seeking the builder of the house [of separate existence], sorrowful earthly-existence again and again!

(154) O builder of the house, thou art discovered!
Thou shalt not build the house again!
All thy rafters are broken, the roof is demolished!
[My] mind has escaped from composite-individuality (*vi-saṃkhāra-gataṃ cittaṃ*); it has attained the destruction of desires.'[5]

§ 6. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Catukka-nipāta* (*the Fours*), *Sutta 45.*[6] (*PTS, ii, p. 55.*)

[1] At one time the Blessed One was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana,[7] in Anāthapiṇḍaka's garden. Then Rohitassa, a spirit (*deva-putto*),[8] when the night had advanced, illumining with exceeding brightness the whole Jetavana . . . standing at one side spoke to the Blessed One. . . .[9] [3] [The Blessed One replied,] 'The world's end (*lokassa antaṃ*) where there is no birth, no decay, no death, no continuing (*na cavati*), no rebirth (*na uppajjati*)[10]—I do not say, friend (*āvuso*), that that [world's end] may be known, seen, and reached by going; but, friend, I do say that without reaching[11] [this] world's end there is no making an end of sorrow. And verily, friend,

[1] From Warren, *Bm. in Tr.*, p. 376; see § 3 above. Quoted by Buddhaghosha in his chapter on the Path.

[2] A disciple of the southern Brāhman Bāvarī. The verses are taken from *Sutta-Nipāta* 1118 (SBE, x, p. 197). The name Mogharāja occurs in verses in *Saṃ. Nik.*, I, iv, 4; also in the list of early disciples in *Aṅg. Nik.*, I, 14 (Ch. 10 *c*, 47). For *mogha* meaning delusion cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17].

[3] Ch. 14 *c* § 13 [6]; also Ap. G 2 *b* (*Māra*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 12 (*Māra*).

[4] As in Ap. B *c* § 1 (2).

[5] Ap. E *c* i § 4.

[6] In the First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 6) the Buddha declared that sorrow originates in desire, i.e. personal desire or craving. Here the statement is that the continuous re-existence of the *saṃkhārā* or individuality, lying behind all sorrow, is caused by craving. This fades elsewhere into the extreme idealist theory that existence itself, not merely re-existence, is an illusion originating in that ignorance which lies behind all desire. Cp. Ap. D *c*, *Note*.

[7] This Sutta minus some details appears also as Sutta 6 of *Saṃ. Nik.* (PTS, I, p. 61).

[8] Int. § 138. Ch. 18 *a*, 2 [262]; and IN 8 *a*. For *putta* cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 2 [1]. '*Putto* means "membership of a body" ', *Gradual Sayings*, II, p. 55.

[9] Rohitassa asks whether it is possible 'by going' to reach the world's end, where birth and rebirth cease. The same question is discussed and answered in *Saṃ. Nik.*, *Kindred Sayings*, iv, pp. 57–9.

[10] Ap. B *a* § 4 [1].

[11] *viz.* by thinking.

I declare that even in this fathom-long body with its perceptions and mind[1] are [the phenomenal] world[2] and the origination[3] of the world and the cessation of the world and the path (*paṭipadaṃ*)[4] leading to the cessation of the world.' . . .[5]

c. The Four Stages[6] or Steps towards Saintship; the Arahat,[7] the Selfless.

[*Note.* The Arahat or Saint is one who by successive stages has rid himself of the defilements[8] or fetters,[9] and attained in this life to freedom, to selflessness, to joy, to Nibbāna.[10] The selfhood which the Arahat casts off in this life is necessarily ethical not metaphysical, selfishness not the Ego. The Buddhist idea of Nibbāna being realizable during this life by the Arahat must be an ethical escape from individualism, not a metaphysical liberation from individuality, the latter liberation during lifetime being an obvious impossibility. Thus the Hindu doctrine of Saṃsāra, with personal Karma[11] succeeded by Nirvāna after this life, becomes at least a superfluity[12] if not incongruous with other essential doctrines of the Buddha. The essential step to Arahatship or the attainment of Nibbāna in this life is some form of conversion or 'stream-entrance'.[13] Later ingenuity subdivided this process.[14]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 6 (Mahāli Sutta), 13.*[15]

'When a mendicant brother by the destruction of the passions[16] knows fully by himself here in this world and realizes, and enters upon[17] the

[1] *Sa-mana-ka*; cp. Ap. E *a* i § 4 [7] (*mano*).
[2] *Loka*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
[3] *Samudaya*; Ap. B *c* § 5 [5]; and Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29].
[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 8.
[5] Omitting verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*). The fairy-tale setting seems to show the comparatively late date of the Sutta. Allowing for the date the right interpretation appears to be not that, as in earlier Suttas, the Universal, the Deathless, the Uncreated (Ap. G 2 *a* § 7) is permanent and the Individual is illusory (Ap. D *a* § 10, ii, *delusion*), but that the phenomenal world is illusory and must be so understood by the individual mind conceiving it. Cp. *Gradual Sayings*, ii, pp. 56–7; *Kindred Sayings*, i, pp. 85–7; also Rhys Davids's note in SBB, ii, p. 273; Keith, *B. Philosophy*, p. 55; and *Compendium of Philosophy*, S. Z. Aung and Mrs. Rhys Davids (1929), Ap. on *Attha* (see Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]).
[6] See § 3 [15] n below; Int. § 110; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79] n; Ap. B *a* § 6; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] n; and Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10] n.
[7] Or, *Arahant*. Ch. 4 § 16 n; Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ch. 5 *c* §§ 5 n, 10; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 1, 10; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 1, 2 [17], 6, 16 n, 20 n; Ch. 7 *b* §§ 1, 2 n; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [17] (*goal*); Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [2]; Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [15]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (7); Ch. 13 *c* §§ 17, 22 [3] n; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]; Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [8] n; Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4]; Ch. 20 § 10 [17]; Ch. 22 *b* § 16; Ch. 23 *b* § 4; Ap. A 1 *b* (1); Ap. C *a* § 3 n; Ap. C *b* §§ 4, 7, 10; Ap. E *a* ii § 1; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32] n; Ap. F 1 *c*, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *a* [116] n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; Ap. H 4 *b* § 1 [9]; Ap. H 5 [92]. Cp. Ap. C *a* § 4 n; Ap. E *c* i § 8 [24]; Ap. F 2 *c* (*Brāhman*). The term is not limited to Buddhists; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [1]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [6].
[8] Ap. D *a* § 7.
[9] Ap. D *a* § 8.
[10] Ap. C *b*.
[11] Ap. B *a*.
[12] Cp. 'For all laymen [in Siam] and for most monks the nature of Nibbān is a purely academic question. . . . All the monks, of course, and most of the laymen know that rebirth is one of the possibilities; but it is quite noticeable that rebirth plays a very slight part in their thoughts, whereas heaven and hell are very vivid to them.'—J. B. Pratt, *Pilgrimage of Buddhism* (1928), p. 173. Ap. C *a* § 2.
[13] See § 2 below.
[14] Ap. D *b* § 5 n and IN 6.
[15] As in Ap. C *b* § 4.
[16] Or, taints (*āsavā*).
[17] Ap. I *b* § 4 [8].

liberation of the mind,[1] the liberation of the intellect, the state of passionlessness (*an-āsavaṃ*), and dwells therein—that is a higher and more excellent thing, for the sake of realizing which the mendicant brothers with me lead the holy life.'[2]

§ 2. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, Verse 370.*[3]

(370) Five [things] let him cut off, five let him leave, and five let him be above!
The mendicant who escapes the five impediments[4] is called one who has crossed the flood (*ogha tiṇṇo*).[5]

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Saṃyutta 1 (Khandha-saṃyutta), Sutta 122 (Sīla). (PTS, iii, p. 167.)*

[6] 'This case indeed happens, friend (*āvuso*),[6] that a virtuous (*silavā*) mendicant brother meditating these five grasping aggregations (*pañc-upādāna-kkhandhe*)[7] profoundly, as transient (*a-nicato*), sorrowful (*duk-khato*) . . .[8] and without permanent-self (*an-attato*),[9] may realize (*sacchi-kareyyāti*)[10] stream-attaining[11] as a result (*sotā-patti-phalaṃ*).[12] . . . [8] Again indeed by a stream-attaining mendicant brother, friend Koṭṭhita, these five grasping aggregations . . .[13] must be pondered. [9] This case indeed happens, friend, that a stream-attaining mendicant brother meditating these five grasping-aggregations profoundly, as transient, sorrowful. . . and without permanent-self, may realize once-returning as a result (*sakad-āgāmi-phalaṃ*).'

[10] 'And then, friend, Sāriputta, what thoughts (*dhammā*)[14] must be pondered profoundly by the once-returning mendicant brother?' . . .

[12] 'This case indeed happens, friend, that a once-returning mendicant brother meditating these five grasping-aggregations profoundly, as transient, sorrowful . . . and without permanent-self may realize never-return-

[1] Ap. D *a* § 6.
[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 3 [19]; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [11].
[3] As in Ap. C *b* § 11 (370).
[4] Pāli *saṅgā*. Ap. D *a* § 9 (ii).
[5] See *Note* above; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (414).
[6] Ch. 3 § 5. Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18) is addressing Koṭṭhita (Ch. 10 *c*, 31; Ap. A 1 *b*, 5). The scene is Isipatana near Benāres (Int. § 151). Thus this exposition has not the authority of the Buddha.
[7] i.e. transient individuality or personality. Ap. D *a* § 9; Ap. E.
[8] Omitting 'as disease (*rogato*)', with numerous synonyms, &c., Mrs. Rhys Davids translates these respectively as sickness, an imposthume, a dart, pain, ill-health, alien, transitory, empty (*suññato*).—*Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 143.
[9] Ap. E *c*.
[10] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]. Literally, 'make visible'. The threefold formula to be realized is briefly the subject of the *An-atta-lakkhana Sutta* or Second Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 5 *c*), which presents the metaphysical basis of the more famous First Sermon. Cp. also Ch. 4 § 10 (*manifested*) and Ch. 7 *a* § 19 n.
[11] i.e. conversion, or change of heart. Ap. B *a* § 6 (7); cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 14 *c* § 11 [3] n; Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [7]n; also Ch. 22 *b* § 16 (*devotee*). This must be compared with the symbolism of St. John the Baptist and the Essenes (cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 3, *anointing*; Ch. 22 *b* § 19 [30], *consecration*; and Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [1] n).
[12] Literally, the fruit of stream-attaining. See § 4 [*a*] below; Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 7 *a* § 8; Ch. 10 *a* § 1; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4]; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 8; Ap. G 1 *b* § 6. On *phala* cp. Ap. E *c* i § 9; also Ap. B (*Results of Action*).
[13] Omitting repetitions, as above.
[14] Possibly, points or things; cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [1]. For other uses of this comprehensive and difficult word see Ch. 4 § 10 n.

ing[1] as a result (*an-āgāmi-phalaṃ*). . . . [15] This case indeed happens, friend, that a never-returning[2] (*an-āgāmi*) mendicant brother meditating these five grasping-aggregations profoundly, as transient, sorrowful . . . and without permanent-self may realize Arahatship as a result (*arahatta-phalaṃ*).[3] . . . [18] For the Arahat indeed, friend, there is not anything further to be done, or dependence upon action (*katassa vā paticcayo*);[4] yet indeed these thoughts (*ime dhammā*), practised and developed, lead both to dwelling in bliss[5] in this life[6] and to self-knowledge (*sati-saṃpajaññāya*).[7]

§ 4. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, IX, i, 4.* (*Oldenberg ii, p. 240.*)

[4] '. . . .[8] Just as, mendicant brothers, the great ocean is the abode of powerful beings, and among these are the Timi, . . [9] Asuras,[10] Nāgas,[11] and Gandhabbas,[12] and there are in the great ocean creatures extending over one hundred, two hundred, three hundred, four hundred, and five hundred leagues; just so, mendicant brothers, this Law and discipline (*dhamma-vinayo*) are the abode of powerful beings, and among these are:—

[*a*] The stream-attainer (*sotā-panno*),[13] he who has reached to the realization of the reward of attaining the stream.

[1] Literally, 'not returning'. The idea is non-Buddhist; cp. 'He who studies the Vedas rightly . . . he attains the Kingdom of Heaven; he never returns', *Chandogya-Upanishad*, viii, 15 (*Ten Principle Upanishads*, tr. Shree Purshit Swāmi and W. B. Yeats, 1937, p. 117).

[2] Or, non-returning; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [4] n. According to mediæval Hindu belief such 'non-returners' having entered the Brahmā-world were ultimately re-absorbed together with it and Brahmā into the primæval universal Soul or Brahman (cp. A. Schweitzer, *Indian Thought and its Development*, 1936, pp. 161, 163–4). The purgatorial stages apparently were borrowed and artlessly incorporated by later Buddhism from mediæval Brahmanic and popular ideas of ultimate salvation through rebirth.

[3] This is plainly inconsistent with the fact that the Arahat is a saint in this life upon earth. Similarly the second of these stages is plainly inconsistent with the *an-atta* doctrine, which figures in the first and other stages. Thus the second and third stages do not join, but disunite, the first and fourth, between which they have been thrust. Ch. 5 *b* 2; Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3]. Cp. Int. § 12 (*sagga*) n; also Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n; and Ch. 21 16 (*myself*) n. For further references see Ap. D *c* (*Stages*).

[4] Mrs. Rhys Davids translates this clause as 'Nor is there return to upheaping of what is done'. On the exhaustion of Karma see Ap. B *a* § 4.

[5] Pāli, *sukha*. Ap. C *b* § 11 (203).

[6] The Pāli word used is *diṭṭhi-dhamma*. Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ap. C *b* § 6; Ap. E *c* i §§ 2 [19], 3 [29]. Cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14] (*sandiṭṭhika*); Ap. E *c* ii § 3.

[7] Mrs. Rhys Davids translates this as 'self-possession'. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4; Ap. F 2 *d*, *sammā-sati*; Ap. I, *Note* (*remembrance*).

[8] The speech is attributed to the Blessed One, when he was staying at Sāvatthi, 'in the Eastern Ārāma, the mansion of the mother of Migāra' (Int. § 140; Ch. 18 *b*). the discourse states centrally that as the ocean has one savour so the characteristic of the Law is liberation and in this all castes are united. The inept expansion of the noble simile of the ocean is plainly due to scholastic zeal. Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [3]; Ap. C *b* § 3: Ap. G 1 *b* § 1; Ap. H 4 *d* (*caste*).

[9] Omitting 'the Timingala and Timitimingala', fabulous beings.

[10] Demons of the storm, opponents of the Devas or Spirits; IN 8 *a*. Cp. Ap. G 2 *b*.

[11] Int. § 93 (vii). Cp. *Yakkha* (Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [3] n).

[12] Heavenly minstrels. Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [29] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [2] n; Ap. B *c* § 4 [4].

[13] Literally, fruit (*phala*). Cp. § 3 above; Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [16]; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 (*Samañña-phala-sutta*); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [11]; Ch. 11 *e* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 19 *b*; Ap. C *a* § 3; Ap. G 1 *b* § 6 n; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4. See also *vipāka* (Ap. E *c* i § 9, 2nd verse). Unless the reward is to be enjoyed by others, the desire for it is only another form of that 'grasping' (Ap.

[*b*] The once-returner (*sakad-āgāmi*), he who has reached to the realization of the reward of returning once [only].

[*c*] The non-returner (*an-āgāmi*), he who has reached to the realization of the reward of never returning.

[*d*] The Saint (*arahā*), he who has reached to saintship (*arahattāya paṭipanno*).[1]

D *a*) which the Teacher reprehended. Any claim to have attained such fruit is reprobated in Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]. 'He who has entered the First Path (the converted man, the Sotapanno) and he who has realized the fruit thereof', SBE, xx.

[1] Ap. H 1 §§ 5 n, 6 [7] n; also Ch. 22 *b* § 16 (*fourth in degree*).

APPENDIX E

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter* 5)

THE THREE CHARACTERISTICS[1] OF INDIVIDUALITY

Note. The following passage occurs in the *Tika-nipāta* (the Threes) of the *Aṅguttara Nikāya* (Sutta 134),[2] and states the matter of the Second Sermon in another form.

'All composite-unities[3] (*saṃkhāra*) are transitory (*a-niccā*).[4] A Leader[5] (*Tathāgato*) perceives and realizes this. . . . All composite-unities are sorrowful (*dukkhā*).[6] A Leader perceives and realizes this. . . . All separate-natures (*dhammā*) are without permanent-self (*an-attā*).[7] A Leader perceives and realizes this. . . .'

a. The Transience[8] *of the Saṃkhārā*[9] *(Individuality); the Skandhas or Khandhā*[10] *(Aggregates composing the temporary individuality)*

[*Note.* The object of Gotama in teaching the doctrine of the transience of the Ego (the non-existence of a permanent Ego) is not pessimistic, nihilistic, or destructive; it is purely ethical. Conceiving that the Ego, with its abnormal outlook and its perpetual craving, is the basis of all sorrow, Gotama asks whether, after all, this ravening Ego is real or imaginary. The conclusion that it is illusory seems to him a happy discovery, enabling man (not to plunge safely into a self-centred life of non-moral irresponsibility but) to free himself from monstrous errors regarding the relative importance of himself and the rest of the world, and so to overcome and ultimately

[1] Ap. D *c* § 3 [6]; Ap. H 1 § 5 (*symbols*). Cp. Ch. 7 *a* §§ 12 [8] n, 16, 19 n; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n.
[2] Ch. 4 § 18.
[3] Or, individualities. Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [18] (*sakkāya-nirodha*) and Ap. E *c* i § 7 (*conceit*); also Ap. E *c* i § 4 (*citta*).
[4] Transient because originated. This is the central theme of the Enlightenment (Ch. 4 § 11; Ch. 5 *c* § 3, *not this*; Ch. 1 6 *a* § 2 [261]); Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425]; Ch. 22 *b* § 28 (*dissolvable*). See below, Ap. E *a* (*Transience*) and Ap. E *a* i.
[5] Follower, or Successor. Ap. A 2 *c*.
[6] Sorrowful because of craving. This is the subject of the First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 5, *Sorrow*). See *b* below.
[7] Separated from the Permanent (cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7, *cessation*); separated from the eternal Spirit by individualism. This is the subject of the Second Sermon (Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [38]). See *c* (i) below.
[8] See Ap. E, *Note* (*anicca*) above and Ap. E *a* i below; Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45] (*not mine*); Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] (*confident*) n; also Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [2] (*jarā-maraṇā*).
[9] See (ii) § 2 below; Ch. 5 *a* § 2; Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40]; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 21 § 16; Ch. 22 *b* §§ 25, 27; Ap. B *a* § 2 [10]; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2); Ap. C *b* § 1; Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (368); Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (383); Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14); Ap. I *a* § 2 [5]. Cp. Ch. 4 § 10 (*dhamma*) n; Ch. 10 *c*, 69 (*puggala*); Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (viii) *soul*; Ap. B *b* § 1 (*nāma-rūpa*); Ap. C *b* § 10 (*attan*); Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii) [3] (*sakkāya*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9] (*satta*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3, 1 (*jīva*). See also Ch. 1 § 11 (*jāti*); Ap. B (*saṃsāra*); Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*bhava*); Ap. C *b*, *Note* (*pari-nibbāna*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3, 1 (*pari-maraṇa*).
[10] Int. § 97; Ch. 5 *b* § 5 (First Truth); Ch. 5 *c* (*Second Sermon*); Ap. E *a* ii; and Ap. B *c* § 4 [6] n (*compounds*). The 22nd Saṃyutta of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* is called the *Khandha-saṃyutta*. Skandhas is the Anglicized Sanskrit form of the word; the Pāli forms of terms and names are preferred throughout this work.

annihilate the tormenting desires of egoism. And as he avoids Hedonism on the one hand, he escapes the more refined doctrine of enlightened self-interest on the other, and finds peace in an active self-forgetfulness.[1] It may be objected that his argument does not prove the non-existence, or even the transience, of the soul, but only that the survival of the soul is unproved. This conclusion would quite suffice for Gotama's purpose, which evidently was to diminish the exorbitant importance attached by his contemporaries[2] to the soul-theory and the consequent egoism and individualism of current thought.

There is a highly elaborate psychological literature on the khandhas,[3] or factors of which individuality is composed, but it shows every sign of having been developed long after Gotama's death. The manner of mention of the Khandhas in the First and Second Sermons at Benāres suggests that the fivefold division was familiar to the hearers and was a current pre-Buddhist analysis.[4] Possibly the analysis was made by Gotama and taught to his first disciples during the years of his asceticism, but there is no hint of this in the texts; and it may be observed that the philosophically trained Sāriputta and Moggallāna apparently before their conversion[5] were familiar with the idea, and possibly with the actual terms, of the analysis. Finally it may have been elaborated later, by Gotama or others, and added to the narrative as an expansion of the essential term *saṃkhāra* in order to emphasize the lesson of the transience of individuality. It seems desirable to translate these terms in a simple and popular manner, rather than with any attempt at the precision of psychology. Exact psychology can scarcely have been within the purpose of Gotama, who none the less may well have been, along with his hearers, accustomed to the idea of the individuality as a composite capable of some analysis. The more elaborate and pretentious the analysis the less likely it is to have been made by Gotama, and the more likely to have been added exegetically by his successors. It may be observed that the first three Khandhas seem to fit the case of animal natures; and the last two apply to human nature, which, with the acquisition of a pronounced personality, adds the faculty of knowledge to the humbler characteristics shared with lower natures.

The word *saṃkhāra*[6] is plainly the most important of the terms, for it is not only used to designate the fourth subdivision, but is also used comprehensively to connote all the five Khandhas, i.e. not only as individual character, will, or personality, but also as individuality in general, an individuality which is both composite and dependent and therefore perishable. There seems ample justification for translating *saṃkhāra* as 'will' or 'personal will'. This rendering makes the fivefold analysis of the Khandhas intelligible. Further it is supported by independent passages[7] in the *Canon*. In *Mahā-vagga VI, xxxi, 2*,[8] of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, it is stated that Sīha

[1] Ap. F 1. [2] Ap. G 2 *c*. Cp. Ap. E c i § 7 [3].
[3] Cp. Buddhaghosha's *Visuddhi-magga*, ch. xiv, translated in Warren's *Buddhism in Translations* (1922) pp. 155–7. See also Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism* (1912), 69 ff.; and, for the 193 subdivisions of the five Khandhas, RDB, pp. 90–93; IN 6.
[4] See (ii) § 3 below.
[5] Ch. 7 *a* §§ 18–24.
[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [14]; Ap. E *b* §§ 2, 3 (2); and Ch. 22 *b* § 27 n; Ap. B *c* § 1 (2).
[7] Cited in OB, pp. 279–280. See (ii) § 2 n below.
[8] Ap. B *b* § 3 (2).

the General, who desired to meet the Buddha, heard unfavourable reports concerning him, and thereupon his wish (will, *saṃkhāra*) to visit the Blessed One subsided; and again it is stated in MPS, iii, 10, that when the Buddha in extreme old age took the resolution to lèt his life come to an end he knowingly and consciously rejected the 'will to live (*āyu-saṃkhāraṃ*)'.[1] This meaning is not inconsistent with 'individuality' or 'composite unity', the individual being primarily will and desire.

In the Chain of Causation *viññāna* and *rūpa* are universal; they are here in the Khandhas individual. It is not stated in either context, however, that the individual loses entirely these universal qualities, or that there is not a subconscious and universal substratum[2] below that which is particular in the individual. All that is particular and derivative is liable to suffering and deterioration; the All, the Self-same (*Ātman*), changes but does not suffer alteration, that is does not become other than it was, is not diminished or destroyed. It seems possible that the traditionary account of Gotama's Enlightenment[3] and the obscure theorizing of the *Paṭicca-samuppāda*[4] misrepresent a theory, which may without improbability be attributed to Gotama, that in *kalpa* after *kalpa*[5] there arise from the divine primæval source intelligent social beings and ultimately leaders[6] having the clear conception of the law of unity. The somewhat puzzling and difficult word *amata*,[7] which occurs in various parts of the Canon, may perhaps be rendered 'the impersonal (Eternal)'. It is this impersonality which remains when the personal, superimposed upon the impersonal, perishes. As one reads the Suttas one becomes conscious that in Gotama's theory the Soul, though individually it is transient, is essentially divine, arising as a flame[8] and passing away mysteriously. It is a compound of two parts, the individual or personal, which is mortal, and the impersonal, which is eternal. Life moulds and stamps the coin; death obliterates the superscription and releases the mysterious substance. Buddhism is not atheistic. To the Buddha the divinity is not a person[9] but a mystery, a spirit, and eternal substance, an impulse[10] pervading matter, informing and transcending[11] transient individuality—which in opposing its limitations to the Universal is the origin of all sorrow and ill[12]—and dwelling[13] in good-will, in pity, in sympathy with joy, and in serenity, and finding expression in beauty[14] and in truth].[15]

[1] '*Lebenssankhāra*', OB. p. 279; Ch. 21 § 16. 'Deliberately and consciously rejected the rest of his allotted sum of life', SBE, xi, p. 44. 'Life-element', *Pāli Dict.* See *jīvita-saṃkhāra-saṃkhāra* in MPS, ii, 23 (Ch. 21 § 7 [23]).
[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 3 n.
[3] Ap. B *c* § 1 (1).
[4] Cp. Ap. B *c* § 3.
[5] Int. § 107.
[6] Ap. A 2 *c* (*Tathāgatas*).
[7] See (ii) § 1 below; Ap. C *b* § 11 (374). Cp. Ch. 1 § 11 (*nibbāna*).
[8] Cp. *a* (ii) § 4 (4) below; Ap. B *b* 2.
[9] Ap. G 2 *a*.
[10] Cp. Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, iv, 40; Int. § 99.
[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*sammā-samādhi*).
[12] Ap. D (*Egoism*).
[13] Ap. F 2 (ii, *brahma-vihārā*).
[14] Cp. Ch. 3 § 5 n; Ap. C *a* § 1 (95) n.
[15] Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6 n.

i. *The epithet a-nicca*[1] *(non-eternal, impermanent, transient).*

Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, verse 277.[2]

(277) 'All individuals[3] (*saṃkhārā*) are transient': this when one sees with understanding (*pannāya*),[4]
One then becomes superior to[5] (*nibbindati*) sorrows.[6] This is the Path of Purity.[7]

ii. *The Khandhas*[8] *(Aggregates composing individuality).*

§ 1. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, verse 374.*[9]

(374) As soon as he comprehends the origin[10] and decay[11] (*udaya-bbayaṃ*) of the aggregates [which compose individuality],
He obtains the joy and happiness of those who know[12] the immortal (*amataṃ*).

§ 2. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga,*[13] *Khandha-saṃyutta (Saṃ. 1), Sutta 79 (Sīha, 2). (PTS, iii, p. 87.)*

. . . .[14] [8] 'And why, mendicant brothers, do you say composite-unities[15] (*saṃkhāre*)? They make up a compound (*saṃkhataṃ*),[16] mendicant brothers; therefore they are called "composite-unities". And what compound do they make up? They make up matter[17] (*rūpaṃ*) into a material-compound; they make up sensation[18] (*vedanaṃ*) into a sensation-compound; they make up perception[19] (*saññaṃ*) into a perception-compound; they make up individual-character[20] (*saṃkhāre*) into a character-compound; they make

[1] See Ap. E, *Note* and Ap. E *a* (*Transience*). Ch. 4 § 18 [1]; Ch. 5 *c* § 2; Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [3] n; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]; Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [2]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [13]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [425]; Ch. 21 § 17 [2] n; Ap. E *c* i §§ 3 [29], 6 [3]; also Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8] (*nicca*).

[2] From the chapter or section on the Path (*Magga-vagga*). Ap. E *b* § 1; Ap. E *c* i § 1.

[3] Or, composite-unities. See (ii) § 2 below; Ap. E *c* ii § 5.

[4] Ch. 20 § 4 [8] (7); Ap. F 2 *a* (132).

[5] Or, indifferent to. Ch. 5 *c* § 4.

[6] Or, sufferings.

[7] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3].

[8] Ap. E *a* (*Khandhā*). Also Ch. 4 § 16 n; Ch. 5 *c* § 1 (*rūpa*); Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2] n; Ch. 9 *a* §§ 6, 10; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 n; Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [2] n; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n; Ch. 21 § 8 [26] n; Ap. D *a* § 3; Ap. E b § 3 [2] n; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii) n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [15] n; Ap. G 2 *b* § 1 [4] n; Ap. I, *Note* (*body*). Cp. Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7] (*sīla-khandha*); also Ch. 16 *d* 8 [5] (*name and form*).

[9] From the Mendicant-section (*Bhikkhu-vagga*).

[10] Ch. 4 § 10 n.

[11] Ch. 4 § 11 n.

[12] i.e. Arahats. Ap. D *c*.

[13] See *Note* above. Ap. C *b* § 11 (374).

[14] At Sāvatthi (Ch. 18).

[15] 'Activities-compound', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 73; Ap. E *a* (*Saṃkhāra*) n; see (i) above; cp. Ch. 9 *a* [2] (*kāya-saṃkhāra*); Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [11] (*citta-saṃkhāra*), § 8 [4] (*one*) n. Here the word has a more comprehensive meaning than in the list below.

[16] Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]; Ch. 21 § 12 [48]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 5.

[17] Or, material-form; body. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [10]; Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1] (*body*); Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [9] (*body-compound*); Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *nāma-rūpa*); Ap. E *c* i § 4 (*elements*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *sarīra*).

[18] Or, feeling-faculty. 'Feeling', *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 73. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [17]; Ap. B *a* § 5; and Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] (*vedayita*). Cp. § 3 below (*sense-organs*).

[19] Or, perceiving-faculty. Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [40]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6]; Ch. 20 § 6 (1); cp. Ap. E *c* i § 2 [38].

[20] Characteristics, idiosyncrasies, inclinations, unifying-principle or will (see Ap. E *a*, *Note*). 'Activities', *Kindred Sayings*, iii. Ch. 5 *c* § 1; Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [7]; Ch. 18 *f* § 1 [4]. Here the word plainly has a more restricted meaning than above.

up consciousness[1] (*viññānaṃ*) into a conscious-compound. They make up a compound indeed, mendicant brothers, therefore they are called "composite-unities." '

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 1*), *Sutta 47* (*Samanupassanā*). (*PTS, iii, p. 46.*)

[3] 'Mendicant brothers, however diversely [teachers],[2] whether devotees (*samaṇa vā*) or Brāhmans (*brāhmaṇa vā*)[3] regard the self (*attānaṃ*),[4] they all regard it as the five grasping-aggregates (*pañc-upādāna-kkhandhe*) or one of these. [4] . . . So, mendicant brothers, the uninstructed ordinary man (*puthu-jjano*)[5] . . . unacquainted with the Law, regards the self either as [the same as], or as having, or as including, or as included[6] in either material-form . . .[7] or sensation . . . or perception[8] . . . or individual-character[9] (*saṃkhāre*) . . . or consciousness.[10] So the notion "I am"[11] arises in him. [5] . . . Then enter the five sense-organs[12] . . .[13] [6] mind (*mano*),[14] thoughts[15] (*dhammā*), and the element of ignorance.[16] . . .[17] [7] Now, mendicant brothers, the well-instructed disciple of the noble[18] has the same five sense-organs, but he casts off ignorance and acquires wisdom. Because of the absence of ignorance . . . he does not think—"I am; this I exists.[19] . . ." '

§ 4. *Sutta Piṭaka, Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 72* (*2nd Vacchagotta Sutta*).[20] (*PTS, i, pp. 486–9.*)

(1) [p. 486.] '. . . .[21] The Right-farer,[22] Vaccha,[23] is not committed to views;[24] but this is viewed[25] by the Right-farer—the material-form,[26] the origin

[1] Or, reason; mind. Ch. 11 *c* § 20 [18] n; Ap. B *c* § 4 [21]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 1.

[2] Ap. A 2 *d* [21]; Ap. G 2 *c*; see *Note* above. The scene is Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c*; Ch. 18 *a*).

[3] Ap. F 2 (iii).

[4] i.e. the individual self. Int. § 36. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 5 [189]; also Ap. E *c* i; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [I. 30].

[5] Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8].

[6] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].

[7] Omitting repetitions.

[8] 'Ideas', RDB, p. 94.

[9] Or, personality. 'Propensities', RDB, p. 94. Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [14].

[10] 'Mind', RDB, p. 94.

[11] i.e. 'I am a permanent self'.

[12] These correspond with the second Khandha, see § 2 above (*vedanā*). Ap. D *a* § 9 (i).

[13] Omitting the five physical organs.

[14] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2 n, *saḷāyatana*). Ap. D *a* § 9 (i) n.

[15] i.e. of objects submitted to the senses. 'Qualities', RDB, p. 95. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].

[16] Misapprehensions, delusion (Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]; Ap. D *b*). The present passage may be an exegetical addition and illusionist or idealistic. In the Second Sermon the argument is based on the dissolubility of the self and all its parts; here it is based on the delusiveness of the senses and the mind.

[17] As in Ap. D *b* § 2.

[18] The Pāli word is *ariya-sāvaka*: Ch. 5 *c* § 4; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [1] n; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 4 [8] n, 7 [9]; Ch. 18 *f* §§ 1 [12], 2 [13]; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]. For *noble* see also Ch. 5 *b* §§ 4 [18] (*ariya*), 5; Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2] (*Noble*); Ch. 16 *a* §§ 2 [265], 5 [2]; Ch. 20 § 7 (6); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*ariyā*). For *sāvaka* see Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (1); the term is not limited to Buddhists (Ch. 22 *b* § 8 [15]).

[19] Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [1].

[20] Or, *Aggi-Vacchagotta Suttanta*. The scene is laid in Sāvatthi in the Jetavana monastery (Ch. 9 *a*).

[21] As in Ap. G 1 *a* § 5.

[22] Or, Leader. The Pāli word *Tathā-gata* (literally So-goer) may mean either one who follows the ancient path, or one who shows the way. The title is given to Gotama by the reporter, but it is scarcely established that the Teacher himself assumed it. Ap. A 2 *c*; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [73]. See § 4 (5) below.

[23] Int. §§ 30, 84; Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [2]; Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481]; see (6) below. Cp. Ch. 10 *c* [3] (28).

[24] Or, theories. The Pāli word is *diṭṭhi*, which means view, whether true or false. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4; with Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8]; Ch. 20 § 8; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

[25] Or, clearly perceived (*diṭṭhaṃ*).

[26] Or, body.

(*samudayo*)[1] of the material-form, the disappearance (*attha-gamo*)[2] of the material-form; sensation, the origin of sensation, the disappearance of sensation; perception, the origin of perception, the disappearance of perception; individual-character[3] (*saṃkhāra*), the origin of individual-character, the disappearance of individual-character; consciousness,[4] the origin of consciousness, the disappearance of consciousness. Therefore, I say, the Right-farer not grasping[5] (*an-upādā*) is liberated (*vimutto*)[6] by the destruction,[7] fading-away (*vi-rāgā*),[8] cessation (*nirodhā*), abandonment[9] and renunciation (*paṭi-nissaggā*),[10] of all illusions,[11] of all perturbations, of all egoism,[12] all selfishness[13] and all proclivities of pride.'[14]

(2) 'But, O Gotama (*bho Gotama*),[15] whither does the mendicant with mind thus liberated proceed[16] (*upa-pajjati*)?' 'The phrase "he proceeds",[17] indeed, Vaccha, does not apply (*na upeti*).'[18] 'Then indeed, O Gotama, he does not proceed.' 'The phrase "he does not proceed", Vaccha, does not apply.' 'Then indeed, O Gotama, he both proceeds and does not proceed.' 'The phrase "he both proceeds and does not proceed", Vaccha, does not apply.' 'Then indeed, O Gotama, he neither proceeds nor does not proceed.'[19] 'The phrase "he neither proceeds nor does not proceed", Vaccha, does not apply.' 'Being asked "Whither, O Gotama, does the mendicant with mind thus liberated proceed?" thou repliest "The phrase he proceeds does not apply.". . .[20] [p. 487.] In this matter, O Gotama, I have arrived at ignorance and confusion. That degree of clearness which arose in me from previous talk and conversation with the revered Gotama now has vanished from me.'

(3) 'There is enough[21] [cause], Vaccha, for ignorance and confusion in thee. Deep indeed, Vaccha, is this Law, difficult to see, hard to under-

1 Ch. 5 *c* § 7.
2 Literally, home-going. Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7] (*ending*); Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [10] n; Ap. I *a* [174]; and Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 19 (*nirodha*).
3 Or, will.
4 Or, mind.
5 Or, without personal desire. Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*).
6 Ap. D *a* § 6. See (5) below.
7 Ap. C *b* § 1.
8 Ch. 5 *b* § 7 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4]; Ch. 20 § 6 (6); Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii) n; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174].
9 *Cāga;* Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [5].
10 Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [13]. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 4 (*nibbindati*).
11 The Pāli word is *maññita*.
12 Pāli *ahiṃkāra*. Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [3] n; Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [3]; Ap. E *c* i § 7 [3] n. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 [2] (*nāma-rūpa*); Ap. D (*Egoism*); Ap. D *b* § 2 [6]; also Ch. 21 § 16 (*labour*); Ch. 22 *b* § 25 n; and Ch. 15 *a* § 6 [172] (*fulfilment*).
13 *Pāli maminkāra.*
14 Pāli *mān'-ānusaya*. Ap. D *a* § 8 (221); cp. Ap. D *a* § 9 (iv).
15 Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [3]; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11]; Ch. 19 *d* § 2 [3]; Ch. 22 *b* § 15; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [1]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; Ch. 15 *b* § 1 [1]; also Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2] (*bho*); *Bho* is the voc. sing. of *bhavaṃ* (Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]); it is used in polite address and is equivalent to My lord, Sir, Mr., or merely O (Ch. 14 *f* § 7). Cp. *am-bho* (Ch. 14 *f* § 11 [4]).
16 Or, where is he re-born? Ap. I *b* § 3. Cp. Int. 4; Ap. B *b* § 1 (*pati-sandahati*).
17 Or, is re-born.
18 Or, come in (appropriately), fit, harmonize. Compare the phrase *na samvattati* used in the reply to Malunkyaputta, Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6). Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 [14] n.
19 This is the usual fourfold arrangement of possibilities in argument. Cp. Ap. D *b* § 2; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1); Ap. G 2 *c* §§ 2 (ii) [16] n, 3 (i) [32].
20 Omitting repetitions.
21 Ch. 12 *d* § 4.

stand, tranquillizing (*santo*), exalted, not in the sphere of reasoning[1] (*a-takk'-āvacaro*), subtle, to be felt by the wise;[2] it is difficult to be understood by thee, having another view[3] (*añña-diṭṭhikena*), acquiescing in other things,[4] approving other things,[5] associated differently, and taught differently.[6] Therefore indeed, Vaccha, I will question thee now, and do thou answer as it may please thee.

(4) What thinkest thou, Vaccha? If a fire burn in front of thee, wouldst thou be aware that it was burning in front of thee?' '. . . I should be aware that the fire was burning in front of me.' 'But if, Vaccha, one should ask thee "On what depends[7] (*kiṃ paṭicca*) this fire which burns in front of thee?" what wouldst thou answer?' 'I would answer thus: "This fire which burns before me depends on fuel of grass or wood."' 'But if . . . the fire should become extinguished (*nibbayeyya*) wouldst thou be aware that it was extinguished (*nibbuto*)?'[8] '. . . I should be aware that it was extinguished.' 'But if, Vaccha, one should ask thee . . . to what region[9] (*katamaṃ disaṃ*), east or west or north or south has the fire[10] gone hence, what wouldst thou answer?' 'This does not apply (*na upeti*), O Gotama, for the fire burnt depending on fuel of grass or wood, and when this has been consumed and no other fuel is obtained, on being without nutriment it is reckoned as extinct.'

(5) 'So indeed, Vaccha, the material-form of the Right-farer (*Tathāgatassa*)[11] by which one might distinguish him, being rejected,[12] being cut off at root, rendered like an up-torn palm-tree,[13] deprived of separate existence (*ana-bhāva-kataṃ*),[14] not able to proceed [to further existence] in the future (*ayatiṃ anuppāda-dhammaṃ*),[15] and the Right-farer indeed,

[1] Ch. 5 *a* § 2 (*questioning*); Ch. 9 *a* § 11; Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*reasoning*); Ap. I *b* § 4 [8]. Contrast Ap. B *c* § 5 [6]. The later forms of Buddhism are difficult to grasp on account of their metaphysical sublety. Difficulty in grasping the earliest form was due not to such subtlety, for the Four Noble Truths are simple enough, but to the individualism which is deeply rooted in human nature, though not more deeply than the social instinct. 'If there is no permanent-self,' says the excellent King Milinda in the post-canonical book *Milinda-pañha* (ed. Trenckner, p. 25, tr. Warren, *Bm. in Tr.*, 1922, p. 130; see Ap. B *b* § 1 n), 'in that case, there is no merit; there is no demerit; there is no one who does or causes to be done meritorious deeds; neither good nor evil deeds can have any fruit or result.' That is, the convinced individualist, being released from hopes and fears of adequate reward and punishment, will cease to strive after good and to avoid evil, regardless of the inevitable effects of his actions, words, and thoughts upon others, the welfare of society, and the irrefragable unity of the whole into which all individuals are woven. To give up the egoistic point of view is necessarily supremely difficult.

[2] *Paṇḍita*; Ch. 15 *a* § 8.

[3] Or, thinking otherwise.

[4] Or, feeling otherwise.

[5] Or, willing otherwise.

[6] i.e. individualistically. Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [8] n.

[7] Or, from what proceeds? Cp. Int. § 186; Ap. B *c*.

[8] Ch. 2 § 2.

[9] Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [3].

[10] Ap. E *a*, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 27 (*flame*); Ap. E *c* i §§ 2 [73], 3 [31] n, 5 [12]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 8.

[11] It seems possible that the word Tathāgata is here used generally and is equivalent to Arahat, i.e. saint or converted; cp. (1) above; Ch. 13 *c* 22 [3]; Ch. 14 *e* § 5 [1] n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1); and Ap. A 2 *c*.

[12] Or, destroyed; *pahīna;* Ap. C *a* § 1 (90) n.

[13] This is a constantly recurring phrase. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] n; Ap. B *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [15]; and Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3] n.

[14] Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *bhava*).

[15] Or, rise again; Ch. 9 *a* § 5. 'Not liable to spring up again in the future', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 127.

Vaccha, thus liberated[1] from "material-form", being profound, immeasurable, unfathomable, even as the great ocean,[2] the phrase "he proceeds"[3] does not apply, the phrase "he does not proceed" does not apply. [p. 488.] . . .[4] [So also with] the sensations . . . the perceptions . . . the individual-character . . . the consciousness of the Right-farer. . . .'

(6) On this being said the Wanderer (*paribbājako*)[5] Vaccha-gotta[6] spoke to the Blessed One thus: '. . .[7] Excellent (*abhi-khantaṃ*),[8] O Gotama; excellent, O Gotama! It is as if one should set upright what was overturned, or disclose what was concealed, or show the path to the erring, [p. 489] or hold up a lamp in the darkness so that they who have eyes see forms; even so the Law is made clear by Gotama in different methods. I here come for refuge[9] to the revered (*bhavantaṃ*) Gotama, and to the Law, and to the community of mendicant brothers; let the revered Gotama receive me as a lay disciple (*upāsakaṃ*)[10] taking refuge from this day forth whilst life lasts.[11]

b. Sorrow[12]

[*Note.* Selfish desire[13] is the root of all sorrow and ill; but that there is a 'noble craving',[14] which leads to joy,[15] was also taught by Gotama. That noble craving is to be rid of selfishness, to extinguish it in Nibbāna,[16] the selfless life on earth. It may be objected that in holding out to his followers the eradication of sorrow, Gotama was teaching a refined type of Epicureanism,[17] that is a system based ultimately upon egoism. In reply it may be asked how else could the Teacher have begun his appeal to an egoistic world than through that ego which is its sensitive point. He offers to a restless world the joy of peace, and so obtains a hearing. He proceeds to show that the pain which dims the world and casts a shadow over its pleasures has its root in the desires of the self,[18] and that if these personal and individualistic desires can be uprooted then sorrow will be up-rooted with them. His call to the self has now become a call to forget the self. The First Sermon promises the destruction of sorrow. The last stage of the Sermon proper is an appeal for an eightfold self-forgetful

[1] See (1) above.

[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 3 n; Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (17); Ap. E *c* i § 2 n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3 [14]. Cp. Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421] (*attā*) n. He is 'made one with nature' (Ap. G 2 *a*), as was the extinct fire. Gotama further refused to discuss the future of the saint on the ground that such discussion was unprofitable, not tending to the elimination of desire (Ap. G 1 *a* § 3, 6, *profit*).

[3] Or, is re-born.

[4] Omitting repetitions.

[5] Int. § 126; Ch. 8 *k* [1].

[6] See (1) above; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [2]. Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 14 [2]. For *gotta* cp. Ch. 14 *d* § 7 [2]; Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [501]; and Ap. E *b* § 2 [5].

[7] Omitting a comparison of Gotama's clear and concise teaching with a sāl-tree stripped of decayed branches and bark.

[8] These words are attributed to various converts and form a regular feature of the conversion sermons. Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[9] Ap. H 1 *c*; Ap. H 2, *Note*.

[10] Ch. 8 *l*; and Ch. 10 *c*.

[11] Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [34].

[12] Ch. 4 § 18; Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42]; Ch. 11 *d* § 4 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92]; Ap. B *c* §§ 2 (2), 5 [6]; Ap. D; Ap. E, *Note*; Ap. E *c* i § 6 [3]; Ap. F 2 *a* (165); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (5); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. Ch. 18 *c* § 4 [111] n (*soka*). On the ending of sorrow see also Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [12]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].

[13] Ap. D *a*.

[14] Ap. F 1 *c*.

[15] See § 2 [8] below; Ch. 7 *b* § 2; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [13]; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [94] n; Ch. 12 *d* § 4; Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [7]; Ch. 20 § 5 (4). Ap. C *b* § 11 (203); Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (393); Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]; Cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [3].

[16] Ap. C *b*. Ap. E *c* ii; Ap. F 2.

[17] Int. § 99.

activity, and this appeal is accompanied, as in the earlier part of the Sermon, but with a difference, by a promise of the ensuing joy of peace. Some apparent contradiction is inevitable, since it corresponds with the natural fact, doubtless dependent on man's social nature,[1] that as self-forgetfulness increases so in the same degree does joy. Such joy follows as an inevitable effect; but if it is thrust forward as the object it vanishes, in accordance with the first Truth. The joy of Gotama's Nibbāna is an effect, not an object, though at first as he speaks it may gleam for a moment before the eyes of the selfish world as a lure. But the joy is real; there is no gloom in Gotama's Nibbāna; it is frankly and naturally glad. It may be remarked that gladness distinguishes the peoples who follow his creed; the pessimism attributed to it is visible only from the perhaps radically individualistic view-point of the West, which seeks the perpetuation of the perfected self and sees blank despair in ultimate, or present, self-oblivion.]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, verse 278.*[2]

(278) 'All individuals are sorrowful': this when one sees with understanding,
One then becomes superior to sorrows. This is the Path of Purity.

§ 2. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 1*), *Sutta 22* (*Bhāraṃ*). (*PTS, iii, p. 25.*)

. . . .[3] [3] 'I will show you, mendicant brothers, the burden[4] (*bhāraṃ*), the bearer of the burden, the grasping[5] of the burden (*bhār-ādānaṃ*), the laying down of the burden. Do you hearken. [4] What is the burden, mendicant brothers? To this it must be replied "The five grasping compounds[6] (*pañc-upādāna kkhandhā*)". What five? Namely, the grasping body-compound, the grasping sensation-compound, the grasping perception-compound, the grasping will-compound,[7] the grasping mind-compound;[8] these are called the burden. [5] And who is the bearer of the burden? To this it must be replied "The individual (*puggalo*),[9] this venerable so-and so, of such-and-such a family (*evaṃ-gotto*);[10] he is called the bearer of the burden. [6] And what is the grasping of the burden? It is [the action of] this recurring[11] craving associated with bliss and passion, seeking bliss everywhere, namely, lust-craving, the craving for individual-existence, the craving for the opposite of individual-existence;[12] this is

[1] Int. § 97.
[2] Ap. E *a* i.
[3] Omitting the opening formula, which states that the discourse was preached at Sāvatthi (Ch. 18) by the Blessed One.
[4] Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [6]. The burden is egoism (Ap. D). The ideal of the discourse is not metaphysical but ethical, in contrast with the individualistic and non-ethical aim specifically attributed to the Nigaṇṭhas in *Majjh. Nik.* 14 (Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93], *virtuous ideas*).
[5] Or, taking up. Cp. Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*).
[6] Or, aggregations, constituting the desirous transient individuality. Ch. 5 *b* § 5. See Ch. 15 *b* § 9 [7] n.
[7] Ap. E *a*, *Note*.
[8] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *viññāna*).
[9] Ch. 19 *c* (69); Ch. 23 *b* § 8; Ap. I *b* § 3. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 2 (*satta*); Ap. E c ii.
[10] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (4). Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 8 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1]. Ap. B *c* § 5 [3]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6); also Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (393).
[11] Pāli *pono-bbhavikā*. Int. § 24; Ch. 5 *b* § 6.
[12] See Ap. D *a* § 1. The difficult term *vi-bhava-taṇhā* may be rendered 'desire to be rid of [the rightful burden and duties of] personal existence' (cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 5 n (*diligent labour*)).

called the grasping of the burden. [7] And what is the laying down of the burden? It is the cessation[1] of this very craving, so that no remnant or trace of it remains—its abandonment, its rejection, liberation from it, detachment from it; this is called the laying down of the burden.' [8] Thus said the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*);[2] the Well-farer (*Sugato*)[3] having thus said, thereafter the Teacher (*satthā*)[4] said this:—

'A burden indeed are the five compounds [constituting individuality],
And the bearer of the burden is the individual (*puggalo*),
The taking up of the burden in the world (*loke*)[5] is sorrow (*dukkhaṃ*),
The laying down of the burden is bliss (*sukhaṃ*).[6]

He who lays down the heavy burden,
And does not grasp[7] at any other,
Having eradicated craving (*taṇhaṃ*),[8]
Being without longing (*ni-cchāto*),[9] he is completely at Peace (*parinibbuto*).'[10]

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 1*), *Sutta 53* (*Upāyo*). (*PTS, iii, p. 53.*)

(1) . . .[11] 'Attachment (*upāyo*),[12] mendicant brothers, is absence of freedom, detachment[13] is freedom. When consciousness abides, mendicant brothers, it abides as being attached to material-form (*rūp-upāyaṃ*); and being founded on material-form and standing on material-form it serves enjoyment,[14] and attains to growth, increase, and fullness.[15] Being founded on personality[16] and standing on personality[17] it serves enjoyment and attains to growth, increase, and fullness. If anyone, mendicant brothers, says thus: "I declare the coming or the going (*āgatiṃ vā gatiṃ vā*),[18] the passing away or the uprising (*upapattiṃ*), the growth, increase, or fullness of the consciousness apart from material-form, apart from sensation, apart from

[1] See Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (First Sermon, third Truth). Absence of craving or passion was for Gotama far from being a negative, passive or quietist virtue; it was altruistic, active, and mildly and serenely masterful, like the great Teacher himself. Ap. E *c* ii.
[2] Ch. 4 § 9; Ch. 5 *b* § 10.
[3] Ch. 18 *b* § 6 [5]; also Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7]; Ch. 11 *d* § 7 [16]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 8; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [4]; Ch. 21 § 12 [38]; Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [21]; Ap. C *b* § 11 (285); Ap. H . § 6. Cp. Ch. 10 *c* [4] (34), *conduct*; also Part I (*title*).
[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 2; Ch. 6 *a* § 1; Ch. 7 *a* § 7; Ch. 21 §§ 16, 17 [3]; Ch. 22 *b* § 21; Ap. A 1 *b* (9).
[5] Ap. C *b* §§ 6 n, 11 (89).
[6] See *Note* above; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]; Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; Ch. 17 *a* [4]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]; Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (2). Cp. § 3 below (*nandi*). Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6, *upasama*).
[7] Or, take up.
[8] Literally, thirst.
[9] Literally, without hunger. Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] (*hunger*); cp. Ap. D *a* (*taṇhā*).
[10] Ap. C *b* § 11 (89).
[11] Omitting the opening formula, which states that the discourse was preached at Sāvatthi (Ch. 18).
[12] Literally, approaching, drawing near to. Cp. Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*).
[13] Literally, free (*vi-mutto*). Ap. D *a* § 6.
[14] Ch. 5 *b* § 6. The Pāli word used is *nandi*. This is to be distinguished from the bliss (*sukha*) of selflessness (see § 2 above).
[15] Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].
[16] Or, composite-unity (*saṃkhārā*). This is the fourth Khandha; Warren in *Bm. in Tr.* (1922, p. 162) includes the second and third Khandhas previously.
[17] i.e. consciousness.
[18] 'Re-birth and re-death', Rhys Davids and Stede in *Pāli Dict.* Ap. B.

perception, apart from personality"—this position is untenable (*n'etaṃ thānaṃ*[1] *vijjati*).

(2) If a mendicant brother's desire (*rāgo*)[2] for the form-element (*rūpa-dhātuyā*)[3] is abandoned then with the abandonment of the desire the foundation is destroyed and there is no standing-place for consciousness. If the mendicant brother's desire for the sensation-element, for the perception-element, for the individuality-element, and for itself[4] is abandoned, then with the abandonment of the desire the foundation is destroyed and there is no standing-place for consciousness. That consciousness being without standing-place, it is without increase and without individuality[5] and is liberated.[6] Having become liberated in itself it is stable and happy (*santusitaṃ*), being happy in itself it is not agitated, not being agitated it attains complete Peace (*pari-nibbāyati*)[7] in its own self (*pacc-attañ-ñeva*).[8] It knows "Earthly-existence[9] (*jāti*) is closed, the holy-life has been lived, what ought to be done has been done, there is nothing beyond this state (*n'āparaṃ itthattāya*)".'[10]

c. Individuality is not the Permanent Self[11]

i. *No Permanent Individual-Self* (*or permanently separate Self*)*; the epithet an-atta or an-attā.*

[*Note.* In stating, as he insistently does, that the individual has no *attan* (or *atta*; Sanskrit *ātman*) or Ego, Buddha necessarily means that the individual has no permanent Ego or radical individuality. That there are temporary Egos or individualities is self-evident; he necessarily speaks of himself and of his interlocutors as individuals. His whole mission was directed against the dangerous error of egoistic[12] or individualistic desire. The pursuit of the apparent interests of the temporary self, he showed, is delusive and absurd, because each Ego is a transient phenomenon arising momentarily out of and subsiding swiftly back into the Whole.[13] This doctrine is characteristic of the teaching of Buddha and distinguishes it from that of Hinduism, which in accepting Saṃsāra (transmigration) and

[1] Or, point. Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [13]; also Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411]; Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 21 § 12 [48].
[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 6.
[3] Each of the five Khandhas is an element (*dhātu*) of the individual. Ap. E *a* ii. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* [6]; Ap. I *b* § 3; and Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n.
[4] Literally, for the consciousness-element.
[5] The Pāli word is *abhi-saṃkhāra*, in which the prefix means 'further' or 'higher'. The word may possibly indicate further birth (Ap. B *a*), or better the whole individuality as distinguished from the fourth Khandha which is similarly named (Ap. E *a*, *Note*).
[6] i.e. from individualistic desire or individualism.
[7] Ap. C *b* § 11 (89); Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32].
[8] Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8]; Ap. E *c* ii.
[9] Better 'separate existence', or 'the sense of separate-existence'.
[10] For this frequently repeated sentence see Ch. 5 *c* § 5.
[11] Int. § 62 (*ideal*); Ch. 4 § 18 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [3]; Ch. 20 § 6 (2); Ap. E, *Note*; also Ch. 5 *c* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]. See IN 3 *a*; Int. §§ 4, 6, 7, 8; Ch. 4 § 14 ('*I am*'); Ch. 5 *a* § 10 [172] n; Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [xiv] n; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 3 [19] n, 19 [4] n, 22 [3] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 6 [4] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 1 n; Ap. B *a*, *Note*, and §§ 3 [2] n, 4 (*atta-bhāva*); Ap. B *c* §§ 4 [6] n, 5 [6] n; Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] n; Ap. D *a* §§ 3 n, 8 (ii) n; Ap. E *a* ii § 3 n; Ap. F 1, *Note*; Ap. F 1 *b* §§ 3 [2] n, [6] n; Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii) n; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*, and § 4 [3] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [i. 30] n. Cp. Int. §§ 10 (*non-egoism*), 48 (*self*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*nothingness*); also Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6] (*ajjh-atta*); Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421] (*pacoatta*); and Ap. D *b* (*avijja*).
[12] Ap. D.
[13] Ap. G 2 *a*.

(personal) Karma[1] attributes a lasting though not everlasting individuality to the soul. The ultimate escape from that individuality through the purgation of many lives is the object of Hinduism and of ordinary modern Buddhism; the immediate escape from it through the abandonment of selfishness in the present life,[2] and through the perception of the illusoriness of the self and consequently of all self-interest, is the object of the teaching of Gotama.

That orthodox Buddhism presents a reconciliation of these objects is due to the efforts of teachers later than Gotama. The formula of this reconciliation lays down that though there is no *attan* (permanent self or individuality), yet *kamma* (consequence of actions) passes on from one living being to another at the moment of death,[3] as a flame[4] is passed on from one lamp to another, until at last the force of Karma is extinguished by refinement. Of this mystical hypothesis the object doubtless was to secure the moral responsibility of the agent. But such responsibility is fully secured without recourse to the mystery of transmission of *kamma* at the death of one person to another single individual. Such transmission of the consequence of actions, including deeds, words, and thoughts, takes place momentarily, and not to one individual only but to many in unlimited succession. To the convinced egoist such consequence is doubtless a matter of indifference, but Gotama's whole teaching was devoted to the elimination of egoism, to proving its misery and its absurdity. To him the fears and rewards of the doctrine of personal Karma could make no appeal, but the extended moral effects of every deed, word, and thought were plainly evident.[5]

A later school of metaphysical Buddhism found in the Buddha's denial of the *attan* or Ego a proof of his purely idealistic or illusionist outlook;[6] but Gotama's aversion from metaphysics is well established,[7] as is his practical ethical interest in this world, with which and with whose inhabitants he busied himself daily for forty-five devotedly laborious years, after rejecting the isolation of the recluses. Gotama does not attempt to prove that there is neither a permanent Ego nor a transitory Ego, and that the world consequently is entirely illusory. He holds that the individual has no durable self, and that the selfish desires and supposed advantages of an Ego which is merely transitory are therefore trifling. But he takes much pains to lay down rules of conduct for all men, which he would certainly not have done if he had held that the individual had not even a transitory Ego. The Eightfold Way of Conduct is the very centre of his teaching;[8] right deed, word, and thought are of the first importance. Hindu predecessors of Gotama and his own later followers took up the extreme idealist position and taught the doctrine of Māyā or illusion. His own attitude towards them was much that of the Stoics towards the extreme idealism of the Academics and Sceptics.[9] Logic and metaphysics, in fact, so largely developed by his successors, did not appeal greatly to Gotama. He had the strong common sense of a man to whom a career of activity[10] was natural. He did not question the facts of which he had direct and instinctive knowledge. He would not trust his powerful reasoning faculty when it went beyond that imme-

[1] Ap. B *a*.
[2] Ap. C *b*.
[3] RDB, p. 101; Ap. B *b* § 1 n.
[4] Ap. B *b* § 2.
[5] Ap. B *b*.
[6] Ap. D *b*.
[7] Ap. G 1 *a*.
[8] Ap. F 2 *d*; Ap. G 1 *b*.
[9] IN 10; Ap. G 2 *c*.
[10] Ap. F 1.

diate knowledge; but he reconciled the two. Not finding in the individual a lasting Ego, he did not decide that there was no Ego, for instinctive knowledge will not accept this extreme theory; but he concluded that the individual Ego is a transient phenomenon. Similarly he did not decide that the actions of this transient individuality are unimportant, for direct instinctive knowledge says the exact contrary; but he concluded that selfish interests are trivial, though so far as they affect the whole, which is lasting, they are of high import.][1]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, verse 279.*[2]

(279) 'All separate-natures (*dhammā*)[3] are without permanent-self (*an-attā*): this when one sees with understanding,
One then becomes superior to sorrows. This is the Path of Purity.

§ 2. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 1 (Brahmajāla-S., the Universal Net),*[4] *ii. 37 ff.*

. . .[5] [ii. 37] 'There are, mendicant brothers, some religious teachers[6] (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇā*), theorizing on the future, who hold erroneous-views,[7] and these regarding the future (*aparantaṃ*),[8] expound divers systems in 44 ways. . . .[9]

[38] [Among these] there are some religious teachers who believe in consciousness after death and announce [the existence of] a conscious[10] self (*saññiṃ attānaṃ*) after death in sixteen ways. . . .[11]

[iii. 1] There are, mendicant brothers, some religious teachers who believe in unconsciousness after death and announce an unconscious self (*a-saññiṃ attānaṃ*) after death in eight ways. . . .[12]

[5] There are some religious teachers who believe in [a state of] neither

[1] Int. § 97.

[2] Ap. E *a* i.

[3] Or phenomena. Ch. 4 § 10; Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]; Ch. 12 *a* § 7 [228]; Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (1); Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [7]. Both *dhammā* and *saṃkhārā* may be rendered as 'systems' (i.e. separate, originated systems), which latter word is indeed practically a literal translation of *saṃ-khārā* (cp. Part I, title, n). The phrase may be rendered 'No form is the permanent-self'.

[4] Ch. 11 *d* § 8; Ch. 23 *b* § 8; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii); also Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [3] n. *Brahmajāla* is used alternatively with *Attha-jāla* (Ap. C *b* § 10 [2], *fundamental*), *Dhamma-jāla* and *Diṭṭhi-jāla* (Ap. F 2 *d*, *outlook*), see *Dīgha-Nik.*, i, p. 46 [74]; and the holders of false views are said to be caught in the 'net of the 62 modes', see p. 46 [72].

[5] The first half of the Sutta places the scene of this discourse of the Blessed One at Ambalaṭṭhikā (Int. § 145), midway between Rājagaha and Nālandā, and after introducing the threefold treatise on virtuous conduct called the *Cūla-sīla, Majjhima-sīla* and *Mahā-sīla* (Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*), proceeds to enumerate 18 erroneous views regarding the beginning of things. What follows is an enumeration of 44 erroneous views regarding the Soul or Self thus making up a total of 62 views repudiated by the Buddha. See § 9 below; Ch. 11 *d* § 8 [4] n; Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note* and § 1 (414) n; also IN 13.

[6] Pious devotees or holy recluses. Ap. A 2 *d* [21]; also Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 4 [2], 9, [411]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200]; cp. Int. § 185 (*Brāhmans*).

[7] The Pāli word is *aparant-ānu-diṭṭhino*. Cp. Ap. D *b*, *Note* (*diṭṭhi*); Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32].

[8] Ap. B *a*; Ap. E *c* i § 6 [8].

[9] Omitting repetitions.

[10] Or, percipient. Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 2 (*saññā*).

[11] Omitting details concerning material or immaterial, finite or infinite existence (*an-antava*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3, 2), and simple or complex, happy or miserable consciousness (Ap. C *a* § 2).

[12] Omitting details concerning material or immaterial, finite or infinite existence.

consciousness nor unconsciousness after death and announce a self neither conscious nor unconscious after death in eight ways. . . .

[9] There are some religious teachers who believe in annihilation (*ucchedavādā*)[1] and announce the annihilation,[2] destruction, and non-becoming (*vi-bhavaṃ*)[3] of the soul (*sattassa*)[4] in seven ways. . . .[5]

[19] There are some religious teachers who believe in Nibbāna[6] in this world[7] (*diṭṭha-dhamma-nibbāna-vādā*) and announce the ultimate Nibbāna of a real[8] soul (*sato sattassa*) in this world in five ways. . . .[9]

. . .[10] [73] When the channel[11] of his separate existence[12] has been broken up, mendicant brothers, the body of the Follower[13] (*Tathāgatassa*) remains. So long as his body shall remain, spirits[14] and men (*deva-manussā*) perceive him. After the destruction of the body, on the consummation[15] of individual life[16] (*jīvita-pariy-ādānā*) spirits and men perceive him not[17] [again]. . . .'[18]

§ 3. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 15* (*Madā-nidāna Sutta*)[19] *27–32.*

. . .[20] [27] 'In what ways, Ānanda, does the theorist regard the self? Either, Ānanda, regarding the self he deems[21] "Sensation[22] is my self (*me attā*)"; or . . .[23] he deems "Sensation is not my self, my self is without sensa-

[1] Ch. 5 *b* § 6 n; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7]; Ap. B *b* § 3 [5]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [6]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [24]. Their error is that they imply the separate existence of the soul, since the annihilation of the soul implies its separate existence before destruction. Gotama's theory is that the individual is never really, but only apparently, separated from the Whole (cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5), *ocean*; Ap. B *b* 1, *nāma-rūpa*; see § 3 [32] n below).

[2] Literally, cutting or breaking up.

[3] Ap. D *a* § 1.

[4] Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 6; Ap. A 2 *a* (*Bodhi-satta*), and Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [6] (*ajjh-atta*); Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *bhava*); Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*); Ap. E *b* § 2 (*puggala*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *jīva*); also Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].

[5] Omitting details concerning lower and higher forms of the soul, and regarding the four stages higher than the fourth trance (see iii, 19 below).

[6] The five varieties of Nibbāna as here described are egoistic (Ap. D, *Egoism*) and regard the Self as existing independently. Cp. Ch. 1 § 11.

[7] Ap. C *b*; Ap. D *c* § 3.

[8] Or, separately existing.

[9] Omitting details concerning the enjoyment of the pleasures of the senses or alternatively the experience of the first, second, third, or fourth trance (*catuttha-jjhāna*); see iii, 9 above, n; Ch. 3 § 4; Ap. I *a*.

[10] Omitting several summaries of the 62 'views', with brief refutations. The last of these summaries [iii. 71] includes, with apparent disapproval, the eight latter stages of the well-known chain of causation or 'Dependent Origination' (Ap. B *c* § 2, 2).

[11] The Pāli word is *netti*. The channel or course is selfhood. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2]; Ch. 21 § 17 [2].

[12] The Pāli word is *bhava*. Ap. D *a* § 1; cp. Ch. 4 § 17 (*jāti*).

[13] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).

[14] Int. § 35. It is evident from the context that the 'spirits', like the men, are inhabitants of this world. They are the spirits of trees, serpents, and the like, and they are inferior to the Buddha's disciples, who are instructed (Ch. 6 *b* § 1) to teach them the Dhamma. The phrase 'spirits and men' is a popular one, and it may have been used by Gotama in current speech, and may be taken to mean in these passages 'intelligent beings of all kinds on earth'.

[15] Cp. Ap. C *a* § 4.

[16] Ch. 11 *c* § 18 [3] n.

[17] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (4).

[18] Omitting illustrations and formal repetitions.

[19] Ap. B *c* 4. In this discourse Gotama deals with Causation (*nidana*) and with the Self.

[20] The previous paragraphs deal with the Self considered as matter or form.

[21] It seems to be implied that Gotama's contemporaries were familiar with the Khandha analysis. Ap. G 2 *c*.

[22] Or, the faculty of feeling.

[23] Omitting repetition.

tion"; or . . . he deems "Sensation is not myself, but myself is not without sensation, my self feels, my self has by nature sensation[1] (*vedanā-dhammo*)".

[28] In that case, Ānanda, whoever says "Sensation is my self" must be answered thus: "There are three sensations,[2] friend (*āvuso*), pleasant (*sukha*) sensation, painful (*dukkha*)[3] sensation, and neither painful nor pleasant sensation. Which of these three sensations dost thou regard as the self?" Whenever, Ānanda, one feels a pleasant sensation one does not at the same time feel a painful sensation, nor does one feel a sensation neither painful nor pleasant, one feels at that time only a pleasant sensation. Whenever one feels a painful sensation . . . one feels at that time only a painful sensation. Whenever one feels a sensation neither painful nor pleasant . . . one feels at that time only a sensation neither painful nor pleasant.

[29] But pleasant sensations . . . painful sensations . . . sensations neither painful nor pleasant, Ānanda, are transitory (*a-niccā*),[4] made up[5] (*saṃkhatā*), originated by dependence (*paṭicca-samuppannā*),[6] are by nature decaying, perishable (*vaya-dhammā*),[7] fading away, and have by their nature cessation (*nirodha-dhammā*).[8] In him[9] thus feeling a pleasant sensation . . . a painful sensation . . . a sensation neither painful nor pleasant there arises the thought 'This is my self (*me attā*)". After the cessation of this same . . . sensation the thought [necessarily] arises "My self has passed away[10] (*vyāgā*)". Thus the theorist who regards sensation as the self deems that even in this life (*diṭṭhe va dhamme*)[11] the self is transient, is pleasant, painful, and mixed, and has by nature rise and ending. Therefore, Ānanda, it is unsound for anyone to deem "Sensation is my self".

[30] In this case, Ānanda, whoever says "Sensation is not my self, my self is without sensation", must be answered thus: "But, friend, where there is no sensation at all, would there be any 'I am (*asmīti*)?' "[12] 'No indeed, revered sir'. 'Therefore, Ānanda, it is unsound for anyone to deem "Sensation is not my self, my self is without sensation".

[31] In that case, Ānanda, whoever says "Sensation is not my self, but my self is not without sensation, my self feels, my self has by nature sensation", must be answered thus: "If, friend, sensation were to cease completely, absolutely, and without remainder, when there was altogether no sensation, after the cessation of sensation would there be any "This am I" (*ayam aham asmīti*)?" '[13] 'No indeed, revered sir.' 'Therefore, Ānanda, it is unsound for anyone to deem "Sensation is not my self, but my self is not without sensation, my self feels, my self has by nature sensation."

[1] 'My ego possesses the faculty of sensation', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.*, 1922, p. 135.

[2] Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]; Ch. 9 *a* § 3 [11]; Ch. 11 *c* § 14 n; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [5]; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *sensation*); Ap. E *c* i § 5 [9]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.

[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 5.

[4] Ap. E *a* i.

[5] i.e. caused. Ap. G 2 *a* § 5.

[6] Ap. B *c*.

[7] Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7]; see also Ch. 21 § 16.

[8] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n.

[9] i.e. the theorist.

[10] This apparently is a reductio ad absurdum.

[11] Ap. D *c* § 3.

[12] See [31] below.

[13] i.e. personal (feeling) self. See [30] above; cp. Ap. D *b* § 1. The argument has proved that the personal (feeling) self is transitory. There is nothing in this contrary to the Buddha's teaching, though a contradiction is here implied. The metaphysics here savour more of his followers than of the Teacher (Ap. G 1 *a*). It is to be observed that the argument assumes that there is a universal impersonal Self and that it cannot be extinguished, and also that it has no (personal) feelings (Ap. G 2 *a*). The dual nature of the individual, the personal and mortal, the universal and immortal (*amata*; Ap. C *b* § 2), as of a wave upon the ocean and of fire in the sunlight (Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 4) is here a cause of confusion.

[32] From the time that a mendicant brother neither deems that sensation is the self, nor deems that the self is without sensation, nor deems "My self feels, my self has by nature sensation", he no longer grasps at (*upādiyati*)[1] anything in the world, and not grasping he is not perturbed, and being unperturbed he attains complete Peace (*pari-nibbāyati*) even in himself (*pacc-attaṃ*),[2] . . .[3] Now it is unsound that one should say of a mendicant brother thus liberated in mind (*vimutta-cittaṃ*),[4] Ānanda, that his view[5] is that "The Follower (*Tathāgato*)[6] exists (*hoti*)[7] after death"[8] . . . "does not exist after death" . . . "both exists and does not exist after death"[9] . . . "neither exists nor does not exist after death" . . .[10] [33] . . .'[11]

§ 4. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Nidāna-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. i*), *Sutta 61* (*Assutava i*) [*6–8*].[12] (*PTS, ii, p. 94.*)

[6] 'It would be better, mendicant brothers, if an uninstructed (*a-ssutavā*) ordinary[13] man should mistake this body (*kāyaṃ*)[14] composed of the four elements (*cātu-mahā-bhūtikaṃ*)[15] rather than mind[16] (*cittaṃ*), for the Self (*attato*). [7][17] Why so? This body composed of the four elements, mendicant brothers, remains visible for one year, two years . . . a hundred years or more. But, mendicant brothers, that which is called mind (*cittaṃ*), or mental faculty (*mano*),[18] or consciousness (*viññānam*),[19] by night and by day arises as one thing and passes away (*nirujjati*)[20] as another. [8] It is just as when[21] an ape moving round in a wild forest seizes one branch and then releasing it seizes another. Just so, mendicant brothers, that which is called mind, mental faculty, or consciousness by night and by day arises as one thing and passes away as another.'

1 Ap. D *a* § 5.
2 Ap. E *b* § 3 (2).
3 As in Ch. 5 *c* § 5 (*khīna jāti, &c.*).
4 Ap. E *c* ii § 6 [20], i.e. an Arahat. Ap. D *c*.
5 Or, erroneous notion (*diṭṭhi*). See § 2 [ii. 37] above.
6 The context suggests that by the title *Tathāgata* is meant a monk 'thus liberated', i.e. an *Arahat* (saint). Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [3]; Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*.
7 Or, continues to exist as an individual.
8 Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
9 For this exhaustive fourfold logical formula favoured by Gotama's opponents, see Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2); Ap. G 2 *c*. All these four positions imply that the individual is a separate or isolated Self at one time or another, and herein are erroneous. See § 2 [9] n above; and *Saṃ. Nik.*, iv, pp. 286–7.
10 Omitting synonymous clauses of expansion, including the phrase 'higher knowledge of how far that which fares (or possibly, returns) goes on' (*yāvatā vaṭṭaṃ vattati*; Int. § 92).
11 The rest of the Sutta deals with the seven states of conscious being (*satta viññāna-ṭṭhitiyo*; Int. § 93, vi), and the eight stages of emancipation (*aṭṭha vimokhā*; Ap. I *a*), all of which appears to be commentarial addition (IN 6).
12 The scene of this discourse by Gotama was the Jeta Grove at Sāvatthi.
13 *Puthu-jjana* means proletarian, common; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [7]. Cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
14 Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
15 See § 5 [2] below; Ap. G 2 *a* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* [6]; Ap. E *a* ii § 2 (*rūpa*). In Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421–3] five elements are mentioned including ether (*ākāsa*), and in Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n a sixth, mind (*viññāna*).
16 Or, thought. See § 8 [18] below; Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29]; Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 10 *c* (12); Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 14 [91], 21 [18]; Ch. 13 *d* § 9; Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (ix); Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [19]; Ch. 22 *b* § 2 (*ceto*); Ap. B *a* § 1; Ap. D *b* § 5 (154); Ap. G 1 *a* § 2 n; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3. Cp. Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8] (*attan*); and Ap. E, *Note* (*saṃkhārā*).
17 See § 5 [7] below.
18 Or, intellect. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]; Ch. 9 *a* § 11; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; Ch. 14 *c* § 7 [9]; Ap. D *a* § 3; Ap. E *c* ii §§ 2 n, 6 (1). Cp. Ap. I *b* § 6 (*vīmaṃsā*).
19 Or, reason. Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2); Ap. G 1 *a* § 7 n; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2].
20 Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n.
21 Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

§ 5. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Nidāna-vagga, Nidāna-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. I*), *Sutta 62* (*Assutavā ii*). (*PTS, ii, p.* 95.)

. . .[1] [2] 'An uninstructed ordinary man, mendicant brothers, may be indifferent to (*nibbindeyya*),[2] may be without passion for, may be liberated from this body composed of the four elements.[3] [3] Why so? The waxing and waning of this body composed of the four elements are seen, the acquiring and the laying down of it. Therefore here the uninstructed ordinary man may be indifferent. . . .[4]

[4] But as to that which is called mind or mental faculty, or consciousness, here the uninstructed ordinary man is not equal to being indifferent. [5] For long ages, mendicant brothers, the uninstructed ordinary man has held, cherished, and relied on the idea "This is mine (*mama*),[5] this I am, this is my self (*me attā*)". Therefore here the uninstructed ordinary man is not equal to being indifferent. . . . [6] But it would be better, mendicant brothers, if an uninstructed ordinary man should mistake this body composed of the four elements, rather than the mind, for the Self. [7] . . .[6]

[8] Here (*tatra*) the instructed (*sutavā*) disciple of the noble[7] (*ariya-sāvako*)[8] well and thoroughly considers Dependent Origination (*paṭicca-samuppādaṃ*):[9]—On this existing that exists, from the arising of this that arises, on this not existing that does not exist, from the cessation of this that ceases. [9] Pleasant sensation,[10] mendicant brothers, arises in dependence on contact (*phassaṃ*) pleasantly felt, and on the cessation of that pleasantly felt contact the pleasant sensation which arose in dependence on that pleasantly felt contact then ceases and subsides. [10] Painful sensation . . . [11] sensation neither painful nor pleasant . . . arises in dependence on contact . . . and on the cessation of that contact . . . subsides. [12] It is as when from the rubbing together of two sticks heat is generated and flame (*tejo*)[11] is produced (*abhi-nibbataṭi*).[12] But on the separation and laying aside of the two sticks the heat from them ceases and subsides. [13–15] Just so a . . . sensation on the cessation of . . . contact . . . subsides. [16] Regarding them thus, mendicant brothers, he becomes indifferent. . . .'[13]

§ 6. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xxii*), *Sutta 46* (*Aniccatā ii*). (*PTS, iii, p.* 45.)

. . .[14] [3] 'Material form, mendicant brothers, is transient (*aniccaṃ*);[15] that which is transient is suffering (*dukkhaṃ*);[16] that which is suffering is

[1] The opening formula places the scene at Sāvatthi. Ch. 18.
[2] Ch. 5 *c* § 4.
[3] See § 4 [6] above.
[4] Omitting repetitions.
[5] i.e. my permanent part, the soul. Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [vi. 42]. Cp. Ap. G 2 *c*; also Int. § 4, and Ch. 7 *a* 20 n.
[6] As in § 4 [7] above.
[7] Or, Noble Law. For *ariya* see Ch. 5 *b* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*]; Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (5); Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3]; Ch. 20 § 7 (6); cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 8 n (*ayya*); Ch. 9 *b* § 8 (*ayiraka*).
[8] See Ch. 8 [19] below; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 7 [9], 18 [4]; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [14]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [8]; Ap. E *a* ii § 3; Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [3]. See also Ch. 8 *l* §§ 1 (18) *sāvaka*, 2 (*sutaṃ*); and Ap. E *c* ii § 2 (*ariya*).
[9] Ap. B *c*.
[10] Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28].
[11] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [4].
[12] Ch. 9 *a* § 10. Cp. Ap. B *b* § 1 (*paṭi-san-dahati*), (*nibbattaṃ*)
[13] As in Ch. 5 *c* §§ 4–5, to end of [vi. 46].
[14] The scene is Sāvatthi (Ch. 18); Buddha speaks.
[15] Ap. E *a* i.
[16] Ap. E *b*.

without permanent-self (*an-attā*);[1] that which is without permanent-self is not mine (*mama*),[2] I am not that, that is not my self. Thus must this be viewed with right insight (*samma-paññāya*)[3] as it really is.

[4–7] Sensation ...[4] perception ... personality[5] (*saṃkhāra*) ... consciousness is transient.... Thus must this be viewed with right insight as it really is.

[8] For one thus regarding this with right insight as it really is there are no theories of the past[6] (*pubbant'-ānudiṭṭhiyo*); upon the disappearance of theories of the past there are no theories of the future[7] (*aparant'-ānudiṭṭhiyo*); upon the disappearance of theories of the future there is no obstinate holding on[8] (*paramāso*); upon the disappearance of obstinate holding on, his mind (*cittaṃ*) becomes without passion[9] for material form, for sensation, for perception, for composite unity, for consciousness, and having ceased to grasp (*anupādāya*) is liberated from the defilements (*āsavehi*);[10] having become liberated in itself (*vimutt-attā*) it is stable, being stable in itself it is happy, being happy in itself it is not agitated, not being agitated it attains complete Peace (*pari-nibbāyati*) in its own self (*pacc'-attañ-ñeva*).[11] ...'[12]

§ 7. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xxii*), *Sutta 91* (*Rāhula i*).

[1] At Sāvatthi[13] ... in the garden (*ārāme*). [2] ...[14] [3] Seated at one side the Venerable Rahula thus addressed the Blessed One: 'How, revered sir, should one understand,[15] how should one regard [things] so that both in this body (*kaye*) with its consciousness (*sa-viññānake*)[16] and also in all external appearances there are for him no impulses to egoism, selfishness, and conceit?'[17]

1 It is assumed that the Self (the self-same) is not subject to suffering.

2 Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [vi. 42].

3 Or, full understanding. Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ch. 20 § 4 [8] (7) n. Cp. § 7 [3] n below; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3] n. For the prefix *samma-* see Ch. 5 *b* § 4.

4 Omitting repetitions.

5 'The activities', Mrs. Rhys Davids in *Bk. of K. S.*, iii, pp. 39–40.

6 Namely of the self or soul. 'There is no more guessing at the far-off past', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Bk. of K. S.* It seems to be stated definitely here that the sage not only ceases to trouble about his own past and future but rejects the whole theory of rebirth. If he regards himself as the exception he might consider himself as released from the future, but in the rebirth theory he could not be independent of his past lives. Int. § 4. Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] (*pubbe-nivāsa*); Ap. B *c* § 1 (1).

7 'There is no more guessing at the far-off future', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Bk. of K. S.*, Ap. E *c* i §§ 2 [ii. 37], 7 [4].

8 Namely to individuality. 'Stubborn perversity', Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Bk. of K. S.*, Cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).

9 Or, desire.

10 Ch. 6 *a* § 8 [11]; Ap. D *a* § 7.

11 Ch. 20 § 2 (7); Ap. E *b* § 3 (2); Ap. E *c* ii § 3.

12 As in Ch. 5 *c* § 5 from 'he knows' to end of [vi. 46].

13 Ch. 18.

14 The Venerable (*āyasmā*; Ch. 8 *g*) Rāhula (Ch. 2 § 1; Ch. 10 *c*, 22) approaches the Blessed One.

15 *Kathaṃ jānato*, knowing what? Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*sammā-sati*); see § 6 [3] above (*samma-paññāya*).

16 See Ch. 14 *c* 6 [3]; cp. Ap. B *c* 2 (2). The Khandhas are here summarized as body and consciousness.

17 Or, conceit of egoism and selfishness. The Pāli words used are *ahaṃkāra* (Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 1), *mamaṃkāra*, and *mān-ānusaya* (Ap. D *a* § 8, ii; Ap. E *a*, *Note*). Ch. 4 § 14 [4]; Ch. 11 *c* § 12 [3] n. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] (*delusion*); Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [ii. 1] (*pride*), 21 [18] (*sakkāya*); Ap. D *b*; and Ap. E, *Note* (*saṃkhārā*); also Int. § 19.

[4–8] 'When one regards all material-form (*rūpaṃ*) whatsoever, Rāhula . . . all sensation . . . all perception . . . all personality[1] . . . all consciousness[2] whatsoever, whether past, future,[3] or present, whether of oneself or external, whether gross or subtle,[4] low or high, far or near, and thinks "This is not mine,[5] this I am not, this is not my permanent self", then one regards it with right insight as it really is. [9] For one thus understanding, Rāhula, for one thus regarding [things] there are in this body with its consciousness and also in all external appearances no impulses to egoism, selfishness, and conceit.'

§ 8. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. xxii*), *Sutta 1* (*Nakulapitar*) *18–25.*

. . .[6] [18] 'And how, householder (*gaha-pati*),[7] is one wretched in body but not wretched in mind[8] (*ātura-citto*)? [19] Now here[9] (*idha*) the instructed disciple of the noble,[10] acquainted with the Noble Law,[11] well-disciplined in the Noble Law, an observer of true men (*sa-ppurisānaṃ*), acquainted with the Law of true men, well-disciplined in the Law of true men, does not regard matter[12] (*rūpam*) as the permanent-self (*attato*), nor the self as material[13] (*rūpavantaṃ*), nor matter as in the permanent-self, nor the permanent-self as in[14] matter, and is not fixed in the idea "I am matter, matter is [an essential part] of me (*mama*)";[15] and since he is not fixed in the idea "I am matter, matter is [an essential part] of me" when matter changes and deteriorates, then from the change and deterioration of matter there do not arise in him grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair.[16]

[20–23] The instructed disciple . . . does not regard sensation[17] . . .[18] perception . . . individual character . . . consciousness . . . as the permanent self . . . then from [their] change and deterioration . . . there do not arise in him grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair. [24] Thus, householder, is one wretched in body but not wretched in mind'.[19] [25] Thus

1 Or, individual character.
2 Or, thought.
3 Cp. § 6 [8] above.
4 For this and the context see Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [vi. 44]; Ch. 14 *c* § 6 [4].
5 Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [42].
6 The scene is laid among the Bhaggas (Int. 164), on the Sumsumara Peak (Int. § 148, iv) in the Bhesakalā Wood in the Deer Park (see Ch. 5 *a* § 9 n). The householder having spoken with the Blessed One has approached the great disciple Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1]; Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [4] n). On the rebirths of Nakulapitar the *Aṅguttara* Commentary adds many strange details (ThB. p. 115; Ap. B *a*).
7 Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [7].
8 See § 4 (6) above. This sentiment is familiar to the Stoics (Int. § 109).
9 Or, about this point; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]; Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [2]; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24]; Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13]; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 4 [9], 5 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [8], 7 [5]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [19]. Contrast Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (20). Compare Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; and Ch. 21 § 7 [25] (*tattha*).
10 Or, Noble Path. See § 5 [8] above.
11 Part I (title); Ch. 14 *c* §§ 4 [7], 5 [189].
12 Or, material form.
13 Or, having material form. See Ch. 14 *c* § 5 [189].
14 Or, included in. Ap. E *a* ii § 3.
15 Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [vi. 42].
16 Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [3]; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).
17 Thus evidently the permanent-self has no feeling, perception, or thought, at least of a personal or individualistic kind.
18 Omitting repetitions.
19 Namely, by realizing the transience of the individual portion, and the permanence of the universal substratum, of the self. This is the process of *samādhi* (Ch. 5 *b* § 4; Ap. D *c*; Ap. E *c* ii § 1 n; Ap. F 2 *d*, *self-transcendence*).

spoke the Venerable Sāriputta; the householder Nakulapitar, rejoicing, welcomed the word[1] of the Venerable Sāriputta.

§ 9. *Buddhaghosha's Visuddhi-magga (Path of Purity), ch. xix*[2] *(Kankhā-vitaraṇa-visuddhi-niddesa). (PTS. pp. 602–3.)*

'... He then sees clearly, in the light of the highest knowledge, [*samma-ppaññāya*], that when a cause is acting, or the fruit of an action [*vipaka-ppavattiyā*] ripens, it is merely by a conventional form of speech [*samaññā-mattena*] that the wise speak of an actor or of any one as experiencing the fruit of an action. Therefore have the ancients said,

'No doer[3] is there does the deed,
Nor is there one who feels the fruit;
Constituent parts[4] (*suddha-dhammā*) alone roll on;
This view alone is orthodox.

'And thus the deed, and thus the fruit[5] [*vipāke*]
Roll on and on, each from its cause;
As of the round of tree and seed,
No one can tell when they began.

'Nor is the time to be perceived
In future births [*saṃsāre*] when they shall cease.
The heretics [*titthiyā*] perceive not this,
And fail of mastery o'er themselves.

'"An Ego", say they, "doth exist [*sattasaññaṃ gahetvā*],
Eternal, or that soon will cease";
Thus two-and-sixty[6] heresies
They 'mongst themselves discordant hold.

'Bound in the bonds of heresy,
By passion's flood [*taṇhā sotena*] they're borne along;
And borne along by passion's flood,
From misery find they no release.

'If once these facts he but perceive,
A priest whose faith on Buddha rests,
The subtle, deep, and self-devoid
Dependence[7] then will penetrate.

[1] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [vi. 29] n.

[2] Ap. D *b* § 3. Quoted from Warren's *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), pp. 247–9; the Pāli has been added in square brackets. Buddhaghosha's chapter xix deals with the over-coming of Doubt. The preceding prose passage may be translated—Beyond the deed he sees no doer, beyond the fruit no reaper. The old verses cited by Buddha-ghosha do not necessarily take exactly the view of that great commentator. In any case the view taken is less realistic than Gotama's, and exaggerates the impermanence of the individual to vanishing point (IN 8 *c*, *Mahāyāna*).

[3] Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17].

[4] See the last verse below. Perhaps mere phenomena; cp. Ch. 4 § 10 [i. 3]. Contrast Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [7] (*satañ ca dhammo*).

[5] Result or resultant action; Ap. B *a* § 4 [1] (*results*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23]; seed and fruit are action and reaction. Ap. G 1 *b* § 6 n; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. B *b* § 1 (*evil actions*); Ap. D *c* §§ 3 [6], 4 [*a*] n (*phala*); Ap. G 1 *c* § 4. See 7th verse below.

[6] See § 2 n above.

[7] *Paccaya*, causation; literally, cause. Ap. B *c* §§ 1 (1), 2 [2]; cp. Ch. 4 § 11 [i. 5]. The word translated 'self-devoid' is *suñña*; cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] (*void*).

'Not in its fruit[1] (*vipākamhi*) is found the deed
Nor in the deed finds one the fruit;
Of each the other is devoid (*suññā*),
Yet there's no fruit (*phalaṃ*) without the deed.[2]

'Just as no store of fire is found
In jewel [*maṇihi*],[3] cow-dung, or [the rays of] the sun,
Nor separate from these exists,
Yet short of fuel no fire is known [*sambhārehi ca jāyati*];[4]

'Even so we ne'er within the deed
Can retribution's fruit descry,
Nor yet in any place without;
Nor can in fruit the deed be found.

'Deeds separate [*sunnam*] from their fruits exist,
And fruits are separate from the deeds:
But consequent [*upādāya*] upon the deed
The fruit doth into being come.

'No god of heaven[5] or Brahma-world[6]
Doth cause the endless round of birth;[7]
Constituent parts[8] alone roll on,
From cause[9] and from material[10] sprung.'

ii. *The Temporary Self;*[11] *Buddhist Self-reliance and Self-training.*[12]

[*Note.* The emphasis which Gotama lays upon the necessity of self-reliance and self-training, as shown in the following extracts, is sufficient evidence, if evidence be needed, that by his *an-atta* doctrine he intends only that there is no permanent individuality, not that there is no temporary present Ego or that this life is in any sense unreal. The Brāhman idealistic doctrine of *maya*[13] or the illusoriness of this life can have made no appeal to the Teacher of the Noble Eightfold Path of duty.[14] Throughout Gotama's teaching it is implied that the self is real, however transient the individual,

[1] Result or resultant action. See 2nd verse above.
[2] Cp. Ap. B *b* (*Impersonal kamma*). Contrast Ap. B (*Results of Action*).
[3] *Mani* here is a crystal or burning-glass; *Miln.* 54 (*Pāli Dict.*).
[4] Rather, 'yet is born of them in combination'. For *sambhāra* see the last verse below.
[5] i.e. no personal Deity (*deva*). Cp. IN 2 *b* (*devatā*).
[6] The word is *Brahma*. Int. § 35; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13].
[7] *Saṃsāra*; Ap. B. Karma is the seed, retribution is the fruit. The one issues from, and in, the other. But 'no doer does the deed, nor is there one who feels the fruit'; the process is a universal movement, not a transference from one personality to another.
[8] See the first verse above.
[9] *Hetu*, precedent conditions; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]. Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 7 (*uncreated*).
[10] *Sam-bhāra*, literally 'brought together'; combination; perhaps of elements. See 8th verse above.
[11] Ch. 18 *c* § 6 [8] (*common self*); Ap. C *b* § 10 [2]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [3]; Ap. F 1 *c* [161]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8] (*mind*); and Ap. E *b* § 2 [5] (*puggala*).
[12] IN 3 *b*; Int. §§ 5, 40, 106; Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 9 *a* § 8 (*development*); Ch. 10 *c* (69) n; Ch. 16 *d* § 36; Ap. D *b* § 3 (*doer*); Ap. F 1; Ap. G 1 *b* § 5; Ap. G 1 *c* § 2; Ap. H 4 (*self-discipline*); Ap. I *a* (*Exercises*). Cp. Int. § 25 (*responsibility*); Ch. 21 § 16 (*labour*); Ap. G 1 *a* (iii, *Realism* and iv, *Rationalism*); also Ap. D *b* (*Ignorance*).
[13] IN 8 *c*.
[14] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (especially *s. saṃkappo, s. ājīvo* and *s. vāyāmo*); Ap. G 1 *a* (*ethical outlook*).

and the will is free.[1] Nor can the supreme goal of the Eightfold Path, the transcendence of the temporary self, *sammā-samādhi*, be reconciled with any materialistic philosophy. The path of Gotama is a realism, sometimes practical, sometimes mystical, midway between the subtlety of idealism and the grossness of materialism.]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 26 (Ariya-pariyesana S.*[2]*). (PTS, i, pp. 172–3.)*

'Hearken, mendicants, the Immortal[3] has been attained. I explain, I declare the Law.[4] If you walk as I explain, then ere long and in the present life and by yourselves[5] (*sayaṃ*) you will learn fully,[6] realize, and having attained[7] abide in that unsurpassed [ideal], the fulfilment of the holy life,[8] for the sake of which the clansmen rightly go forth from the household to the houseless life.

§ 2. *Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 152 (Indriya-bhāvanā Sutta).*[9]

[PTS, iii, p. 298] . . .[10] Then the young man Uttara, the pupil[11] of Pārāsariya,[12] went to where the Blessed One was. . . .[13] When Uttara was seated at one side the Blessed One addressed him thus: 'Does the Brāhman Pārāsariya teach his disciples (*sāvakānaṃ*)[14] the training of the senses (*indriya-bhāvanaṃ*)?' 'He does. . . .'[15] 'How then, Uttara, does he teach . . . the training of the senses?' 'As to that, O (*bho*) Gotama, one does not see form (*rūpaṃ*) with the eye, one does not hear sound with the ear; even thus, O Gotama, does the Brāhman Pārāsariya teach his disciples the training of the senses.'[16] 'If this be so, Uttara, a blind man might be trained in the sense of sight, a deaf man might be trained in the sense of hearing, according to the word of the Brāhman Pārāsariya. A blind man indeed, Uttara, does not see form with the eye, a deaf man does not hear sound with the ear'. . . .[17] [p. 299] 'In what way, Ānanda, in the discipline of the noble (*ariyassa*)[18] is there unsurpassed training of the senses? . . .[19] [p. 302]

1 Int. § 8 (*responsibility*); Ap. D *a* (*Hīnayāna*); Ap. F 1 *c*.

2 From the introduction to the First Sermon; Ch. 5 *a* § 10.

3 The universal substratum, attained by *samādhi*. Ap. E *c* i § 8 n; Ap. F 2 *d* (*self-transcendence*).

4 Part I (title) n.

5 i.e. by your own exertions. Int. §§ 10, 27, 35 (ii), 40; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ap. I *b* § 3; and Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]. Cp. § 3 below (*pacattaṃ*); Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 7 (*sāmam*); also Ch. 5 *a* § 2 [2] (*questioning*); Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68] (*reasoning*); further Ch. 12 *d* § 4 n, and Ch. 13 *b* § 4 [4].

6 *Abhiññā* for *abhiññāya*, gerund; cp. Ch. 21 § 14 [50].

7 Ap. I *b* § 4 [8].

8 Ap. F 2 *c*.

9 On the cultivation or training of the powers or senses (*indriyāni*; Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [1]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, i, [23]; cp. Ap. B *c* § 2, 2; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4). Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2] (*exercised*); Ch. 20 § 5, 1 (*exercise*); Ap. I *a* (*Meditation*); also Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13] (*development*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [78] n (*Brahma-vihārā*).

10 The scene is laid at Kajaṅgalā (Int. § 157) in the Mukhelu Grove.

11 The Pāli word is *antevāsin*. Cp. Ch. 8 (*i*).

12 Not mentioned elsewhere in the first-four Nikāyas. This Brāhman teacher (Int. § 185) was apparently an idealist. Int. § 178 (*Vedāntist*); Ap. D *b* (*Māyā*); and Ap. G 2 *c*.

13 Omitting the usual formula as in Ap. B *b* § 3 (4).

14 Cp. Ch 8 *l*.

15 Omitting repetition.

16 Or, sensory powers.

17 The disciple Ānanda takes up the questioning; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265].

18 Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8].

19 Gotama proceeds on this realistic basis to describe the training of sight, hearing, smell, taste, touch, and mind (*mano*; Ap. E c i § 4), for the attainment of tranquillity (*upekkhā*; Ap. F 2 *b*). Cp. Ap. F 1 *b* § 2.

Meditate (*jhāyatha*),[1] Ānanda, do not be slothful (*mā pamādattha*),[2] do not reproach yourselves afterwards'. . . .

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Nidāya-vagga, Kassapa-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ.* 5), *Sutta 3* (*Candupama*).

'. . .[3] [15] Kassapa, mendicant brothers, when he teaches the Law to others thinks thus: "Well-announced by the Blessed One is the Law, it is of this life[4] (*san-diṭṭhiko*),[4] it says 'Come and see',[5] it is a guide[6] [to Nibbāna] and must be perceived by the wise, each by himself (*paccattaṃ*).[7] O that they[8] may hear from me the Law, and then having heard the Law may understand, and then having understood may thus go on." '

§ 4. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 16* (*Mahā-parinibbāna S.*) *ii, 26.*[9]

'Therefore, Ānanda, abide self-reliant (*atta-dīpā*[10]), taking refuge in yourselves (*atta-saraṇā*),[11] not taking refuge in others; reliant on the Law (*dhamma-dīpā*), taking refuge in the Law, not taking refuge in another. . . . Those, Ānanda, who now or after my passing away shall abide self-reliant . . . reliant on the Law . . . these shall become my mendicants (*bhikkhū*), Ānanda, above darkness[12] (*tamat-agge*)—those who are desirous to learn (*sikkhā-kāmā*).'[13]

§ 5. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16, vi, 7.*[14]

'Composite-unities[15] (*saṃkhārā*) are perishable by nature; labour diligently (*a-ppamādena*).'[16]

6. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada Verses.*

(1) [Our] natures (*dhamma*)[17] are the result of [our] mind,[18] they are mainly [our] mind (*mano-seṭṭha*), they are made by [our] mind (*mano-mayā*).[19]

If with corrupted mind one either speaks or acts,[20]
Then sorrow follows one as the wheel follows the foot of the draft-ox.

[1] Cp. Ch. 9 *a*; Ap. I *a*. See Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [266]. [2] Ch. 22 *b* 25; see § 5 below.

[3] Gotama addresses his followers at Sāvatthi (Ch. 18) in the Jetavana monastery on the merits of the great disciple Kassapa (Ch. 7 *a* § 2; Ap. A 1 *b*, 3). Ch. 8 *h* § 1.

[4] Ap. D *c* § 3 [18]. 'Of advantage even in the present life', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 419. The epithet is strikingly significant (IN, 5 *b*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 7, *beyond*, n). [5] i.e. it invites all.

[6] 'Conducive to salvation', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* Literally, leading on. See Ap. B *a* § 6 [9].

[7] Int. § 40; Ap. E *c* i § 6 (8); Ap. H 1 § 6 [6]; also Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [121]. Cp. § 1 above (*sayaṃ*); § 4 below (*atta-dīpā*).

[8] Others. Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 (*ānukampaya*); see § 5 n below.

[9] Ch. 21 § 8 [26]. The scene is Beluva-Gāmaka (Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [21]; Ch. 12 *d* § 1 n).

[10] Ch. 11 *d* § 13 [1]; Ch. 21 § 8 [26]. Cp. Int. §§ 6, 106; see § 3 above (*pacattaṃ*). Literally, *terra firma* to yourselves. The picturesque rendering 'Be ye lamps unto yourselves' (SBE, xi, p. 38) was afterwards abandoned by Rhys Davids in the *Pāli Dict.* [11] Int. § 40; Ap. H 2 *a* § 1 [3]. [12] Or, the region of doubt.

[13] Ap. F 1 *c*. [14] The Buddha's last words. Ch. 22 *b* § 25.

[15] Individuals. Ap. E *a* i.

[16] See § 2 above; Ap. C *b* § 11 (21). The object of this diligent labour is liberation (Ap. D *a* § 6) from individualistic desires by self-training, and to help others to the same (see § 3 above; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 (*ānukampaya*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*).

[17] Ap. E *c* i § 1 (279).

[18] Or, way of thinking, outlook. The Pāli word is *mano* (Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7]). Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4, *sammā-diṭṭhi*; and Int. § 45 (*the true worshipper*).

[19] Ch. 10 *c* [2] (11). [20] Ap. B *b*, *Note*.

(2) [Our] natures are the result of [our] mind, they are mainly [our] mind, they are made by [our] mind.
If with pure mind one either speaks or acts,
Then joy (*sukhaṃ*)[1] follows one as a shade[2] which fails not [to protect].—

(19) Even though he speaks much of what is correct, if being a slothful (*pamatto*)[3] man he does not act accordingly,
Like a herdsman counting the herds of others, he is not a sharer in the recluse-fellowship (*sāmaññassa*).[4]

(20) Even though he speaks little of what is correct, if he is one who walks rightly in accordance with the Law,[5]
Having abandoned[6] lust, hatred, and delusion (*mohaṃ*),[7] having full knowledge, having a mind happily liberated (*su-vimutta-citto*),[8]
Not-grasping (*an-upādivāno*)[9] after anything either here or beyond (*idha va huram va*),[10] he is a sharer in the recluse-fellowship.—

(50) Not others' perversities, not others' acts and omissions,
One should regard one's own (*attano*) acts and omissions.

(80) Engineers (*netti-kā*)[11] lead the water; arrow-makers (*usu-kārā*) shape the dart;
Carpenters (*taccha-kā*) shape the wood; the wise (*paṇḍitā*) train themselves.

(103) One may conquer a million men in battle,
But he who conquers himself alone verily is the utmost battle-winner.[12]—

(121) One should not underrate evil (*pāpassa*),[13] thinking 'It will not come near me'.
By the falling of drops of water the water-jar is filled;
The foolish man (*bālo*) is filled with evil little by little accumulated.

(122) One should not underrate virtue (*puññassa*),[14] [thinking] 'It will not come near me'.
By the falling of drops of water the water-jar is filled;
The steadfast man (*dhīro*) is filled with virtue little by little accumulated.—[15]

1 Ap. C *b* 11 (203); Ap. E *b* § 2. The personal note, with the sense of reward and punishment. recurs often in the *Dhammapada*, in spite of obvious efforts to exclude it.

2 Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6].

3 Ap. C *b* § 11 (21). Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 7.

4 Ch. 8 *g* and *l*.

5 Or, is one who walks according to the spirit of the Law (*dhammassa hoti anudhamma-cārī*).

6 Pāli *pahāya*; cp. Ch. 9 *a* §§ 5, 12.

7 The three Fires. Ap. D *a* § 10.

8 Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32]. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 8.

9 Ap. D *a* (*upādāna*).

10 In this world or the next. Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 6; Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6]. Contrast Ap. E *c* i § 8 [19].

11 IN 14. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [2].

12 Ap. D *a* § 4 (103).

13 Ap. G 2 *b*.

14 Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [17]. Cp. Ap. F 2; also Ap. D (*Evil*), and Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*).

15 Cp. Ap. B *b*. *Note*.

(222) He who checks his rising anger[1] as a whirling chariot,
Him I call a charioteer,[2] the other folk but rein-holders.

(239) Let the wise man (*medhāvī*) little by little from time to time,
Like a silver-smith, blow away his own impurity (*malaṃ*).

[1] Cp. Ap. D *a* § 10, ii (*hate*).
[2] Ch. 9 *b* § 10 n; Ap. H 1 § 6.

APPENDIX F

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter* 6)

THE ETHICAL SYSTEM[1] OF GOTAMA

1. ETHICS OF ACTION[2]

'To do no harm, to be active in well-doing,
To purify one's mind; this is the Law of the Enlightened Ones', Dhp. 183.

[*Note*. In promulgating the *an-atta* doctrine,[3] which emphasizes the impermanence of the individual soul, Gotama by no means advocated a negative or passive attitude towards the duties of this world. With the self-importance of the individual there disappear the exaggerated values and turmoil of life, but not the duties of life. Gotama's ideal resembles the 'imperturbability' and the 'indifference' of Stoicism[4] towards individual interests; but as the Stoics inculcated a strong sense of social or 'common'[5] duty, so Gotama taught an intense altruistic activity. The Teacher's last words[6] inculcate strenuous endeavour and afford a fitting close to his own long life of arduous and masterly labour. The well-known Buddhist list of the 'seven constituents of enlightenment'[7] includes the active virtues of heroism (or energy) and joy, as well as the passive virtues of tranquillity (or repose) and indifference (or serenity). These and other active virtues are also prominent among the Ten Perfections[8] which sum up the characteristics of a Bodhisatta. The classes to whom specific duties should be actively rendered are enumerated in the Sigālovāda Sutta.[9]

In the 'graduated discourse' which converted Yasa[10] the first section was a *dāna-kathā*, or discourse on giving,[11] and the second a *sīla-kathā*, or discourse on virtuous action.[12] This sermon was evidently repeated constantly. It is natural that in the forefront of a religion of altruism such as Gotama's there should be placed spontaneous giving of alms or material charity as first of all the practical virtues. Along with it must be placed the

1 For the duties and ideals of different classes see Ch. 8 *h*, *i*, and *l*; Ch. 9 *b*; Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [2] n. See also Ap. D; Ap. G 1 *a*; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]; Ap. H 4. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*kammanta*); Ch. 22 *b* § 25 n (*karanīya*); Ap. H 1 § 6 [8] (*sīla*). C. T. Strauss's *Buddha and his Doctrine* (1923) contains a good collection of short passages (pp. 73–85) but gives no references.

2 Int. § 3; Ch. 4 § 16 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 5 n; Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*cessation*) n; Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [4] n; Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [3]; Ap. B *b* (*kamma*); Ap. B *b* § 3 [6] (*deed*); Ap. F 2 *a* (137), (152); Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. E *c* ii, also Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [6] (*puñña*); and Ch. 8 *l*; Ch. 20 §§ 2–10; Ch. 22 *b* § 2. The encouragement of the private activities of householders (Ch. 9 *b* § 10 [35] n) and of their wives (Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3], *women*) and of the public works of kings (Ap. G 1 *c* §§ 5 [v], *roads*, 7, *welfare*) is consonant with the spirit of active compassionate labour which filled Gotama's long life (Ch. 6 *b* § 1, *compassion*).

3 Ap. E *c* i.

4 IN 10; Int. § 101; Ap. F 2 *b* (*serenity*).

5 Int. § 97.

6 Ch. 22 *b* § 25.

7 Ch. 9 *a* § 8; Ap. F 2, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].

8 Ap. F 2 *a*.

9 Int. § 103; Ch. 8 *l*.

10 Ch. 6 *a* § 2.

11 Ap. F 1 *a*.

12 Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3; Ap. H 2 *b*.

first of the *Brahma-vihārā*, spiritual charity or fraternal love (*mettā*).[1] Without the spirit of altruism charity is a mere political convenience or, if unorganized, a public nuisance. In Gotama's discourse *dāna* is the practical equivalent of *mettā*.]

a. Dāna or Generosity[2]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, verse 177.*

(177) Verily the niggardly do not go to the divine world (*deva-lokaṃ*);[3]
Fools (*bālā*) indeed do not praise giving (*dānaṃ*).
But the wise man (*dhīro*) rejoices in giving;
And thus he is blissful (*sukhī*) hereafter[4] (*parattha*).

§ 2. *Jātaka Commentary,*[5] *Birth Story No. 316 (Sasa-Jātaka; Fausböll, iii, 51 ff).*

THE HARE BIRTH

[p. 51] . . .[6] 'Long ago when Brahmadatta was ruling in Benāres[7] the Bodhisatta[8] came to birth again as a hare, and lived in a wilderness. On one side of this wilderness there was mountain country, on one side a river, and on another a frontier village.[9] And there were three others—a monkey, a jackal, and an otter—his friends. These four wise beings living together took their food each in his own feeding place, and in the evening used to assemble together. The wise hare by admonition to the three animals

[1] Ap. F 1 *b*.

[2] Int. § 101 (*love*); Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 9 *b* §§ 7, 10 n; Ch. 10 *c* (66) n; Ap. D *a* § 4 (354); Ap. F 1, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *a* (117); Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vii]; Ap. H 5 [95] n; also Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43] (*giver*). Cp. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n (*cāga*); also Int. § 25 (*altruism*). The 13th *Vagga* (10 sections) of the Twos of *Aṅg. Nik.* is named *Dāna-vagga* as also is the 4th *Vagga* (10 Suttas) of the Eights.

[3] This apparently is that 'heaven' which in popular Buddhism superseded the less easily comprehensible *Nibbāna* of the Teacher. Int. § 70; Ap. C *a* § 2.

[4] Or, elsewhere; literally, 'beyond'. Ch. 7 *b* § 2.

[5] Int. § 16; Ch. 1 § 1; Ch. 7 *a* § 8 n; Ch. 8 *d* § 6 n; Ch. 10 *d* § 3 n; Ap. H 1, *Note*; Ap. I *b* § 3 (*rebirth*) n; also Int. §§ 22, 31, 52; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 1 n, 2 [3] n. The verses which are comprised in the Birth Stories contained in the *Jātaka Commentary* form together one of the Parts or Books of the 5th *Nikāya* (Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note*) of the *Sutta Piṭaka*, but they are scarcely intelligible by themselves. The necessary prose setting has for the most part come down to us only in the *Jātaka Commentary*, but the extent of the changes made during the process (Ch. 14 *b* § 7 [3] n) cannot be ascertained. The Commentary, or at least the nucleus of it, most probably was translated from the archaic Sinhalese (Int. § 21). Gotama is supposed to be the narrator of the Stories. Many of the tales are probably in germ more ancient than the time of the Buddha, and were altered and attributed to the great moral teacher apparently by later generations because of their ethical nature. They all assume the verity of the doctrine of transmigration in the literal Hindu sense (Ap. B *a*). The morality of these Birth Stories is sometimes decidedly dubious and childish, and not at all in character with the Teacher; for example in No. 208 the Bodhisatta, or future Buddha, in monkey form gets the better of his deceitful crocodile opponent by telling an even bigger falsehood than his adversary and then jeers at him for his size and stupidity.

[6] Omitting a commentarial setting which states the occasion of the story.

[7] Int. § 158.

[8] Or, future Buddha; literally Wisdom-being (or embodiment of enlightenment). Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

[9] On the edge of the aboriginal country such as exists to this day in the Santhāl Parganahs and Chota Nāgpūr. Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2.

would make known the Law, saying "Alms[1] must be given, duty[2] must be kept, holy-day observances[3] must be practised". They having accepted his admonition would enter each his own dwelling-place in the thicket and stay there. [p. 52] Thus time passed and one day the Bodhisatta looking at the sky and observing the moon and perceiving "To-morrow will be holy-day" said to the three others: "To-morrow will be holy-day; do you three observe your duty and keep the day. Almsgiving, based on duty,[4] is very fruitful; therefore if any beggars arrive you should feed them, giving them the food which was to be eaten by yourselves." They saying "Good" assented, and each then stayed in his own dwelling-place. On the next day very early the otter, saying "I will search for food", having gone out went to the bank of the Ganges. Now a fisherman had caught seven red fish and strung them on a rush string, and having buried them in the sand on the bank of the Ganges, had gone down the Ganges fishing. The otter scenting the smell of the fish removed the sand and seeing the fish took them out. Having called out three times "Is there any owner of these" and seeing no owner, he gripped the rush string with his teeth and put the fish in his own dwelling-place in the thicket, and thinking "I will eat these at the right time" he lay down and reflected on his own duty. The jackal likewise went out in search of food, and saw in the hut of a field-watcher two spits of meat, a large lizard, and a jar of curds. Having called out three times "Is there any owner of these" and seeing no owner, he put the string handle of the jar over his neck and gripped the spits of meat and the lizard between his teeth and taking them away he put them in his own lair in the thicket, and thinking "I will eat these at the right time" he lay down and reflected on his own duty. [p. 53] The monkey likewise going into the woodland fetched a heap of mangoes and put them in his own dwelling-place in the thicket, and thinking "I will eat these at the right time" he lay down and reflected on his own duty.

But the Bodhisatta lay in his own thicket, and he thought: "At the right time, I will go out and eat sweet grass. It is not possible to give grass to beggars who may come to me, but I have no sessamum, rice, and such like; if a beggar comes to me I will give him my own body to eat". Through the radiance of his duty the throne of Sakka,[5] made of pale precious stone, glowed like embers. Sakka pondering on this perceived the cause and thought "I will test the king of hares".

First he went to the dwelling-place of the otter and stood there in the form of a Brāhman.[6] And on being asked "Brāhman, why standest thou there?" he replied "Pundit,[7] if I obtain some food, then keeping the holy-day I shall perform what is ordained for a devotee".[8] The other said

[1] *Dāna*.

[2] *Sila*. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n; Ap. H 1, *Note*; Ap. H 4 a; and Ap. F 2 *a* (122). Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (27) n.

[3] *Uposatha-kamma*. Ap. H 1. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (26); Ch. 11 *a* § 3. One of the chief observances was fasting, that is abstinence from any but the early morning meal; Int. § 190 (*fasts*).

[4] Ch. 20 § 8 [12] n; cp. Ch. 8 *l* (27) n.

[5] Int. § 93 (i).

[6] Or, holy man. A Brāhman in the restricted caste sense could not beg food from anyone of lower caste. Ap. F 2 *c*.

[7] Wise or learned sir (*paṇḍita*). Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [3].

[8] *Samaṇa*. Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]; Ap. A 2 *d* (*samaṇa-brāhmaṇa*).

"Good, I will give thee food", and in conversation with him uttered the first verse:[1]

"Seven red fish drawn from the water to the shore have I.
This, O Brāhman, is what I have; eat it and stay here in the grove".

The Brāhman said "It is right early,[2] let it be for a while; I will decide later", and went to the jackal; and on being asked "Brāhman, why standest thou there?" he replied in the same way. [p. 54] The jackal said "Good, I will give", and in conversation with him uttered the second verse:

"I have carried away the evening meal of a certain field-watcher,
Two spits of meat, one lizard, and a jar of curds.
This, O Brāhman, is what I have; eat it and stay here in the grove".

The Brāhman said "It is right early, let it be for a while; I will decide later", and went to the monkey; and on being asked "Brāhman, why standest thou there?" he replied in the same way. The monkey said "Good, I give", and in conversation with him uttered the third verse:

"Ripe mangoes, cold water, and cool delightful shade,
This, O Brāhman, is what I have; eat and stay here in the grove".

The Brāhman said "It is right early, let it be for a while; I will decide later".

Then he went to the wise hare, and on being asked "Brāhman, why standest thou there?" he replied in the same way. Hearing him the Bodhisatta was delighted and said: "Brāhman, thou hast done well in coming to me for food; to-day I will give a gift which I never gave before, yet thou dutifully wilt not have caused destruction of life. Go thou, friend,[3] collect sticks, make a fire and inform me. I will give up myself and leap into the midst of the fire, and when my body is cooked eat thou the flesh and perform what is ordained for a recluse". [p. 55] And in conversation with him he uttered the fourth verse:

"A hare has no sessamum, no beans, no rice.
My flesh cooked in this fire eat thou and stay here in the grove".

Sakka having heard his words built a heaped-up fire by his own power and informed the Bodhisatta. The latter rising from his lair of sweet grass went to the fire, and saying "If there are insects in my fur they must not be killed" shook his body three times. Then giving his own body as a gift he leapt and fell upon the heaped-up fire as greatly delighted in mind as a royal swan amidst a cluster of lotuses.[4] But the fire was not able to make hot even a pore of the skin of the Bodhisatta's body, and he felt like one who has plunged into the midst of snow. Then addressing Sakka he said: "Brāhman, the fire made by thee is very cold and is not able to make hot even a pore of the skin of my body. Why is this?" "Pundit," said he, "I am no Brāhman; I am Sakka, come to test thee". Then the Bodhisatta cried a cry of exultation:[5] "O Sakka, stay I pray! If the whole company of the world should put me to the test through giving it would not see in me

[1] i.e. of the original story, of which the prose setting is here amplified in the Commentary. The verses were fixed, but the prose was probably left to the choice of the story-teller. Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.

[2] The one meal of a holy or fast day must be eaten before noon. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (25).

[3] *Tata*. Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [2].

[4] Ch. 5 *a* § 6.

[5] *Sīha-nāda*; literally, lion-roar. Ch. 10 *c* (8); Ch. 11 *d* § 5 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 10.

unwillingness to give". Then Sakka said to him "Wise hare, let thy merit become familiar to the whole of this age",[1] and having pressed a mountain and taken its essence he painted on the circle of the moon the sign of a hare; and having addressed the Bodhisatta he laid him upon tender sweet grass in that woodland in the thicket, and was gone to his own divine abode. [p. 56] And those four wise beings dwelling happily together, fulfilling their duty and practising holy-day observances, passed away according to their *karma*.'[2]

. . .[3] The Teacher (*Satthā*), having finished this narrative and made clear the moral-truths (*saccāni*), applied the story (*jātakaṃ*). . . . 'The otter of that time was Ānanda,[4] the jackal was Moggallāna,[5] the monkey was Sāriputta,[6] and I myself was the wise hare.'

b. Mettā, Friendship or Love;[7] *a-vera, non-enmity;*[8] *friendliness*[9]

[*Note.* When Gotama declares that selfish desire[10] is the cause of all sorrow, it must not be thought that he advocates a passive condition of mere indifference. Between selfish desire, based on individualism, and an ardent desire for the welfare of others, such as the Teacher himself exhibited throughout his long life, there is all the difference in the world.[11] The inculcation of goodwill, charity, and universal love, is an essential part of Gotama's teaching. So greatly did this virtue figure in the Buddhist view that ultimately, in Mahāyānist Buddhism, it became personified as Metteyya[12] or the Loving Spirit, the coming Buddha, who after the age of Gotama Buddha would in due course come to enlighten mankind anew. *Mettā* is the first of the Divine Qualities (*Brahma-vihārā*),[13] and the ninth of the Ten Perfections,[14] both of these lists culminating in serenity (*upekhā*),[15] a virtue based upon, not contrary to, well-doing.]

§ 1. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka X, iv, 3.4.*

[3] . . .[16] 'And do you live in agreement,[17] Anuruddha and friends,[18] in unity, and without disputes, mingling like milk and water, regarding each other with friendly eyes?' 'Certainly, revered sir. . . .'[19] 'Now in what way? . . .' [4] 'In this matter, revered sir, the thought comes to me "The gain is mine, great gain is mine, that I live with such men leading a holy life

[1] *Sakala-kappa;* Int. § 107.
[2] Their actions and what these involved (Ap. B *b* § 1).
[3] Omitting commentarial setting.
[4] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4].
[5] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
[6] Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].
[7] Int. §§ 40 (*others*), 16 (*brotherhood*), 53 (*love*), 101 (*love*); Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [7]; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (21) n; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [4] n § 9; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [9]; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [13]; Ch. 20 § 7 (1); Ap. F 2 *a* (157); Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6 (*compassion*); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10] (*soracca*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9] (*agreement*); also Int. §§ 10 and 25 (*altruism*), and Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [154] (*friend*).
[8] Ap. D *a* §§ 8 (ii), 10 (ii).
[9] Ch. 13 *a* § 6 (*hitesin*).
[10] Ap. D *a* (*taṇhā*).
[11] Ap. F 1 *c*.
[12] Ap. A 2 *c*, *Note*.
[13] Ap. F 2 *c*.
[14] Ap. F 2 *a*.
[15] Ap. F 2 *c* (*upekhā*).
[16] Khandhaka X deals with the dissensions of the Saṃgha at Kosambi (Int. § 143). and describes how Gotama left the quarrelsome monks of that place and wandered alone back to Sāvatthi. He meets Anuruddha at Pācīna-vaṃsa-dāya (Int. § 150), and other disciples on the route.
[17] Ch. 13 *a* § 6. See Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [156].
[18] Anuruddha is in the plural, which includes his two friends, Nandiya and Kimbila; SBE, xvii, p. 310. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1].
[19] Omitting repetitions.

together". There is present in me, revered sir, towards these venerable persons loving-kindness (*mettaṃ*) in my deeds (*kāya-kammaṃ*)[1] both open and unperceived, loving-kindness in my words (*vacī-kammaṃ*), loving-kindness in my thoughts (*mano-kammaṃ*), both open and unperceived. The thought comes to me, revered sir, "What now if, giving up my own wish (*sakaṃ cittaṃ*),[2] I should proceed even according to the wish of these venerable persons?" Thus, revered sir, giving up my own wish, I proceed even according to the wish of these venerable persons; we have indeed different bodies, sir, yet we have I think one mind (*cittaṃ*). . . .'[3]

§ 2. *Sutta Piṭaka, Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 21* (*Kakac-ūpama Sutta*),[4] *PTS, i, p. 127.*

. . . 'Thus indeed, mendicant brothers, must one train oneself:[5] "Our mind (*cittaṃ*)[6] shall not be perverted, nor will we utter evil speech, and we will abide steady and compassionate, with loving-kindness in our mind (*mettacittā*) and no hatred therein (*na dos-antarā*);[7] and we will abide suffusing[8] such and such a person (*puggalaṃ*) with mind full of loving-kindness, and beginning from this we will abide suffusing the whole world with mind full of loving-kindness, great, expanding, unmeasured, without enmity, without ill-will". Thus must you, mendicant brothers, train yourselves.' . . .

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Sagātha-vagga,*[9] *Kosala-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. 3*), *Sutta 4* (*Piya*). (*PTS, i, p. 71.*)

. . .[10] [2] Seated at one side[11] King (*rājā*) Pasenadi the Kosalan addressed the Blessed One thus: 'Just now, revered sir, while I was in seclusion and pondering the following reasoning arose in my mind: "Who now are friendly to themselves, and who are unfriendly to themselves?"[12] And this thought came to me—[3] They who do ill-doing (*du-ccaritaṃ*)[13] by deed,[14] ill-doing by word, ill-doing by thought, these are unfriendly to themselves. Although they should say "We are friendly to ourselves" yet they are unfriendly to themselves. Why so? That which an enemy (*a-ppiyo*) would do to an enemy that they themselves even do to themselves (*attanā va attano*);[15] therefore they are unfriendly to themselves. [4] And they who do well-doing (*su-caritaṃ*) by deed, well-doing by word, well-doing by

[1] Ap. B *b*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 n; see § 3 [3] below.
[2] Ap. E *c* i § 4; cp. § 2 below.
[3] After Anuruddha has spoken his two friends repeat his words.
[4] Discourse of the Saw-simile; delivered by Gotama in the Jetavana at Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c* § 2); on refraining from anger. Even though sawn asunder the bhikkhu should feel no anger (Int. § 109). On *upama* (simile or comparison) see Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].
[5] Ap. E *c* ii § 2.
[6] See § 1 above.
[7] Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [9].
[8] Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. Cp. Marcus Aurelius viii, 57; Int. § 114.
[9] Ap. B *a* § 1.
[10] The scene is laid in Sāvatthi in the Jetavana monastery (Ch. 14 *c* and Ch. 18 *a*), whither the Kosalan king Pasenadi comes to meet the Buddha. Int. § 169 (i).
[11] Ap. B *b* § 3 [4].
[12] Literally, To what persons is their self friendly (*piyo*), to what persons is their self unfriendly? 'Who are those who love themselves? and who do not love themselves?' (Warren, *Bm. in Tr.*, 1922, p. 213). The *attā* here is the temporary self or individuality (Cp. Ap. E *c* i).
[13] Ap. B *b* § 3 [6] n.
[14] See § 1 above.
[15] Literally, 'as self to the self', i.e. through the temporary self to the universal self in which all share. Ap. E *c* ii.

thought, these are friendly to themselves. Although they should say "We are not friendly to ourselves" yet they are friendly to themselves. Why so? That which a friend (*piyo*) would do to a friend that they themselves even do to themselves; therefore they are friendly to themselves.'[1] [5] 'Even so, great King (*mahārāja*), even so.' . . .[2]

[6] If anyone holds self (*attānaṃ*) dear let him not fetter (*saṃyuje*)[3] it with evil (*pāpena*),
For happiness (*sukhaṃ*) is not truly obtained by the evil-doer.

When a man draws near his end and he quits his human existence,
What then is his own, and what does he take as he goes?
What follows him like a shadow[4] that never falls away?

Both his virtue and his evil-doing, whatever a mortal may do here (*idha*),[5]
That indeed is his own, and that he takes as he goes.
That follows him like a shadow that never falls away.

Therefore let him do what is good (*kalyānaṃ*),[6] accumulating treasure for a future state.
Virtuous deeds (*puññāni*)[7] are the support of lives in the future world (*para-lokasmiṃ*).[8]

§ 4. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada verses.*

(5–6) Not at any time through enmity[9] (*verena*) are enmities appeased here;
But they are appeased through non-enmity (*a-verena*): this is an eternal law (*dhammo*).[10]
Others do not know that here we must restrain ourselves (*yamāmase*);[11]
But they who know this, through them quarrels are appeased.

(368) The mendicant who dwells in loving-kindness (*mettā-vihārī*),[12] happy in the Buddha's doctrine,
He may attain the path of peace (*padaṃ santaṃ*),[13] the blissful, where individuality is at rest (*saṃkhār-ūpasamaṃ*).[14]

[1] Because all are one (Ap. C *b* 10). Int. 113.
[2] Omitting repetitions.
[3] Ap. D *a* 8.
[4] Ap. E *c* ii 6 (2).
[5] Ap. E *c* ii 6 (20).
[6] Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (20).
[7] Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 9 *b* § 4; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [2]; Ch. 18 *c* §§ 1 [101], 7 [7]; Ap. A 2 *a* (13); also Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*).
[8] Ap. G 1 *b* § 2. Cp. § 7 (*kindness*) below.
[9] Ap. C *a* 2. These verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) unfortunately reduce altruism to longsighted and enlightened self-interest, thereby altogether deserting the teaching of Gotama, which in insisting upon the doctrine of Non-self dwells, as does the present prose text, upon the fundamental unity holding all together, but necessarily not upon any advantages to be derived therefrom by individuals (Ap. D; Ap. F 1 *c*). Yet even here there is no mention of rebirths, but only of the 'next world'.
[10] Int. §§ 46, 104; Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [19]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 10; also Ch. 18 *c* § 7 [7]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43]. Cp. Ch. 20 § 3 (5). These lines are found also in *Majjh.* 128 (Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [154]).
[11] Part I (title); Int. § 28. Cp. Ch. 13 *e* § 1.
[12] Ch. 22 *d* § 9 [43]; and Int. § 104. Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (4).
[13] Ch. 10 *c* (74).
[14] Ap. C *b* § 11 (285).
[15] Ap. E *a*; also Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] and Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6)

§ 5. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Iti-vuttaka,*[1] *Eka-nipāta, III, 7.*

This indeed was said by the Blessed One, said by the Saint (*arahatā*)[2]—so have I heard. '[As to] those foundations[3] [of the future] that are grounds of merit,[4] all [the rest of] these are not worth a sixteenth part[5] of love (*mettāya*) which liberates[6] the mind (*ceto-vimuttiyā*). Love which liberates the mind transcends them and shines with clear and radiant light. Just so the light of all the stars is not worth a sixteenth part of the light of the moon.[7] . . .'

§ 6. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta,*[8] *Uraga-vagga 8* (*Metta-sutta*).

(7) 'As a mother even with her life protects her child, her own and only son, so let one cultivate [a loving] heart (*mānasam*) without measure towards all living beings.

(8) Let one cultivate a loving (*mettañ-ca*) heart without measure throughout the world,[9] above, below, from side to side, unstinted, without strife (*a-veraṃ*), without rivalry. . . .[10]

§ 7. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Pañcaka-nipāta* (*the Fives*), *Sutta 44.* (*PTS, iii, p. 49.*)

[2] . . .[11] 'Who confers a kindness does a kindness[12] (*manāpaṃ*) to himself.'

c. Noble Craving or Quest;[13] *Right and Wrong Desire;*[14] *the Good*[15]

[*Note.* Though Gotama taught that selfish desire is the root of all sorrow and ill, yet he also taught that there is a 'noble craving', which leads to true joy.[16] This is the joy of those who in this life transcend selfishness.[17] All the eight divisions of the Noble Eightfold Path are but striving

[1] 'Sayings of the Buddha'; literally, 'so-said'. Ap. A 1 *a*, n.
[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.
[3] *Opadhikāni*, cp. *upadhi*; Ch. 7 *a* § 24.
[4] *Puñña-kiriya*; cp. Ap. B *a* § 6 [9].
[5] Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]. Cp. *Dhp.* 70.
[6] Ap. D *a* § 6.
[7] Cp. *Saṃ. Nik.*, iii, p. 156, v, p. 44. See Ch. 3 § 5 [167] n.
[8] Ap. A 1 *a*, n.
[9] Ap. F 2 *b* [6].
[10] Cp. Int. § 55 n; Ap. C *b* § 10.
[11] The scene is Vesāli (Ch. 12); the Buddha addresses the generous householder Ugga (Ch. 10 *c*, 66).
[12] Ch. 19 *c* § 1 [392]; Ch. 21 § 12 [48]; also Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84]; Ch. 22 *a* § 7 [35]; and Int. §§ 3 (*altruism*), 113; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13] (*another*); Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [6] (*another*); cp. § 3 [6] above (*puññāni*). 'Who gives the good shall gain the good', *Gradual Sayings*, iii, p. 42. The Sutta is scarcely a worthy setting of this line as it expatiates on the rewards and advantages received by givers. It takes an altruistic saying of the Teacher and interprets it egoistically. Incidentally it describes foods (Int. § 190), Kas i (Benares) muslins (Ap. B *a* 2 [6]), and luxurious furniture (Int. § 190), and represents Ugga as returning from the Spirit world as a *deva* (Int. §§ 35, 74) to express his satisfaction.
[13] The search to end the ego. Int. § 112. Cp. Ch. 3 § 6; Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ap. E *b*, *Note*; also Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*cessation*) n; Ch. 21 § 16 (*labour*); Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; and Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vi) n.
[14] Ch. 5 *b* § 6; Ap. D *a*.
[15] Ch. 2 § 5; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93]; Ch. 11 *a* § 1; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [11]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [32]; also Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [7] n (*Santo*); Ap. B *b* §§ 1 (*sobhāna*), 3 [6] (*a-kusala*); Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6] (*kalyāna*). Cp. Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (122, *virtue*); and Ap. D (*Evil*).
[16] Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; Ch. 12 *d* § 4; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] n; Ch. 17 *a* [4] (*dibba-sukha*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*pīti-sukha*). Cp. Ap. F 2 *b* (*muditā*).
[17] Ap. D *c* (*Arahat*).

towards this culmination through self-transcendence (*sammā-samādhi*), and the second division is expressly named Right Wish or Will.][1]

Sutta Piṭaka, Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 26 (Ariya-pariyesana Sutta). (PTS, i, pp. 161–3.)

[p. 161] . . .[2] 'There are these two quests (*pariyesana*), mendicant brothers, the noble (*ariyā*)[3] quest and the ignoble quest. And what is the ignoble quest? Here a man himself (*attanā*)[4] belonging to the system of individual existence (*jāti-dhammo*)[5] makes quest of that which too belongs to the system of individual existence; himself belonging to the system of decay[6] . . .[7] of disease . . . of death . . . of grief . . . himself belonging to the system of defilement (*saṃkilesa-dhammo*)[8] makes quest of that which . . . belongs to defilement. [p. 162] And what, mendicant brothers, should you call belonging to the system of individual-existence? Wife and child belong to the system of individual-existence, female slaves and male slaves[9] . . . sheep and goats . . . fowls and pigs . . . elephants, cattle, horses, and mares . . . gold and silver belong to the system of individual-existence. These supports (*upadhayo*)[10] belong to the system of individual-existence, and this man tied,[11] hampered, and bound by them, himself belonging to the system of individual-existence, makes quest of that which too belongs to the system of individual-existence. And what, mendicant brothers, should you call belonging to the system of decay . . . of disease . . . of death . . . of grief . . . of defilement? Wife and child . . . female slaves and male slaves . . . sheep and goats . . . fowls and pigs . . . elephants, cattle, horses, and mares . . . gold and silver.[12] . . . These supports belong to the system of defilement, and this man tied, hampered, and bound by them, himself belonging to the system of defilement, makes quest of that which too belongs to the system of defilement. This, mendicant brothers, is the ignoble quest.

And what is the noble quest? Here a man himself belonging to the system of individual-existence, having perceived the wretchedness in what belongs to the system of individual-existence, makes quest of the supreme peace of a Nirvāna (*nibbāna*)[13] not belonging to individual-existence; [p. 163] himself belonging to the system . . . of defilement, having perceived the wretchedness in . . . defilement, makes quest of the supreme peace of a Nirvāna undefiled. This, mendicant brothers, is the noble quest.

[1] Ap. F 2 *d* (*samma-saṃkappa*).
[2] The setting of this Sutta in Sāvatthi is given in Ch. 18 *b* § 5. The continuation of the present passage is the narrative of the Noble Enquiry of Gotama himself, given in Ch. 1 § 11 and in the four following chapters; see Ap. I *a* § 1.
[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].
[4] Literally, by himself (Ap. E *c* ii).
[5] Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 21 [7] n, 29 [4]; Ap. A 2 *a* (8). Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 n; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 (3) n; Ch. 21 § 16 (*vaya-dhamma*); and Part I (title) n.
[6] Or, old age.
[7] Omitting repetitions.
[8] i.e. personal desire. Ch. 1 § 11 [163]. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 7 (*āsavā*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].
[9] Int. § 190; Ch. 8 *j* § 11.
[10] Or, acquisitions. Int. § 111; Ch. 7 *a* § 8; Ch. 16 *a* § 4 [9]. Cp. Ch. 14 *a* § 5 [3] (*wives*).
[11] Cp. Ap. D *a* § 9.
[12] Ap. H 2 *b*.
[13] Ap. C *b*. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10] (*true good*).

2. The Positive Virtues[1] enumerated

[*Note.* The virtues are enumerated negatively in the threefold treatise on Moral Conduct (*Sīla*)[2] and more narrowly and technically in the Ten Prohibitions or Precepts (*dasa sikkhāpadāni*).[3] They are enumerated positively and comprehensively in the poetic list of the Ten Perfections,[4] in the beautiful and complete survey of the Brahma-vihāras,[5] in the scattered verses on the nature of the True Brāhman,[6] in the fourth Noble Truth which describes the Eightfold Path[7] to *Nibbāna*, and also in such series as the Seven Constituents of Enlightenment[8] and the Seven Treasures.[9]

The poetic enumeration of the Perfections is doubtless later than the Buddha's own times, but represents vividly the Buddhist ideal of mingled benevolence and quietude.]

a. The Ten Perfections (*Dasa Paramiyo*),[10] *Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Buddha-vaṃsa,*[11] *ii, 116–66.*[12]

116. 'Come,[13] let me search the Buddha-making things[14] (*dhamme*) this way and that, above, below, to the ten points,[15] even to the elemental foundation of things (*dhamma-dhātuyā*).'[16]

117. Then searching, I saw the first Perfection, which is Giving (*dāna-pāramiṃ*),[17] the great road trodden by former Sages.

118. 'This first do thou adopt and make secure (*daḷhaṃ*); advance to the perfection of giving, if thou wilt attain to Wisdom (*bodhiṃ*).[18]

119. As a full jar that someone overturns pours forth the water altogether and keeps back nothing in it.

120. Even so do thou on seeing suppliants, lowly or high or betwixt these, give thy giving without reserve, as a jar overturned.

[1] Ap. G 1 *c* §§ 3 n (*guṇā*), and 5 [vii] n. See Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*conduct*); Ch. 8 § 8 (*qualities*); Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]; Ch. 10 *c*, 64 (*sangaha*); Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3] (*faculties*); Ch. 20 § 2 [6] (*dhammā*); Ch. 21 § 15 n (*dhammā*); Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (122); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6); Ap. H 1 § 5; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [1]; cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1]. For an enumeration of vices see Ch. 9 *a* § 5; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [3] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424]; Ap. D *a* § 8, and Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]. For a Brāhman list of virtues see Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] (*dhamma*).
[2] Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *a*.
[3] Ap. H 2 *b*.
[4] See *a* below.
[5] See *b* below.
[6] See *c* below.
[7] See *d* below.
[8] Ap. F 1, *Note*.
[9] Ch. 14 *c* § 9.
[10] Int. §§ 31, 69; Ap. A 1 *a*, *Note* (*Jātaka*); Ap. F 2, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note*; also Ap. F 1. Cp. Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 ('*ten*'); Ap. H 4 *a* (*Sīlas*). The *pāramiyo* apparently are not mentioned in the first four Nikāyas or in *Vin. Piṭ.*
[11] Ap. A 2 *a*.
[12] These slokas are quoted as verses 125–75 in the Pāli Introduction to the *Jātaka*.
[13] The Buddha speaks of the resolution formed by him during his existence as Sumedha. Though this is not explained in the poem Sumedha might have entered Nirvāna during his lifetime (Ap. D *c*, *Arahat*) under the then Buddha, but resolved instead to become himself a Buddha and the Teacher of a future age.
[14] 'Conditions', BBS, i, p. 19.
[15] 'The four cardinal points of the compass, the four intermediate points, the zenith and nadir', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 23 (Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; Ap. F 2 *b* [6]).
[16] Ap. G 2 *a*. Cp. Ch. 4 § 10.
[17] Ap. D *a*, *Note*, and Ap. F 1 *a*.
[18] Ap. A 2 *b* (64). The Ten Perfections are not steps towards, but an analysis of, *bodhi*, which they all presuppose, but which is not defined as a whole.

121. But the things that make a Buddha (*Buddha-dhammā*) cannot be thus few; let me search the other things that make Wisdom perfect.'[1]

122. Then searching I saw the second Perfection, which is Duty (*sīla-pāramiṃ*),[2] observed and followed by former Sages.

123. 'This second do thou adopt and make secure; advance to the perfection of duty, if thou wilt attain to Wisdom.

124. As a yak-cow, when the hairs of her tail are entangled in anything, undergoes death there and will not injure her tail,

125. So also do thou fulfilling the duties (*sīlāni*) in the four stages (*catūsu bhūmīsu*)[3] ever keep thy duty, as the yak her tail.'

126. . . .[4] 127. Then searching I saw the third Perfection, which is Renunciation (*nekkhamma-pāramiṃ*),[5] observed and followed by former Sages.

128. . . .[6] 129. 'As a man in prison, long undergoing pain knows there no pleasure (*rāgaṃ*) but only looks for release,

130. So also do thou see all individual-existences (*sabba-bhave*)[7] as prisons. Turn thy face towards renunciation for the sake of liberation[8] from individual-existence.'

132. Then searching I saw the fourth Perfection, which is Insight[9] (*paññā-pāramiṃ*). . . .

134. 'As a mendicant brother begging shuns no families (*kulāni*),[10] lowly or high or betwixt these,[11] and thus receives his daily fare.

135. So also do thou at all times question wise (*buddhaṃ*) folk; advancing to the perfection of insight thou wilt attain full Wisdom (*sambodhiṃ*).'

137. Then searching I saw the fifth Perfection, which is Courage (*viriya-pāramiṃ*).[12] . . .

139. 'As the lion, king of beasts, lying, standing, walking, lacks not in courage, but is ever high-hearted,

[1] This *sloka* is repeated below as a refrain in the verses 126, 131, 136, 141, 146, 151, 156, 161.
[2] Ch. 14 *c* § 9; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]; Ap. H 4 *a*.
[3] Cp. the four Āshramas, the stages of pupil, householder, recluse, and ascetic; see Eliot, *H. and B.*, i, p. 89.
[4] As in 121 above.
[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 2 (*cāga*); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10] (*hiri*); Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4] (*surrender*); Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [43] (*control*); and Ap. D (*Egoism*). *Nekkhamma* is the opposite of *kāma*; Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vii) n.
[6] Omitting repetitions.
[7] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).
[8] Ap. D *a* § 6.
[9] Or, reason. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]; Ch. 10 *c* [1] (2); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20]; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [4]; Ch. 21 § 17 [2]; Ap. C *b* § 4; Ap. E *a* i (277); Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3; Ap. I *b* § 3. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [4] (*believing*); Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*yoga*, knowledge); Ap. H 1 § 6; Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*).
[10] Int. § 159 n; Ch. 7 *c* § 1; Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 10 *c* [1] (6); Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [2]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* § 16; Ch. 22 *b* § 12 [22]; also Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [55]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [ii. 1] (*gotta*), 15 (19), *clan*.
[11] Cp. Ch. 3 § 1 (*continuously*).
[12] Or, energy. 'Exertion', BBS; 'Courage', Warren. Literally, 'manliness'. Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [17]; Ch. 9 *a* § 8; Ch. 10 *c* (18); Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [4]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]; Ch. 20 § 4 (5); Ch. 21 § 7 [23]; Ap. F 1; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 (*fear*); Ap. D *a* § 9 (ii), *fear*.

140. So also do thou in each individual-existence (*sabba-bhave*) hold up thy courage firmly (*daḷhaṃ*); advancing to the perfection of courage thou wilt attain full Wisdom.'

142. Then searching I saw the sixth Perfection, which is Patience (*khanti-pāramiṃ*),[1] . . .

143. 'This . . . do thou adopt and make secure; then with single mind thou wilt attain full Wisdom.

144. As indeed the earth bears all that is cast upon it, both the pure and the impure, and feels neither resentment (*paṭighaṃ*)[2] nor rejoicing (*dayaṃ*),

145. So also do thou receive all favours and rebuffs.' . . .

147. Then searching I saw the seventh Perfection, which is Truth (*sacca-pāramiṃ*).[3] . . .

148. 'This . . . do thou adopt and make secure; then with single speech thou wilt attain full Wisdom.

149. As the star of healing (*osadhī*)[4] balanced in the heavenly world (*sa-devake*), in its time and season swerves not from its path,

150. So also do thou swerve not from the path of truth.' . . .

152. Then searching I saw the eighth Perfection, which is Steadfastness (*adhiṭṭhāna-pāramiṃ*).[5] . . .

153. 'This . . . do thou adopt and make secure; then unshaken thou wilt attain full Wisdom.

154. As a rocky mountain unshaken, firmly-based, quails not beneath the tempests, but abides in its own place,

155. So also be thou ever unshaken in thy steadfastness.' . . .

157. Then searching I saw the ninth Perfection, which is loving-kindness (*mettā-pāramiṃ*).[6] . . .

158. '. . . Be thou unequalled in loving-kindness if thou wilt attain to Wisdom.

159. As water fills with its coolness the good and bad alike, and cleanses them from dust and impurity,

160. So also do thou suffuse friend and foe alike with loving-kindness.' . . .

162. Then searching I saw the tenth Perfection, which is Serenity (*upekkhā-pāramiṃ*).[7] . . .

[1] Or, forbearance. Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [7]; Ch. 22 *c* § 10; and Int. § 104. Cp. *upekkhā* (verse 162 below); *passaddhi* (Ch. 9 *a* § 8); *soracca* (Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]).

[2] Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424]; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (3), *repugnance*; Ap. D *a* (ii, *ill-will*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*resistance*). Cp. Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [423] n.

[3] Or, truthfulness. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [10]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 3; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9]; and Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (4).

[4] 'The planet Venus', BBS; 'the morning star', Warren.

[5] Resolution or will. Cp. Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (vi); Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10] (*resolute*); also Ap. F 1.

[6] Ap. F 1 *b*.

[7] 'Equanimity', BBS; 'Indifference', Warren. Literally, 'looking-on', i.e. aloofness. The illustrations show that *upekkha* closely resembles *khanti* (verse 142). These two virtues are magnanimous tolerance and balance of mind rather than indifference. *Upekkha* is unshaken calmness, not apathy or impassivity. Compare the Stoic 'unperturbedness' (Int. § 101). Ch. 20 § 5 (7); Ap. F 2 *b* (*upekkhā*); cp. Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (vii), (viii).

163. 'This tenth do thou adopt and make secure; balanced, secure, thou wilt attain full Wisdom.

164. As indeed the earth, when the pure and the impure are cast upon it, looks on (*upekkhati*) them both without repugnance or complacence,

165. So also be thou ever balanced in joy and sorrow (*sukha-dukkhe*);[1] advancing to the perfection of serenity thou wilt attain full Wisdom.

166. Thus many are the things which in this world (*loke*) make Wisdom perfect; beyond these there are no others. On these stand thou secure.'

b. The Four Divine Qualities (*Brahma-vihārā*).[2]

[*Note.* In the first part of the *Tevijja Sutta*[3] the Buddha ridicules the idea of union with the God Brahmā since that deity has not been seen by anyone and is not known to anyone. Suddenly the Teacher enumerates the beautiful Brahma-vihāras or Divine Qualities. The word *brahma-vihārā* means literally not only holy states or stations but holy abiding places, and this meaning may be interpreted as signifying that the fundamental divine impersonal spirit[4] pervading and unifying all things abides especially in these beautiful unifying virtues. The suggestion may be ventured that these four 'divine' feelings can be found to be the four principal moods of music, which may be regarded as the most beautiful, because the most harmonious, expression to which the human spirit can be impelled.

The passage below sets forth the Brahma-vihāras though it does not give them that title, but calls them the *brahma-uccā-sayana*, the holy 'high-seat' or 'throne'.]

Sutta Piṭaka, Aṇguttara Nikāya, Tika-nipāta (*the Threes*), *Sutta 63.* (*PTS, i, p. 183.*)

[6] . . .[5] 'When I have returned from seeking alms and have taken my meal I go to a grove (*vanaṃ*),[6] and there I heap together grasses or leaves, such as are found there, and seat myself thereon with crossed legs, and

[1] Ap. E *b*; cp. Ap. F 2 *b* (*muditā*).

[2] Holy states or attitudes of mind. Int. §§ 32, 35 (i), 37, 44, 101; Ch. 1 § 1 n; Ch. 12 *a* §§ 4 [7] n, 7 [228] n; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 4 [2] n, 14 [4] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424] n; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] n; Ch. 23 *a* [9] n; Ap. F 2, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [78] n. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 22 [3] (*Tathāgata-vihāra*); Ch. 14 *c* § 12 [2]; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26]; and Ch. 19 *b* § 4 (*state*); also Ch. 14 *b* § 4 [3] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 14 (*vihāra*). These divine and harmonizing qualities are the bases of altruism; Int. § 25. For the meaning of *Brahma* compare *Brāhman* (Ap. F 2 *c*); also *brahmacariya* (Ch. 5 *c* § 5).

[3] Ch. 14 *d* § 6 n; Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*; Ap. D *a* § 9 (i); Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 (*Unity*).

[4] Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*).

[5] The scene of this Sutta is the Brāhman village of Venāgapura in the Kosalan country (Int. § 149; Ch. 14 *c*). Questioned as to the 'throne' or summit of his powers (*indriyāni*) Gotama replies that it is threefold, namely divine (*dibba*), holy (*brahma*), and noble (*ariya*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4). The first of these divisions comprises the four Meditations (Ch. 9); the present passage explains the second; the third is the extinction of the Three Fires (Ap. D *a* § 10). See also Ap. I *a* § 4.

[6] Int. § 125.

holding the body erect I fix my thought (*satiṃ*)[1] intently. So I stay whilst I suffuse[2] with a mind (*cetasā*) full of loving-kindness[3] one world-quarter, then a second, then a third, then the fourth.[4] Thus I stay whilst I suffuse the whole world (*lokaṃ*)[5] above, below, across, on all sides, in all completeness, with a mind full of loving-kindness . . .[6] with a mind full of pity[7] . . . with a mind full of sympathetic-joy[8] . . . with a mind full of serenity,[9] wide, extended, unmeasured, without enmity, without ill-will (*a-vyāpajjhena*).'[10]

c. The True Brāhman[11] *(holy man); caste*[12] *and real uncleanliness*

[*Note.* In the poetic use of the term Brahman, signifying 'a Brāhman indeed' or 'a true Brāhman', we see apparently the original meaning of the title, namely one who participates in the nature of the Divine One, *Brahman*,[13] not a priest of the personal God Brahmā,[14] nor necessarily a caste man. The root idea of a Brāhman caste is that of unity with and power over a fundamental impersonal force, Bráhman (Sanskrit, neuter), through spiritualistic and magical knowledge, inherited and kept strictly secret in a limited circle. Against this idea Gotama habitually protested, declaring that true priesthood or superiority lies in right thought, word, and act. Thus Gotama may safely be considered to have been familiar with the idea of an impersonal all-pervading Brahman, an All-One, a fundamental force underlying the phenomenal world, the universal soul (*Param-ātman*, *Ātman*, Sanskrit; *attan* or *atta*,[15] in Pāli) resembling and connected with the personal soul (ātman, Sanskrit; *attan* or *atta*,[16] in Pāli) of the individual, as

[1] Or, attention. See Ch. 14 *f* § 15 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [7]; also Ch. 9 *a*; Ch. 20 § 2 (7); Ap. F 2 *d* (*sammā-sati*); Ap. I *a* (*Exercises*).

[2] Ap. F 1 *b* § 2.

[3] *Mettā*; Ap. F 1 *b*. See Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [207]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [76]; also Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [7].

[4] Cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (116); and Ch. 9 *b* § 1.

[5] See Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] n. There is no trace here of the manifold worlds of Hindu and later Buddhist mythology. Int. § 70; Ap. F 1 *b* § 6 (8).

[6] Omitting repetitions.

[7] *Karuṇā*; sympathy with sorrow. Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14]. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 6 (*karuññatā*); Ch. 6 *b* § 1 (*compassion*); Ch. 13 *a* § 6 (*anukampā*); Ap. G 1 *b* § 2; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8] (*dayā*).

[8] *Muditā*; sympathy with joy. Etymologically the word may be taken to include both the meaning of 'softness' and the different though not inconsistent meaning of 'joy'. The latter idea cannot be omitted. Cp. Ap. E *b*, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *a* (165); also Ch. 20 § 5 (4).

[9] *Upekkhā*, or *upekhā*. Ch. 9 *a* §§ 8, 13 (8); Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [3] n; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 7 [2] n, 8 [7] n; Ch. 20 § 5 (7); Ap. F 2 *a* (162); Ap. H 1 § 5; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]. Cp. Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [3] n; and Ch. 5 *c* § 4 (*indifferent*).

[10] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii).

[11] Int. §§ 44, 108, 141 n, 185; also Ch. 7 *a* §§ 7, 22 [3] n; Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [1] n; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [3] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 18; Ap. A 2 *d*, n; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [53]; Ap. F 2, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [25]; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note* and § 4; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i); Ap. H 3 *a* § 2. Cp. Ch. 17 *d* § 3 [3] n; Ap. D *c* (*Arahat*); Ap. H 4 *c* (*Ascetic*); also Int. § 106 n. For the meaning of *brahmaṇa* compare *brahma-cariya* (Ch. 5 *a* § 10), and *brahma-vihārā* (Ap. F 2 *b*), and *a-brahmacariya* (Ch. 8 *d* § 5); also *brahma-deyya* (Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1]); *brahma-daṇḍa* (Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12]).

[12] Int. § 185; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17] n; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ap. H 4 *d*.

[13] Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*. Etymologically the word *brahma* means 'growth' (cp. the Greek *phusis*); Int. § 39.

[14] Ap. G 2 *b*.

[15] Nominative *attā*. Ch. 5 *c* § 2 [45]; Ap. E *c* i (*an-atta*). Cp. Sir C. Eliot, *H. and B.*, Vol. ii, pp. 311–13 and also p. 266.

[16] Ap. E *c* i § 2.

taught in the Upanishads. He met the Brāhmans' priestly claims, partly by declaring that acts, not the show of secret ritual powers,[1] constituted true unity with the One; and partly by denying the durable existence of the personal *ātman* (*atta*),[2] the basis of all pride and desire. He denounced all tampering with magical or spiritualistic jugglery.[3] Not by magic, incantations, ritual, and sacrifices, as the Vedic priesthood taught; nor by isolation and trance,[4] as the more philosophic recluses and ascetics thought; but by self-forgetfulness and the active right-doing of the Noble Eightfold Path,[5] did one transcend the narrow bounds of the ego and unite oneself in peace[6] with the All.]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada verses.*[7]

(383) Cut off the stream (*sotaṃ*)[8] resolvedly; drive away lusts (*kāme*),[9] O Brāhman;
When thou knowest the destruction of individuality[10] (*saṃkhārānaṃ*), thou knowest the uncreated (*a-kata-ññū 'si*),[11] O Brāhman.

(393) Not by matted-hair (*jatāhi*),[12] not by descent (*gottena*),[13] not by birth is one holy (*brāhmano*);
In whom there is truth and the Law (*dhammo*), he is blissful (*sukhī*)[14] and he is holy.

(394) What hast thou, unwise, from matted-hair? What hast thou from a garment of antelope-hide?[15]
Inside thee there is covetousness (*gahaṇaṃ*);[16] the outside thou makest seemly.

(414) He who passes beyond this impeding mire,[17] this wandering (*saṃsāraṃ*),[18] this delusion (*mohaṃ*),[19]
Having crossed over (*tiṇṇo*),[20] having gone over (*pāra-gato*),[21] meditative, unagitated, not doubting (*a-kathaṃ-kathī*),[22]
Not grasping (*an-upādāya*),[23] peaceful (*nibbuto*)[24]—him I call holy.

[1] Ap. D *a* 8 (ii, *sīla-bbata-paramāso*). [2] Ch. 5 *c*. [3] Ap. I *b*.
[4] Ap. I *a*. [5] Ap. F 2 *d*. [6] Ap. C *b*.
[7] Verses 383–423 constitute the *Brāhmaṇa-vagga* (section on holy-men) of the *Dhammapada*. Ap. C *a* § 2 (423); Ap. D *a* § 9 ii (397).
[8] i.e. of personal desire. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 6 [7].
[9] Ap. D *a* § 1. [10] i.e. of the sense of selfhood. Ap. E *a*.
[11] With *a-kata*, 'the uncreated', compare *a-mata*, 'the deathless' (Ap. C *b* § 11, 374); see Ap. G 2 *a* § 7. Also contrast *samudaya-dhamma*, 'originated' (Ch. 5 *c* § 7, *origin*). [12] Int. § 186 (*Jaṭilas*); see § 3 (11) below.
[13] Tribe or family. Ap. E *b* § 2; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [4].
[14] Ap. E *b*, *Note*. [15] Ch. 8 *j* § 4 n.
[16] Ap. D *a* (*grasping*). [17] Or, perhaps, less picturesquely, 'obstacle'.
[18] Ap. B (*saṃsāra*). Whatever the exact meaning of the delusion of saṃsāra in this context, it is clear that by the date of the *Dhammapada* the doctrine of repeated re-births had found a place along with self-interested notions of heaven and hell (Ap. C *a* § 2) at least in the poetic teaching of Buddhism, in spite of the fact that in the very forefront of the *Sutta Piṭaka*, in the first Discourse (Ap. E *c* i § 2), all possible kinds of belief in the survival of the personal soul (to be distinguished from the impersonal) are rejected. [19] Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).
[20] Ap. D *c* § 2; see § 3 (11) below.
[21] Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [262]; and Int. § 12.
[22] Or, questioning; Ch. 6 *a* § 7. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *vi-cikicchā*).
[23] Ch. 6 *a* § 8 [11]. [24] Ch. 2 § 2.

§ 2. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta,*[1] *Uraga-vagga 7* (*Vasala Sutta*).

(21) Not by birth[2] does one become an outcast (*vasalo*),[3] not by birth does one become a Brāhman;
By one's action (*kammanā*)[4] one becomes an outcast, by one's action one becomes a Brāhman.

§ 3. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta,*[5] *Culla-vagga 2* (*Āmagandha Sutta*).

(7) Anger, intoxication, obduracy, and obstinacy,
Deceit (*māyā*),[6] envy, and boastfulness,
Pride and arrogance,[7] fellowship with the insolent;
This is defilement (*āma-gandho*),[8] not the eating of meat.[9]

(11) Not fish or flesh, not abstinence,
Not nakedness, shaven head (*muṇḍiyaṃ*),[10] matted-hair (*jaṭā*),[11] dirt, or garments of hide;[12]
Not observance of the fire-sacrifice (*aggi-hutass'*),[13]
Or many 'immortal' penances[14] (*amarā bahū tapā*) in this world,
Charms[15] and oblations[16] (*mant-āhutī*), observance of the seasons by sacrifice—[17]
[Not these] make clean the mortal who has not passed beyond[18] doubt[19] (*a-vitiṇṇa-kaṃkhaṃ*).

d. The Fourth Noble Truth[20] *or the Noble Eightfold Path*[21]

[*Note.* It is to the Fourth Noble Truth, that of the Noble Eightfold Path or Way, that the first three Noble Truths of Gotama's teaching lead. Without this final Truth his teaching would have remained negative and passive; with it the doctrine of the first three Truths becomes positive and active.[22] Without it the doctrine would have been, what it is so often charged with being, pessimistic; with it the Dhamma still is, what so many critics are surprised to see it in practice, a religion of cheerfulness and of something more than resignation, namely courage and well-doing. The

[1] Ap. A 1 *a*, n.

[2] Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1].

[3] Literally, small, low. Int. § 185 (*sūdra*).

[4] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*kammanta*); also Ch. 14 *f* § 16 [9]; Ap. H 4 (*conduct*). Contrast Ap. B *a* (*personal karma*). Cp. § 3 (7) below (*defilement*).

[5] Ap. A 1 *a*, n.

[6] Cp. Ap. D *b*.

[7] *Ati-mana*; cp. Ap. D *a* § 8, ii (*uddhacca*).

[8] Literally, the odour of flesh. Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [1]; see § 2 (21) above (*action*). Cp. *Āsavā* (Ap. D *a* § 7); *saṃkilesa* (Ch. 1 § 11 [163] n); *rāga* (Ap. D *a* § 10, ii); *asubha* (Ch. 20 § 6 [3]).

[9] Ch. 8 *j*; and Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14] (v).

[10] Ch. 2 § 5.

[11] See § 1 (393) above.

[12] Ch. 8 *j* § 4 n.

[13] Int. § 186; Ch. 7 *a* § 8 [83]; Ap. G 1 *a* (*practices*).

[14] Ap. B *b* § 3 [5]; also Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]. Perhaps, 'penances to gain immortality'.

[15] Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]; and Int. § 176 (*Vedas*).

[16] Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24].

[17] *Yaññam-ut-upasevanā*; Ch. 11 *a* § 2 [1].

[18] See above § 1 (414), *tiṇṇa*.

[19] i.e. the dubious delusions of egoism; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii). Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 19 [4]; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii), *vi-cikicchā*.

[20] Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*.

[21] Int. §§ 5, 24, 54, 59; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17]; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 11 [5]; Ap. C *b* § 7 [i] and [ii]; Ap. F 2, *Note*; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [2] n; Ap. I, *Note*. Cp. Ap. B *c* § 5 [7] n; Ap. G 1 *a* §§ 4 [2], 8 [14]; also Ap. C *a* § 3. See Ch. 9 *a* §§ 10 n, 13, for what is plainly a commentarial expansion of the Path.

[22] Ap. F 1.

Eightfold Path is the practical way of right thought, right speech, and right act,[1] based upon the theory of the first three Truths, namely that in selfishness or individualism is the root of all sorrow and evil. Uproot selfishness and life will no longer be sorrowful, but full of gladness.[2]

The fourth Truth is the core of Gotama's teaching. The eightfold division, though it may not be scientific, is practical enough, and covers the whole duty of man, who must look at the world rightly, that is unselfishly, and train his wishes accordingly, speak and act accordingly, earn his livelihood and exert himself actively in accordance with the same principle; and finally live thoughtfully and practise a deep religious feeling, surveying worthily the underlying mystery of life.

The nature of the Way shows clearly the nature of the liberation[3] which it offers. The freedom offered was not the philosopher's or Yogi's escape from an illusory world,[4] not the ascetic's aloofness[5] from the world of labour and duty, but the plain and kindly man's emergence from the dominion of self-interest, out of which he is guided by his fellow-traveller, the mendicant-monk. From the beginning the dutiful layman and laywoman figured prominently in Gotama's following.[6] The mendicants or friars were the chosen agents for spreading the faith broadcast; the best examples of dutifulness, not a grade through which it was necessary to pass in order to obtain personal salvation.[7] It is to be noticed that the Noble Eightfold Way is not represented as leading to any personal reward. It merely leads away from selfish individualism, and only thus leaves sorrow behind. Sorrow will only be out-distanced when self is forgotten and no reward is claimed.[8]

The 'graduated discourse'[9] of the Conversion Sermons and the 'comprehensive religious discourse'[10] of the *Mahā-parinibbāna Sutta* are re-statements of the Eightfold Path. The Ten Prohibitions[11] and the Eightfold Path are respectively negative and positive developments of the first Three Truths or rather of that third Truth which requires the destruction or renunciation of egoistic desire. The Ten Fetters[12] and the Ten Perfections[13] are similarly negative and positive extensions of the same. The prefix *sammā-*,[14] attached to the title of each section of the Path, is not quite satisfactorily translated by the word 'right' which in this context has no very precise meaning. The prefix probably has much the same generally eulogistic signification as the epithet *ariya* (Noble) attached to each of the Four Truths.

Like other parts of Gotama's doctrine and practice the Eightfold Path may have been suggested to him by the teaching of his contemporaries. It is possible that the Path is an adaptation and spiritualization of an earlier Sānkhya[15] octave intended to induce trance and so to liberate the spirit from the entanglement of matter.]

[1] Int. § 8; Ap. B *b*, *Note*.
[2] Ap. E *b*, *Note*.
[3] Ap. D *a* § 6.
[4] Ap. D *b* (*Māyā*).
[5] Ch. 5 *b* § 4.
[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 11.
[7] Ap. C *b*, *Note* (*layman*).
[8] Ap. F 1 *c* (*Noble Craving*); cp. Int. § 113.
[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].
[10] Ch. 20 § 8.
[11] Ap. H 2 *b*.
[12] Ap. D *a* § 8.
[13] Ap. F 2 *a*.
[14] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 16.
[15] Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*thought*).

Sutta Piṭaka, Saṃyutta Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sacca-saṃyutta (*Saṃ. xii*), *Sutta 11.*[1]

[PTS, v, p. 421.] And, mendicant brothers, what middle road . . . leads to Peace? It is indeed this Noble Eightfold Path, namely, right outlook,[2] right wish,[3] right speech,[4] right act,[5] right self-control,[6] right self-exertion,[7] right self-knowledge,[8] right self-transcendence.[9]

1 As in Ch. 5 *b* §§ 4 and 10.

2 'Right views', SBE, xi; 'right belief', SBE, xiii; 'right views', ThB, p. 87. Cp. E *c* i § 2 n; and Ch. 7 *b* § 4 n. Contrast Ap. G 1 *b* § 3 (*diṭṭhi*).

3 'Right aspirations', SBE, xi; right aspiration', SBE, xiii; 'right intention', ThB

4 'Right speech', SBE, xi; SBE, xiii, ThB.

5 'Right conduct', SBE, xi; SBE, xiii; 'right action', ThB. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*cessation*) n, also Ch. 20 § 3 (1).

6 Or, way of living. 'Right livelihood', SBE, xi, ThB; 'right means of livelihood', SBE, xiii.

7 'Right effort', SBE, xi, ThB; 'right-endeavour', SBE, xiii.

8 'Right mindfulness', SBE, xi, ThB; 'right memory', SBE, xiii. Ch. 9 *a*; Ch. 11 *b* § 2 [10]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2] (*meditation*); Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* [1] (*satimat*), [3] (*patissati*); Ch. 20 § 4 (6); Ch. 21 § 7 [23] (*sata*); Ap. C *a* § 3; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6, *abhiññā*).

9 'Right contemplation', SBE, xi; 'right meditation', SBE, xiii; 'right concentration', ThB; 'right rapture', Rhys Davids, *Early Buddhism*. The root meaning of the word *samādhi* is 'putting together' (concentration, comprehension; perhaps union). Int. § 53; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ch. 5 *c* § 5 n; Ch. 11 *c* § 15 n; Ch. 12 *c* §§ 11 [2] n, 12 [20]; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [4]; Ch. 13 *d* § 8 n; Ch. 21 § 17 [23]: Ap. E *c* i § 8 [24] n; Ap. E *c* ii § 1 n; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3; Ap. G 2 *a*; Ap. H 1 § 6 [8]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* §§ 20 n, 24; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5]; Ch. 14 *e* § 3 n (*ñāna-dassana*); Ap. I *a* (*Meditation*); Ap. I *b* § 5 (*noble*); also Ap. B *c* § 1 (2), *vi-saṃkhāra-gata*; and Int. § 31. The aim is *nibbāna* or *yoga-khema* (Ch. 1 § 11); for merely psychic means to this end compare Ch. 3 § 4 (*attainments*), and for unethical ascetic means see Ch. 3 § 7 (*austerities*) and Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] n (*dukkara*); and for Buddha's marked condemnation of extreme means see Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] (*self-mortification*). Its nature is explained in *Majjh.* 44 (SBB, v, p. 215).

APPENDIX G

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter* 7)

THE DHAMMA[1] AND ITS BASIS

1. The Limitations of the Dhamma

a. Gotama's positivism, realism, and rationalism;[2] his purely ethical outlook;[3] his opposition to transcendental, idealistic, and metaphysical views,[4] and to formal or ritualistic practices.[5]

[*Note*. The first two extracts below[6] state emphatically the positive outlook of the Dhamma.[7] The succeeding extracts[8] declare the Buddha's marked opposition to metaphysical speculation as leading the mind into regions of unprofitable turmoil and unease, away from the essentials of religion, the cessation of desire and passion, the ethical problem of the removal of egoism. Such metaphysical subjects are the themes of the philosophic schools[9] described in the *Brahmajāla Sutta*.[10] These passages declare that the doctrine of the Noble Truths concerning the eradication of Egotism is all-important, and that its metaphysical background may be left out of account. That Gotama himself examined the background is, however, practically certain, his long course of training, previous to his enlightenment, ensures it. That background[11] is the reality of things and their fundamental unity. The refusal to enter upon metaphysical discussions implies (1) that average persons cannot reason metaphysically with any clearness or advantage; (2) that the world is what it appears to be, no illusion but real. No māyā-ist (illusionist) could have consistently refused to discuss the questions which Gotama pushed aside. The last two extracts[12] repudiate dogmatic authority and insist on self-reliant reasoning, and override the assumptions of Hindu dogmatic orthodoxy. The highest wisdom for Gotama is not mystical knowledge or supernatural acquaintance with the past or future,[13] as might sometimes be supposed from the later texts; it has nothing to do with secret knowledge or magic[14] of any kind. It is simply, as here stated, a knowledge of the Four Noble Truths, implying as

[1] Part I (title).
[2] See (iii) and (iv) below; Int. §§ 6, 35, iii, 105.
[3] Ch. 13 *c* § 29 [2] n; Ap. E *c* ii, *Note*; Ap. F.
[4] Int. § 10; IN 8 *c*; Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] n; Ap. B *c*, *Note*; Ap. D *b* (*illusion*); Ap. E *c* i, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a* (*presuppositions*).
[5] See (iv) below; Ch. 7 *a* § 8 (*sacrifice*); Ap. A 2 *d* (*practices*); Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *sīla-bbata-paramāsa*); Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 [11]; Ap. G 1 *c* § 4; Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 n. Cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 23.
[6] See (i) below.
[7] Ap. G 1 *b*.
[8] See (ii–iii) below. Cp. *Dīgha Nikāya*, *Sutta* 9, 'a discussion with Poṭṭhapāda on questions concerning the soul, which Buddha refuses to answer because they do not conduce to enlightenment and Nirvāna', ThB, p. 258.
[9] Ap. G 2 *c*.
[10] Ap. E *c* i § 2.
[11] Ap. G 2 *a*.
[12] See (iv) below.
[13] Ap. B *c* § 1 (1).
[14] Ap. I *b*.

these do the perception of the transience[1] of the ego and the error of selfishness. The attitude shown in these extracts agrees remarkably with the decisive, realistic, judicial, and serenely moderate and practical character[2] illustrated by the many rulings of the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*. From the purely ethical foundation of his beliefs there would naturally arise that toleration of other creeds which was a marked characteristic both of the Teacher and of his imperial follower Asoka.[3] All creeds which arise from the altruistic ideal must be akin.[4]

It seems altogether improbable that these passages should mean that the Buddhist must ignore all other speculative theories and accept only the belief that the uprooting of desire will lead to ultimate escape from the otherwise endless succession of rebirths,[5] by means of steadily improving stages of existence, a belief which seems to imply a fiercely tenacious egoism[6] entirely opposed to the destruction of desire. In the fourth extract Uttiya characteristically does not ask the reasons for Gotama's refusal to solve the metaphysical problems put to him, but proceeds to ask the irrelevant and futile karma-ist question whether the whole of the world, or half, or a third part, will be saved by the Law which he preaches. The Teacher naturally meets this question with silence; and here doubtless the *Sutta* should properly end. It seems justifiable to conclude from Gotama's silence his indifference to the whole theory of the salvation of the world by purification during transmigration. That he did not wish to attack it seems clear enough also from the fact that such attacks by the Teacher are not recorded, though he certainly was accused of being an *a-kiriyavādin*[7] or opponent of the doctrine of Karma. But whilst he did not accept he plainly did not desire to assail a doctrine which so strongly taught the moral responsibility of the individual.[8] The reporter or compiler who attributed this closing passage of the *Sutta* to Ānanda[9] evidently felt that Uttiya's last question was no more irrelevant than his earlier questions. But it would seem that in this he missed the point of the positive part of Gotama's answer, namely 'I reveal the Law for the removal of sorrow and the realization of Nibbāna'. The Law is the way or path to freedom. Whether all the world or only a portion of the world shall travel by it is a separate question altogether; very important doubtless to believers in the doctrine of transmigration, but of secondary importance to Gotama and to those who feel with him that the problem of life is the attainment of selflessness and the showing of the Way, so that in each generation those following it may increase in number as far as possible.[10] In the former case, those who do not follow now the right path to liberty must wander through the ages till they find it hereafter. In the second case, there is no wandering except in this life of the temporary ego, whose sorrows may be assuaged by

[1] Second Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 2).

[2] Ch. 7 *c* (final note); Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 6. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*middle road*).

[3] Ap. G 1 *c*.

[4] Int. § 117.

[5] Ap. B *a*.

[6] Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *a-rūpa-rāga*).

[7] Ap. B *b* 3 [2].

[8] Compare his reprobation of the teachings of Makkhali Gosāla (Int. §§ 42, 183).

[9] See § 4 [3] below; also IN 6 (*Canon*).

[10] Ap. B *b*.

finding and following the Path. The reason for his blank and repeated refusal to solve metaphysical questions is that whatever the answers to them the fact of sorrow remains, and sorrow arises only from selfishness and individualism, the removal of which alone is Gotama's mission. It seems quite impossible to reconcile the attitude here taken by Gotama either with the doctrine of transmigration or with the orthodox Buddhist modification of that belief.[1] In rejecting metaphysics he can scarcely have intended to advise his followers to abandon such speculations only in order to favour a similar method of his own for curtailing the fatigue of recurring existences.

With this attitude of Gotama before the great problems of metaphysics may be compared that of Marcus Aurelius,[2] who finds that whatever their solutions a man can still hold his soul firm and live the natural, that is, the social, life of duty and happiness.]

(*i*) *The Positive Scope of the Dhamma;*[3] *the four central Truths.*[4]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 29* (*Pāsādika-Suttanta*),[5] *32.*

[32] '. . .[6] "But what, friend (*āvuso*),[7] [they say,] is shown (*vyākataṃ*) by the recluse Gotama?" When this is asked, Cunda,[8] the unorthodox Wanderers should be answered thus: "This is sorrow"—this, friend, is shown[9] by the Blessed One. "This is the origination of sorrow"—this, friend, is shown by the Blessed One. "This is the cessation of sorrow"—this, friend, is shown by the Blessed One. "This is the road leading to the cessation of sorrow"—this, friend, is shown by the Blessed One.'

§ 2. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Tika-nipāta* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 88* (*Sikkhā i*).[10]

'. . .[11] And what, mendicant brothers, is the lesson of the higher knowledge[12] (*adhi-paññā-sikkhā*)? When a mendicant brother knows as it really is "This is sorrow". . . . "This is the origination of sorrow". . . . "This is the cessation of sorrow", and when he knows as it really is "This is the road leading to the cessation of sorrow"—this, mendicant brothers, is called the lesson of the higher knowledge.'

1 Int. §§ 4, 25.
2 Int. § 100; see § 3 below.
3 See *Note* above; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note*. Cp. Ap. B *b* § 3 [9] (*confident*).
4 See § 1 [32] n below; Int. §§ 24, 25 (*conduct*); Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ch. 7 *a* § 19 n; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 8; Ch. 16 *c* § 1 [2] (*path*); Ch. 21 § 18 n.
5 The scene is laid amongst the Sakyans in the mango-grove of the Sakyan Vedhañña or the Vedhaññas (cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 1, *Bhagge* and Ch. 13 *c* § 24). The Sutta gives some account of the Jain creed (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3, ii), and summarizes Gotama's Dhamma.
6 Omitting mention of the unorthodox Wanderers (*añña-titthiyā paribbājakā*). Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*, and § 3. Cp. Int. § 179.
7 Cunda the novice of Pāvā (Int. 148, i), who is Buddha's interlocutor.
8 Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [2]. Cp. *Mahā-Cunda* (Ch. 11 *c* § 6).
9 Or, explained. Ch. 4 § 17 (*Four Truths*). See § 6 [5] below; Ap. G 1 *a* (i), *Truths*; Ap. G 1 *b* §§ 4 (*path*), 5 (*path*); Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.
10 The three Disciplines or Lessons (*sikkhā*) are those of *adhi-sīla* (Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]), *adhi-citta* (Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]) and *adhi-paññā*. See § 3 (2) below.
11 Omitting the first two Disciplines.
12 Insight or reason. 'The discipline in elevated wisdom', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 330. Ch. 20 § 5; Ap. I *a*. Cp. Ch. 4 § 17 (*Four Truths*); Ch. 9 *a* §§ 9, 13 (1).

(ii) *Unanswered Questions*[1]

§ 3. *Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 63 (Cūla-Māluṇkya-sutta).*[2] *(PTS, i, pp. 426–32.)*

(1) [p. 426] Thus was it heard by me. Once the Blessed One stayed at Sāvatthi[3] in the Jeta Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's garden.[4] At that time whilst the venerable Māluṇkyāputta[5] was alone and quiet[6] a reflection arose in his mind thus: 'These theories[7] which are unexplained, set aside, and rejected by the Blessed One: "the world (*loko*)[8] is eternal[9] (*sussato*)", "the world is not eternal"; "the world is finite (*antavā*)", "the world is infinite"; "the soul (*jīvaṃ*)[10] is [the same as] the body (*sarīraṃ*)",[11] "the soul is other than the body"; "the Right-farer (*tathāgato*)[12] continues to be after death . . . does not continue . . . both continues and does not continue . . . neither continues nor does not continue to be after death (*paraṃ maranā*)":[13] these the Blessed One does not explain to me; and that the Blessed One does not explain them to me does not please me, does not seem fitting to me. . . .'[14]

(2). [p. 427] Then the venerable Māluṇkyāputta in the evening having arisen from his quiet [contemplation][15] drew near to where the Blessed

[1] See Note above. Ch. 11 *c* § 16 n; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [3]; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n; Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (v) n; Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [3] n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 3; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [32]; cp. Ch. 5 *a* §§ 2 [v. 2] (*beyond questioning*), 5 n; Ap. B *b* § 3 [9] (*undecided*). In the theory called the *dhamma-cakkhu* and in the *khandhā* and *an-attā* doctrines Gotama seems to infringe his rule of silence on metaphysical subjects. He states in the first that all things originated or caused have a cessation (Ch. 5 *c* § 7), in the second that the individual self is compounded (Ap. E *a* ii), and in the third that the individuality is not the permanent Self (Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45], Self; Ap. E *c* i). These three points amount to the dual inference that the individual self is transient and the uncaused Self endures (Ch. 7 *a* § 19 n; Ap. G 2 *a*). In any case, whatever the answers to metaphysical problems, the practical and social need of overcoming individualistic desire remains (Int. § 10).

[2] Int. §§ 84, 100. [3] Ch. 14 *a*. [4] Ch. 9 *a*.

[5] Int. § 84. The form of the name is matriarchal; cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1] (*Sāriputta*).

[6] During the period set aside daily for mental exercises. Ch. 5 *a* § 2 [v. 2]; Ch. 8 *a* [2]; Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1]; Ch. 19 *b* § 2; also Ap. I *a* (*Exercises*).

[7] Pāli *diṭṭhi-gatāni*. Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [20]; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8]; see § 4 (3) below; also Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).

[8] Or, universe. Int. § 70 (*sphere*); Ap. B *c* § 5 [5]; Ap. C *a* § 2 (178); Ap. D *b* § 6 [3]. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] n (*lok-uttara*); Ap. C *b* § 4; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*ākāsa*).

[9] See §§ 4 [1], 5 (1) below; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [5]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [i. 30]. Cp. Int. § 107 (*kappa*).

[10] See § 4 [1] below; Ch. 11 *c* § 27 n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [26]. Cp. Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*); Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9] (*satta*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [3]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*viññāna*); also Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*six views*).

[11] Cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 2 (*rūpa*); Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6] (*kāya*).

[12] Ap. A 2 *c*. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5); Ap. H 1 § 5 (*Buddhas*). If, as is possible, the word means Successor the point is peculiarly subtle: how do the Enlightened arise successively?

[13] See § 4 [1] below; Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [3]; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [32]; Ap. G 2 *a* §§ 2 [81], 3 [7]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23] and [31]. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 10 (*death*); Ch. 12 *e* § 9 [2]; Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [1] n; Ch. 13 *d* § 3 [7] n; Ap. B *b* § 1 (*māran-antika*); Ap. C *b* § 11 (174, *sagga*); Ap. E *a* (*saṃkhārā*); Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*nothingness*); also Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [2] (*jarā-maraṇa*). For the exhaustive fourfold logical formula see Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2) n.

[14] Omitting Māluṇkyāputta's decision to leave the Buddha unless satisfied on these points.

[15] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2].

One was . . . Seated at one side he spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Whilst I was alone and quiet, revered sir, a reflection arose in my mind: "Those theories which are unexplained, set aside, and rejected by the Blessed One . . .[1] if the Blessed One will not explain these to me . . . then I will abandon the discipline (*sikkhaṃ*)[2] and return to the world[3] (*hīnāy' āvattissāmi*). . . . 'If the Blessed One does not know whether the world is eternal . . . whether the world is infinite[4] . . . whether the soul is [the same as] the body . . . whether the Right-farer continues to be after death . . . [p. 428] then the only straightforward [course] for him if he is without knowledge and without vision is this, to say "I do not know, I have not the vision (*na passāmi*)".'[5]

(3). 'How now, Māluṇkyāputta, have I ever said to thee: "Come, Māluṇkyāputta, lead with me the holy life; I will explain to thee that the world is eternal . . . [or] that the world is infinite? . . .".' 'No indeed revered sir.' 'Or didst thou ever say to me: "I, revered sir, will lead the holy life with the Blessed One if the Blessed One will explain to me that the world is eternal . . . [or] that the world is finite. . . ." ' 'No indeed, revered sir.' '. . . This being so, deluded man (*mogha-purisa*),[6] whom dost thou thus denounce?[7] Whosoever, Māluṇkyāputta, should say: "I will not lead the holy life with the Blessed One until he explains to me that the world is eternal . . . [or] finite . . ." then, before this was explained by the Successor, that person (*puggalo*)[8] would perish.'

(4). [p. 429] It is as if,[9] Māluṇkyāputta, a man were wounded by an arrow thickly smeared with poison[10] and his friends and intimates, kinsmen and relatives should cause a physician and surgeon[11] to attend him; and the wounded man were to say: "I will not have this arrow extracted until I know about the man by whom I have been wounded, whether he is a Kshatriya (*khattiyo*), or a Brāhman, or a Vaisya (*vessa*), or a Sudra (*suddo*);[12] or . . . that he is so named, of such and such a family (*evam-gotto*)[13] . . . tall, or short, or betwixt these . . . black,[14] or brown or fair-skinned . . . of a certain village (*gāme*), township (*nigame*),[15] or city (*nagare*)."[16] . . . Or he were to say: "I will not have this arrow extracted until I know about the bow . . . the bow-string . . . the shaft with which I have been wounded. . . ."[17] [p. 430] Then before this was known by that man he would perish. . . .'

1 Omitting repetitions.
2 See § 2 above. 'Religious training', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 118.
3 Literally, to the low state, i.e. of a layman. Ch. 8 *l*.
4 Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92] i; Ap. E *c* i § 2 [38]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii) [16].
5 Literally, I do not see. 'I have not that insight', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 119.
6 Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [17].
7 Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5] n.
8 Ch. 10 *c* (69) n.
9 Ch. 6 *a* § 7.
10 Sorrow metaphorically is the poison; desire or selfishness, the arrow.
11 Int. § 190 (*medicine*); Ch. 8 *l* § 3 (*poison*).
12 Int. § 185.
13 Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 8 *g* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 10 [ii. 1], 15 (19); Ch. 22 *b* § 22; Ap. E *b* § 2 [5]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 1 (393).
14 *Kāla*; cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 11 [3] (*nīla*).
15 Ch. 11 *e* § 4; Ch. 15 *a* § 14; and Ch. 3 § 5 [166] (*sena-nigama*).
16 Ch. 14 *d* § 2; Ch. 20 § 11 [26]; Ch. 22 *b* § 9 [17]; Ch. 22 *c* § 3. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 15 *a* § 5.
17 Omitting a long list of unnecessary questions of detail regarding the origin, nature, shape, and construction of the weapon. Int. § 175 (*arms*).

(5). Holy-living (*brahmacariya-vāso*)[1] does not depend on the correctness of the view that the world is eternal. . . . Holy-living does not depend on the correctness of the view that the world is not eternal. Whether the view that the world is eternal is correct, or the view that the world is not eternal is correct, there yet is earthly-existence[2] (*jāti*), there is decay, there is death, there are grief, lamentation, sorrow,[3] dejection, and despair, the destruction (*nighātaṃ*)[4] of which[5] in this world (*diṭṭhe va dhamme*)[6] I make known. Holy-living does not depend on the correctness of the view that the world is finite . . . or that the soul is other than the body . . . [p. 431] or that the Successor continues to be after death. . . . Whether this view is correct, or that view . . . is correct, there yet is earthly-existence, there is decay, there is death, there are grief, lamentation, sorrow, dejection, and despair, the destruction of which in this world I make known.

(6). Accordingly, Māluṇkyāputta, bear in mind what has not been explained by me and also bear in mind what has been explained by me. And what, Māluṇkyāputta, has not been explained by me? That the world is eternal . . . that the world is finite. . . . And why is this not explained by me? Because it is without profit,[7] is not connected with the essentials of the holy-life (*n'adi-brahmacariyikaṃ*)[8] and does not lead (*na saṃvattati*)[9] to detachment (*nibbidāya*),[10] to absence of desire (*vi-rāgāya*),[11] to cessation (*nirodhāya*),[12] to tranquillity (*upasamāya*),[13] to highest knowledge (*abhiññāya*),[14] to full enlightenment (*sambodhāya*),[15] to Peace (*nibbānāya*).[16] . . .

(7). And what, Māluṇkyāputta, is shown[17] by me. "This is the origina-

1 Ch. 5 *c* § 5.

2 Or, birth. Ch. 1 § 11; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

3 Pāli *dukkha*. Ap. E *b*.

4 Cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2, *nirodha*).

5 Pāli *yesaṃ*. The antecedents plainly are the various kinds of grief, not birth, decay, and death. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7; Ap. D *a* § 4 (354).

6 Ap. C *b* § 4. 'In the present life', Warren, p. 121.

7 The Pāli word is *attha*. See § 6 [4] below; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ch. 13 *a* § 5 [9]. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5), unprofitable.

8 Ch. 5 *c* § 5. 'Nor has to do with the fundamentals of religion', Warren, p. 122.

9 Does not fit or harmonize with. See § 5 (1) below. Compare the phrase *na upeti* used in the reply to Vacchagotta (Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 2).

10 Ch. 5 *c* § 4 [46]. 'Aversion', Warren. This and the six succeeding qualities or states (cp. Ap. F 2) appear together in Ch. 3 § 5; the last four appear together in Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]. The three passages thus brought together show severally that in the Buddha's opinion enlightenment is not reached through mystical trances, or through asceticism, or through metaphysical subtleties.

11 Ch. 20 § 6 (6); Ap. C *b* § 1. Cp. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii, *rāga*); also Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1] (*app-iccha*).

12 i.e, of sorrow arising from egotistical desire. Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [411]. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7; See Int. § 25.

13 Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (368). Cp. Ap. E *b* 2 (*sukha*).

14 See § 4 [2] below. Ch. 11 *d* § 5; Ch. 12 *d* § 4; Ch. 13 *a* § 6; Ch. 20 § 10 [16]; Ch. 21 § 14 [50] n; Ap. I *a* § 5 [2]; Ap. I *b* § 3. Warren translates this as 'the supernatural faculties', but apparently without justification. The word *abhi-nna* doubtless implied the supernatural and magical to those later Buddhists who added so many unnecessary miraculous details to do fancied honour to their Master (Int. § 94). Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*dhamma-cakkhu*); Ap. A 1 *b* (9); Ap. F 2 *d* (*sammā-sati*, self-knowledge); see § 6 (3) below; Ap. H 1 § 6 (*pasāda*); Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*). Cp. also Ch. 10 *c* (29).

15 Ch. 4 § 4. The context shows clearly that this is not supernatural or metaphysical knowledge.

16 Int. 186 (*basis*); Ap. C *b*. The context shows clearly that this is not a mystic future state.

17 Ch. 4 [7] (*Four Truths*); cp. 4 [2] below.

tion of sorrow". . . . "This is the cessation of sorrow". . . .'[1] Thus spoke the Blessed One; the venerable Māluṇkyāputta, rejoicing, welcomed the word[2] of the Blessed One.

§ 4. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta* (*the Tens*), *Sutta* 95 (*Uttiya*).[3]

[1] Then Uttiya the wandering philosopher (*paribbājako*)[4] drew near to where the Blessed One was. . . .[5] Seated at one side he spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'What now, O Gotama (*bho Gotama*),[6] "the world is eternal":[7] is this true and anything else mistaken (*mogham*)?'[8] 'This has not been declared[9] by me, Uttiya: "the world is eternal, this is true and anything else mistaken."' 'What then, O Gotama, "the world is not eternal . . .?"' 'This also has not been declared by me. . . .' 'What then, O Gotama, 'the world is finite . . . [or] infinite . . . the soul[10] is [the same as] . . . [or] other than the body . . . the Successor continues to be after death . . . [or] neither continues nor does not continue to be after death":[11] is this true and anything else mistaken?' 'This also has not been declared by me, Uttiya. . . .' [2] 'What now, O Gotama, on being asked . . . thou sayest "This has not been declared by me". . . . Then what has been declared by the respected Gotama (*bhota Gotamena*)?'[12] 'I show[13] to hearers (*sāvakānaṃ*),[14] Uttiya, through a higher knowledge (*abhiññāya*)[15] the Law,[16] for the purification[17] of living-beings (*sattānaṃ*),[18] for the overcoming of griefs and lamentations, for the ending[19] of sorrow[20] and dejection, for the attainment of the Method[21] (*nāyassa*), for the realization (*sacchi-kiriyāya*)[22] of Peace.'[23]

'If then, the respected Gotama (*bhavaṃ Gotamo*),[24] by higher knowledge shows to hearers the Law . . . for the realization of Peace, will all the world (*loko*)[25] escape[26] by it or half or a third-part?' On this being said the Blessed One was silent.

[1] Omitting a statement that 'this is profitable and connected with the essentials of the holy life', the reverse of the statement regarding the 'questions'; and repetitions.

[2] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].

[3] Int. §§ 84, 100. See Ap. I *a* § 5. The scene is not indicated.

[4] Int. § 126; Ch. 8 *k* [1]; Ap. G 2 *c*.

[5] Omitting stock phrases. Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29] n.

[6] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2); Ap. H 4 *a* § 3; see [2] below.

[7] See § 3 (1) above.

[8] Ch. 7 *a* § 2[17]; , Ap. D *b* § 4.

[9] Or, explained.

[10] See § 3 (1) above.

[11] See § 3 (1) above. All the alternatives found in the Māluṅkyaputta *Sutta* are repeated here.

[12] See [1] above. The form of address is that used by an equal or superior.

[13] Cp. § 3 (7) above.

[14] Ch. 7 *a* § 16.

[15] See § 3 (6) above.

[16] IN 5 *b* (*Dhamma*). The purpose of the Dhamma is here set forth. So little does it refer to rebirth that Uttiya attempts, quite vainly, to recall the Buddha's attention to that subject (Ap. B *a*).

[17] Pāli *vi-suddhi*. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3]; Ch. 14 *a* § 7. Cp. Ap. D *b* § 3.

[18] Ch. 5 *a* § 6. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9]; and [4] (*pāna*) below.

[19] *Atthaṇ-gama;* Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7].

[20] Ap. E *b*.

[21] Or, the Way; literally, 'on-going'. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ap. C *a* § 3 [22]; also Ch. 22 *b* § 16; Ap. H 1 § 6 [7]. Cp. Ap. F 2 *d* (*Path*).

[22] Literally, 'visualisation'. Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1]; Ap. D *c* § 3 [6].

[23] Ap. C *b*.

[24] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; Ch. 20 § 11 [29].

[25] Ch. 9 *a* § 11; Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [9]. Cp. [4] below.

[26] Whether escape from rebirth or merely from sorrow is not made clear. If Uttiya is a mere sceptic, either of these meanings would suit the purpose of his question, namely to force a confession of ignorance. If the first interpretation be accepted Gotama ignores rebirth; and if the second, both Gotama and Uttiya do so.

[3] Then to the venerable Ānanda[1] this thought came: 'Let not Uttiya the Wanderer receive from this the wrong opinion (*diṭṭhi-gataṃ*):[2] "Strange indeed that the recluse Gotama, when asked a question, is overwhelmed and does not reply; it is evident that he cannot": for this would be to the disadvantage and sorrow of Uttiya the Wanderer for a long time.' Then the venerable Ānanda thus addressed Uttiya the Wanderer:

[4] 'As regards this, friend Uttiya, I will make thee a comparison; for some wise men learn by comparison[3] the meaning (*atthaṃ*)[4] of a statement. It is as if,[5] friend Uttiya, a king has a border town[6] (*nagaraṃ*), with strong foundations, walls, and gates and but one entrance. Of this there is a door-keeper, wise, sagacious, intelligent, turning back anyone not known and admitting anyone known to him; and he, going along the path encircling that town on all sides, can observe no joint or hole in the walls large enough for even a cat to get out by. Now he does not reason thus, "Just so many beings (*pāṇā*)[7] either enter or leave this town"; but his reasoning on the matter is thus, "Whatsoever beings of any considerable size either enter or leave this town, all of them enter or leave by this door". And thus, friend Uttiya, the Tathāgata's desire is not "All the world (*loko*) shall escape by this way, or half the world, or a third-part"; but he thinks regarding the matter thus: "Whatsoever persons have escaped from this world (*lokamhā*),[8] or are escaping, or shall escape, all of them, having rid[9] themselves of the five[10] hindrances (*nivarane*),[11] those passions of the mind (*cetaso upakkilese*)[12] causing weakness of understanding (*paññāya*),[13] and by means of the four meditations (*sati-paṭṭhānesu*)[14] having become firm-minded, having developed truly (*yathā bhūtaṃ*) the seven faculties (*bojjh-aṅge*)[15]—these persons have escaped from the world thus, or are escaping, or will escape". When therefore, friend Uttiya, thou askedst this question of the Blessed One, thou really askedst the [previous] question[16] in another manner. Therefore the Blessed One did not explain to thee.'

1 See Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note* above; Int. § 30; Ap. A 1 *b* (8); also Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]; Ap. B *c* § 4. The paragraphs following are given here as illustrating the way in which additions to the *Canon* probably occurred (IN 6, *Canon*). Feeling that the Buddha should not be made to seem non-plussed, a later redactor, as it would appear, has put a defence of Gotama's silence into Ānanda's mouth; as though the brilliant intellect of the Master required assistance from his good, loving, and faithful, but avowedly backward, cousin and disciple, Ānanda. Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [3] (*method*) n.

2 See § 3 (1) above.

3 Ch. 14 *e* § 3 [148]; Ap. F 1 *b* § 2 n. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 7 (*methods*).

4 Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [2]. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10.

5 Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

6 Int. § 175; Ch. 20 § 11 [26]; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2.

7 Cp. [2] (*satta*) above.

8 Cp. [2] above. The ambiguity of expression is in the original Pāli text, where *loko* (the world) is used for 'people' and *lokamhā* (from the world) for 'from this life'; cp. Ap. C *b* §§ 6, 11 (89). It is possible that 'escape from the world' means escape from worldliness, i.e. that graspingness or egoism (Ap. D) which brings sorrow.

9 Ap. I *b* § 4 [8].

10 Ap. D *a* § 9.

11 Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [6].

12 Cp. Ap. F 1 *c* [161]. Literally, 'defilements of the mind'.

13 Ap. F 2 *a* (132); Ap. I *a* § 1 [175].

14 Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1].

15 Ap. C *b* § 11 (89); Ap. F 1, *Note*. The scholastic tone of the passage seems clear.

16 Namely, 'Is the world eternal or not eternal, etc.' This is stated in the Commentary (see Andersen's *Pāli Reader*, 1910, p. 91). The word 'previous' is implied by the phrase 'in another manner'.

(iii) *Metaphysics repudiated; Realism*[1]

§ 5. *Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 72 (2nd Vacchagotta Sutta).*[2]

(1) . . . [p. 485] 'Then what danger does the respected (*bhavaṃ*) Gotama perceive in them that he thus has rejected these views[3] entirely?' 'The view that the world[4] is eternal,[5] Vaccha, is a jungle,[6] a maze (*diṭṭhi-kantāraṃ*),[7] a contortion,[8] a writhing, a fetter (*diṭṭhi-saṃyojanaṃ*),[9] and is associated with sorrow, confusion, despair, and fever,[10] and does not lead[11] to detachment, to absence of passion, to cessation,[12] to tranquillity, to highest knowledge, to full enlightenment, to Peace.

§ 5 (2). The view . . .[13] that the Successor continues to be after death [p. 486] . . . [or] neither continues nor does not continue to be after death is a jungle . . . and does not lead to Peace. Perceiving this danger in them I have thus entirely rejected these views.'

§ 5 (3). 'Has then the respected Gotama any view?' . . .

§ 6. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sacca-saṃyutta (Sam. lvi), Sutta 31 (Siṃsapā). (PTS, v, p. 437.)*

[1] Once the Blessed One stayed at Kosambi[14] in the Siṃsapā-grove (*Siṃsapā-vane*).[15] [2] Then the Blessed One took a few Siṃsapā leaves in his hand and instructed the mendicant brothers, saying: 'What think you, mendicant-brothers? Which are more—these few Siṃsapā leaves which I have taken in my hand[16] or the remaining leaves in the Siṃsapā-grove?' 'The leaves, revered sir, which the Blessed One has taken in his hand are few, and the remaining leaves in the grove are more.' [3] 'So also, mendicant brothers, the things[17] which knowingly[18] I have not announced[19] to you are more, and those which I have announced are few. [4] And why, mendicant brothers, have I not announced them? They are without profit,[20] are not connected with the essentials of the holy-life, and do not lead[21] to detachment, to absence of passion, to cessation, to tranquillity, to highest knowledge, to full enlightenment, to Peace; therefore I have not

[1] See *Note* above; Int. § 25; Ap. B *a* § 5 n; Ap. B *c* § 5 [5]; Ap. G 1 *a* (*Rationalism*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*; Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 n; Ap. I, *Note*. Cp. Ap. E *c* ii.

[2] For the first part of this Sutta see Ch. 18; for the closing portion see Ap. E *a* ii § 4.

[3] Theories or opinions.

[4] Or, universe.

[5] See § 3 (1) above.

[6] Literally, a thicket of opinions; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8].

[7] 'A wilderness', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 124. Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*.

[8] 'A puppet-show', Warren. Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (7).

[9] Ap. D *a* § 8. These theories bewilder, distort, and fatigue the mind, and unduly detain it from ethical and practical subjects; cp. Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3] (*entanglements*).

[10] Or, fretting.

[11] See § 3 (6) above; § 6 [4] below. By contrast the Dhamma possesses these qualities; Part I (title) n.

[12] i.e. of egotistical desire. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7.

[13] Omitting the series of questions as before.

[14] Int. § 143.

[15] Int. § 144; Ch. 15 *b* § 8.

[16] Cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25].

[17] Pāli *etad*, singular and collective.

[18] 'Which I know and (*was ich erkannt und*)', OB, p. 229. The Pāli word *abhiññāya* may be either a gerund 'knowing' or an ablative 'by higher knowledge', cp. § 3 (6) above. A later reporter might naturally attribute to the Master a knowledge of all mysteries, though the claim would be inconsistent in the mouth of Gotama.

[19] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4].

[20] See § 3 (6) above.

[21] See § 5 (1) above.

announced them. [5] 'And what have I announced? "This is sorrow" . . .[1] [6–7] . . .'[2]

(iv) *Rationalism*[3]

§ 7. *Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 38* (*Mahā-taṇhā-saṅkhaya-Sutta*). (*PTS, i, p. 265.*)

. . .[4] 'Would you then, mendicant brothers, thus knowing, thus seeing, say thus: "Esteemed is our teacher (*satthā*) and out of esteem for the teacher we say thus"?' 'Not so, revered sir.' . . . 'What you say, mendicant brothers, is it not what you yourselves (*sāmaṃ*)[5] know, yourselves perceive, yourselves have comprehended?' 'It is so, revered sir.' . . .

§ 8. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 13* (*Tevijja Sutta*),[6] *13–14, 25.*

. . . [13] 'What then, Vāseṭṭha,[7] those ancient seers (*isayo*)[8] of the Three-Veda (*te-vijjānaṃ*)[9] Brāhmans, the makers of verses (*mantānaṃ*),[10] the singers of verses, they whose old collected verses, chanted and sung, the Three-Veda Brāhmans now sing and recite, reciting what was recited, repeating what was repeated—namely Aṭṭhaka, Vāmaka, Vāmadeva, Vessāmitta, Yamataggi, Angirasa,[11] Bhāradvāja, Vāseṭṭha, Kassapa, and Bhagu[12]—did even they say thus: "We know, we see, where Brahmā[13] is, whence Brahmā is, whither Brahmā is [proceeding]?"' 'Not so, revered Gotama.' [14] 'Then it is thus, Vāseṭṭha, not one of the Three-Veda Brāhmans has seen with his own eyes where Brahmā is; not one teacher of the Brāhmans . . . not one teacher of a teacher[14] of the Brāhmans . . . up to the seventh generation, has seen where Brahmā is; and even the ancient seers of the Three-Veda Brāhmans, the makers of verses, the singers of verses . . . even they did not say thus: "We know, we see, where Brahmā is, whence Brahmā is, whither Brahmā is [proceeding]." These Three-Veda Brāhmans then say thus: "We show the path (*maggaṃ*)[15] to

[1] The rest of the Four Noble Truths follow. See § 1 [32] above.

[2] Omitting repetitions.

[3] Ap. G 1 *a* (*Rationalism; Practices*); see *Note* above. Cp. Ch. 5 *a* § 10; Ch. 5 *c* § 8 [32]; Ap. B *a* § 6 [7]; Ap. B *c* § 5 [6]; Ap. E *c* ii; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3 (*paññā*); Ap. I, *Note* (*mysticism*); Ap. I *b* (*Mysticism*).

[4] The scene is laid at Sāvatthi in the Jetavana monastery (Ch. 18). The Buddha addresses the brethren on the heretical view of the monk Sāti who holds that consciousness (*viññāna*; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7]) transmigrates (*saṃsarati*; Ap. B; Ap. G 1 *b, Note*). The discourse includes a recapitulation of the *Paṭicca-samuppāda* (Ap. B *c*) which at least in its present metaphysical and dogmatic form must be an interpolation.

[5] Ap. G 2 *a, Note.* Cp. *sayaṃ* (Ap. E *c* ii § 1).

[6] Int. §§ 35 (i), 37; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5] n; Ch. 14 *d* § 6; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i).

[7] Gotama addresses the two young Brāhmans Vāseṭṭha and Bhāradvāja; Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1]. Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4]; Ch. 22 *b* § 10 [19].

[8] 'Rishis', SBE, xi, p. 172. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12]; cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 8. See Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [200] n.

[9] Int. §§ 44, 176; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 14 *f* § 7 n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1; Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 n. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 13 [1] n. See also Int. § 185 (*Brāhmans*).

[10] Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [24]; Ap. F 2 *c* § 3 [11].

[11] Ch. 13 *c* § 9 (534) n.

[12] Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 10 [155] n.

[13] Int. § 93 (ii); Ap. H 3 *a* § 2. Cp. Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; and Ap. E *c* i § 9, last verse.

[14] Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199]; Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23].

[15] Cp. Ap. F 2 *d*.

union (*sahavyatāya*)[1] with one whom[2] we do not know, one whom we have not seen...." Now what thinkest thou, Vāseṭṭha? This being so does not the talk of the Three-Veda Brāhmans become pointless?'[3] 'Yes indeed, revered Gotama....'[4]

[25] 'Even thus, Vāseṭṭha, the Three-Veda Brāhmans, rejecting the things (*dhammā*)[5] which make a Brāhman,[6] and taking up the things which make a non-Brāhman, say thus: "Indra[7] we invoke, Soma[8] ... Varuna ... Isāna ... Pajāpati ... Brahmā[9] we invoke, Mahiddhi ... Yama we invoke".[10] ...'

b. Essentials of the Dhamma[11]

[*Note*. Of the enthusiasm aroused by Gotama's teaching there is abundant evidence.[12] The message must have been new and of a singularly lofty nature. The doctrine of *saṃsāra*[13] was not new; similarly the theory of a gradual escape from the pains of *saṃsāra* through Karma[14] is old, and it has always aroused patient endurance rather than enthusiasm. The novelty lay in the sense of sudden escape through the doctrine of Non-Ego,[15] or realization of the transience of the individual ego; but this in itself would have been in no sense lofty, and little liable to arouse moral enthusiasm, without its correlative, the doctrine of altruism, self-sacrifice, and service[16] implied in the Eightfold Way,[17] as that of Non-Ego is in the first three of the Noble Truths. Whatever view of the nature of Buddha's doctrine be taken, it must be sufficient to account for the enthusiastic reception which quickly gave it religious pre-eminence in India. It is not sufficient to attribute to it mere re-arrangement of the subtleties of Hindu metaphysics, for these do not supply the necessary moral vigour to account for its rapid growth.

In many passages[18] in the Suttas Gotama declares that his essential message is the four Truths. In some of the following extracts the theme is stated somewhat more fully, but the basis of these amplifications remains always the Truth of the sorrowfulness of individuality, the Truth of the origin of that sorrow in individualistic craving, the Truth of the cessation

1 Ch. 11 *f* § 2 [3] n; Ch. 17 *a* [4] n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4]; Ap. I *a* (*Trance*).

2 'What', SBE, xi, p. 173. It is the personification of the divine (Brahmā) to which Gotama objects. He himself proceeds immediately to teach the way to union with the impersonal Brahman (Int. § 35, i; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note*, *unity*) or Fundamental Harmony. Cp. Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [84] n.

3 'Foolish', SBE, xi.

4 Omitting repetitions and illustrations.

5 'Qualities', SBE, xi, p. 180. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].

6 Or, holy man. Ap. F 2 *c*.

7 Int. § 93 (iii). On the names of gods see Ap. G 2 *b* § 2.

8 It is more probable that the Indian Dionysos and Herakles of Megasthenes are identifiable with Soma and Indra respectively than as Eliot suggests (*H. and B.*, Vol. ii, pp. 137–8) with Vishnu and Siva.

9 Int. § 93 (ii).

10 Death personified; Int. § 70 (*spheres*) n. Cp. Ap. G 2 *b* (*Māra*).

11 Law or System. Int. §§ 11, 29, 35 (iii); IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*); Ch. 4 § 18 (*principle*); Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [9]; Ch. 12 *c*
Ch. 5 *a* § 5 n; Ch. 8 *b* § 1; Ch. 9 *a*, n; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] n; Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3] n;
§ 8 [3] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 1 [4]; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 8 [1] n, 14 [91], 18; Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vii] n;
Ch. 22 *b* § 15; Ap. C *b* §§ 5, 10 [2] (*fundamental*); Ap. D *a* § 2; Ap. H 4 *a* §§ 1 [3] n
Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*; Ap. H 1 § 6 [9]. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 2 (*faith*); also Ch. 14 *c* § 8 [2] n (*sad-*
(*paññā*), 2 n (*sammā-diṭṭhi*); and Int. § 9 (*revolt*); § 6 [10] (*sad-attha*).
dhamma) n; Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3] (*anudhamma*); Ch. 18 *b*; Ch. 22 *a*.

12 Ch. 6 *a* § 7 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [8]; Ch. 9 *a*; Ch. 18 *b*; Ch. 22 *a*.

13 Ap. G 1 *a* § 7 n.

14 Int. § 4.

15 Ap. E *c* i.

16 Ap. F 1.

17 Ap. F 2 *d*.

18 Ch. 22 *a*; Ap. G 1 *a* (i).

of craving and of sorrow, and the Truth of the way to that cessation. In the fourth passage below, quoted from the *Mahā-parinibbāna-Sutta*, the Buddha is represented as answering his own question 'What is the Dhamma?' All the points mentioned in his answer are explained in the long summary of the Dhamma called the *Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-Sutta*,[1] except the four 'efforts',[2] the four roads to *iddhi* (power) and the five 'moral forces'. As regards the four roads to *iddhi* (*iddhi-pādā*),[3] these are merely concentration (1) of purpose, (2) of energy, (3) of mind, (4) of thought. And the five 'moral forces' (*balāni* or *indriyāni*)[4] are (1) faith (*saddhā*),[5] (2) energy (*viriya*), (3) recollection (*sati*), (4) contemplation (*samādhi*), (5) intuition (*paññā*), three of which are also included in the next group, the seven 'parts of wisdom (*bojjh-aṅga*)'.[6] Thus, apart from the possibly, but not necessarily, mystical meaning of *iddhi*, the 'Law' resolves itself into first, meditation on, or realization of, the transient nature of the body, sensations and mind, and of the conditions of existence, and last, the eightfold path of duty, the intermediate points being merely links between the two. Nothing is said here of the doctrine of rebirth.[7]

In the first passage[8] below, quoted from the *Culla-vagga* of the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, the Buddha is represented as declaring that the one savour of the Law is 'liberation', that is the peace of liberation[9] from egoistic desire. Such liberation is the Buddha's Nirvāna,[10] which is thus the very centre of the teaching of Gotama; but this Nirvāna is the present peace of self-forgetful activity, not the attainment of an individual advantage hereafter. With this Nirvāna the four beautiful divine virtues (*Brahma-vihārā*)[11] of Love, Pity, Sympathy, and Serenity fully accord, as being themselves various aspects of one harmonious end, and not mere means to personal gain. The Eightfold Path is directed to the attainment of nibbāna,[12] and the Ordination formula promises the complete end of sorrow.[13] The end of sorrow is *nibbāna* in this life, the state in which one no longer thinks "Such an one is superior to me".[14] The enthusiasm with which the teaching of Gotama was early received was due evidently not to its adoption of the ancient and sorrowful doctrine of rebirth, but to its offering an immediate escape from that sad and egotistical process. Doubtless the Buddha's present Nirvāna was often popularly mistaken for an immediate heaven,[15] self-interest thus creeping back.]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga IX, i, 4.*[16]

'As the great ocean,[17] mendicant brothers, has a single savour, the savour of salt, so also, mendicant brothers, this Law and discipline (*dhamma-vinayo*)[18] have a single savour, the savour of liberation.'[19]

[1] Ch. 9 *a*; Ch. 15.
[2] See §§ 4, 5, below.
[3] Ap. I *b* § 6 [22]; cp. Ap. I, *Note*. See § 4 below.
[4] See *Dīgha Nik.*, iii, p. 77, and *Saṃ. Nik.*, v, p. 219. Cp. Int. § 25 (*responsibility*).
[5] Ch. 10 *c* (21); Ch. 11 *f* § 6 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [5].
[6] Ch. 9 *a* § 8. See RDB, p. 173.
[7] IN 2; see § 6 n below.
[8] See § 1 below.
[9] Ap. D *a* § 6.
[10] Ap. C *b* § 4.
[11] Ap. F 2 *b*.
[12] Int. § 44; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].
[13] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.
[14] Ap. C *b* § 10.
[15] Int. §§ 12, 48; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.
[16] Ap. C *b* § 3; Ap. D *c* § 4; Ap. H 4 *d*. Buddha addresses his followers in the Eastern Monastery at Sāvatthi (Ch. 18 *b*).
[17] The Ocean and five great rivers are frequently mentioned in the *Canon*. The rivers are not those of the Panjāb. Int. §§ 155 n, 158. Cp. Ap. B *a* § 3 [3].
[18] Ch. 6 *a* § 13.
[19] Pāli *vimutti*. See *Note* above.

§ 2. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 14 (Mahāpadāna Suttanta)*[1] ii, *14–15*.

[14] 'Then Prince Vipassin driving to his park saw an "anchorite" (*pabbajitaṃ*)[2] with shaven head and yellow robes. . . . Then, mendicant brothers, Prince Vipassin spoke thus to the "anchorite": "What then, sir, doest thou? Thy head is not as others, thy garments are not as others." "I, lord, am an 'anchorite'." "Why then sir, art thou an 'anchorite'?" "I indeed, lord, am an 'anchorite' [for this reason]—excellent is life under the Law,[3] excellent is the tranquil[4] life . . . good action . . . virtuous[5] action . . . harmlessness[6] . . .[7] compassion[8] for living beings." [15] . . . Then Prince Vipassin having shaved off his hair and beard and assumed the yellow robes[9] went forth from the household to the homeless life.'

§ 3. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 16 (MPS) i, 12.*[10]

The Blessed One staying at Rājagaha on the Vulture Peak delivered that full[11] religious (*dhammiṃ*) discourse[12] to the mendicant brothers, thus: 'Such is virtuous conduct (*sīlaṃ*),[13] such is self-transcendence (*samādhi*),[14] such is reason (*paññā*).[15] When infused by[16] virtuous conduct self-transcendence is most fruitful, most commendable; when infused by self-transcendence reason is most fruitful, most commendable. The mind (*cittaṃ*)[17] infused by reason is completely liberated from the passions[18] (*āsavehi*), that is to say from the passion of lust,[19] from the passion of individual-existence,[20] from the passion of wrong-outlook,[21] from the passion of ignorance.'[22]

1 Ap. B *c* § 3. The *Great Apadāna* (Tradition) Discourse. The scene is laid in the Jetavana at Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *c* § 2). The Sutta narrates the lives of the six Buddhas immediately preceding Gotama, and especially the life of Vipassin, the first of these (Ap. A 2 *c*). The account of the early life of Gotama in the *Jātaka* Introduction and that of the *Mahā-vagga* introduction are largely based upon this legend of Vipassin: Ch. 1 §§ 1 n, 4 n, 6, 8, 9; Ch. 4 § 10 n; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 2, 5, 7 n; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 2, 4; Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [6] n; Ap. I *b* § 3 (*re-birth*). See IN 6 (*Canon*).

2 Literally, 'forth-goer'. Ch. 1 § 9.

3 The Buddhist Law is here anticipated and the Buddhist ideal of life summarized.

4 Pāli *sama*, as prefix. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].

5 Pāli *puññā*, as prefix. Ap. F 1 *b* § 3 [6].

6 Pāli *avihiṃsā*. Int. § 49; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.

7 Omitting repetition.

8 Pāli *anu-kampā*. Int. § 3 (*altruism*); Ch. 6 *b* § 1. Cp. Ap. F 2 *b* (*karuṇā*); Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [vii].

9 Ch. 6 *a* § 13.

10 As in Ch. 12 *c* § 12, and Ch. 20 § 8. See Int. § 53.

11 'Comprehensive', SBE, xi, p. 11.

12 Int. § 53. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 12 *e* § 7 [2]. See IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

13 Ch. 21 § 17 [2]; Ap. F 1, *Note*. Cp. the list of essentials in Ch. 19 *a* § 1 [7].

14 'Earnest contemplation', SBE. Ap. F 2 *d*; also Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [5] n; and Ch. 13 *d* 8 n.

15 Insight, comprehension. Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [7]; Ch. 14 *c* § 9; Ap. F 2 *a* (132); Ap. G 1 *a* (iv). Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 13 [1] n; Ch. 21 § 3 [13] (*sampajāna*).

16 'Set round with', SBE.

17 Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7].

18 Or, taints; 'evils', SBE; Ap. D *a* § 7.

19 Pāli *kāma*.

20 Pāli *bhava*. 'Individuality', SBE.

21 Or, views. Pāli *diṭṭhi*. Contrast Ap. F 2 *d* (*right outlook*).

22 Pāli *avijjā*.

§ 4. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 16 (MPS), III, 50.*[1]

'Which then, mendicant brothers, are the laws (*dhammā*)[2] that I have learnt and shown? . . .[3] They are these: the four earnest-meditations (*sati-paṭṭhāna*),[4] the four right-efforts (*samma-ppadhānā*),[5] the four roads to mental-power (*iddhi-pādā*),[6] the five moral-faculties (*indriyāni*),[7] the five moral-forces (*balāni*),[8] the seven parts of wisdom (*bojjh-aṅga*),[9] the Noble Eightfold Path.'[10]

§ 5. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Khandha-saṃyutta (Ṣaṃ. xxii), Sutta 101 [5–6].*[11] *(PTS, iii, p. 153.)*

[5] 'In a mendicant brother who continually neglects to apply himself to spiritual-development[12] although a wish may thus arise: "Would indeed that my mind (*cittaṃ*), were without grasping (*an-upādāya*)[13] and liberated[14] from the passions[15] (*āsavehi*)", but his mind nonetheless grasping is not liberated from the taints. [6] Then what is the cause of this? It must be said to be his lack of spiritual-development. His lack of spiritual-development in what? Lack of spiritual-development in the four earnest-meditations,[16] the four right-efforts,[17] the four roads to mental-power,[18] the five spiritual-organs,[19] the five moral-forces,[20] the seven parts of wisdom,[21] the Noble Eightfold Path.'[22]

[1] Numbered iii, 65 in SBE xi, p. 60. The passage contains 'the thirty-seven points (afterwards called the Bodhi-pakkhiya-dhammā) in which the Buddha, just before his death, summed up his teaching', SBB, iii, p. 347, note by Rhys Davids.

[2] 'Truths', SBE. See Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. Cp. Part I (title) n; Ch. 9 *a* § 5; Ch. 14 *d* § 8 [5]; Ch. 22 *b* § 13 [23]. Compare the Great Questions in Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [2].

[3] As in Ch. 21 § 15. The full passage appears also in *Dīgha Nik.*, *Sutta* 29 (Ch. 13 *c* § 24 n), and in *Majjh. Nik.*, *Suttas* 103 and 104 (Ch. 13 *c* § 25 n).

[4] Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1] (*body, &c.*); and Ch. 13 *a* § 6; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [6]; Ch. 21 § 15 (1); cp. § 6 below (*insights*).

[5] See *Note* above; Ch. 21 § 15 (2); cp. Ch. 3 § 6. See *Dīgha Nik.*, *Sutta* 33 (PTS, iii, p. 225).

[6] Purpose, energy, mind, and investigation, *Dīgha* 18 (PTS, ii, p. 213). See § 6 below (*Paths*); Ch. 21 § 15 (3); Ap. H 1 § 5; Ap. I *b* § 6.

[7] Ch. 3 § 5 [164] n; Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [17]; Ch. 13 *a* § 9 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7]; Ch. 21 § 15 (4). Cp. Ch. 10 *c* (43); Ch. 13 *e* § 2 [1]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 18 [2], 19 [3]; Ap. E *c* ii § 2. See RDB, p. 173. The *indriyāni* are the same as the balāni, see *Saṃ. Nik., Mahā-vagga, Saṃyutta iv, Sutta* 43 (PTS, v, p. 219).

[8] Faith, energy, recollection, and intuition or reason (*Saṃ. Nik.*, PTS, v, p. 219); see Ch. 18 *a* § 2. 'Moral powers', SBE, Ch. 21 § 15 (5). Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 (*five qualities*); Ch. 10 *a* § 2 (*dasa-bala*); Ch. 20 § 10 [17] n (*dubbalī*).

[9] Ch. 9 *a* § 8; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7]; Ch. 20 § 5 (1); Ap. G 2 *a* § 9. See § 5 below. The 46th division of *Saṃ. Nik.* is called *Bojjhanga-Saṃyutta.*

[10] Ap. G 1 *a* § 1; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*; and Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7]. The Eightfold Path here appears as the central and representative Truth (Ap. F 2 *d*, *Path*).

[11] The scene is laid at Sāvatthi. Ch. 14 *c*.

[12] Pāli *bhāvanā*. 'Self-training', Mrs Rhys Davids, *Kindred Sayings*, iii, p. 129. Ap. E *c* ii; Ap. I *a* (*Meditation*) n.

[13] Ch. 5 *c* § 10.

[14] 'Were freed without grasping', Mrs. Rhys Davids.

[15] Or, taints; the vices of egoism. Ap. D *a* § 7. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* §§ 2 n, 4 n.

[16] Ch. 9 *a*.

[17] See *Note* above; Ch. 21 § 15 (1).

[18] 'Ways of Will-Power', Mrs. Rhys Davids.

[19] 'Controlling-faculties', Mrs. Rhys Davids. Ch. 13 *a* § 6.

[20] 'Powers', Mrs. Rhys Davids.

[21] See § 4 above. For *aṅga* (parts) see Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [3] (*points*); Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 (*ten qualities*).

[22] Ap. G 1 *a* § 1.

§ 6. *An-āgata-Vaṃsa (Chronicle of Future Events). Journal of the PTS (1886), 33 ff.*[1]

'Disappearance of the [Buddhist] method:[2] My disciples being unable to realize the trances,[3] the insights,[4] the Paths,[5] and the Fruits,[6] will keep only the four purities[7] of conduct. Then as time goes on they will keep only the commandments forbidding the four deadly sins.[8] As long as there are a hundred or a thousand priests who keep the commandments forbidding the four deadly sins the disappearance of the method will not have occurred. But when the last priest shall break the precepts, or shall die, the method will have disappeared. This, O Sāriputta,[9] is the disappearance of the method'.

c. The Dhamma as summarized in the Edicts of the Emperor Asoka[10]

[*Note.* An examination of the Edicts of the famous Buddhist emperor Asoka, issued about two and a half centuries after the closing years of Gotama's ministry, seems to bear out the contention that the ethics of the Truths[11] and the Way[12] are the sole essentials of the Dhamma. Though the Four Truths are not specifically mentioned they are implicitly referred to throughout the Edicts, which breathe a spirit of active altruism and self-control. 'The welfare of all folk is what I must work for', writes that pious monarch, 'and the root of that, again, is in effort and the dispatch of business.'[13] ' "The Law of Piety is excellent" ', he quotes, and then proceeds to summarize the Law: 'but wherein consists the Law of Piety? In these things, to wit, little impiety,[14] many good deeds, compassion, liberality, truthfulness, and purity.'[15] He enjoins his officers 'to give instruction in the Law of Piety, to wit: "A meritorious thing is the hearkening to father and mother;[16] a meritorious thing is liberality to friends, acquaintances, relatives, Brāhmans,[17] and ascetics; a meritorious thing is abstention

1 Cited from Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), pp. 482–3.

2 The *Anāgata-Vaṃsa* (Ap. A 1 *a*), from which the present passage is taken, contains a narrative of a prophecy, attributed to Gotama, on the gradual decline of the religion (cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [6] n). It is uncanonical but of early date (cp. IN 6, *Canon*). The discourse is supposed to have been delivered at Kapilavatthu in the Banyan Grove (Int. § 136) on the banks of the Rohini river. The passage indicates the points which were considered as the essentials without which the Dhamma would cease to exist. It is noticeable that there is still no mention of the doctrine of rebirth (see *Note* above) unless this be found in the 'Fruits' (Ap. D *c* § 4; cp. Ap. E *c* i § 9), or of anything mystical, unless this be read into the 'Trances' (Ap. I *a*). Insight, the 'paths', and purity of conduct, are set forth as the bases of Gotama's religion. Ap. H 1 § 6 [7].

3 Ap. 1 *a*.

4 Cp. § 3 above (*paññā*).

5 See § 4 above (*iddhi-pādā*).

6 Ap. D *c* § 4.

7 Purity (*suddhi*) in teaching (*desanā*), in restraint (*saṃvara*), in seeking (*pariyeṭṭhi*) and in reflection (*paccavekkhaṇa*); see *Vi-suddhi-magga* 43 (Rhys Davids's *Pāli Dict.*).

8 As laid down in the first four *Sīlāni* or Precepts (Ch. 8 *b* § 6, the four Pārājakas; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 the first four *sikkhā-pādāni*).

9 Ch. 7 *a* § 18.

10 Int. §§ 12, 21, 118; IN 5 *a*; Ch. 10 *b* § 2 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 16; Ch. 15 *a* § 1 [36] n: Ch. 17 *a* [4] n; Ch. 17 *e*, n; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1 (i) n; Ap. H 2, *Note*.

11 Ap. G 1 *a* § 1.

12 Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.

13 Rock Edict VI (V. A. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 164; cp. 3rd ed., p. 172).

14 i.e. the minimum of sinfulness (or selfish desire). The Māgadhi *āsinave* are the Pāli *āsavā* (taints; Ap. D *a* § 7; Ap. G 1 *b* § 3); see RDBI, p. 296 n.

15 Pillar Edict II (V. A. Smith, 2nd ed., p. 183; 3rd ed., p. 200).

16 Ch. 9 *b* § 3; see § 5 [viii] below.

17 More properly 'holy men' (Ap. F 2 *c*).

from the slaughter of living creatures;[1] a meritorious thing is small expense and small accumulation." '[2] And similarly he writes that upon persons of various denominations, or householders is laid 'this duty of hearkening to superiors, hearkening to father and mother, hearkening to teachers, and proper treatment of friends, acquaintances, comrades, relatives, slaves, and servants, with fidelity of attachment.'[3] The Emperor, according to the usual but not necessarily correct rendering of the Edicts looks to 'the next (or other) world' and to 'heaven'.[4] 'Whatsoever exertions I make', he announces,[5] 'are for the end that I may discharge my debt to animate beings, and that while in this world I make some persons happy, they may win heaven in the world beyond.'[6] 'The Ceremonial[7] of Piety [the Dhamma]', he declares, 'is not temporal; because even if it fails to attain the desired end in this world,[8] it certainly produces endless merit in the world beyond.[9] If it happens to attain the desired end here, then both gains are assured, namely, in this world the desired end, and in the world beyond endless merit is produced by that Ceremonial[10] of Piety.'[11] Thus, according to this interpretation, Asoka is not able to dispense with religious sanctions, and heaven and the next world are held forth as rewards for right conduct here; but no mention whatever of transmigration[12] is made in the Edicts. It may be that the present peace of the Nibbāna of Gotama's teaching, in the two and a half centuries which elapsed between his ministry and the period of the Edicts, had become the more easily comprehended and popular future 'Heaven' to his imperial follower,[13] and was to be lost, at some later period, in that anxious succession of past and future states preliminary to total extinction, which constitutes the main feature of ancient and modern Hindu belief.[14] The doctrine of rebirth or personal Karma, already common in Indian thought, thus apparently was introduced into Buddhism subsequently to the period of Asoka's Edicts, since the pious Emperor ignores it, whereas 'heaven' (*svarga*, *sagga*, *svaga*) is mentioned some seven times and 'this side and the other side' or similar terms are used some sixteen times in the surviving inscriptions.

[1] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (1); Ch. 8 *j* § 7; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2; see §§ 3, 4, 6, below.
[2] Rock Edict III (V. A. Smith, 2nd ed., p. 158; cp. 3rd ed., p. 163); see § 5 [viii] below. Cp. *Siṅgālovāda-sutta* (Int. § 53).
[3] Rock Edict XIII (V. A. Smith, 2nd ed., p. 172; cp. 3rd ed., p. 185).
[4] Int § 33; Ch. 13 *b* § 5 [1] n; Ch. 13 *d* § 8 n. All depends on the proper translation of *sagga* and of *idha* (*hida*) and *paratrā* (*palata*). *Sagga* may mean not a future heaven but the present peace of Nibbāna in this life (Ap. C *b*; see §§ 2, 7, below; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3]). *Idha* and *paratrā* (Ap. E *c* ii § 6, 20) may mean not 'this side and the other side' of death, but 'this side and the other side' of that stream which is reached by the *sota-panna* at the time of conversion (Int. § 12; Ch. 14 *b* § 8 [2] n; Ap. C *b* § 11 (370); Ap. D *c*, *stages*; cp. *orimaṃ tīraṃ* and *pārimaṃ tīraṃ*, in Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210]; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3; and Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [3]. This rendering has the advantage of presenting the Emperor to his subjects as a sagacious practical ruler rather than as a pious zealot. No mention of a correlative hell is made.
[5] Rock Edict VI (V. A. Smith, 2nd ed., p. 164; cp. 3rd ed., p. 172; see § 7 below).
[6] Or, after conversion.
[7] Or, observance.
[8] Or, in n[illegible]lane affairs, in the outer world.
[9] Or, in the inner world, i.e. after conversion.
[10] Observance.
[11] Rock Edict IX (V. A. Smith, 2nd ed., p. 167; cp. 3rd ed., p. 178); see § 4 below.
[12] Int. § 4.
[13] Meanwhile the opposite and more philosophical Mahāyāna movement (Int. § 21) arose as a new effort to transcend individualism and insisted not merely that individuality was transient but that the whole world was a figment. Int. §§ 11, 48 n (*Heaven*).
[14] Int. § 48 n.

Besides the schisms created by Devadatta[1] and the Six Buddhist Dissentients (the *Cha-bbaggiyā*)[2] constantly mentioned in the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* there doubtless arose various sects in the Buddhist Church within the two hundred and fifty years immediately succeeding Gotama's death. To some of these allusion is made in Asoka's Sārnāth Edict.[3] But there seems little reason to doubt that the main teachings of the Buddha still dominated the Church and are represented adequately by the Dhamma of Asoka. The *Kathā-vatthu*,[4] the fifth book of the *Abhidhamma-Piṭaka*, which is traditionally but doubtfully[5] stated to have been composed by Tissa Moggali-putta in Asoka's reign, sets forth the controversial questions which early arose.

That the Emperor summoned a Buddhist Council[6] to settle the Canonical texts before sending forth his religious missions, mentioned in Rock Edict XIII,[7] seems more than likely. The circumstances indeed almost necessitated this measure. But it may well have been an informal affair since the Edicts say nothing on the subject. It is difficult to avoid feeling that the Pāli Canon[8] as known to us, though it probably includes the Canon of Asoka's time, comprises much more and was brought together as a whole at a later period, and further that the first four Nikāyas, and even the older Suttas included in them, contain much added matter, though some less than others. The texts mentioned by the Emperor as pre-eminent passages[9] are doubtless included in the Canon as we know it, but probably imbedded in later accretions.

Vincent Smith's translation of the Edicts (third edition, 1920) is here used. Different renderings have been suggested in footnotes. The original texts, as found in all the different versions of the rock and pillar inscriptions hitherto discovered, are collected and edited, with an English translation, in Hultzsch's learned edition, published by the Government of India in 1925. The texts transliterated in Roman characters are collated and a Glossary of all words used is given in A. C. Woolner's *Asoka*, 1924.]

§ 1. *The Bhābrā Edict.*[10]

His Grace the King of Magadha[11] addresses the Church[12] with greetings and bids its members prosperity and good health.[13]

1 IN 7.

2 Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*dissentients*).

3 Minor Pillar Edict I (V. A. Smith, 2nd ed., p. 195; cp. 3rd ed., p. 215). For the Buddhist sects of this early period see Eliot, *H and B.*, i. 259 ff. See Int. § 87.

4 '*Points of Controversy*', translated by S. Z. Aung and Mrs. Rhys Davids. Ap. A 1 *a* (*Abhidhamma-Piṭaka*).

5 Keith, *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 18.

6 Int. § 56. See Eliot, *H. and B.*, i, pp. 270–1; Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, pp. 18–19.

7 V. A. Smith, 2nd ed., p. 174; cp. 3rd ed., p. 186.

8 Int. § 21.

9 Bhābrā Edict; see § 1 below. For identifications of these texts see V. A. Smith, *Asoka* (3rd ed.), pp. 32, 155–7, and RDBI, p. 169, and A. B. Keith's criticism in his *Buddhist Philosophy*, p. 17. The passages would seem to deal with the right conduct of monks rather than with essential doctrine.

10 Or, *Bhābrū*. An isolated inscription on rock. V. A. Smith, p. 154.

11 More properly the Māgadhan King Piyadasi (Ch. 13 *c* § 16 n). Int. § 158; see §§ 2, 6, below.

12 The Saṃgha; Ch. 8; Ch. 22 *b* § 23 n. For the control of the Buddhist Saṃgha by the State compare H. G. Q. Wales's *Ancient Siamese Government and Administration* (1934), pp. 93, 237–50.

13 Literally, health and ease. *Dīgha Nik.*, i, p. 204; *Majjh. Nik.*, ii, p. 125; cp. *Vin.*, i, p. 253.

You know, Reverend Sirs, how far extend my respect for and faith in the Buddha,[1] the Sacred Law, and the Church.

Whatsoever, Reverend Sirs, has been said by the Venerable [*Bhagavatā*] Buddha, all of that has been well said.

However, Reverend Sirs, if on my own account I may point out (a particular text),[2] I venture to adduce this one: 'Thus the Good Law[3] will long endure.'[4] [I mean] Reverend Sirs, these passages of the Law[5] [*dhamma-paliyāni*], to wit:

The Exaltation of Discipline;[6]
The Course of Conduct of the Great Saints;[7]
Fears of what may happen;[8]
The Song of the Hermit;[9]
The Dialogue on the Hermit's Life;[10]
The Questioning of Upatishya;[11] [and]
The Address to Rāhula,[12] beginning with the *Subject*[13] *of Falsehood*—

spoken by the Venerable [Bhagavatā] Buddha—these, Reverend Sirs, I desire that many monks[14] and nuns[15] should frequently hear and meditate; and that likewise the laity, male and female [*upāsakā ca upāsikā ca*], should do the same.

For this reason, Reverend Sirs, I cause this to be written, so that people may know my intentions.[16]

[1] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4, *refuge*].
[2] Better, 'a series of texts'.
[3] *Aṅg. Nik.*, iii, p. 247 (*saddhammo ciraṭṭhitiko hoti*, 'the Good Law long endures'). Cp. *Aṅg. Nik.*, i, p. 59 (*saddhammassa ṭhitiyā*, 'for the endurance of the Good Law').
[4] i.e. if the texts are borne in mind. The sentence may be literally translated: 'But what, sirs, [the phrase] "Thus the Good Law will long endure" seems to me [to imply] that I think right to point out, [namely,] Sirs, these discourses on the Law.'
[5] See *Note* above; Int. § 22 n; and Hultzsch (1925), p. 174 n.
[6] *Vinaya-samukase.* The reading *samukāse* might mean 'abstract'; but SBE, xiii, p. xxvi is to be preferred, and may refer to the *Pātimokkha* rules in an early form (Ap. H 1). The *Pātimokkha* rules, however, can scarcely be called 'discourses'. Cp. *ukkaṃseti*, *Majjh.*, iii, p. 37 (S. N. Mitra, see Woolner's *Glossary*); *Vinayānuggaha* ('supporting the discipline'), *Aṅg.*, i, p. 98.
[7] *Aliya-vasāni.* Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]. *Vasāni* means 'powers', not necessarily supernatural. Perhaps *vāsā*; see Ch. 16 *a* § 5 [2], *Aṅg. Nik.*, v, p. 29 (Woolner's *Glossary*); 'Methods of living', SBB, iv, p. 247; 'Ways of Ariyan living', *Gradual Sayings*, v, p. 21.
[8] *Anāgata-bhayāni.* Five 'fears for the future' are analysed in the *Pañcaka-nipāta* of the *Aṅguttara-Nikāya* (PTS, iii, pp. 100–10). *Aṅg.* iii, p. 103 (Woolner's *Glossary*).
[9] *Muni-gāthā*; plural. *Muni* means 'Sage'; the term includes the Buddha and the early saints. *Muni-gāthā* = *Muni-sutta*, *Sutta-Nipāta*, 206–20 (Woolner's *Glossary*).
[10] *Moneya-sute. Moneyya* (Vedic *moneya*) means 'the state of a *muni*', or passionless. *Aṅg.*, i, pp. 271–3, and *Nalaka-sutta*, *Sutta-Nipāta*, 699–723 (Woolner's *Glossary*).
[11] *Upatissa-pasine.* Ch. 7 *a* §§ 19, 23; Ch. 11 *d* § 6. *Sāriputta-sutta*, *Sutta-Nipāta*, 955–75 (Woolner's *Glossary*).
[12] *Lāghul-ovāde.* Ch. 2 § 1; Ch. 7 *b* § 7. The Sutta here meant is evidently the *Ambalaṭṭika-Rāhul-ovāda-sutta* (*Majjh.* 61; Ch. 11 *d* § 9) on insincerity. Several other Suttas in *Majjh. Nik.* and *Saṃ. Nik.* dealing with transience and the futility of egoism, are named after Rāhula, as is one of the poetical suttas in the *Sutta-Nipāta.*
[13] 'Concerning', Hultzsch.
[14] 'Groups of monks', Hultzsch, monasteries or chapters (Ap. H 3 *b* § 1) seem to be meant.
[15] Ch. 12 *d*.
[16] 'That they may know my intention', Hultzsch.

§ 2. *Minor Rock Edict I* (*Rūpnāth text*).[1]

Thus saith His Sacred Majesty:[2]

For more than two-and-a-half years I was a lay disciple,[3] without, however, exerting myself strenuously. But it is more than a year since I joined[4] the Order, and have exerted myself strenuously.[5]

The gods[6] who up to this time had been unassociated[7] [with men] in India (*Jambudvīpa*)[8] have now become associated.

For this[9] is the fruit of exertion.[10] Nor is this to be attained by greatness only, because even by the small man who exerts himself immense heavenly bliss[11] may be won.

For this purpose has the proclamation been made:[12] 'Let small and great exert themselves.' . . .[13]

§ 3. *Minor Rock Edict II* (*Brahmagiri text*).[14]

Thus saith His Sacred Majesty:

Father and mother[15] must be hearkened to; similarly, respect for living creatures[16] must be firmly established; the truth[17] must be spoken. These are the virtues[18] of the Law which must be practised. Similarly the teacher (*ācariye*) must be reverenced by the pupil (*aṃtevāsinā*), and fitting courtesy must be shown to relations.

[1] V. A. Smith, p. 150. The Brahmagiri version includes Minor Rock Edict II (see § 3 below).

[2] The royal titles in the Edicts vary slightly (see 1, 4; Ch. 13 *c* 16). The personal name Asoka is found only once in the inscriptions as yet discovered, namely in the Maski rock inscription found in the Nizām's dominions in 1915. See V. A. Smith, *Oxford H. of I.* (1920), pp. 104, 106.

[3] Ch. 8 *l*.

[4] 'Visited', Hultzsch. *Upete* means literally, 'drawn near to', and seems to indicate a spiritual alliance rather than formal admission. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1] (*king*); Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [13].

[5] *Devā*; Int. § 49. In the Ediots this word is used only in this passage excepting in the title Devānampiya and similar royal titles (Hultzsch). It is here used freely as equivalent to *svage* ('heaven') i.e. Nibbāna on earth. The passage may be freely rendered: 'But in this time heaven which before seemed distant now appeared [to me] to be near, [here] in India.' Cp. Ch. 20 § 11 [29] n, where *devatā* may mean Arahats; and *Dhp.* verse 200; also Ch. 17 *b* § 1 n.

[6] In his 2nd edition (p. 149) V. A. Smith translated *a-misā* as 'true', following Bühler and Senart.

[7] *Jambudipase*; Ch. 1 § 2.

[8] i.e. heavenly bliss or saintship; nearness to or mingling with heaven.

[9] Ap. E *c* ii; cp. Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7]; also see § 7 below; cp. § 5 [ix] n below. The word used is *pakamasi* (loc.).

[10] *Pipule pi svage*. 'Even the great heaven', Hultzsch. See *Note* above (*heaven*). The Emperor can scarcely have meant that even the poor can reach a heaven hereafter.

[11] *Sāvane*. Cp. § 5 below.

[12] The edict then states that this proclamation was made by envoy (*vyuthena*), 256 persons being employed. The Sahasrām version (Hultzsch, p. 170) states that the proclamation was made by envoy on 256 occasions. The conventional number 256 is 4×4×4×4 and may indicate every quarter and sub-division of the empire. Cp. § 5 [iv] below (*Officers*); V. A. Smith, p. 214 (*vyutha*).

[13] V. A. Smith, p. 150. This is appended to the Brahmagiri version of Minor Rock Edict I (see § 2 above).

[14] See § 5 [viii] below.

[15] *Prānesu*. See *Note* above.

[16] Ap. F 2 *a* (147).

[17] *Guṇā*. Ap. F 2.

[18] *Nātikesu*. Literally, what is proper must be practised towards relatives.

This is the ancient nature of things[1]—this leads to length of days,[2] and according to this men must act. . . .[3]

§ 4. *Rock Edict IX* (*Kālsī text*).[4]

Thus saith His Sacred and Gracious Majesty[5] the King:

People perform various ceremonies.[6] In sickness, at the weddings of sons, the weddings[7] of daughters, the birth of children, departure on journeys—on those and other similar occasions people perform many[8] ceremonies. Nay, the womenkind perform many, manifold, trivial, and worthless ceremonies.

Ceremonies, however, have to be performed, although that kind bears little fruit. This sort, on the other hand, to wit, the ceremonial[9] of piety (*dhaṃma-magale*), bears great fruit.[10] In it are included proper treatment of slaves[11] and servants, honour to teachers (*gulunā*), gentleness[12] towards living creatures, and liberality towards ascetics and Brāhmans.[13] These things and others of the same kind, are called the Ceremonial of Piety.[14] . . .

§ 5. *Pillar Edict VII* (*Delhi-Topra*[15] *text*).

Thus saith His Sacred and Gracious Majesty the King:—

[ii] . . . This (thought) occurred to me: . . . By what means, then, can men be induced to conform?[16] by what means can men grow with the growth[17] of the Law of Piety[18] in due proportion? by what means can I lift up at least some of them through the growth of that Law?[19]

1 'Ancient rule', Hultzsch.
2 *Dīgh-āvuse*, '[is] conducive to long life'
3 Cp. Ch. 9 *b* (*Singālovāda-S.*).
4 V. A. Smith, p. 178. See *Note* above. This is part of the series or code of fourteen Edicts inscribed on rock and surviving in various places (see §§ 6, 7 below). A second series or code of seven Edicts was inscribed on pillars (see § 5 below).
5 See § 2 above; Ch. 13 *c* § 16. These terms render the titles *devānam-piya* (beloved of the gods; Int. § 49) and *piya-dasi* (gracious-seeming).
6 *Maṃgalam*, ritual. Int. § 190 (*priesthood*), and § 51; Ap. G 1 *a* (*practices*). Cp. Ch. 9 *b* (*Singālovāda-S.*); Ap. D *a* (ii), *sīlabbata*; cp. also § 5 [ix] (*regulations*) below.
7 *Āvāhasi vivāhasi*, at carryings to and carryings from [home]. In the Girnar versions '*āvāha vivānahesu*'.
8 Various, lit. high and low.
9 Or, observance (of the Law). 'Practice (of morality)', Hultzsch.
10 *Mahā-phale*, '[is] very fruitful'. Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [16]. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [11]; Ap. C *a* § 3 [22]; Ap. D *c* § 4; Ap. E *c* i § 9; also Int. § 26 n; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12] (*field*); and Ap. B *a* § 4 (*result*).
11 Int. § 190.
12 *Sayame*; 'self-control', Woolner. See *Note* above.
13 More properly 'holy men'. Ap. F 2 *c*; cp. § 5 [vi. viii], § 6 below; and Ap. A 2 *d* [21].
14 The ranking of all kindly and social acts (Ap. F 1) as religious ceremonies implies the sanctity of the bond uniting all living things. Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*).
15 V. A. Smith, pp. 209–12. This is the last portion of the series or code of seven Edicts inscribed on pillars and surviving in part in various places. A first series of fourteen Edicts was inscribed on rock (see § 4 above). The seventh Edict is found only on the Delhi-Topra Pillar and might properly be called a third series or code, since it consists of ten distinct sections.
16 i.e. to the Dhamma, the Law; 'Morality', Hultzsch, p. 134.
17 Or, grow through the spreading of the Law.
18 'By the promotion of morality', Hultzsch.
19 The Dhamma.

[iv] . . . I have set up pillars of the Law, appointed Censors (High Officers)[1] of the Law, and made a proclamation[2] of the Law.

[v] . . . On the roads,[3] too, I have had banyan-trees[4] planted to give shade to man and beast; groves (or 'gardens') of mango-trees I have had planted; at every half-kos[5] I have had wells dug; rest-houses,[6] too, have been erected; and numerous watering-places[7] have been provided by me here and there for the enjoyment of man and beast.

A small matter, however, is that so-called enjoyment.[8]

[vi] . . . My Censors (or 'High Officers') of the Law of Piety, too, are employed on manifold objects of royal favour affecting[9] both ascetics [*pavajītānaṃ*] and householders, and are likewise employed among all denominations[10] . . . among the Brāhmans[11] and Ājīvakas [*Ājīvakesu*][12] are they employed [by my orders]. Similarly they are employed [by my orders] among the Jains [*Nigaṃṭhesu*];[13] among miscellaneous sects,[14] too, are they employed. . . .

[vii] . . . Both these and many other officers, heads of departments[15] are employed in the distribution of alms both my own and those of the Queen[16] [*devīnaṃ*] . . . [also] of the alms of my sons . . . in order to promote the practice of the Law of Piety and conformity to that Law.[17] The practice of the Law of Piety and the conformity to that Law referred to are those whereby[18] compassion,[19] liberality,[20] truth, purity, gentleness, and saintliness[21] will thus grow among mankind.

[viii] . . . Whatsoever meritorious deeds[22] have been done by me, those deeds mankind [*loke*] will conform to and imitate,[23] whence follows that[24]

1 *Dhamma-mahāmātā*. Int. § 172. Cp. Ch. 11 *f* § 1 [5]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [3]; and Ch. 11 *c* § 21 [1]. See also § 2 n above (*envoy*); and Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1] (*king*).

2 Reading *savane*. See 2 above.

3 Int. § 189; also Ap. F 1 (*action*).

4 Nigrodha-trees; Ch. 4 § 1 [68]. As banyan-trees would soon eat up a road these were more probably pīpal-trees.

5 i.e. at every mile or mile and a half.

6 *Nimsidhayā*; 'flights of steps (for descending into the water)', Hultzsch. Cp. Ch. 20 § 11 [32].

7 *Āpānāni*. Senart translates as 'serais' (Woolner's *Glossary*).

8 i.e. material comfort compared with the enjoyment of the Dhamma. Cp. [ix] below; also § 7 n below.

9 Better, matters helpful to.

10 Or, faiths; reading *sava-pāsamdesu*.

11 The word often indicates 'holy men' in general (cp. § 4 above), but here plainly refers to the Brāhman priesthood.

12 *Ajivaka* means literally, 'those who follow a [strict] way of living'; not Jains. It does not seem certain that the ascetics thus called in Asoka's time held the same doctrines as the Ājīvakas to whom Gotama was so strongly opposed. Int. § 183.

13 See Hultzsch, p. 181 n.

14 Better, various faiths. Ap. G 2 *c*.

15 *Mukhā*; 'chief (officers)', Hultzsch. Int. § 172.

16 Int. § 190 (*wives*).

17 Or, for the sake of teaching and practice of the Law.

18 Are such that. These virtues (Ap. F 2) amount to selflessness which is the aim and sum of the Dhamma.

19 *Dayā*; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2 [14].

20 *Dāne*; Ap. F 1 *a*.

21 Sādhave; 'goodness', Hultzsch. The Dhamma is here summarized according to the virtues which it inculcates; in the next sub-division, [viii] below, of this Edict it is summarized according to the different grades of human society whose duty it teaches.

22 *Sādhavāni*; good (works). Studious scholars have found the Edicts boastful, but Asoka's silence on his good deeds would have been self-conscious and would have deprived his governors, officers, and people of necessary guidance.

23 Present tense. Cp. Int. § 25 (*collective karma*); and Ap. B *b* § 2 n (*influence*).

24 Better, 'and through this'.

they have grown and will grow in (the virtues of) hearkening to father and mother,[1] hearkening to teachers (or 'elders') [*gulusu*], reverence to the aged, and seemly treatment of Brāhmans[2] and ascetics [*bābhana-samanesu*], of the poor and wretched; yea, even of slaves[3] and servants.

[ix] . . . Among men, however, when the aforesaid growth of piety has grown, it has been effected by two-fold means, to wit, by regulations[4] of the Law of Piety and by reflection.[5] Of these (two), however, regulations of the Law are of small account,[6] whereas reflection is superior.[7] . . .

[x] . . . This scripture[8] of the Law of Piety, wheresoever pillars of stone or tables of stone exist, must there be recorded so that it may long endure.

§ 6. *Rock Edict IV*[9] (*Girnār text*).

. . . By reason of the inculcation of the Law of Piety by His Sacred and Gracious Majesty the King[10] have increased abstention from the (sacrificial) slaughter[11] of living creatures, abstention from the killing[12] of animate beings, seemly behaviour (or courtesy) to relatives, seemly behaviour to Brāhmans[13] and ascetics, hearkening to father and mother,[14] hearkening to elders.[15]

Thus, and in many other ways, the practice of the Law has increased, and His Sacred and Gracious Majesty the King will make such practice of the Law increase still further.

The sons, grandsons, and great-grandsons of His Sacred and Gracious Majesty the King will cause this practice of the Law to increase[16] until the aeon of universal destruction.[17] Standing firm in the Law (of Piety) and in morality [*sīlamhi*] they will inculcate the Law. . . .

§ 7. *Rock Edict VI*[18] (*Girnār text*).

Thus saith His Sacred and Gracious Majesty the King:

. . . Work I must[19] for the welfare[20] of all the folk; and of that, again, the root is energy[21] and the dispatch of business; for nothing is more essential than the welfare of all the folk. And whatsoever efforts I make[22] they are

[1] See *Note* above; § 3 above and § 6 below; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (29); Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [2]; also Int. § 103.
[2] See § 4 above.
[3] Int. § 190. 'Down to (including) slaves' is a juster translation.
[4] *Dhamma-niyama*; religious constraint. Cp. § 4 above (*ceremonies*).
[5] *Ni-jhati*, meditation; cp. Ap. I *a* (*Jhana*). *Nijjhatti* is thought leading to compassion, self-transcendence, and Nibbāna (cp. § 2 above, *exertion*).
[6] *Lahu*; little. Cp. [v] above.
[7] Or, from reflection [comes] more [good].
[8] *Libi* (or *lipi*); edict, literally, writing. See § 7 below.
[9] V. A. Smith, pp. 165–6. See § 4 n above; also Ch. 22 *c* § 4 n.
[10] Better, His Sacred Majesty King Piyadasi; see § 1 n above.
[11] Ch. 7 *a* § 8; and Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (1). *An-ārambho* means 'non-slaughter'.
[12] See *Note* above. *A-vi-hīsā* equals *a-hiṃsā* (Int. § 49).
[13] See § 4 above.
[14] See § 5 [viii] above.
[15] The word used is *thaira* (*thera*).
[16] Cp. Ap. B *b* § 2 n (*influence*); Ap. D *a* § 4 (335); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*burden*).
[17] *Āva saṃvaṭa-kapā*; as long as the *kalpa* or aeon rolls forward; i.e. until the aeon (Int. §§ 49, 107) declines. But possibly more simply 'until their life's end'; cp. *Gradual Sayings*, iv, p. 206 n on *kappa*.
[18] V. A. Smith, pp. 172–3. See § 4 n above; also Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note*.
[19] Or, I deem that men must work.
[20] Cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 13 *a* § 6. The word used is *hita*. See also Ap. F 1 (*action*).
[21] Or, exertion; the word used is *usṭāna* (Pāli *uṭṭhāna*). Cp. § 2 above.
[22] However I exert myself (*pārākramāmi*).

made that I may attain release from my debt[1] to animate beings, so that[2] while in this world I make some persons happy, they may win heaven[3] in the world beyond.[4] For that purpose have I caused this scripture[5] of the Law to be written in order that it may endure, while[6] my sons, and grandsons and great-grandsons may take action for the welfare of all folk. That, however, is difficult save by the utmost exertion [*pārākramena*].

2. The Presuppositions of the Dhamma

a. Metaphysical Presuppositions[7] *of Gotama: the Fundamental Unity,*[8] *and Altruistic or Collective Karma*[9]

[*Note.* Whilst Gotama the teacher, in remarkable contrast with his later followers, steadily refused to interest himself in metaphysical discussions, repeatedly declaring that the religious life did not depend on them, it was nevertheless impossible for him to dissociate his mind entirely from such considerations. After long and eager study of the philosophical thought[10] of his day and the practice of *yoga*[11] under Brāhmanical teachers,[12] and after

[1] *An-aṃṇa* means 'freedom from debt'. Asoka's sense of debt to all living creatures implicitly acknowledges their unity and sanctity (Ap. G 2 *a*); compare the answer to the first of the 'Novices' Questions' (Ch. 8 *i*), which to the question 'What is the "one"?' replies 'All beings existing by food'. Compare also the Stoic sense of social duty (Int. § 100), e.g. in Marcus Aurelius, II (1), III (11), IV (4), (23), V (6), VI (42), VIII (34), IX (23), X (6), and the passage XI (18) in which the Roman Emperor compares himself to 'the bull before the herd'.

[2] Better 'and that'.

[3] *Sagga*; perhaps, 'the peace of Nibbāna'. See Note (*heaven*) above; Int. § 19; Ap. C *a* § 2 (126); Ap. C *b* § 11 (174). The phrase may have meant one thing in the people's mind and another in the Emperor's.

[4] 'In this world (*idha*) and in the world beyond (*paratrā*)' is a free rendering and perhaps not justified. The literal meaning is 'here and on the other side'. The terms may indicate the outer world of practical life (cp. § 5 [v. *enjoyment*] above) and the inner world of the converted spirit (Int. § 12). The passage might be rendered: 'In this practical life I increase the well-being of some, and on the other (and spiritual) side they may gain the heaven (of selflessness and Nibbāna).' Cp. Ap. C *b* § 4 (*this world*); also Ch. 7 *b* § 2; Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [261]; Ch. 18 *c* § 2 [8].

[5] See § 5 [x] above.

[6] Better, 'and thus'.

[7] Int. §§ 25, 117, 186 (*basis*); Ch. 5 *a* § 5 n; Ap. G 1 *a* (*views*).

[8] Int. §§ 8, 35 (i), 39, 49, 67; also IN 8 *a*. Cp. Ch. 4 § 16 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 10 (*Immortal*); Ch. 14 *c* § 2 [1] n; Ch. 14 *d* § 3 (*Mūla*); Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3] (*ādi*); Ap. C *b* § 10 (*attha*); Ap. F 2 *b*, *Note* (*spirit*); also Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5]; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*animism*) n, and § 2 (ii) [II. 30); Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 n; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (14, *veil*); also Ch. 13 *c* § 18 (*discord*). The difficulties inherent in the idea of impersonal divinity are plainly less formidable for altruism (Int. § 3) than for individualism. See A. Coomaraswamy's *Buddha and the Gospel of Buddhism*, 1928, pp. 239–40, on the Void (cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 11 [3]).

[9] Int. §§ 6, 25, 36, 49, 186 (*basis*); Ap. B *b*; also Ap. B *a* §§ 2 n, 3 n, and Ch. 4 § 16 n.

[10] The form of his Four Noble Truths may have been borrowed from the Sāṇkhya philosophy (Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*), which has for its object the cessation of suffering, and defines a fourfold process of (1) suffering, (2) liberation or the cessation of suffering, (3) the cause of suffering or the failure to discriminate between the soul and matter, (4) the means of liberation or discriminating knowledge (see Eliot, *H. and B.*, ii, p. 297). The Buddhist way of liberation is by overcoming desire, the Sāṇkhya way is by overcoming ignorance (Ap. D *b*, *avijjā*; Ap. D *a* § 10, 251, *moha*). Cp. Ap. F 2 *d*, *Note* (*Sāṇkhya*).

[11] *Yoga* asceticism marks an ethical advance beyond Vedic charms and sacrifices. Ch. 11 *c* § 17 [3] n; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.

[12] Int. § 178; cp. Eliot, *H. and B.*, ii, pp. 304–5.

years devoted to intense contemplation, he arrived at the conclusions impressively stated in his first sermon delivered to his five earliest followers in the Deer Park near Benāres. These conclusions are purely ethical outwardly, but they are necessarily based upon his previous metaphysical analysis of human life and of the universe with which it is surrounded. He himself found it unnecessary to state these bases, except cursorily;[1] he did not wish to be entangled in unpractical discussions, which might be endlessly prolonged[2] by the learned without light, and might divert the attention of the world from the simple lessons which it so much needed and which remained true, whatever the result of these arguments.[3] He felt that his conclusions, once arrived at, were self-evident,[4] and could be mastered by any simple earnest mind. True, he hesitated at first[5] in face of the task of convincing the world that individualism was the great delusion; but he appears quickly to have felt that the same statement put in another way, namely that the self was the great evil, that selfishness was the root-cause of sorrow, that self-forgetfulness and kindly labour brought solace and peace and the consoling sense of unity and love, would be acceptable to men of good will, whose best instincts spontaneously prompt them to the same effect and who only need a definite call to accept and believe.[6] He hesitated to preach the doctrine in its metaphysical shape; but he did not hesitate to state it in its ethical form. But the metaphysical form remains as the background or the basis of the ethical teaching, and though it may not be necessary it seems desirable to examine it.

In the account of Gotama's early inquiries given in the Introduction to the *Jātaka* we have a very cursory account of the teachings of his first masters, Āḷāra Kāḷāma and Uddaka. 'Coming to Āḷāra Kāḷāma and Uddaka, the disciple of Rāma, he acquired from them the eight stages of meditation; but becoming convinced that they did not lead to enlightenment he ceased to practise them.'[7] In the *Majjhima-Nikāya* a somewhat fuller, but still by no means clear, account is given of the several doctrines of these teachers. On his asking Āḷara Kāḷāma how far his doctrines conducted, he received the answer that it conducted to 'the realm of nothingness';[8] and when he put the same question later to Uddaka, regarding the discipline taught by Rāma his master, the answer was that it conducted to 'the realm of neither perception nor yet non-perception'.[9] Of these eight stages of meditation, which he 'ceased to practise' a fuller account is given in the texts cited in Appendix I (*Trances*). It is remarkable that the *Mahāparinibbāna* (Great Decease) *Sutta*, in the form in which it has come down to us, gives a long account[10] of how Gotama the Tathāgata, immediately before his death entered each of these stages, namely first the four trances,[11] and then successively 'the realm of the infinity of space . . . the realm of the infinity of consciousness . . . the realm of nothingness . . . the realm of neither perception nor yet non-perception', till finally 'rising from the realm of neither perception nor yet non-perception, he arrived at the cessation of perception and sensation', the last or ninth stage being apparently a completely negative refinement of the eighth and equivalent to total

1 Ch. 5 *c* (Second Sermon).
2 Ap. G 1 *a* § 5 (*maze*).
3 Int. § 100.
4 Ap. G 1 *a* § 7. Cp. Ch. 21 § 7 [25] (*inner doctrine*).
5 Ch. 5 *a* § 1.
6 Ch. 5 *a* § 6.
7 Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 69; see Ch. 3 § 4.
8 Ch. 3 § 5.
9 Ch. 3 § 5.
10 Ch. 22.
11 Ap. I *a*.

escape, though even then, according to this account, the Tathāgata returned through all the stages, only to repeat the four trances before attaining to *parinibbāna* or final liberation. One may suspect that Gotama's followers, responsible for this portion of the narrative, returned to the doctrines which he himself learnt but rejected 'becoming convinced that they did not lead to enlightenment'. In these doctrines we apparently have in some form the ancient Vedāntic theory of *Māyā* (illusion)[1] or idealistic monism, according to which the world is appearance only and the individual soul has but to make a sufficiently great and prolonged effort to be able to transcend the illusion and realize its identity with the One. That Gotama was acquainted with this philosophic theory and with the great Vedāntic dictum '*Tat tvam asi* (That art thou, or, Thou art that)'[2] seems more than probable. That it impressed him, and that he finally rejected it, as he finally rejected, though without any harshness or hostility, the teachings of Āḷāra Kāḷāma and Uddaka, would follow; but it would leave its traces on his mind in a vivid perception of the unity of the world.[3] Monistic by inclination, but deeply moral and practical, Gotama rejected the doctrine of illusion and its consequent passivism. The world to him was not illusory, but vividly real; a place for the exercise of all virtue, a field and opportunity for the duties of the Noble Eightfold Path, the last and the culmination of the Four Noble Truths. The *an-atta* doctrine[4] so strongly emphasized by him declares the transience of individuality, yet insists upon an ultimate or fundamental unity.[5] But this unity is not that of the idealists; it relies not upon contemplation and passivism for its attainment, but upon action,[6] charity, and love; upon the breaking down of the barriers set up by self-interest,[7] not upon the elimination of thought and perception. Thus behind the teachings of Gotama there is a monism which is not idealistic or māyā-ist, but realistic,[8] moral, and practical.

Throughout the Canonical Books mention is made of Brahmā Sahampati, Sakka, Indra, Māra, and other divine or supernatural personalities, good or evil. These plainly are inconsistent with Gotama's *an-atta* doctrine of the transience of personality, and would therefore seem necessarily to be later accretions acquired by Buddhism during the long process which assimilated it to Hinduism[9] before finally extinguishing it in India.

[1] Ap. D *b*; Ap. G 2 *c*, Note (*Vedāntic*). Cp. Ch. 11 *c* 29 (*thought*); also Ch. 15 *a* § 16 [7] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] n. A Greek analogy suggests that the complete Scepticism of Sañjaya (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 [32]), the early teacher of Sāriputta and Moggallāna, was the natural concomitant or immediate successor of the complete Idealism of the Vedānta philosophy.

[2] See Eliot, *H. and B.*, i, p. 81, also i, p. xvi, and ii, p. 308. Cp. § 2 below; Ch. 1 § 11 (*yoga-kkhema*); Ap. C *b* § 10 [1], and Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [7]. '"The highest Brahman, the Soul of all, the great mainstay of the universe, more subtle than the subtle, the eternal Being, that art thou, that thou art, *Tat twam asi*" (Kaivalya Upanishad, vi)', A. Schweitzer, *Indian Thought and its Development*, 1936, p. 35, where kindred passages from the Upanishads are also cited.

[3] Ap. F 2 *c*, *Note*.

[4] Ap. E *c* i.

[5] See § 3 below (*ocean*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 (*union*).

[6] Ap. F 1.

[7] Ap. D (*Egoism*).

[8] See § 9 below (*unity*); Ap. G 1 *a* (iii). Cp. 'The visible and tangible universe is much more than can be interpreted in terms of traditional physical science. . . . The ultimate interpretation is the spiritual interpretation for which all that is clearly definable in the visible and tangible world is the manifestation of God. The materialistic interpretation is not a possible one . . .', J. S. Haldane, *The Philosophy of a Biologist*, 2nd ed. (1936), p. 165.

[9] IN 8.

The personification[1] of divinity is a process natural to the human mind whether in Asia or in Europe. The opposite process is more familiar in the East than in the West. Behind the greatest of the gods, behind the supreme Brāhmanical triad[2] of Brahmā the Creator, Vishnu the Preserver, Shiva the Destroyer, there exists for the Hindu mind a more primeval power, a still deeper and more mysterious divine force, the impersonal Brahman,[3] the *Attan*[4] (Sanskrit, *Ātman*, breath, spirit), the source from which they rose and into which eventually after incalculable ages they must at last be resolved. Hence it has been maintained that Hinduism in spite of its pantheon of myriads of gods is at bottom mono-theistic. The force that runs through and maintains all, however, is not to the Indian philosophic mind theistic, but impersonal; not a deity but divine; not an individuality, however supreme, but breath or spirit. To Western thought the notion of an impersonal divinity contains a contradiction in terms; not so to the Eastern mind. The teachings of Gotama seem necessarily to imply this Eastern philosophic attitude and to involve not atheism, for the moral structure of the world is implied in every utterance of his doctrine, and chance and mechanism and irresponsibility are repudiated by every word of the zealous preacher and every effort of the laborious and imperious organizer, but the belief in a single divine impersonal force behind the fleeting lives of men, leading their spirits away from particularity back to unity, and combating that assertion of the self. that thirst and grasping, in which Gotama found the cause, a negative one necessarily involved in transient and separate being, of all sorrow and evil.

The obscure list of sequences known as the *paṭicca samuppāda*[5] may perhaps fairly be interpreted as meaning, in its original form, that from the fundamental Unity arises individuality, and with the individual arise ignorance and desire, decay, and death, and from the ignorant desires of the perishable individual arise all the sorrows of our existence; and that if one can get rid of individualistic desire one can return to the harmony of the underlying fundamental Unity. With the addition of the theory of re-birth to the original nucleus the present complete confusion was introduced. That such speculations were foreign to the times can hardly be maintained in view of the *Brahmajāla-Sutta*[6] and the date now generally assigned to the early Upanishads.

That Gotama was acquainted with the Hindu doctrine of transmigration[7] is scarcely open to question. The notion that Buddhism introduced this doctrine seems no longer tenable. There are not only proofs of the greater antiquity of the doctrine, but it is strictly opposed to Gotama's own tenets, especially to his *an-atta* theory. Yet it seems clear that this great belief did not leave him uninfluenced. The great moral lesson vividly impressed by the doctrine of Karma is that every action, word, and thought[8] bring their inevitable consequences, and the teachings of Gotama are full of the sense of this responsibility. But whereas to the Hindu the consequences are purely, or at least primarily, borne with an artificial poetic justice by the individual responsible, the doer, who though he may appar-

[1] Ap. G 2 *b*.
[2] Post-Vedic, and perhaps later than Buddha.
[3] Int. §§ 37, 48 n (*Preas Prohm*). Cp. Int. § 93 (ii) n.
[4] Int. § 37. Cp. Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note* (*Paramatta*).
[5] Ap. B *c* § 3.
[6] Ap. E *c* i § 2.
[7] Int. § 4.
[8] Ap. B *b*, *Note*.

ently escape from or miss them during this life will inevitably be overtaken by them or draw the advantage of them in another life, to Gotama this personal, individualistic, incentive or appeal is not only negatived by the essential theory of the transience of the soul, but is also strongly reprobated[1] by it as an appeal to that very individuality which is the basis of all thirst, desire, grasping, sorrow, and evil. Eager to retain the great moral force in the doctrine of transmigration, Buddhists, at an early date apparently, endeavoured to reconcile these two irreconcilable positions, by maintaining that though the soul is transient and does not survive, yet the consequences of its actions cannot be lost and therefore must pass on[2] at the moment of death to a new-born soul, as a flame from one lamp to another, or knowledge from teacher to pupil; and thus a new life, bearing the consequences of the actions of the old life, and scarcely distinguishable from it, carries on the load, heavy or light, imposed by the earlier agent. But it would not appear that Gotama himself promulgated a doctrine thus dependent on an entirely arbitrary assumption and limitation. By what force should the actions, words, and thoughts of an individual concentrate themselves at the moment of death in order to transfer themselves to a new and disconnected individuality? To Gotama it must have been obvious—all his words seem to imply it[3]—that every action, word, and thought of man has its immediate consequences, here and now, on all who are brought into relationship with it, and that these consequences have no end, but proceed relentlessly onward from life to life, from generation to generation. The force of Karma thus is real, is ever-present and eternal. But it is not one single individual who suffers or who gains by any action whether in this life or in another; nor is it one soul who passes on a load, heavy or light, or an advantage, great or small, to one other soul brought into some close and mystical relationship with the former; but it is all the world, in each transient generation, that suffers or gains by the deeds, words, and thoughts of every fleeting individuality that manifests for a brief lifetime the phenomenon of separate being. And it is in so far as these actions of the transient self negative the separation of individuality, and reassert the original and fundamental unity of life, that they cancel sorrow and bring the joy of Nirvāna or self-forgetfulness. Thus the Karma accepted by Gotama appears not as an individualistic force appealing to the fears and hopes of each unit, but as an altruistic moral power, which may perhaps be termed Collective Karma. Of such Karma the sanctions appear to be at least as powerful as those of individual loss or salvation, and indeed the sense that in thinking an evil thought one is injuring the whole fabric of human society, the texture of the all-inclusive One, may be almost an excessive moral burden.[4]

It should never be forgotten that Buddhism is a reformed Brāhmanism, as is evidenced by the invariably honorific use which Gotama makes of the title Brāhman,[5] and it therefore takes for granted certain Vedic or Vedāntic postulates. This accounts for certain partial silences in the Buddha's teachings. The back-ground of Buddhism, as that of Brāhmanism, is

[1] Ap. D *a* § 8 (*Fetters*).
[2] Ap. B *b* § 2.
[3] Ap. B *b* §§ 3 [6, *actions*], 5; Ap. E *c* ii § 5.
[4] Int. § 24 (*pono-bbhavikā*); Ap. D *a* § 4 (335); Ap. E *c* i § 9; Ap. G 1 *c* § 6.
[5] Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] (*sutta*); Ap. F 2 *c*; and Int. § 185.

Brahman, the impersonal divine unity,[1] underlying, and harmonizing all individualities, all egoism, all differences, and all strife. And equally important as a background to Buddhism is the characteristic Hindu doctrine of moral responsibility, the endless succession of the consequences of actions, but with the essential differences imposed by Gotama's equally characteristic doctrine of the non-permanence of individuality. That Gotama was actuated by the keenest sense of this moral responsibility, is evidenced by almost everything that is recorded of him, but special mention may be made of his repudiation of the charge of being an *a-kiriyavādin*,[2] and of his rooted hostility to the doctrine of irresponsibility propagated by the nihilist Makkhali Gosāla.[3] That he accepted the doctrine of the consequence of actions in some form or measure is clear; but his teaching of the impermanence of the self necessitated his rejection of the Hindu doctrine of personal reward and punishment in repeated rebirths. The consequences of actions are borne collectively, or ultimately, by the underlying One. This view seems adequately, and alone, to explain Gotama's last words: 'Individuals are perishable by their nature; work therefore strenuously.'[4] The meaning of this last message to mankind must be—the individual has but a little while in which to labour, lovingly and lastingly, for the whole. Gotama was a realist; but later Buddhism tended towards, and Mahāyānism actually adopted, like the Vedāntism of the Hindus, the theory of *māyā* or idealism, and found in the Buddhist *Canon* justification for attributing the same idealism to the Master. There must presumably therefore have been something in Gotama's teaching, realistic though it was, which was not dissonant with, and indeed approached to, idealism; and this may perhaps be found in this Collectivism, in an insistence on the importance of the unseen Whole and on the transience of the visible individual, in whose self-regard he found the origin of all sorrow.

The first portion of the *Aṅguttara-Nikāya* containing the *Eka-nipāta* (the 'One' or 'Synthesis' section) concludes with the *Jhāna-vagga* or chapter on profound meditation,[5] and the last part of this chapter treats of the *Amata*,[6] the Immortal. This Immortal or Deathless may be either *Nibbāna*, the state of harmony with the fundamental unity, or that unity itself, the *a-kata*,[7] the unmade, the uncreated, whence arise for ever the harmonies of goodness, truth, and beauty,[8] and in separation from which arise sorrow, error, and discord, the fires of lust, of ignorance, and of enmity.[9]]

[1] Int. § 178; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14] n. The starting point is the same. On the divine fundamental unity as seen from the earliest Upanishadic point of view see the *Isha-Upanishad* (*The Ten Principal Upanishads*, tr. Shree Purohit Swāmi and W. B. Yeats, 1937, p. 15). 'The more deeply we penetrate Buddhist and Brāhmanical thought, the less is it possible to divide them', A. Coomaraswāmy, *Buddha and the Gospel of Buddhism*, 1916 (1928), p. 214. Later Buddhism represents the universal in the form of Ādi-Buddha, the Primal Mind (see *The Gods of Northern Buddhism*, A. Getty, 1914, p. 2).

[2] Ap. B *b* § 3 [2].

[3] Int. § 183.

[4] Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7].

[5] The theme of the chapter is *Kāya-gatā sati* or meditation on the body. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 (*sammā-sati*); Ap. I *a* (*Jhāna*).

[6] See § 6 below. Cp. Ch. 21 § 11 [33] (3) n.

[7] See § 7 below; and Dhp. 97.

[8] Ch. 3 § 5.

[9] Ap. D *a* § 10.

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 11 (Kevaddha-Sutta),*[1] *85.*

'. . . The Mind (*viññānaṃ*),[2] the indefinable,[3] the infinite, released from all[4] (*sabbato pahaṃ*);
Here water, earth, fire, air[5] has not a footing;
Here the great and the small, the subtle and the gross, the beautiful and the unbeautiful,
Here individuality (*nāmañ ca rūpañ ca*)[6] completely ceases (*uparujjhati*);
With the cessation[7] of the [individual] mind (*viññānassa*)[8] here this [individuality][9] ceases.

§ 2. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 13 (Tevijja-Sutta),*[10] *37–82.*

[37] . . . On this being said the youth Vāseṭṭha said to the Blessed One: 'I have heard, O Gotama, that the recluse Gotama[11] knows the path to union with the Brahmās[12] (*Brahmānaṃ sahavyatāya*).' . . .[13] [39] 'It is well, let the respected (*bhavaṃ*)[14] Gotama show the way to union with the Brahmās, let the respected Gotama save the Brāhman stock.' 'Hearken then, Vāseṭṭha, attend well, I will speak.' 'Be it so, sir', said the youth Vāseṭṭha assenting to the Blessed One. . . .'[15] [76] 'He [the recluse or mendicant] abides suffusing one world-quarter with a mind (*cetasā*) full of loving-kindness,[16] then a second, then a third, then the fourth.[17] Thus he abides suffusing the whole world above, below, across, on all sides, in all completeness, with a mind full of loving-kindness . . . [78] with a mind full of pity . . . with a mind full of sympathetic joy . . . with a mind full

[1] Ap. I *b* § 4. The scene of the *Sutta* is the Pāvārika mango-grove at Nāḷandā (Int. § 145; Ch. 11 *d* § 5). The *Sutta* includes what must be an interpolated story of a visit to each of the gods successively, from the Four Great Kings (Int. § 93, v) to Mahā-Brahmā, and concludes with these ancient verses (Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*) attributed to the Buddha, dealing with the four elements and where they cease.

[2] Ap. B *c* § 3.

[3] 'Das Unzeigbare', OB, p. 258.

[4] Or, the basis of all. The Commentary interprets *paha* as *tittha*, a landing-place; see Rhys Davids's *Pāli Dict.*

[5] Ap. E *c* i § 4.

[6] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2). This is here the same as *saṃkhārā*, the fourth *khandha*.

[7] Ch. 7 *a* § 19 [5].

[8] This is the fifth *khandha*. Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

[9] The antecedent of 'this (*etaṃ*)' is to be found in the immediately preceding line.

[10] PTS numbering; SEB, ix numbers as i. 40 to iii. 9. Ch. 14 *d* § 6 [3]n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8. The negative part of the *Sutta* here closes, and the constructive portion begins.

[11] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2].

[12] Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [206]. In the preceding paragraphs the phrase has been *Brahmā-sahavyatāya*. At some point in the *Sutta* the meaning slips from the personal God to the impersonal divinity. Int. § 35 (i); Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii); cp. Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] (*Brahmā-bhūtā*). See SBE, xi, p. 168 n; OB, p. 74 n.

[13] Omitting the paragraph in which Gotama is represented as claiming to know the path to the Brahmā-world as well as the villagers know the way to Manasākata (Int. § 149), a claim which savours of the zeal of a follower rather than of the tranquil moderation of the Teacher.

[14] Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12].

[15] Omitting the long extract taken from the *Sāmaññaphala-Sutta* (see Ch. 19 *c* § 2 n) and elsewhere (see SBE, xi, p. 186 n), which has been added here by the compiler (IN 6, *Canon*), and which, after stating that the life of the householder (Ch. 8, *l*) is full of hindrances, sets forth the *Cūla-Sīla*, *Majjhima-Sīla* and *Mahā-Sīla* or short, middle, and long Rules of Conduct (Ap. A 2 *d*), which are repeated in all the first thirteen Suttas of the *Dīgha-Nikāya*. These greatly hamper the present Discourse.

[16] *Mettā*. Ap. F 2 *b* [6].

[17] Cp. Ch. 9 *b* § 1. The habitual survey of the universe with love is the true Buddhist form of prayer. 'These meditations play a great part in later Buddhism, and occupy very much the place that prayer takes in Christianity.' SBE, xi, p. 201 n.

of serenity,[1] wide, extended, unmeasured, without enmity, without ill-will. Truly, Vāseṭṭha, this is the way to a state of union with Brahman.[2] . . .[3] [81] Indeed, Vāseṭṭha, that the self-controlled mendicant-brother on the dissolution[4] of the body after death (*paraṃ maraṇā*)[5] should attain to union with the self-controlled (*vasa-vatissa*) Brahman—this state is possible (*vijjati*). [82] On this being said the youths Vāseṭṭha and Bhāradvāja said to the Blessed One: '[How] excellent, revered sir, [how] excellent!' . . .[6]

§ 3. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga*,[7] *A-vyākata-saṃyutta*[8] (*Saṃ. xliv*), *Sutta 1* (*Khemā-theri*), *3–20*. (*PTS, iv, p. 374*.)

. . .[9] [3] At that time Pasenadi[10] the Kosalan, going from Sāketa[11] to Sāvatthi,[12] between Sāvatthi and Sāketa made a stay of one night at Toraṇavatthu.[13] . . . [6] Then King Pasenadi the Kosalan drew near to where Khemā[14] the mendicant-sister (*bhikkhunī*)[15] was and . . . having exchanged greetings seated himself at one side[16] [7] . . . and spoke thus: 'What now, revered-lady (*ayye*),[17] does the Right-farer (*tathāgato*)[18] continue to be after death?'[19] 'It is not declared,[20] great king (*mahā-rāja*), by the Blessed One that the Right-farer exists after death.' 'What now, revered lady, does the Right-farer not continue to be after death?' [8] 'This also is not declared by the Blessed One. . . .' [9] 'Does he both continue and not continue to be after death? . . . [10] Does he neither continue nor not continue to be after death?' 'This also is not declared, great king, by the Blessed One. . . .' [11] '. . . What is the cause, revered lady, what is the reason (*paccayo*)[21] for which this is not declared by the Blessed One?'

[12] 'I now, great king, will question thee, and do thou answer[22] as it may please thee. [13] What thinkest thou, great king, hast thou any accountant or mint-master (*muddiko*)[23] or treasurer who is able to count the sand of the Ganges, saying so many grains of sand, or so many hundreds or thousands or hundred thousands of grains?' 'No indeed.' [14] 'Or . . . who is able to count the water in the great ocean, saying so many measures of water, or so many hundreds or thousands or hundred thousands of measures of water?' 'No indeed.' 'For what cause?' 'The great ocean[24]

[1] These are the four famous *Brahma-vihārā* (Ap. F 2 *b*). They are essentially selfless and harmonizing. Cp. *bhāvanā* or mental cultivation (Ap. E *c* ii § 2); Ap. I *a* (*Jhāna*).

[2] Int. § 29; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4]. Cp. *Note* above (*Tat twam asi*).

[3] Omitting repetitions; also a passage in which it is agreed that Brahman does not resemble those who grasp at possessions and are subject to anger, malice, impurity, and want of self-control (cp. the Five Hindrances, Ap. D *a* 9, iv).

[4] Ch. 9 *a* § 10 (*bheda*).

[5] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1). It may be noticed that the conversion of the two youths takes place without any mention of rebirth (Int. § 30).

[6] As in Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

[7] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2); see § 4 below.

[8] Section on 'unexplained points'; Ap. G 1 *a* (ii). See Ch. 14 *e* § 1 [4] n.

[9] The Buddha was at Sāvatthi.

[10] Int. § 169 (i).

[11] Int. § 149 (*b*).

[12] Int. § 138.

[13] Int. § 149.

[14] Ch. 10 *c* [49]; Ch. 14 *e* § 1 [2]; Ap. A 2 *b* (68); and Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [1] n.

[15] Ch. 12 (*b*).

[16] Ap. B *b* § 3 [4].

[17] Ch. 12 *b* § 3 [2].

[18] Or, 'follower' (Ap. A 2 *c*; see § 8 below. The question is put generally in § 4 [3] below.

[19] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [1].

[20] Or, explained.

[21] Literally, ground or basis. Cp. Ap. B *c* §§ 1 (1), 2 (2).

[22] Or, declare.

[23] Literally, 'sealer'. 'Munzmeister', OB, p. 320. Int. § 189 (*money*).

[24] Ap E *a* ii § 4 (5).

is profound, immeasurable, unfathomable.' [15] 'So indeed, great king, the material form[1] of the Right-farer,[2] by which one might define[3] him, being rejected,[4] being cut off at root . . .[5] and the Right-farer, thus liberated from material-form, being . . . unfathomable, even as the great ocean, the phrase "the Right-farer continues to be after death" does not apply,[6] the phrase "the Right-farer does not continue to be after death" does not apply. . . .[7] [16] [So also with] the sensations . . . [17] the perceptions . . . [18] the individual character . . . [19] the consciousness of the Right-farer. . . .' [20] Then the king . . . rejoicing and welcoming the word of Khemā the mendicant-sister, rose from his seat . . . and departed. . . .[8]

4. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga,*[9] *Avyākatā-Saṃyutta (Sam. xliv), Sutta 10 (Ānanda). (PTS, iv, p. 400.)*

. . .[10] [2] At that time Vacchagotta the Wanderer[11] drew near to where the Blessed One was, and having drawn near he exchanged courtesies[12] with the Blessed One, and having gone through the current phrases of courtesy seated himself at one side. [3] Seated at one side Vacchagotta the Wanderer spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'What now, O (*bho*) Gotama, is there a self[13] (*atth' attā ti*)?' On this being said the Blessed One was silent. 'What then, O Gotama, is there not a self?'[14] And again the Blessed One was silent. Then Vacchagotta the Wanderer rose from his seat and departed. [4] Then the venerable Ānanda[15] soon after Vacchagotta had departed, spoke to the Blessed One thus: 'Why then, revered sir, did the Blessed One, when questioned, not answer Vacchagotta the Wanderer?' [5] 'If I, Ānanda, being asked "Is there a self?" had answered Vacchagotta "There is a self", this would have supported the religious teachers (*samaṇa-brāhmana*)[16] who teach the [theory that the self is] eternal (*sassata-vādā*).[17] [6] If I being asked "Is there not a self?" had answered Vacchagotta "There is not a self", this would have supported the religious teachers who teach the [theory that the self is] annihilated (*uccheda-vādā*).[18] [7] If I

[1] Ap. E *a* ii (*Khandhas*).
[2] Or, 'follower' generally.
[3] Or; distinguish.
[4] Cp. *anicca* (transient) in Ap. E *a* i, where the statement is universal, not particular.
[5] As in Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (5).
[6] The four questions do not apply because they are in the plane of individualism and imply the separateness of the self. Even Vedāntism in accepting caste and rebirth admitted the principle of individualism, however unwittingly. Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*.
[7] Omitting repetitions.
[8] Pasenadi then goes to the Blessed One and receives the same answers.
[9] See § 3 above.
[10] The scene is not given.
[11] Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6).
[12] Int. § 190 (*ceremonial*); Ch. 12 *c* § 3 (*courtesies*).
[13] Or, soul. 'Das Ich', OB, p. 313. Cp. Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*); also Ch. 12 *e* § 8 [3] n; Ap. B *b* § 1 (*nāma-rūpa*), and Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *jīva*). On contemporary schools of metaphysical thought see Ap. G 2 *c*.
[14] Cp. § 3 [7] above.
[15] Ap. A 1 *b* (8).
[16] Or, recluses and Brāhmans, Ap. A 2 *d*.
[17] The question can be asked of the soul as here, or of the material world as in Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
[18] Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9]; cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [7] (*dissolution*). Believing in the annihilation of the ego, the Uccheda-vādins were materialists and denied moral responsibility (cp. Int. § 181). In opposition to these the Sassatavādins or eternal-ists probably were believers in transmigration and personal Karma (Int. § 4), more especially the Jains.

. . . had answered "There is a self", would that have been suitable for me holding the doctrine that "separate-natures[1] (*dhammā*) are without [permanent] self"?' 'Not so, revered sir.' [8] 'If I . . . had answered "There is not a self", then in Vacchagotta, already deluded, the further delusion[2] might have arisen, "I had certainly a self formerly, but it now does not exist '.'[3]

§ 5. *Aṇguttara-Nikāya, Tika-nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 47.*

These three, mendicant-brothers, are the signs of the compositeness (*saṇkhata-lakkhaṇāni*) of the created (*saṇkhatassa*).[4] What three? Origination[5] (*uppādo*) is perceived, decay[6] (*vayo*) is perceived, separation[7] from the steadfast (*ṭhitassa*) is perceived. These are the three signs of the compositeness of the created.

These three, mendicant brothers, are the signs of the unity[8] of the uncreated (*a-saṇkhatassa*).[9] What three? No origination is perceived, no decay is perceived, no separation from the steadfast is perceived. These are the three signs of the unity[10] of the uncreated.

§ 6. *Khuddaka-Nikaya, Dhammapada, verse 374.*[11]

Whensoever he comprehends the origin and destruction[12] of the aggregates,
He obtains the joy and happiness of those who know the immortal (*a-mataṃ*).[13]

§ 7. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Dhammapada, verse 383.*[14]

Cut off the stream resolvedly; drive away lusts, O Brāhman;
When thou knowest the destruction[15] of individuality (*saṇkhārānaṃ*), thou knowest the uncreated,[16] O Brāhman.

[1] Individual-existences, or forms. Ap. E c i § 1.
[2] Pāli *saṃ-moha*. Ap. D a § 10 (ii).
[3] i.e. the ego has been destroyed. Gotama's teaching is that in reality and apart from delusion there has been no separateness or isolation (Ap. C b § 10). The questions cannot be answered because they are on the plane of individualism and have ineradicable egoistic implications (cp. Ap. E a ii § 4, 3).
[4] Ap. E a ii § 2; Ap. E c i § 3 [29].
[5] Literally, 'arising'. Cp. Ap. B c.
[6] Ch. 21 § 16. Cp. Ch. 5 c § 7 (*cessation*); see §§ 6, 7 below.
[7] Literally, 'elsewhereness'. The real difference between the changing Many and the steadfast One lies not in the compositeness but in the separation of the former.
[8] Literally, 'non-compositeness'.
[9] Cp. § 7 below (*a-kata*); Ch. 5 c §§ 1 [38], 3 [45] (*Self*); and Ch. 12 a § 7 [228] (*imperishable*).
[10] Cp. Ch. 7 a § 20 (*dhamma-cakkhu*). The main metaphysical difference between Vedāntism and Buddhism is that whereas the former regards the fundamental substance as thought having no real existence, the latter regards it as a divine uncreated reality. Hence arise further essential differences, those of passivism and activism, self-concentrated asceticism and self-forgetful altruism.
[11] As in Ap C b § 11 (374).
[12] Cp. § 5 above (*decay*).
[13] See *Note* above; Ch. 5 a § 10; Ch. 11 d § 2 [10]; Ch. 14 c § 19 [3]; Ch. 16 c § 2 n; Ch. 18 b § 4 [79] n; Ap. C b § 2 [8]; Ap. I, *Note*; and Ch. 7 a § 18 [1]. Cp. Int. § 37 (*Brahman*); also *a-saṃhīra* and *a-saṃkuppa* (Ch. 14 c § 5 [189]); and *mahatta* (Ch. 14 c § 8 [2] n).
[14] As in Ap F 2 c § 1 (383).
[15] Cp. § 5 above (*decay*).
[16] Pāli *a-kata*. See *Note* above, and Int. § 98; Ch. 7 a § 19; Ch. 18 b § 4 [79] n; Ap. D b § 6 [3] n; Ap. I, *Note*. Cp. § 5 above (*a-saṇkhata*); Ap. G 2 c § 3 (i) [26]; also Ch. 1 § 11 (*a-jāta*); Ch. 15 a § 11 [3] (*void*); Ch. 18 d § 2 [207] (*infinite*); Ap. E c i § 9 n (*hetu*).

§8. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta,*[1] *Pārāyana-vagga* 7 (*Upasīva-māna-va pucchā*).[2] (*Buddha speaks:*)

'Just as the flame,[3] touched by a breath of wind,
Goes to its rest (*attham*)[4] and disappears from knowing,
So goes the Sage,[5] his name-and-body[6] leaving,
Into his rest, from knowledge disappearing.'

(*Upasīva speaks:*)

'Is he who goes to rest from being taken?[7]
Is everlasting being his, released from pain?[8]
This wilt thou, Sage, reveal in full to me,
For known to thee in truth is this ordaining.'

(*Buddha speaks:*)

'No measure measures him, who enters rest.
There is no word with which to speak of him.
What thought can grasp[9] is here concluded;
So are all paths that words can take here barred.'

§ 9. *Khuddaka-Nikāya, Khuddaka-pātha,*[10] *ch. iv* (*Kumāra-pañhā*).[11]

Q. What is the one (or unity)?[12] A. All beings (*sattā*)[13] existing by food.

Q. What are the two? A. Name and form (*nāman ca rupam ca*).[14]

Q. What are the three? A. The three feelings (*vedanā*).[15]

Q. What are the four? A. The four noble truths.[16]

Q. What are the five? A. The five grasping-aggregates (*pañc' upādāna-kkhandhā*).[17]

Q. What are the six? A. The six personal perceptive organs (*ajjhattikāni ayatanāni*).[18]

Q. What are the seven? A. The seven parts of wisdom (*bojjh-aṇgā*).[19]

[1] Ap. A 1 *a*, n; Ap. A 2 *a*, *Note*.
[2] The rhythm of the present version is based on Oldenberg's translation. See SBE, x, p. 189; PTS, pp. 206–7.
[3] Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (4). Cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (17) n; and Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [2] n (*ether*).
[4] 'Goes out', SBE, x, p. 189. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 10 [1].
[5] *Muni*; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (1). Cp. § 3 [7] above.
[6] Or, separate existence; *nāma-kāya*. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2); see § 9 below.
[7] Literally, non-existent.
[8] 'Is he ever free from sickness?' SBE.
[9] Literally, all thought.
[10] The 'Brief Instruction' constitutes the first book of the fifth Nikāya. Ap. A 1 *a*, n.
[11] Questions for children or novices. Ch. 7 *b* § 4 [92] n; Ch. 8 *i*. Cp. also Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (*precepts*).
[12] See *Note* above. The answer shows that this unity is not a person; it is all living beings, united by the mysterious bond of life. Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n; and Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [4], [8] (*beings*).
[13] Ch. 5 *a* § 6; see in 'the nine' below. Cp. Ap. G 2 *b*.
[14] The intangible and tangible *khandhā*; see § 8 above.
[15] i.e. the painful, pleasant, and indifferent sensations, all of which are transient. Ch. 9 *a* § 3; Ap. E *c* i § 3 [28].
[16] Ch. 9 *a* § 9. Ap. G 1 *a* § 1. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [6] (*meditations*).
[17] i.e. the composite personality. Ch. 5 *b* § 5; Ch. 9 *a* § 6; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7] n.
[18] Including the mind. Ch. 9 *a* § 7; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2). See Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7], footnote to Six.
[19] Ch. 9 *a* § 8; Ap. G 1 *b* § 4.

Q. What are the eight? A. The noble eight-fold path.[1]

Q. What are the nine? A. The nine abodes[2] of beings[3] (*satt-āvāsā*).

Q. What are the ten? A. It is said 'the saint (*araha*)[4] is attended[5] (*samannāgato*) by ten qualities[6] (*aṅgehi*).

§ 10. *Khuddaka Nikāya, Dhammapada, verse 5.*[7]

Never here through enmity are enmities appeased;
But by non-enmity they are appeased: this is the primal Law[8] (*dhammo sanantano*).

b. Personifications of Power,[9] Evil, &c.; Māra,[10] the Tempter

[*Note.* The source of the ill-regulated thoughts and passions which arise unwelcomed in the mind, perhaps especially in a mind stirred and rendered sensitive by religious fervour, must be to those who are conscious of them a frequent subject of wonder. It seems natural to attribute them to a malicious Spirit, the personification of evil, as the Canonical Books frequently do.[11] In the first of the following extracts the Buddha answering a question replies that Māra, the principle of destruction, is found wherever the constituents of individuality are found; in other words transience and discord abide in individuality, in selfishness, and egoistic desire.[12] This extract seems clearly to define the Buddha's attitude. In the second and much later passage the very names of the three daughters of the Tempter show that these dread figures are mere personifications of mean vices.[13] The habit of personification and the mythopoeic faculty are inherent in man's nature as is shown in all men's speech and writings, and stored-up myths are always ready with examples and supplementary surmises. To these sources of darkness may be added the occult relations[14] which appear between minds made unhealthy or sickly by undue self-

[1] Ending in self-transcendence. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8); Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [7]; Ap. F 2 *d*.

[2] Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [8]. These are enumerated in *Dīgha* 33 (iii. 2; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n) a discourse attributed to Sāriputta (Ch. 7 *a* § 18), very late in tone and highly complex; and also in the 'nines' in *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, iv, p. 401). The nine 'abodes' are those of individual men and spirits liable to deterioration, spirits of the Brahma-body (Int. § 93, vi), spirits of radiance, spirits of brightness, unconscious spirits, and beyond these the four states which succeed the four Trances, and of which the last is that of neither consciousness nor non-consciousness (Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 22 *b* § 26; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175] n.

[3] See 'one' above.

[4] Ap. D *c*.

[5] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1]; Ap. I *b* § 6 [22].

[6] These are voluminously set forth in *Dīgha* 33 (iii. 3; Ch. 13 *a* § 3 [4] n) and summarized in SBE, xiii, p. 141 n. In *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, v, p. 209) it is stated that the Arahat must be free from lust, enmity, delusion, anger, ill-will, pretence, spite, jealousy, greed, and pride. Cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 2; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [9]; Ap. F 2 *a*; also Ap. G 1 *b* § 5. Are these stated more briefly in the *Khuddaka-pātha* itself?

[7] As in Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (5).

[8] Of unity, continuity, and altruism; Int. § 55; also Int. § 28.

[9] Int. § 70 (*spheres*); IN 8 *a*; Ch. 1 § 9 [59] n; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 26 n, 28 [3] (*sky*). Ap. A 2 *d* (*Spirits*); Ap. D *c* § 4.

[10] Int. §§ 69, 93 (iv); Ch. 10 *c* [5] (50) n, (59) n; Ch. 12 *c* § 7 [5]; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 12 [1] n, 13 [3]; Ap. D *a* §§ 2, 3; Ap. H 3 *a* § 2; Ap. I *a* § 1 [175]. Cp. Yama (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [25]).

[11] A division of the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* is named the *Māra-saṃyutta*; and another is called the *Yakkha* (Int. § 93, vii; Ch. 8 *d* § 6; Ch. 10 *d* 1 n) or Ogre Division, being devoted to minor dangerous local spirits who were confronted with the Dhamma.

[12] See § 1 below.

[13] See § 2 below.

[14] Ap. I *b*.

development, self-concentration, self-consciousness, or self-distrust, and to which the busy, kindly, healthy, mind is habitually impervious. These indeed belong to the province of the pathology of the self.[1]]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Saṃyutta Nikāya, Khandha-vagga, Rādha-Saṃyutta (Sam. ii), Sutta 1 (Māra) 3–8.*[2]

[3] . . .[3] ' "Māra, Māra", is said. Now how far, revered sir, is there a Māra?' [4] 'Where there is material-form (*rūpe*),[4] Rādha, there is Māra,[5] or the destroyer of it, or further that which is destroyed. Therefore, Rādha, do thou regard material-form as Māra, or regard it as the destroyer, or regard it as that which is destroyed, as a disease, as a tumour,[6] as a dart, as suffering, as the essence of suffering (*agha-bhūtan-ti*). They who see it thus see rightly. [5] Where there is feeling-faculty . . .. [6] Where there is perceiving-faculty. . . . [7] Where there is individual-will (*saṃkhāresu*). . . . [8] Where there is knowing-faculty (*viññāne*), Rādha, there is Māra, or the destroyer of it, or further that which is destroyed. Therefore, Rādha, regard it as Māra . . .[7] as the essence of suffering. They who see it thus see rightly.'

§ 2. *Jātaka Commentary, Introduction (Nidāna-kathā). JN, p. 78.*[8]

Craving (*Taṇhā*), Dislike (*Aratī*),[9] and Desire (*Ragā*), the three daughters of Māra,[10] said: 'Our father is not to be seen. Where now is he?' Looking for him they saw him writing dejectedly on the ground. Going up to their father they asked 'Why art thou, dear father (*tāta*), sorrowful and dejected?' 'Dear ones (*ammā*),'[11] he answered, 'this great devotee transcends my power; watching him for so long a time I cannot see a defect in him; therefore am I sorrowful and dejected.' [p. 79] 'If so,' they replied, 'think no more; we will have him in our power, and return bringing him.' . . . Approaching the Blessed One they said 'We are thy hand-maids,[12] O devotee.' The Blessed One neither paid attention to their speech nor opened his eyes to look at them.

c. *Gotama's Opponents; contemporary thought*[13]

[*Note*. Generalizing very freely one may say that prior to the time of the Buddha the development of Hinduism may be divided into three

1 Ap. D (*Egoism*).
2 The Scene is Sāvatthi. Ch. 18.
3 The venerable Rādha addresses the Buddha.
4 Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [38]; Ap. E *a* ii (*Khandhas*).
5 Literally, the destroyer, death. Thus Māra is merely the principle of transience, which is the main characteristic of the *Khandhā*; in other words, of individuality, which separates the transient self from the One, or of Selfishness which divides the individual from the whole. See *Note* above, and Ap. B *c* § 1 (1).
6 A painful excrescence. Cp. Marcus Aurelius, ii. 16 (Int. § 114).
7 As in [4] above.
8 Ch. 4 § 6 n. Cp. *Kindred Sayings*, i, p. 156; *Sutta-Nipāta*, SBE, x, p. 154.
9 Hate or hostility; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii). 'Discontent', BBS, i.
10 The Destroyer. See *Note* above. On the daughters see Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [2] n. For the personifications compare Ap. A 2 *d* [21] (*Agni*); also the names of Gods in Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [25].
11 Int. § 190 (*address*).
12 Literally, foot-servants.
13 Int. §§ 6, 7 n, 19; IN 8; IN 13; Ch. 2; Ch. 5 *c* § 1 n; Ch. 7 *a* § 2 (*jatila*); Ch. 8 *a* [4] n; Ch. 8 *k* [1]; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93] n; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 29; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 4 [1], 8 [1], 10 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* §§ 5 [1. 15], 7 [227];

stages, which in reality interpenetrate each other. The first stage is the Vedic or naturalistic, in which are worshipped the great nature-gods[1] behind whom is seen vaguely a universal divine creative impersonal power. In this stage the individual soul is taken for granted with little if any speculation as to its immediate origin, but speculation as to its future has given rise to theories of heavens[2] and hells[3] and limbo. In limbo the souls of the departed are supported by the prayers and offerings given in ancestor-worship[4] by their living descendants. The tree and serpent worship[5] of this stage is doubtless a survival from an earlier indigenous animism.[6] The second stage is the transmigrational[7] in which the vague speculation as to the origin of the individual soul has led to the conclusion that the total number of souls was created in the beginning by Brahmā the Creator and that these migrate from form to form and from age to age through all vicissitudes towards the highest heaven and either eternal existence there or ultimate re-absorption along with all the Gods in the impersonal creative power underlying all. The doctrine of transmigration seems to have been non-Brāhmanical in origin[8] and is markedly dualistic in character. The third stage is the Vedāntic,[9] in which the phenomenal world and the transmigrations of the soul cease to be material and become ideal or a process of divine thought. The ultimate triumph of Hinduism in India shows the enduring strength of the Brāhmanic religious philosophy, which had become a monistic idealism, comprehending and transcending a realistic polytheism, teaching the ethical and personal dogma of transmigration, enforcing caste discipline and daily ritual, and tolerating or favouring spirit worship and magical rites. Where it has encountered them in prolonged conflict, the reasoned self-transcendence of Buddhism has been overcome by the disciplined hierarchy of caste and by the fervour of monotheism. With other opponents it has met and compromised.]

Vedic ritualists; ascetics; practisers of Yoga.

The Brāhmanical sacrifices[10] were largely magical in character, and their object was personal advantage whether mundane or supra-mundane. A

Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [481]; Ch. 12 *d* § 2 [11]; Ch. 12 *e* § 11 [2]; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 13 *c* § 8 [2]; Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [11]; Ch. 22 *c* § 9 (6) n; Ap. C *b* § 7; Ap. E *c* i § 5 [5]; Ap. G 1 *a*, *Note*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 4 [3]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 4 n; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 [1]. See also *Paribbājakā* (Int. § 126), *Titthiya* (Int. § 179, *Six*), *Brāhmans* (Int. § 185), and *Samaṇa-brāhmaṇā* (Ch. 14 *f* § 4 [2]). See OB, pp. 190–200 (*Buddhas Gegner*); RDBI, pp. 140–6 and ch. xiii; Eliot, *H. and B.*, i, pp. 95–100, ii, pp. 291–317; ThB, pp. 129–31, 184–5, 193, 199–202. For a concise and clear survey see Pt. III (*Contemporary Systems*) in A. Coomaraswāmy's *Buddha and the Gospel of Buddhism*, 1916 (1928).

1 Ap. A 2 *d*.

2 Ap. B *a* § 6 (7).

3 Ap. B *a* § 7.

4 Ch. 9 *b* § 4. Cp. Int. 134; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [5].

5 Int. § 93 (vii); Ch. 4 § 1.

6 Ch. 13 *c* § 17 n; Ap. A 2 *d* (*animistic practices*). Animism recognized the divinity in natural objects; it failed to recognize with Gotama the unity of that divineness (Ap. G 2 *a*, *Unity*).

7 Ap. B *a* (*saṃsāra*).

8 Cp. Eliot, i, pp. lv, 94, 73–4, 76, 88. King Ajātasatru of Kāsi (Int. §§ 158–3, 162) and King Janaka of Videha, with whom the theory is first associated, were apparently early chiefs of the Eastern clansmen.

9 Int. §§ 8 n, 97; Ch. 5 *c* § 5 n; Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] n; Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26] n; Ap. D *b* (*Māyā*); Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Māyā*).

10 See § 1 below; Ch. 7 *a* § 8. In *Mahā-vagga*, VI. XXXV. 8, *Majjh.* 92 and the *Sela-sutta* of the *Sutta-Nipāta*, it is stated that 'The forefront of [Brāhmanical] oblations to Agni is the sacrifice; the Sāvitthi is foremost in sacred verse'. The Sāvitthi is the famous Sāvitri hymn to the principle of light in *Ṛig Veda*, III. lxii. 10.

more spiritual effort emerged in asceticism[1] or the sacrifice of the external self, and the austerities of Gotama before his enlightenment are examples of this movement. Higher than these was the endeavour to attain by some form of idealistic, intellectual, or spiritual union (*yoga*)[2] to religious insight or knowledge,[3] and by this intellectual movement the age of Buddhism is marked.

Six orthodox Brāhmanized views.[4] The six great orthodox schools (literally 'views') of Hindu philosophy may not have been fully developed, but seem to have existed in sufficiently distinct forms, in the Buddha's time. Of these the first pair, comprising Vedānta, or the *Uttara Mīmāṃsā*,[5] and its ceremonial basis the *Pūrva Mīmāṃsā*, are in their theoretical part monistic and idealistic; the second pair, comprising Sāṇkhya[6] and its ascetic application in (psychic non-Vedāntic) Yoga, are dualistic; the third pair, comprising the Vaiṣeshika[7] (analytical) philosophy with Nyāya its companion analysis of the laws of logic, are pluralistic and materialistic. The order in which these are here placed is not necessarily that of time, but the *Pūrva* (old) *Mīmāṃsā*, which sets forth the Vedic ceremonial, is doubtless the starting point from which the rest proceed. Vedānta and Vedāntic are names which may be applied comprehensively to the literature and period immediately following the Vedic period. The names, however, belong more especially to the speculative books which express the monistic idealistic philosophy drawn by genius from the hymns and ritual of the Vedas. It is sufficiently established that some part of this literature existed before Gotama's day. The great contribution[8] of Buddha to religious philosophy is the clear teaching that selfishness or individualistic desire is the cause of sorrow; and the corollary of this is his insistence that the individual or self is transient.[9] It is not, as the Vedāntists teach, ignorance that is the root-cause of sorrow and ill, but ignorant desire; it is not the reality of the individual self that is to be doubted but the inflated importance attributed to it. To Gotama, moreover, the many have real importance in their universal relation to each other[10] and towards the One. The dualistic theory of mind and matter was the fundamental doctrine of the Sāṇkhya philosophy. The frequency of the question put to Gotama by his opponents as to whether the soul was or was not the same as the body,[11] shows that the subject was familiar to the times. The Vaiṣeshika materialistic and pluralistic philosophy regards the soul as subtle matter, and all matter as finally resolvable into atoms. It finds the fundamental substance to be not one but the many. By its acceptance of the doctrine of the transmigration of the soul it was brought within the scope of Brāhmanical orthodoxy. It has been maintained, though unconvincingly, that its first great exponent Kaṇāda[12] preceded the Buddha. Buddhism, which

[1] Int. §§ 183 (*Ājīvaka*), 187 (*ascetics*); Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ch. 13 *d* § 5 [387]; Ch. 18 *c* § 3 [3]; Ch. 21 § 11 [33] (4) n; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Māyā*).
[2] Cp. § 2 (i) [4] below.
[3] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 (*Dhamma-cakkhum*); Ap. D *b* (*avijja*); Ap. F 2 *a* (132, *pañña*).
[4] Cp. § 2 below.
[5] Cp. Ap. I *b* § 6 (*vīmaṃsā*).
[6] Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*thought*); Ap. I, *Note*. Cp. Int. § 178 (*yoga*); and Ch. 21 11 [33] (4) n; Ch. 22 *b* § 26 (9) n (*yoga*).
[7] Cp. § 3 (i) [27] below; IN 10 n; Ch. 12 *e* § 13 [133] n (*lokāyata*).
[8] Ap. G 1 *b*.
[9] Ch. 5 *c*.
[10] Ap. F.
[11] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).
[12] Eliot, *H. and B.*, p. 292; Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, p. 305.

is often regarded as based on the Sāṇkhya philosophy, is rather a development of both Vedānta and Sāṇkhya, being both monistic and realistic in that it accepts the reality of the visible universe and finds a fundamental unifying force in it. It is a question whether Gotama borrowed from early Sāṇkhya or Sāṇkhya borrowed from Buddhism. Gotama appears to have been familiar with dualism and also with idealistic monism, and to have endeavoured to synthesize these in his own realism or substantialism, which finds the divine principle or substance in all individuals, and all individuality transient. In the ultimate analysis all things are not the divine mind but the divine substance. Beyond finding the divine fundamental and eternal principle to be universal and harmonious, and declaring the origin of all discord to be in transient individuality he refuses to speculate. But this synthesis presupposes an examination of both dualism and monism, and it may be added of pluralism, at any rate in their rudiments. Pluralism in the spiritual world was a main tenet of Jainism, the most active opponent of early Buddhism.

Six unorthodox non-Brāhmanical teachers.[1] The most controversial of Gotama's opponents were Pūrana Kassapa, Makkhali Gosāla, Ajita Kesakambalin, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya Belaṭṭhiputta, and Nātaputta. These unorthodox Hindu opponents of Gotama ignored, as he did, the Vedas and caste, but did not all reject the theory of rebirth. They included materialists, fatalists, nihilists, and sceptics, and in all these respects were repugnant to the Buddha. It is important to notice how much their opinions resembled, as well as how much they differed from, the teachings of Gotama. The greatest of these non-orthodox opponents of Gotama was undoubtedly Nāta-putta the Nigaṇṭha,[2] whose sect, which has been identified with the Jains, has outlasted that of the Buddha in India. The Nigaṇṭhas ignored the Vedas and caste, as did Gotama. They believed in the fundamental duality of mind and matter and in the eternal plurality of souls. They accepted the theory of rebirth, but to them *karma*, the cause of transmigration, was a material substance, a subtle element of corruption, ultimately to be eliminated. These views were rejected by Gotama except the belief in moral consequence or responsibility, which is implied in his teaching of the continuity of evil and of good.[3] According to the Nigaṇṭhas that which passes on is matter, and matter is the foundation of evil; according to Gotama that which passes on is influence, and the root of evil is desire; whereas the Vedāntists taught that what transmigrates is ignorance, and that ignorance is the basis of ill, in an illusory world. It is difficult to see, apart from mere externals, what differences of internal principles divided Buddhists from Jains after Buddhism had accepted the doctrine of transmigration, except as regards the theory of that which was liable to transmigrate and the tendency of Buddhism to monism (later to idealistic monism) as opposed to the dualism of the Jains. When once the canonical books of the two sects had been composed these differences might suffice as a cause of quarrel, but during the lives of the two founders

[1] See § 3 below; Int. § 179; Ch. 8 *a* [1]; Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [13]; Ch. 9 *c*; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 n; Ap. C *b* § 9; Ap. H 2 *a* § 3. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1] where the *titthiya* leader Sañjaya is termed a *paribbājaka* (wanderer). In *Saṃ. Nik.* (i, p. 68) the six are termed *samaṇa-brāhmaṇā* (Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]); cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] n.

[2] Int. § 184; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13] n; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92]; Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [1]. Cp. Ap. B *a* § 4 n (*actions*).

[3] Ap. B *b*.

this was not the case and apart from the doctrine of rebirth no sufficient cause of grave and prolonged dispute appears. Jainism in its long intercourse with Hinduism has retained its fundamental and distinctive principle of dualism. Buddhism, when it lost sight of its original doctrine of pure, disinterested, and Stoic altruism,[1] retained no guiding principle capable of resisting the idealistic monism of Vedānta and the personal adoration of *bhakti* in medieval Indian philosophy and religion. Stoicism, when once it had merged the earthly 'city of God'[2] into the unorganized realm of self-culture and self-sufficiency, retained nothing that could resist the other-worldly thought and emotion of early Christianity.

Six Buddhist dissentients.[3] Six is also the number of the opponents of Gotama within the Buddhist Saṃgha, but these necessarily only appear in the later years of his life. They are the opponents of his administration, such as must arise in any sect or congregation, and their opposition and practices gave occasion to new rules recorded from time to time in the *Vinaya*.

Steps towards Bhakti[4] (*adoration*) *and emotional Hinduism.* The warmth and glow of Buddhist ethical feeling seems to have influenced the growth of *bhakti* or religious adoration, which has since characterized the Hindu beliefs. It is markedly different from the earlier ritual respect paid to unseen powers. Bhakti is the union of the inward self with a divine person, whereas Vedānta and Buddhism teach union with an impersonal divinity. The period of the great Epics which celebrate the exploits of heroic incarnations of divinity, shortly followed the age in which the philosophic religious systems of Vedanta and Buddhism originated and first flourished. The glow in Buddhism helped to kindle the fire in the *Bhagavad-gita*,[5] just as Buddhism owes much of its intellectual radiance to *Vedānta*. That great poem, in discussing the means to salvation, elevates adoration above works and knowledge. In it the rapture of adoration has replaced the rapture of self-transcendence in the Buddha's threefold 'comprehensive statement' of his teaching.[6]]

§ 1. *Vedic*[7] *rites and sacrifices.*[8]

(i) *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I. xix. 1.*[9]

At that time the matted-haired ascetic Uruvela-Kassapa's great sacrifice (*mahā-yañño*) drew near, and a vast concourse of Aṅgas[10] and Magadhas[11]

[1] Int. § 3; cp. Int. §§ 9, 22 n.

[2] Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, iv. 23, and ii. 16, iii. 11, iv. 3, 4, 29, v. 22, vi. 44, x. 6, 33, xii. 36; see IN 10.

[3] Ch. 8 *c* § 3; Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note* (*Chabbaggiya*). Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 14 n; Ch. 15 *b* (ii); and Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]; also Ch. 8 *l* § 4 [2] n.

[4] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [6] n.

[5] Cp. Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, p. 220.

[6] Ch. 20.

[7] Ch. 11 *a* §§ 2 n, 3 n; Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [12] n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8; also Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] (*sutta*). In the *Sela-Sutta* of the *Sutta-Nipāta* there is an analysis of Vedic learning, comprising apparently the Three Vedas, ritual (as a fourth code) and exegesis 'as a fifth', with grammar and disputation and the knowledge of signs. This is repeated in *Majjh.* 91 (Ch. 12 *e* § 13).

[8] See *Note* above; Int. §§ 185 (*ritual*), 190 (*priesthood*); Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *sīlabbata-paramāsa*); Ap. H 1, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 9 *b* §§ 1 [2], 4; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [4] n; Ch. 11 *d* § 13 [1] n.

[9] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 n.

[10] Int. § 146.

[11] Int. § 158.

were desirous of attending it, bringing solid and soft food.[1] Then to Kassapa . . . this thought came: 'My great sacrifice now draws near. . . . If the great devotee (*mahā-semaṇo*) should perform a marvel before the crowd . . . my gain and honour would decrease. The great devotee then shall not come to-morrow.' . . .

(ii) *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, I. xxii. 4.*[2]

'What hast thou seen, dweller in Uruvela, that thou, called the Emaciated, hast abandoned Agni?
I ask thee, Kassapa, the meaning of this. Why hast thou abandoned the fire-sacrifice?'

'Sacrifices promise material-things and things heard and savours and sensual delights.
In regarding these supports[3] (*upadhīsu*) I perceived "This is dross"; therefore have I no pleasure in sacrifice or oblation.'

2. *Brāhmanic orthodox views.*[4]

(i) *Sutta Piṭaka, Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 13* (*Tevijja Sutta*),[5] *2–5.*

[2] At that time many very well-known and much-attended[6] Brāhmans were staying at Manasākata,[7] namely Caṇki, Tārukkha, Pokkharasāti,[8] Jāṇussoṇi, Todeyya,[9] and other . . . Brāhmans.[10] [3] Then a discussion arose between Vāseṭṭha and Bhāradvāja,[11] whilst they pursued their walk and meditated as to the [true] path and the false path. [4] The youth[12] Vāseṭṭha said thus: 'This indeed is the straight path; this direct road guides and leads the practiser to union with Brahmā (*Brahma-sahavyataya*),[13] this is announced (*akkhāto*)[14] by the Brāhman Pokkharasāti.' [5] The youth Bhāradvāja said thus: 'This is the straight path . . . announced by the Brāhman Tārukkha.' . . .[15]

(ii) *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 1* (*Brahmajāla Sutta*),[16] *I. 29–II. 30.*

[I. 29] There are, mendicant brothers, some religious-teachers (*samaṇa-*

[1] Int. § 190 (*food*); Ch. 6 *a* § 12 [4]. When limiting or prohibiting the killing of animals Asoka (Ap. G 1 *c*) mentions numerous forms of animal food (V. Smith, *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 56).

[2] As in Ch. 7 *a* § 12 [4].

[3] i.e. of the desirous self.

[4] See *Note* above. For the learning and claims of the Brāhmans see also *Dīgha* 4 (*Soṇadaṇḍa-s.*) and *Sutta* 95 (*Caṇki-sutta*) of *Majjh. Nik.* (Ch. 14 *f* § 7 n). *Saṃyutta* viii of *Saṃ. Nik.* is directed against the Brāhmans and their rites.

[5] Ch. 14 *d* § 6; Ap. G 1 *a* § 8.

[6] Literally, with large halls; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 18 [1].

[7] Int. § 149 (*a*).

[8] Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [9] n, [13]; Ch. 14 *d* § 4.

[9] Ch. 11 *c* § 21 n. Buddhaghosha's commentary on these names is given in SBE, xi, pp. 167–8. The five names recur in *Majjh.* 98 and *Sutta-Nipāta* (PTS, p. 115). See Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [201] n.

[10] Mention is made later of the Addhariya, Tittiriya, Chandoka, Chandava, and Brahmacariya Brāhmans. Int. § 185; Ap. F 2 *c*.

[11] Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1]. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 2 [2].

[12] *Mānava*; a youth of the Brāhman caste. Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [91].

[13] Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [14]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [78]. Cp. *Note* above (*yoga*); Ch. 1 § 11 (*yoga-kkhema*); Ch. 3 § 5 [164], [165]; Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [9] n; Ap. I, *Note* (*yoga*); and Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [199] (*kusala*).

[14] Ap. G 1 *a* § 6 [3].

[15] They refer their dispute to Gotama.

[16] Ch. 23 *b* § 8; Ap. A 2 *d*; Ap. E *c* i § 2. *Brahma-jāla* means Brahma Net or net to catch all mistaken views on Brahma (*Brahman*; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2 [37]). It would appear that all these views err either in making the self (soul) a separate durable

brāhmanā)[1] . . . theorizing on the past, who hold erroneous views,[2] and these regarding the past (*pubbantaṃ*)[3] expound divers systems in 18 ways. . . .

[30] There are some religious teachers who believe in eternity (*sassata-vādā*)[4] and announce an eternal (*sassataṃ*) self[5] (*attānañ ca*) and world[6] (*lōkañ ca*) in four ways. . . .[7]

[II. 1] There are some religious teachers partly eternalists and partly non-eternalists who announce a self and world in one respect[8] (*ekaccaṃ*) eternal and in one respect non-eternal in four ways. . . .[9]

[16] There are some religious teachers, finite-ists and infinite-ists, who announce the end or no-end (*ant'-ānantaṃ*)[10] of the world in four ways. . . .[11]

[23] There are some religious teachers, eel-like twisters,[12] who in every direction, when they are asked a question, perform speech-twisting and eel-twists in four ways. . . .[13]

[30] There are some religious teachers, uncaused-originationists, who announce a self and world originating without cause (*a-dhicca-samuppannaṃ*)[14] in two ways. . . .[15]

§ 3. *Titthiya (unorthodox Hindu) philosophers.*[16]

(i) *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 2 (Sāmaññaphala-suttanta),*[17] *17–33.*

. . .[18] [17] 'Pūrana Kassapa[19] spoke thus to me: ". . . By the doer[20] (*karoto*)

individual (see *Saṃ. Nik.*, iv, p. 287) or in propounding a dualistic, pluralistic, or materialistic cosmogony, or in being sceptical on all points. The outline of the discourse may be Gotama's; the numbers and confused details may be attributed to scholastic expansion.

1 Ch. 13 *d* § 4; Ch. 22 *b* § 15; Ap. A 2 *d* [21].

2 Pāli *pubbant'-ānu-diṭṭhino*. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20] (*wrong-outlook*); Ch. 20 § 8.

3 'The beginning of things', ThB, p. 200. Cp. Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [5]; Ap. B *c*.

4 Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1). Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 18 n (*kiṃ-vadin*).

5 Or, soul. Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [3]; cp. Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*).

6 'Universe', ThB.

7 These four opinions are transmigrationist. The first three are due to delusion of memory carried back through varying cycles of transmigration (Ch. 4 § 17 n; Ap. B *c* § 1, 1). The fourth declares an eternal (*sassato*) self and world and states that 'these beings (*sattā*, i.e. souls) recur, transmigrate (*saṃsaranti*, Ap. B, *Saṃsāra*), pass, and arise; but it (*tv' eva*, i.e. the world) exists for ever.

8 'In some respects', ThB.

9 The first three opinions attribute permanence to Brahmā or the gods and impermanence to the individual soul (see Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, p. 40). The fourth 'holds that the sense-organs form an impermanent, changeable ātman, but that there is also a permanent ātman not liable to change called thought, mind, or consciousness'. (ThB, p. 201.)

10 Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (2).

11 These four views are that the world is finite, infinite, both finite and infinite, or neither finite nor infinite. For the logical formula cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).

12 'Some wriggle like eels', ThB.

13 These include those who fear to err and other less innocent sceptics. 'Sañjaya of the Belaṭṭha clan appears in Sāmaññaphala Sutta [*Dīgha N.*, PTS, i, p. 59] as expounding these precise views' (Keith, *B.P.*, p. 41). See § 3 (i) [32] below; Int. § 182. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13] (*doubt*); Ap. D *a* §§ 8 (ii, *vicikicchā*), 9 (iv).

14 See § 3 (i) [26] and [32] below; and Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n. Cp. Ap. B *c*; Ap. G 2 *a* (*Unity*).

15 The first of these opinions is due to a delusion of memory during the long course of transmigration. The second is due to erroneous reasoning.

16 See *Note* above; cp. Ch. 14 *a* § 7 (*teachers*). See also the *Sandaka Sutta* of *Majjh. Nik.* (PTS, i, p. 513) and the 'Fives' of the *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, iii, p. 383). The first four of these philosophers are definitely 'non-moral' or 'unethical'; the sixth is indefinitely so; the fifth is individualistic. The views of the first four are somewhat differently distributed in the *Sanḍaka-s*.

[For notes 17–20 see next page.]

evil (*pāpaṃ*)[1] is not done. . . . From generosity, from self-control, from self-restraint, from truth-telling, there is no merit[2] (*puññaṃ*), there is no result of merit." Thus, revered sir, Pūrana Kassapa on being questioned by me regarding the visible fruit[3] of devotion expounded [the doctrine of] disbelief in [responsibility and reward for] action (*a-kiriyaṃ*).[4] . . .'

[20] Makkhali-Gosāla[5] spoke thus to me: 'There is, Mahārāja, no cause (*hetu*), there is no condition (*paccayo*)[6] for the impurity (*saṃkilesāya*) of beings. . . . There is no cause, there is no condition for the purity of beings. . . . All beings . . . powerless[7] . . . experience pleasure and pain. . . . Having transmigrated (*saṃsaritvā*)[8] they make an end of pain.' [21] Thus Makkhali-Gosāla on being questioned . . . expounded [a doctrine of] purification by [mere] transmigration.[9] . . .'

[23] Ajita Kesa-kambalin[10] spoke thus to me: 'There is no gift, there is no sacrifice, there is no offering, there is no fruit or effect[11] of actions well-done or ill-done,[12] this world is not, there is not a world beyond (*paro loko*).[13] . . . A man consists of four great elements[14] and when he dies the earth [in him] returns to earth,[15] the water returns to water, the fire returns to fire, the air returns to air, his faculties[16] (*indriyāni*) pass into space[17] (*ākāsaṃ*). . . . Both fools and wise in the breaking up of the body are dissolved (*ucchijjanti*) and perish; after death (*param maranā*)[18] they are

[17] Discourse on the fruits or use of devotion (Ch. 11 *c* § 23; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [13] n); cp. Ap. A 2 *d* n. The scene is laid at Rājagaha, in the mango-grove (*Amba-vana*) of Jīvaka the Prince's attendant (*Komāra-bhacca*). The meaning of the second name of this famous physician (Int. § 190, *medicine*; Ch. 10 *c*, 69; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [1]; Ap. H 2 *b* § 1) is uncertain; the gossiping commentarial explanation is incorporated (IN 6, *Canon*) in *Vinaya Piṭaka*, MV, viii, i (see SBE, xvii, p. 174 n; also KM, pp. 29, 30). The Prince was Bimbisāra's son Abhaya (Int. § 168).

[18] King Ajātasattu (Int. § 168) inquires of Gotama regarding the use of devotion, and informs him of his visits to other teachers.

[19] Int. § 179; Ch. 22 *b* § 15. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513] n.

[20] Cp. Ap. D *b* § 3; Ap. E *c* i § 9; also Ap. B *b*.

---

[1] Ap. D (*Evil*).

[2] Or, virtue. 'Increase of merit', Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, p. 137. Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]; Ap. E *c* ii § 6 (122).

[3] Or, practical use.

[4] 'His theory of non-action', SBB, ii, p. 70; 'The doctrine of non-action', ThB, p. 129. As a fatalist he believed in the continuous consequences of actions, but not in the two other parts of the Karma doctrine, namely moral responsibility and personal reward. Ap. B *b* § 3 [2].

[5] Int. § 183. See also Ch. 12 *c* § 5 [3] n; cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513] n; and Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n (*cause*).

[6] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[7] 'Without inherent force', Keith, *B.P.*, p. 97.

[8] Ap. B (*Saṃsāra*).

[9] This is a doctrine of *saṃsāra* without moral responsibility; Int. § 4. 'Merely by transmigration, not by any action of the individual', ThB, p. 130.

[10] Int. § 179; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]. His denial of the reality of phenomena is not idealistic but materialistic (Ap. D *b* § 3). Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 9 [401] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513] n.

[11] *Vipāka*; Ch. 14 *c* § 4 [8]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [190]; Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42]; Ap. E *c* i § 9, 2nd verse. Cp. Ap. B (*Results of Action*).

[12] 'No fruit of good or evil deeds', Keith, *B.P.*, p. 97.

[13] See [32] below; Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169]. Cp. Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*nothingness*).

[14] Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [421]; Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6]; and Ch. 10 *c* (45). The formal resemblance to Marcus Aurelius, *Meditations*, iv. 5 is notable (IN 10, *Stoicism*).

[15] Literally, 'the body of the earth', &c. See [26] below.

[16] 'Senses', Keith, *B.P.*, pp. 94, 135. Ap. E *c* ii § 2; cp. [26] below.

[17] Or, the ether. Ch. 22 *b* § 26; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174]; and Ch. 22 *b* § 28.

[18] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

not.' [24] Thus Ajita Kesakambalin on being questioned . . . expounded the doctrine of dissolution[1] (*uccheda-vādaṃ*). . . .

[26] Pakudha Kaccāyana[2] spoke thus to me: 'There are seven uncreated (*a-katā*)[3] bodies[4] (*kāyā*), unmade, unconstructed, without a builder (*a-nimmātā*), bare, standing like peaks, firm as pillars. These neither move nor change nor affect each other at all to the pleasure or pain or both of one another. What seven? Earth,[5] water, fire, and air,[6] with pleasure and pain[7] and life[8] (*jīva*) making seven. . . . Thus there is no[9] slayer or inciter to slaying, hearer or speaker, knower or explainer [but only a combination of elements]. . . .' [27] Thus Pakudha Kaccāyana on being questioned . . . expounded one thing by[10] another. . . .

[29] Nāta-putta the Unfettered (*Nigaṇṭho*)[11] spoke thus to me: 'Here (*idha*)[12] the "unfettered" is restrained[13] by fourfold[14] control or restraint.[15] . . . He is restrained at every turn, stopped at every turn, shaken at every turn, and influenced at every turn.[16] . . . Because the unfettered is controlled by four restraints and controls he is called "unfettered", self-perfected and self-controlled and steadfast. [30] Thus Nāta-putta the Unfettered on being questioned . . . expounded restraint by fourfold control. . . .'

[32] Sañjaya[17] Belaṭṭhi-putta spoke thus to me: 'If thou askest me, Is there a world beyond (*paro loko*)?[18] . . .[18] Are there beings arising spontaneously?[19] . . . Is there fruit and result of good and bad actions?[20] . . . Does the Tathāgata[21] exist after death?[22] . . . I should answer: I do not think in this way [in set terms]; I do not think it is so, and I do not think it is

[1] Or, annihilation (i.e. of the soul). Ap. E *c* i § 2 [9]. 'His theory of annihilation', SBB, ii, p. 74.

[2] Int. § 179; Ch. 14 *b* § 3 [5]. Cp. Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513] n.

[3] Ap. G 2 *a* § 7. Cp. § 2 (ii) [30] above.

[4] 'Permanent substances', Keith, *B.P.*, p. 136.

[5] Literally, 'the body of the earth', &c. See [23] above; cp. IN § 10 n.

[6] Ch. 10 *c* [4] (45).

[7] Or, soul, i.e. the sensations. Cp. *indriyāni* [23] above. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

[8] Cp. Ap. D *b* § 3; also Ap. B *b*.

[9] Perhaps 'by the side of, separated from', as atoms. Cp. *Note* above (*Vaiṣeshika*).

[10] Int. § 184; Ch. 11 *d* § 6; Ap. B *a* § 5; Ap. H 4 *b* § 1 n. See (ii) below. In [28] the king addresses Nātaputta as Aggivessana; Ch. 11 *c* § 29 n. For Gotama's criticism of the Jain doctrines see also *Majjh. Nik.*, S. 14 (*Cūla-Dukkhakkhandha-s.* in Ch. 9 *c* § 1).

[11] Ap. E *c* i § 8 [9].

[12] The word is *saṃvuta*; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [93].

[13] There is allusion to the manifold prohibitions of Jainism. The obscurity of the passage is apparently due to sarcasm. Cp. 'Restrained as regards all water; restrained as regards all evil; all evils has he washed away; . . . suffused with the sense of evil held at bay', SBB, ii, p. 74; resists evil with every form of resistance, is absorbed in resisting evil, has shaken off evil by resistance, and is instinct with the spirit of resistance to evil', SBB, v, p. 270 (*Majjh.* 56).

[14] 'Restraints in four directions', ThB, p. 130.

[15] The terms are not clear, but refer apparently to Jain precautions against Karma.

[16] Int. § 182; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Note* (*Māyā*); see § 2 (ii) [23] above. Cp. IN 10 n.

[17] See [23] above; Ap. B.

[18] Omitting: Is there not a world beyond? Is there a world beyond and no world beyond? Is there neither a world beyond nor no world beyond? 'Sañjaya . . . seems as an agnostic to have been the first to formulate the four possibilities of existence, non-existence, both and neither', Keith, *B.P.*, p. 303. (Ap. E *a* ii § 4, 2 n.) Sañjaya found none of these four possible positions tenable. This negativism Gotama found intolerable in the ethical, not in the metaphysical, field (Ap. G 1 *a*, ii).

[19] See § 2 (ii) [30] above; Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 n (*diṭṭhi*).

[20] Ap. B *b* § 1 (*actions*); Ap. F 1 *c* (*Good*). Cp. Ch. 22 *a* § 9 [42] (*vipāka*).

[21] This term in Sañjaya's speech reported by the King can scarcely have meant the Buddha, and seems to apply to any follower of righteousness. Ap. A 2 *c*; cp. Ch. 10 *a* § 8 [7].

[22] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1).

otherwise; I do not affirm that it is not so, and I do not deny that it is not so.' [33] Thus Sañjaya Belaṭṭhi-putta on being questioned . . . expounded distraction[1] (*vi-kkhepaṃ*). . . .[2]

(ii) *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 29* (*Pāsādika-suttanta*).[3]

[1] Thus was it heard by me. At one time the Blessed One stayed among the Sakkans (*Sakkesu*)[4] in the storied-building (*pāsāde*)[5] in the mango-grove of the Sakyans named Vedhaññā.[6] Now at that time Nāthaputta[7] the Nigaṇṭha had recently died at Pāvā.[8] On his death the Nigaṇṭhas were split and divided in two,[9] disputing, quarrelling, contending, and continued attacking each other with recriminations. . . . Those who were householders (*gihī*), lay (*odāta-vasanā*)[10] disciples of the Nigaṇṭha Nāthaputta, became indifferent (*nibinna-rūpā*),[11] detached from and opposed to the [ascetic] followers of the Nigaṇṭha Nāthaputta,[12] as being under a wrongly-proclaimed (*du-r-akkhāte*),[13] ill-taught doctrine and discipline.[14] . . .

[1] 'Show(ed) his manner of prevarication', SBB, ii, p. 75.

[2] Gotama explains the general outlook of the Buddhist convert (Ch. 15 *b* §§ 1 [1], 2 [513] n) and sets forth the nature of the four Jhānas (Ap. I *a*) as experienced by the adept and the advantages accruing therefrom, culminating in liberation from the Āsavas (Ap. D *a* § 7).

[3] Ch. 13 *c* § 24 n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 1.

[4] Int. § 148 (ii).

[5] Int. § 190.

[6] 'The Sakyan family named the Archers', Rhys Davids, *Dialogues of the Buddha*, Pt. III, p. 111.

[7] Or, Nātaputta; Ch. 13 *c* § 25. See § 3 (i) [29] above.

[8] Int. § 148 (i).

[9] These doubtless were the more moderate Svetāmbara (white-clad) and the more ascetic Digāmbara (sky-clad) sects of the Jains.

[10] Ap. H 4 *b* § 2 [2]. Literally, white-robed; cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 13 [1].

[11] Ch. 5 *c* § 4.

[12] *Nātha-puttiya*; the monkish ascetic disciples of Nāthaputta. Cp. Ch. 7 *c* § 2 [7].

[13] Ch. 5 *c* § 8. All Jains considered that rebirth ultimately released the individual soul from the bondage of matter. The sects differed as regards necessary austerities; Int. § 184.

[14] Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 12 *c* § 10 [68].

APPENDIX H

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter* 8)

THE SAṂGHA;[1] ITS RULES AND GOVERNMENT

1 The Pātimokkha[2] Ceremony: Uposatha[3] (Fast Day), Profession of Faith and Confession of Sins

[*Note.* The *Pātimokkha* rules are given in the *Vinaya Piṭaka*, embedded in a very voluminous Commentary.[4] The *Vinaya Piṭaka*[5] consists of three main parts—Part I comprising the two *Sutta-vibhaṅgā* or Rules-analysis; Part II comprising the *Khandhakāni* or Divisions of the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga*; and Part III comprising the *Parivāra* or Supplement. The two Vibhaṅgas contain rules of morality and conduct, or rather a classification of transgressions requiring confession. The Khandhakas, comprising the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga*, contain administrative resolutions, those in the *Culla-vagga* being closely connected with the administration of the rules in the Vibhaṅgas. In the *Mahā-vagga* and *Culla-vagga* reference is made from time to time to 'the two Pātimokkhas',[6] into which the whole of the rules are divided. These apparently correspond with the rules in the two Vibhaṅgas, the first comprising the *Pārājikā, Saṃghādisesā, Aniyatā, and Nissaggiyā Pācittiyā* rules,[7] while the second contains the remaining rules, possibly of later date. Distinction is also drawn between those rules which deal with morality and those which deal with conduct,[8] that is to say between the *Pārājika* and *Saṃghādisesa* rules and those of minor importance. A main distinction is also drawn between the *Pārājikā* (expulsion) section and the *Pācittiya* (penance) section.[9] The four *Pārājika* rules along with the Introductory Formula constitute the essential portion of the *Pātimokkha* Recital,[10] which should strictly be recited, whilst the rest might be omitted at times of danger; and thus are clearly the nucleus of the rules. The rules amounted ultimately to 220, or 227 including the *Adhikaraṇa-samathā*, which are not strictly rules.[11]

The *Pātimokkha* recitation is the chief feature of the *Uposatha* service.[12] In the *Mahā-vagga* account of the origin of that service great stress is laid upon the discourse[13] which was to explain the nature of the *Dhamma*. This discourse implies an instructive public profession of faith, not a mere

[1] Ch. 8 (A).
[2] Ch. 8 *b*; Ch. 8 *j* § 7 n; Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [9] n. See KM, pp. 74–5.
[3] See (*a*) below; Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 15 *b* § 11[i. 4] n; Ch. 19 *b* § 8 [17]; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]; Ap. H 4 *b* § 12.
[4] Int. § 14; IN 6 (*Canon*); Ch. 8 *b* § 3 n; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2.
[5] Int. § 13. Cp. Ch. 23 *b* § 7 [7] (*ubhato-vinaye*).
[6] Ch. 8 *b* § 5 n. *Mahā-vagga I*, xxxvi. 14; *Culla-vagga IV*, xiv. 19, *IX*, v. 1; see SBE, xiii, pp. xviii, xxix.
[7] Ch. 8 *b* § 7 [1] n. Otherwise, '"the two Pātimokkhas" (i.e. for monks and for nuns)', ThB, p. 275; Ch. 9 *c* § 3 (*Mahā-vibhaṅga*).
[8] *Mahā-vagga IV*, xvi. 12; SBE, xiii, p. 184 n.
[9] SBE, xiii, p. ix.
[10] *Mahā-vagga II*, xv. 1 (Ch. 8 b § 7).
[11] Ch. 8 *b* § 7 n.
[12] Ch. 8 *b* § 2.
[13] Ch. 8 *b* § 1. On lunar (*Uposatha*) Buddhist observances and lay attendance thereat in Tibet and Mongolia, see *The Gods of Northern Buddhism*, A. Getty. 1914 (Introduction tr. fr. the French of J. Deniker, pp. xxxviii-xl).

recital of the Rules of the Order or a confession by monks; and indeed the public were excluded from such confessions.[1] No summary positive profession of faith is set forth in the *Mahā-vagga* account. Such, however, may perhaps be found in the Three Refuges of the Ordination Service,[2] which were on occasions expanded.[3] A negative summary is provided by the four *Pārājika* rules,[4] which form the nucleus of the existing *Pātimokkha*, and by the Ten Prohibitions[5] set forth in the Ordination Service. That a positive teaching was originally provided is indicated not only by the *Mahā-vagga* account but by the third rule of the mendicant sisters,[6] requiring them on *Uposatha* day twice a month to listen to a sermon (*ovāda*) by a member of the assembly of mendicant brothers. It is to be noted that *Uposatha* day was utilized by the Emperor Asoka[7] for the publication and repetition of his pious and ethically admirable Edicts to his subjects in the districts, and that therefore the public must have been present at some part of that day's service, though not necessarily at the *Pātimokkha* recital. Clearly the present *Pātimokkha*, which is a private and specific confession of sins,[8] would not satisfy the popular demand for an explanation of the Doctrine. The confession must have been succeeded or preceded by a public religious discourse, which being of a variable form has dropped out of the formal record. The whole service was evidently of a simple, non-ritual character. The Puritanical simplicity of early Buddhist religious observances is notable. Religious ritual[9] was avoided by the new sect or, so far as rendered necessary by custom, was left to Brāhmans, as still in modern Buddhist Siam the chief part in religious ceremonies is played by nominal Brāhmans or Bakus.[10]

The signification of the word *Pāti-mokkha* is highly complex. The root meaning of the principal part of the word is 'liberation', and the prefix is adversative. In the root meaning may be found the ideas of a state of liberation or purification, an act of purification or confession, a state from which one must be freed of sin, and the act of freeing or absolution; whilst the adversative prefix introduces the idea of compulsion or binding rule. The ancient commentarial meaning, namely that which is foremost, is connected with another root, signifying 'face' or 'fore-front'. Possibly all these meanings are combined in the Buddhist mind.

The organization of the observance of *Uposatha* day[11] is elaborately set forth in *Khandhaka II* of the *Mahā-vagga*, which may be summarized thus:

Chs. i–iii. Origin of the *Uposatha* Ceremony.

Ch. iv.[12] The *Pātimokkha* not to be recited every day, but on *Uposatha* day, once each half-month, on the 14th or 15th day.

[1] See § 2 below. [2] Ap. H 2. [3] See (*c*) below. [4] Ch. 8 *b* § 6.

[5] Ch. 8 *d* § 5; cp. § 6 [8] below. Of these Prohibitions the first four correspond closely with the four *Pārājika* rules, and with the first four *Sīlāni* (Ap. H 4 *a* n). In the Hare Birth-story the observance of *sīla* (duty) is practically equivalent to the keeping of the *Uposatha* service (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2), thus it may be gathered that public recitation of the Sīlas, and possibly instruction on them, formed part of that day's service. [6] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4]; see Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [2], and *ch. xxxvi* below.

[7] Minor Pillar Edict I (Sāranāth), V. A. Smith's *Asoka*, 2nd ed., p. 195; Ap. G 1 *c*.

[8] See (*b*) below. [9] Ap. G 2 *c* § 1.

[10] See H. G. Q. Wales, *Siamese State Ceremonies* (1931), p. 60.

[11] Ap. H 3, *Note* (MV 2).

[12] Cp. chs. xiv, xxxiv. Breaches of this and the following rules are *dukkaṭa* (ill-deed) offences; or, in very serious cases, *thullaccaya* (grave-transgression) offences. See § 2 below. Contrast Ch. 8 *b* § 7 (*Pārājika*).

Ch. v. The *Uposatha* service to be held unitedly, i.e. as far as one 'residence' (district)[1] extends.

Ch. vi. The *Saṃgha* to determine the boundary of each 'residence' (district).[2]

Ch. vii. The boundaries[3] to be three yojanas[4] in extent at most; no boundary to extend to the opposite side of a river, unless there be a regular ferry-boat or causeway.[5]

Ch. viii. The *Pātimokkha* to be recited in a regular place appointed; never two *Uposatha* halls to be in one district.

Ch. ix. The *Saṃgha* to determine the size of the *Uposatha* hall.

Ch. x. The Elders (*Therā*) to assemble first.

Ch. xi. The *Uposatha* to be held in one place.

Chs. xii, xiii. Boundaries.[6]

Ch. xiv. 'There are two *Uposatha* [services], that of the 14th and that of the 15th [of the shorter and longer half-months respectively].'[7] All *Uposatha* services to be held lawfully and by complete congregations.

Ch. xv. Abridgements of the *Pātimokkha*; allowable only in cases of danger.[8] Questions about the *Vinaya* to be put and answered only by duly appointed persons.

Ch. xvi. On reproofs, authorized and unauthorized. The *Pātimokkha* to be recited audibly; and not before laymen.[9]

Ch. xvii. Cases of ignorance of the *Pātimokkha* among communities of Bhikkhus.

Ch. xviii. Reckoning by days of the half-month. Counting the Bhikkhus.

Ch. xix. The Elder (*Thera*) of the community to proclaim the *Uposatha* day in due time.

Ch. xx. The *Uposatha* hall to be swept; seats to be placed; lamp, drink, and food to be provided.[10]

Ch. xxi. Cases of ignorance of *Uposatha* day and *Pātimokkha*.

Ch. xxii. Cases of absence for sickness at times of *Uposatha*. 'Uposatha is not to be held by an incomplete assembly'; an absentee must send his declaration of *pārisuddhi*[11] (purity) by deputy.

Ch. xxiii. Cases of absence for sickness at times when the *Saṃgha* meets to transact business; an absentee must send his assent (*chanda*) by deputy.

Ch. xxiv. Similar provision in cases of absence under compulsion.

Ch. xxv. The insane to be certified and excused.

Ch. xxvi. Cases of communities of less than five.[12]

Ch. xxvii. Cases of offence on the very day of *Uposatha*,[13] or of doubtful offences, or of offence remembered during the *Uposatha* ceremony, of offences in common (not confessed in common but individually),

[1] See ch. vi.
[2] See chs. v and vii; Ch. 8 (*f*).
[3] See chs. vi, xii, xiii.
[4] Ch. 2 § 7.
[5] Or, bridge. Int. § 189 (*transport*).
[6] See ch. vii.
[7] See ch. iv above and § 1 below.
[8] Ch. 8 *b* § 7 [3]; *ch. xxxv* below.
[9] See *ch. xxxvi* below.
[10] See § 4 below; Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2].
[11] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]. It seems clear that confession was to be made individually before the *Uposatha* day. Thus the threefold question in the *Nidāna* (Ch. 8 *b* § 3) is formal. The point of the *Pātimokkha* is the declaration of the Rules and of conformity thereto.
[12] Four was the regular quorum for *Uposatha*. Cp. *Mahā-vagga IX*, iv (Ch. 8 *e* § 5); also Ch. 8 *d* § 3.
[13] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1] n.

and of offence committed by a whole *Saṃgha*; in no case is there to be any hindrance to holding *Uposatha*.

Ch. xxviii. Cases of inadvertent lateness.

Chs. xxix–xxxiii. Incomplete *Uposatha*.

Ch. xxxiv.[1] Fixing the date of *Uposatha* with incoming Bhikkhus sharing *Uposatha* with resident Bhikkhus. 'In case, O Bhikkhus, the resident Bhikkhus count the day as the 14th (of the *pakkha*), the incoming Bhikkhus as the 15th; if the number of the resident Bhikkhus is greater,[2] the incoming Bhikkhus ought to accommodate themselves to the resident Bhikkhus. If their number is equal, the incoming Bhikkhus ought to accommodate themselves to the resident Bhikkhus. If the number of the incoming Bhikkhus is greater, the resident Bhikkhus ought to accommodate themselves to the incoming Bhikkhus.'[3]

Ch. xxxv. Journeys on *Uposatha* days, not permitted except with a sufficient number to compose a *Saṃgha*, or in cases of danger,[4] or when arrival in time for an *Uposatha* ceremony is possible.

Ch. xxxvi. The *Pātimokkha* not to be recited before a Bhikkhunī,[5] a *sikkhamānā* (woman-student), a *sāmaṇera* (novice),[6] a *sāmaṇerī*, &c.[7]

Rules for exclusion[8] from the *Pātimokkha* ceremony are given in *Khandhaka IX* of the Culla-vagga, and are summarily as follows:

cap. i. The Buddha causes an offender to be expelled from the *Pātimokkha*.[9]

cap. ii. The Buddha authorizes the form of exclusion from the *Pātimokkha*.

cap. iii. Illegal and legal inhibitions from the *Pātimokkha*.

cap. iv. Conditions under which a Bhikkhu may take upon himself the conduct of an accusation. Five necessary conditions: (1) right time, (2) the accusation must be just, (3) it must tend to advantage, (4) probability that the accuser's associates will support the case in accordance with *Dhamma* and *Vinaya*, (5) the *Saṃgha*, as a result of the case, shall not fall into strife.[10]

cap. v. Conditions under which a Bhikkhu may warn another.][11]

a. *Uposatha* (*Observance Day*)[12]

§ 1. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka II, xiv*[13]

[1] Then the thought came to the Bhikkhus: 'How many *Uposatha* [services][14] are there?' They reported the matter to the Blessed One. He

[1] See *ch. iv* above.

[2] Ch. 8 *e* § 7.

[3] SBE, xiii, p. 291. Difficulties in determining new-moon day are familiar in the East.

[4] See *ch. xv* above.

[5] See *Note* above.

[6] Or, probationer. Ch. 8 *d* § 5.

[7] See *ch. xvi* above and § 3 below.

[8] Ap. H 3, *Note* (*CV* 9).

[9] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]. '. . . H. O[ldenberg] has already pointed out (in his 'Buddha', p. 381, note 2) that we have evidently here a later innovation. The whole frame of the *Pātimokkha* shows that it was at first intended that a guilty Bhikkhu should confess his offence during the recitation, if he had not done so before', SBE, xx, p. 306 n.

[10] Ch. 16 *b*.

[11] The instructions in these last two chapters are addressed by Buddha to Upāli (Ap. A 1 *b*, sloka 3) in his rôle of Vinaya-dhara (keeper of the Discipline); they are particularly wise and beautiful, and may well be attributed to Gotama himself.

[12] See *Note* above and § 4 below.

[13] See *Note* above (*ch. xiv*).

[14] 'Uposatha (days)', SBE, xiii, p. 258. Ch. 8 *a* [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]. Cp. Ch. 8 *c* § 5; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1).

replied: 'There are two *Uposatha* [services], that of the fourteenth and that of the fifteenth [of the shorter and longer half-months respectively]; these, mendicant brothers, are the two *Uposatha* [services].' . . .

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga II, xvi.*[1]

[8] At that time Devadatta[2] recited the *Pātimokkha* at a meeting (*parisāya*) where there were laymen.[3] They reported the matter to the Blessed One. He replied: 'The *Pātimokkha* must not be recited, mendicant brothers, at a meeting where there are laymen; he who so recites it is guilty of a grave offence (*dukkaṭassa*).'[4]

§ 3. *Mahā-vagga II, xxxvi.*[5]

[1] The *Pātimokkha* must not be recited at a session (*nisinna-parisāya*) before[6] a mendicant sister;[7] he who so recites it is guilty of a grave offence.[8] The *Pātimokkha* must not be recited . . . before a woman-student,[9] nor before a male novice,[10] nor before a female novice, nor before one who has disavowed the discipline[11] (*sikkhaṃ paccakkhātakassa*), nor before one guilty of an extreme offence (*antima-batthuṃ*)[12]. . . .

b. Confession of Sins[13]

4. *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society (1875); J. F. Dickson's paper on the Pātimokkha ceremony under the Ceylon Kamma-vācā (Formulary of Procedure).*[14]

'The chapter was held in the Sīmā[15] or consecrated space in the ancient Lohapāsāda or Brazen Palace, in the city of Anurādhapura. . . . The colossal stone pillars alone remain. . . . At the back of some dozen or more of these gigantic pillars were stretched pieces of white calico, to form the sides of the room: the ceiling in like manner was formed by stretching white calico[16] above the pillars to conceal the shabby roof, the bare ground was covered with clean mats, two lamps gave a dim light. . . .

'Accompanied by a friend, I went to the chapter-house about seven o'clock in the evening; we were met at the door by the priests, who showed us to the places prepared for us—two cushions on the floor at the bottom of the room, at a distance of about two fathoms from the place reserved for the priests. The ordinances of Buddha require that all persons who

[1] See *Note* above.
[2] Ch. 19 *a*.
[3] The Pāli word for 'layman' here used is *gahaṭṭha* (householder). Ch. 81.
[4] See *Note* (*ch. iv*) above. Ch. 7 *b* § 8 [6]; Ch. 8 *c* §§ 3 [2], 4 [13]; Ch. 8 *i* § 2 [4]; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2]; Ap. H 2 *a* § 2; Ap. H 2 *b* § 2 [4]; Ap. H 3 *b* (*Penalties*); Ap. H 4 *c*; Ap. I *b* § 1 [2]. Cp. § 3 below.
[5] See *Note* (*ch. xxxvi*) above; Ch. 8 *g* § 6.
[6] Literally, 'to'.
[7] Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii) n.
[8] Ap. H 4 *c*.
[9] The grade of *sikkhamānā* was below that of *sāmaṇerī* (novice).
[10] Or, probationer, who had received the first ordination only. Ch. 8 *d* § 1 (*pabbajja*) n.
[11] Or, training. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1]; Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [3] n.
[12] Cp. § 2 above.
[13] See *Note* above.
[14] Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), 405 ff. For *kamma* (procedure) see Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3]; Ch. 8 *e* § 5; Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1]; Ch. 19 *b* § 8 [17]; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]; SBE, xiii, pp. xx, xxxvii. See also Int. § 58; Ch. 8 *b* § 5 n; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5; Ap. H 5, *Note*.
[15] Bounds. Ch. 8 *f* § 2.
[16] Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [11] n.

are not ordained priests, free at the time from all liability to ecclesiastical censure, shall keep at a distance of two and a half cubits[1] from the assembled chapter. It was on my pointing out that this was the only direction of Buddha on the subject, that the priests consented to make an exception in my favour, and to break their rule of meeting in secret conclave.[2]

'After we were seated the priests retired two and two together, each pair knelt down face to face and made confession of their faults,[3] one to another, in whispers. Their confessions being ended, they took their seats on mats[4] covered with white calico, in two rows facing each other. The senior priest, the seniority[5] being reckoned from the date of ordination, sat at the head of one row, the next in order at the head of the opposite row, the third next to the senior priest, and so on right and left down the room. The senior priest remained sitting, the others knelt and made obeisance to him, saying: "Permit me. Lord, give me absolution from all my faults committed in deed, or word, or thought."[6]

'The senior then says: "I absolve you, brother. It is good to grant me absolution." All reply: "Permit me. Lord, I absolve you." The second in order of seniority now resumes his seat, and all his juniors[7] kneel and receive and give absolution . . . and so on, till no one has a junior present. . . . After all are seated, they fall together on their knees and say: "Praise be to the blessed one, the holy one, the author of all truth". . . .[8]

'The priests here rise from their knees and resume their seats. The senior, or some other deputed in his stead to officiate, then takes a seat at the top between the two rows. The interrogatories[9] are then proceeded with. . . .

'The interrogatories being ended, the Pātimokkha is intoned. . . . The text . . . will be found divided into ten chapters, as follows: I. Interrogatories relating to the requisites for forming a chapter. II. The Introduction. III. The four deadly sins. IV. The thirteen faults involving temporary separation from the priesthood. V. The two undetermined offences. VI. The thirty faults requiring confession and absolution, and involving forfeiture of the article in reference to which the offence has been committed. VII. The ninety-two faults requiring confession and absolution. VIII. Four offences requiring confession. IX. The seventy-five rules of conduct. X. The seven rules for settling cases. The whole is sometimes known as the two hundred and twenty-seven precepts.'[10]

[1] See below (*interrogatories*).

[2] See § 2 above. 'The recitation of the Pātimokkha is regularly performed [in Camboja] and I have several times witnessed it. All but ordained monks have to withdraw outside the Sīmā stones during the service', Eliot, *H. and B.*, vol. iii, p. 130.

[3] These were evidently formal statements of purity, the detailed confessions having been made beforehand. Ch. 8 *b* § 3.

[4] Ch. 11 *d* § 15 [2]; cp. Ch. 13 *b* § 2 [92].

[5] Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1].

[6] Ap. B *b*, *Note*; and Int. § 25.

[7] Ch. 8 *c* § 4 [14]; Ch. 8 *g* §§ 2, 3.

[8] As in § 5 below.

[9] See Baynes, *The Way of the Buddha* (1914), pp. 76–9. The Interrogatories are questions regarding the preparedness of the room, seats, lights, and such details (see *Note* above, *ch. xx*), followed by questions regarding the season, the purity, and number of those present, &c. The *Puccha-vissajjana* (question and reply) includes a statement that 'there are present no persons whom it is proper to keep at a distance of two and a half cubits', namely laymen, novices, &c. (see above).

[10] Ch. 8 *b* § 7; Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [1] n; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [6].

c. *Profession of Faith; the Three Refuges*[1]

§ 5. *Extract from J. F. Dickson's paper*[2] *on the Pātimokkha ceremony: the three Refuges, according to the Ceylon Kamma-vācā.*

'We believe in the blessed one, the holy one, the author of all truth,[3] who has fully accomplished the eight kinds of supernatural knowledge[4] and the fifteen holy practices,[5] who came the good journey which led to the Buddhahood, who knows the universe, the unrivalled, who has made subject to him all mortal beings, whether in heaven or in earth, the teacher of gods[6] and men, the blessed Buddha. Through life till I reach Nirvāṇa[7] I will put my trust in Buddha.

I worship continually
The Buddhas[8] of the ages that are past,[9]
And the Buddhas of the ages that are yet to come,
And the Buddhas of this present age.

I have no other Refuge,
Buddha is the best Refuge;
By the truth of these words
May I conquer and win the victory.

I bow my head to the ground, and worship
The sacred dust of his holy feet.
If in aught I have sinned against Buddha,
May Buddha forgive me my sin.

'The Law[10] was graciously preached by Buddha, its effects are immediate, it is unlimited by time,[11] it is conducive to salvation, it invites all comers, it is a fitting object of contemplation, the wise ponder it in their hearts. Through life till I reach Nirvāṇa I will put my trust in the Law.

The Law as it has been in the ages that are past,
The Law that will be in the ages that are yet to come,
The Law as it is in this present age,
I worship continually.

I have no other Refuge,
The Law is my best Refuge;
By the truth of these words
May I conquer and win the victory.

1 See *Note* above; Int. § 115; Ch. 6 *a* § 7; Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3]; Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [3]; Ch. 15 *b* § 14 [11]; Ch. 21 § 16 n; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6) [489]; Ap. H 5 [92]. Compare *nissaraṇa*, escape (Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]). Cp. IN 5 *b* (*Essentials*).

2 JRAS (1875), viii, 62 ff. See § 4 above; Ap. H 5, *Note*.

3 'In him who has arrived at the knowledge of total truth', Baynes, *The Way of the Buddha*, p. 72. Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5; also Part I (title) n, *Buddha*.

4 Int. § 69 n; Ap. I *a* (*Higher Knowledge*); Ap. I *b* § 3 (*iddhi*) n.

5 Cp. Ap. F 2; also Ch. 9 *b* § 2 [3] (*fourteen*) and § 6 [5] below.

6 Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1 [2] n.

7 Ap. C.

8 Ap. A 2 *c*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *tathāgata*).

9 Int. § 49.

10 Part I (title) n.

11 Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14].

I bow my head to the ground and worship
The Law, the noble doctrine of the Three Baskets.[1]
If in aught I have sinned against the Law,
May the Law forgive me my sin.

'Buddha's holy Church,[2] the congregation of righteous men that lead a godly life, that walk in the straight way, in the way of wisdom, that walk faithfully in the four paths[3] of holiness, the eight orders[4] of the elect, worthy of offerings from afar, worthy of fresh offerings, worthy of offerings of the daily necessaries of life, entitled to receive the respectful salutation of joined hands raised in homage to the forehead, this holy Church produces merit[5] which, like unto a rich field, yields its increase for the benefit of this world of men. Through life till I reach Nirvāṇa I will put my trust in the Church.

The Church as it has been in the ages that are past,
The Church as it will be in the ages that are yet to come,
The Church as it is in this present age,
I worship continually.

I have no other Refuge,
The Church is my noble Refuge;
By the truth of these words
May I worship and win the victory.

I bow my head to the ground and worship
The Church, threefold and best.
If in aught I have sinned against the Church,
May the Church forgive me my sin.

Buddha and the Law, the Pacceka-buddhas,[6]
And the Church are my lords.
I am their slave.
May their virtues ever rest on my head.

The three refuges, the three symbols[7] and equanimity,[8]
And lastly, Nirvāṇa,
Will I worship with bowed head, unceasingly.
Thus shall I receive the benefit of that threefold Power.

[1] Ap. A 1 *a*.
[2] 'Brotherhood', Baynes, p. 74.
[3] Ap. G 1 *b* § 4. See § 6 [7] below (*four pairs*). Cp. *Dīgha-Nik*. 24 (PTS, iii, p. 5), and SBB, iv, p. 11 n.
[4] *Dīgha* 33 under the Eights. Cp. Ap. D *c* § 4 (*saintship*); 'The four pairs of men, the eight types of men', *Gradual Sayings*, ii, pp. 39, 65.
[5] Ap. B *a* § 6 [9], from which this encomium of the *Saṃgha* is drawn.
[6] Ch. 1 § 2.
[7] 'The three properties (tilakkhaṇaṃ) of existing things or of the phenomenal world are anicca, dukkha, anatta, or impermanence, suffering, unreality', Rhys Davids's *Pāli Dict.* (*lakkhaṇa*); Ap. E. 'Fa-Hsien describes the Buddhism of Ceylon as he saw it about 412 A.D. . . . the relics of Gotama's body were its chief visible symbols', Eliot, *H. and B.*, iii, p. 20.
[8] Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. Equanimity is the last of the four 'Sublime Moods or Illimitables' (Mrs. Rhys Davids, *Buddhism*, p. 218), the first three being love, pity, and sympathizing joy.

May the three refuges rest on my head,
On my head may there rest the three symbols.
May peace rest on my head,
May Nirvāṇa rest on my head.

I worship the Buddhas, the all-pitiful,
The Law, the Pacceka-buddhas;
The Church and the three sages[1]
I worship with bowed head.

I worship every saying
And every word of the Great Teacher.
I worship every shrine,[2]
My spiritual superior and my tutor.
By virtue of these feelings of reverence
May my thoughts be freed from sin.'

§ 6. *Sutta Piṭaka, Saṃyutta Nikāya, Mahā-vagga, Sotāpatti-saṃyutta* (*Saṃ. lv*), *Sutta 1* (*Rājā*), *5–7*. (*PTS, v, p. 343.*)

. . .[3] [5] 'Now, mendicant brothers, the true-disciple (*ariya-sāvako*)[4] is thoroughly in possession of clear-faith (*pasādena*)[5] in the Buddha, and he says:[6] "The Blessed One (*Bhagavā*) is the holy (*arahaṃ*),[7] supremely enlightened; who attained to wise living,[8] the well-farer[9] (*sugato*), the world-knowing (*loka-vidū*), the supreme driver[10] and tamer of man, the teacher (*satthā*) of spirits[11] and men, the Buddha, the Blessed One."

'[6] He is thoroughly in possession of clear faith in the Law, saying: "Well-taught (*svākkhāto*)[12] by the Blessed One is the Law; it is for this world (*sandiṭṭhiko*)[13] and for all-time (*a-kāliko*),[14] [saying]: 'Come and see (*ehi-passiko*),'[15] leading onwards (*opa-nayiko*);[16] it must be perceived by the wise, each by himself (*paccattam*)."[17]

[1] Cp. Ap. A 2 c (18). 'In southern Buddhist temples the pure white image of Maitreya is sometimes found by the side of Gautama's idol; and among the followers of the Great Vehicle, at least as early as the time of Fa Hian, 400 A.D., the worship of the two Bodhisatwas named Manju-śrī and Avalokiteṣvara, had already become general', RDB, p. 201.

[2] Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [7] n; also Int. § 134; Ch. 22 *b* § 4 [8] n.

[3] The scene is Sāvatthi (Ch. 14 *b*); Buddha speaks. Omitting a statement that a mendicant *ariyasāvaka* who possesses four things (*dhammā*; viz. the three Refuges and virtuous conduct) is liberated from rebirth in hell or as an animal or as a ghost or in any state of punishment (Ap. B *a* § 6 [8]). The subsequent eulogy of gifts to the Saṃgha shows the self-interested origin of much of the main passage as well as of the setting (IN 6, *Çanon*).

[4] Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]. See [8] below (*noble*).

[5] Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2] n; Ap. H 2 *b* § 4 [6]; Ap. I *b* § 5; also Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6]; Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [13]; Ch. 10 *c* (68); Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]; Ap. I *a* § 1 [174] (*clarity*); and Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1] (*believers*). Cp. Ch. 4 § 16; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 (*saddhā*); Ap. F 2 *a* (132); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [6]; Ap. I *a* (*Knowledge*); also Ch. 10 *c* (26). The four principles recur frequently in the *Sotapatti-saṃyutta* of *Saṃ.Nik.* (Ch. 14 *c* § 11 [3] n; Ch. 15 *u* § 11 [3] n) and elsewhere.

[6] Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]; Ap. H 2, *Note* (*Refuges*).

[7] Ch. 5 *b* § 10.

[8] Pāli *vijjā-caraṇā*. Cp. § 5 above.

[9] Ch. 21 § 16; Ap. E *b* § 2; cp. Ap. A 2 *c* (*Tathāgata*).

[10] Pāli *sārathi*. Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [2]; Ap. E *c* ii (222).

[11] Ch. 6 *b* § 1.

[12] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.

[13] Literally, belonging to the visible. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 6 [4].

[14] Ch. 8 *h* § 1 [14] (*immediate*) 'Passing not away', SBE, xi, p. 27. Cp. Int. § 49 (*kappa*).

[15] 'Welcoming all', SBE, xi, p. 27; 'Sie heisst, "Komm und siehe"', O.B., p. 387.

[16] 'Leading to salvation', SBE, xi, p. 27. It is *Nibbāna* to which the *Dhamma* leads.

[17] Ch. 21 § 16; Ap. E *c* ii § 3.

'[7] He is thoroughly in possession of clear faith in the Community, saying: "The Community of the disciples[1] (*sāvaka-saṃgho*) of the Blessed One walks in good conduct, the Community of the disciples of the Blessed One walks in straight conduct, the Community of the disciples of the Blessed One walks in lawful conduct,[2] the Community of the disciples of the Blessed One walks in right conduct;[3] that is the four pairs[4] (*purisa-yugāni*), the eight [kinds of] persons[5] (*purisa-puggalā*) [constituting] this Community of the disciples of the Blessed One; deserving of offerings, of hospitality, of gifts, and of salutation, it is the supreme field of merit[6] for the world."

'[8] He is in possession of the virtues (*sīlehi*)[7] beloved by the noble,[8] whole, intact, unstained, unblemished, emancipating, extolled by the wise, independent[9] (*a-parāmatthehi*), conducive to self-transcendence.[10]

'[9] He is in possession of these four things (*dhammehi*).[11] . . .'[12]

2. The Upasampadā[13] Ordination Ceremony and the Previous Pabbajjā[14] Ceremony

[*Note.* The *Vinaya-Piṭaka* records three stages in the development of the ordination ceremony. The first and simplest form is that used by Gotama himself and distinguished by the formula '*Ehi Bhikkhu*'.[15] The second form recorded is that used by the early individual missioners and distinguished, so far as externals are concerned, by exclusive insistence on the repetition of the formula of the three Refuges.[16] The third and final form of the ordination, superseding that used by individual missioners, required the sanction of a formal chapter[17] assembled at the local head-quarters of the Order. This third form is more detailed than the second

1 Ch. 7 *a* § 16; Ch. 8 *l*.
2 The prefix is *ñāya* (method or way). Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2]; Ap. G 1 *b* § 6.
3 Ch. 22 *b* § 2 [3]. The prefix is *samīcī*, derived from *sammā* (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]).
4 Cp. § 5 above (*four paths*); also Ch. 22 *b* § 16 (*fourth in degree*).
5 These are declared in Sutta 60 of the *Aṭṭhaka-nipāta* (Eights) of the *Aṅg. Nik.* (PTS, iv, p. 293) to be the Stream-attainer and one who has reached the reward of stream-attaining, the Once-returner and one who has reached the reward, &c., the Non-returner and one who has reached, &c., the Arahat and one who has reached arahat-ship. Ap. D *c* § 4. See also *Dīgha-Nik.* 24 (SBB, iv, p. 11).
6 Ap. B *a* § 6 [9].
7 Virtuous conduct; or rules of conduct. Ch. 20 § 7 (5). Cp. Ap. F; also Ap. H 1, *Note.*
8 Pāli *ariya.* See [5] above; Ch. 5 *b* § 5. Cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [7] (*wise*).
9 Or, disinterested. 'Untarnished by the desire of future life or by the belief in the efficacy of outward acts', SBE, xi, p. 27. The third fetter is *sīla-bbata-paramāsa* (Ap. D *a* § 8 ii).
10 The Pāli word is *samādhi* (Ap. F 2 *d*). 'Conducive to high and holy thought', SBE, xi, p. 27.
11 Ch. 12 *a* § 6 [2]; Ch. 13 *a* § 6. See Ap. G 1 *b*; cp. Part I (title) n; Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (6); Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [1].
12 Omitting a statement that the ruler of four continents is not worth a sixteenth part of one who possesses these four things (Ch. 11 *a* § 3 [17]; cp. Dhp. 70). The comparison is in marked contrast with the non-individualism of Ap. C *b* § 10 [1].
13 Ch. 8 *d*; Ch. 8 *e* § 5; Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [56]. See KM, pp. 77–9.
14 See *a* below; Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 8 *d* § 1. Cp. Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (10).
15 Ch. 5 *c* § 8. Cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [6] (*admitted*).
16 Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (6); Ap. H 1 § 6. There is mention of an earlier Dyad formula of refuge (Ch. 4 § 8 n; cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 13 [1]).
17 Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3] (*ñatti*).

and is still used by the Buddhist Order in Ceylon. In the Ceylon formulary,[1] however, a distinction is drawn between the *Pabbajjā* (going forth or renunciation) and the *Upasampadā* (admission) ceremonies. The latter ceremony includes the former, but the *Pabbajjā* ceremony is also held separately for the purpose of conferring upon qualified persons the rank of probationer or novice.[2] The necessity for this distinction doubtless arose when it became evident that a long probationary period[3] of instruction in the Doctrine was required, and also when the need arose to exclude[4] or expel[5] the unqualified and unfit. As will be seen the present form of *Upasampadā*-ordination in the Ceylon *Kammavācā* follows very closely the ancient lines of the *Vinaya-Piṭaka*. It is naturally the third or most developed formula which is used, not either the primitive formula adopted by the Buddha or that attributed to the early individual missioners.

The probationary period[6] between the two ordinations varied in length according to circumstances, it being eventually ruled that the minimum age for the *Pabbajjā* should be fifteen,[7] whilst the *Upasampadā*-ordination could not be conferred upon anyone less than twenty years of age.[8] A status of service or pupilage junior to that of the regular probationers seems to be indicated in the texts.[9]

The three Refuges, the formal recognition of which is the essential part of both ceremonies, are frequently mentioned[10] in the first four Nikāyas, but apparently not as part of a specific rite. Similarly the four Nikāyas use the terms *pabbajjā* and *upasampadā* frequently, but these are not precisely distinguished from each other or used with reference to a formal ceremony other than the personal call of the Buddha, excepting perhaps the account of the eight conditions imposed by Gotama when at last he was persuaded to admit Mahāpajāpati and her female companions to ordination.[11] This might be expected from the fact that the first four Nikāyas[12] claim to record only the discourses of the Buddha and a few of his greatest and earliest disciples.]

a. Admissions to the Order: the Pabbajjā Ceremony,[13] *the Ten Precepts,*[14] *and Parivāsa*[15] *or Period of Probation*

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga, Khandhaka I, liv, 3.*

[3] '. . . I sanction, mendicant brothers, a renunciation-ordination for novices[16] (*sāmaṇera-pabbajjaṃ*) with the three declarations of taking refuge.[17]

[1] See *a* § 5 and *c* below.

[2] The title of deacon sometimes applied to this stage seems scarcely appropriate in view of the youth of many of those undergoing probation.

[3] See *a* (*parivāsa*) below. Women were required to undergo training for two years (Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4], vi).

[4] Ch. 8 *d* § 6 (*impediments*).

[5] See *b* below.

[6] See *a* § 3 (*parivāsa*) below.

[7] MV, I, l.

[8] See *b* § 4 [6] below.

[9] MV, I, li; Ch 8 *g* (*grades*); Ap. H 2 *a* § 5.

[10] e.g. *Dīgha* 16 (MPS, iv, 34); *Majjh.* 72 (i, p. 489); *Saṃ. Nik.*, iv, p. 113.

[11] *Aṃg. Nik.*, PTS, iv, p. 276; Ch. 12 *b*.

[12] Ch. 23 *b* § 8; Ap. A I *a*, *Note* (*Suttanta-Piṭaka*).

[13] See *Note* above.

[14] Or, Prohibitions. Ch. 8 *d* § 5 below. Cp. the Eight Rules for Nuns (Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4]).

[15] See *Note* above. Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [28]; Ap. B *b* § 5; Ap. H 3 *b* § 1.

[16] Ch. 8 *g* and *i*.

[17] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [4]; see § 5 below. Cp. Ch. 21 § 8 [26]; Ap. E *c* ii § 4.

And it is thus, mendicant brothers, that the renunciation-ordination[1] should be conferred: [The candidate] should have his hair and beard cut off, assume the yellow robes, adjust the outer wrap over one shoulder, salute the feet of the mendicant brothers, sit upon his heels and raise his joined palms; then he must be told to say thus: "I come for refuge to the Enlightened, I come for refuge to the Law, I come for refuge to the Community, and so a second time . . . and a third time. . . ." I sanction, mendicant brothers, the renunciation-ordination for novices with these three declarations of taking refuge.'

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga I, 1.*

. . . 'Let not a boy (*dārako*) less than fifteen years old[2] receive the *pabbajjā*-ordination. If anyone [so] confers the *pabbajjā*-ordination he is guilty of a grave offence.'[3]

§ 3. *Mahā-vagga I, xxxviii.*

[1] . . . 'If anyone, mendicant brothers, has formerly belonged to one of the different philosophical schools[4] and desires the renunciation-ordination (*pabbajjaṃ* and admission (*upasampadaṃ*) under this doctrine and discipline, a probation-period (*parivāso*)[5] of four months must be given him. . . .[6] [3] And let him . . . approach the *Saṃgha* . . . and say: "I, revered sirs . . . desire admission under this doctrine and discipline; I ask the *Saṃgha*, revered sirs, for a probation-period of four months." . . .'[7]

§ 4. *Mahā-vagga I, xxxviii, 11.*

[11] . . . 'If any fire-worshipping (*aggikā*) matted-haired ascetics (*jaṭilakā*)[8] come, these must receive *Upasampadā*-ordination, and no probation period need be given them. For what reason? They hold the doctrine that actions have consequences (*kamma-vādino ete*), they are believers in [the effects of] action (*kiriya-vādino*).[9]

If, mendicant brothers, a Sākuyan[10] (*Sākiyo*) by birth formerly belonging to one of the different philosophical schools[11] comes, he must receive

[1] See Ch. 7 *b* § 7 [3] n.
[2] Cp. Ch. 1 § 8. See *b* § 3 below.
[3] Ap. H 1 § 2.
[4] The Pāli word used is *añña-titthiya*; Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [28]; and Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*teachers*). See § 4 below; Ch. 13 *c* § 3.
[5] See *Note* above; Ap. H 4 *b*.
[6] The first part of the ceremony is the same as that for ordinary probationers, see § 1 above.
[7] A formal proposal (*ñatti*), put three times to the meeting, follows as in Ch. 8 *d* § 1.
[8] Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [1]. The notable exemption here granted indicates a sympathy between early Buddhism and the doctrine of a divine eternal fire from which all things originate and to which all things return (Ch. 5 *c* § 7; Ap. G 2 *a*, *Unity*). The Jains (Int. § 184), in whose favour no exemption is here allowed, were associated with the doctrine of Karma, in the usual sense of that term, more closely than the fire-worshippers. The latter, as physical philosophers, must have accepted a Karma which was a law of harmonious, and not necessarily mechanical, unity and continuity of action. Gotama was opposed to the ritualistic Brāhmans (Ap. G 1 *a*; Ap. G 2 *c*) and to the worship of Brāhmanic or Vedic deities (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8), but he evidently sympathized with the prominent Brāhman sect which worshipped Agni, the divine universal principle of fire (Int. § 186). Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 5 [291] n.
[9] Ap. B *b* § 5, and Int. § 4.
[10] Or, Sakyan. Int. § 148 (ii); Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]. See also Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [28] (*distinction*).
[11] See § 3 [1] above.

Upasampadā-ordination, and no probation-period need be given him. This I grant as a special privilege to kinsmen.'[1]

§ 5. *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society (1874): J. F. Dickson's paper on the Ordination Ceremony under the Ceylon Kamma-vācā (Formulary of Procedure)*[2]*—the First Ordination.*

'To form a chapter for this purpose [i.e. the *Pabbajjā*-ordination] not less than ten duly ordained priests[3] are required, and the president must be of not less than ten years' standing[4] from his *Upasampadā*-ordination. . . . An examination and ordination is held on the full-moon day in Wesak,[5] and on the three succeeding Poya days, or days of quarters of the moon. . . . In the translation [of the Ordination service] I have placed in italics the rubrical directions in the text, and all explanations and amplifications of the text I have placed in square brackets. . . .

'Praise be to the Blessed One, the Holy One, to him who has arrived at the knowledge of all truth.[6]

'[The candidate, accompanied by his tutor,[7] in the dress of a layman, but having the yellow robes of a priest in his arms, makes the usual obeisance and offering to the President of the chapter, and standing says,]

'Grant me leave to speak. Lord, graciously grant me admission to deacon's orders. *Kneels down*. Lord, I pray for admission as a deacon. . . .[8] In compassion for me, lord, take these yellow robes,[9] and let me be ordained, in order to the destruction of all sorrow,[10] and to the attainment of Nirvāṇa. . . .[11]

'[The President takes the bundle of robes.]

'In compassion for me, lord, give me those yellow robes, and let me be ordained, in order to the destruction of all sorrow, and in order to the attainment of Nirvāṇa. . . .

'[And the President then gives the bundle of robes, the yellow band[12] of which he ties round the neck of the candidate, reciting the while the tacapañcakaṃ,[13] or formula of meditation on the perishable nature of the human body, as follows: kesā lomā nakhā dantā taco—taco dantā nakhā lomā kesā (hair of the head, hair of the body, nails, teeth, skin—skin, teeth, nails, hair of the body, hair of the head). The candidate then rises up, and retires. . . . While changing his dress he recites the following: In wisdom I put on the robes, as a protection against cold, as a protection against heat, as a protection against gadflies and mosquitoes, wind and sun,

[1] The advantages of facilitating the admission of men of solid and practical temperament were great, and Gotama may have thought himself justified in encouraging specially members of his own clan as a counterweight to the more subtle and ascetic Brāhmanic party in the Order. Int. § 22 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 3; cp. Ch. 22 *c* § 6 [21] n.

[2] Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), 394 ff. See Int. §§ 58, 63; Ap. H 1 § 4; Ap. H 2, *Note*; Ap. H 2 c § 1; Ap. H 5, *Note*; also Int. § 21.

[3] Ch. 8 *d* § 3.

[4] Ch. 8 *d* § 4.

[5] *Visākhā* or *Vesākha* (April–May). Ap. H 2 *c* § 2 (i); also Ch. 1 § 3 n.

[6] Ap. H 1 § 5. 'Total truth', Baynes, *Way of the B.* (1914), p. 57.

[7] Ch. 8 *g*; Ap. H 2, *Note*.

[8] Omitting double repetition.

[9] Ch. 6 *b* § 2. The bowl is not given till the second ordination.

[10] Ch. 5 *c* § 8.

[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17].

[12] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].

[13] Int. § 105; Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1] (*train*); Ch. 9 § 2 [5] n; Ch. 20 § 6 (3).

and the touch of serpents, and to cover nakedness,[1] i.e. . . . not for ornament or show. . . . He returns to the side of his tutor, and says,]

'Grant me leave to speak. I make obeisance to my lord. Lord, forgive me all my faults. Let the merit that I have gained be shared by my lord. . . .[2] Grant me leave to speak. Graciously give me, lord, the three refuges[3] and the precepts.[4]

'[He kneels down. . . . The tutor gives the three refuges and the ten precepts as follows, the candidate still kneeling, and repeating them after him. . . . The candidate says,]

'I have received these ten precepts. Permit me.

'[He rises up and makes obeisance to his tutor.]

'Lord, I make obeisance. Forgive me all my faults. May the merit[5] I have gained be shared by my lord. Give me to share in the merit of my lord. It is good, it is good. I share in it.'

'[This completes the ordination of a deacon, and the candidate retires.]'

b. Exclusions[6] from the Order; expulsion[7]

§ 1. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Mahā-vagga I, xxxix.*

[1] At that time five afflictions,[8] leprosy, tumour, eczema, consumption, and epilepsy, were prevalent among the Magadhans.[9] People affected by these five afflictions approached Jīvaka Komārabhacca[10] and said: 'Cure us, doctor (*ācariya*).' He replied: 'Sirs (*ayyo*),[11] I am very busy, I have many duties; Seniya Bimbisāra[12] the Māgadhan king must be attended by me, and the women of the palace (*itth-āgāraṃ*),[13] and the community of mendicant brothers headed by the Buddha;[14] I cannot cure you.' . . . [2] Then these men approached the mendicant brothers and asked for ordination (*pabbajjaṃ*). . . . The mendicant brothers attended them and Jīvaka Komārabhacca cured them. . . .[15] [7] Then the Blessed One . . . instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'The *Pabbajjā*-ordination must not be conferred on [a candidate] affected by [any of] the five afflictions. . . .'

[1] The necessity of clothing is emphasized by the Buddhist (Ch. 8 *d* § 2, 2), in opposition to the unsocial indifference of egoistic asceticism (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17], *middle road*).

[2] As in the closing formula below.

[3] See § 1 above.

[4] For references see Ap. H 2 *a* (headline) n.

[5] As above, here repeated. Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]. Contrast Buddha's teaching of non-individualism (Ap. C *b* § 10 [1]); the motive of acquiring merit must not be individualistic self-advancement.

[6] Ch. 8 *d* § 6 (*impediments*). In MV, 1, lxxi, thirty-two cases in which *pabbajjā* is forbidden are set forth, and in MV, 1, lxi–lxx twenty cases in which *upasampadā* is forbidden are stated.

[7] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 (*Pārājika*); Ch. 15 *b* §§ 11 [i, 1], 13 [1] (*suspension*); Ap. H 2, *Note*; Ap. H 3, *Note* (CV, 9); Ap. H 3 *b* (*Penalties*); see § 5 below. In MV, 1, lx, ten causes for expulsion of novices are stated. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [2] n; also Ch. 15 *b* § 12 [12] (*restore*).

[8] Ch. 8 *d* § 6.

[9] Int. § 158 (2).

[10] Int. § 190 (*medicine*); Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [34]; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) n.

[11] Int. § 190 (*address*); Ch. 4 § 2; Ch. 8 *a* [2]; Ch. 8 *j* § 8 [13]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 9 [8], 10 [9]; Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [2].

[12] If this 'connexion' can be relied on, the king's acceptance of the new religion must have been complete (Int. § 168).

[13] Int. § 190 (*women*); also Ch. 8 *j* § 1 [1] n; Ch. 11 *c* § 23 [9]; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [13].

[14] Ch. 7 *a* § 14 [17]. It is difficult to ascertain how early this title was given to Gotama by his followers (cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]).

[15] Omitting the consequent inconveniences and the return of one of these individuals to the world after being cured, and Jīvaka's report to the Buddha.

§ 2. *Mahā-vagga I, xl.*

[1] At that time the border[1] (*paccanto*) of the Māgadhan king Seniya Bimbisāra[2] was disturbed. Then the king . . . caused the high officers at the head of the army[3] to be assembled and said: 'Go now and clear[4] the border.' . . . [3] The high officers at the head of the army asked the [soldiers] in the king's service[5] (*rāja-bhaṭe*) saying: 'What now, the warriors so-and-so and so-and-so are not to be seen?' 'The warriors so-and-so and so-and-so, sir (*sāmi*),'[6] they replied, 'have been ordained[7] (*pabbajitā*) among the mendicant brothers.' . . . Then the king . . . asked the high legal officers (*vohārike mahāmatte*):[8] 'If anyone, now, ordains a [soldier] in the king's service, to what is he liable?' They replied: 'The instructor's (*upajjhāyassa*)[9] head,[10] lord (*deva*), should be cut off, the president's (*anussāvakassa*)[11] tongue should be torn out, half the ribs of those attending the chapter (*gaṇassa*) should be broken.'[12] [4] Then the king approached the Blessed One. . . . And the Blessed One . . . instructed the mendicant brothers saying: 'The *Pabbajjā*-ordination, mendicant brothers, must not be conferred on a [soldier] in the king's service. He who so confers it is guilty of a grave offence.'[13]

§ 3. *Mahā-vagga I, I.*

'Let not a boy less than fifteen years old', he said, 'receive the *pabbajjā*-ordination. . . .'[14]

§ 4. *Mahā-vagga I, xlix.*

[1] At that time there were in Rājagaha seventeen boys (*dārakā*) who were friends belonging to a group; at their head was the boy Upāli.[15] Now this thought came to the mother and father of Upāli: '. . . If Upāli should learn writing (*lekhaṃ*)[16] then after our death he would live at ease and not suffer want.' Then they thought: '. . . his fingers will become painful. If he learns counting (*gaṇanaṃ*) . . . [2] . . . he will have a pain in the

[1] 'Border provinces', SBE, xiii, p. 194. These were doubtless the aboriginal tracts to the south and south-east of the kingdom. Int. § 158; Ch. 1 § 2 n; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4]. Cp. Ch. 8 *e* § 5 n. See Ch. 11 *a* § 5 [1].

[2] Int. § 168; Ch. 11 *c* § 22 [3]. King Bimbisāra's dealings with Gotama would appear to have been mostly administrative; cp. Ch. 3 § 1.

[3] Int. § 175 (*armies*). Compare the high legal officers mentioned below.

[4] Literally, gather up. 'Search through', SBE.

[5] Ch. 8 *d* § 6. It may be gathered from the context that the forces employed were feudal levies. Cp. Ch. 11 *d* § 10 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* § 10 [1] n. See Wales, *Ancient Siamese Government*, pp. 135, 139–40, for similar conditions in medieval Siam.

[6] Int. § 190 (*address*).

[7] They had joined the Order after realizing the spiritual dangers of war.

[8] Int. § 190 (*legal procedure*; Ch. 10 *a* § 10 [9]. Cp. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (22); Ch. 14 *b* § 6 [2] (*judgement*); also Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [iv]. See Int. § 172; and Ch. 23 *a* [8] n. These are civil officials to be distinguished from the military officials mentioned above (*senānāyake mahāmatte*).

[9] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4].

[10] Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18].

[11] i.e. of the chapter ordaining. Literally, the announcer. 'Him who recites (the kammavāka)', SBE.

[12] Cp. Ch. 7 *c* § 1 n.

[13] Ap. H 1 § 2.

[14] As in *a* § 2 above.

[15] The name appears to be conventional. This noisy youth was not Upāli the Sakyan.

[16] Ch. 17 *d* § 1 [15] n; and Int. § 190 (*education*). Cp. Ch. 12 *e* § 3 [3] (*letters*).

breast; if he learns goldsmiths-work[1] (*rūpaṃ*) . . . his eyes will become painful. Now these devotees, the disciples of the Sakyan,[2] with pleasant duties and a pleasant way of life eat good food and lie on sheltered beds; if Upāli should be ordained among the devotees, disciples of the Sakyan, then after our death he would live at ease and not suffer want.' [3] . . . Then the boy Upāli . . . spoke to the [other] boys. . . . The mendicant brothers conferred the *pabbajjā*- and *upasampadā*-ordinations on them. . . .[3] [5] The Blessed One rebuked[4] [them]. . . . [6] 'This,' he said, 'is not either for the edification (*pasādāya*) of the unedified or for the increase of the edified (*pasannānaṃ*).'[5] . . . The *upasampadā*-ordination should not knowingly be conferred on a person less than twenty years old.[6] He who [so] confers the *upasampadā*-ordination must be made subject to the law (*yathā-dhammo kāretabbo*).'[7]

§ 5. *Mahā-vagga I, lxxix.*

[1] . . . 'In this case, mendicant brothers, that a mendicant brother, on committing a fault and not admitting[8] it, has been suspended[9] and wanders away[10] and afterwards having returned asks the mendicant brothers for the *upasampadā*-ordination, this must be said to him: "Wilt thou acknowledge that offence?" If he says "I will acknowledge it", he should receive the *pabbajjā*-ordination.'

c. The Upasampadā[11] Ceremony; the Four Requisites;[12] the Four Prohibitions[13]

§ 1. *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society (1874): J. F. Dickson's paper on the Ordination Ceremony under the Ceylon Kamma-vācā (Formulary of Procedure)[14]—the Second Ordination.*

'[. . .[15] The candidate being duly qualified, returns with his tutor,[16] and goes up to the President of the chapter,[17] presenting an offering, and makes obeisance, saying,] "Permit me to speak. Lord, graciously grant me your

[1] Cp. *jāta-rūpa* (gold) in Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (10). The meaning is uncertain. SBE, xiii (p. 201) translates as 'money-changing', on the strength of Buddhaghosha's commentary (Int. § 21). Drawing, painting, and other meanings have been suggested. Int. § 189 (*money*).

[2] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2].

[3] Omitting the noisy unruliness of the youths.

[4] Cp. Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3] n.

[5] 'For converting the unconverted and for augmenting the number of the converted', SBE. See Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1]. *Pasāda* means 'clearness', and so 'clear and serene faith' (Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]).

[6] Ch. 2 § 4 n; Ap. H 2, *Note.*

[7] 'The law alluded to is the 65th pākittiya rule', SBE. The offender was liable to a penance (Ap. H 1 § 4). Ap. H 4 *c* (*penances*).

[8] Literally, not seeing; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 11 [i. 1], 12 [12], 13 [1]. Cp. Ap. H 4 *c* (*penances*).

[9] 'Against whom expulsion has been pronounced', SBE. For references see *b* (headline) above; see further Ch. 8 *e* 7.

[10] 'Returns to the world', SBE, xiii, p. 237.

[11] Ch. 5 *c* § 8; Ch. 8 *d*.

[12] See § 2 (2) below; Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (*Bases*).

[13] See § 2 (3) below; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 (*Pārājika*); Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [2].

[14] Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), 397 ff; Baynes, *Way of the B.* (1914), 60 ff; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5. For present Buddhist sects or schools in Ceylon see Eliot, *H. and B.*, iii, p. 37.

[15] The whole of the *Pabbajjā* formula of the first Ordination is repeated as an essential part of the second or *Upasampadā* Ordination. Ch. 22 *b* § 18 [28] n.

[16] Ch. 8 *g*.

[17] Ch. 8 *d* § 3.

sanction and support. *He kneels down.*[1] . . .[2] Lord, be my superior.[3] . . . [The President says,] It is well. [And the candidate replies,] I am content. . . . From this day forth my lord is my charge. I am charge to my lord. . . ."

'[The candidate . . . retires alone to the foot of the assembly, where his alms-bowl[4] is strapped on his back. His tutor then goes down, takes him by the hand, and brings him back, placing him in front of the President. One of the assembled priests . . . places himself on the other side of the candidate. . . . The tutors say to the assembly,] With your permission, [and then proceed to examine the candidate. . . .] Your name is Nāga? It is so, lord. Your superior is the venerable Tissa? It is so, lord. [The two tutors together say,] Praise be to the Blessed One, the Holy One, to him who has arrived at the knowledge of all truth. [They then recite the following commands of the Buddha.] First it is right to appoint a superior. When the superior has been appointed, it is right to inquire whether the candidate has alms-bowl and robes [which they do as follows]. Is this your alms-bowl? It is so, lord. Is this the stole? It is so, lord. Is this the upper robe? It is so, lord. Is this the under robe?[5] It is so, lord. Go and stand there. [The candidate here retires, going backwards in a reverential posture, and stands at the lower corner of the assembly. The tutors remain in front of the President, and one of them says,] Priests, hear me. The candidate desires ordination under the venerable Tissa. Now is the time of the assembly of priests. I will instruct the candidate.

'[The tutors make obeisance to the President, and go down to the foot of the assembly, and join the candidate, whom they instruct. . . .[6] The two tutors here go to the top of the assembly, and make obeisance to the President, and one of them says,] Priests, hear me. The candidate desires ordination under the venerable Tissa. He has been duly instructed by me. Now is the time of the assembly of priests. If the candidate is here, it is right to tell him to approach. [One of the tutors says,] Come hither.

'[The candidate comes up, and stands between the tutors, makes obeisance to the assembly, and kneels down.] Priests, I ask the assembly for ordination. Priests, have compassion on me, and lift me up. . . . [The candidate rises up, and makes obeisance. The tutors say,] Priests, hear me. This candidate desires ordination under the venerable Tissa. Now is the time of the assembly of priests. I will examine the candidate respecting the disqualifications for the priestly office. Listen, Nāga. This is the time for you to speak the truth, to state what has occurred. I will inquire of you concerning facts. If a thing is, it is right to say it is; if a thing is not, it is right to say it is not. . . .[7]

'[One of the tutors reports the result as follows.] This candidate desires ordination under his superior the venerable Tissa. He is free from disqualifications. He has his alms-bowl and robes complete. The candidate asks the assembly for ordination under his superior the venerable Tissa. The assembly gives the candidate ordination under his superior the vener-

[1] The words in italics are a rubric; those in square brackets are explanatory.
[2] Omitting double repetition.
[3] Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4].
[4] The robes have been given at the first ordination.
[5] Ch. 6 *b* § 2 [3]; Ch. 8 *j*.
[6] Omitting their directions regarding the following procedure. Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [2].
[7] Questions on disqualifications follow as in Ch. 8 *d* § 6 [1].

able Tissa.[1] If any of the venerable assembly approves the ordination of the candidate under the venerable Tissa, let him be silent; if any objects, let him speak. A second time. . . . A third time I state this matter. . . . [The two tutors here again make obeisance to the President, and say,] The candidate has received ordination from the priesthood under his superior the venerable Tissa. The assembly approves the resolution: therefore it keeps silence. So I understand your wish.'[2]

[. . . The ceremony is repeated with each candidate.][3]

§ 2. *General Exhortation to the newly ordained*[4] *in Ceylon.*

[When all the candidates have been ordained, one of the assembly (generally one of the tutors) rises and addresses the following exhortation to the recently ordained:]

(1) 'It is meet to measure the shadow of the sun; it is meet to tell the season and the division of the day; it is meet to tell all these together.[5]

(2) 'It is meet to tell the four requisites of a priest. . . .[6]

(3) 'It is meet to tell the four sins forbidden to priests to commit. . . .'[7]

3. The Government[8] of the Saṃgha[9]

[*Note.* The code which provides for the government of the *Saṃgha* is the *Vinaya Piṭaka*.[10] This, the first division of the Canon, is itself divided into three parts, the *Sutta-vibhaṅga*[11] (containing the *Pātimokkha* rules with their setting), the *Khandhakāni* (comprising the *Mahā-vagga* or greater chapter and the *Culla-vagga* or lesser chapter), and the *Parivāra*[12] or supplement (comprising later regulations). The *Pātimokkha*[13] rules concern conduct or personal discipline; they are not only a classified series of rules to be observed by individual monks, but also from another point of view constitute a survey of the powers of the *Saṃgha* to inflict penalties upon

[1] This is the proposal or resolution. Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [3].

[2] Ch. 8 *b* § 5.

[3] 'It is quite possible, even after ordination, for any member to leave the Brotherhood. There is no compulsion. Whosoever yearns again after the joys of this world may confess his weakness to the Thêra, when the Saṃgha will not detain him, and he may leave without any stain upon his character.'—Baynes, *Way of the B.*, p. 67. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 4 n.

[4] Baynes, *Way of the B.* (1914), pp. 64–7; OB, pp. 398–9.

[5] 'Then let them measure the shadow, tell (the newly-ordained Bhikkhu) what season and what date it is, tell him what part of the day it is, tell him the whole formula', MV, I. lxxvii (SBE, xiii, p. 234). The purpose was to fix the seniority of the Bhikkhus. Ap. H 2 *a* 5 (Wesak); cp. Ch. 1 § 3.

[6] MV, I. lxxvii, which repeats I. xxx. 4 (as in Ch. 8 *d* § 2). For references see Ap. H 2 *c* (headline) In insisting that monks must beg their food and possess no private property, Gotama was not insisting upon asceticism either for priests or laymen, but was emphasizing the connexion of personal cares and anxieties with that selfishness or individualism which is the root of all sorrow. The monks at least should attain to freedom from individualistic cares, and so set an example of unselfishness to the lay-brethren whose necessary labour supported their families and the monks themselves, and so the ideals preached and upheld by the latter. Ch. 8 *l*.

[7] Or, interdictions. MV, I. lxxviii (as in Ch. 8 *d* 7). For references see Ap. H 2 *c* (headline).

[8] Ch. 8 *e* (*Constitution*).

[9] Ch. 8 (A).

[10] Ch. 4 § 9; Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 8 *e* (*Vinaya*); Ch. 10 *d* § 1 n (12th *vassa*); and IN 10 n.

[11] For Bhikkhus and Bhikkhunis respectively, cp. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (iii) n.

[12] Ap. H 4 *c* § 1.

[13] Ch. 8 *b*.

offending members of the community, as is shown especially in the sections called *Pārājika*[1] (expulsion) and *Saṃgh-ādisese*[2] (penalties supervised by the *Saṃgha*). The subjects of the sections or *Khandhakāni* grouped together as the *Mahā-vagga* are as follows: 1, Admission;[3] 2, *Uposatha*[4] and *Pātimokkha*; 3, Vassa;[5] 4, *Pavārana*;[6] 5, leather shoes,[7] seats, and vehicles, and indulgences for outlying districts[8] such as Avanti[9] and the southern jungle[10] (*Avanti-dakkhiṇ-āpatha*); 6, medicaments and food;[11] 7, *Kaṭhina* cloth;[12] 8, apparel;[13] 9, validity of procedure;[14] 10, schisms.[15] The subjects of the sections forming the *Culla-vagga* are: 1, Disciplinary procedure[16] (*kamma*); 2 and 3, *Saṃghādisesa*[17] offences; 4, settlement (*samatha*) of cases;[18] 5, small points of daily life;[19] 6, lodgings, seats, and beds;[20] 7, schisms;[21] 8, classes[22] of Bhikkhus, the refectory, hot baths,[23] &c.; 9, exclusion[24] from the *Pātimokkha*; 10, the Order of mendicant-sisters (*bhikkhunī*);[25] 11, the first General Council[26] at Rājagaha[27] after the death of the Buddha; 12, the second General Council at Vesāli.[28] Thus it may be stated generally that the *Culla-vagga* is an appendix to or expansion of the disciplinary personal rules contained in the *Pātimokkha*, whilst the *Mahā-vagga* has a broader outlook and comprises for the most part administrative regulations of a wider bearing. The occasion of each rule or regulation is set forth, and every ruling is attributed to the Buddha. The 'occasions' are generally credible and rational but sometimes magical,[29] absurd, and superfluous, e.g. *MV*, v. 1, where journeys through the air and performances in the sky are described. A perusal of the lengthy volumes of the *Vinaya-Piṭaka* leaves a feeling of radical incongruity between the practical and systematic tone of the bulk of the material and the imaginative accounts of spirits and marvels which distinguish the introductory and evidently commentarial portion of *Khandhaka I* of the *Mahā-vagga*.[30]

The elaborate and thoroughly competent procedure of Buddhist assemblies was based apparently on that of the numerous public assemblies,[31] imperial or local, which flourished in the time of Gotama and are referred to in the *Mahā-Parinibbāna-Sutta*.]

1 Ch. 8 *b* § 6.
2 Ch. 8 *b* § 7; see below.
3 Ch. 8 *d*.
4 Ch. 8 *a*. For a summary of this *Khandhaka* see Ap. H 1, *Note*.
5 Ch. 8 *c*.
6 Ch. 8 *c*.
7 Int. § 190 (*dress*); Ch. 8 *j* §§ 6 [29], 7.
8 Int. § 158; Ch. 8 *e* § 5 (*central*).
9 Int. § 156.
10 Int. § 132 (*Dakkhiṇa-giri*).
11 Int. § 190 (*food*); Ch. 8 *j*.
12 Ch. 8 *j*.
13 Ch. 8 *j*.
14 Ch. 8 *e* § 5.
15 Ch. 16 *b*. See below (*CV*, 7).
16 See *b* § 2 [3] below.
17 See above.
18 A case or disputed question is called *adhikaraṇa*. Ch. 8 *b* § 7 n.
19 Ap. H 5; and Ch. 13 *b* § 3 n.
20 Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (9); Ch. 8 *g* § 8.
21 See above (MV, 10); Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7] n.
22 Ch. 8 *g*.
23 Int. § 190 (*bathing*).
24 Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [2]; Ap. H 2 *b* (*expulsion*). For a summary of this *Khandhaka* see Ap. H 1, *Note*.
25 Ch. 12 *b*.
26 IN 6; Ch. 8 *e* § 3 n.
27 Int. § 125.
28 Int. § 133.
29 Ap. I *b*.
30 Ch. 4 § 9 n.
31 See *a* below; and Ch. 20 § 2 (1).

a. Public Assemblies[1] *in the time of Gotama*

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 16 (Mahā-Parinibbāna-Sutta), I, 4.*[2]

[4] . . . 'Doubtless thou hast heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians[3] are much-given to meetings, favouring meetings.'[4] 'I have heard so, revered sir. . . .' 'As long, Ānanda, as the Vajjians are much-given to meetings, favouring meetings, so long, Ānanda, is the increase of the Vajjians to be expected and not their decline.'

§ 2. *Mahā-Parinibbāna-Sutta, III, 21–3.*[5]

[21] 'There are, Ānanda, these eight sessions (*parisā*).[6] Which eight? Sessions of Kshatriyas,[7] sessions of Brāhmans,[8] sessions of householders,[9] sessions of devotees,[10] sessions of the [spirits] attending the Four Great Kings [guardians of the four regions],[11] sessions of the Thirty-three,[12] sessions of Māra,[13] and sessions of Brahmā.[14] [22] I remember indeed, Ānanda, that, when I had approached a session of many hundreds of Kshatriyas, then before I was seated there and before speaking and entering upon conversation, my colour[15] (*vaṇṇo*) became such as theirs and my accent (*saro*) became such as theirs was. . . . [23] When I had approached a session of many hundreds of Brāhmans . . . of householders . . . of devotees . . . of [spirits] attending the Four Great Kings . . . the Thirty-three . . . Māra . . . [or] Brahmā . . . my colour became such as theirs and my accent became such as theirs was. . . .'

§ 3. *Mahā-Parinibbāna-Sutta, V, 19–20.*[16]

[19] . . . The venerable Ānanda, wearing his under-robes and assuming his outer-robe[17] and alms-bowl, having taken a companion[18] (*atta-dutiyo*)

[1] Int. § 171 (*government*); Ch. 1 § 8; Ch. 7 *a* § 22 [2] n; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (1); Ch. 13 *c* § 5. See *Note* above. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 3 (*thrice*). Ch. 8 *d* § 1 [4] (*ñatti*). On the orderly procedure of debates see Ch. 15 *a* § 9. For a monarchical council see Ch. 13 *c* § 15 (17).

[2] As in Ch. 20 § 1. Gotama speaks.

[3] Int. § 147.

[4] The Pāli word for public-meeting is *sannipāta*. Ch. 8 *a* [4]; Ch. 12 *d* § 5 [2] (1). See Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [2]; Ch. 19 *d* § 3 [4].

[5] As in Ch. 21 § 1.

[6] Ch. 8 *a* [4] n; Ch. 8 *f* § 1; Ch. 10 *c* [4] (37); Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [ii. 1]; Ch. 14 *e* § 4 [3]; Ch. 14 *f* § 3; Ch. 19 *a* § 2 [3]; Ch. 19 *b* § 4 [1]; Ch. 21 § 11 [12] n; Ch. 23 *b* § 2. Cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 2 [18] (*parisajja*). The word does not always mean a formal assembly: Ch. 16 *a* § 6 [55]; Ch. 22 *b* § 12 [22], and Ch. 15 *b* §§ 2 [513, 524], 3 [1]. Cp. Ch. 13 *c* § 28 [3] (*sabhā*).

[7] Int. § 185. 'Nobles', SBE.

[8] Ap. F 2 *c*.

[9] The Pāli word is *gahapati* (Ch. 6 *a* § 5; Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [3]; Ch. 9 *b* § 1 [1]; Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2], gihin; Ch. 10 *a* § 6 [1]; Ch. 14 *b* § 5 [5], § 6 [2]; Ch. 22 *b* § 6 [10]). These formed the Vaisya caste (Ch. 8 *d* § 8; see Int. § 185, *three*).

[10] Pāli *samaṇa*. Ap. A 2 *d* [21]; Ch. 8 *d* § 7.

[11] Int. § 93 (v). 'The angel hosts of the Guardian Angels', SBE.

[12] Pāli *tāva-tiṃsa*. Int. § 70.

[13] Ap. G 2 *b*.

[14] Int. § 93 (ii). This Sutta dates necessarily from after the Buddha's death, and parts at least of the present text were composed so long after that the rational and sceptical tone of the great Discourses (Ap. G 1 *a* § 8 [13]) had been forgotten in undiscriminating zeal. Public meetings were plainly considered natural to all intelligent beings and so were attributed to super-human beings also. IN 8 *a*.

[15] Or, appearance. Ch. 8 *d* § 8.

[16] As in Ch. 22 *b* §§ 10 [19]–11 [20]. SBE. xi numbers this passage as v. 45–6.

[17] Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1].

[18] Or, associate. Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [2]; Ch. 8 *g*.

entered Kusinārā. [20] Now at that time the Mallas[1] of Kusinārā were met in the assembly-hall[2] (*santh-āgāre*) for some business (*karaṇiyena*).

b. The Powers[3] of the Saṃgha; Penalties[4]

§ 1. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Sutta-vighaṅga, Samghādisesa (end).* (*Vin. Piṭ.*, *Oldenberg, III, p. 186.*)[5]

'Venerable sirs, thirteen Samghādisesa[6] offences (*dhammā*)[7] have been recited, nine which are offences[8] at once and four which become offences after three [warnings]. When a mendicant brother has committed one or other of these, for as many days as he has knowingly concealed it, for so many days must that brother live under restraint.[9] When the mendicant brother has gone through the probation[10] a further period of six days must be undergone as a penance.[11] The mendicant brother, having undergone the penance, should be reinstated (*abbhetabbo*)[12] at a chapter[13] of the *Saṃgha* where there are twenty present.'

§ 2. *Culla-vagga, I, i.*

[1] At that time the Blessed Buddha[14] was staying at Sāvatthi in the Jeta Grove, the garden of Anāthapiṇḍika.[15] Then at that time the mendicant brothers following Paṇḍuka and Lohita[16] themselves makers of disputes and quarrels and dissensions and talk and trouble in the *Saṃgha*, having approached such other mendicant brothers as were makers of disputes ... in the *Saṃgha*, spoke to them. ... Thereby both new disputes[17] arose and old disputes grew to greater intensity. ...[18] [3] Then the Blessed One

[1] Int. § 164.

[2] 'Council hall', SBE, xi, p. 102. Int. §§ 137, 164, 171; Ch. 12 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 22 *b* § 11 [20]; Ch. 22 *c* §§ 1 n, 8. Cp. Ch. 8 *f* § 4; also Ch. 22 *c* § 10 (*meeting*).

[3] Ch. 8 *e*. For the power of decision by vote or tally see Ch. 19 *b* § 9 [1] n; Cp. Ch. 23 *a* [9] (*number*), and Ch. 15 *b* § 11 [i. 1] (*unanimous vote*).

[4] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 (*pārājika*); Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1] n; Ch. 15 *b* § 15 [12]; Ap. H 2 *b* (*expulsion*); Ap. H 4 *c* (*penances*); and Ch. 22 *b* § 24 n. An offence (*āpatti*) was regularly classified according to the section of the Pātimokkha violated, with three more general classes, namely *dukkata* (ill deed, Ch. 8 *b* § 7), *dubbāsita* (ill speech) and *thullaccaya* (gross transgression); see SBE, xiii, p. 244 and CV, IX. iii. 3; cp. Ap. H 1 § 2, and Ch. 8 *j* § 4. Another such general term is *vajja* (sin; to be shunned); Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]. CV, I, defines the penalties of censure, suspension, or expulsion to be imposed in different cases of obstinate ill-doing.

[5] SBE, xiii, p. 14.

[6] Ch. 8 *b* § 7.

[7] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*].

[8] The Pāli word used is *āpatti* (transgression). Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 3 [3]; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 11 [1], 12 [v. 11].

[9] 'Even against his will remain in probation', SBE.

[10] Pāli *parivāsa*. Ch. 8 *g* § 7 [1]; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [21]; Ap. H 2 *a*.

[11] *Mānatta*. This was apparently a sign of repentance rather than a penalty. Ch. 12 *b* § 2 [4] (v); also Ap. H 4, *Note*.

[12] Ch. 8 *e* § 5 (*abbhāna*).

[13] *Gana*. Ch. 8 *d* § 3; cp. Ap. G 1 *c* § 1 n; also Ch. 3 § 5 [165]; and Ch. 22 *c* § 10 (*meeting*).

[14] Ch. 15 *a* § 15 [1].

[15] Ch. 14 *a*.

[16] 'These were two out of the six notorious Khabbaggiya Bhikkhus', SBE, xvii, p. 330 (see Ch. 8 *c* § 3). The names may be conventional, as are those of other obstinate culprits in the *Vin. Piṭ.*

[17] Cp. Ch. 16 *b*; Ch. 19 *a*.

[18] [2] includes the characteristic phrase recurring frequently in the prohibitive disciplinary sections of the MV and CV: 'This [tends] not to the conversion (*pasādaya*) of the unbelieving (*a-ppasannānaṃ*) nor to the increase of the believing, but both to the unbelief of the unconverted and to the alienation (*aññathataya*) of some believers'. See Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1]; CV, I. i. 2; MV, v. iv. 2, vii. 2, viii. 2, VI. xxiii. 9.

having rebuked those mendicant brothers, in different methods[1] spoke in dispraise of being hard to support and hard to feed, and of the covetousness,[2] discontent, and gregariousness of the slothful[3] (*kosajjassa*), and in different methods spoke in praise of being easy to support and easy to feed, and of the uncovetousness and contentment of the self-restrained[4] (*sallekhassa*), earnest[5] (*dhutassa*), believing[6] (*pāsādikassa*), humble[7] (*apacayassa*), and strenuous (*viriy-ārambhassa*);[8] and having delivered to the mendicant brothers a discourse[9] on the Law suitable and appropriate to the occasion, he instructed them saying: 'Therefore, mendicant brothers, let the *Saṃgha* perform the act of censure (*tajjaniya-kammaṃ*)[10] of the mendicant brothers following Paṇḍuka and Lohita.'

4. Ideals of Conduct[11] and Self-discipline:[12] The Sīlas (*duties for all*), Sikkhāpadas (*precepts for the Order*) and Pārājikā Dhammā (*basic commandments*).

[*Note.* The general rules of conduct, which must be observed by all mendicant brothers and by the laity, are known as the Sīlas (*sīlāni*) or collectively as *sīla* (duty). The particular regulations of the Order are developed in great detail in the *Pātimokkha*[13] rules for the ordained clergy only. The pious layman[14] was expected to share for a short period each year, either at home or in a monastery, the duties of a probationer preparing for ordination, and thus to observe the general rules as distinguished from the *Pātimokkha* regulations by participating in the novices' life of ideal simplicity as to lodging, food, raiment, and strict life and thought. The general rules known as *Sīla* closely resemble but are not identical with the ten *Sikkhāpadāni*[15] or Precepts for probationers. The first four Precepts correspond though not exactly with the four *Pārājika*[16] Rules, breach of which implied expulsion from the Order, as well as with the first four Sīlas. The fifth Precept corresponds, though not invariably, with the fifth *Sīla*; and these five are compulsory for all alike,[17] ordained mendicant brothers, novices, and laymen, throughout life. The remaining

[1] Ch. 6 *a* § 7.
[2] *Mah-icchatā*. Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [1] (i). Cp. Ch. 11 *c* § 13 [2] n; and Ch. 15 *b* § 13 [1] (*app-iccha*).
[3] Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [16]. Cp. Ap. C *b* § 11 (21); Ap. F 2.
[4] 'Who has eradicated (evils from his mind)', SBE. Cp. Ch. 14 *f* § 8 [1].
[5] 'Who has quelled his passions', SBE. Cp. Ap. H 4 *a* (*dhut-aṅga*).
[6] Ap. H 1 § 6 [5].
[7] 'Full of reverence', SBE.
[8] Ap. F 2 *a* (137). See Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14].
[9] Ch. 6 *a* § 12; Ch. 8 *a* [4]; Ch. 8 *g* § 5 [6]. Cp. Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [3]. For the simple ethical principles of this customary discourse of the Buddha compare the 'graduated discourse' in Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] and the 'comprehensive discourse' in Ch. 20 § 8 (*discourse*); Ap. H 4 *a* § 3 n. These formed the essential part of Gotama's teaching (IN 5 *b*). Cp. also Ap. F.
[10] For *kamma* see Ap. H 3, *Note* (CV 1), and Ap. H 1 § 4. Other cases of *tajjaniya* follow; also of *nissaya* (support), *pabbajaniya* (banishment), *patisāraniya* (reconcilement) and *ukkhepaniya* (suspension for not acknowledging an offence or not renouncing an erroneous doctrine).
[11] Int. § 8 (*responsibility*); Ch. 8 *h* (*Duties*); Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [3] (*reflection*); Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101] (*righteous*); Ch. 19 *b* § 11 [7] (*gain*); Ch. 20 § 2 (*conditions*); Ap. F (*Ethical System*); Ap. F 2 *c* § 2 (21) *action*. For a list of ideal characteristics see Ch. 18 *e* § 2 [3].
[12] Ap. E *c* ii.
[13] Ch. 8 *b*.
[14] Ch. 8 *l*; Ch. 9 *b* § 5.
[15] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 [1]. See *b* below.
[16] Ch. 8 *b* § 6.
[17] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (24) n.

rules, embodying the monastic mode of life, are arranged differently in different parts of the *Canon*, and appear sometimes as five in number, and sometimes as three, owing to omission of the rule against the use of precious metals and the grouping of two of the remaining rules together. Thus the main Duties[1] are known sometimes as the Five Sīlas, and these at times are expanded to ten and at times to seven only, whilst indeed in the ancient treatise known as the *Cūla-sīla* (Brief Duty) they number still more than ten. Again the Precepts or perhaps better the Injunctions (*sikkhāpadāni*) are ten in number, occasionally compressed into eight,[2] the later Precepts being sumptuary rather than ethical and so different from the later Duties, whilst the five earlier Precepts correspond closely with the five main Sīlas.

The treatise known as the Sīla[3] or Duty is inserted, not without awkwardness, in each of the first thirteen Suttas of the *Dīgha-Nikāya*. It is divided into three parts entitled *Cūla-sīla* (Brief Duty), *Majjhima-sīla* (Middle Duty) and *Mahā-sīla* (Longer Duty). Of these the last two are expansions of the first with variations in the arrangement, being thus apparently of a somewhat later date. They present a vivid and displeasing picture of the priestcraft, both Brāhmanic[4] and unorthodox, and of the general life[5] of the times, displaying a laxity of pursuits and habits which is contrasted with the severe purity of the Buddha's followers.

Apart from the general rules of Duty and the disciplinary regulations of the *Pātimokkha*, with the penalties for the breach thereof, there were the self-imposed penances[6] and austere exercises of the ascetically minded who were not contented with the minimum of piety enforced by the regulations. Buddhist ascetic ideals perhaps are best expressed in the poetic *Songs of the Brethren* and *Songs of the Sisters* included in the somewhat miscellaneous collection constituting the fifth *Nikāya*,[7] which contains compositions of various dates evidently added to the *Canon* from time to time. They are also expressed though with less concentrated ardour in the verses of the *Dhammapada* and in some of the poems contained in the *Sutta-Nipāta*, all being included in the wide fold of the fifth Nikāya. Implied in all these ideals is to be found the idea of the transcendence of individuality and of all appertaining to it. This further implies the equality of all good men and the ignoring of caste distinctions.[8] The only inequalities are those of progress along the Eightfold Path. And as the true disciple of the Sakyan must give up all pretensions to caste superiority, so he must abstain from all claims to ritual secrets and magic influence[9] over supernatural forces, and live as the selfless exemplar, not as the self-righteous superior or the favoured lord, of men.]

[1] See *a* below.

[2] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (26).

[3] See *a* § 4 below; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 8 [4] n, 10 [1] n; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1] n; Ap. A 2 *d*, *Note*; and Int. § 32.

[4] The term *Samaṇa-Brāhmana* seems to include the religious practitioners of the clansmen of the Middle Land as well as the Brāhman ritualists deriving from north-west India. Ap. A 2 *d* [21]. Cp. Ch. 1 § 2 [49] n.

[5] IN 14.

[6] See *c* below; Ap. H 3 *b* § 1 n.

[7] Ap. A 1 *a* (*Khudda-Nikāya*).

[8] See *d* below.

[9] See *c* § 2 (2) *Sutta Nipāta*.

a. Abstinences:[1] *the Sīlas*[2] *or Duties*

§ 1. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Pañcaka-Nipāta (the Fives), Sutta 47.*

[1] There are five treasures[3] (*dhanāni*), mendicant brothers. Which five? The treasure of faith,[4] the treasure of duty,[5] the treasure of learning, the treasure of renunciation, the treasure of insight. [2] . . .[6] And what, mendicant brothers, is the treasure of duty? [3] Here, mendicant brothers, the worthy disciple (*ariya-sāvako*)[7] abstains from the destruction of life;[8] he abstains from taking what is not given; he abstains from lustful misbehaviour[9] (*kāmesu micchācārā*) he abstains from false speaking; he abstains from intoxicating wine and spirits causing negligence. This is called the treasure of duty.[10] . . .[11]

§ 2. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Tika-Nipāta (the Threes), Sutta 115.*

[5] There are three attainments[12] (*sampadā*), mendicant brothers. Which three? Attainment of duty (*sīla-sampadā*), attainment of will[13] (*citta-sampadā*), attainment of outlook (*diṭṭhi-sampadā*).[14] And what, mendicant brothers, is the attainment of duty? Here, mendicant brothers, one abstains from the destruction of life; abstains from taking what is not given; abstains from lustful misbehaviour; abstains from false speaking; abstains from malicious speech; abstains from harsh speech; and abstains from frivolous talk.[15] This, mendicant brothers, is called the attainment of duty. . . .[16]

§ 3. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya, Dasaka-Nipāta (the Tens), Sutta 169.*

[1] Then Sangārava the Brāhman[17] drew near to where the Blessed One

[1] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (*sikkhā-padāni*); Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (27) n; Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (3), (4); Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [4]; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]. These are negative only and do not suffice for virtue. For the positive side of Buddhist ethics see Ap. F 2, *Note* (*Sīla*).

[2] Ap. H 1, *Note*, n; see *Note* above; Int. § 32; Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5]; Ch. 12 *c* § 12 [20]; Ch. 13 *d* § 9; Ch. 14 *f* § 13 [5] n; Ch. 18 *e* § 1 (3); Ch. 20 § 7 (5); Ch. 21 § 17 [2]; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2 [51]; Ap. F 2 *a* (122). Cp. Int. § 38 n; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [9], 8 [9] (ten); Ch. 21 § 16; Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *sīlabbata-paramāsa*).

[3] Ch. 7 *b* § 4; Ch. 8 *g* § 8 (*qualities*); Ap. F 2. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 8 [3] n.

[4] Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180].

[5] Or, good conduct.

[6] Omitting a definition of *saddhā* (faith) as belief in the Enlightenment (*bodhiṃ*) of the Tathāgata (Ap. A 2 *c*), the teacher of spirits (Ap. H 1 § 5) and men. The speech is attributed to Buddha, but the terms are scholastic.

[7] Ap. E *c* i § 5 [8]; Ap. H 4 *b* § 1 [9].

[8] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (1); Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (4). Cp. Ch. 13 *e* § 1 n.

[9] Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [4]; also Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*].

[10] The direct use of the terms *pañca sīlāni* and *dasa sīlāni* does not occur apparently in the four Nikāyas.

[11] Omitting definitions of learning, renunciation, and insight. Insight (*paññā*) is defined as clear knowledge of origination and cessation (Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]) and of the complete destruction of sorrow; Ch. 20 § 7 (6); cp. Ap. G 1 *b*. The treasures do not include belief in Karma (IN 2).

[12] Ch. 8 *g* § 8 n (*sampadā*); Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1]; cp. Ch. 15 *a* § 3 [13] (*development*).

[13] Ch. 13 *d* § 9.

[14] The 'attainment' of outlook is *sammā-diṭṭhi* (see § 3 [2] below; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ap. G 1 *b*), which is defined as belief in the reality (Ap. G 1 *a*, iii; cp. Ap. D *b*, *Illusion*) of the world [of origination and cessation], in the results of actions, in a beyond (*para-loka*; Ch. 5 *a* § 6), and in beings arising spontaneously (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 i [32]; Ap. I, *Note*).

[15] Cp. Ch. 20 § 3 (2); also Ch. 15 *b* § 2 [513] (*vulgar*).

[16] From the definitions which follow it is clear that *citta* is the heart or willing mind, distinguished from the thinking mind; *citta-sampadā* is defined as freedom from covetousness and malice (see § 3 [2] below. Cp. *citta-vimutti*, Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29]).

[17] Ch. 14 *f* § 1 [210]; and Ap. G 2 *c*.

was and . . . spoke thus: 'Now what, O Gotama (*bho Gotama*),[1] is this side (*orimaṃ tīraṃ*), what is the other side (*pārimaṃ tīram*)?'[2] [2] 'The destruction of life, Brāhman, is on this side; abstaining from the destruction of life is on the other side. Taking what is not given, Brāhman, is on this side; abstaining from taking what is not given is on the other side. Lustful misbehaviour is on this side; abstaining from lustful misbehaviour is on the other side. False speaking is on this side; abstaining from false speaking is on the other side. Malicious speech[3] is on this side; abstaining from malicious speech is on the other side. Harsh speech is on this side; abstaining from harsh speech is on the other side. Frivolous talk is on this side; abstaining from frivolous talk is on the other side. Covetousness[4] is on this side; uncovetousness (*an-abhijjhā*) is on the other side. Malevolence[5] is on this side; benevolence (*a-vyāpādo*) is on the other side. Wrong outlook[6] (*micchā-diṭṭhi*) is on this side; right outlook (*sammā-diṭṭhi*)[7] is on the other side. This is, Brāhman, this side; and that is the other side.' . . .[8]

§ 4. *Dīgha-Nikāya, Sutta 1 (Brahmajāla-Sutta),*[9] *I, 1–10 (Cūla-Sīla).*[10] *(PTS, I, pp. 4–5.)*

[8] 'The Samaṇa Gotama[11] renounces[12] the destruction of life, abstains from the destruction of life. Without staff, without sword, modest, pitiful,[13] he lives friendly and compassionate[14] to all breathing creatures.' So indeed, mendicant brothers, let the ordinary man[15] (*putho-jjano*) speak in praise of the Tathāgata.[16] 'The Samaṇa Gotama renounces taking what is not given, abstains from taking what is not given. Taking what is given, desiring [only] what is given, he lives with an honest and a pure mind (*attanā*).'[17] . . . 'The Samaṇa Gotama renounces unholy living (*a-brahmacariyā*);[18] living holily, living apart, he abstains from lewd and vulgar behaviour (*methunā gamā-dhamma*).[19] . . .

[9] 'The Samaṇa Gotama renounces false-speaking, abstains from false-

[1] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [1].

[2] It is interesting to observe how Gotama evaded the theme of 'the further shore' and kept the discussion to the plane of ethics. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*sagga*); Ap. C *b* § 11 (174); Ap. G 1 *c*, *Note* (*heaven*).

[3] Or, slander. Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (4).

[4] Or, greed. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1]; Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [3]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [21]; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [8]. Cp. Ch. 11 *c* §§ 13 [2] n, 15 n; Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii, *desire*). The last three Sīlas amount practically to avoidance of the Three Fires. In their positive attitude they closely resemble the *samādhi* and *paññā* of the Comprehensive Discourse (Ch. 20 § 8; Ap. H 3 *b* § 2 [3]) and the first two and also the last two sections of the Eightfold Path (Ap. F 2 *d*).

[5] The fifth Fetter, or second Obstacle (Ch. 9 *a* § 5 [13]). Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *ill-will*). See § 2 n above; cp. Ch. 20 § 3 (5).

[6] Or, false views; i.e. egotism and scepticism, the first two Fetters. The ten are classified as three of the body, four of speech, and three of the mind (Ch. 13 *a* § 2 [1] n; and Int. § 25; cp. Ap. F 1 *b* § 1 [4] (*deeds*)).

[7] See § 2 (*diṭṭhi-sampadā*) above; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[8] Omitting verses on 'the further shore', which appear also in Dhammapada (85–89).

[9] Ap. A 2 *d*.

[10] See *Note* above. Cp. Ch. 17 *a* [1] n (*abstinences*).

[11] Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [2]. In the first thirteen Suttas of the *Dīgha-Nikāya* the brief setting of the Sīlas varies, but their substance is the same. In some Suttas the word *Bhikkhu* more appropriately takes the place of Samaṇo Gotamo.

[12] Ap. I *b* § 4 [8].

[13] *Dayā-panna*. Ch. 15 *b* § 3 [2] (3); cp. Ap. F 2 *b* [6].

[14] *Hit-ānukampin*. Ch. 6 *b* § 1.

[15] Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [4].

[16] Follower or Successor. Ap. A 2 *c*.

[17] Ap. E *c* ii; cp. Ap. E *c* i § 4 [6] (*citta*). 'In purity of heart', SBE, xi, p. 189.

[18] Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (3).

[19] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*a*].

speaking. Speaking truth,[1] bound to truth, firm, steadfast, he keeps his word to the world (*lokassa*).'[2] . . . 'The Samaṇa Gotama renounces malicious speech,[3] abstains from malicious speech. What he has heard here he does not repeat to people elsewhere to divide them from those here, and what he has heard elsewhere he does not repeat to people here to divide them from those elsewhere. So he is a binder of the divided, a producer of union, delighting in agreement,[4] rejoicing in agreement, loving agreement, a speaker of words which cause agreement.' . . . 'The Samaṇa Gotama renounces harsh speech, abstains from harsh speech. What speech is hurtless, pleasant to the ear, loving, moving the heart, civil, pleasing to people, gracious to people—of such words he is a speaker.' . . . 'The Samaṇa Gotama renounces frivolous talk, abstains from frivolous talk. Speaking in season, speaking of fact, speaking of reality[5] (*attha-vādī*), speaking of the law and of the discipline, he is a speaker of words worth treasuring, timely, reasonable,[6] definite, conforming to reality[7] (*attha-saṃhitaṃ*).' 'So indeed, mendicant brothers, let the ordinary man speak in praise of the Tathāgata.

[10] 'The Samaṇa Gotama abstains from injuring plants[8] and creatures.[9] Taking one meal a day[10] (*eka-bhattiko*), the Samaṇa Gotama fasts at night; the Samaṇa Gotama abstains from eating at the wrong time. The Samaṇa Gotama abstains from dancing, singing, music, and watching contortionists . . . from wearing garlands, using scents and unguents for adornment and ostentation . . . from high or large beds.[11]

'The Samaṇa Gotama abstains from accepting gold and silver . . .[12] fields or land.' . . .[13]

b. Primary Rules of the Monastery: the Sikkhāpadāni[14]

§ 1. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya* (*the Threes*), *Sutta 70.*

. . .[15] [9] 'Then, Visākhā, the worthy disciple[16] thus reflects: "Throughout

[1] Ap. F 2 *a* (147).
[2] Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [2].
[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*vācā*); Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (3). Cp. Ch. 29 § 3 (5).
[4] The Pāli word is *samagga*. Ch. 8 *j* § 5 [2]; also Ch. 23 *a* [9]. Cp. Int. § 3 (*altruism*); Ap. F 1 *b* (*Mettā*).
[5] Ap. C *b* § 10 [2].
[6] 'Well-grounded', SBE, xi, p. 190.
[7] 'Full of wisdom', SBE.
[8] *Bīja-gāma*; literally, seed-kind (Int. § 49; Ch. 8 *c* § 1 [2] n). 'Any herb', SBE. This return to the subject of the first Sīla suggests a new commencement by a later hand.
[9] *Bhūta-gāma*; Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (19). 'Any creature', SBE. 'Vegetation', Rhys Davids, *Pāli Dict.*, following Buddhaghosha (Int. § 21).
[10] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (25); Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [89]; Ch. 18 *c* § 1 [101]; Ap. H 4 *b* § 1 [14]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [11] n; also Ch. 15 *a* § 14 (*evening-meal*).
[11] Here the *Sutta-Nipāta* list ends. Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (26).
[12] As in Ap. 8 *j* § 11.
[13] Omitting what is apparently a supplementary and somewhat fortuitous list, including such matters as going on messages, buying and selling, cheating with weights, bribery, maiming, highway robbery, and plundering villages (Int. § 189, *land*). The development of the three *Sīla* treatises may be considered an apt example of the growth of the *Canon* from concise to full beauty and thence to questionable diffuseness, incongruously but fruitfully enclosing the original nucleus (IN 6, *Canon*).
[14] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [1]; Ch. 8 *d* § 5; Ch. 20 § 2 (3); see *Note* above.
[15] The scene is the Eastern Monastery at Sāvatthi; Gotama addresses Visākhā the donor (Ch. 18 *b*), regarding the *uposatha* (Ap. H 1) of herdsmen, of Niganṭhas (Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (1) [29]) and of the disciples. The Niganṭhas are criticized as individualists.
[16] Ch. 8 *l* § 1 (18); Ap. H 1 *a* § 1 [3]. Here at least the *sāvaka* is a layman.

life the saints (*arahanto*)[1] renounce the destruction of life, abstain from the destruction of life. . . .[2] And I to-day abstain. . . . In this point let me follow the saints, and observance-day (*uposatho*) will be kept by me. [10] Throughout life the saints renounce taking what is not given, abstain from taking what is not given. . . . [11] Throughout life the saints renounce unholy living; living holily, they abstain from evil living, from lewd and vulgar behaviour. . . . [12] Throughout life the saints renounce false-speaking, abstain from false-speaking. . . . [13] Throughout life the saints renounce intoxicating wine and spirits causing negligence. . . . [14] Throughout life the saints taking one meal a day,[3] fasting at night, abstain from eating at the wrong time. . . . [15] Throughout life the saints abstain from dancing, singing, music, and watching contortionists, and from wearing garlands, using scents and unguents for adornment and ostentation.[4] . . . [16] Throughout life the saints renounce high or large beds . . . and I to-day abstain. . . . In this point let me follow the saints, and observance-day will be kept by me. Thus, Visākhā, is observance-day (*ariy-ūposatho*) rightly kept." . . .'[5]

§ 2. *Aṅguttara-Nikāya*, *Pañcaka-Nipāta* (*the Fives*), *Sutta 179.*

. . .[6] [2] 'By what five precepts[7] is [the white-robed householder][8] restrained[9] [in action]? [3] Here, Sāriputta,[10] the worthy disciple abstains from the destruction of life; abstains from taking what is not given; abstains from lustful misbehaviour; abstains from false speaking; abstains from intoxicating wine and spirits causing negligence. By these five precepts (*pañcasu sikkhāpadesu*) he is restrained [in action].'

c. Penances[11] *and Ascetic*[12] *Ideals; the Dhūtanga*[13] *Rules*

§ 1. *Vinaya Piṭaka*, *Parivāra*[14] *XV*, *vi.*

[1] . . .[15] From want of wisdom . . .[16] not from the absence of desire arises [the practice of] the forest-dweller.[17] . . . [2] From want of wisdom . . .

1 Ap. D *c*.
2 Omitting expansions.
3 Ch. 8 *d* § 5 (6); and Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10].
4 Int. § 190 (*dress*).
5 This enumeration does not include gold and silver. The lists of prohibitions in the Nikāyas do not seem to have attained fixity.
6 The scene is Sāvatthi. In the presence of the householder Anāthapiṇḍika (Ch. 9 *a*) and a company of laymen Buddha addresses Sāriputta.
7 Ap. H 5 [92]; and Ch. 13 *c* § 20 [4].
8 *Gihin*; (Ch. 13 *c* § 25; Ch. 13 *d* § 8 [1] n). Cp. *gahapati* (Ch. 7 *a* § 11 [3]), and *upāsaka* (Ch. 8 *l*). White-robed (*odātavasana*; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 ii) is an epithet of the layman, who is contrasted with the yellow-robed monk; Ch. 8 *j*.
9 Ch. 16 *d* § 2 [9].
10 Ch. 10 *c* (2).
11 Ap. H 4, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] (*self-mortification*); Ap. H 3 *b* (*Penalties*)· also Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99] (*restraint*). An essential part of penance was the acknowledgement of error; cp. Ap. H 2 *b* § 5 [1].
12 Int. § 5; Ch. 8 *k*; Ap. F 2 *c* (*Brāhman*).
13 See § 1 [13] below; Ap. A 1 *b* (3).
14 The Supplement; Ap. H 3, *Note*.
15 The speech is attributed to the Buddha, addressing Upāli (Ch. 8 *e* § 2).
16 Omitting unfavourable terms. These scarcely accord with Gotama's known tolerance, and may probably be attributed (IN 6, *Canon*) to those monks who favoured the common life in monasteries rather than the solitary life of the hermit. The condemnation is in accord with the social tendency of Buddhism, which is opposed to individualistic concentration upon self-salvation (Ch. 8 *h*, *Duties*). The Dhūtangas are similarly depreciated in *Parivāra*, VI, v.
17 The forest-dweller is called *āraññaka*. Ch. 8 *k* [8]; Ap. H 5 [93].

arises [the practice of him] who lives [solely] on alms;[1] [3] . . . [of him] who wears [only] rags from the dust-heap;[2] [4] . . . [of him] who lives at the foot of a tree;[3] [5] . . . [of him] who lives in a cemetery;[4] [6] . . . [of him] who lives under the sky;[5] [7] . . . [of him] who will own only three robes;[6] [8] . . . [of him] who proceeds without omission[7] [begging from door to door]; [9] . . . [of him] who sleeps in a sitting posture;[8] [10] . . . [of him] who spreads his couch anywhere;[9] [11] . . . [of him] who sits alone [to eat];[10] [12] . . . [of him] who will not eat after [noon][11] . . . [13] From want of wisdom . . . not from the absence of desire arises [the practice of him] who eats [only] from a begging-bowl.[12] . . . The Dhūtanga-vagga[13] [is ended, being] the sixth chapter.

§ 2. *Sutta-Piṭaka, Khuddaka-Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta, Cūla-vagga 13 (Sammāparibbājaniya-Sutta).*[14]

(1) 'I ask the Sage (*muniṃ*)[15] most wise, who has crossed (*tiṇṇaṃ*), who has gone over (*pāra-gataṃ*),[16] who is completely at peace (*pari-nibbutaṃ*)[17] and steadfast—Having gone forth from the home, having rejected pleasure (*kāme*), how should a Bhikkhu travel rightly (*sammā*)[18] in the world (*loke*)?'

(2) 'He for whom auspices are naught',[19] saith the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*), 'portents, dreams, and signs;[20] he who has abandoned the corruption of auspices such a Bhikkhu travels rightly in the world.

(3) 'Let the Bhikkhu put away desire (*rāgaṃ*)[21] for pleasures (*kāmesu*),[22]

[1] *Piṇḍapātika.* Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (1). Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14] (ii), [15]. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [3] (*rattha-piṇḍo*); and [13] below.

[2] *Paṃsukūlika.* Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (2).

[3] *Rukkhamūlika.* Ch. 8 *d* § 2 (3).

[4] *Sosānika.* Ch. 8 *j* § 10 [1].

[5] *Abbh-okāsika.* 'Living in an unsheltered place', KM, p. 76.

[6] *Te-cīvarika*; Ch. 8 *j*. This impeded cleanliness.

[7] *Sapadāna-cārika.* 'Proceeding from door to door in due order when begging', KM, p. 75. Cp. Ch. 3 § 1.

[8] *Nesajjika.*

[9] *Yathā-santhatika.* 'Spreading a night-couch where one happens to be', KM, p. 7.

[10] *Ek-āsanika.* 'Eating at one sitting', KM. Cp. Ch. 3 § 2 n; Ch. 8 *k* [7] (*invitation*); and Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [10] (*one meal*).

[11] *Khalu-pacchā-bhattika.* This apparently means refusing to eat after midday precisely; less probably, not eating afterwards what one has left. KM, p. 76 and Rhys Davids's *Dict.* cite Childers's *Pāli Dict.*, p. 310. Ch. 8 *j* (*Food*); Ch. 11 *f* § 5 n.

[12] *Pattapiṇḍika.* 'Eating from one vessel only', KM. Cp. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1] (*saṃgha-bhatta*); and [2] above.

[13] *Dhūtanga* means the practice of those shaken (by conscience or religious zeal). See heading above; also Ap. I, *Note.* No. 13 practically repeats no. 2 and is omitted from the *Mahāyāna* list (Int. §§ 21, 22; see KM, p. 76). These ascetic practices show a Hindu and self-regarding rather than a Buddhist and other-regarding tendency (Int. § 3 (*altruism*); cp. Ch. 3 § 7 (*enlightenment*)).

[14] Right travelling or wandering. Cp. Int. § 126, and Ch. 8 *h* § 2 (10). See Ap. I *b* § 2.

[15] Ch. 1 § 6 [55] n; Ch. 22 *b* § 27; Ap. G 2 *a* § 8. In the *Apadāna* or 'Story of the Saints' (Ch. 1 § 8 n) the full title *Sakya-muni* is used (i, p. 42); see also Ch. 13 *c* § 16.

[16] 'Gone to the other shore', SBE, x, p. 58. Cp. *pāragū* (14) below.

[17] Ch. 2 § 2; Ap. C *b* § 11 (89).

[18] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

[19] 'Destroyed', SBE, x, p. 59. Literally, 'struck out'. Ap. I, *Note.*

[20] Int. § 188; Ap. A 2 *d* [21]. These were Brāhman studies (Int. § 190, *Brāhman*). They were objectionable both as pretentious and as egoistic.

[21] Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).

[22] Ap. D *a* § 1.

human and divine[1] (*dibbesu*). Having transcended individual-existence[2] (*bhavaṃ*), walking with the Law, such a Bhikkhu travels rightly in the world.

(4) 'Turning his back on slanders,[3] let the Bhikkhu give up anger,[4] meanness;[5] and give up siding with or against. Such a Bhikkhu travels rightly in the world.

(8) 'The Bhikkhu who perceiving "They greet me" is not uplifted; who being reviled is not resentful;[6] and receiving special food (*para-bhojanaṃ*)[7] is not elated; such a Bhikkhu travels rightly in the world.

(10) 'Knowing what conforms with himself (*sāruppam attano*)[8] the Bhikkhu does not harm (*hiṃseyya*)[9] anyone in the world, truly knowing the Law. Such a Bhikkhu travels rightly in the world.

(14) 'Pure and victorious, he who has lifted the veil,[10] master of his thoughts (*dhammesu*),[11] he who has gone over (*pāra-gū*),[12] unshaken, skilled in the knowledge[13] bringing cessation[14] of individuality,[15] such a Bhikkhu travels rightly in the world.

(15–17) '. . .'

d. Caste-equality[16] in the Order

Vinaya-Piṭaka, Culla-vagga, Khandhaka IX, i. 4.[17]

[4] '. . . Just as,[18] mendicant brothers, all the great rivers, namely Gangā, Yamunā, Aciravati, Sarabhū, Mahī, when they reach the great ocean, lose their former names and differences and are denominated as the great Ocean, even so, mendicant brothers, these four castes Kshatriyas, Brāhmans, Vaisyas, Sūdras, when they go forth from the household to the houseless life under the Law and discipline made known by the Leader, lose their former names and families and are denominated as devotees and disciples of the Sakyan. . . . As the great Ocean, mendicant brothers, has a single savour, the savour of salt, so also, mendicant brothers, this Law and discipline have a single savour, the savour of liberation. . . .'

[1] Ch. 6 *b* § 1; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [9] n; Ap. C *b* § 9. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 6 (*vibhava-taṇhā*); Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5] (*sagga*); Ap. D *a* § 8 (ii, *arūparāga*); Ap. I, *Note* (*self-seeking*); also Ap. C *b* § 10 [2] (*self*). Thus the 'future state' of the individual does not enter into the true Bhikkhu's philosophy (Int. § 7).

[2] Or, individualism; Ap. B *c* § 2 (2). 'After conquering existence', SBE.

[3] Or, malicious speech. Ap. H 4 *a* § 3.

[4] *Kodha*. Ap. D *a* § 8, i (221). Cp. Ap. F 1 *b* § 4 (6).

[5] *Kad-ariya*. 'Avarice', SBE. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17] (*an-ariya*).

[6] Int. § 105.

[7] Ch. 8 *j*.

[8] 'What becomes him', SBE, x, p. 60. Cp. Int. § 113.

[9] Int. § 49.

[10] Pāli, *vivatta-cchadda*; Ch. 14 *c* § 3 [1] n. 'Who has removed the veil (of the world)', SBE. This is language spontaneous to ethical monism (Ap. G 2 *a*, *Unity*). For it transmigration is a superfluity (Ap. B *a* § 6 [8]; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 [2]). The kingdom of heaven may be elsewhere and afar, but is actually in the hearts of the living (Int. § 35, i, *Brahma-vihārā*; Ap. C *b*) and is visible when the craving of individuality is transcended (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18] (*samādhi*). Cp. Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii, *delusion*); Ap. D *b* (*Māyā*).

[11] Or, among phenomena. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3]; cp. Ch. 4 § 10.

[12] Clearly here this is before death. Int. § 12; cp. (1) above. Contrast Ap. B *a* § 7 (306), *parattha*.

[13] *Ñāna*. Ch. 4 § 16.

[14] *Nirodha*. Ch. 5 *b* § 7.

[15] *Saṃkhārā*. Ap. E *a*.

[16] Ch. 17 *b* § 2 [184]. Ch. 18 *b* § 3 [3] n; Ap. F 2 *c* (*caste*); Ap. G 1 *b* § 1. Cp. Int. § 185; Ch. 13 *c* § 10 [ii. 1] (*gotta*).

[17] As in Int. § 155 n; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ap. C *b* § 3.

[18] Ch. 6 *a* § 7.

5. Gotama's Daily Habits[1]

[*Note*. The following abstract is taken from the *Sumaṇgala-Vilāsini* (*I*, *45*), Buddhaghosha's[2] Commentary on the *Dīgha-Nikāya*. The translation is abbreviated from H. C. Warren's *Buddhism in Translations* (1922). The passage is also translated in T. W. Rhys Davids's (Lectures on) Buddhism, its History and Literature (1896).[3] The *Sumaṇgala-Vilāsini* was written about nine centuries after Buddha's death, but the references given below show that the great commentator closely followed the *Canon* in the credible details of his narrative. In adding incredible and unnecessary accessories he doubtless sought to enhance the nobly simple humanity of the Teacher. The whole passage shows clearly what may be called the medieval Buddhism of Buddhaghosha, which differs markedly from the religion of the Emperor Asoka's Edicts[4] and is practically equivalent to the Buddhism of modern Ceylon.[5]]

Buddhaghosha's Sumaṇgala-Vilāsini,[6] *I, 45, translated by H. C. Warren in* 'Buddhism in Translations' (1922), pp. 91–5.

[p. 91] . . . His before-breakfast[7] habits were as follows: The Blessed One would rise early in the morning, and when . . .[8] he had rinsed his mouth[9] and otherwise cared for his person, he would sit retired until it was time to go begging. And when it came time, he would put on his tunic, girdle,[10] and robes, and taking his bowl, he would enter the village or the town for alms. Sometimes he went alone, sometimes surrounded by a congregation of priests. . . .[11] [p. 92] Some would implore him 'Reverend Sir, give us ten priests to feed';[12] some 'Give us twenty'; and some, 'Give us a hundred priests'. And they would take the bowl of the Blessed One, and prepare a seat for him, and zealously show their reverence for him by placing food in the bowl. When he had finished his meal the Blessed One, with due consideration for the different dispositions of their minds, would so teach them the Doctrine that some would become established in the refuges,[13] some in the five precepts,[14] some would become . . .[15] established in the highest fruit, that of saintship,[16] and would retire from the world. . . . He would rise from his seat, and return to the monastery. [p. 93] On his arrival there, he would take his seat in a pavilion, on the

[1] Cp. Ch. 8 *h* (*Duties*); also IN 14, and Ap. H 3, *Note* (*Culla-vagga*, 5).
[2] Int. § 21 and Int. § 14 (*Commentaries*).
[3] 2nd edition 1926, pp. 108–12.
[4] Int. § 12; IN 5, *Note*.
[5] Ap. H 1 §§ 4, 5; Ap. H 2 *a* § 5.
[6] Commentary on the *Dīgha Nik.*
[7] i.e. before noon. Ch. 8 *k* [1]. Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 11 [1]; Ch. 11 *e* § 3 [1] n (*divā-divassa*); Ch. 12 *a* § 8 [1]. Cp. Revata's decision in CV, XII. i. 10 (SBE, xx, pp. 397–8): 'Is it allowable to eat the midday meal beyond the right time, provided only that the shadow has not yet turned two inches?' 'No, it is not allowable.'
[8] Omitting 'out of kindness to his body-servant', i.e. in order to permit him to acquire merit (Ap. B *a* § 6 [9]).
[9] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8].
[10] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].
[11] Omitting 'sometimes without anything especial happening, sometimes with the accompaniment of many prodigies', and examples of miracles, and popular demonstrations. Int. § 94 (iii).
[12] Ch. 8 *d* § 2 [4] (1); Ch. 10 *a* § 7; Ch. 20 § 11 [29]. Cp. Ch. 19 *b* § 6 [13] n.
[13] Ap. H 1 *c*.
[14] Ap. H 4 *b* § 2.
[15] Omitting the stages of Conversion, Once-returning, and Never-returning. Ap. B *a* § 6 [7] n (*Bonds*); clearly Buddhaghosha accepted the doctrine of rebirth (Int. § 92).
[16] Ap. D *c* (*Arahat*).

excellent Buddha-mat[1] which had been spread for him, where he would wait for the priests to finish their meal. When the priests had finished their meal, the body-servant[2] would announce the fact to the Blessed One. Then the Blessed One would enter the perfumed chamber.[3] . . .

Then the Blessed One, having thus finished his before-breakfast duties, would first sit in the perfumed chamber, on a seat that had been spread for him by his body-servant, and would wash his feet.[4] Then taking up his stand on the landing[5] of the jewelled staircase[6] which led to the perfumed chamber, he would exhort the congregation of the priests, saying: 'O priests, diligently work out your salvation.[7] . . .'[8] At this point some would ask the Blessed One for exercises[9] in meditation, and the Blessed One would assign them exercises suited to their several characters. Then all would do obeisance to the Blessed One, and go to the places where they were in the habit of spending the night or the day—some to the forest,[10] some to the foot of trees, some to the hills, and so on. . . .[11] Then the Blessed One, entering the perfumed chamber, would, if he wished, lie down[12] for a while, mindful and conscious, and on his right side after the manner of a lion.[13] And secondly, his body being now refreshed, he would rise and gaze over the world. And thirdly, the people of the village or town near which he might be dwelling, who had given him breakfast, would assemble after breakfast[14] at the monastery. . . .[15] [p. 94] Thereupon the Blessed One, when his audience had assembled . . .[16] taking his seat in the lecture hall, on the excellent Buddha-mat which had been spread for him, (he) would teach the Doctrine, as suited the time and occasion. And when he perceived it was time, he would dismiss the audience. . . .

When he had thus finished his after-breakfast duties, he would rise . . .[17] and if he desired to bathe, he would enter the bath-house[18] and cool his limbs with water made ready by his body-servant. Then the body-servant would fetch the Buddha-seat, and spread it in the perfumed chamber. And the Blessed One, putting on a tunic of double red cloth, and binding on his girdle[19] and throwing his upper robe over his right shoulder,[20] would go thither and sit down and for a while remain solitary, and plunged in

[1] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10] n.
[2] Ch. 8 *j* § 6 [4]; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [2].
[3] Ch. 10 *a* § 2; and Ch. 14 *c* § 2 (*Jetavana*).
[4] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10].
[5] Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1] (*pāsāda*).
[6] Or, on the platform of the steps. Cp. Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [4].
[7] Ch. 22 *b* § 25 [7].
[8] Omitting 'for not often occur the appearance of a Buddha in the world and existence among men and the propitious moment and retirement from the world and the opportunity to hear the true Doctrine'. Ap. A 2 *c* (*Buddhas*).
[9] Ap. I *a*.
[10] Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [1].
[11] Omitting mention of the heaven of the Four Great Kings (Int. § 93, v) and the Vasavatti heaven (Int. § 70, *seventh sphere*; Ch. 13 *c* § 21 [9] n).
[12] *Majjh. Nik.* i, p. 249; OB, p. 168. The midday siesta renders possible the late nights and early mornings of Eastern life; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19].
[13] Ch. 13 *c* § 23 [354]; Ch. 14 *f* § 6 [1]; Ch. 22 *a* § 8 [40]; Ch. 22 *b* § 1.
[14] In the afternoon, after the hot hours.
[15] Omitting descriptions of dress.
[16] Omitting Buddha's miraculous approach. Int. § 94 (iii).
[17] This brings the day to the commencement of evening.
[18] Int. § 190; Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [10] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 2 [1].
[19] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [9].
[20] Ch. 8 *i* § 1 [8] (*wrap*).

meditation.[1] After that would come the priests from here and from there to wait on the Blessed One. And some would propound questions, some would ask for exercises[2] in meditation, and some for a sermon; and in granting their desires the Blessed One would complete the first watch[3] of the night. . . .

And now, when the Blessed One had finished his duties of the first watch of the night, and when the priests had done him obeisance and were departing . . .[4] the Blessed One . . . would complete the middle watch of the night. . . .

The last watch of the night he would divide into three parts, and as his body would be tired from so much sitting since morning, he would spend one part in pacing up and down[5] to free himself from the discomfort. [p. 95] In the second part he would enter the perfumed chamber, and would lie down. . . . In the third part he would rise, and taking his seat, he would gaze over the world with the eye of a Buddha.[6] . . .[7] These were his habits of the last watch of the night.

[1] Ch. 8 *b* § 2 [2]; Ch. 9 *c* § 1 [92]. Cp. Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [19] (noon-day rest). 'The Buddhist bhikkhus in Siam and the great majority of those in Ceylon (the adherents of the Siyam-samâgama) always keep one shoulder uncovered. It is evident that the bhikkhus in Burma and those in Ceylon, who belong to the Amara-pura-samâgama, are more in accordance with ancient custom in wearing the robe ordinarily over both shoulders', SBB, iii, p. 186 n.

[2] Ap. I *a*.

[3] Ch. 4 § 4; Ch. 8 *b* § 4 [1]; Ch. 12 *d* § 3 [2].

[4] In his desire to paint the beauty and augustness of the deep night, whilst the Buddha communed with his soul and all the divine in nature, Buddhaghosha, devout and learned in all the later Buddhist lore, has brought in 'the deities throughout the entire system of ten thousand worlds' to converse with and question the great Teacher. These have been here omitted. Int. § 93 (vi); cp. Ch. 6 *b* § 1 [1] n.

[5] Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [4]; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 6 [4], 11.

[6] Cp. Ap. B *c* § 1 [1].

[7] Omitting the explanation that this was done in order to discover anyone who under a former Buddha had made the 'earnest wish' (cp. Ch. 3 § 5 [165], *effort*) along with almsgiving (Ap. F 1 *a*), keeping the precepts (cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5], *sīla*) or other meritorious acts. This recalls the introduction to the beautiful 'Ten Perfections' in the *Buddha-vaṃsa* (Ap. A 2 *a*).

APPENDIX I

(*Texts supplementary to Chapter* 9)

TRANCES AND OCCULTISM

[*Note.* The knowledge and insight[1] which Gotama sought and found are rather scientific than metaphysical.[2] He sought to penetrate phenomena and find the stable basis supporting their fluctuating forms, rather than to rise above the material world to a higher sphere of spirit. Realizing that everything which has a cause has also a cessation[3] he strove to attain in thought to the uncaused cause, the *amata*,[4] the *akata*,[5] which being ever One and the selfsame[6] suffers no increase or diminution, no origination or decay.[7] From this origin all transient phenomena arise spontaneously,[8] and thus they are made of it rather than by it and are interfused by it rather than transcended by it. In their non-realization of this fundamental union, in the egotism and desirousness of individuals, lies the cause of sorrow.[9] The dualistic attempt to cast off the material world and so reach a higher spiritual sphere is condemned by him as not being due to absence of desire.[10] Having experienced the nature of the attempt he early repudiated the method of trance.[11] The compiler of the *Mahā-parinibbāna-Sutta* attributes to the Teacher on his death-bed a long succession of trances and 'attainments'[12] culminating in his decease; but the account stultifies itself since it describes a procession through eight successively higher stages to the highest followed by a return to the lowest and then again an ascension to the fourth stage, where final release or *parinibbāna* was attained, thus describing sixteen supererogatory stages prior to the ultimate four. These four stages[13] when examined may be seen to be successive efforts to shake off individual desires and so attain to the tranquillity of *upekkhā*, wherein the universal harmony is realized. Herein it is realized that the *amata* is the origin of the whole universe of beauty[14] and right impulse; sorrow and evil finding their natural source in the discords of fleeting individual desires. All that is contrary to this harmony is repudiated by Gotama. True *yoga*[15] is found in the harmonizing activities of *sīla*, *paññā*, and *samādhi*,[16] not in the floating dreams or the dreamlessness of trance. The trance-method is repudiated as exaggerated asceticism is repudiated. These things are not free from egoistic desire. Similarly the Brāhmanic practices of auspices, prognostications, interpretation of omens, dreams, and signs, are repudiated,[17] being calculated to increase and not to diminish personal aims and desires. And in like manner is repudiated all claim to personal spiritual

[1] See below Ap. I *a* (*Higher knowledge*).
[2] Ap. G 1 *a* (iii).
[3] Ch. 5 *c* § 7 [29]; ch. 7 *a* § 19.
[4] Ap. G 2 *a* § 6.
[5] Ap. G 2 *a* § 7.
[6] Ch. 5 *c* § 1 [38] (*self*).
[7] Ch. 1 § 11.
[8] Ap. H 4 *a* § 2 [5] n (*diṭṭhi*).
[9] Ap. D.
[10] Ap. H 4 *c* § 1 [13] (*Dhūtanga*).
[11] Ch. 3 § 7 n.
[12] Ch. 22 *b* § 26.
[13] See *a* (*Trance*) below; RDB, pp. 175–6; Rhys Davids, *Pāli Dict.* (*jhāna*).
[14] Ch. 3 § 5 n; Ch. 5 *a* § 6 [169] (*lotuses*).
[15] Int. § 5; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i) [4].
[16] Ch. 20 § 8 [12] (*Religious Discourse*).
[17] See *b* below.

distinction;[1] and all pretension to powers of a supernatural order. Miracles[2] are attributed in parts of the *Canon* to Buddha and to his disciples; but the *Canon* also records Gotama's disapproval and prohibition of all such personal displays. Here[3] and not only hereafter is the divine life, and it is inconsistent with all self-seeking.[4]

The theory that Gotama himself recommended the habit of Trance, or attainment of states of mystic unconsciousness as distinguished from profound but natural contemplation, is inconsistent with his known teaching. It seems probable that his followers after his death developed the method in sympathy with the later Yoga discipline of the Sāṇkhya school.[5] Doubtless Yoga seeks to get rid of the individual self by immersion in the universal self; but in its isolation it leaves the rest of the world to look after itself and is but seeking its own salvation or escape from the toils of individual existence. Only in active altruism, in the Eightfold Way,[6] could Gotama's spirit find peace. Regarding this subject T. W. Rhys Davids[7] writes as follows: 'Buddhism . . . has not been able to escape from the natural result of the wonder with which abnormal nervous states have always been regarded during the infancy of science. It has mistaken the temporary cessation of the outward signs of life for an actual victory of mind over matter, and has regarded the loss of mental power as the highest form of mental activity. But it must be added, to its credit, that the most ancient Buddhism despises dreams and visions; and that the doctrine of Jhāna is of small practical importance compared with the doctrine of the Noble Eightfold Path.' In the Eightfold Path the last two sections are right recollection (*sammā-sati*) and right transport (*sammā-samādhi*) of which the former consists in remembrance[8] of the transient nature of man's body,[9] sensations, perceptions, individual character, and consciousness, whilst the latter induces a state of mind dependent on this remembrance of individual mortality. Right recollection underwent a process of metamorphosis; remembrance of the transience of all individual life became knowledge of previous existences, divine vision,[10] and knowledge of the process of causation, or alternatively a supernatural knowledge comprising the six *abhiññā*,[11] namely the power of spirit over matter (*iddhi*),[12] the heavenly ear, knowledge of the thoughts of others, knowledge of previous existences, knowledge of future existences and certainty of emancipation.[13] Here the path of duty ends and we enter through a forest of mysticism[14] the realm of miracles, of magic transport through the air, of spirits and talking animals, and those prognostications[15] which Gotama declared to be 'corruption'.]

[1] Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].
[2] Int. § 94.
[3] Ap. C *b*.
[4] Ap. C *b* § 10 [1]; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (3).
[5] IN 8; Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note*. Cp. Eliot, *H. and B.*, ii, p. 304.
[6] Ap. F 2 *d*.
[7] RDB, p. 177.
[8] Ap D *c* § 3 [18].
[9] Ap. E *a* ii.
[10] Ap. B *c* § 1 (1).
[11] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17], and Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]. The list of *abhiññā* occurs at *Dīgha Nik.*, iii, p. 281 (Ap. I *b* § 3).
[12] Ap. I *b*, *Note*; and IN 6 (*Canon*) n.
[13] Ap. B *a* 6 [8] (*Law-Mirror*).
[14] Ap. G 1 *a* (iv).
[15] Ap. H 4 *c* § 2 (2).

a. '*Trance*' (*Jhāna*)[1] *or Meditation*[2] (*sati*); *Exercises*[3] (*bhāvanā*); *and Higher Knowledge*[4]

§ 1. *Sutta Piṭaka, Majjhima Nikāya, Sutta 26* (*Ariya-pariyesana-sutta*).[5]

[174] 'It is just as when,[6] mendicant brothers, a forest deer roaming forests and wooded slopes walks[7] free, stands free, lies free, couches free. And why? He is beyond the range of the hunter. Even so, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu detached from pleasures (*kāmehi*),[8] detached from evil thoughts[9] (*a-kusalehi dhammehi*),[10] attains and dwells in the first contemplation ,with reasoning (*sa-vitakkaṃ*),[11] with investigation (*sa-vicāraṃ*),[12] arising from detachment[13] (*vivekajaṃ*), joyous and blissful (*pīti-sukhaṃ*).[14] . . .[15] And further, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu by the subsidence of reasoning and investigation attains and dwells in the second contemplation, an internal[16] clarity[17] (*sampasādanaṃ*), a concentration of mind (*cetaso*),[18] without reasoning, without investigation arising from transport[19] (*samādhijaṃ*), joyous and blissful. . . . And further, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu by

[1] Absorption or profound contemplation. See *Note* above (*stages*); Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8); Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1]; Ch. 12 *a* § 9 [2], [3] n; Ch. 12 *c* § 4 [5] n; Ch. 12 *e* § 10 n; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92] n; Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6]; Ch. 14 *f* § 14 [4] n; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 1 [1] n, 10 [156] n; Ch. 16 *c* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 16 *d* § 5 [3] n; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [204]; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 n; Ch. 22 *b* § 26; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (1) [33] n. Cp. Int. § 178 (*yoga*); IN 8 *c* (*teachers*); Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [266] (*meditate*); Ap. G 1 *c* § 5 [ix]; also Ch. 22 *a* § 6 [26]; Ap. G 2, *Note* (*meditation*). In later, if not in earlier Buddhism the four Jhānas (Int. § 82) constitute the first stages of the Samāpattis (attainments, Ch. 3 § 4 [66]; cp. Ch. 18 *b* § 4 [79]); these latter are reckoned sometimes as eight and sometimes as nine, the ninth being the attainment of annihilation of the preceding stages. The eight *vimokkhā* (deliverances, Ch. 21 § 11 [33]) correspond with these nine stages, the first three steps being roughly equivalent to the four Jhānas. Cp. Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, pp. 42, 124. That an elaborated Jhāna was not at first adopted by Buddhists is probable (Int. § 66 n; cp. Ch. 16 *c* § 2 n). Compare Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3], where the *Kasiṇa* series is set forth. Compare also *nissaraṇa* (escape; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13]).

[2] Ch. 9 *a* (*concentration*); Ch. 10 *c* [4] (33). Cp. Ap. F 2 *d* (*samādhi*); also Ch. 20 § 5 (1), *exercise*.

[3] Ch. 3 § 4 [6]; Ch. 16 *d* § 3 [6]; Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [424]; Ap. E *c* ii § 2; and Ap. G 1 *b* § 5; also Ch. 16 *d* §§ 2 [13], 7 [2], 8 [6]; Ch. 20 § 6 (1) n. See also Ap. F 2 *b* [6] (*sati*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *quiet*); Ap. H 5 [93]; cp. Ap. E *c* ii.

[4] Full or complete knowledge; Ap. C *b* § 11 (89); Ap. G 1 *a* § 2; Ap. H 1 § 5 (*supernatural knowledge*); Ap. I *b* § 3. Cp. *ñāna* (Ch. 4 § 16); *paññā* (Ap. F 2 *a*, 132); *abhiññā* (Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 [6]); *añña* (Ap. C *a* § 3); *pasāda* (Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]); *dibba-cakkhu* (Ap. B *c* § 1); also *a-vijjā* (Ap. D *b*), and *te-vijjo* (Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482] n).

[5] Ch. 5 *c* § 6; Ap. F 1 *c*.

[6] Ch. 6 *a* § 7 n.

[7] Ch. 9 *a* § 3.

[8] Ch. 9 *a* § 11; Ap. D *a* § 1.

[9] Ap. D (*Evil*); and Ch. 19 *c* § 2 [99].

[10] Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (6); Ap. C *b* § 2.

[11] Ch. 15 *a* § 10 [3] (*notions*); cp. Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (3). See § 2 below.

[12] Ch. 9 *a* § 11.

[13] Or, aloofness, Ch. 13 *c* §§ 6 [246], 29 [4]. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*an-ālaya*). 'Arising from seclusion', ThB, p. 181 (from the *Sāmaññaphala-s.*, *Dīgha Nik.*, i, pp. 73–6, where the four Trances alone appear).

[14] Ch. 9 *a* § 8; Ch. 13 *c* § 14 [92]; Ap. E *b*, *Note*; Ap. F 1 *c*, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [10]; Ch. 18 *d* § 2 [204].

[15] Omitting mention of Māra (Int. § 93, iv) as hunter.

[16] *Ajjhatta*, within the self. Cp. Ch. 21 § 11 [33].

[17] Ch. 11 *d* § 5; Ap. H 1 § 6 [5]. 'Internal serenity', ThB.

[18] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].

[19] Or, self-transcendence; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18]; Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (8); Ch. 21 § 7 [25]. 'Produced by concentration', ThB.

the fading-away[1] (*vi-rāgā*) of joy dwells serene[2] (*upekhako*), self-scrutinizing[3] (*sato*) and comprehending; he experiences[4] bliss in the body and attains and dwells in the third contemplation—that [state] which the noble (*ariyā*)[5] describe as "serene, self-scrutinizing, dwelling in bliss". . . . And further, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu, by the giving up of bliss, by the giving up of sorrow,[6] by the disappearance[7] of gladness and dejection[8] previously [felt] attains and dwells in the fourth contemplation, without sorrow, without bliss, the purification of self-scrutiny[9] in serenity.[10] . . . And further, mendicant brothers, a Bhikkhu, by passing entirely beyond perceptions of form,[11] by the disappearance of perceptions of resistance,[12] by not thinking of perceptions of diversity, saying "Space[13] (*ākāso*) is infinite" attains and dwells in the realm[14] of space-infinity[15] . . . and having passed entirely beyond the realm of space-infinity says "Consciousness (*viññānaṃ*)[16] is infinite",[17] and attains and dwells in the realm of consciousness-infinity . . . and having passed entirely beyond the realm of consciousness-infinity says "There is not any [individual] thing" and attains and dwells in the realm of nothingness[18] . . . [175] and having passed entirely beyond the realm of nothingness he attains and dwells in the realm of neither [individual] perception[19] nor non-perception[20] . . . and having passed entirely beyond the realm of neither perception nor non-perception he attains and

1 Or, absence of desire for. Cp. Ap. D *a* 10 (ii); Ap. E *a* ii 4 (1).

2 Ap. F 2 *b* [6]. 'Indifferent', Warren, *Bm. in Tr.* (1922), p. 348; 'with equanimity', ThB.

3 Ch. 13 *a* § 4 [1]; Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [7]; Ch. 21 §§ 3 [12], 7 [23]; Ap. I *b* § 5 [18]; cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 1 [1] (*satimat*). 'Contemplative', Warren; 'mindful and conscious', ThB, p. 182.

4 *Paṭisaṃvedeti*; Ch. 4 § 5; cp. Ch. 16 *d* § 7 [9] n (*paṭisaṃvedin*).

5 Ap. E *a* ii § 3 [6].

6 Ap. E *b*.

7 *Attha-gama*; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (1).

8 *Domanassa*; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2].

9 *Sati*; Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [18].

10 'With the purity of mindfulness and equanimity', ThB. Cp. Ch. 16 *a* §§ 2 [265] (*unperturbedness*), 5 [3] (viii).

11 *Rūpa*; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]; Ap. E *a* ii § 2.

12 *Patigha*; cp. Ap. F 2 *a* (114). 'Inertia', Warren, p. 348.

13 Or, ether. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23]; also Ch. 18 *d* § 1 [423] (*ether*). Cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (*loka*).

14 *Āyatana*; cp. Ap. B *c* § 2 (2). 'Stage', ThB, p. 184 (from the MPS, *Dīgha Nik.*, ii, p. 156; Buddhaghosha's *Visuddhi-Magga*, ch. xxiii). Cp. also Ch. 2 § 3 (*bhava*).

15 'Infinity of space', SBE, xi, p. 115; ThB, p. 184. More logically, the undivided nature or continuity of space. See Ch. 21 § 11 [33] (4).

16 Ch. 22 *b* § 26; also Ch. 11 *c* § 20 [18] n; Ch. 17 *d* § 4 [3] (*mind-unity*); Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]; cp. Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *jīva*).

17 Perhaps continuous, without internal boundaries.

18 Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]. Perhaps, nothing separated or individualized, i.e. continuity. Cp. Ch. 5 *c* § 3 [45] (*not this*); Ap. D *b* (*Māyā*); Ap. E *c* i (*an-attā*); Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (1, *death*); Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i) [23] (*world beyond*).

19 The Pāli word is *saññā*. Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [8].

20 Ch. 14 *d* § 3 n; Ch. 16 *a* § 2 [265]; and Ch. 16 *d* § 8 [8] (*nine*) n. Gotama is represented earlier in this Sutta (Ch. 3 § 5 [165]) as having rejected the teachings of Uddaka as of Āḷāra Kāḷāma because they did not proceed further than this and the preceding realms respectively. It is implied in the present passage that had they proceeded to the next step, namely the cessation of perception and sensation, he would have been satisfied, and that his own achievement was the attainment of this. This would mean that the contribution of Buddhism to religion consisted in the ninth stage (Ap. G 2 *a* § 9 n) of trance, or complete cessation of perception and feeling, a meagre substitute for the Third Truth (Ch. 5 *b* § 7) and Gotama's ethical system. Cp. § 4 below (*upekhā*); also Ch. 14 *c* § 10 [6] (*perception*); Ch. 18 *a* § 2 [259] n; Ch. 18 *f* § 2 [13] (*percipient*).

dwells in the cessation[1] of perception and sensation.[2] And on insight (*paññāya*)[3] appearing his taints (*āsavā*)[4] are ended. Of this Bhikkhu, mendicant brothers, it is said: "He has made Māra[5] blind, he has struck the eye of Māra so that it cannot follow, he has become invisible to the evil one (*pāpimato*), he has passed beyond adherence[6] to the world (*loke*). . . .[7] He is beyond the range of the evil one." ' Thus spoke the Blessed One; the mendicant brothers rejoicing welcomed the word of the Blessed One.[8]

§ 2. *Saṃyutta Nikāya, Saḷāyatana-vagga, Rahogataka-saṃyutta (Sam. ii), Sutta 11 (Rahogataka).*[9] *(PTS, IV, p. 217.)*

'. . .[10] [5] Moreover, mendicant brother, the gradual (*anupubbaṃ*)[11] cessation of the composite-unity[12] (*saṅkhārānaṃ*) is announced by me. For one who has attained the first trance speech ceases. For one who has attained the second trance reasoning[13] and investigation cease. For one who has attained the third trance joy ceases. For one who has attained the fourth trance exhalation and inhalation[14] cease. For one who has attained the realm of space-infinity perception of form ceases. For one who has attained the realm of consciousness-infinity the perception of space-infinity ceases. For one who has attained the realm of nothingness the perception of consciousness-infinity ceases. For one who has attained the realm of neither perception nor non-perception the perception of the realm of nothingness ceases. For one who has attained the cessation of perception and sensation both perception and sensation (*vedanā*)[15] cease. For the Bhikkhu whose taints[16] are ended desire ceases, hate ceases, delusion[17] ceases.'

§ 3. *Vinaya-Piṭaka, Sutta-vibhaṅga, Pātimokkha, Pārājika IV.*[18]

'Whatsoever mendicant brother, not being conscious of capacity above [ordinary] human-nature, shall claim as his own the knowledge and insight of the truly noble saying 'Thus I know, thus I see', and then at a later time, whether compelled or not compelled, being guilty and desirous of purification shall say thus: 'Not knowing, friends, I said that I knew, not seeing I said that I saw, telling an empty falsehood', he too is expelled and is not in communion.'

1 *Nirodha*; Ap. B *c* § 2 [2]. Cp. § 4 below (*serenity*).
2 Pāli *vedayita*; see § 2 (*vedanā*) below; Ap. E *a* ii § 2. 'Consciousness and feeling', ThB, p. 184 n. 'The consciousness of sensations and of ideas', SBE, xi, p. 115.
3 Or, understanding. Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4].
4 Ap. D *a* § 7.
5 Ap. D *b* § 4; Ap. G 2 *b*.
6 *Visattika*. Cp. Ch. 5 *b* § 7 (*an-ālaya*).
7 Omitting comparison with the deer.
8 In this Sutta the exposition of the Trances takes the place of the First Sermon (Ch. 5 *b* § 9 n) and is plainly unauthentic. The connexion between the two parts of the trance-series is clearly artificial; compare the Chain of Causation in Ap. B *c*, and the obviously compounded list of Stages in Ap. D *c*. See also IN 6 (*Canon*).
9 Concerning the Solitary.
10 Buddha addresses an unnamed Bhikkhu.
11 Ch. 6 *a* § 4 [5].
12 Or, individuality.
13 See § 1 [174] above.
14 Ch. 9 *a* [2]. Spiritual exercises here merge into physical.
15 See § 1 [175] above; Ch. 9 *a* § 3 [11]; Ch. 22 *b* § 26 [8].
16 Ap. D *a* § 7.
17 These are the Three Fires of individuality (Ap. D *a* 10). In the authentic and early Fire Sermon no recourse to trance or any realm of the inane is mentioned as needed for escape from these Fires (Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [2]).
18 As in Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].

§ 4. *Sutta Piṭaka, Aṅguttara Nikāya, Tika-nipāta, Sutta 63.*[1]

[6] 'When I have returned from seeking alms having taken my meal, I go to a grove, and there I heap together grasses or leaves, such as are found there, and seat myself thereon with crossed legs, and holding the body erect I fix my thought (*satiṃ*) intently.[2] So I stay whilst I suffuse with a mind (*cetasā*)[3] full of loving-kindness one world-quarter, then a second, then a third, then a fourth. Thus I stay whilst I suffuse the whole world above, below, across, on all sides, in all completeness, with a mind full of loving-kindness . . . with a mind full of pity . . . with a mind full of sympathetic-joy . . . with a mind full of serenity,[4] wide, extended, unmeasured, without enmity, without ill-will.'

§ 5. *Aṅguttara Nikāya, Dasaka-nipāta, Sutta 95* (*Uttiya*).

. . .[5] [2] 'Then what has been declared by the respected Gotama?' 'I show to hearers, Uttiya, through a higher-knowledge (*abhiññāya*)[6] the Law, for the purification of living beings, for the overcoming of griefs and lamentations, for the removal of sorrow and dejection, for the attainment of the Way (*ñāyassa*), for the realization of Peace.'[7]

b. Occultism,[8] *Mysticism,*[9] *and Magic* (*iddhi*)[10] *rejected*

§ 1. *Vinaya Piṭaka, Culla-vagga V, xxxiii.*

[2] At that time the party of six dissentient mendicant brothers[11] learnt the base arts (*tiracchāna-vijjaṃ*)[12] [of prophecies, omens, and the like]. . . . 'The base arts, mendicant brothers, must not be learnt', he said; 'whosoever learns them is guilty of a grave offence.'[13] And at that time the party of six dissentient mendicant brothers taught the base arts. . . . 'The base arts, mendicant brothers, must not be taught', he said; 'whosoever teaches them is guilty of a grave offence.'

§ 2. *Sutta Piṭaka, Khuddaka Nikāya, Sutta-Nipāta, Sammā-paribbājaniya-sutta.*[14]

(2) 'He for whom auspices are naught', said the Blessed One (*Bhagavā*), 'portents, dreams and signs; he who has abandoned the corruptions of auspices; such a Bhikkhu travels rightly in the world.'

§ 3. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 34* (*Dasuttara-s.*).

. . .[15] [7(x)] 'What six ideas[16] (*dhammā*) must be realized (*sacchikātabbā*)?

[1] As in Ap. F 2 *b*.
[2] *Parimukhaṃ*, in front.
[3] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].
[4] Cp. 1 above (*cessation*); Ap. C *b*.
[5] As in Ap. G 1 *a* § 4.
[6] Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6).
[7] Ap. C *b*.
[8] Int. §§ 95, 188; Ch. 8 *b* § 6 [*d*].
[9] Ap. G 1 *a* (iv); and Int. § 22 (*metaphysical*).
[10] Ch. 9 *c* (heading) and § 2 [1]; Ch. 18 *b* § 2 [476] n; Ap. A 2 *d* (*practices*); Ap. C *b* § 9 (*power*). Cp. Int. §§ 22 (*miraculous*), 94.
[11] Int. § 179; Ch. 8 *c* § 3.
[12] Literally, animal-science; Ap. A 2 *d* [21]. 'The low arts (of divination, spells, omens, astrology, sacrifices to the gods, witchcraft, and quackery)', SBE, xx.
[13] Ap. H 1 § 2.
[14] As in Ap. H 4 *c* § 2.
[15] The discourse is attributed to Sāriputta (Ch. 10 *c*, 2), who is said to have delivered it in the presence of the Blessed One at Campā (Int. § 146), on the bank of the Gaggarā lotus pond (Ch. 11 *e* § 1 [1]). It forms the last Sutta of the *Dīgha-Nikāya*, and its late date is pointed out in Rhys Davids's *Pāli Dict.* (*abhiññā*); see IN 6 (*Canon*).
[16] 'Doctrines', ThB, p. 260. Ch. 7 *a* § 5 [3].

The six higher knowledges (*abhiññā*).[1] Here, friends (*āvuso*), the Bhikkhu comes to manifold kinds of power (*iddhi-vidhaṃ*).[2] Being one he becomes multiplied,[3] being multiplied he becomes one; detaching himself he becomes visible [elsewhere] and goes to a distance; goes through partitions, through walls, through mountains, just as through the air; rises from or dives into the earth, just as through water; walks upon solid water, just as on earth; travels cross-legged through the air, just as a bird on the wing; touches and feels with his hand the moon and sun, so potent and majestic; and exercises influence as far as the Brahmā-world (*Brahma-lokā*)[4] with the body.[5] With the divine hearing-faculty (*sota-dhātuyā*),[6] purified, superhuman,[7] he hears sounds both divine and human, both far and near. With the mind (*cetasā*)[8] he comprehends and knows the minds of other beings and other men (*para-puggalānaṃ*);[9] a desirous mind he knows to be desirous and a mind without desire he knows to be without desire, a mind . . . without hate . . . without delusion[10] . . . unperturbed . . . not overbearing . . . unsurpassed, a mind composed . . . a mind liberated (*vimuttaṃ*)[11] he knows to be liberated, and a mind unliberated he knows to be unliberated. He follows up [his] repeated rebirth[12] (*pubbe-nivāsaṃ*), namely one birth (*jātiṃ*),[13] two births . . . a hundred . . . a hundred thousand births through many ascending aeons[14] and many cycles of aeons ascending and descending . . .[15] thus he follows up [his] repeated rebirth with recital of details. With the divine eye,[16] purified, superhuman,[17] he sees beings moving on (*cavamāne*), proceeding (*uppajjamāne*),[18] lowly, exalted, fair, foul, well-faring (*sugate*),[19] ill-faring, undergoing [lives] according to their [previous] action.[20] By the destruction of the taints (*āsavānaṃ*)[21] he knows fully and realizes in

[1] Here 'occult powers'; Ap. I, *Note*. Cp. Ch. 9 *c* § 3 [1] (*tevijja*); Ch. 14 *c* § 14 [3]; Ch. 14 *e* § 7 [1] n; Ap. G 1 *a* § 3 (6); Ap. I *a* (*knowledge*). This definition is found also in *Dīgha* 28 (PTS, iii, p. 110) and elsewhere.

[2] The definition of *iddhi* is found also in *Dīgha* 11 (see § 4 below), *Dīgha* 28 (see § 5 below) and elsewhere (Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] n; Ch. 19 *c* § 2 n; Ch. 23 *a* [9] n). See § 6 below; also Ap. H 1 § 5 (*supernatural knowledge*), and Ch. 12 *d* § 6 [1] (*power*). Cp. Ch. 6 *a* § 5 [8] n (*iddh-ābhisaṃkhāraṃ*).

[3] This is 'the power to project mind-made images of oneself' (Rhys Davids's *Pāli Dict.*, *iddhi*).

[4] Int. § 70.

[5] '(He can) reach in body the heaven of Brahmā', Keith, *Buddh. Phil.*, p. 129.

[6] Ch. 16 *a* § 1 [502] n. *Dhātu* means element, constituent part, factor; cp. Ap. E *b* § 3 (2).

[7] Cp. Int. § 69 n; Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5].

[8] Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29]. These definitions are found also in *Dīgha* 2 (PTS, i, p. 79 ff). Mind-reading is termed *ādesanā* in *Dīgha* 11 (see § 4 [7] below). Cp. Ch. 14 *c* § 14 [4] n.

[9] Ap. E *b* § 2.

[10] Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii). See Ch. 9 *a* § 4 [12] n.

[11] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[12] Or, previous abiding. Ch. 10 *c* [4] (40); Ap. B *c* § 1 (1, *first watch*). This recollected knowledge is the basis of the *Jātaka* birth stories (Ap. F 1 *a* § 2), the *Buddha-Vaṃsa* (Ap. A 2 *a*) and the Vipassin legend (Ap. G 1 *b* § 2), and is devised as a support to the Karma doctrine (Ap. B *a*).

[13] Ap. B *c* § 2 (2).

[14] The Pāli word is *kappa*. Int. § 107.

[15] Omitting mention of his name, family (*gotta*), colour (*vaṇṇa*), and other details. Cp. the legend of Vipassin Buddha (Ch. 1 § 1 n).

[16] Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] (*vision*); Ch. 12 *c* § 9 [482] n; Ch. 13 *b* § 6; Ap. A 1 *b* (4); Ap. B *c* § 1 (1, *divine vision*). See *Dīgha* 2 [95] (SBB, ii, p. 91) and *Dīgha* 28 (PTS, iii, p. 111).

[17] Ch. 8 *d* § 7 [5].

[18] Or, re-born; Ap. E *a* ii § 4 (2).

[19] Ap. C *a* § 2 (126).

[20] *Yathā kammam.* Ap. B *a*.

[21] Or, passions. Ap. D *a* § 7.

this world[1] by himself[2] and enters upon taintless liberation[3] of the mind, a liberation by insight.[4] These six ideas must be realized.'

§ 4. *Dīgha Nikāya, Suttanta 11* (*Kevaddha-s.*).[5]

. . .[6] [5] 'One faithful[7] believer declares to another regarding a faithless disbeliever: "Surprising indeed, sir (*bho*), strange[8] indeed, sir, the great potency (*mah'-iddhikatā*)[9] and eminence of the *samaṇa*.[10] . . ." Seeing indeed in *iddhi*-marvels[11] (*iddhi-patihāriye*) this danger, I am grieved at, am repelled by, am averse from, *iddhi*-marvels. . . . [7] Seeing indeed in thought-reading[12] marvels this danger, I am grieved at, am repelled by, am averse from, thought-reading marvels. [8] And what, Kevaddha, is the marvel of teaching[13] (*anusāsani-patihāriyaṃ*). Here, Kevaddha, a Bhikkhu teaches thus: "Reason[14] (*vi-takketha*) in this way, do not reason in that way; think in this way, do not think in that way; avoid[15] (*pajahatha*) this, attain[16] and abide in that." '

§ 5. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 28* (*Sampasādanīya-s.*).[17]

. . .[18] [18] 'There are, revered sir, these two powers (*iddhiyo*). There is, revered sir, power which being associated with the taints[19] (*sâsavā*), and with the bases [of egoism] (*sa-upadhikā*),[20] is called "not noble".[21] There is, revered sir, power, which being without the taints and without the bases [of egoism], is called "noble (*ariyā*)".[22] . . .[23] And what, revered sir,

[1] Ap. C *b* § 4. [2] Ap. E *c* ii § 1. [3] Ap. D *a* § 6.

[4] *Paññā*; Ap. F 2 *a* (132). 'Certainty of emancipation already attained', Rhys Davids's *Pāli Dict.* (*abhiññā*). This sixth *abhiññā* is ethical and had plainly no connexion originally with the preceding list.

[5] Ch. 17 *e*, n; Ap. G 2 *a* § 1. 'In this curious dialogue the Buddha is asked to authorize the performance of miracles. . . . He refuses categorically, saying there are three sorts of wonders namely *iddhi*, that is flying through the air, &c.: the wonder of manifestation which is thought-reading: and the wonder of education. Of the first two he says "I see danger in their practice and therefore I loathe, abhor, and am ashamed of them". . . . He adds that the true miracle is the education of the heart', Eliot, *H. and B.*, i, p. 320.

[6] The scene is the Pāvārika mango-grove at Nālandā (Ch. 11 *d* § 5). Buddha's interlocutor is Kevaddha, the householder's son. The discussion is on *iddhi*, which is described in full (see § 3 above).

[7] *Saddhā*; Ch. 8 *l* § 2 [180]. [8] Ap. B *c* § 4 [1].

[9] Ch. 19 *b* § 7 [14]. Cp. Ch. 7 *a* § 2 [xx. 17]. [10] Ap. A 2 *d* [21].

[11] Or, magic. Ch. 9 *c* § 2 [2]; Ch. 11 *a* § 2; Ch. 12 *a* § 5 [i. 19], [ii. 2] n; Ch. 13 *a* § 10 [4]. Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 4 (*marvellous*).

[12] *Ādesanā*; literally, pointing out. The details following are as in § 3 above (*mind*).

[13] Ch. 6 *a* § 7 [10]; Ap. A 1 *b* (10). Cp. Ch. 12 *d* § 4 (*marvellous*).

[14] Cp. E *a* ii § 4 (3).

[15] Rid yourselves of (Ap. G 1 *a* § 4 [4]), or renounce (Ap. H 4 *a* § 4 [8]). The avoidance of selfish desire is the essence of Buddha's doctrine (IN 5 *b*; Ch. 5 *c* § 4, *nibbindati*; Ap. D *a*, *upādāna*). [16] Ap. D *c* § 1; Ap. E *c* ii § 1.

[17] Discourse on clear faith. Ap. H 1 § 6 [5].

[18] The scene is the Pāvārika mango-grove at Nālandā (Ch. 11 *d* § 5). Sāriputta (Ch. 10 *c*, 7) declares to Buddha his clear faith and repeats the main points of the Doctrine.

[19] Ap. D *a* § 7. [20] Cp. Ch. 7 *a* 8 (*supports*).

[21] Ch. 5 *b* § 4 [17]. Cp. Ch. 10 *b* § 3 [4] (*lower sort*); Ch. 10 *c* [2] (11) n.

[22] This 'noble' power is that of rising above individuality. Cp. Ch. 10 *c* [1] (3); Ap. F 2 *d* (*transcendence*).

[23] Omitting a description of 'non-noble' *iddhi*, including the details found in § 3 above.

is the power which is called "noble"? Here, revered sir, a Bhikkhu, if he wishes "In the impurity[1] [of this life] let me live conscious of that which is not impure", thereupon lives conscious of that which is not impure; if he wishes "In that which is not impure let me live conscious of that which is impure", thereupon lives conscious of that which is impure; if he wishes "Both in the impurity [of this life] and in that which is not impure let me live conscious of that which is not impure", thereupon lives conscious of that which is not impure; if he wishes "Both in that which is not impure and in the impurity [of this life] let me live conscious of that which is impure", thereupon lives conscious of that which is impure; if he wishes "Turning completely away[2] both from the impurity [of this life] and alike from that which is not pure let me live serene, self-scrutinizing, (*sato*),[3] and comprehending", thereupon lives serene, self scrutinizing, and comprehending. This power, revered sir, being without the taints and without the bases [of egoism] is called "noble".'

§ 6. *Dīgha Nikāya, Sutta 18* (*Janavasabha-suttanta*).[4]

. . .[5] [22] 'Then what think ye? . . .[6] As taught by that Blessed One, the wise, the seeing, the saint, the supremely-enlightened,[7] there are these four bases[8] of power (*iddhi-pādā*).[9] . . .[10] What four? Here, sirs (*bho*), the Bhikkhu practises the base of power acquiring[11] concentration of a transcendent effort of purpose;[12] the base of power acquiring concentration of a transcendent effort of will;[13] the base of power acquiring concentration of a transcendent effort of mind;[14] the base of power acquiring concentration of a transcendent effort[15] of thought.[16] These four bases of power, sirs, are taught by that Blessed One, the wise, the seeing, the saint, the supremely-enlightened. . . .'

1 The Pāli word is *paṭi-kkūla*, literally, against the slope, i.e. objectionable.
2 Cp. Ch. 5 *c* 4 (*nibbindati*).
3 The epithets are applied to the third Meditation (Ap. I *a* § 1 [174])
4 Ch. 12 *e* § 6.
5 This discourse on the rebirth of the faithful is attributed to Buddha at Nādikā (Ap. B *a* § 6 [6]). 'An extension of the discourse to the people of Nādikā as given in No. 16 [MPS, ii. 5–11], in which Buddha repeats a story told him by the yakkha Janavasabha', ThB, p. 258; Int. § 93 (vii) n; Ap. B *c* § 4 [4].
6 The speech is attributed to Brahmā Sanaṃkumāra (Int. § 70), seated on the throne of (i.e. as) Sakka, ruler of the gods (Int. § 93, i).
7 Ch. 5 *b* § 10.
8 Or, constituents.
9 Ch. 11 *c* § 25 [44] n; Ch. 21 § 10 [3]; Ap. G 1 *b*, *Note* and § 4.
10 The words omitted are doubtful.
11 Pāli *samannāgata*. Ch. 8 *g* § 8 [1]; Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.
12 Or, impulse; Pāli *chanda*. Cp. Ch. 9 *a* § 13 (6); Ap. D *a* § 8 (*ii*, *kāma-cchanda*).
13 Or, energy; *viriya*. Ch. 9 *a* §§ 8, 13 (6); Ap. F 2 *a* (137).
14 Pāli *citta*; Ch. 5 *b* § 9 [29].
15 Pāli *padhāna*; Ch. 3 § 5 [167]; Ch. 10 *b* § 2.
16 Investigation or examination. Pāli *vīmāṃsā*. Cp. Ap. E *c* i § 4 [7] (*mano*); Ap. G 2 *c*, *Note* (*Mīmāṃsā*).

LIST OF PASSAGES FROM PĀLI BOOKS TRANSLATED AND INCLUDED IN THE PRESENT WORK

A. CANONICAL BOOKS

VINAYA PIṬAKA

Sutta-Vibhaṅga (*Pātimokkha*), *Mahā-vibhaṅga:*

Nidāna. Ch. 8 *b* § 5.
Pārājika. Ch. 8 *b* § 6; Ch. 9 *c* § 3; Ch. 12 *a* § 2. Ap. H 1 §§ 4–5 (Ceylon *Kamma-vācā*); Ap. 1 *a* § 3.
Saṃghādisesa. Ap. H 3 *b* § 1.
Pācittiya, lxxxiv, 2 (Ch. 18 *b* § 1).

Mahā-vagga

Khandhaka I. Ch. 4 §§ 9–15; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 2–4; Ch. 5 *b* §§ 3–9; Ch. 5 *c* §§ 1–5, 7–10; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 2–14; Ch. 6 *b* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 2–6, 11–15, 18–24; Ch. 7 *b* §§ 7–8; Ch. 7 *c* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 8 *d* §§ 1–7; Ch. 8 *e* §§ 6, 7; Ch. 8 *g* §§ 1, 4, 5; Ch. 8 *i* § 1; Ch. 11 *a* §§ 2, 5; Ch. 11 *b* §§ 2, 3; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 1, 3. Ap. B *b* § 5; Ap. B *c* § 2; Ap. C *b* §§ 1, 2; Ap. D *b* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1; Ap. H 2 *a* §§ 1–4, 5 (Ceylon *Kamma-vācā*); Ap. H 2 *b* §§ 1–5; Ap. H 2 *c* §§ 1, 2 (Ceylon *Kamma-vācā*).
Khandhaka II. Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 8 *b* §§ 1–3, 7; Ch. 8 *e* § 1; Ch. 8 *f* §§ 1–4; Ch. 8 *g* §§ 2, 6; Ch. 11 *d* § 11. Ap. H 1 §§ 1–3.
Khandhaka III. Ch. 8 *c* §§ 1–3.
Khandhaka IV. Ch. 8 *c* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 11 *f* §§ 1, 3, 4, 7.
Khandhaka V. Ch. 8 *j* §§ 6, 7; Ch. 11 *a* § 4; Ch. 11 *c* § 22; Ch. 17 *d* § 2.
Khandhaka VI. Ch. 8 *j* §§ 8, 9; Ch. 11 *d* § 15; Ch. 12 *c* § 11; Ch. 12 *e* § 5; Ch. 13 *a* § 7; Ch. 15 *a* § 12; Ch. 16 *d* § 6. Ap. B *b* §§ 3, 4.
Khandhaka VII. Ch. 8 *j* § 5; Ch. 14 *e* § 2.
Khandhaka VIII. Ch. 8 *i* § 2; Ch. 8 *j* §§ 1–4; Ch. 11 *d* § 1; Ch. 12 *c* § 1; Ch. 12 *d* § 3; Ch. 14 *c* § 17; Ch. 15 *a* § 12; Ch. 17 *e*.
Khandhaka IX. Ch. 8 *e* § 5; Ch. 15 *a* § 15.
Khandhaka X. Ch. 15 *a* § 2; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 11, 12. Ap. F 1 *b* § 1.

Culla-vagga

Khandhaka I. Ch. 15 *b* § 13. Ap. H 3 *b* § 2.
Khandhaka II. Ch. 8 *g* § 7.
Khandhaka IV. Ch. 11 *c* § 24.
Khandhaka V. Ch. 8 *l* § 4; Ch. 9 *c* § 2; Ch. 12 *c* § 2; Ch. 13 *c* § 2. Ap. I *b* § 1.
Khandhaka VI. Ch. 8 *e* § 2; Ch. 8 *g* § 8; Ch. 8 *j* § 10; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 6–12; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 14 *b* § 1; Ch. 14 *c* § 1.
Khandhaka VII. Ch. 10 *b* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 13; Ch. 19 *b*.
Khandhaka IX. Ch. 8 *b* § 4; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 13 *a*. Ap. C *b* § 3; Ap. D *c* § 4; Ap. G 1 *b* § 1; Ap. H 4 *d*.
Khandhaka X. Ch. 12 *b* §§ 2, 3.
Khandhaka XI. Ch. 8 *e* § 3; Ch. 13 *a* § 4; Ch. 15 *b* § 15; Ch. 23 *b*.

Parivāsa: Ap. H 4 *c* § 1.

SUTTA PIṬAKA

Dīgha Nikāya

Sutta 1 (*Brahmajāla-s.*): Ch. 8 *j* § 11; Ch. 11 *d* § 8. Ap. A 2 *d*; Ap. E *c* i § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii); Ap. H 4 *a* § 4.
Sutta 2 (*Sāmaññaphala-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 23; Ch. 19 *c* § 2. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i).
Sutta 3 (*Ambaṭṭha-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 10; Ch. 14 *d* § 5.
Sutta 4 (*Soṇadaṇḍa-s.*): Ch. 11 *e* § 1.
Sutta 5 (*Kūtadanta-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 10.
Sutta 6 (*Mahāli-s.*): Ch. 12 *c* § 4; Ch. 14 *a* § 2. Ap. C *b* § 4; Ap. D *c* § 1.
Sutta 7 (*Jāliya-s.*): Ch. 15 *b* § 1.
Sutta 9 (*Poṭṭhapāda-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 10.
Sutta 10 (*Subha-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 8.
Sutta 11 (*Kevaddha-s.*): Ap. G 2 *a* § 1; Ap. I *b* § 4.
Sutta 12 (*Lohicca-s.*): Ch. 14 *f* § 10; Ch. 15 *a* § 3.
Sutta 13 (*Tevijja-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 6. Ap. D *a* § 9 (i), (iv); Ap. G 1 *a* § 8; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i).
Sutta 14 (*Mahā-'padāna-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 2. Ap. B *c* § 3; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2.
Sutta 15 (*Mahā-nidāna-s.*): Ap. B *c* § 4; Ap. D *a* § 5; Ap. E *c* i § 3.
Sutta 16 (*Mahā-parinibbāna-s.*): Ch. 8 *g* § 3; Ch. 11 *c* § 25; Ch. 12 *c* § 12; Ch. 12 *d* § 1; Ch. 13 *a* § 1; Ch. 19 *d*; Chs. 20–2. Ap. B *a* § 6; Ap. C *a* § 4; Ap. E *c* ii §§ 4, 5; Ap. G 1 *b* §§ 3, 4; Ap. H 3 *a* §§ 1–3.
Sutta 18 (*Janavasabha-s.*): Ch. 12 *e* § 6; Ch. 16 *b* § 1. Ap. I *b* § 6.
Sutta 19 (*Mahā-Govinda-s.*): Ch. 15 *a* § 1; Ch. 17 *c*.
Sutta 20 (*Mahā-samaya-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 17.
Sutta 21 (*Sakka-pañha-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 12.
Sutta 22 (*Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-s.*): Ch. 9 *a*. Ap. C *a* § 3.
Sutta 23 (*Pāyāsi-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 2.
Sutta 24 (*Pāṭika-s.*): Ch. 12 *a* § 5; Ch. 12 *d* § 2; Ch. 13 *a* § 10.
Sutta 25 (*Udumbārika-sīhanāda-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 11.
Sutta 26 (*Cakkavatti-sīhanāda-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 13.
Sutta 27 (*Aggañña-s.*): Ch. 18 *b* § 3; Ch. 18 *c* § 2.
Sutta 28 (*Sampasādanīya-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 5. Ap. I *b* § 5.
Sutta 29 (*Pāsādika-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 24. Ap. G 1 *a* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii).
Sutta 30 (*Lakkhana-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 3.
Sutta 31 (*Singālovāda-s.*): Ch. 9 *b*.
Sutta 33 (*Sangīti-s.*): Ch. 13 *a* § 3.
Sutta 34 (*Dasuttara-s.*): Ap. I *b* § 3.

Majjhima Nikāya

Sutta 1 (*Mūla-pariyāya-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 3.
Sutta 2 (*Sabb-āsava-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 4.
Sutta 12 (*Mahā-sīhanāda-s.*): Ch. 12 *c* § 10.
Sutta 14 (*Cūla-dukkhakkhandha-s.*): Ch. 9 *c* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* § 8; Ch. 13 *c* § 14.
Sutta 16 (*Ceto-khila-s.*): Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii).
Sutta 18 (*Madhupiṇḍika-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 18.
Sutta 21 (*Kakacūpana-s.*): Ap. F 1 *b* § 2.
Sutta 24 (*Ratha-vinīta-s.*): Ch. 14 *e* § 3

LIST OF PASSAGES FROM PĀLI BOOKS TRANSLATED AND INCLUDED IN THE PRESENT WORK

A. CANONICAL BOOKS

Vinaya Piṭaka

Sutta-Vibhaṅga (*Pātimokkha*), *Mahā-vibhaṅga:*

Nidāna. Ch. 8 *b* § 5.
Pārājika. Ch. 8 *b* § 6; Ch. 9 *c* § 3; Ch. 12 *a* § 2. Ap. H 1 §§ 4–5 (Ceylon *Kamma-vācā*); Ap. 1 *a* § 3.
Saṃghādisesa. Ap. H 3 *b* § 1.
Pācittiya, lxxxiv, 2 (Ch. 18 *b* § 1).

Mahā-vagga

Khandhaka I. Ch. 4 §§ 9–15; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 2–4; Ch. 5 *b* §§ 3–9; Ch. 5 *c* §§ 1–5, 7–10; Ch. 6 *a* §§ 2–14; Ch. 6 *b* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 2–6, 11–15, 18–24; Ch. 7 *b* §§ 7–8; Ch. 7 *c* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 8 *d* §§ 1–7; Ch. 8 *e* §§ 6, 7; Ch. 8 *g* §§ 1, 4, 5; Ch. 8 *i* § 1; Ch. 11 *a* §§ 2, 5; Ch. 11 *b* §§ 2, 3; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 1, 3. Ap. B *b* § 5; Ap. B *c* § 2; Ap. C *b* §§ 1, 2; Ap. D *b* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c* § 1; Ap. H 2 *a* §§ 1–4, 5 (Ceylon *Kamma-vācā*); Ap. H 2 *b* §§ 1–5; Ap. H 2 *c* §§ 1, 2 (Ceylon *Kamma-vācā*).
Khandhaka II. Ch. 8 *a*; Ch. 8 *b* §§ 1–3, 7; Ch. 8 *e* § 1; Ch. 8 *f* §§ 1–4; Ch. 8 *g* §§ 2, 6; Ch. 11 *d* § 11. Ap. H 1 §§ 1–3.
Khandhaka III. Ch. 8 *c* §§ 1–3.
Khandhaka IV. Ch. 8 *c* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 11 *f* §§ 1, 3, 4, 7.
Khandhaka V. Ch. 8 *j* §§ 6, 7; Ch. 11 *a* § 4; Ch. 11 *c* § 22; Ch. 17 *d* § 2.
Khandhaka VI. Ch. 8 *j* §§ 8, 9; Ch. 11 *d* § 15; Ch. 12 *c* § 11; Ch. 12 *e* § 5; Ch. 13 *a* § 7; Ch. 15 *a* § 12; Ch. 16 *d* § 6. Ap. B *b* §§ 3, 4.
Khandhaka VII. Ch. 8 *j* § 5; Ch. 14 *e* § 2.
Khandhaka VIII. Ch. 8 *i* § 2; Ch. 8 *j* §§ 1–4; Ch. 11 *d* § 1; Ch. 12 *c* § 1; Ch. 12 *d* § 3; Ch. 14 *c* § 17; Ch. 15 *a* § 12; Ch. 17 *e*.
Khandhaka IX. Ch. 8 *e* § 5; Ch. 15 *a* § 15.
Khandhaka X. Ch. 15 *a* § 2; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 11, 12. Ap. F 1 *b* § 1.

Culla-vagga

Khandhaka I. Ch. 15 *b* § 13. Ap. H 3 *b* § 2.
Khandhaka II. Ch. 8 *g* § 7.
Khandhaka IV. Ch. 11 *c* § 24.
Khandhaka V. Ch. 8 *l* § 4; Ch. 9 *c* § 2; Ch. 12 *c* § 2; Ch. 13 *c* § 2. Ap. I *b* § 1.
Khandhaka VI. Ch. 8 *e* § 2; Ch. 8 *g* § 8; Ch. 8 *j* § 10; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 6–12; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 4, 5; Ch. 14 *b* § 1; Ch. 14 *c* § 1.
Khandhaka VII. Ch. 10 *b* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* § 13; Ch. 19 *b*.
Khandhaka IX. Ch. 8 *b* § 4; Ch. 8 *d* § 8; Ch. 13 *a*. Ap. C *b* § 3; Ap. D *c* § 4; Ap. G 1 *b* § 1; Ap. H 4 *d*.
Khandhaka X. Ch. 12 *b* §§ 2, 3.
Khandhaka XI. Ch. 8 *e* § 3; Ch. 13 *a* § 4; Ch. 15 *b* § 15; Ch. 23 *b*.

Parivāsa: Ap. H 4 *c* § 1.

SUTTA PIṬAKA

Dīgha Nikāya

Sutta 1 (*Brahmajāla-s.*): Ch. 8*j* § 11; Ch. 11 *d* § 8. Ap. A 2 *d*; Ap. E *c* i § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (ii); Ap. H 4 *a* § 4.
Sutta 2 (*Sāmaññaphala-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 23; Ch. 19 *c* § 2. Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (i).
Sutta 3 (*Ambaṭṭha-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 10; Ch. 14 *d* § 5.
Sutta 4 (*Soṇadaṇḍa-s.*): Ch. 11 *e* § 1.
Sutta 5 (*Kūtadanta-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 10.
Sutta 6 (*Mahāli-s.*): Ch. 12 *c* § 4; Ch. 14 *a* § 2. Ap. C *b* § 4; Ap. D *c* § 1.
Sutta 7 (*Jāliya-s.*): Ch. 15 *b* § 1.
Sutta 9 (*Poṭṭhapāda-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 10.
Sutta 10 (*Subha-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 8.
Sutta 11 (*Kevaddha-s.*): Ap. G 2 *a* § 1; Ap. I *b* § 4.
Sutta 12 (*Lohicca-s.*): Ch. 14 *f* § 10; Ch. 15 *a* § 3.
Sutta 13 (*Tevijja-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 6. Ap. D *a* § 9 (i), (iv); Ap. G 1 *a* § 8; Ap. G 2 *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *c* § 2 (i).
Sutta 14 (*Mahā-'padāna-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 2. Ap. B *c* § 3; Ap. G 1 *b* § 2.
Sutta 15 (*Mahā-nidāna-s.*): Ap. B *c* § 4; Ap. D *a* § 5; Ap. E *c* i § 3.
Sutta 16 (*Mahā-parinibbāna-s.*): Ch. 8 *g* § 3; Ch. 11 *c* § 25; Ch. 12 *c* § 12; Ch. 12 *d* § 1; Ch. 13 *a* § 1; Ch. 19 *d*; Chs. 20–2. Ap. B *a* § 6; Ap. C *a* § 4; Ap. E *c* ii §§ 4, 5; Ap. G 1 *b* §§ 3, 4; Ap. H 3 *a* §§ 1–3.
Sutta 18 (*Janavasabha-s.*): Ch. 12 *e* § 6; Ch. 16 *b* § 1. Ap. I *b* § 6.
Sutta 19 (*Mahā-Govinda-s.*): Ch. 15 *a* § 1; Ch. 17 *c*.
Sutta 20 (*Mahā-samaya-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 17.
Sutta 21 (*Sakka-pañha-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 12.
Sutta 22 (*Mahā-satipaṭṭhāna-s.*): Ch. 9 *a*. Ap. C *a* § 3.
Sutta 23 (*Pāyāsi-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 2.
Sutta 24 (*Pāṭika-s.*): Ch. 12 *a* § 5; Ch. 12 *d* § 2; Ch. 13 *a* § 10.
Sutta 25 (*Udumbārika-sīhanāda-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 11.
Sutta 26 (*Cakkavatti-sīhanāda-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 13.
Sutta 27 (*Aggañña-s.*): Ch. 18 *b* § 3; Ch. 18 *c* § 2.
Sutta 28 (*Sampasādanīya-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 5. Ap. I *b* § 5.
Sutta 29 (*Pāsādika-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 24. Ap. G 1 *a* § 1; Ap. G 2 *c* § 3 (ii).
Sutta 30 (*Lakkhana-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 3.
Sutta 31 (*Singālovāda-s.*): Ch. 9 *b*.
Sutta 33 (*Sangīti-s.*): Ch. 13 *a* § 3.
Sutta 34 (*Dasuttara-s.*): Ap. I *b* § 3.

Majjhima Nikāya

Sutta 1 (*Mūla-pariyāya-s.*): Ch. 14 *d* § 3.
Sutta 2 (*Sabb-āsava-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 4.
Sutta 12 (*Mahā-sīhanāda-s.*): Ch. 12 *c* § 10.
Sutta 14 (*Cūla-dukkhakkhandha-s.*): Ch. 9 *c* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* § 8; Ch. 13 *c* § 14.
Sutta 16 (*Ceto-khila-s.*): Ap. D *a* § 9 (iii).
Sutta 18 (*Madhupiṇḍika-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 18.
Sutta 21 (*Kakacūpana-s.*): Ap. F 1 *b* § 2.
Sutta 24 (*Ratha-vinīta-s.*): Ch. 14 *e* § 3

SUTTA PIṬAKA (*cont.*)

Majjhima Nikāya (*cont.*)

Sutta 26 (*Ariya-pariyesana-s.*): Ch. 1 § 11; Ch. 2 § 5; Ch. 3 § 5; Ch. 4 § 16; Ch. 5 *a* §§ 5–10; Ch. 5 *c* § 6; Ch. 11 *a* § 1; Ch. 15 *a* § 6; Ch. 18 *b* § 5. Ap. E *c* ii § 1; Ap. F 1 *c*; Ap. I *a* § 1.
Sutta 31 (*Cūla-Gosinga-s.*): Ch. 12 *e* § 10.
Sutta 35 (*Cūla-saccaka-s.*): Ch. 12 *a* § 7.
Sutta 36 (*Mahā-saccaka-s.*): Ch. 4 § 17; Ch. 12 *c* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 6, 7. Ap. D *a* § 7.
Sutta 38 (*Mahā-taṇhā-saṇkhaya-s.*): Ap. G 1 *a* § 7.
Sutta 39 (*Mahā-Assapura-s.*): Ch. 11 *e* § 4.
Sutta 53 (*Sekha-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 23.
Sutta 56 (*Upāli-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 6.
Sutta 57 (*Kukkara-vatika-s.*): Ch. 13 *d* § 5.
Sutta 58 (*Abhaya-rāja-kumāra-s.*): Ch. 19 *c* § 1.
Sutta 60 (*Apaṇṇaka-s.*): Ch. 14 *f* § 9.
Sutta 61 (*Ambalaṭṭhika-Rāhul-ovāda-s.*): Ch. 11 *d* § 9.
Sutta 62 (*Mahā-Rāhul-ovāda-s.*): Ch. 18 *d* § 1.
Sutta 63 (*Cūla-Māluṇkyā-s.*): Ap. G 1 *a* (ii) § 3.
Sutta 66 (*Laṭukikopama-s.*): Ch. 11 *f* § 5.
Sutta 67 (*Cātumā-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 26.
Sutta 70 (*Kītāgiri-s.*): Ch. 15 *a* § 14.
Sutta 71 (*Vacchagotta-s.*): Ch. 12 *c* § 9.
Sutta 72 (*2nd Vacchagotta-s.*): Ap. E *a* ii § 4; Ap. G 1 *a* § 5.
Sutta 74 (*Dīghanakha-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 14.
Sutta 75 (*Māgandiya-s.*): Ch. 16 *a* § 1.
Sutta 76 (*Sandaka-s.*): Ch. 15 *b* § 2.
Sutta 77 (*Mahā-Sakuludāyi-s.*): Ch. 8 *k*; Ch. 11 *c* § 9.
Sutta 82 (*Raṭṭhapāla-s.*): Ch. 16 *a* § 6.
Sutta 83 (*Mahādeva-s.*): Ch. 12 *e* § 12.
Sutta 84 (*Madhura-s.*): Ch. 17 *b* § 2.
Sutta 85 (*Bodhi-rājkumāra-s.*): Ch. 13 *b* § 2.
Sutta 86 (*Angulimāla-s.*): Ch. 12 *a* § 3; Ch. 14 *a* § 3; Ch. 18 *c* § 1.
Sutta 87 (*Piya-jātika-s.*): Ch. 18 *c* § 4.
Sutta 89 (*Dhammacetiya-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 30.
Sutta 90 (*Kaṇṇakatthala-s.*): Ch. 14 *f* § 12.
Sutta 91 (*Brahmāyu-s.*): Ch. 12 *e* § 13.
Sutta 93 (*Assalāyana-s.*): Ch. 14 *a* § 7.
Sutta 94 (*Ghoṭamukha-s.*): Ch. 15 *a* § 13.
Sutta 95 (*Canki-s.*): Ch. 14 *f* § 7.
Sutta 96 (*Esukāri-s.*): Ch. 8 *l* § 2.
Sutta 99 (*Subha-s.*): Ch. 18 *d* § 2.
Sutta 100 (*Sangārava-s.*): Ch. 14 *f* § 1.
Sutta 101 (*Devadaha-s.*): Ch. 13 *d* § 4.
Sutta 103 (*Kinti-s.*): Ch. 13 *a* § 6.
Sutta 104 (*Sāmagāma-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 25.
Sutta 106 (*Ānañja-sappāya-s.*): Ch. 16 *a* § 2.
Sutta 108 (*Gopaka-Moggallāna-s.*): Ch. 23 *a*.
Sutta 118 (*Ānāpāna-sati-s.*): Ch. 18 *b* § 4.
Sutta 122 (*Mahā-sunnata-s.*): Ch. 13 *c* § 19.

SUTTA PIṬAKA (*cont.*)

Majjhima Nikāya (*cont.*)

Sutta 128 (*Upakkilesa-s.*): Ch. 15 *b* § 10.
Sutta 131 (*Bhaddekaratta-s.*): Ch. 14 *c* § 5.
Sutta 136 (*Mahā-kammavibhaṅga-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 29.
Sutta 140 (*Dhātu-vibhaṅga-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 19. Ap. C *b* § 5.
Sutta 141 (*Sacca-vibhanga-s.*): Ch. 15 *a* § 8.
Sutta 143 (*Anāthapiṇḍikovāda-s.*): Ch. 18 *a* § 2.
Sutta 144 (*Channovāda-s.*): Ch. 11 *c* § 6.
Sutta 150 (*Nagaravindeyya-s.*): Ch. 14 *f* § 5.
Sutta 152 (*Indriya-bhāvanā-s.*): Ap. E *c* ii § 2.

Saṃyutta Nikāya

Sagātha-vagga: Ch. 11 *b* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* § 27; Ch. 11 *d* §§ 2, 14; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 27, 28; Ch. 13 *e* §§ 1, 2; Ch. 14 *a* §§ 4, 5, 6; Ch. 14 *b* §§ 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8; Ch. 14 *c* § 13; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 3, 15, 16; Ch. 18 *c* §§ 3, 5, 6, 7; Ch. 18 *e* §§ 1, 2.
Nidāna-vagga: Ch. 8 *h* § 1; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 7, 26; Ch. 11 *d* § 7; Ch. 12 *c* § 7; Ch. 12 *e* § 7; Ch. 16 *a* §§ 3, 4; Ch. 16 *b* § 2; Ch. 16 *d* § 4. Ap. B *a* §§ 2, 3; Ap. B *c* § 5; Ap. E *c* i §§ 4, 5; Ap. E *c* ii § 3.
Khandha-vagga: Ch. 5 *c* §§ 1–5, 10; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 18, 20; Ch. 12 *c* § 5; Ch. 13 *b* § 4; Ch. 13 *d* § 3; Ch. 14 *c* § 6; Ch. 14 *e* § 8; Ch. 15 *a* § 16; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 6, 9; Ch. 18 *f* § 1. Ap. C *b* § 6; Ap. D *a* § 2; Ap. D *b* § 2; Ap. D *c* § 3; Ap. E *a* ii §§ 2, 3; Ap. E *b* §§ 2, 3; Ap. E *c* i §§ 6, 7, 8; Ap. G 1 *b* § 5; Ap. G 2 *b* § 1.
Salāyatana-vagga: Ch. 7 *a* §§ 5, 6; Ch. 11 *c* §§ 12, 17; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 2, 8, 11; Ch. 13 *d* § 6; Ch. 14 *c* § 7; Ch. 14 *d* § 7; Ch. 14 *e* § 1; Ch. 15 *b* §§ 7, 14; Ch. 16 *d* § 5; Ch. 17 *d* §§ 1, 3. Ap. C *b* § 7; Ap. G 2 *a* §§ 3, 4; Ap. I *a* § 2.
Maha-vagga: Ch. 5 *b* § 10; Ch. 11 *c* § 28; Ch. 11 *f* § 6; Ch. 12 *a* § 6; Ch. 12 *e* § 4; Ch. 13 *a* § 9; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 20, 21, 22, 29; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 11, 12, 14, 15, 18, 19; Ch. 14 *e* §§ 4, 7; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 11, 13; Ch. 15 *a* § 11; Ch. 15 *b* § 8; Ch. 16 *c* § 1; Ch. 16 *d* §§ 3, 7; Ch. 18 *b* § 6; Ch. 19 *a* §§ 1, 2. Ap. C *b* § 8; Ap. D *a* §§ 1, 6; Ap. F 2 *d*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 6; Ap. H 1 § 6.

Aṅguttara Nikāya

The Units: Ch. 10 *c*.
The Threes: Ch. 1 § 10; Ch. 4 § 18; Ch. 11 *a* § 3; Ch. 11 *c* § 10; Ch. 12 *d* § 4; Ch. 13 *c* § 8; Ch. 14 *f* §§ 4, 8, 14; Ch. 15 *a* § 10; Ch. 18 *f* § 2. Ap. B *a* §§ 4, 5; Ap. C *b* § 9; Ap. E, *Note*; Ap. F 2 *b*; Ap. G 1 *a* § 2; Ap. G 2 *a* § 5; Ap. H 4 *a* § 2; Ap. H 4 *b* § 1; Ap. I *a* § 4.
The Fours: Ch. 11 *c* §§ 15, 21; Ch. 12 *e* §§ 1, 3; Ch. 13 *a* § 8; Ch. 13 *d* §§ 7, 9; Ch. 14 *c* § 8; Ch. 14 *d* § 1; Ch. 14 *e* § 5; Ch. 15 *b* § 5; Ch. 17 *b* § 1. Ap. D *b* § 6.
The Fives: Ch. 8 *l* § 3; Ch. 11 *f* § 2; Ch. 12 *a* §§ 8, 10; Ch. 12 *c* § 8; Ch. 14 *e* § 6; Ch. 15 *b* § 3. Ap. F 1 *b* § 7; Ap. H 4 *a* § 1; Ap. H 4 *b* § 2.

SUTTA PIṬAKA (*cont.*)

Aṇguttara Nikāya (*cont.*)

The Sixes: Ch. 12 *e* § 9; Ch. 13 *b* § 5; Ch. 14 *f* § 2; Ch. 15 *a* § 9; Ch. 16 *c* § 2. Ap. C *b* § 10.

The Sevens: Ch. 11 *e* § 2; Ch. 12 *d* §§ 5, 6; Ch. 13 *b* § 6; Ch. 14 *c* §§ 9, 16; Ch. 15 *b* § 4.

The Eights: Ch. 12 *a* § 4; Ch. 12 *c* § 6; Ch. 13 *c* § 12; Ch. 13 *d* § 8; Ch. 16 *c* § 3; Ch. 17 *a*.

The Nines: Ch. 11 *c* § 13; Ch. 16 *d* § 2.

The Tens: Ch. 11 *c* § 16; Ch. 11 *d* § 4; Ch. 11 *e* § 3; Ch. 12 *a* § 9; Ch. 13 *a* §§ 2, 5; Ch. 14 *a* § 1; Ch. 14 *f* § 6; Ch. 15 *a* § 4; Ch. 16 *a* § 5; Ch. 16 *d* § 8; Ch. 17 *d* § 4. Ap. B *c* § 6; Ap. D *a* § 10; Ap. G 1 *a* § 4; Ap. H 4 *a* § 3; Ap. I *a* § 5.

Khuddaka Nikāya

Khuddaka-pāṭha: Ap. G 2 *a* § 9.

Buddha-vaṃsa: Ap. A 2, *a*, *b*, *c*; Ap. D *a* § 10 (i); Ap. F 2 *a*.

Dhammapada:

(1–2): Ap. E *c* ii § 6.
(5–6): Ap. F 1 *b* § 4.
(19–20): Ap. E *c* ii § 6.
(21–3): Ap. C *b* § 11.
(50): Ap. E *c* ii § 6.
(80): Ap. E *c* ii § 6.
(89): Ap. C *b* § 11.
(90): Ap. C *a* § 1.
(94–6): Ap. C *a* § 1.
(103): Ap. D *a* § 4.
(121–2): Ap. E *c* ii § 6.
(126): Ap. C *a* § 2.
(153–4): Ap. D *b* § 5.
(168): Ch. 7 *b* § 2.
(174): Ap. C *b* § 11.
(177): Ap. F 1 *a* § 1.
(178): Ap. C *a* § 2.
(202–3): Ap. C *b* § 11.
(221): Ap. D *a* § 8 (i).
(222): Ap. E *c* ii § 6.
(239): Ap. E *c* ii § 6.
(251): Ap. D *a* § 10 (ii).
(277): Ap. E *a* i.
(278): Ap. E *b* § 1.
(279): Ap. E *c* i § 1.
(285): Ap. C *b* § 11; Ap. D *a* § 4.
(306–9): Ap. B *a* § 7.
(335–6): Ap. D *a* § 4.
(342): Ap. D *a* § 8 (i).
(354): Ap. D *a* § 4.
(368): Ap. F 1 *b* § 4.
(369–70): Ap. C *b* § 11.
(370): Ap. D *c* § 2.
(372): Ap. C *b* § 11.
(374): Ap. C *b* § 11.
(383): Ap. F 2 *c* § 1.
(393–4): Ap. F 2 *c* § 1.
(397): Ap. D *a* § 9 (ii).
(414): Ap. F 2 *c* § 1.
(423): Ap. C *a* § 2.

Itivuttaka: Ap. F 1 *b* § 5.

Jātaka: Verses in Ap. F 1 *a* § 2.

Sutta-nipāta: Ch. 8 *h* § 2; Ch. 8 *l* § 1; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 4, 15. Ap. F 1 *b* § 6; Ap. F 2 *c* §§ 2, 3; Ap. G 2 *a* § 8; Ap. H 4 *c* § 2; Ap. I *b* § 2.

Thera-gāthā: Ch. 13 *c* § 9; Ch. 13 *d* § 1.

B. NON-CANONICAL BOOKS AND RECORDS

Commentaries on Canonical Books:

Commentary on the Dīgha Nikāya, Sumaṇgala-Vilāsini by Buddhaghosha: Ap. H 5.

Commentary on the Buddha-vaṃsa, Madhurattha-Vilāsini: Ch. 10 *b* § 1; Ch. 10 *d*; Ch. 11 *d* § 3; Ch. 12 *a* § 1; Ch. 12 *b* § 1; Ch. 13 *b* § 1; Ch. 14 *b* § 2; Ch. 16 *d* § 1; Ch. 18 *a* § 1.

Commentary on the Dhammapada: Ch. 18 *b* § 2.

Commentary on the Jātaka, Nidāna-kathā or Introduction: Ch. 1 §§ 1–9; Ch. 2 §§ 1–4, 6–7; Ch. 3 §§ 1–4, 6–8; Ch. 4 §§ 1–8; Ch. 5 *a* § 1; Ch. 5 *b* §§ 1–2; Ch. 6 *a* § 1; Ch. 7 *a* §§ 1, 7–10, 16–17; Ch. 7 *b* §§ 1–6; Ch. 10 *a* §§ 1–5; Ch. 10 *b* § 2; Ch. 11 *c* § 3; Ch. 13 *c* §§ 5, 11; Ch. 13 *d* § 2; Ch. 15 *a* §§ 5, 7. Ap. B *c* § 1; Ap. F 1 *a* § 2.

Other Pāli Books or Records:

An-āgata-vaṃsa: Ap. A 1 *a*; Ap. G 1 *b* § 6.
Asokan Edicts: Ch. 13 *c* § 16. Ap. G 1 *c*.
Dīpa-vaṃsa: Ch. 8 *e* § 4. Ap. A 1 *b*.
Milinda-pañha: Ap. B *b* §§ 1, 2.
Visuddhi-magga, by Buddhaghosha: Ap. D *b* §§ 3, 4; Ap. E *c* i § 9.

INDEX I

ANNOTATED PĀLI WORDS

The Pāli words indexed below are given in the inflected form appearing in the various texts and footnotes referred to. The translation shows the different meanings and uses of the word under consideration. Compare especially *Dhamma*.

Order of Pāli alphabet adopted: A, Ā, I, Ī, U, Ū, E, O, K, Kh, G, Gh, Ṇ, C, Ch, J, Jh, Ñ, Ṭ, Ṭh, Ḍ, Ḍh, Ṇ, T, Th, D, Dh, N, P, Ph, B, Bh, M, Y, R, L, Ḷ, V, S, H.

INDEX II

PROPER NAMES, TITLES, AND MODES OF ADDRESS

For this Index the English order of the alphabet is followed.